Mahā Suññata Sutta

The Greater Discourse on Emptiness

Theme: The joy of spiritual solitude
Translated by Piya Tan ©2005

1 Sutta themes

1.1 COMPARATIVE STUDY. According to Rod Bucknill’s Pali & Chinese Ágama concordance (2004), the Mahā Suññatā Sutta is found in the Taishō Tripitaka as MA 191 = T1.738a-740c,2 and the Tibetan Kanjur3 as P957 (P38.279) and as Kj:De 291. The Tibetan version is entitled Mahāśūnyatā Mahāsūtra (The Great Discourse on the Great Emptiness), and Peter Skilling says that since the sutra itself is rather short, here the title must mean “Discourse on the Great Emptiness.” (1997:369)5

This sutta together with its full commentary has been published by Bhikkhu Nāṇamoli as The Greater Discourse on Voidness (1965).6 The main idea of this sutta is that of the ideal conditions for spiritual development, internal (proper attitude) and external (proper teacher). The sutta is implicitly but beautifully structured on the noble eightfold path. Bhikkhu Pesala has done a paraphrased summary of this sutta.7

1.2 DANGER OF SOCIALIZING. The sutta opens with the Buddha in Kapila, vatthu where he notices that a large company of monks are staying close together and sees the danger of their socializing and fraternizing [§§1-2.2]. Ānanda informs the Buddha that the monks who have gathered were making robes as it is robe season (which would be the month after the rains retreat, that is, around October-November) [§2.3]. The Buddha rebukes Ānanda, exhorting him that a monk who delights in company “does not shine” [§3], that is, would not progress spiritually, not even attain “freedom of mind that is temporary and pleasant” [§4.2].

The Commentary explains that this “freedom” refers to freedom from defilements through attaining full concentration with the mind fixing itself on the meditation object (appit’apppita, samaye kilesehi vimuttam) (MA 4.158). This evidently refers to “letting-go through suppression” (vikkhambhana, pahāna), that is, the temporary overcoming of the defilements through the attainment of the first dhyana (MA 4:158).8

The Buddha points out the danger of lustful desire in physical things [§5]. He speaks of his own “abiding in emptiness” (suññatā vihāra) [§6] and encourages the monks to abide thus [§7].

1.3 THE MADDING CROWD

1.3.1 The Majjhima Commentary generally stresses on the issues of crowding and of space: a crowded life is spiritually stifling; the spacious life supports a focussed mind that brings freedom.

---

1 Translated at the request of David Sugiman (Indonesia), National University of Singapore Buddhist Soc, 2004.
2 Here, see Choong 1999:79-84.
4 Kj:De 291 = Kj:De 71,253b-261b, the mdo chen pos tong pa nyid chen po zhes bya ba, tr Jinamitra, Prajñāvarman and Ye śes sde prob early 9th cent. For Romanized & other eds, see Skilling 1994:xiii f, 182-263; for his critical tr, see 1997:365-400.
5 For a discussion on prefix mahā before suttas, see Analayo 2005 ad M 122 Intro n & also Satipaṭṭhāna Ss (D 22; M 10), SD 9.2.
7 http://www.aimwell.org/assets/Emptiness.pdf
8 The Paṭisambhidā, magga speaks of 5 kinds of extinction (nirodha) of mental defilements and distraction: (1) extinction by suppression (vikkhambhana nirodha); (2) extinction by substitution of opposites (tad-anga nirodha); (3) extinction by cutting off of destruction (samuccheda nirodha), ie at the moment of attaining the Path; (4) extinction by tranquillization (paṭipassaddhi nirodha), ie at the moment of the fruition on the Supramundane Path; (5) extinction by escape or liberation (nissaraṇa nirodha), that is, the attainment of nirvana. (Pm 1:27, 220 f; Vism 410; cf Vism 693). These 5 are also called abandonment (pahāna), freedom (vimutti), solitude (viveka), detachment or dispassion (virāga) or letting go or relinquishing (vossagga).
tone of the Commentary here reflects that of a passage from the prophetic Cakka, vatti Siha, nađa Sutta (D 26), where it describes India (Jambu, dipa) of the future thus:

And in the time when those people have a lifespan of 80,000 years, this Jambu, dipa [Jambul9 Continent] will be powerful and prosperous, and villages, towns and cities will be but a cock’s flight from one to the next.

And in the time when those people have a lifespan of 80,000 years, this Jambu, dipa would be like the Aviçi hell, thick with people like the jungle is thick with reeds and rushes.

At that time, the Benares of today will be a royal city called Ketu, mati, powerful and prosperous, crowded with people and plenty. In Jambu, dipa there will be 84,000 cities headed by Ketu, mati as the royal capital.

The Mahā Sūñata Sutta opens with the Buddha noticing the crowded dormitories at Kāla Khemaka’s dwelling, how the beddings and resting places are placed so close together that they touch one another.

1.3.2 The Commentary gives this long dramatic account:10

Before this, it seems, the Blessed One had never before seen ten or twelve monks dwelling in one place. Then this occurred to him,

“This group-living [social life] (gaña, vāsa) is extremely common in the rounds of existence. As water collects into rivers, so group-living is common in hell, in the animal world, in the ghost realm, and in the asura existence; and in the human world, the heavenly world, and the Brahmā world, too.

For hell is 10,000 yojanas11 across and is crowded with beings, like powdered lead packed in a tube. There is no counting or reckoning the beings in the place of torture of by the fivefold bind-

---

9 The jambul is the black plum of India: see Kosala S 1 (A 10.29/5.59-65) @ SD 16.15 (3).


11 A yojana is the yoke of an Indian plough (J 6:38, 42). As distance, it is as far as can be covered by a yoke of oxen, ie, about 11.25 km or 7 mi (DhA 1:108, 2:13).
ing. There is no counting or reckoning the beings in the place of paring with adzes, etc. Such is the way they are cooked in groups.

As for the animal world—just as there is no counting or reckoning the termites in a single termite nest; and there is no counting or reckoning of ants in an ant-hill—even so, is the group-living in the animal world, too.

And there are ghost cities a quarter or half a yojana across crowded with ghosts. Such is group-living in the ghost realm, too.

The 10,000-yojana-wide sphere of the asura demons is like the hole in the ear just that a needle might go through. Such is group-living in the asura world, too.

As regards the human world, there are 5,700,000 in the families living in Sāvatthī; inside and outside Rājagaha, there are 1,800,000 people. Such is group-living in certain places in the world, too.

Beginning with the earth deities, there is group-living in the heavens and the Brahmā world, too. Each deva has two and a half crore of dancers, even up to nine crores. And there are ten thousand Brahmās living in one place.”

Then he thought, “For four incalculables and a hundred thousand aeons, the ten perfections have been fulfilled by me for the purpose of undoing group-living. As soon as those monks who formed themselves into groups and find delight in groups, they will act in an unbecoming manner, forming groups and delighting in them.”

Then, the feeling of concern for the Dharma arose in him, and he thought again, “If it were possible to announce a training rule that two monks should not live in one place I would do so, but that is not possible. Come now, let me expound the discourse called ‘The Practice of Great Emptiness’ (mahā suññatā paṭipatti nāma suttatām), which for training young men of family desirous of training, will be like a promulgated training rule.

It will be like a full-length looking-glass placed at the city gate. Then, just as kshatriyas [nobles] and so on, seeing their blemishes in the looking-glass, would get rid of them and become unblemished; even so, indeed, even for 5000 years after I have attained final nirvana, young men of families delighting in solitude, will act in an unbecoming manner, forming groups and delighting in them.”

And the number of young men of family who, by heeding this discourse and avoiding groups would, as it were fulfilling the Blessed One’s wish, have made an end of suffering and attained final nirvana is beyond reckoning.

For, in the Vălika,piṭṭhi monastery [in Sri Lanka], the Abhidhamma specialist named Abhaya Thera, after reciting this discourse together with a number of monks on the occasion of entering the rains residence, said: “The Fully Self-awakened One enjoins us to act thus, and what are we doing?” And all of them, by avoiding the group and delighting in solitude, attained arhathood within that same rains.

---

12 See Băla,paṇḍita S (M 129,10/3:166), SD 2.22 & Deva,duṭta S (M 130,10/3:182 f), SD 2.23.
13 See Băla,paṇḍita S (M 129,12/3:166), SD 2.22 & Deva,duṭta S (M 130,12/3:183), SD 2.23.
14 “The ten perfections” (dasa pāramitā) are a late canonical list of virtuous qualities said to lead to Buddhahood. These 10 qualities, occurring frequently in Buddha,vinasa (B 6 f, 11, 38, 62, 48), Cariyā,piṭṭaka (Cp 83, 102 f, 588), Jātakas (J 1:73, 6:546), Apadāna (Ap 5 f, 17, 23, 26, 28 f, 32, 37, 40, 43, 45, 48, 212, 309, 318, 325, 369, 411, 443, 551), & DhA 1:84, are: (1) generosity (dāna), (2) moral virtue (sīla), (3) renunciation (nekkhamma), (4) wisdom (paññā), (5) effort (vīrya), (6) patience (khanti), (7) truthfulness (saçca), (8) determination (adhīṭhāna), (9) lovingkindness (mettā), and (10) equanimity (upekkhā). On older usage of pāramitā as “completeness, perfection, highest state, see Sn 1018, 1020; Pug 70; VvA 2; PvA 139. Cf pārami-pattā (M 3:28 f; Nc 20, 435; Miln 21, 22). The Skt sources list 6 perfections (pāramitā), probably older: (1) generosity (dāna), (2) moral virtue (sīla), (3) patience (ksānti), (4) effort (vīrya), (5) concentration (samādhī) and (6) wisdom (prajñā). These were later also increased to 10 to complement the 10 stages (bhūmi) of a Bodhisattva’s career, with the additional perfections: (7) skillful means (upāya,kausalya), (8) resolution (prāṇidhāna), (9) strength (bala), and (10) spiritual knowledge (jīna). See BHSD: pāramitā for refs.
This discourse is called the breaker-up of groups (gaṇa, bhedanāṁ). (MA 4:155-157)

1.4 Benefit of Solitude

1.4.1 The Commentary goes at length to give examples where the seeker, when burdened with company, failed to attain his spiritual goal. The Bodhisatta Vipassī wandered for seven years with 84,000 renunciants but failed to find awakening; but wandering by himself, he attained his goal in seven days. Our Bodhisatta himself wandered with the 5 monks for 6 years, but only when they left him, did he win his goal (MA 4:159). One might here recall the story of Sāriputta and Moggallāna, who, during the hill-top festival (gir’agga samajjā), had a spiritual experience that led them to renounce the world to become Sañjaya’s pupils. But it was only after they went their separate ways that they finally met their true teachers in Assajī and the Buddha (V 1:40; J 1:85; DhA 2:84).

