13

Mahā Assa, pura Sutta

The Greater Discourse at Assa, pura | M 39
Theme: A recluse should be worth his salt
Translated by Piya Tan ©2003, 2023

1 Assa, pura & the 16 great countries

- **1.1** The most important suttas delivered by the Buddha at **Assa,pura** are **the Mahā Assapura Sutta** (M 39/1:271-280), **the Cūļa Assapura Sutta** (M 40/1:281-284) (MA 2:312), and **the Soṇadaṇḍa Sutta** (D 4/-1:111-126). According to **the Cetiya Jātaka** (J 422/3:460), Assapura was built by the second of the 5 sons of King Apacara (or Upacara) of Ceti, on the spot where the prince saw a pure white horse (*assa*). It lay to the south of Sotthivatī, Apacara's capital (J 3:460).
- **1.2** The Assa,pura of the suttas was a city in the kingdom of **Aṅga**, the easternmost of the 16 "great countries" (*mahā,janapadā*) mentioned in the Pali Canon, namely, Aṅga, Magadha, Kāsī, Kosala, Vajjī, Mallā, Cetī, Vaṁsā, Kuru, Pañcāla, Macchā, Sūrasena, Assaka, Avantī, Gandhāra, and Kambojā (A 1:213, 4:252, 256, 260, etc).¹ The Aṅga territory lay south of the Ganges, to the east of Magadha (eastern part of south Bihar today), separated by the river Campā. Its capital city was **Campā** or Campā,purī, on the confluence of the Campā and the Ganges. Undoubtedly, this area is today denoted by Campapura (also called Campanagara, Nagaracampa or Nagarcam), 34 km (24 mi) to the east of modern Bhagalpur.²
- **1.3** The country is generally referred to by the name of its people, the Aṅgā, though occasionally, it is called Aṅga,raṭṭha (DhA 1:384). In the Buddha's time it was part of Magadha, ruled by king Bimbisāra, who was well-respected by the people of Aṅga (MA 1:279 f). There were frequent movements of people between the two countries (J 2:211), and occasional wars between them (J 4:454, 5:316, 6:271).
- **1.4** In the Buddha's time, the rajah of Aṅga was merely a wealthy kshatriya, mentioned in the suttas as having granted a pension to a brahmin (M 2:163). The people of Aṅga and Magadha are generally mentioned together as **Aṅga,Magadha**. The people of Aṅga-Magadha provided Uruvelā Kassapa with offerings for his great fire sacrifices (V 1:27). It was their custom to offer an annual sacrifice to Mahā Brahmā in the hope of gaining a hundred-thousandfold reward (SA 1:351). On one occasion, it is said, Sakra, the king of the gods, himself, appeared in person and went with them to the Buddha so that they may not waste their resources in futile sacrifices (SA 1:269 f).
- **1.5** The Mahā Govinda Sutta (D 19) seems to indicate that once, in the past, Dhata,raṭṭha (Skt Dhrta, $r\bar{a}$ ṣṭra) was king of Aṅga (D 2:235 f), but this probably refers to another country. Before **Soṇa Kolivīsa** joined the Order, he was a serf or humble servant (paddhagu) of Aṅga (Tha 632).

¹ Other similar lists mention 10 countries, eg D 2:200; cf Mvst 1:34, 198; Lalv 24(22).

² Cunningham, *Ancient Geography of India*, ed Majumdar, Calcutta, 1924:546 f. J Finegan, *An Archaeological History of Religions of Indian Asia*, NY: Paragon House, 1989:84 f.

³ D 2:202; M 2:2; V 1:27; ThaA 1:548

⁴ D:RD 2:270 n.; see also The Rāmāyaṇa 1.8, 9, 17, 25.

⁵ For detailed list, see **(Tad-ah') Uposatha S** (A 3.70) @ SD 4.18 App.

2 Summary

- **2.2** In the Sutta title, Mahā Assa,pura Sutta, the word **mahā** refers to sutta. In other words, this is the "great" or "greater" discourse given at Assa,pura. In most cases, where mahā prefixes a sutta title, it means that there is at least one other identically titled sutta prefixed with a cūļa, "lesser," usually shorter. However, in some cases, the mahā clearly refers to a name, for example, the Mahā Kaccāna Bhadd'eka,ratta Sutta (M 113), it is "Mahā Kaccāna" that is referred to. I B Horner helpfully discusses the qualifiers cūļa and mahā in sutta titles in her introduction to Middle Length Sayings (M:H 1:xiii-xvii).

3 Anomalies in the list of stages?

3.1 Rod Bucknell, in his paper, "The Buddhist path to liberation: An analysis of the listing of stages," thinks that there is a textual corruption in the reading of *hiri*, ottappa (moral shame and moral fear) as a dvandva [§3.2 f] instead of as two separate terms, as in this passage on the second and third of the 7 good qualities of a noble disciple from **the Sekha Sutta** (M 53):⁷

He has <u>moral shame</u>. He is ashamed of bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct. He is ashamed of engaging in bad unwholesome states.

He has <u>moral fear</u>. He fears of bodily misconduct, of verbal misconduct, and of mental misconduct. He fears of engaging in bad unwholesome states. (M 53,11-12/1:356)

However, following the Sutta theme—that of "there is still more to be done"—it is not difficult to see why *hiri,ottappa* is given as a dvandva, and not two separate items—since they are not explained in any detail as in the Sekha Sutta. It is highly unlikely that a sutta teaching or section was originally given in full and then abridged by the reciters in this manner, especially when it is merely a familiar dyad.

3.2 A second "textual corruption" noted by Bucknell is the inclusion of the "purity of mental conduct" (parisuddha mano,samācāra) passage [§6]:

Two anomalies [in the Mahā Assapura list of stages] have now been noted:

⁶ R Bucknell, "The Buddhist Path to Liberation: An analysis of the listing of stages." JIABS 1984:7-40.

⁷ Bucknell 1984:17. "In other lists [besides Mahā Assapura S] where *hiri* and *ottappa* occur, they are invariably reckoned as <u>two separate items</u>...[such as] in the *pañca balāni* (five powers): *saddhā*, *hiri*, *ottappa*, *viriya*, *paññā* (faith, shame, fear of blame, energy, insight) [A 3:9, 5:123 f; cf D 2:120 for better known set that excludes *hiri* and *ottappa*], and the *satta saddhammā* (seven excellent qualities): *saddhā*, *hiri*, *ottappa*, *bahussuta*, *viriya*, *sati*, *paññā* (faith, shame, fear of blame, hearing much, energy, mindfulness, insight) [D 3:252; M 1:356]" (1984:19; emphases added).

- (a) the illogical position of pure mental conduct [6] and pure livelihood [7], suggesting a combination of the two familiar triads⁸; and
- (b) the atypical treatment of hiri and ottappa as a single stage.

These two anomalies are in one respect complementary: the first amounts to the addition of an extra stage, the second effectively reduces the total number of stages by one. This suggests that the two are perhaps associated aspects of a single textual corruption. The observed facts can be accounted for with the following hypothesis:

The list of 10 "things to be done by recluses and brahmins" formerly began thus:

- (1) hiri
- (2) ottappa
- (3) pure conduct of body
- (4) pure conduct of speech
- (5) pure livelihood
- (6) guarding the sense-doors

Monks responsible for memorizing and transmitting this list were also familiar with the triad of conduct of body, speech, and mind. Since the list contained the first and second members of this triad, they added the third member; and to compensate for the resulting increase in the number of "things to be done," they simultaneously combined *hiri* and *ottappa* into a single item. This corruption—which may have been carried out largely unconsciously—went undetected because the list occurred only once in the entire Tipiṭaka (in the *Mahā-Assapura-sutta*). Hence the list as we now have it. (1984:19 f)

Here again, when we consider the Sutta theme—"there is still more to be done"—it is natural that the 3 karmic doors—speech, body and mind—are mentioned as a set. If we unbderstand "the mind" here as including intention (cetanā), it actually acts as a "bridge" into livelihood, the intention to ensure that we support ourselves without breaking the precepts.

3.3 Analayo, in *A Comparative of the Majjhima Nikāya,* notes that, although the Pali sutta begins by stipulating <u>moral shame and moral fear</u> as two qualities of a true recluse, this statement is not found in the Chinese versions of the sutta, of which two exist, one in the Madhyama Āgama and the other in the Ekottara Āgama.¹⁰

A few lines of the sutta have also been preserved in the Sanskrit fragments discovered in Central Asia. From this finding, it is possible that the section of moral shame and moral fear could have been

⁸ The triads are: (1) pure conduct of body, speech and mind; and (2) right speech, right action, and right livelihood (Bucknell, "The Buddhist Path to Liberation: An analysis of the listing of stages." JIABS 7,2 1984:19).

