

# Gaddula,baddha Sutta 1

Paṭhama Gaddula,baddha Sutta

## The First Discourse on the Leashed

[Dealing with the five aggregates]

(Saṃyutta Nikāya 22.99/3:149 f)

Translated by Piya Tan ©2009

### 1 The two Gaddula,baddha Suttas

**1.1 A COMPARATIVE NOTE.** There are two versions of the Gaddula,baddha Sutta—the first (S 22.99) and the second (S 22.100)—both dealing with the nature of the aggregates. While **the First Gaddula,-baddha Sutta** (S 22.9) bases the reflection on the characteristic of not-self (*anattā*), **the Second Gaddula,baddha Sutta** (S 22.100) first deals with the *not-self* characteristic of the aggregates [§5], and in the closing section, centres on impermanence of the aggregates [§§12-13].

The significance of the two discourses is obvious. While the first Gaddula,baddha Sutta leads to the attainment of arhathood, the second Gaddula,baddha Sutta ends with at least streamwinning. The second Sutta’s ending (S 22.100.13) is the pericope for the attainment of arhathood, except for the missing closing line, “And <so-and-so> became of the arhats” (*annataro va pana <ittha,nāma> arahataṃ ahoṣī ti*).

Yet this is not surprising because *all learner stages of sainthood lead to arhathood in a matter of time*. However, for those who lack the spiritual capacity for this-life arhathood, there is always streamwinning or once-return—or even non-return, if we are willing to work towards attaining dhyana strong enough to overcome all sensual attachments.

However, streamwinning is the easiest level to work for, as we only need to break the first three fetters, namely, self-identity view, attachment to rituals and vows, and spiritual doubt.<sup>1</sup> In fact, **the Yamaka Sutta** (S 22.85) Commentary says that at the end of such an instruction [S 22.100.12-13],<sup>2</sup> he becomes a streamwinner (SA 2:309).

**1.2 GADDULA,BADDHA.** The term *gaddula,baddha* is here translated as “an animal on a leash,” it literally translates as “one tied to a leashed,” an indirect reference to any leashed animal. Other translators, following the Commentary (SA 2:326), usually render *gaddula,baddha* as “a dog tied up by a leash” (S:W 3:126) or “a dog tied up on a leash” (S:B 957).<sup>3</sup> Buddhaghosa, the Saṃyutta Commentator, explains that *the dog* is the fool (*bāla*); *the leash* is view (*diṭṭhi*); *the post* is self-identity (*sakkāya*); and like a dog, worldlings are leashed by view and craving to self-identity.<sup>4</sup> The hint of streamwinning is clear from the above commentarial gloss, thus:

<u>Simile</u>	<u>Fetter</u>	<u>Commentary</u>
“the post” ( <i>thambha</i> )	self-identity view	view ( <i>diṭṭhi</i> )
“an animal”	spiritual doubt	the fool = a dog ( <i>bāla</i> ; <i>sunakha</i> )
“the leash” ( <i>gaddula</i> )	attachment to vows and ritual	the fool ( <i>bāla</i> )

<sup>1</sup> Respectively, *sakkāya, diṭṭhi, sīla-b, bata parāmāsa*, and *vicikicchā*. See above n & **D 33.1.10(10)/3:216; M 2.11/1:9**; cf **A 6.86/3:438**. On streamwinning & the 10 fetters, see **Udakūpama S** (A 7.15) = SD 28.6 Intro (1.2.4). On the streamwinner, see **Entering the Stream** = SD 3.3.

<sup>2</sup> S 22.85.14-20/3:111 = SD 21.12. See **Gaddula,baddha S 2** (S 22.100.12-13/3:152) = SD 28.7b.

<sup>3</sup> This parable is also found in **Pañcattaya S** (M 102), where the phrase *sāgaddula,baddha* (which is prob read as *sā gaddula,baddho*, as in Comy) is used (M 102.12/2:232 f), where Comy similarly glosses it as “a leashed dog” (*baddha,sunakho*, MA 4:21)..