1.4.2 It is important to understand here that this teaching of spiritual solitude is not that of an anti-social hermitism, but rather that mental cultivation or meditation can only be effectively by oneself alone. In the quest mental focus leading to spiritual freedom, one has to journey alone. However, once one has won the goal, one may be with the crowd (for its benefit), but is never of the crowd. Furthermore, it should be said that when one is faced with the greatest of difficulties or with the height of true success, one will be inevitably by oneself. Only when one has stepped down from that pinnacle of pain or of triumph, that one finds oneself in the company of others again. One enters this world alone; one leaves it alone. One can only understand both in one’s aloneness.

1.4.3 The purpose of physical solitude is to train oneself in mental solitude (the wholesome state of not being carried away by worldliness). When one has some mastery of mental solitude, one depends less and less on physical solitude. One can then be alone in a crowd; one can be with the crowd, but not of the crowd. In other words, physical and mental solitude helps one cultivate mental calm and clarity.

1.4.4 Understandably some religions today discourage their followers against meditation, simply out of fear that the practitioner would discover the truths for themselves. As Sujato points out in his work, A History of Mindfulness,

Contemplation will always remain a threat to religious orthodoxy, since there is always the uncomfortable possibility that the truth a meditator sees may not agree with the truth that the books say they’re supposed to see. However[,] in Buddhism, unlike Christianity, the contemplative life lies at the very heart of the Founder’s message. (2004b:82)

1.4.5 This spiritual aloneness is most significantly stated in the Mahā, parinibbāna Sutta (D 16) and a number of other places, attesting to its importance:

Therefore, Ānanda, dwell with yourselves as islands, with yourselves as refuge, with no other refuge—dwell with the Dharma as an island, with the Dharma as refuge, with no other refuge. (D 16.2.26/2:100 f = 26.1/3:58, 26.27/77; S 22.43/3:42, 47.9/5:154, 47.13/5:163, 17.14/5:164)

The same sutta goes one to say that this statement refers to the practice of satipaṭṭhāna.¹⁵

1.5 Sainthood. The Mahā Suññata Sutta recount the 4 dhyanas [§8]—that is, right concentration—and how they lead on to streamwinning through the attaining of dhyanas up to the formless attainments, here called “the imperturbable” (āneñja) [§§9-10]. It is interesting here to note that the attainment of streamwinning has directly to do with moral virtue and mindfulness regarding the body [§11], that is, right mindfulness as satipaṭṭhāna, “focus of mindfulness.” The section on the path of once-returning deals with right speech [§12] and right thought [§13]. Non-returning is won with full understanding of the 5 cords of sensual pleasures (pañca, kāma, guna) and the total destruction of sense-desire, that is, a more refined level of right thought [§14-15]. And finally arhathood is attained with right view regarding the 5 aggregates of clinging (pañc upādāna-k, khandha) [§16], so that the conceit “I am” is overcome [§17], and so the whole spiritual path has been traversed [§18]: this is the fruit of right view.

¹⁵ See Satipaṭṭhāna S (M 10), SD 13.
1.6 Two Levels of Sense-Experience. The Buddha here distinguishes between two levels of sense-experience: that of “the 5 cords of sensual pleasure,” that is, the level of the worldling [§14], and that of “the 5 aggregates of clinging,” that is, the level of the practitioner [§16]. The 5 cords of sensual pleasure have a “binding” or “grasping” effect on one who enjoys them. The 5 aggregates of clinging, on the other hand, are natural states that arise and fall away moment to moment. If a practitioner watches this rise and fall, he would abandon the “I am” conceit, and as such be free from Māra’s grip.

1.7 Teacher-Pupil Relationship. Next follows the section on teacher-pupil relationship. The Buddha exhorts that a pupil should not look up to a teacher purely for his academic prowess, that is, proficiency in “the exposition of Suttas and Geyyā” since this is not the mark of his spiritual attainment. However, if the pupil has found a spiritually accomplished teacher, he should stay with that teacher “even if he is told to leave” [§20].

The Buddha goes on to warn of how the training of a teacher, of a pupil, and of a brahmachari can be undone [§21]. Their undoing (upaddava) is basically caused by too much socializing and reverting to luxury even if they lead solitary lives [§§22-24.1]: this undoing is the result of wrong livelihood. Of the three undoings, however, the Buddha deems the failure of the brahmachari, that is, of a Buddhist practitioner, as the most serious [§24.2]. The Commentary (MA 4:165) uses a simile: falling from training in a non-Buddhist system is like falling from the back of the donkey: one is, at worst, covered with dust; but falling from monastic training is like falling from the back of an elephant, that is, where one has freely taken up the rules of training but fails to keep to them.

1.8 Spiritual Friendship. The sutta closes with teachings on spiritual friendship, where the Buddha speaks on the teacher’s compassion in teaching the Dharma and the pupil’s proper attitude towards him [§§25-26]. This section is based on right effort.

The Potter Simile. The Buddha then makes an enigmatic declaration, “I shall not treat you as a potter treats raw damp clay,” but we have clear hints from his ensuing statements: “Restraining you again and again, I will admonish you, cleansing you again and again. The core that is strong will remain standing.” [§27]. A potter, we all know, shapes clay into various vessels and objects; but the Buddha does not shape anyone in this manner. The potter then fires his wares in a furnace: the Buddha, however, trains his disciples, who then shape themselves. When the firing is done, the potter (the Buddha) then carefully checks and tests each artifact for flaws and cracks, rejecting the flawed and cracked ones: what is rejected is the flaw, not the person. The Buddha points out his disciples’ weaknesses and flaws so that they can correct them for his own spiritual progress.

2 Three kinds of emptiness (practice)

2.1 The Mahā Suññāta Sutta teaches the perception of emptiness in three ways: inwardly (ajjhatta) [§§9a, 10a], outwardly (bahiddhā) [§§9b, 10b], and alternating both ways (ajjhatta,bahiddhā) [§§9c, 10c], or alternatively, of internal emptiness, of external emptiness, and both of them alternatively. Evidently, these practices do not fully fruit on their own, but are best done on emerging from dhyanas. The context is clear here, as they are placed immediately after the section of the dhyanas [§§7b-8d]. Let us first look at three attempts at translating these important passages.17

R C Chalmers (1927):
“He ponders on internal emptiness…external emptiness…both internal and external emptiness.”

(Further Dialogues of the Buddha, 1927 = M:C 2:218)

I B Horner (1959):
“He attends to an inward (concept of) emptiness…to an external (concept of) emptiness…to an inward and to an external (concept of) emptiness.”

(Middle Length Sayings, 1959 = M:H 3:155)

16 “Brahmachari,” brahma,cāri, i.e., one living a celibate holy life: see §21 n below.
17 For full refs here, see “Textual Conventions” in the Epilegomena.
2.2 All these translations are acceptable except in the case of Horner, where she has the amplification “concept of,” which as we have seen in the Cūḷa Suññata Sutta study.¹⁸ Both the Cūḷa Suññata Sutta (M 122) and the Mahā Suññata Sutta (M 121), it is vital to note, shows that the “emptiness” here is an exercise in the attending to what is absent and what is present that in due course leads to a direct experience of freedom.

2.3 The Commentary explains the phrase “abiding in emptiness internally” (ajjhattam suññatāraṇi...viharitumī) [§6], as meaning that it is as if one were alone, though sitting in the midst of company (MA 4:159). “Internally” refers to his one’s sense-spheres (gocar’ ajjhattam eva), or one’s own 5 aggregates (MA 1:161). Attending to emptiness externally (bahiddhā) refers to contemplating on the 5 aggregates in someone else. Bodhi notes,

The emtpiness spoken of here thus must be the temporary deliverance of mind through the insight contemplation of non-self, as explained at [Mahā Vedalla S, M 43,33/1:297 f]. When the insight into non-self is brought to the level of the path, it issues in the fruition experiencing Nibbāna by way of its aspects of emptiness. (M:NB 1334 n 1152, emphases added)

The sutta formulation includes the progression ajjhattam...bahiddhā...ajjhatta,bahiddhā, just as for all the 4 satipatthanās.¹⁹ This is not merely a mechanical process. Gethin explains that this repetition has to do with the blurring of distinction between self and other—something which is, of course, entirely consistent with the notion of not-self in Buddhists thought. Thus as the bhikkhu watches body, feelings, mind and dhammas within, without, within and without, rather than seeing a world made up of distinct ‘persons’ or ‘selves,’ he becomes progressively aware of a world of dhamma made up entirely of dhammas of all of which are ‘not-self.

(The Buddhist Path of Awakening, 2001:54 f)

2.4 Peter Skilling, in his comparative study of the early sutras, Mahāsūtras: The great discourses of the Buddha, has a very useful discussion on these threefold emptiness.²⁰ After noting the various modern English translations noted above, he adds, “When translating from the Tibetan, I render the terms as ‘inward emptiness,’ etc, in the hope that this gives at least a hint of the adverbial sense.” (1997:378)

2.5 The emptiness practice of the Mahā Suññata Sutta is presented as leading to the attainment of the imperturbable” [§§9.4, 10.4], that is, the fourth formless attainment. This stage of practice will be examined in the next section.