⁹ Bucknell: "Had the earlier list occurred in several *suttas* in different *nikāyas*, palpable discrepancies would have resulted, thereby alerting the memorizers to the corruption. Thus, generally speaking, infrequent occurrence of a textual passage would be conducive to corruption of it." (JIABS 1984:39 n34)

¹⁰ These are MĀ 182 = T1.724c & EĀ 49.8 = T2.801c-802b. MĀ 182 and EĀ 49.8 agree with M 39 on the location of the sutta (鴦騎國,馬邑 *Yāng Qí Guó, Mǎyì* in MĀ 182, apparently abbreviated to 鴦藝村 *Yāng Yì Cūn* in EĀ 49.8). MĀ 182 also has the same title as the Pali version (馬邑 *Mǎyì*), without however qualifying this discourse to be a "greater" one. (Analayo 2006 Intro)

¹¹ Cat bo 562 in SHT 1:250 (identification of this fragment as a parallel to M 39 by Schlingloff 1967:422); and cat no 1392 in SHT 6:113. Cat no 562 parallels the assumption that nothing more needs to be done, found at M 1:271,-26; cat no 1392 parallels the Buddha's instruction to purify mental conduct at M 1:272,20; cat no 562 and cat no 1392 each also have a part paralleling the description of sense-restraint at M1:273,3. (Analayo 2006 ad M 1:271)

added some time after the Chinese translations were made or that the Chinese translation is based on a text that did not have this passage.

- **3.4** Be that as it may, it should also be remembered that Buddhism is not so much a text-based system as it is **an oral tradition**—or "aural" tradition, since it is also <u>heard</u>—even to this day. ¹² "Oral/aural tradition" here has <u>two important senses</u>: first, the textual transmission through <u>recitation and recited texts</u>; and secondly, the direct and personal teaching or lineage of transmitting the Dharma <u>from teacher to pupil</u> (going back to the Buddha's own day). No matter how much technical care is taken in the reciting and the writing or printing of the sacred texts, they would suffer various errors, such as scribal errors, lost leaves, sectarian revisions and worst of all, misinterpretations, misuse and disuse.
- **3.5** The personal transmission of the Dharma through living Dharma-spirited teachers, nurtured by one's mindfulness, is still the most foolproof way of tasting the original flavour of the Dharma. That is, if one's intention is to find spiritual liberation. The texts no matter how authentic or accurate are but dry ink on dead leaves. The spirit of the Dharma only comes alive when we experience and understand these teachings as a personal experience of true reality. No matter how well made the spoon is, it still does not taste the soup; only the taster tastes and is nourished.

4 Studying the sutta

- **4.1** Except for the occasion of this sutta, its teachings are all staple and found elsewhere in the Nikāyas, which attest to their age and importance. The section on <u>abandoning the hindrances</u> and their similes [12-14] are found in **the Sāmañña,phala Sutta**¹³ and **the Yodh'ājīva Sutta** 1.¹⁴ **The (Nīvaraṇa) Saṅgārava S**¹⁵ gives a colourful simile to each of these hindrances. The Majjhima Commentary gives elaborate details for each of the 5 similes here.¹⁶
- **4.2** The sections on the dhyanas [15-18] are also found in the Sāmañña, phala Sutta (D 2). Similarly, the rest of the Mahā Assapura Sutta (ie on the 3 knowledges) [19-21], except for the closing section, on the etymologies of "arhat" [22-29], are found in the Sāmañña, phala Sutta (D 2,93-98/1:82-84) and the Bhaya, bherava Sutta (M 4).

_ _ _

¹² Technically, I have rendered *anussavana* simply as "tradition" (referring esp to brahminical oral/aural traditions), and reserved "oral tradition" for the Buddhist reciter tradition.

¹³ D 2,67-74/1:71-74.

¹⁴ A 5.75.12/ 2:244 f.

¹⁵ S 46.55/5:121-126.

¹⁶ See Nyanaponika, *The Five Mental Hindrances,* Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, Wheel no 26, 1961:27-34 & Appendix below.

¹⁷ D 2,75b-82/1:74-76.

¹⁸ M 4,27-32/1:22 f.

Mahā Assa, pura Sutta The Greater Discourse at Assa, pura

M 39

[271]

1 Thus have I heard.

At one time the Blessed One was staying amongst **the Anga people**. There was a market town of the Angas called **Assa,pura**.

1.2 There the Blessed One addressed the monks: "Bhikshus!"

"Bhante! [Bhadante!]" the monks replied in assent.

What makes a recluse?

The Blessed One said this:

2 "'Recluses (samana), recluses,' bhikshus, that is how people perceive you.

And when you are asked, 'What are you?' you claim, 'We are recluses.'

Bhikshus, since you are designated thus, since you claim so, (thus you should train yourselves:)¹⁹

THE 10 TRAININGS IN MORAL VIRTUE

- 3 'Having undertaken the duties that make one <u>a recluse</u> and that make one <u>a brahmin</u>,²⁰
- (1) we will do those duties so that our designation will thus be *true* and this claim of ours will be *real*,²¹ and we partake of the requisites of *robes*, *almsfood*, *lodging*, *and medicine*,

support and necessities for the sick, so that our deeds will be of great fruit, of great benefit, 22 and so that this very going-forth would not be barren but be fertile and fruitful.'

Thus, bhikshus, you should train yourselves.

Moral shame and moral fear (hiri, ottappa)

- 3.2 And what, bhikshus, are the things that make one a recluse and make one a brahmin?²³
- (2) 'We will be accomplished in **moral shame** and **moral fear**.'²⁴ Thus, bhikshus, you should train yourselves.

¹⁹ This parenthesis is an echo of the last line of this paragraph for easier reading.

²⁰ Both the terms "recluse" (samaṇa) and "brahmin" (brāhmaṇo) refers to a "monk" (bhikkhu). See below.

²¹ "So that our designation will thus be true and this claim of ours will be real," (Be) evam no ayam amhākam samaññā ca saccā bhavissati paṭiññā ca bhūtā; (Ce) evam no amhākam samaññā ca ayam ...; (Ee Se) evan no ayam

²² That is, help the monks in physically supporting them in their spiritual cultivation and also bringing great merit to the donors.

²³ Dhammā samaṇa,karaṇā ca brāhmaṇa,karaṇā ca. In **Cūḷa Assa,pura S** (M 40), the by-line is "the proper way of a recluse" (samaṇa,sāmīci-p,paṭipadā) (M 40/1:281-284) = SD 41.8, Here, "brahmin" is used not in a social or biological sense of a class, but in a *spiritual* sense of a true practitioner, a recluse.

²⁴ "Moral shame and moral fear," *hiri ottappa*. Comy (MA 2:313 f) qu **(Loka,pāla) Hiri,ottappa S** where they are said to be "protectors of the world" (A 2.1.9/1:51), so called because they are the pillars of a healthy society.

The Abhidhamma defines <u>moral shame</u> (*hiri*) as "to be ashamed of what one ought to be ashamed of, to be ashamed of performing bad and unwholesome deeds" (Pug 24); cf Dhs:R 18 f. It is one of the 7 noble treasures

3.3 But, bhikshus, you may think thus:

'We are accomplished in moral shame and moral fear.

3.4 That much is enough, we have done enough,²⁵ the goal of recluseship has been won. There is nothing more to be done.'

And so you would settle contented with yourselves with just that much.²⁶

3.5 Bhikshus, I declare to you; bhikshus, I make it known to you: you who desire recluseship, do not lose sight of the goal of recluseship²⁷—there is still more to be done.²⁸

The fourfold purity (catu parisuddhi)

- 4 And, bhikshus, what more should be done? [272]
- (3) 'Our <u>bodily</u> conduct will be pure, clear, open, flawless, restrained, and we will not praise ourselves and scorn others on account of that pure *bodily* conduct.' Thus, bhikshus, you should train yourselves.
 - 4.2 But, bhikshus, you may think,

'We are accomplished in moral shame and moral fear; our bodily conduct is pure.

4.3 That much is enough, we have done enough, the goal of recluseship has been won. There is nothing more to be done.'

And so you would settle contented with yourselves with just that much.