<sup>4</sup> *Evameva khô ti ettha sunakho viya vaṭṭa,nissito bālo, gaddulo viya diṭṭhi, thambho viya sakkāyo, gaddula,-rajjuyā thambhe upani,baddha,sunakhassa thambhānuparivattanaṃ viya diṭṭhi,tanḥāya sakkāye baddhassa puthuj-janassa sakkāyānuparivattanaṃ veditabbaṃ*. (SA 2:326)

In fact, pace Buddhaghosa, I see the two Gaddula,baddha Suttas<sup>5</sup> as further elaborations on the parable of the six animals of the Cha,pāṇā Sutta (S 35.247), where they represent the six internal sense-bases, as follows:

<u>Animal on a leash</u>		<u>Sense-base</u>	
A snake	( <i>ahi</i> )	the eye	( <i>cakkhu</i> , <i>cakkh'āyatana</i> )
A crocodile	( <i>sumsumāra</i> )	the ear	( <i>sota</i> , <i>sot'āyatana</i> )
A bird	( <i>pakkhī</i> )	the nose	( <i>ghaṇa</i> , <i>ghaṇ'āyatana</i> )
A dog	( <i>kukkura</i> )	the tongue	( <i>jivhā</i> , <i>jivh'āyatana</i> )
A jackal	( <i>sigāla</i> )	the body	( <i>kāya</i> <i>kāy'āyayana</i> )
A monkey	( <i>makkāṭa</i> )	the mind	( <i>mana</i> <i>man'āyatana</i> )

(S 35.247/4:198-201) = SD 19.15

Each of these animals are said to be leashed, and the free ends of the leashes are bound together in a common knot. Each of the animals tries to struggle free, thinking of heading to their favourite habitat. However, the bound pack is dragged along by the strongest of the pack in its direct. This represents the unfocussed mind that is distracted by various sense-objects.

In the second part of the parable of the six animals, they are all leashed to a single post, strongly sunk into the ground. No matter how much the animals struggle, they remain bound near to the post. In the end, tired out by their struggle, they lie quietly down near the post. This represents the focussed mind in meditation.<sup>6</sup>

Both **the Gaddula,baddha Suttas** (S 22.99+100) use this simile in a similar way:

Suppose, bhikshus, an animal on a leash,<sup>7</sup> bound to a strong post or pillar, would just keep on running, going in a circle around it,...

(S 22.99.71/3:150 = S 22.100.4/3:151)

This is clearly an abridged form of the second part of the six-animal simile of the Cha,pāṇā Sutta mentioned above. While the Cha,pāṇā Sutta (S 35.247) applies the six-animal parable to the six internal senses and their respective objects, the Gaddula,baddha Suttas applies it to the five aggregates. In the Chga,pāṇā Sutta, the teaching is regarding *sense-restraint*, while in the Gaddula,badha Suttas, it is about how to reflect on the aggregates in terms of *the not-self characteristic*.

## 2 Anamatagga

**2.1 DEFINITION OF TERM.** One of the difficult terms used in both the Gaddula,baddha Suttas (S 22.99 +100) is *anamatagga*, which is problematic. There is a collection of ten discourses centred around the term, called **Anamatagga Sāmyutta** (the Connected Discourses on *Anamatagga*) (S 15)<sup>8</sup> [see below].

The term is also found in the nun Sumedhā's **Thera,gāthā**:

<p><i>assu thañṇaṃ rudhiram saṃsāraṃ anamatagato saratha   sattānaṃ saṃsaritaṃ sarāhi aṭṭhīnañ ca sannicayaṃ   </i></p>	<p>The tears, the breast-milk, the blood, remember—samsara is without beginning nor end. Of the beings wandering on in samsara, remember the piling up of bones. (Thī 496)<sup>9</sup></p>
---	--

The Therī,gāthā Commentary, **Dhammapāla**, explains *anamatagga* at Thī 496 as follows: “*Anamatagga-to* means the *anamat'aggattā*, that is, the not-knowing of the foremost point (*agga*) (ThīA 289).<sup>10</sup> He

<sup>5</sup> S 22.99+100/3:149-152 = SD 28.7ab.

<sup>6</sup> S 35.247/4:198-201.

<sup>7</sup> Ee Se *gaddula,baddho*; Ke Se *gaddūla,bandho*. See Intro (1.2).

<sup>8</sup> S 15.1-10/2:178-186.

<sup>9</sup> See also Thī 495, 498, 499.

