1 Moggallāna’s struggle

1.1 The title Pacalā Sutta\(^1\) is found in the colophon (uddāna) of the PTS edition. The Siamese texts call it the Moggallāna Sutta,\(^2\) and the Burmese and the Siamese World Tipiṭaka, Pacalāyamāṇa Sutta (pacalāyamāṇa means “nodding off”). This Sutta records the efforts of Mahā Moggallāna, the second chief disciple of the Buddha, to attain spiritual liberation during the week after his ordination in the second year of the ministry.

For his intensive training, Moggallāna went to live near a village called Kallavāḷa, mutta or Kallavāḷa-putta (“liquor-dealer’s son”)\(^3\) in Magadha. On the seventh day of his ordination, when he was engaged in meditation, he was troubled by fatigue and torpor. According to the Aṅguttara Commentary, he had been walking up and down vigorously in meditation for seven days, so when he sat down for his meditation, drowsiness or torpor (middha) overcame him (AA 4:41).\(^4\)

1.2 While listening to the Buddha expounding these teachings on the meditation of the elements (dhātu, kamma-t, thāna), Moggallāna won the three higher paths and the apex of a chief disciple’s perfection by attaining arhatthood (A 4:85 f; AA 4:42).

1.3 Moggallāna’s struggle for arhatthood here is recounted dhyana by dhyana in the first nine discourses of the Moggallāna Saṁyutta (S 40.1-9),\(^5\) that is, on the 4 dhyānas, the 4 formless attainments, and the signless meditation. Historically, it is likely that the Pacalā Sutta records Moggallāna’s meditation struggle just before that recorded in the Paṭhama Jhāna Pañha Sutta (S 40.1).\(^6\)

Another possibility is that both the discourses—the Pacalā Sutta and the Paṭhama Jhāna Pañha Sutta—are recounting the same event. While the Aṅguttara reciters records how the Buddha admonished Moggallāna on overcoming drowsiness (and also teachings on letting go), the Saṁyutta reciters recounts only the meditation practice itself, and in nine discourses describe his gaining of the form dhyānas and the formless attainments.

1.4 Like Sāriputta, Moggallāna was an arhat “freed both ways” (ubhato, bhāga, vimutta).\(^7\) Within the same week of striving, Moggallāna not only masters the successive planes of meditative concentration but also wins the “paths of spiritual power” (iddhi, pāda), and thus gains direct knowledge (abhiññā).

---

\(^1\) Be adds 2 pp of text (A 4:88-90), a single line on p88.
\(^2\) Due to editorial oversight in the PTS Pali ed, this Sutta and the following (Puñña) Mettā S (A 7.58a) are treated as one. See (Puñña) Metta S (A 7.58/a:4:88-91), SD 3:2.11a.
\(^3\) Here called (Sattaka) Moggallāna S, the (Sevens) Discourse on Moggallāna to distinguish it from (Catukka) Moggallāna S, the (Fours) Discourse on Moggallāna (A 4:167), SD 46.16.
\(^4\) In the Then, gāthā Comy on Moggallāna’s verses, it is called Kallava, vāla (ThA 2:162).
\(^5\) Cf. Sona Kolivisa who walked up and down in meditation until his feet bled (V 1:179-185; Tha 632-644; AA 1:233 f; Tha:RD 275 f). A shorter text, the Sona S (A 6.55/5:3:374-379) records the Buddha’s instruction on the middle way (simile of the lute) to Sona Kolivisa. He is the foremost of the monks who exert effort (A 1:24).
\(^6\) S 40.1-9/4:262-269 @ SD 24.11-19.
\(^7\) S 40.1/4:262 f @ SD 24.11.
\(^8\) See SD 4.25 (**).
2 Problem reading

The Pali of the first method of overcoming drowsiness [§2] given by the Buddha poses a problem in translation as there are two variant reading that apparently contradict one another, that is, (a) the PTS and Siamese (Se) readings, and (b) the Sinhalese (Ce) and Burmese (Be) readings:

PTS: yathā saññissa te viharato taṁ middham okkamati, taṁ saññāṁ manasā’kāsi taṁ saññāṁ bahulaṁ akāsi.