(*ariya,dhanāni*, DA 2:34; ThaA 240; VvA 113), ie the treasures of generosity (*cāga,dhanāni*, D 3:163, 251; A 4:5; VvA 113; cf A 3:53): faith, moral conduct, moral shame, moral dread, learning, generosity, wisdom. Cf Sn 77, 462 (= D 1:168), 719.

Moral shame is often paired with <u>moral fear</u> (*ottappa*) (eg M 1:271; S 2:220; A 2:78; lt 34; Tikap 61; J 1:127; Vism 221; DhA 3:73). The term *ottappa* is derived from *apa* + VTRAP, to be abashed [Skt *āpatrapya > apatrapā (Trenckner)]. Andersen suggests that this etym must be preferred to that of Childers: *autappya > uttāpa, ut + VTAP, heat (PG 62). Edgerton (BHSD) has apatrāpya and the cpd *hrīr-apatrāpya* (P *hiri,ottappa*). According to **Visuddhi,magga**, the proximate cause for moral shame is self-respect, while for moral dread it is respect for others. Out of self-respect (attāna garu katvā), one, like the daughter of a good family, rejects bad-doing through moral shame. Out of respect for others (param garu katvā), one, like a courtesan, rejects bad-doing through moral fear (Vism 14.142/464 f). The former is sometimes known as self-regarding moral conduct (motivated by the shame the deed entails), while the latter as other-regarding moral conduct (motivated by the healthy *fear* of karmic repercussion). As such these 2 actions are known as the 2 bright states that protect the world, if not for which "one would neither respect one's mother, nor one's mother's sister, nor one's brother's wife, nor one's teacher's wife" (A 1:50). [In his translation, Ñāṇamoli rendered *hiri* as "conscience," but apparently mistranslated *ottappati* as "is ashamed" and *ottappa* as "shame," Vism:Ñ 524 f.] See Intro (3).

- ²⁵ "That much is enough, we have done enough," *alam ettāvatā katam ettāvatā*, lit "that much is enough, that much has been done."
- ²⁶ "You would be pleased with yourselves with just that much," *tāvataken'eva tuṭṭhiṁ āpajjeyyātha,* lit "you would fall into contentment with just that much."
- ²⁷ Comy (MA 2:314) qu **Sāmañña S 1 & 2** (S 45.35-36/5:25): "What, bhikshus, is recluseship (*sāmañña*)? The noble eightfold path, that is to say, right view...right concentration—this is called recluseship. And what, bhikshus, is the goal of recluseship (*sāmaññ'attha*)? The destruction of greed, hate and delusion—this is the goal of recluseship."
- ²⁸ Sati uttarim karaṇīye. This means that sainthood and liberation have not been attained yet. A similar teaching with this statement is given by Ānanda to the brahmin youth Subha in (Ānanda) Subha S (D 10,1,31 etc.), SD 40a.13

4.4 Bhikshus, I declare to you; bhikshus, I make it known to you: you who desire recluseship, do not lose sight of the goal of recluseship—there is still more to be done.

5 And, bhikshus, what more should be done?

(4) 'Our verbal conduct will be pure, clear, open, flawless, restrained,

and we will not praise ourselves and scorn others on account of that pure *verbal* conduct.' 'Thus, bhikshus, you should train yourselves.

5.2 But, bhikshus, you may think,

'We are accomplished in moral shame and moral fear; our bodily conduct is pure;

our verbal conduct is pure.

5.3 That much is enough, we have done enough, the goal of recluseship has been won. There is nothing more to be done.'

And so you would settle contented with yourselves with just that much.

5.4 Bhikshus, I declare to you; bhikshus, I make it known to you: you who desire recluseship, do not lose sight of the goal of recluseship—there is still more to be done.

- 6 And, bhikshus, what more should be done?
- (5) 'Our mental conduct²⁹ will be pure, clear, open, flawless, restrained, and we will not praise ourselves and scorn others on account of that pure mental conduct.' Thus, bhikshus, you should train yourselves.
 - 6.2 But, bhikshus, you may think,

'We are accomplished in moral shame and moral fear;

our bodily conduct is pure; our verbal conduct is pure;

our mental conduct is pure.

6.3 That much is enough, we have done enough, the goal of recluseship has been won. There is nothing more to be done.'

And so you would settle contented with yourselves with just that much.

6.4 Bhikshus, I declare to you; bhikshus, I make it known to you: you who desire recluseship, do not lose sight of the goal of recluseship—

there is still more to be done.

7 And, bhikshus, what more should be done?

(6) 'Our livelihood will be pure, clear, open, flawless, restrained,

and we will not praise ourselves and scorn others on account of that pure livelihood.'

'Thus, bhikshus, you should train yourselves.

²⁹ R Bucknell thinks that the addition of this *parisuddha mano,samācāra* passage is a "textual corruption": see Intro (3).

7.2 But, bhikshus, you may think,

'We are accomplished in moral shame and moral fear;

our bodily conduct is pure; our verbal conduct is pure; our mental conduct is pure;

our livelihood is pure. [273]

7.3 That much is enough, we have done enough, the goal of recluseship has been won. There is nothing more to be done.'

And so you would settle contented with yourselves with just that much.

7.4 Bhikshus, I declare to you; bhikshus, I make it known to you: you who desire recluseship, do not lose sight of the goal of recluseship—there is still more to be done.

Restraint of the senses (indriya,samvara)

- 8 And, bhikshus, what more should be done?
- (7) 'We will guard the sense-doors.
- 8.2 On seeing **a form** with <u>the eye</u>, we will not grasp at any **sign or detail**³⁰ by which —if we were to dwell without restraint over *the eye faculty* the bad unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure³¹ might assail us.

We will practise restraint, we will guard the eye faculty, we will dwell with the eye faculty restrained.

- 8.3 On hearing **a sound** with <u>the ear</u>, we will not grasp at any *sign or detail* by which —if we were to dwell without restraint over *the ear faculty* the bad unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might assail us. We will practise restraint, we will guard <u>the ear faculty</u>, we will dwell with *the ear faculty* restrained.
- 8.4 On smelling **a smell** with <u>the nose</u>, we will not grasp at any *sign or detai* by which —if we were to dwell without restraint over *the nose faculty* the bad unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might assail us. We will practise restraint, we will guard the nose faculty, we will dwell with *the nose faculty* restrained.

³⁰ "Sign and detail," *nimitta,anuvyañjana*. Technically, a "**sign**" arises from <u>thinking</u> (*vitakka*) or just knowing, and a "**detail**" (or details) from <u>pondering</u> or investigating. See *Nimitta* & *anuvyañjana*, SD 19.14.

[&]quot;Covetousness and displeasure," abhijjhā,domanassaṁ, which Walshe (1995:335 & n632) renders as "hankering and fretting for the world"; alt tr "covetousness and displeasure" or "longing and loathing." MA says that covetousness and displeasure signify the first 2 hindrances—sensual desire and ill will—principal hindrances to be overcome for the practice to succeed. They thus represent the contemplation of mind-objects, which begins with the 5 hindrances. Cf M 1:274/39.13; see also Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S (D 22,13) and Satipaṭṭhāna S (M 10,36) on how to deal with the hindrances in one's meditation. The monk effects the abandoning of the hindrances by the contemplations of impermanence, fading away (of lust), cessation (of suffering) and letting go (of defilements), and thus comes to look upon the object with equanimity. On abhijjhā,domanassa, there is an interesting related passage from Pubba or Pubb'eva Sambodha S: "Bhikshus, before my awakening, when I was still a bodhisattva, this thought occurred to me...'Whatever physical and mental joy (sukha,somanassa) there is in the world, that is the gratification (assāda) in the world; that the world is impermanent, suffering and of the nature to change, that is the wretchedness (ādīnava) in the world—the removal and abandoning of desire and lust for the world, that is the escape from the world'." (A 1:258/3.101, pointed out to me by Robert Eddison).

8.5 On tasting a taste with the tongue, we will not grasp at any sign or detail by which

—if we were to dwell without restraint over the tongue faculty—

the bad unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might assail us.

We will practise restraint, we will guard the tongue faculty, we will dwell with the tongue faculty restrained.

8.6 On feeling **a touch** with the body, we will not grasp at any *sign or detail* by which

—if we were to dwell without restraint over the body faculty—

the bad unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might assail us.

We will practise restraint, we will guard the body faculty,

we will dwell with *the body faculty* restrained.

8.7 On knowing a thought with the mind, we do not grasp at any sign or detail by which

—if we were to dwell without restraint over the mind faculty—

the bad unwholesome states of covetousness or displeasure might assail us.'32

We will practise restraint, we will guard the mind faculty,

we will dwell with the mind faculty restrained.