<sup>10</sup> *Saṃsāraṃ anamatagato saṃsārassa anu amata-g.gattā ñāṇena anugantvāpi amata,aggattā avidita-g.gattā.*

glosses *anamata* as *avidita* (“not knowing,” indicating that he takes *ana-* as the double negative prefix *na-* or *a-*).<sup>11</sup> This gloss is problematic, as it is ahistoric (it does not reflect the way it was used in its time).

**Buddhaghosa** provides a similar personal interpretation of *anamata*, resolving it as *anu* (signifying repetition or persistence) + *amat’agga* (unknowable point). He explains that

Even if it were to be pursued with spiritual knowledge (*ñāṇa*) for a hundred or a thousand years, it would still be of unknowable beginning, of unknown beginning.<sup>12</sup> It would not be possible to now its beginning from here or there. The meaning is that it is without a delimiting first or last point. Samsara is the continuous successive occurrence of the aggregates, etc (*khandh’ādī-nam avicchinna-p,pavattā paṭipāṭi*). (SA 2:156)

The Critical Pali Dictionary (CPD), resolves it as *an* + *amata* + *agga*. The BHS cognate is *anavarāgra* (Mvst 1:34,7), “without lower or upper limit.”<sup>13</sup> Another Prakrit (Ardha,māgadhī) cognates are *aṇavadagga* (Skt *anamadagra*) and *aṇavayagga* (literally, “having the point not bent (*anama*),” found in a Jain text entitled *Udāyaṇa*).<sup>14</sup> Hence, it is here rendered as “without a beginning nor an ending.”<sup>15</sup>

Although the Commentaries are not very helpful here, the meaning of *anamata* can easily be teased out from its occurrences in the Suttas. The impossibility of finding the first beginning of things is stated in a number of discourses,<sup>16</sup> such as

<u>Sutta</u>	<u>Simile or topic</u>	<u>Reference</u>
<b>Tiṇa,kaṭṭha Sutta</b>	grass and wood	S 15.1/2:178,
<b>Paṭhavī Sutta</b>	the earth	S 15.2/2:179 f,
<b>Assu Sutta</b>	tears	S 15.3/2:179 f,
<b>Khīra Sutta</b>	a mother’s milk	S 15.4/2:180 f,
<b>Pabbata Sutta</b>	a mountain	S 15.5/2:181 f,
<b>Sāsapā Sutta</b>	mustard seeds	S 15.6/2:182,
<b>Sāvaka Sutta</b>	disciples [Listeners]	S 15.7/2:182 f,
<b>Gaṅgā Sutta</b>	the river Ganges	S 15.8/2:183 f,
<b>Daṇḍa Sutta</b>	the stick	S 15.9/2:184 f,
<b>(Anamatagga) Puggala Sutta</b>	the person	S 15.10/2:185 f,
<b>Gaddula Sutta 1</b>	leashed animals	S 22.99/3:149 f,
<b>Gaddula Sutta 2</b>	leashed animals	S 22.100/3:151 f,
<b>Āpaṇa Sutta</b>	the 5 faculties	S 48.50/5.226,

<sup>11</sup> See CPD, sv <sup>1</sup>*an-a* & Tha:N 1089: *anappameyya* = *ana* + *pameyya*, “immeasurable.” This process is found in *ana-bhāva* (opp of *bhāva*, “state”), and prob also *ana-vajja* (opp of *vajja*, “offence”), common in Prakrit (cf R Pischel, *Grammatik der Prakrit-Sprachen*, 1900 §§77, 251 n1; Sadda,nīti 396 n10): see CPD, sv <sup>3</sup>*a-* (9). Words like *anamata*, however, should be explained otherwise: see V Trenckner, *Pali Miscellany*, 1879: 64. See also *Ñāṇakitti* in *Tīkā* on DhsA 11; V:O (Oldenberg, *Vinaya Texts*) 2:114; DP sv *anamata*.

<sup>12</sup> *Vzssa,sataṃ vassa,sahassaṃ ñāṇena anugantvā pi anamat’aggo avidit’aggo*.