3 Kinds of freedom

3.1 THE IMPERTURBABLE (ĀNEṆJA). The Vinaya Commentary glosses āneñja as acala, “unshaking, steady” (VA 157). The words ānañja (BHS āniñjya), āņaņja, aneja, aneñja, aneņja, aneja, and āneņja are synonyms, with āṁjata (Ved ōjāte, ts) as the verb and āṁjita (ts) as the adjective.²¹ The adjective “im-

¹⁸ See SD 11.3(7).
¹⁹ See Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S (D 2:292 passim) & Satipaṭṭhāna S (M 10,5/1:56 passim), SD 10.1.
²¹ See CPD: ānañja; BHSD: āniñjya.
perturbable” (aniñjita) [§9.4] is an important canonical technical term describing the fourth dhyana and the four formless attainments (arūpa, samāpatti).\(^{22}\)

However, in the Sunakkhatta Sutta (M 105) and the Āneñja Sappāya Sutta (M 106), only the fourth dhyana and the two lower formless attainments are discussed as “the imperturbable,”\(^{23}\) the higher two attainments are discussed separately elsewhere.\(^{24}\) All the states below the fourth dhyana—the first three form dhyanas and lower mental states—are classified as “the perturbable” (iñjita). It is interesting to note that even the attaining of “the imperturbable” does not guarantee one’s attaining even of stream

The Mahā Suññata Sutta Commentary on §9.4 says of the Buddha: “Thinking, I will be freed both ways,”\(^{25}\) he attends to the formless attainment and imperturbability (āneñja, arūpa, samāpatti) (MA 4:161).

3.2 Temporary Freedom and Unconditional Freedom

3.2.1 The expression “freed both ways” (MA 4:161) [3.1] refers to the freedom of mind that is temporary and pleasant [desira] [1.2], or in the freedom of mind that is unconditioned [time-free] and unshakable [§4.1+2]. The former is freedom through the dhyanas and the formless attainments, the latter is the freedom through the supramundane paths and fruits. The Mahā Sārūpama Sutta (M 29) mentions one who goes forth out of faith, reflecting on the nature of suffering, and in due course attains the unconditional liberation (asamaya vimokkha) (M 29,6).\(^{26}\)

The “unconditional unshakable freedom of mind” (asāmāyikā akuppā ceto,vimutti) is the freedom from the defilements and that has nothing to do with the temporal, that is, unconditioned by time. As such, it is freedom that is immutable and supramundane. It consists of “the four noble paths and the four fruits of recluseship” (that is, the paths and fruits) (MA 4:159), which quoting the Pañjasambhidā, magga (Pm 2:40), adds nirvana.\(^{27}\)

3.3 The 2 Kinds of Freedom. More commonly, the two types of freedom are called the “freedom of mind and freedom by wisdom.” They are respectively ceto,vimutti (or, freedom by concentration) and paññā,vimutti (or, freedom by wisdom) (A 1:60). The one freed of mind has destroyed all the mental hindrances, and as such could attain dhyana at will. The one freed by wisdom “may not have reached the 8 liberations (vimokkha = jhāna) in his own body, but through seeing with wisdom, his mental influxes are destroyed” (M 70,16/1:478).

All arhats are perfectly freed in the same way from ignorance and suffering, but are distinguished into two types on the basis of their proficiency in concentration. Those who can attain the 8 liberations (attha,vimokkha), which include the four formless attainments and the attainment of cessation, are called freed both ways, that is, freed from the physical body by means of the formless dhyanas, and from all defilements by the path of arhathood.

Arhats like Sāriputta, Moggallāna, and Sālā are “freed both ways” (ubhato, bhāga, vimutta). The differences between the two types of freedom are given in the Mahā,nidāna Sutta (D 15)\(^ {28}\) and the Kīṭāgiri Sutta (M 70).\(^ {29}\)

4 The Buddha and visitors

4.1 Advice to Visitors. All the three versions of the Mahā Suññata Sutta recount how the Buddha treats his visitors by saying that he would instruct them with a mind bent on solitude. However, the Pali

\(^ {22}\) See Lātuukiombokama S (M 66,22-34/1:454-456), SD 28.11; also MA 3:171.
\(^ {24}\) See V 3:4; cf M 2:229 where wrong views regarding the imperturbable are discussed.
\(^ {25}\) That is, the freedom of mind that is temporary and pleasant [desirable], or in the freedom of mind that is not temporary [unconditioned by time] and unshakable [§4.2].
\(^ {26}\) M 29,6/1:197,27+28 (SD 53.8).
\(^ {27}\) See M:NB 1224 n348.
\(^ {28}\) D 15,35/2:70 f (SD 5.17); also D 3:262, 228; Vimokkha S, A 8.66/4:306; also M 120,37/3:103 (SD 3.4.37).
\(^ {29}\) M 70,16-17/1:477 f @ SD 11.1 (5.2(2A)).
version stand alone in mentioning “kings, the kings’ chief ministers, other religious teachers, the disciples of other religious teachers” [§6]. The relevant Pali passage reads:

Tatr’ Ānanda Tathāgato viveka, ninnen’ eva cittena viveka, poṇena viveka, pabbhārena vūpakat-thena nekkhamābhiratena vyanti, bhūtena sabbaso āsava-ṭ, thāniyehi dhammehiañī-d-attu uyyojaniya, paṭisānyuttaṁ y’ eva kathan kattā hoti.

Then, Ānanda, with a mind bent on solitude, leaning towards solitude, inclining towards solitude, mentally aloof (from distractions), delighting in letting-go of sense delights, and totally done with things that are the bases for mental influxes,

he is one who only speaks in connection with rousing them in the wholesome (and then dismissing them).

(M 122,6.2/3:111 ≠ A 4:233)

4.2 Uyyojeti
4.2.1 In the last section—añña-d-attu uyyojaniya, paṭisānyuttaṁ y’ eva katham kattā hoti—the word uyyojaniya can be rendered in two ways: (1) to inspire, incite [§4.3] and (2) to dismiss. [31] The Commentary reading, uyyojanika, paṭisānyuttain, explains that, in saying, “You may go!” the expression is thus connected with words of dismissal, uyyojanikena vacanena. The Commentary continues:

When the Blessed One, after a meal, having lain down (to rest) and then risen…went into the attainment of the fruits. At that time, the company assembled to hear the Dharma. The Blessed One…taught Dhamma, and without letting pass the right time (to hear it), he viveka, ninnen citena, parisaṁ uyyojeti.

(MA 4:160)

4.2.2 The Pali phrase here could be rendered in either of two ways: (1) “he inspired (them) with a mind bent on solitude,” or (2) “he dismissed (them) with a mind bent of solitude.” The verb uyyojeti itself is ambiguous, and according to I B Horner could mean either: with his mind tending to aloofness he dismissed the company; or: with his mind tending to aloofness he inspired the company… It is possible that uyyojeti should be understood in both its meanings: that the Lord incited the company to seek aloofness for themselves and also dismissed them in order that they might do so. If we were to take uyyojeti only as ‘he dismisses,’ this would imply a certain selfishness on the Lord’s part, and the AA (4:122) is apparently against this: tesaṁ upaṭṭhāna, gamanakāmi yevā ti attho, the meaning is going to their service (ie helping them).

(M:H 3:154 n8)

4.2.3 Horner goes on to point out that the phrase añña-d-attu uyyojaniya, paṭisānyuttaṁ y’ eva katham kattā hoti also occurs in the (Mahā, purisa, vitakka) Anuruddha Sutta (A 8.30), where the Commentary gives a different explanation, saying that the phrase uyyojaniya, paṭisānyuttaṁ, kathā refers to talk that is going to be of support for the listeners (tesaṁ upaṭṭhāna, gamanakāmi, AA 4:122). This alternative rendition, notes Analayo,


[32] Uyyojeti (Skt ud-yojayati) is caus of uyuyijati (he goes away; makes effort, is active). SED: ud-vyuj defines udyojaya (caus) only as “to excite, incite, make active or quick, stimulate to exertion.” BHSD however gives both meanings: (1) he dismisses (Sikś 56.2), and (2) Tib brtson par hyur = (to be) made zealous. Edgerton (BHSD) also shows that the meaning depends on the context (p132). See also CPD: uyyojeti; DP: uyyojana; PED: uyyojeti.


[34] E M Hare renders this as “(he) entirely confines his talk to the subject of going apart” (A:H 4:158).

[35] Ie the famous discourse in “the 8 thoughts of the great man,” A 8.30.21/4:233,33. See SD 5.18 (5).
based on the meaning of uyyojeti as “inciting,” finds support in the Chinese and Tibetan parallels to M 122, as according to MĀ 191, on such occasions, the Buddha would “speak Dharma to advise and help visitors, 說說勸助, and according to the Tibetan version in Skilling 1994: 202, the Buddha would “exchange pleasant words” with the visitors and “proceed to give them a discourse on the Dhamma” [Analayo’s tr], phan tshun kun dga’ bar gtam ’dre bar smra, phebs par smra zhih chos kyi gtam yang zer ro. This is in fact what one would expect, since the Buddha to talk to others with the intention of dismissing could seem to be, as Horner 1959:155 n8 remarks, “a certain selfishness” on his part. (Analayo 2005 ad M 3:112 n; citations normalized)

4.3 STAGES IN TEACHING. A number of suttas report that the Buddha or Ānanda or a teacher as “having instructed (sandassetvā), inspired (samādapetvā), roused (samuṭṭejetvā) and gladdened (sampahanisetvā)... with a Dharma talk.” This action sequence reflects the basic structure of the Buddha’s teaching method: (1) the Dharma is shown; (2) the listeners are enthused; (3) they are fired with commitment and action; and (4) filled with joy. (This sequence can, of course, also be applied to an individual listener.)

The Commentaries explain that by instructing, the Buddha dispels the listener’s delusion; by inspiring him, heedlessness is dispelled; by rousing him, indolence is dispelled; and by gladdening, brings the practice to a conclusion. In short, when we teach Dharma to benefit others, we should do our best to bring instruction, inspiration, motivation and joy to the listener. These four qualities are, in fact, the sixth or last of the ideal skills of a Dharma speaker. Clearly here we see the Buddha far from dismissing his audience, but instructing them on the spiritual path.