Thus, bhikshus, you should train yourselves.

8.8 But, bhikshus, you may think,

'We are accomplished in moral shame and moral fear;

our bodily conduct is pure; our verbal conduct is pure; our mental conduct is pure;

our livelihood is pure;

our senses are restrained.

8.9 That much is enough, we have done enough, the goal of recluseship has been won. There is nothing more to be done.'

And so you would settle contented with yourselves with just that much.

8.10 Bhikshus, I declare to you; bhikshus, I make it known to you: you who desire recluseship, do not lose sight of the goal of recluseship—there is still more to be done.

Moderation in food (bhojane mattaññutā)

- **9** Bhikshus, what more should be done?
- (8) 'We will be moderate in food:33

³² For an elaborate teaching on sense-restraint, ie, "the cultivation of the faculties" ($indriya\ bh\bar{a}van\bar{a}$), Indriya,-bhāvanā S (M 152/3:298-301), SD 17.13.

³³ Bhojane mattaññuno. This reflection is one of the 4 on the use of monastic supports (robes, food, shelter and medicine) (see Sabb'āsava S, M 2,13-16/1:10 @ SD 30.3) and found by itself at Mahā Assa,pura S (M 39,9/1:273), SD 10.13; Sekha S (M 53,9/1:355), SD 21.14; Gaṇaka Moggallāna S (M 107,5/3:2), SD 56.3; Sāriputta Saddhi,vihāri-ka S (S 35.129/4:104); Rathôpama S (S 35.239/4:176, 177), SD 55.14; Apaṇṇaka Paṭipada S (A 3.16/1:114), SD 74.11; Aparihāna S (A 4.37,4/2:40); (Taṇhā) Bhikkhuṇī S (A 4.159,4/2:145), SD 10.14; Nanda S (A 8.9,3/4:167); Nm 1:240, 241, 368ī 2, 484; Nc:Be 292; Dhs 231; Vbh 249; Pug 25.

9.2 Wisely considering food, we will take it,

not for amusement, not for intoxication, not for fattening, not for adorning;

but only that this body may endure and continue,

for keeping it unharmed,

for helping it to live the holy life, thus,

"I shall end the old feeling [of hunger], and not cause a new feeling to arise.

Thus will I be blameless and live at ease.'

Thus, bhikshus, you should train yourselves.

9.3 But, bhikshus, you may think,

'We are accomplished in moral shame and moral fear;

our bodily conduct is pure; our verbal conduct is pure; our mental conduct is pure;

our livelihood is pure; our senses are restrained;

we are moderate in food.

9.4 That much is enough, we have done enough, the goal of recluseship has been won. There is nothing more to be done.'

And so you would be pleased with yourselves with just that much.

9.5 Bhikshus, I declare to you; bhikshus, I make it known to you: you who desire recluseship, do not lose sight of the goal of recluseship—there is still more to be done.

Wakefulness (jāgariya)

- 10 Bhikshus, what more should be done?
- (9) 'We will devote ourselves to wakefulness.
- 10.2 During the day, while walking to and fro and sitting down, we will purify the mind of obstructions.³⁴

During the first watch of the night,³⁵ [274] while walking to and fro and sitting down, we will purify the mind of obstructions.

During the middle watch of the night, we will, after mentally noting the time for rising,³⁶ mindfully and clearly aware, lie down lion-like³⁷ on our right side, one foot placed on the other.

³⁴ "Obstructions," āvaraṇā, syn of nīvaraṇā, "mental hindrance." See Āvaraṇa,nīvaraṇa S (S 5:94-96).

 $^{^{35}}$ In the Buddha's time, the day was divided into 2 parts: forenoon (dawn to noon) and afternoon (noon to sunset); and the night into 3 watches ($y\bar{a}ma$): the first watch (6.00-10.00 pm), the middle watch (10.00 pm-2.00 am) and the last watch (2.00 to 6.00 am) (DA 1:45 ff, 3:727; MA 1:255; SA 3:184; SnA 131 f; BA 8, 133. 298).

³⁶ After mentally noting the time for rising," *uṭṭhāna,saññam manasi karitvā*: **D 33**/3:209; **M 39**,10/1:274, **53**,5 +10/1:354 f; **S 4.7**/1:107, **35.120**/4:105, **35.239**/4:177, **35.243**/4:184; **A 3.16**/1:114, **4.23**/2:40, **4.58.9**/4:87, **8.9**.4/-4:168, **10.67**,1/5:123, **10.68**,1/5:126; **U 8.5**/84. When one is going to sleep is an example of "sleeping mindfully," mentioned in **Sati,paṭṭhāna S** (M 10,8(7)/1:57). In **Pacalā S** (A 7.58), the Buddha exhorts, "Moggallāna, mindful and clearly aware, you should lie down lion-like on your right side, placing foot on foot, keeping in mind the thought that on awakening, you would get up quickly, thinking, 'I will dwell without indulging in the pleasure of sleep, or in the pleasure of reclining, or in the pleasure of drowsiness'" (*na seyya,dukham na passa,sukham na middha,sukham anuyutto*) (A 7.58/4:87), SD 4.11. On this mental noting of rising up again, see also n at **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16,-4.14/2:135, 16,5.1/2:137), SD 9.

During the last watch of the night, while walking to and fro and sitting down, we will purify the mind of obstructions.'38

Thus, bhikshus, you should train yourselves.

10.3 But, bhikshus, you may think,

'We are accomplished in moral shame and moral fear;

our bodily conduct is pure; our verbal conduct is pure; our mental conduct is pure;

our livelihood is pure; our senses are restrained; we are moderate in food;

we are **devoted to wakefulness**.

10.4 That much is enough, we have done enough, the goal of recluseship has been won. There is nothing more to be done.'

And so you would be pleased with yourselves with just that much.

10.5 Bhikshus, I declare to you; bhikshus, I make it known to you: you who desire recluseship, do not lose sight of the goal of recluseship—there is still more to be done.

Mindfulness and clear awareness (sati sampajañña)

11 Bhikshus, what more should be done?

(10) 'We will be accomplished in mindfulness and clear awareness:

11.2 in going forward or going back, in looking forward or looking back, in bending or stretching, in carrying his upper robe, outer robe and bowl, in eating, drinking, chewing and tasting, in voiding or peeing, in walking, in standing, in sitting, in being asleep, in being awake, ³⁹ in talking, or in remaining silent,

he is clearly aware of what he is doing; he is clearly aware of what he is doing; he is clearly aware of what he is doing; he is clearly aware of what he is doing; he is clearly aware of what he is doing; he is clearly aware of what he is doing;

he is clearly aware of what he is doing.'

Thus, bhikshus, you should train yourselves.

11.3 But, bhikshus, you may think,

'We are accomplished in moral shame and moral fear;

our bodily conduct is pure; our verbal conduct is pure; our mental conduct is pure; our livelihood is pure; our senses are restrained; we are moderate in food; we are devoted to wakefulness;

³⁷ **Seyyā S** (A 4.244) mentions $\underline{4}$ sleeping-postures ($\underline{seyy\bar{a}}$): that of the ghosts ($\underline{pet\bar{a}}$) (lying supine like a corpse); that of those who indulge in sense-pleasures ($\underline{k\bar{a}ma}$, $\underline{bhog\bar{\imath}}$) (lying on the left side); that of the lion (lying on the right side); and that of the Tathāgata (lying while in the 4 dhyanas); the lion's sleeping posture is described in detail (A 4.244/2:244 f), SD 76.6. Comy qu **Seyyā S** but places $\underline{k\bar{a}ma}$, $\underline{bhog\bar{\imath}}$, $\underline{seyy\bar{a}}$ first (MA 2:316). See **Avassuta Pariyāya S** (S 35.143) where the Buddha, after saying, "My back aches, so I will stretch it," lies in the lion-posture (S 35.143/4:184). Cf SA 1:78; UA 403; VbhA 345.

³⁸ For refs on this pericope, see **Danta,bhūmi S** (M 125,18) n, SD 46.3.

³⁹ "In being asleep, in being awake" *sutte jāgarite*. Comy glosses *sutte* as *sayane*, "lying down, sleeping." See SD 13.1 (3.6.3).

we are accomplished in mindfulness and clear awareness.

11.4 That much is enough, we have done enough, the goal of recluseship has been won. There is nothing more to be done.'

And so you would be pleased with yourselves with just that much.

11.5 Bhikshus, I declare to you; bhikshus, I make it known to you: you who desire recluseship, do not lose sight of the goal of recluseship—there is still more to be done.