<sup>13</sup> Tib *thog-ma dan tha-ma med pa*, cf Dharma,praṭīpika 64,9 ad Mahābodhivamsa 2,14: *anavarāgra* = ag-mul nāti, taking *avara* and *agra* as “lowest and highest limit.” *Anavarāgra*, says CPD, is an adaptation of ≠ Amg *aṇava(d)agga*, eg Bhagavatī I 1§18 (CPD 156, sv *an-amat’-agga*). See BHS Grammar 2.48; Dh:G (Brough) 256 n259; also *Journal of the Pali Text Soc* 1906-1907: 84; S:B 795 n254’ Thī:N 172 n495.

<sup>14</sup> H Jacobi, *Ausgewählte Erzählungen in Mahārāshtrī*, Leipzig, 1886, III 33, 89. See also AC Woolner, *Introduction to Prakrit*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed 1928: 158 n1.

<sup>15</sup> There is a suggestion that *anamata* be resolved as *a-muta* + *agga* (from Skt *a* + *amuto* + *agra*), where if (*a*)*muto* = (*a*)*mata*, we have the meaning “of which you cannot say that it begins from there or there.” Comys also hint at taking *anamata* as cognate with Skt *a* + *amṛta* + *agra*, meaning “not ending in nirvana (*amata*, the death-free)” (eg DhsA 11,8): see DPL 31 (sv *anamata*); CPD 156 (sv *an-amat’-agga*); PED, sv *anamata*.

<sup>16</sup> A similar statement is also found in Skt fragments of two **Ekottara Āgama** sutras (ed Tripāṭhī 1955:143, 144): *pūrvā koṭir na prañāyate duḥkasya*; and in **Divyāvadāna** (cf Cowell 1886:197); see Analayo, *Comparative Study of the Majjhima Nikāya* (draft 2005) M 1:54 n.

<b>Satti,sata Sutta</b>	a hundred spears	S 56.35/5:440 f, <sup>17</sup> and
<b>Avijjā Sutta</b>	ignorance	A 10.61/5:113-116.

Provisionally, we can say that the “beginning” of all things is ignorance. In **the Avijjā Sutta** (A 10.61),<sup>18</sup> for example, we find this statement: “a specific conditionality (*idap,paccayatā*) of ignorance can be become known...what is the food for ignorance? It is the five hindrances” (*Paññāyati idap,paccayatā avijjā...ko c’āhāro avijjāya? Pañca nīvaraṇā*).

A similar reference is found towards the end of **the Sammā,dīṭṭhi Sutta** (M 9), where it says:

With the arising of the influxes, there is the arising of ignorance.

With the ending of the influxes, there is the ending of ignorance. (M 9.66/1:54) = SD 11.14

On the first line, the Commentary says:

Here the influxes of sense-pleasures and of existence are, through consciousness (*saha,jāta*), the conditions for ignorance. On the other hand, ignorance is the condition, through consciousness, of the influxes of sense-pleasures and existence...

This explanation of the influxes is by way of the condition showing ignorance as the chief condition in dependent arising (*paṭicca,samuppāda*). Through this exposition, it is shown that the beginninglessness and endlessness of samsaric existence is inconceivable. How? From the arising of ignorance, there is the arising of the influxes; from the arising of the influxes, there is the arising of ignorance. Having made the influxes the condition for ignorance, and ignorance the condition for the influxes, the first point of ignorance is not to be found; therefore, the fact that the beginninglessness and endlessness of samsaric existence is inconceivable is seen. (MA 1:224)

**2.2 WITHOUT BEGINNING AND WITHOUT END.** Without the right spiritual tool, there is no way of knowing the real beginning of the universe, the world, life and suffering. It is just like before the day of modern science, diseases were attributed to spirits and demons, or punishment from God or the gods, or some external agency. In due course, such superstitions sublimated into more specific ideas such as a supreme being, which is as a rule a tribal God, as the idea historically always arises in a tribal situation.

Then the tribe’s leaders and thinkers introduced new ideas to make their God more powerful than other Gods, and so on: this is theology, the study and method of how to create and maintain a God-idea.<sup>19</sup> In the early centuries of the God-idea, in the tribal systems, there was almost no concept of an *individual*, and the tribe was *the* individual, the body politic.<sup>20</sup> Understandably, in such a system, a universal creator God who favours a particular would work very well. However, as history clearly shows, as the idea of individuality evolved, the God-idea became less meaningful and was easily rejected.