However, the context of the Mahā Suññata Sutta is clear: it is about emptiness and solitude for the sake of personal development. Reflecting on the dual meaning of the word uyyojeti [4.2], as used in the Suttas, we can surmise, as Horner suggests, that here the Buddha both inspires his audience and also dismisses them in due course, so that the Dharma session does turn into a socializing session, but to spur one on for spiritual practice and realization. I have applied both these senses in my translation.

5 Related suttas

5.1 The Mahā Suññata Sutta should be studied together with the Cūja Suññata Sutta (M 121) which opens with a mention of the Buddha’s own “abiding in emptiness” (suññatā, vihāra) (M 121.3/3:104), and goes on to elaborate the “truly real, undistorted, utterly pure descent into emptiness.” Choong Munkeat makes a useful observation on the relationship between the Cūja Suññata Sutta (M 121) and the Mahā Suññata Sutta (M 122), that in M 121 “the practice proceeds vertically, step by step...through the fading away of...perception in the process of practising emptiness” up to the apex of emptiness in the destruction of the influxes. M 122, however, “proceeds horizontally from inner to outer.” (1999:83)

5.2 The sutta should be studied with the Laṭṭikikōpama Sutta (M 66/1:447-456), especially M 66.17-34. In fact, §§30-34 elaborate on the various “imperturbable” states, that is, the formless states. The Laṭṭikikōpama Sutta Commentary gives detailed explanations of a number of important terms common to both suttas.

5.3 The section of “Teacher & Pupil” (especially §§19-24) should be studied with the Lohicca Sutta (D 12), where it is stated that wrong view leads one to one of two destinies: the hells or the animal kingdom. The sutta further mentions four kinds of teachers: the first three are false teachers, only the fourth is an accomplished one:

http://dharmafarer.org
(1) A teacher who is not accomplished in spiritual training; his pupils do not wish to listen to him.
(2) A teacher who is not accomplished in spiritual training; his pupils listen to him.
(3) A teacher who is accomplished in spiritual training; his pupils do not wish to listen to him.
(4) A teacher who is accomplished in spiritual training; his pupils listen to him.

The Greater Discourse on Emptiness

M 122

1. Thus have I heard.
At one time the Blessed One was staying among the Sakyas in Nigrodha’s Park near Kapila, vattthu.

The crowded lodgings

2. Then, the Blessed One, having dressed himself in the morning and taking robe and bowl, entered Kapila, vattthu for alms.

Then the Blessed One, having gone into Kapila, vattthu for alms, having returned from the almsround and finished his meal, went to the dwelling of Kāla Khemaka the Sakya for his midday rest.

Now, at that time, there were many lodgings prepared in the dwelling of Kāla Khemaka the Sakya. Having seen that there were many lodgings prepared in the dwelling of Kāla Khemaka the Sakya, the Blessed One thought:

“There are many lodgings prepared in the dwelling of Kāla Khemaka the Sakya. Do so many monks stay here?”

2.2 Now at that time, the venerable Ānanda, along with many monks, were busy making robes in the dwelling of Ghaṭāya the Sakya.

Then, the Blessed One, after rising from his retreat, went to Ghaṭāya the Sakya’s dwelling, and sat down on the prepared seat. Seated thus, the Blessed One addressed the venerable Ānanda:

“Ānanda, there are many lodgings prepared in the dwelling of Kāla Khemaka the Sakya. Do so many monks stay here?”

42 Comy on Cūla Dukkha-khandha S (M 14) says that Nigrodha was a Sakya. He came to Kapilavatthu and made a dwelling for the Buddha in his own park, and presented it to him (MA 2:61).

43 Khemaka was his name, and had a dark complexion (kālu) (MA 4:155).

44 “Lodgings” (senāsana). They were of various kinds, such as beds, stools, bolsters and pillows [Horner “mattresses”], straw mats, strips of hide, grass, leaves, branches, all laid out…touching one another; for this is where groups of monks were staying (mañco piṭhaṁ bhisi, bimbohanaṁ taṭṭikā camma, khaṇḍo tiṇa, santhāro paṇḍa, santhāro palāla, santhāro ti-ādīni paṇṇattānī honti…āhacca ḫapitāṇi, gaṇa, bhikkhunaṁ vasana-ṭ, thāṇa, sadisaiṁ ahosi, MA 4:155).

45 “The venerable Ānanda…making robes,” āyasmā Ānanda sambahulehi bhikkhūhi saddhiṁ…cīvara, kammaṁ karoti. Here the verb is in the singular; but the English tr dictates a pl verb.

46 Ghaṭāya. This is the only place it is mentioned. Nānamoli/Bodhi take his name as Ghaṭā, but the reading is the cpd Ghaṭāya, sakkassa, as followed by IB Horner (M:H 3:153) & Malalasekera (DPPN). Like Kāla Khemaka’s dwelling, Ghaṭāya’s was also built in Nigrodha’s Park monastery (MA 4:157). See Skilling 1997:372 for a discussion.

47 Comy explains that this is merely a rhetorical question, since the Buddhhas can know by direct knowledge whatever they wish to know. The Buddha asks this with the thought: “As soon as these monks form into a group and delight in the group, they will act improperly. I shall expound the discourse called the practice of great emptiness (mahā, suṇātā, paṭipattim nāma suttantaṁ) which, like a city gate or like a mirror for the whole body, will be like a training-rule for those noble youths who delight in training.” (MA 4:156). All the versions agree on this: that a large
Wrong livelihood: Where a monk shines not

3 “Ānanda, a monk does not shine [is not beautiful] who delights in company, who enjoys company, who is devoted to delighting in company; who delights in the group, who enjoys the group, devoted to delighting in the group.

3.2 Indeed, Ānanda, for a monk who delights in company, who enjoys company, who is devoted to delighting in company; who delights in the group, who enjoys the group, devoted to delighting in the group, it is not possible that he would attain, at will, without difficulty, the joy of letting-go of sense-pleasures, the joy of solitude, the joy of peace.

3.3 But, Ānanda, for a monk who lives alone, away from company, who is expected that he would attain, at will, without difficulty, the joy of letting-go of sense-pleasures, the joy of solitude, the joy of peace, the joy of self-awakening — this is possible.
4 Indeed, Ānanda, for a monk who delights in company, who enjoys company, who is devoted to delighting in company; who delights in the group, who enjoys the group, devoted to delighting in the group,
it is not possible he would ever attain and abide in either the freedom of mind that is temporary and pleasant [desirable],\(^{57}\) or in the freedom of mind that is unconditioned [time-free] and unshakable.\(^{58}\)

4.2 TWO KINDS OF FREEDOM. But, Ānanda, for a monk who lives alone, away from company, it is expected that he would attain and abide either in [I11] the freedom of mind that is temporary and pleasant [desirable], or in the freedom of mind that is unconditioned and unshakable.\(^{59}\)

Right mindfulness: The true nature of form

5 Ānanda, I do not see a single form,\(^{60}\) from the change and alteration of which there would not arise sorrow, lamentation, (physical) pain, (mental) displeasure, and despair in one who lusts for it and delights in it.

6 THE BUDDHA’S OWN ABIDING IN EMPTINESS. However, Ānanda, there is this abode awakened to by the Tathagata [Thus Come],\(^{61}\) namely, that having attained and abiding in emptiness internally [in the inner emptiness]\(^{62}\) by not attending to any meditation sign.\(^{63}\)

6.2 Now, Ānanda, if while the Tathagata is abiding in this manner, he is visited by monks, nuns, laymen, laywomen, kings, the kings’ chief ministers, other religious teachers, the disciples of other religious teachers,

then, Ānanda, with a mind bent on solitude, leaning towards solitude, inclining towards solitude, mentally aloof (from distractions), delighting in letting-go of sense delights, and totally done with things that are the bases for mental influxes,\(^{64}\)

he is one who only speaks in connection with rousing them to in the wholesome (and then dismissing them).\(^{65}\)

\(^{57}\) “The freedom of mind that is temporary and pleasant” (sāmāyikā kantā ceto.vimutti). The concentrated mind is free from the defilements. Comy qū Pm 2:40 says that this temporary freedom consists in the attainment of the 4 dhyanas and the 4 formless spheres (MA 4:158). See Mahā Sārōpama S (M 29.6/1:196 f; M:H 1:243).

\(^{58}\) “The freedom of mind...unshakable,” sāmāyikaṁ vā kantāṁ ceto.vimuttiṁ upasampajja viharissati asāmāyikaṁ vā akuppān ti. The former is temporary freedom through the dhyanas and the formless attainments, the latter is unshakable freedom through the supramundane paths and fruits. Mahā Sārōpama S (M 29) mentions one who goes forth out of faith, reflecting on the nature of suffering, and in due course he attains the unconditional liberation (asamaya vimokkha) (M 29.6/1:196). See foll n.

\(^{59}\) Asāmāyikā akuppā ceto.vimutti. This is freedom from the defilements and that has nothing to do with the temporal, ie unconditioned by time. As such, it is freedom that is immovable and supramundane. It consists of “the 4 noble paths and the 4 fruits of recluseship” (ie the paths and fruits) (MA 4:159), qu Pm 2:40 where nirvana is added.

\(^{60}\) Comy glosses with “body” (sarīra) (MA 4:159). See prec n.

\(^{61}\) Comy: The Buddha begins with this passage to prevent any criticism that while he enjoins his disciples to live as a recluse, as a mendicant, and as a hermit, he himself is often surrounded by a large retinue. “Emptiness” here refers to the fruition attainment of emptiness. Cūḷa Suññata S (M 121) opens with a mention of the Buddha’s own “abiding in emptiness” (suññatā, vihāra) (M 121.3/3:104), and where this section is elaborated.

\(^{62}\) “Abiding in emptiness internally” (ajjhattā suññatam...vihāroti), ie, he is as if alone, though sitting in the midst of company (MA 4:159). Cf §9.1. See (2).

\(^{63}\) The Buddha alludes to this in Mahā Sacceka S (M 36.45.3), SD 49.4.