TRAINING IN CONCENTRATION

Effective meditation

12 Bhikshus, what more should be done?⁴⁰

PLACES CONDUCIVE FOR MEDITATION

Here, bhikshus, a monk resorts to a secluded dwelling:

- a forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, a jungle grove, the open air, a heap of straw.⁴¹
 - **13** Returning from his alms-round, after his meal, he sits down, crosses his legs, holds his body upright, and establishes **mindfulness** before him.⁴²
- 13.2 Overcoming the mental hindrances
 - (1) Abandoning covetousness with regard to the world,

he dwells with a mind devoid of covetousness.

He cleanses his mind of covetousness.

(2) Abandoning ill will and anger,

he dwells with a mind free of *ill will*, caring for the welfare of all living beings. **[275]** He cleanses his mind of *ill will* and anger.

(3) Abandoning sloth and torpor,

he dwells with a mind devoid of *sloth and torpor*, mindful, alert, perceiving light.

⁴⁰ This well known stock is found at **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,67-74/1:71-74) & **Yodh'ājīva S 1** (A 5.75,12/3:92 f). **The (Nīvaraṇa) Saṅgārava S** (S 46.55/5:121-126) gives a colourful simile to each of these hindrances. MA gives elaborate details of each of the 5 similes here: see Nyanaponika, *The Five Mental Hindrances*, Kandy: Buddhist Publication Soc, Wheel 26, 1961:27-34. See Appendix below.

⁴¹ This stock is found, with minor variations at: Sāmañña,phala S (D 2,67.2/1:71); (Ānanda) Subha S (D 10,2.-6.2/1:207); Mahā Govinda S (D 19,46/2:242); Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S (D 25,16/3:49, 50, 51); Cūļa Hatthi,padô-pama S (M 27,17/1:181); Mahā Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S (M 38,37.2/1:269); Mahā Assa,pura S (M 39,12/1:274); Kandaraka S (M 51,18/1:346); Bhaddali S (M 65,14+15/1:440, 441); Ghoṭa,mukha SD (M 94,20/2:162); Deva,daha S (M 101,36/2:226); Gaṇaka Moggallāna S (M 107,8/3:3); Mahā Suññata S (M 122,22.2+23.2+24.3+24.5/3:115, 116×2, 117); Attan Tapa S (A 4.198/2:210); Yodh'ājīva S 1 (A 5.75/3:92); Yodh'ājīva S 2 (A 5.76/3:100); (Navaka) Nāga S (A 9.40/4:437); (Durabhisambhava) Upāli S (A 10.99/5:207); Nm 1:26, 1:140, 2:341; Vbh 244 (more elaborate), 251 (abbreviated); Pug 29, 68. For meaning analyses of suññâgāra, see SD 48.9 (9.1). On other lists of places suitable for meditation, see M 10,4.2: n on "an empty place," SD 13.3.

⁴² Comy. He applies mindfulness towards his meditation subject; or he sets it up in the region of the mouth. As such, it is said in **Vibhaṅga**: "This mindfulness is set up, set up well, at the tip of the nose or at the sign of the mouth" (MA 2:216; DA 1:210; SA 1:238; Vbh §537/252). **M Abhinava Ṭīkā**: The "sign of the mouth" (*mukha,nimit-ta*) is the middle region of the upper lip, against which the air strikes when it comes out of the nose (MṬ:Be 2:124).

He cleanses his mind of sloth and torpor.

(4) Abandoning restlessness and worry,

he dwells undisturbed, his mind inwardly stilled.

He cleanses his mind of restlessness and worry.

(5) Abandoning doubt, 43

he dwells, having crossed over doubt,

with no perplexity with regard to wholesome mental states.

He cleanses his mind of doubt.

Parables for the abandoning of the 5 hindrances⁴⁴

14 (1) COVETOUSNESS [D 2.69]

Bhikshus, suppose that a man, **taking a loan**, invests it in his businesses. His businesses succeed. He repays his old debts and there is a surplus for wife and ornaments.

The thought would occur to him,

'Before, taking a loan, I invested it in my businesses. Now <u>my businesses have succeeded</u>. I have repaid my old debts and there is a surplus for wife and ornaments.'

Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

(2) ILL WILL AND ANGER [D 2.70]

Now, bhikshus, suppose that a man **falls sick**, in pain and seriously ill. He does not enjoy his meals and there is no strength in his body.

As time passes, he <u>recovers from that sickness</u>. He enjoys his meals and there is strength in his body. The thought would occur to him,

'Before, I was sick; now I have recovered from that sickness. I enjoy my meals and there is strength in my body.'

Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

(3) SLOTH AND TORPOR [D 2.71]

Now, bhikshus, suppose that a man is **bound in prison**.

As time passes, he eventually is <u>released from that bondage</u>, <u>safe and sound</u>, <u>with no loss of property</u>.

The thought would occur to him,

'Before, I was bound in prison. Now I am released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.'

Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

(4) RESTLESSNESS AND WORRY [D 2.72]

Now, bhikshus, suppose that a man is **a slave**, subject to others, not subject to himself, unable to go where he likes.

As time passes, he eventually is <u>released from that slavery</u>, subject to himself, not subject to others, free, able to go where he likes.

⁴³ These are not doubts seeking answers, but persistent doubts regarding the Buddha, the Dharma, the Sangha, the threefold training (moral virtue, mental cultivation, wisdom), the past, the future, both past and future, and states arising through specific conditionality and dependent arising (Vbh 914/365).

⁴⁴ For tr of Comy on this section, see App below, where similes for the 5 mental hindrances are given. These 5 similes also appear, with some minor differences, in **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,69-75/1:71-73), SD 8.10.

The thought would occur to him,

'Before, I was a slave subject to others, not subject to myself,⁴⁵ unable to go where I like. Now I am released from that slavery, subject to myself, not subject to others, free, able to go where I like.'

Because of that [276] he would experience joy and happiness.

(5) DOUBT [D 2.73]

Now, bhikshus, suppose that a man, <u>carrying money and goods</u>,

is journeying on a road through the wilderness.⁴⁶

As time passes, he eventually <u>emerges from the wilderness</u>, safe and sound, with <u>no loss of property</u>. The thought would occur to him,

'Before, carrying money and goods, I was journey on a road through the wilderness. Now I have emerged from the wilderness, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.'

Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

[D 2.74] In the same way, when these **5 hindrances** are not abandoned in himself, the monk regards it as a debt, as a sickness, as a prison, as slavery, as a journey on a road through the wilderness.⁴⁷

[D 2.75] But when he knows that these 5 hindrances are <u>abandoned</u> in him, he regards it as solvency, as good health, as release from prison, as emancipation, as a place of security.

THE FULLER AWAKENING PERICOPE

(§§15-21)48

THE 4 DHYANAS⁴⁹

The 1st dhyana

15 Having abandoned the 5 mental hindrances, imperfections of the mind that weaken wisdom,⁵⁰ <u>quite detached from sense-objects</u>,⁵¹ detached from unwholesome mental states,

he enters and remains in the 1st dhyana,

accompanied by initial application (vitakka) and sustained application ($vic\bar{a}ra$), accompanied by zest ($p\bar{\imath}ti$) and happiness (sukha), born of seclusion. ⁵² He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body ⁵³

with zest and happiness born of *seclusion*.

⁴⁵ le, neither free nor self-reliant, but totally dependent on others.

⁴⁶ "Journeying...through the wilderness," kantār'addha,magga.

⁴⁷ For tr of Comy of this section, see Appendix below.

⁴⁸ This whole section (§§15-21)—the fuller awakening pericope—includes similes. The same pericope is found in Sāmañña,phala S (D 2,76-100/1:82-85) with more details and similes, and a unique passage on "knowledge of the mind-made body" (D 2,87-88), and called the comprehensive awakening pericope (D 2,93-98/1:81-84), SD 8.10. Without the similes—called the full awakening pericope—it occurs in Bhaya,bherava S (M 4,27-33/1:22 f), SD 44.3

⁼ Dvedha Vitakka S (M 19,18-24/1:117-24), SD 61.1; Mahā Saccaka S (M 36,34-44/1:247-250), SD 49.4.

⁴⁹ This section is almost as at **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,75.2-82/1:74-76).

⁵⁰ "That weaken wisdom," *paññāya dubbalī,karaṇe*. Since the mental hindrances prevent us from seeing the truth and weaken our wisdom, they have to be overcome.

⁵¹ On the tr of *kāmehi* (pl), see SD 8.4 (5.1.1.1).

⁵² le, of samadhi.