According to early Buddhism, no God-idea or holy book can solve the problem of the world and suffering. Our only sources of knowledge are our six senses: the eye, the ear, the nose, the tongue, the body and the mind, and all that we can know are form, sound, smell, taste, touch and ideas.<sup>21</sup> Any God-idea or holy book is but the creations of the mind, our ideas. However, when we truly understand these six senses, that is, with the arising of wisdom, we will understand the nature of the mind and the universe, and end suffering. Then we begin to understand why the world is without beginning and without end, and yet we can get out of this endless loop.

The two Gaddula,baddha Suttas teach us how to get out of that endless samsaric loop.<sup>22</sup> — — —

<sup>17</sup> Qu at Kvu 29; called Anamatagga Pariyāya (DhA 2:268)

<sup>18</sup> A 10.61/5:113-116.

<sup>19</sup> See **Self & Selves** = SD 26.9 (1.7.2).

<sup>20</sup> On the connection btw the God-idea and the “selving” process, see eg Philip Mellor, “Self and suffering,” 1991: 54.

<sup>21</sup> See **Sabba S** (S 35.23/4:15) = SD 7.1.

<sup>22</sup> See **Sammā Dīṭṭhi S** (M 9) = Intro (9).

## The First Discourse on the Leashed

(S 22.99/3:149 f)

- 1 Originating in Sāvattḥī.
- 2 Then the Blessed One said:

### With neither beginning nor end

3 “Without a beginning or an ending,<sup>23</sup> bhikshus, is this samsara [cycle of lives and deaths]. A first point cannot be discerned of beings roaming and wandering on,<sup>24</sup> hindered by ignorance, fettered by craving.

4 There comes a time, bhikshus, when the great ocean will evaporate, dry up, and be no more. Even then, bhikshus, [150] there is no making an end of suffering for those beings roaming and wandering on, hindered by ignorance, fettered by craving, I say!

5 There comes a time, bhikshus, when Sineru, the king of mountains, will burn up and be destroyed.<sup>25</sup>

Even then, bhikshus, there is no making an end of suffering for those beings roaming and wandering on, hindered by ignorance, fettered by craving, I say!

6 There comes a time, bhikshus, when the great earth will burn up, be destroyed, and be no more.<sup>26</sup> Even then, bhikshus, there is no making an end of suffering for those beings roaming and wandering on, hindered by ignorance, fettered by craving, I say!

### An animal on a leash

7a Suppose, bhikshus, an animal on a leash,<sup>27</sup> bound to a strong post or pillar, would just keep on running, going in a circle around it,

even so, bhikshus, the uninstructed worldling [ignorant ordinary] person, who has no regard for the noble ones and is unskilled and undisciplined in the Dharma of the noble ones, who has no regard for the true individuals and is unskilled and undisciplined in the Dharma of the true individuals,

regards form as the self, or the self as possessing form, or form as in the self, or the self as in form;

regards feeling as the self, or the self as possessing feeling, or feeling as in the self, or the self as in feeling;

regards perception as the self, or the self as possessing perception, or perception as in the self, or the self as in perception;

regards formations as the self, or the self as possessing formations, or formations as in the self, or the self as in formations;

regards consciousness as the self, or the self as possessing consciousness, or consciousness as in the self, or the self as in consciousness.<sup>28</sup>

<sup>23</sup> *Anamatagga*: see Intro (2.1).

<sup>24</sup> “Roaming and wandering on,” *sandhāvataṃ saṃsarataṃ* (gen pl); cf *aneka,jāti,sāmsāraṃ sandhāvissaṃ anibbisāṃ*, “Through numerous births in samsara, have I run without rest” (Dh 153).

<sup>25</sup> See n on the “great earth” [§6] below.

<sup>26</sup> Comy: That is, when the fifth sun (*pañcame suriye*) rises, and the great ocean dries up (SA 2:326). This is an allusion to the “seven suns” (*satta suriya*) of **Satta Suriya S** (A 7.62), where it is said that when the “fifth sun” appears (probably a huge comet in our solar system), the oceans will dry up. When the “sixth sun” appears, Sineru (the axis mundi, or centre of our solar system or galaxy) will burn up, and with the “seventh sun,” our world or galaxy as we know it will cease to be (A 7.62/4:100-106) = SD 67.3. For further details on Buddhist eschatology, see Vism 13.32-41/414-417. On other sun similes, see Miln 389 f.