\(^{64}\) “Mental influxes,” āsava. The term āsava (lit “inflow, outflow”) comes from ā-savati “flows towards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously translated as influxes, taints (“deadly taints”, RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, bad (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists four āsava: the influx of (1) sense-desire (kāmāsava), (2) desire for eternal existence (bhavāsava), (3) wrong views (ditthāsava), (4) ignorance (avijjāsava) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These four are also known as “floods” (oghah) and “yokes” (yogah). The list of three influxes (omitting the influx of views) [43] is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63).

The destruction of these āsavas is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict: āsava.
Therefore, Ānanda, if a monk were to wish: ‘May I attain and abide in emptiness within [the inner emptiness],’ then, Ānanda, he should steady his mind internally, quiet it down, make it one-pointed, concentrate it.  

Right concentration: The 4 dhyanas

7.2 And how, Ānanda, does the monk steady his mind internally, quiet it down, make it one-pointed, concentrate it?

8 Here, Ānanda, the monk, having abandoned the 5 mental hindrances, imperfections of the mind that weaken wisdom, quite detached from sensual pleasures, detached from unwholesome mental states, enters and dwells in the first dhyana, accompanied by initial application (vitakka) and sustained application (vicāra), accompanied by zest (pīti) and happiness (sukha), born of solitude [ie samādhi]. He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the zest and happiness born of solitude.

8.2 Furthermore, Ānanda, the monk, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, enters and dwells in the second dhyana, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration. He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the zest and happiness born of concentration.

8.3 And furthermore, Ānanda, the monk, with the fading away of zest, remains equanimous, mindful and clearly comprehending, and experiences happiness with the body. He enters and dwells in the third dhyana, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’ He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the happiness free from zest.

8.4 And furthermore, Ānanda, the monk, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain, and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure, attains and dwells in the fourth dhyana that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.

This is how, Ānanda, the monk steadies his mind internally, quiets it down, brings it to one-pointedness, concentrates it.  

65 Ṭatā’ Ānanda Tathāgato viveka, ninnen’eva citta ma viveka, pabhārena vipokatekha nekkham-mābhirente vyanti, bhūtena sabbhā sāsana-ā thāniyēhi dhammehi añña-d-a-tthu uyyojaniya, puttisaṃyuttaṁ y’eva kathaṁ kattā hoti (M 3:11 = A 8.30/4:233 @ SD 19.5). On the difficulty of this passage, see (4).

66 “Then, Ānanda…(should) concentrate it,” ten’ Ānanda bhikkhunā ajjhattam eva citta. sanjhapetabbaṁ sannisañcetam abbotabbaṁ ekodikatabbam samādahātabbam. This latter sentence very similar to the one in Dvedhā, vitakka S (M 19.10/1:116) & A 2:94.

67 “The 5 mental hindrances,” pañca, nīvaraṇā, are: (1) sensual lust (kāma-c. chanda); (2) ill will (vīrpāda); (3) sloth and torpor (thīna, middha); (4) restlessness and remorse (uddhacca, kukkuca); (5) doubt (vicīkicchā) (A 3:62; Vbh 378). For detailed study, see Pañca, nīvaraṇā: the 5 mental hindrances, SD 32.1 + SD 32; also (Nīvaraṇā) Saṅgārava S (S 46.55), SD 3.12 & Anivaraṇa S (S 46.38b), SD 2.2(5).

68 “That weaken wisdom,” paññāya dubbali, karāne. Since the mental hindrances prevent one from seeing the truth and weaken one’s wisdom, they have to be overcome.

69 The 2nd dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (ariya, tuṇhi, bhāva) because within it initial application and sustained application (thinking and discursion, vitakka, vicāra) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur (S 2:273); cf. S 4:293 where vitakka and vicāra are called verbal formation (vacī, sankhāra), the mental factors responsible for speech. In Aria, pariyesana S (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate).

70 “Joy…pain,” sukha-dukkha: this refers to the physical feelings. The next phrase—“pleasure and displeasure,” domanassa-somanassa—refers to mental feelings, which have been transcended earlier. Mental feelings need to be overcome first so that the mind is not distracted by itself, as it were. Then, all the other feelings (arising from the physical sense-contacts) are transcended. On the significance of this, see Sall’attathena S (S 36.64/4:207-210), SD 5.5.

71 Here, Vibhanga gives 3 factors of the 4th dhyana—equanimity (upekkha), mindfulness (sati) and one-pointedness of mind (cittassa ek’agata)—according to the Sutta analysis (Vbh 261), and 2 factors—equanimity and one-pointedness of the mind—according to the Abhidhamma analysis (Vbh 164; Vism 4.183/165). See Dhyana, SD 8.4 (5.4).
THE PATH TO STREAMWINNING

Wrong concentration: Attending to emptiness and the imperturbable

9 He attends to **emptiness internally**. While he attends to emptiness internally, his mind does not rejoice in [does not plunge into] the emptiness internally, nor does he brighten up with faith, nor is he mentally steadied, nor is he freed.

When it is thus, Ānanda, the monk knows thus:

‘Indeed, while I attended to emptiness internally, my mind did not rejoice in [did not plunge into] the emptiness internally, nor did I brighten up with faith, nor was I mentally steadied, nor was I freed.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

9.2 He attends to **emptiness externally**. While he attends to emptiness externally, his mind does not rejoice in [does not plunge into] emptiness externally, nor does he brighten up with faith, nor is he mentally steadied, nor is he freed.

When this is the case, Ānanda, the monk knows thus:

‘Indeed, while I attended to emptiness externally, my mind did not rejoice in [did not plunge into] emptiness externally, nor did I brighten up with faith, nor was I mentally steadied, nor was I freed.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

9.3 He attends to **emptiness internally and externally**. While he attends to emptiness internally and externally, his mind does not rejoice in [does not plunge into] emptiness internally and externally, nor does he brighten up with faith, nor is he mentally steadied, nor is he freed.

When this is the case, Ānanda, the monk knows thus:

‘Indeed, while I attended to emptiness internally and externally, my mind did not rejoice in [did not plunge into] emptiness externally and internally, nor did I brighten up with faith, nor was I mentally steadied, nor was I freed.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

9.4 He attends to **the imperturbable**. While he attends to the imperturbable, his mind does not rejoice in [does not plunge into] the imperturbable, nor does he brighten up with faith, nor is he mentally steadied, nor is he freed.

When this is the case, Ānanda, the monk knows thus:

‘Indeed, while I attended to the imperturbable, my mind did not rejoice in [did not plunge into] the imperturbable, nor did I brighten up with faith, nor was I mentally steadied, nor was I freed.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

Right concentration: Freedom through emptiness and the imperturbable

10 Then, Ānanda, that monk should steady his mind internally, quiet it down, make it one-pointed, concentrate it on that same concentration sign as before.77

---

72 See Intro (1.5).
73 “Internally,” i.e., to his own sense-spheres (gocar’ajjhattam eva), or his own 5 aggregates (MA 1:161). See §6 & n above. See also Intro (2).
74 That is, to the 5 aggregates of another person (MA 4:161).
75 That is, sometimes to himself, sometimes to another (MA 1:161). This “internal/external/internal-external” pattern is also found in connection with mindfulness practice in Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S (D 2:292 passim) & Satipaṭṭhāna S (M 10.5/1:56 passim). See SD 10.1 (5). See §9a n above.
76 “The imperturbable,” ānežja or ānāžja, i.e., the 4th formless attainment. Comy says of the Buddha, “Thinking, I will become free both ways,” he attends to the formless attainment and imperturbability, ānežja,arūpa,samāpatti (MA 4:161). See Intro (3a).
77 Comy: This refers to the dhyana that was used as the basis for insight. If, after emerging from the basic dhyana, his mind does not enter into emptiness through insight contemplation on his own aggregates or those of others, and he also cannot attain the imperturbably formless attainment, he should return and attend to it again and again. (MA 4:161).
He attends to **emptiness** internally. While he attends to emptiness internally, his mind rejoices in [plunges into] the emptiness internally, he brightens with faith, he is mentally steadied, he is freed.

When it is thus, Ānanda, the monk knows thus:

‘Indeed, while I attended to emptiness internally, my mind rejoiced in [plunged into] the emptiness internally, I brightened with faith, I was mentally steadied, I was freed.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends of them.

10.2 He attends to **emptiness** externally. While he attends to emptiness externally, his mind rejoices in [plunges into] emptiness externally, he brightens with faith, he is mentally steadied, he is freed.

When this is the case, Ānanda, the monk knows thus:

‘Indeed, while I attended to emptiness externally, my mind rejoiced in [plunged into] emptiness externally, I brightened with faith, I was mentally steadied, I was freed.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

10.3 He attends to **emptiness** internally and externally. While he attends to emptiness internally and externally, his mind rejoices in [plunges into] emptiness internally and externally, he brightens with faith, he is mentally steadied, he is freed.

When this is the case, Ānanda, the monk knows thus:

‘Indeed, while I attended to emptiness internally and externally, my mind rejoiced in [plunged into] emptiness externally, I brightened with faith, I was mentally steadied, I was freed.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

10.4 He attends to the **imperturbable**. While he attends to the imperturbable, his mind rejoices in [plunges into] the imperturbable, he brightens with faith, he is mentally steadied, he is freed.

When this is the case, Ānanda, the monk knows thus:

‘Indeed, while I attended to the imperturbable, my mind rejoiced in [plunged into] the imperturbable, I brightened up with faith, I was mentally steadied, I was freed.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

### Right mindfulness: Minding the 4 postures

11 Ānanda, that monk abides thus, when his mind is inclined to walking, he walks, thinking: ‘While I am walking thus, neither covetousness nor displeasure, neither bad nor unwholesome states, [113] will overpower me.’

---

78 This whole section expands on the mindfulness of the 4 postures briefly stated in *Satipaṭṭhāna Sūtra* (D 22.3/-2:292 @ M10.6/1:56 f), SD 13.