⁵³ Here "body" ($k\bar{a}ya$) refers to the "mental body" ($n\bar{a}ma,k\bar{a}ya$), ie feeling ($vedan\bar{a}$), perception ($sa\tilde{n}\tilde{n}a$), formations ($sa\dot{n}kh\bar{a}ra$), and consciousness ($vi\tilde{n}\tilde{n}a\bar{n}a$) (Vism 4.175/169). AA however says that it refers to the "living physical body" ($karaja,k\bar{a}ya$, AA 3:232).

15.2 Bhikshus, just as if a skilled bathman or bathman's apprentice

would pour bath powder into a brass basin and knead it together,

sprinkling it again and again with water,

so that his ball of bath powder—saturated, moisture-laden, permeated within and without—would not drip.

15.3 Even so, bhikshus, does a monk permeate, pervade, suffuse this very body with zest and happiness born of seclusion.

There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and happiness born of seclusion.

The 2nd dhyana

16 Furthermore, bhikshus, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind,

he enters and remains in the 2nd dhyana,

free from initial application and sustained application,

accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration.54

He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body

with zest and happiness born of concentration.

There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and happiness born of concentration.

16.2 Bhikshus, just like a lake with spring-water welling up from within, [277]

having no inflow from the east,

no inflow from the west,

no inflow from the north, and

no inflow from the south,

and with the skies not bringing abundant rain over and again.55

Yet the cool spring welling up from within the lake would permeate and pervade,

flood and fill it with cool waters—there being no part of the lake unpervaded by the cool waters.

16.3 Even so, bhikshus, does a monk permeates, pervades, suffuses this very body with <u>zest and</u> happiness born of *concentration*.

There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and happiness born of concentration.

The 3rd dhyana

17 Furthermore, bhikshus, with the fading away of zest,

he remains equanimous, mindful and clearly aware, and experiences happiness with the body. He enters and remains in **the 3**rd **dhyana**, of which the noble ones declare,

⁵⁴ The 2nd dhyana is known as "the noble silence" (*ariya*, *tuṇhī*, *bhāva*) because within it initial thought and sustained thought (thinking and discursion, *vitakka*, *vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur (S 2:-273); cf. S 4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī*, *saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. In **Ariya**, **pariyesanā S** (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to "either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence" (ie, either talk Dharma or meditate).

⁵⁵ Be Ee devo ca na kālena kālaṁ sammā dhāraṁ anupaveccheyya. Ce devo ca kālena kālaṁ sammā dhāraṁ <u>nâ-nuppaveccheyya</u>. Se omits na: devo ca kālena kālaṁ sammā dhāraṁ anupaveccheyya. See D 1:74 n6. For preferring the na reading, see **Dhyana**, SD 8.4 (8.2).

'Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.'

He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body with happiness free from zest.

17.2 Bhikshus, just as in **a pond of blue** *lotuses*, red-white *lotuses*, or white *lotuses*, some blue lotuses, red-white lotuses, or white lotuses born and growing in the water, stay immersed in the water and flourish without standing up out of the water, so that they are permeated, pervaded, suffused and filled with cool water from their roots to their tips, and nothing of those lotuses would be unpervaded with cool water.

17.3 Even so, bhikshus, does a monk permeates, pervades, suffuses this very body with the happiness free from zest,

so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded with this happiness free from zest.

The 4th dhyana

18 Furthermore, bhikshus, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain, and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure, attains and dwells in **the 4**th **dhyana**

that is <u>neither painful nor pleasant</u>, and with mindfulness *fully purified by equanimity*. ⁵⁸
He sits, pervading the body with a purified [radiant] mind, ⁵⁹
so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded with *a purified* [radiant] mind.

- 18.2 Bhikshus, just as if a man were sitting covered from head to foot with a white cloth so that there would be no part of [278] his body to which the white cloth did not extend.
 - 18.3 Even so, the monk sits, permeating the body with a purified [radiant] mind.

 There is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded with a purified [radiant] mind.

⁵⁶ The 3 kinds of lotus are *uppala* (Skt *utpala*), *paduma* (Skt *padma*) and *puṇḍarika* (ts). There are 2 kinds of *padumā*, ie the red (*ratta,paduma*, VvA 191; PvA 157) and the white (*seta,paduma*) (J 5:37; SnA 125). Also mentioned is the "five-coloured lotus" (*pañca,vaṇṇa,paduma*, J 1:222, 5:337, 6:341; VvA 41). They are further classified as 100-petalled (*sata,patta*) and 1000-petalled (*sahassa,patta*) (VvA 191) (*patta* here lit tr as "leaves"); the usual word for "petal" is *dala*, which can also mean "leaf." In other words, the ponds mentioned here are filled with lotus of more than 3 colours.

⁵⁷ "Joy ... pain," *sukha-dukkha*: this refers to the physical feelings. The next phrase—"pleasure and displeasure," *domanassa-somanassa*—refers to mental feelings, which have been transcended earlier. Mental feelings need to be overcome first so that the mind is not distracted by itself, as it were. Then, all the other feelings (arising from the physical sense-contacts) are transcended. On the significance of this, see **Sall'atthena S** (S 36.6/4:207-210), SD 5.5.

⁵⁸ Here, **Vibhaṅga** gives 3 factors of the 4th dhyana—<u>equanimity (upekhā)</u>, mindfulness (sati) and one-pointedness <u>of mind (cittassa ek'aggatā)</u>—according to the Sutta analysis (Vbh 261), and 2 factors—equanimity and one-pointedness of the mind—according to the Abhidhamma analysis (Vbh 164; Vism 4.183/165). See **Dhyana**, SD 8.4 (5.4).

⁵⁹ "With a purified [radiant] mind" (*cetasā pariyodātena*): a clear allusion to the "radiant mind" (*pabhassara citta*) of **Accharā Vagga** (A 1.6.1-2): "Bhikshus, this mind is radiant (*pabhassara*), but it is defiled by defilements from outside. The uninstructed ordinary person does not understand this as it really is. As such, for him there is no personal development." (A 1:10). On reaching the 4th dhyana, the practitioner becomes directly aware of the truly and naturally pure nature of the mind. There are two views of what this "radiant mind" is: (1) it is the natural pervasive wholesome "original mind" (a common Mahāyāna teaching); (2) it arises only when one has attained dhyana (held by Theravāda meditation teachers such as Brahmavaṁso). See also A:ÑB 1999 §4.

THE 3 KNOWLEDGES⁶⁰

The recollection of past lives

19 (1) REBIRTH

With his concentrated mind thus purified,

and bright, unblemished, free from defects,⁶¹ pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, he directs and inclines it to **the knowledge of the recollection of past lives**.⁶²

He recollects his manifold past lives, that is,

one birth, two births, three births, four, five,

ten, twenty, thirty, forty, fifty,

one hundred, one thousand, one hundred thousand,

many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion,

many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, (recollecting),

'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose there.

There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.'

Thus, bhikshus, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details.

19.2 With his concentrated mind thus purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, ⁶³ pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,

he directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the recollection of past lives.

He recollects his manifold past lives, that is,

one birth, two births, three births, four, five,

ten, twenty, thirty, forty, fifty,

one hundred, one thousand, one hundred thousand,

many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion,

many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, (recollecting),

'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose there.

There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.'

Thus, bhikshus, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details.

⁶⁰ The term "one with the threefold knowledge" (*te,vijja*) refers to an arhat with these 3 realizations in counterpoint to the masters of the 3 Vedas: see **Te,vijja S** (D 8), SD 1.8. This whole section—<u>the 3-knowledge pericope</u>—is stock: see §34 header, "The full awakening pericope" n.

⁶¹ Upakkilesa: to be distinguished from kilesa, "defilement." Perhaps the 10 "imperfections of insight" listed in Vism 20.105 ff are meant here, but potential hindrances at a certain stage of insight meditation. (Walshe)

^{62 &}quot;Past lives," (pubbe,nivāsā), lit "previous abodes".

⁶³ *Upakkilesa*: to be distinguished from *kilesa*, "defilement." Perhaps the 10 "imperfections of insight" listed in Vism 20.105 ff are meant here, but potential hindrances at a certain stage of insight meditation. (Walshe)

19.3 Bhikshus, just as if a man were to go from his home village to another village, and then from that village to yet another village, and then from that village back to his home village. The thought would occur to him, 'I went from my home village to that village over there. There I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way. From that village I went to that village over there, and there I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way. From that village I came back home.'64 19.4 Even so, bhikshus, does a bhikshu recollect his manifold past lives, that is, one birth, two births, three births, four, five, ten, twenty, thirty, forty, fifty, one hundred, one thousand, one hundred thousand, many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion, many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, (recollecting),

There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose there.