<sup>27</sup> Ee Se *gaddula,baddho*; Ke Se *gaddūla,bandho*. See Intro (1.2).

<sup>28</sup> This is the first 5 kinds of self-identity view (*sakkāya,ditṭhi*): see **Samanupassanā S** (S 22.47/3:46 f) = SD 26.12.

So he just keeps running after, going in a circle around *form*.  
 So he just keeps running after, going in a circle around *feeling*.  
 So he just keeps running after, going in a circle around *perception*.  
 So he just keeps running after, going in a circle around *formations*.  
 So he just keeps running after, going in a circle around *consciousness*.

### Going in circles

**7b** As he keeps running after *form*, going in a circle around *form*, he is not freed from form, not freed from feeling, not freed from perception, not freed from formations, not freed from consciousness, not freed from birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair—

He is not freed from suffering, I say!

As he keeps running after *feeling*, going in a circle around *feeling*, he is not freed from form, not freed from feeling, not freed from perception, not freed from formations, not freed from consciousness, not freed from birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair—

He is not freed from suffering, I say!

As he keeps running after *perception*, going in a circle around *perception*, he is not freed from form, not freed from feeling, not freed from perception, not freed from formations, not freed from consciousness, not freed from birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair—

He is not freed from suffering, I say!

As he keeps running after *formations*, going in a circle around *formations*, he is not freed from form, not freed from feeling, not freed from perception, not freed from formations, not freed from consciousness, not freed from birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair—

He is not freed from suffering, I say!

As he keeps running after *consciousness*, going in a circle around *consciousness*, he is not freed from form, not freed from feeling, not freed from perception, not freed from formations, not freed from consciousness, not freed from birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair—

He is not freed from suffering, I say!

### The aggregates are not-self

**8a** But, bhikshus, an instructed noble disciple, who has regard for the noble ones and is skilled and well disciplined in their Dharma of the noble ones, who has regard for the true individuals and is skilled and well disciplined in their Dharma of the true individuals,

does *not* regard form as the self, or the self as possessing form, or form as in the self, or the self as in form;

does *not* regard feeling as the self, or the self as possessing feeling, or feeling as in the self, or the self as in feeling;

does *not* regard perception as the self, or the self as possessing perception, or perception as in the self, or the self as in perception;

does *not* regard formations as the self, or the self as possessing formations, or formations as in the self, or the self as in formations;

does *not* regard consciousness as the self, or the self as possessing consciousness, or consciousness as in the self, or the self as in consciousness.<sup>29</sup>

So he does not run after <i>form</i> ,	not go in a circle around <i>form</i> .
So he does not run after <i>feeling</i> ,	not go in a circle around <i>feeling</i> .
So he does not run after <i>perception</i> ,	not go in a circle around <i>perception</i> .
So he does not run after <i>formations</i> ,	not go in a circle around <i>formations</i> .
So he does not run after <i>consciousness</i> ,	not go in a circle around <i>consciousness</i> .

<sup>29</sup> This is the first 5 kinds of self-identity view (*sakkāya,diṭṭhi*): see **Samanupassanā S** (S 22.47/3:46 f) = SD 26.12.

No more going in circles

**8b** As he does *not* run after *form*, *not* go in a circle around *form*, he is freed from form, freed from feeling, freed from perception, freed from formations, freed from consciousness, freed from birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair—

He is freed from suffering, I say!

As he does *not* run after *feeling*, *not* go in a circle around *feeling*, he is freed from form, freed from feeling, freed from perception, freed from formations, freed from consciousness, freed from birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair—

He is freed from suffering, I say!

As he does *not* run after *perception*, *not* go in a circle around *perception*, he is freed from form, freed from feeling, freed from perception, freed from formations, freed from consciousness, freed from birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair—

He is freed from suffering, I say!

As he does *not* run after *formations*, *not* go in a circle around *formations*, he is freed from form, freed from feeling, freed from perception, freed from formations, freed from consciousness, freed from birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair—

He is freed from suffering, I say!

As he does *not* run after *consciousness*, *not* go in a circle around *consciousness*, he is freed from form, freed from feeling, freed from perception, freed from formations, freed from consciousness, freed from birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair—

He is freed from suffering, I say!”

— evam —

090408, 090513; 090810 ds; 090829