79 “Covetousness and displeasure,” *abhijjā, domanassā*, which Walshe (1995:335 & n632) renders as “hankering and fretting for the world”; alt tr “longing and displeasure” or “longing and loathing.” MA says that covetousness and displeasure signify the first two hindrances—that is, sensual desire and ill will—principal hindrances to be overcome for the practice to succeed. They thus represent the contemplation of mind-objects, which begins with the 5 hindrances. Cf M 1:274/39.13; see also *Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna Sūtra* (D 22.13) and *Satipaṭṭhāna Sūtra* (M 10.36) on how to deal with the hindrances in one’s meditation. The monk effects the abandoning of the hindrances by the contemplations of impermanence, fading away (of lust), cessation (of suffering) and letting go (of defilements), and thus comes to look upon the object with equanimity. On *abhijjā, domanassā*, there is an interesting related passage from *Pubba or Pubbēva Sambodha Sūtra*: “Monks, before my awakening, when I was still a bodhisatta, this thought occurred to me…’Whatever physical and mental joy (*sukha, somanassa*) there is in the world, that is the gratification (*assāda*) in the world; that the world is impermanent, suffering and of the nature to change, that is the wretchedness (*ādīnava*) in the world—the removal and abandoning of desire and lust for the world, that is the escape from the world.’” (A 1:258/3.101, pointed out to me by Robert Ed Dixon). My understanding here regarding the naming of the first two mental hindrances as *abhijjā, domanassā* is to show that with their elimination the other hindrances are eliminated, too—a view confirmed by Ajahn Brahmavamso (30 March 2003). This is further confirmed by the Comys: “But here since taking *abhijjā* includes kāma-c, chanda, and taking *domanassā* includes vyāpāda, therefore it should be understood that the abandoning of the hindrances is spoken of by indicating the pair that is strong among those items that make up the hindrances” (DA 3:759 = MA 1:244 = VbhA 220). Here Gethin adds a parenthetical note: “The
In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

11.2 Ānanda, that monk abides thus, when his mind is inclined to standing, he stands, thinking:
‘While I am standing thus, neither covetousness nor displeasure, neither bad nor unwholesome states, will overpower me.’

11.3 Ānanda, that monk abides thus, when his mind is inclined to sitting down, he sits down, thinking:
‘While I am sitting down thus, neither covetousness nor displeasure, neither bad nor unwholesome states, will overpower me.’

11.4 Ānanda, that monk abides thus, when his mind is inclined to lying down, he lies down, thinking:
‘While I am lying down thus, neither covetousness nor displeasure, neither bad nor unwholesome states, will overpower me.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

12 But, Ānanda, he resolves:
THE TEN BASES OF DISCOURSE.
‘Such talk, Ānanda, concerning austerity [effacement], conducing as a support for mind’s release, and that leads to complete disillusionment, to fading away of lust, to ending of suffering, to inner peace, to higher knowledge, to self-awareness, to nirvana; that is to say, to self, to dis,

Right speech

12 Ānanda, for that monk abides thus, when his mind is inclined to talking, he resolves:

ANIMAL TALK. ‘Such chatter that is low, vulgar, coarse, ignoble, not beneficial, and that does not lead to disillusionment, to fading away [of lust], to ending [of suffering], to inner peace, to higher knowledge, to self-awareness, to nirvana; that is to say, talk about kings, robbers, ministers of state, armies, danger, and wars [battles], about food and drink, about clothing, beds [furniture], garlands and scents, about relatives, about vehicles, about villages, towns, cities, and the countryside, about women and men, [D 1:8] gossip [of the street and at the well], tales of diversity [philosophical discussions of the past and future], talk about the creation of the world and of the sea, and talk of whether things exist or not [or, talk about gain and loss]—I shall not utter such talk.’

12.2 But, Ānanda, he resolves:

THE TEN BASES OF DISCOURSE. ‘Such talk, Ānanda, concerning austerity [effacement], conducing as a support for mind’s release, and that leads to complete disillusionment, to fading away of lust, to ending of suffering, to inner peace, to higher knowledge, to self-awareness, to nirvana; that is to say, taking of domanassa includes vyāpāda because all cittā [rooted in aversion] is accompanied by unpleasant mental feeling.” (2001:49 f & n95).

80 “Fully aware,” ie, to this meditation exercise (kamma-[t,thāna) (MA 4:162).

81 See Intro (1.5).

82 Although unstated, this is tiracchāna,kathā, or “animal talk,” as animals mostly walk parallel to the ground, so this kind of talk does not lead on upwards. On destiny of wrong views, see Lohicca S (D 12.10/1:228). See V 1:188; D 1:7 f, 178, 3:36; M 1:113, 513, 2:1, 23; S 5:419; A 5:128; also D:RD 3:33; S:W 5:355; A:W 5:86. At DA 89, gehasita,kathā (householder talk) is grouped with tiracchāna,kathā. See Pācittiya 85 where the group of 6 monks indulged in such talk (V 4:163); see V:H 3:82 nn.

83 Virāga also “fading away of lust” or “dispassion” (see §21).

84 Nirodha (see §21).

85 Iti, bhavābhava,kathā, may be rendered as “being and non-being” or as “profit and loss,” but according to Walshe, the philosophical sense (as in Horner and Nāṇamoli translations of Sandaka S, M 76) is preferable.

86 These dasa kathā, vattu are listed in Rathaa,vinnīta S (M 24.2.3/1:145); Mahā Suññata S (M 122.12/3:113); Kosala S 2 (S 10.30.9/5:67); Vattu Kathā S 1 (A 10.49/5:129). In Mahā Suññata S (M 122), this list is preceded by the stock, “Such talk concerning austerity [effacement], conducing as a support for mind’s release, and that leads to complete disillusionment, to fading away of lust, to ending of suffering, to inner peace, to higher knowledge, to self-awareness, to nirvana; that is to say,...” (WT Yā ca kho ayam, ānanda, kathā abhisallekkhikā ceto,vinīvaraṇa,sappāyā [Ce Se Ke ceto, vicārāṇ, asappāyā; Ee ceto, vivaraṇa, sappāyā] ekantaniibidāya virāgaya nirodāya
(1) talk about wanting little,
(2) talk about contentment,
(3) talk about solitude,
(4) talk about aloofness from company,
(5) talk about arousing effort,
(6) talk about moral virtue,
(7) talk about mental concentration,
(8) talk about wisdom,
(9) talk about freedom,
(10) talk about the knowledge and vision of freedom—

I shall utter such talk.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

Right intention

13 Ānanda, for that monk abides thus, [114] when his mind is inclined to thinking, he resolves:

‘Such thought that is low, vulgar, coarse, ignoble, not beneficial, and that does not lead to disillusionment, to fading away [of lust], to ending [of suffering], to nirvana, that is to say, thoughts of sense-desire, thoughts of ill will, thoughts of cruelty—I shall not think such thoughts.

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

13.2 But, Ānanda, he resolves:

‘Such thoughts that are noble and leading onward (to nirvana), that lead the one who practises thus to the utter destruction of suffering, [88] that is to say, thoughts of letting-go of sense-pleasures, thoughts of non-ill will, thoughts of non-violence—I shall think such thoughts.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

THE PATH TO NON-RETURNING

The 5 cords of sensual pleasure

14 Ānanda, there are these 5 cords of sensual pleasure.[89] What are the five?[90]

upasamāya abhiññāya sambodhāya nibbānāya saṃvattati, seyyathidaṃ) (M 122.12/3:113), SD 11.4. Cf (Sāriputta) Susima S (S 2.29/1:63). Some of these qualities are mentioned separately, eg Jīna S (S 16.5) says that this passage constitutes Mahā Kassapa’s lion-roar regarding his forest-dwelling (S 16.5/2:202); so too in Mahā Gosīṇa S (M 32), he describes the ideal monk in the same terms: Piṇḍola S (U 4.6/42 f); Vaṅganta,putta Upasena Tha (Tha 581).

87 These are the 10 topics of talk (kathā, vaṭṭhī) conducive to spiritual growth and awakening, viz: app’icchā,- kathā, santuṭṭhi,kathā, paviveka,kathā, asaṃsagga,kathā, viriy’ārmbha,kathā, sīla,kathā, samādhi,kathā, pañña,- kathā, vimutti,kathā, vimutti, nāṇa,dassana,kathā (M 1:145, 3:113; A 5:129).

88 “That lead…to the utter destruction of suffering,” niyanti (niyyāti) tak,karassa samādā,dukkha-k,khayāya, is stock (M 1:68, 81, 322, etc). Horner suggests that takkarassa (of one doing thus) “would be better rendered as ‘thinker’.” (M:H 3:157 n4).

89 Comy: Up to this point, the Buddha has shown the training for the attainment of the first 2 paths, those of streamwinning and once-returning. He now speaks these passages [14-15] to point out the insight needed to attain to the path of non-returning (anāgāmī,maggā) that culminates in the abandoning of sense-desire. (MA 4:163)

90 §14 is stock = Mahā Dukkha-k,khandha S (M 13.8/1:85 f) = Cūja Dukkha-k,khandha S (M 14.7/1:92) = Araṇa,vibhaṅga S (M 139.9/3:234). The word kāma (sense-desire) is also tr as “sensual pleasure” and may refer to either the subjective defilement (kilesa) or the object of desire (vaṭṭhī) (Nm 1.1, Vbh 256, DhsA 62; cf A 3:410 f).

“5 cords of sensual pleasure” (pañca kāma, guṇa), so called because they are the objects of the 5 physical senses (V 1:3, 17, 225, 293, 3:111; D 1:172, 2:243, 245, 3:60, 238; M 1:47, 85, 3:234; S 1:9, 132; A 3:411; Dh 48, 415; Sn 436; Tha 254; J 3:466, 4:172, 173, 469, 6:127; Ap 547; Nm 1; Vbh 256; Mvst 3.417,2; MA 1:199, 131, 2:261). They are also the qualities of desire, ie, that which brings pleasure to the senses, or desirable sense-experience, as listed in the passage here. They are “cords” (guṇa) because they bind one to them, and they “multiply” (guṇa) themselves as

http://dharmafarer.org
(1) Forms cognizable by the eye that are wished for, desirable, agreeable and pleasing, connected with sense-desire, arousing lust.
(2) Sounds cognizable by the ear that are wished for, desirable, agreeable and pleasing, connected with sense-desire, arousing lust.
(3) Smells cognizable by the nose that are wished for, desirable, agreeable and pleasing, connected with sense-desire, arousing lust.
(4) Tastes cognizable by the tongue that are wished for, desirable, agreeable and pleasing, connected with sense-desire, arousing lust.
(5) Touches cognizable by the body that are wished for, desirable, agreeable and pleasing, connected with sensual desire, arousing lust.