There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life-span.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.'

Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such the end of my life.

Thus, bhikshus, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details.

The passing away & re-arising of beings

```
20 (2) KARMA
```

With his concentrated mind thus purified, and bright,

unblemished, free from defects, 65 pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,

he inclines it to the knowledge of the passing away and re-arising of beings.

He sees—by means of **the divine eye** [clairvoyance],⁶⁶ purified and superhuman—

beings passing away and re-appearing,

and he knows how they are inferior and superior,

beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate,

faring in accordance with their karma:

'These beings [279]—who were endowed with bad bodily conduct, speech, and mind,

who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views

and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—

after death, when the body has broken up,

have re-arisen in a plane of misery, a bad destination, a lower realm, in hell.

⁶⁴ The 3 villages are the world of sense-desire, the form world, and the formless world (DA 1:223; MA 2:323).

⁶⁵ *Upakkilesa*: to be distinguished from *kilesa*, "defilement." Perhaps the 10 "imperfections of insight" listed in Vism 20.105 ff are meant here, but potential hindrances at a certain stage of insight meditation. (Walshe)

⁶⁶ Dibba,cakkhu, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (dhamma,cakkhu) (see n in §102).

But these beings—who were endowed with good bodily conduct, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—

after death, when the body has broken up, have re-arisen in a happy destination, in heaven.'

Thus, by means of <u>the divine eye</u>, purified and superhuman—
he sees beings passing away and re-appearing,
and he knows how they are inferior and superior,
beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate,
faring in accordance with their karma—
and understands how they <u>fare according to their karma</u>.

20.2 Suppose, bhikshus, there were two houses with doors and a man with vision standing there between them,

and a man with good eyes were to see people entering a house, leaving it, wandering about.⁶⁷

20.3 Even so, bhikshus, with his concentrated mind thus purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects,⁶⁸ pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, he sees by means of **the divine eye** [clairvoyance],⁶⁹ purified and superhuman—beings passing away and re-appearing,

and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, faring in accordance with their karma:

'These beings—who were endowed with bad bodily conduct, speech, and mind,

who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views

and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—

after death, when the body has broken up,

have re-arisen in a plane of misery, a bad destination, a lower realm, in hell.

But these beings—who were endowed with good bodily conduct, speech, and mind,

who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views

and undertook actions under the influence of right views—

after death, when the body has broken up, have re-arisen in a happy destination, in heaven.'

Thus, by means of <u>the divine eye</u>, purified and superhuman—
he sees beings passing away and re-appearing,
and he knows how they are inferior and superior,
beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate,
faring in accordance with their karma—
and understands how they <u>fare according to their karma</u>.

⁶⁷ This metaphor of rebirth recurs in **Mahā Sakul'udayi S** (M 77,34/2:21), SD 49.5a; **(Majjhima) Deva,dūta S** (M 130,21/3:178), SD 2.23.

⁶⁸ *Upakkilesa*: to be distinguished from *kilesa*, "defilement." Perhaps the 10 "imperfections of insight" listed in Vism 20.105 ff are meant here, but potential hindrances at a certain stage of insight meditation. (Walshe)

⁶⁹ Dibba,cakkhu, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (dhamma,cakkhu) (see n in §102).

The destruction of mental influxes

21 (3) LIBERATION⁷⁰

With his concentrated mind thus purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,

he directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the mental influxes.71

'This is the path leading to the ending of influxes,'

21.2 'This is **suffering**,'

'This is **the arising** of suffering,'

'This is **the ending** of suffering,'

'This is **the path** leading to the ending of suffering,'

thus he knows it as it really is.

thus he knows it as it really is.

thus he knows it as it really is.

21.3 'These are **mental influxes**,' thus he knows it as it really is. 'This is the <u>arising</u> of influxes,' thus he knows it as it really is. 'This is the <u>ending</u> of influxes,' thus he knows it as it really is.

21.4 His mind, thus knowing, thus seeing,

is released from the influx of **sensual desire** is released from the influx of **existence**, is released from the influx of **ignorance**.

thus he knows it as it really is.⁷³

With release, there is the knowledge, 'Freed (am I)!'

He understands thus:

'Birth is ended,

the holy life has been lived,

done is that which needs to be done.

There is no more of this state of being.'74

21.5 Bhikshus, just as if there were <u>a pool of water</u> in a mountain glen, clear, limpid and unsullied,

where a man with good eyesight standing on the bank

⁷⁰ This is a well known stock passage: D 1:83; M 1:23; A 4:178.

 $^{^{71}}$ $\bar{A}sava$ -k,khaya, $\tilde{n}a\bar{n}a$. The term $\bar{a}sava$ (lit "inflow, outflow") comes from \bar{a} -savati "flows towards" (i.e. either "into" or "out" towards the observer). It has been variously translated as taints ("deadly taints," RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, bad (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists 4 $\bar{a}sava$: the influx of (1) sense-desire ($k\bar{a}m'\bar{a}sava$), (2) (desire for eternal) existence or becoming ($bhav'\bar{a}sava$), (3) (wrong) views ($ditth'\bar{a}sava$), (4) ignorance (avijjasava) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These four are also known as "floods" (ogha) and "yokes" (yoga). The list of 3 influxes (omitting the influx of views) is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these $\bar{a}sava$ s is equivalent to arhatship. See BDict under $\bar{a}sava$.

⁷² These 4 statements on suffering pose an interesting problem: they are not called "noble truths" here (and in **Ariya Pariyesanā S**, M 26.43). Norman remarks that "since they appear to be subordinate to the four statements about the $\bar{a}savas$, it is possible that the statements about misery are a later addition, which led to a parallel, but inappropriate, set of four statements being evolved about the $\bar{a}savas$, to provide a symmetry" (Norman 1982:377-91, 1990:130). See also Schmithausen 1981:205.

⁷³ As in **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26.42), SD 1.11.

⁷⁴ Nâparaṁ itthatāya: lit "there is no more of 'thusness'." This is the climax and conclusion for all the instructions where the Buddha says, "There is still something to be done," beginning with §§3.3-3.5. See **Mahā,nidāna S** (M 15.22), SD 5.17.

could see shells, gravel and pebbles, and also shoals of fish swimming about and resting, and it would occur to him,

'This pool of water is clear, limpid, and unsullied.

Here are these [280] shells, gravel, and pebbles,
and also these shoals of fish swimming about and resting.'

21.5 Even so, bhikshus, a monk

knows it as it really is: 'This is suffering';

knows it as it really is: *'This is the arising of suffering';* knows it as it really is: *'This is the ending of suffering';*

knows it as it really is: 'This is the path to the ending of suffering.'75

'These are mental influxes,'
'This is the arising of influxes,'
'This is the ending of influxes,'
'This is the path leading to the ending of influxes,'

'This is the path leading to the ending of influxes,'

'This is the path leading to the ending of influxes,'

'This is the path leading to the ending of influxes,'

'This is the path leading to the ending of influxes,'

His mind, thus knowing, thus seeing,

is released from the influx of **sensual desire** is released from the influx of **existence**, is released from the influx of **ignorance**.

21.6 With release, there is the knowledge, 'Freed (am I)!' He knows thus:

'Birth is ended,
the holy life has been lived,
done is that which needs to be done.
There is nothing further beyond this.'

The arhat (the 7 etymologies)⁷⁶

22 Bhikshus, such a monk is called

a recluse,
or a brahmin,
or one who has washed clean,
or one accomplished in sacred knowledge,
or one learned in sacred lore,
or one who is noble,
or an arhat [one who is worthy].

 $^{^{75}}$ These 4 statements on suffering pose an interesting problem: they are not called "noble truths" here (and in **Ariya Pariyesanā S**, M 26,43). Norman remarks that "since they appear to be subordinate to the four statements about the $\bar{a}savas$, it is possible that the statements about misery are a later addition, which led to a parallel, but inappropriate, set of four statements being evolved about the $\bar{a}savas$, to provide a symmetry" (Norman 1982:377-91, 1990:130). See also Schmithausen 1981:205.

⁷⁶ The derivations of the various terms here are more wordplay and grammatical etymologies. They are meant to be didactic devices (for teaching purposes), not so much for grammatical analysis.

23 And how, bhikshus, is a monk a recluse (samaṇa)?

He has stilled (samita) bad unwholesome states that defile,

that bring rebirth, troubling, resulting in pain, that bring further birth, decay and death. Thus, bhikshus, a monk is a recluse.