These, monks, are the 5 cords of sensual pleasure.\(^{91}\)

15 Here, \(\text{Ānanda},\) a monk should constantly review his own mind, thus:

‘Do any of these 5 cords of sensual pleasure arise in my mind through a sense-base or not?’\(^{92}\)

15.2 If, \(\text{Ānanda},\) when reviewing, a monk knows thus,

‘One or other of these 5 cords of sensual pleasure do arise in my mind through a sense-base,’

then he knows,

‘The lustful desire for these 5 cords of sensual pleasure has not been abandoned in me.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

15.3 If, \(\text{Ānanda},\) when reviewing, a monk knows thus,

‘None of these 5 cords of sensual pleasure arise in my mind through any sense-base,’

then he knows,

‘The lustful desire for these five cords of sensual pleasure has been abandoned in me.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

**THE PATH TO ARHATHOOD**

### Right view: The 5 aggregates of clinging

16 \(^{93}\) Ananda, there are these 5 aggregates of clinging,\(^{94}\) regarding which a monk should dwell contemplating rise and fall in them.\(^{95}\)

---

\(^{91}\) Skilling (1997:388 f) notes that the Tibetan version “has several statements not found in the Pāli:” In 11.2 (of he Tib version), the Buddha declares: “I do not say, \(\text{Ānanda},\) that there is arousal in the mind apart from the 5 cords of sensual pleasure (pañcā kāma, guṇa).” If a monk realizes that his mind is aroused by one or the other of the 5 cords of sensual pleasure (§11.3; cf Pali §15b), he should, with regard to the cords of sensual pleasure, dwell seeing impermanence, decay, dispassion, cessation, release (aniṭṭha kṣaya, virāga, nirodha, nīṣāraṇa) (§11.4). When he does so (the whole list is repeated), his mind will no longer be aroused by any of the 5 cords of sensual pleasures (§11.5).

\(^{92}\) Aththi nu kho me imesu pañcasu kāma, guṇesu aṇīṭṭharasmiṁ vā aṇīṭṭharasmiṁ vā āyatane uppajjati cetasso samuddācāri ti? “Is there an occurrence of any of these 5 cords of sensual pleasure arising in my mind through a sense-base or not?” Here, the Buddha distinguishes between two levels of sense-experience: that of “the 5 cords of sensual pleasure” (pañca, kāma, guṇa) [16], that is, the level of the worldling, and “the 5 aggregates of clinging” (pañc’ upādāna-k, khandha), that is, the level of the practitioner. The 5 cords of sensual pleasure have a “binding” or “grasping” effect on one who enjoys them. The 5 aggregates of clinging, on the other hand, are natural states that arise and fall away moment to moment. If a practitioner watches this rise and fall, he would abandon the “I am” conceit, and as such be free from the grip of Māra [17].

\(^{93}\) “The 5 aggregates of clinging” \(\text{pañc’} upādāna-k, khandha,\) namely, form (rūpa), feeling (vedanā), perception (saññā), formations (sañkhāra) and consciousness (viññāṇa) (S 3:47 Vbh 1). The aggregates of clinging (upādāna-k, khandha) are more fully called “the 5 groups of existence which form the objects of clinging” (Vism 14.214 f/477 f). Khandha S (S 22.48/3:47 f) defines the aggregates of clinging as being “with influxes, subject to clinging”
‘Such is form; such is its arising; such is its disappearance.
Such is feeling; such is its arising; such is its disappearance.
Such is perception; such is its arising; such is its disappearance.
Such are formations; [115] such is their arising; such is their disappearance.
Such is consciousness; such is its arising; such is its disappearance.’

17 When he dwells contemplating rise and fall in these 5 aggregates of clinging, the conceit ‘I am’ on account of the 5 aggregates clinging is abandoned.

When this is the case, he knows thus:
‘The conceit “I am” on account of the 5 aggregates of clinging has been abandoned.’

In this way, he clearly comprehends them.

18 Ānanda, these states are concerned solely with the wholesome (in fruition).96 They are noble, supramundane, and unreachable by the bad one.

TEACHER & PUPIL97

Right speech: Looking up to the right teacher

19 What do think, Ānanda? What good does a disciple see in the teacher so as to be worthy of his devotion even if he [the disciple] is told to leave [is rejected]?98

“Bhante, our teachings are rooted in the Blessed One, guided by the Blessed One, has the Blessed One as refuge. It would be good indeed if the Blessed One were to explain its meaning. Having heard the Blessed One, the monks would remember it.”

20 “Ānanda, a disciple should not regard the teacher as being worthy of his devotion [fit to be followed] for the sake of the exposition of sutras [formulas] or of gevas [recitations].100

---

94 These two passages [16-17] point out the insight needed for the path of arhathood that culminates in the abandoning of the conceit “I am” (MA 4:163). These passages should be contrasted with those on “the 5 cords of sensual pleasures” [14-15]: see n at §15a.

95 “In them,” yattha.

96 “Concerned...with the wholesome,” kusalāyatikā. Comy glosses as kusalato āgatā, coming from the wholesome (MA 4:163). Horner, however, notes that “the sense of the exegesis and of the vll seems to be ‘leading on (step by step) to what is skilled’” (M:H 3:158 n3).

97 This section should be studied with Lohicca S (D 12:1:224-234) & “The Teacher or the Teaching?” (SD 3.14). See Intro (1.5, 3).

98 “Told to leave,” paṇujjamāno, ie rejected, as at Vana,pathta S (M 17.26/1:108).


100 Na kho Ānanda arahati sāvako satthāraṁ anubhandhituṁ yad idaṁ suttaṁ geyyaṁ veyyākaraṇassa hetu. It is unlikely that this passage is concerned with the listing of canonical texts, “but,” says Analayo, it “simply speaks of following the teacher for the sake of ever more ‘explanations’ (instead of engaging in serious practice),” conjectur-
Why is the reason for this?

For a long time, Ānanda, you have learned the Dharma, remembered it, recited it, examined it, and well understood it as a view.101

20.2 But, Ānanda, there is this talk concerning austerity, conducing as a support for the mind’s release, and that leads to complete disillusionment, to fading away (of lust), to ending (of suffering), to inner peace, to higher knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana; that is to say,

- talk about wanting little,
- talk about contentment,
- talk about solitude,
- talk about aloofness from company,
- talk about arousing effort,
- talk about moral virtue,
- talk about mental concentration,
- talk about wisdom,
- talk about freedom,
- talk about the knowledge and vision of freedom.

20.3 It is for the sake of such a talk that a disciple should regard the teacher as being worthy of his devotion even if he is told to leave.

Wrong livelihood: The 3 undoings

21 This being the case,103 Ānanda, there is the teacher’s undoing;104 this being the case, there is the pupil’s undoing; this being the case, there is the brahmachari’s undoing.105

101 “Well understood as a view,” diṭṭhiyā suppaṭividdha, lit “well penetrated by view.” As at M 1:213. The context here, I think, is that the disciple has only “heard” (sutta,mayā paññā) the teaching and thought (cintī,mayā paññā) about it, and has understood it thus far, but he has no direct experience of it through mental cultivation (bhāvanā,-mayā paññā) (D 3:219; Vbh 324).

102 These are the 10 topics of talk (kathā,vatthu) conducive to spiritual growth and awakening, viz: app’ica, - kathā, santutthi,kathā, paiviveka,kathā, asamāsanga,kathā, viriy’ārambha,kathā, sīla,kathā, samādhi,kathā, paññā,-kathā, vimutti,kathā, vimutti,ñāṇa,dassana,kathā (M 1:145, 3:113; A 5:129); see §12.2 above.

103 “This being the case,” evaṁ sante. For some disciples who live alone, it is difficult going (b dīnava).
22. (1) And what, Ānanda, is the teacher’s undoing?
22.2 Here, Ānanda, some teacher\textsuperscript{106} resorts to a secluded lodging: the forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, [116] a jungle grove, the open air, a heap of straw.\textsuperscript{107} 
22.3 While he lives thus secluded, brahmin householders\textsuperscript{108} from the market towns and country visit him, and as a result, he becomes infatuated, harbours desires,\textsuperscript{109} gives in to greed, and reverts to luxury. 
22.4 This, Ānanda, is called a teacher who is undone. He is one struck down by bad unwholesome states that defile, that bring rebirth, that invite trouble, that ripen in suffering, that lead to further [future] birth, decay and death.\textsuperscript{110}

This, Ānanda, is the teacher’s undoing.

23 (2) And what, Ānanda, is the pupil’s undoing?
Anāpāna,sati S (M 118,17), SD 7.13 n. See also Mahā Assa,pura S (M 3,9,12,2) n, SD 10.13.

Anāpāna,sati S (M 118,17), SD 7.13 n. See also Mahā Assa,pura S (M 3,9,12,2) n, SD 10.13.

Anāpāna,sati S (M 118,17), SD 7.13 n. See also Mahā Assa,pura S (M 3,9,12,2) n, SD 10.13.

23.2 resorts to a secluded lodging: the forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, a jungle grove, the open air, a heap of straw.
23.3 While he lives thus secluded, brahmin householders from the market towns and country visit him, and as a result, he becomes infatuated, harbours desires, gives in to greed, and reverts to luxury.
23.4 This, Ānanda, is called a pupil who is undone. He is one struck down by bad unwholesome states that defile, that bring rebirth, that invite trouble, that ripen in suffering, that lead to future birth, decay and death.

This, Ānanda, is the pupil’s undoing.

24 (3) And what, Ānanda, is the brahmachari’s undoing?
24.2 Here, Ānanda, there arises in the world the Tathagata [Thus Come], an arhat, fully self-awakened, accomplished in knowledge and conduct, well-farer, knower of the worlds, unexcelled trainer of tamable persons, teacher of beings human and divine, awakened, blessed.
24.3 He resorts to a secluded lodging: the forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, a jungle grove, the open air, a heap of straw.
24.4 While he lives thus secluded, brahmin householders from the market towns and country visit him. Yet, he does not go astray, does not harbour desires, does not gives in to greed, nor does [117] he revert to luxury.
24.5 But a disciple of this teacher, emulating the teacher’s solitude,\textsuperscript{112} resorts to a secluded lodging: the forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, a jungle grove, the open air, a heap of straw.

\textsuperscript{104} “Undoing,” upaddavo, may also be rendered as “disaster, calamity” (M:NB 1335 n1157).

\textsuperscript{105} “Brahmachari,” brahma,çari, ie one who has taken up the rule of celibacy. The anglicized word is found in English dictionaries like Webster’s 3\textsuperscript{rd} New International Dictionary.

\textsuperscript{106} Cony: An outside teacher (titthiyå) (MA 4:165).

\textsuperscript{107} The more common list is shorter, but prob later: “to the forest or to the foot of a tree or to an empty abode”: see Śravako, kṣaṇa, bhumi, sāla (PM 75.41).

\textsuperscript{108} Brāhma, gahapatikā, also spelt as brāhma,naga, gahapatti, which is invariably a collective term, never an individual, ie, the landed community of of the brahmin villages (brāhma,naga, gām) or fiefs (brāhma, deya) as a whole. This classification is based on land-ownership (ie their economic function), who nonetheless still identified with the larger priestly class. As such, individually, they (as such as Kūta,danta, Cañkī, etc) are still referred to simply as brāhma,nag. See Chakravarti 1987:72 f.

\textsuperscript{109} “He becomes infatuated, harbours desires,” muccha, ti kāmayati (PTS), but Se & Cony (MA 4:165) read muccha, ti ni,kāmayati, MA 4:165: “He longs for and sets going the craving for infatuation” (muccha, ni, pattheti pavatti, i.e falling in love, one of the senses of kāmi, or kāmayati (M 2:40).

\textsuperscript{110} The phrase “bad unwholesome states … decay and death” occurs repeatedly in Mahā Assa,pura S (M 39.22-29/1:280).

\textsuperscript{111} anubrāhīyamāno.
24.6 While he lives thus secluded, brahmin householders from the market towns and country visit him, and as a result, he becomes infatuated, harbours desires, gives in to greed, and reverts to luxury.

24.7 This, Ānanda, is called a brahmachari who is undone. He is one struck down by bad unwholesome states that defile, that bring rebirth, that invite trouble, that ripen in suffering, that lead to future birth, decay and death.

This, Ānanda, is the brahmachari’s undoing.

24.2 But here, Ānanda, the brahmachari’s undoing results in more suffering, bears more bitter fruit, than the teacher’s undoing or the pupil’s undoing, and it even leads one to the lower realms.\(^{113}\)

Right effort: Spiritual friendship with the teacher

25 Therefore, Ānanda, conduct yourselves with friendliness [lovingkindness] towards me, not with hostility.\(^{114}\) This will be for your welfare and happiness for a long time.

25.2 And how, Ānanda, do disciples conduct themselves towards the teacher with hostility, without friendliness?

Here, Ānanda, the teacher teaches the Dharma out of compassion for the disciples, seeking their welfare, caring for them, saying:

‘This is for your welfare. This is for your happiness.’

His disciples neither desire to listen nor give an attentive ear nor establish their mind in wisdom [direct knowledge]. They err and turn away from the Teacher’s teaching.\(^{115}\)

This, Ānanda, is how the disciples conduct themselves towards the teacher with hostility, without friendliness.\(^{116}\)

26 And how, Ānanda, do disciples conduct themselves towards the teacher with friendliness, without hostility?

Here, Ānanda, the teacher teaches the Dharma out of compassion for the disciples, seeking their welfare, caring for them, saying:

\(^{112}\) “Emulating the teacher’s solitude,” tassa satthu vivekaṁ anuyutto brāhmatānaṁ. Cf Akaṅkheyya S (M 6), where the exhortation, “devote yourself to empty places” (brāhathasuṇā āgārānaṁ), is given repeatedly (M 6/1:33-36).

\(^{113}\) Comsa: Going forth outside the Buddha’s Teaching brings small gain, so one who falls away from that falls away only from mundane attainment. He meets no great suffering, just as one who falls from the back of a donkey is only covered with dust. But the going forth in the Teaching brings great gain—the paths, the fruits and nirvana. Thus one who falls away from this meets great suffering, just as one who falls from the back of an elephant (MA 4:165). On an extreme level, (Arahatta) Susima S (S 12.70) calls such a one “a thief of the Dharma” (one who ordains for selfish reasons and transgresses monastic rules), who would face suffering more painful than any earthly punishment, his conduct “results in more suffering, bears more bitter fruit, and it even leads one to the lower realms (S 12.70.62/2:128), SD 16.8.

\(^{114}\) This almost enigmatic statement should be understood in the light of §3-4a, where effectively the Buddha is telling Ānanda to break up the gathering. Understandably, Ānanda, as a mere streamwinner, could still misconstrue this gesture and become upset. Hence this statement.

\(^{115}\) Tassa sāvakaṁ sussūsānti sotaṁ odahanti <na> aṅkaṁ cittaṁ upaṭṭhapenti na vōkkamma [na] ca satthu sāsanā vattanti: ‘The first na is better omitted and the second na should be inserted in PTS ed in accordance with Be Ce Se. Sussūsānti is 3rd pl of sussūsati, desiderative of suṇāti (he listens). However, I think it is also possible to render sussūsati as “he listens properly” (su + suṇāti), as evident from Cūḷa Suṇāta S (M 121.3/3:104), SD 11.3.3. The two words, however, are differently derived: sussūta (M 121.3) = su + suta (participle of suṇāti).

\(^{116}\) For similar a reaction, see the 3rd of the three satipatthanas at Saḷāyatana Vibhaṅga S (M 137.24/3:211), SD 29.5.
‘This is for your welfare. This is for your happiness.’

His disciples wish to listen, they give an attentive ear, they establish their mind in wisdom [direct knowledge]. They neither err nor turn away from the Teacher’s teaching.

This, Ānanda, is how the disciples conduct themselves towards the teacher with friendliness, without hostility.117

26.2 Therefore, [118] Ānanda, conduct yourselves with friendliness [lovingkindness]118 towards me, not with hostility. This will be for your welfare and happiness for a long time.

27 Ānanda, I shall not treat you as a potter treats raw damp clay.116 Restraining you again and again,120 I will admonish you, cleansing you again and again.121 The core will remain standing.”122

28 This is what the Blessed One said. The venerable Ānanda rejoiced and approved of the Blessed One’s word.

— evam —

Bibliography

Analayo Bhikkhu


2011b “Right View and the Scheme of the Four Truths in Early Budhism—The Saṁyukta-āgama parallel to the Saṁmādiṭṭhi-sutta and the simile of the four skills of a physician,” Canadian Journal of Buddhist Studies 7 2011:11-44. download

117 For similar reactions, see the first two of the three satipatthanas at Saḷāyatana Vibhaṅga S (M 137.22-23/-3:211), SD 29.5.

118 “With friendliness,” mittaṃvatāya.

119 “As a potter treats raw, damp clay, yathā kumbha,kāro āmake āmaka,matte and āmaka,matte ti āmake nātisukkhe bhājane, “an unbaked vessel, not quite dry. The potter gently takes these vessels in both hands, saying, “Do not break,” but I will not proceed with you as the potter does.” (MA 4:166). IB Horner notes: “I do not see the full force of this simile... But I believe it means that whereas the potter gives, and can give, his vessels one chance only, the Teacher is undefeated by any initial failure there may be, and proceeds undeterred with the expectation of final success on the part of his pupil” (M:H 3:162 n1).

120 “Restraining you again and again,” niggayha niggayha. Comy: “Having exhorted once, I will not be silent. Constantly reproving (niggahetvā niggahetvā) again and again, I will exhort, I will instruct” (MA 4:166). Cf niggayha, vādī (Dh 76), qu at DhA 2:108.

121 “Cleansing you again and again,” pavayha pavayha (M 1:442, 444, 3:18 = DhA 2:108), ger of pavāhati, “(1) to cause to be carried away, to remove; freq with ref to water: to wash away cleanse (M 1:39; S 1:79, 183, 2:88; Tha 751). (2) to pull out, draw (D 1:77, better read as pabhāhati)” (PED abridged). Comy explains that the Buddha removes one’s faults (dosa), “as a potter, having removed (pavāhetvā, vi pajahitvā) the cracked and broken vessels [Se bhīnna, chiṇṇa, bhājanāṇī] from among those that have been baked, takes the well baked ones, tapping (ie testing) them again and again. So too I having repeatedly removed (faults from you), will again and again exhort and instruct you.” (MA 4:166).

122 Yo sāro so tāsṣati. Comy: “While being exhorted thus by me, those who have reached the pith (sāra) of the ways and the paths will persist. The mundane virtues [aforementioned teachings] are also intended as a criterion of spiritual essence.” (MA 4:167). Sāra means: (1) the heartwood or pith of a tree; (2) essence (essential truth). IB Horner: “It is no doubt meant that this will persist and endure (like well baked vessels) when all the mistakes and errors that dog as learner’s path have been cleared away and removed (like the cracked and broken vessels from among those that have been well baked)” (M:H 3:162 n4). In Gandhāra J (J 406), the potter imagery is again used to show the Buddha’s role as a teacher. Skilling 1997:393 n97 points to a recurrence of this same imagery in the Saṅgha, bheda, vastu (Gnoli 1978a:78,19) is used in the same way.
2012

Bapat, P V 1969

Choong, Mun-keat 1999

Nānamoli, Bhikkhu 1965

Skilling, Peter 1994
1997

Sujato 2004b