24 And how, bhikshus, is a monk a brahmin (brāhmaṇa)?

He has kept out (bahīta) bad unwholesome states that defile,

that bring rebirth, troubling, resulting in pain, that bring further birth, decay and death. Thus, bhikshus, a monk is a brahmin.

25 And how, bhikshus, is a monk one who has been **washed clean** (*nhātaka*)? He is <u>washed cleaned</u> (*nhāta*)⁷⁷ of bad unwholesome states that defile, that bring rebirth, troubling, resulting in pain, that bring further birth, decay and death. Thus, bhikshus, a monk <u>is purified by water</u>.

26 And how, bhikshus, is a monk one <u>accomplished</u> in **sacred knowledge** ($vedag\bar{u}$)? He has <u>won knowledge</u> ($vidit\bar{a}$)⁷⁸ of bad unwholesome states that defile, that bring rebirth, troubling, resulting in pain, that bring further birth, decay and death. Thus, bhikshus, a monk is one accomplished in sacred knowledge.

27 And how, bhikshus, is a monk <u>learned</u> in **sacred lore** (*sotthiya*)?⁷⁹ He has <u>outwitted</u> (*nissuta*)⁸⁰ bad unwholesome states that defile, that bring rebirth, troubling, resulting in pain, that bring further birth, decay and death. Thus, bhikshus, a monk is *learned in sacred lore*.

28 And how, bhikshus, is a monk **a noble one** (*ariya*)? He is <u>far away</u> (<u>āraka</u>) from bad unwholesome states that defile, that bring rebirth, troubling, resulting in pain, that bring further birth, decay and death. Thus, bhikshus, a monk is a noble one.

29 And how, bhikshus, is a monk an arhat [one who is worthy] (arahanta)? He is far away (āraka) from bad unwholesome states that defile, that bring rebirth, troubling, resulting in pain, that bring further birth, decay and death. Thus, bhikshus, a monk is an arhat."

The Blessed One said this. Satisfied, the monks rejoiced⁸¹ in the Blessed One's word.

— evaṁ —

⁷⁷ "The term 'washed' (Be Se *nhātaka*, Ce Ee *nahātaka*; *nhāta*, *nahāta*) refers to a brahmin who, at the end of his discipleship under his teacher, has taken a ceremonial bath marking the end of his training" (M:ÑB 1235 n420). Cf Sn 521.

⁷⁸ Viditā, lit "he has known."

⁷⁹ Sotthiya (Skt śrotiya) = sottiya, Skt śrotiya (fr Ved śrotas or śrotra, ear), syn suta, "one who has heard (much)." The Skt śrotiya refers to a brahmin well versed in the Vedas and sacred lore.

⁸⁰ There is a wordplay here: (a) *ni + suta*, lit "he has out-heard," ie "outlearned," conquered (bad) with his wisdom; (2) *ni + sota*, lit "flowed out," ie purged of (bad). Comy glosses *nissuta* as *apahat'attā*, "whose mind has warded off (bad)."

^{81 &}quot;Joyfully approved," attamanā ... abhinandum.

Appendix

COMMENTARY

ON THE SIMILES OF THE MENTAL HINDRANCES

mentioned in the Mahā Assapura Sutta (MA 2:318-321 on M 39.14/1:276,12)

[The text of the discourse says:] "...when these five hindrances are not abandoned (in himself), the monk regards it as a debt, a sickness, a prison, slavery, a journey on a road through the wilderness."

Here the Blessed One compares the unabandoned hindrance of lustful desire to a debt; and compares the other hindrances to an illness, and so on. These [similes] here should be understood thus:

1. Lustful desire (kāma-c,chanda)82

When a man has fallen into debt, he is ruined. When his creditors, pressing him to settle the debt, speak roughly to him, or harass and beat him, he is unable to retaliate but has to bear it all. This endurance is simply because of his debt.

In the same way, if a man is filled with lustful desire for someone, filled with craving for that object of his desire, he would be attached to it. Even if he is roughly spoken to by that person, or harassed, or beaten, he will bear it all. This endurance is simply because of his lustful desire—he is like a house-husband⁸³ being beaten up by his wife. In this way, lustful desire is like a debt.

2. III will (vyāpāda)

If a man suffering from a bile disorder⁸⁴ were to receive even honey and sugar, he will not enjoy its taste because of his bile disorder. He would simply vomit it, complaining, "It is bitter! It is bitter!" In the same way, when one with an angry mind is admonished even slightly by his teacher or preceptor for his benefit, he does not accept their advice. Saying words like "You are harassing me too much!" he would leave the Order, or would go away and roam about.⁸⁵

Just as the person with bile disorder does not enjoy the taste of honey and sugar, even so one who has the disease of anger will not enjoy the taste of the Buddha's Teaching consisting in the joy of meditative dhyanas, etc. In this way, ill will is like an illness.

 $^{^{82}}$ The term "covetousness" (abhijjhā) is used instead in the Sutta.

^{83 &}quot;House-husband," ghara, sāmika, lit "house owner."

⁸⁴ "Bile disorder" (*pitta,roga*), ie a liver disorder. On the traditional Indian medicine, see **Sīvaka S** (S 36.21/4:230 f), SD 5.6.

⁸⁵ In **Khaluṅka S** (A 8.14), it is stated, "Again, bhikshus, here the monks accuse a monk of an offence. That monk, being thus accused of an offence by the monks, strongly objecting to the accusation, says thus, 'Why do you venerable sirs fuss so much over me? Let me now give up the training and return to the low life!' Having given up the training and return to the lowlife, he says thus, 'Now, bhante, are you satisfied?'" (A 8.14,17/4:194 f), SD 7.9.

3. Sloth and torpor (thīna, middha)

A person who is imprisoned during a festival day is unable to see the beginning or the middle or the end of the festivities. When released on the following day, he hears people saying,

"Oh, how delightful yesterday's festival was! Oh, those dances and songs!" he will not reply. And why not? Because he did not enjoy the festival himself.

In the same way, even if a very eloquent Dharma discourse is being given, one overcome by sloth and torpor would not know its beginning, middle or end. If after the discourse, he hears it being praised:

"How pleasant it was to listen to the Dharma! How interesting the subject was and how good the similes!" he will not reply. And why not? Because of his sloth and torpor, he did not enjoy the discourse. In this way, sloth and torpor are like imprisonment.

4. Restlessness and worry (uddhacca, kukkucca)

A slave who wants to enjoy himself at a festival is told by his master, "Go quickly to such and such a place! There is urgent work to be done. If you do not go, I shall have your hands and feet cut off, or your ears and nose cut off!" Hearing that, the slave will quickly go as ordered, and will not be able to enjoy any part of the festival. This is because of his dependence on others.

In the same way it is with a monk not well versed in the Vinaya, who has gone to the forest for the sake of solitude. If in any matter, down to the question of permissible meat [such as pork], thinking that it is not permissible [taking it for bear's flesh], ⁸⁶ he has to disrupt his solitude to seek a Vinaya master to purify his moral conduct. Thus he will not be able to experience the joy of solitude due to his being overcome by restlessness and worry. In this way, restlessness and worry are like slavery.

5. Doubt (vicikicchā)

A man journeying on a road through the wilderness where travellers have been plundered or killed by robbers would, at the mere sound of a twig or of a bird, become anxious and fearful, thinking, "The robbers have come!" would say, "Go! Stop! Turn back!" Thus he would be more frequently stopping than going ahead. Only with toil and trouble would he reach a safe place, or he might not even reach it.

In the same way, there would be the eight reasons⁸⁷ for doubt to arise in him, such as whether the Buddha is awakened or not. He is unable to accept such matters out of faith. Being unable to do so, he does not attain to the paths and fruits.

Thus, like the traveller on a road through the wilderness who is uncertain whether there are robbers or not, there arise in him persistent doubt and distrust, wavering, mental agitation. Thus he creates an obstacle for himself from reaching the safe ground of the noble ones. In this way, doubt is like travelling on a road through the wilderness.

050220 rev060707 071212 081228 091204 101222 110901 120924 130908 141117 150826 171017 180429 201222 211102 230825.3

⁸⁶ These 2 examples are from MAŢ.

⁸⁷ He has <u>doubts</u> regarding the Buddha, the Dharma, the Sangha, the threefold training (moral virtue, mental cultivation, wisdom), the past, the future, both past and future, and states arising through specific conditionality and dependent arising (Vbh 914/365).