Se: yathā saññissa te viharato taṁ middham okkamati, taṁ saññāṁ manasi,kareyyāsi, taṁ saññāṁ bahulaṁ kareyyāsi.

Ce: yathā saññino te viharato tam middham okkamē ti taṁ saññāṁ mā manasikāsi taṁ saññāṁ mā bahulam akāsi;

Be: yathā saññissa te viharato tam middham okkamati, taṁ saññāṁ mā manasikāsi, taṁ saññāṁ mā bahulam-akāsi;

Bodhi (1999) following the Sinhalese (Ce) reading has: “At whatever thought drowsiness befalls you, you should not give attention to that thought.” (A:B). As does Thānissaro (2002): “…whatever perception you have in mind when drowsiness descends on you, don’t attend to that perception, don’t pursue it.”

However, I have followed the PTS and Siamese (Se) readings: “…when you perceive that drowsiness is descending upon you, you should make a mental note of that perception; frequently make that perception. It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.”

From a practical angle, both readings—although they appear to contradict one another—are valid. When we try to overcome drowsiness or any distracting thought, we could either (a) simply note it at the sense-door as an objective experience (“drowsiness…”9) or (b) simply disregard it and go on with our meditation.10

3 Modes of spiritual progress

3.1 There is a whole chapter (vagga)—the Paṭipadā Vagga—in the Āguttara Nikāya dealing with modes of spiritual progress (patipadā), or simply “ways of progress” (A 4.161-170), of which there are four, namely:11

(1) painful progress with slow direct knowledge dukkha paṭipadā dandhābhīniṁā
(2) painful progress with quick direct knowledge dukkha paṭipadā khippabhīniṁā
(3) pleasant progress with slow direct knowledge sukkha paṭipadā dandhābhīniṁā
(4) pleasant progress with quick direct knowledge sukkha paṭipadā khippabhīniṁā

(A 4.167 @ SD 46.16; also A 4.161-170/2:149-152, 154 f)

Of the suttas in the chapter, two are called Sāriputta Moggallāna Sutta (A 4.167-168). In the Sāriputta Moggallāna Sutta 1 (A 4.167), Sāriputta visits Moggallāna and on being asked by Sāriputta, Moggallāna tells him that his (Moggallāna’s) mode of spiritual progress is painful but with quick direct knowledge.12 In the Sāriputta Moggallāna Sutta 2 (A 4.168), Moggallāna visits Sāriputta who says that his own mode of spiritual progress is pleasant with quick direct knowledge.13

3.2 Moggallāna attains arhatthood by swift realization (khippabhīniṁā), that is, in a week, but his progress is difficult (dukkha,paṭipadā), but needs the Buddha’s help, hence the swiftness in his insight. Sāriputta, on the other hand, takes only slightly longer in his progress (two weeks), but his progress is smooth

9 Māluṅkya.putta S: “When, Māluṅkyāputta, what is to be seen, heard, sensed and cognized by you, | in the seen there will only be the seen; | in the heard there will only be the heard; | in the sensed there will only be the sensed; | in the cognized there will only be the cognized…” (S 35.95,13/4:73), SD 5.9.

10 Vitakka Saññhāna S: “(3) If, monks, while the monk is examining the dangers of those thoughts, there still arises in him evil unskillful thoughts connected with desire, hate or delusion, then he should not mind them, disregard them” (asati amanasikkāra). (M 20.5/1:120), SD 1.6.

11 See (Vitthāra) Paṭipadā S (A 4.162/2:149 f), SD 18.3, esp (1).

12 Sāriputta Moggallāna S 1 (A 4.167/2:154 f), SD 46.16.

sukha,patipadā) and he swiftly gains insight listening to the Buddha exhorting the wanderer Dīgha,nakha (Digha,nakha Sutta, M 74).

Although Moggallāna has the Buddha’s personal guidance in his progress, he has a lesser range in insight, whereas Sāriputta is not only independent in his progress but has a wider range of insight. Hence, Sāriputta’s supremacy in wisdom.

3.3 The Pacalā Sutta is helpful in giving the methods of priming our meditation practice. It is put in the Sutta section (collection of sevens) of the Aṅguttara Nikāya because it lists 7 ways of dispelling drowsiness. The eighth factor, not exactly a “solution” for drowsiness, is to take a rest, and is not exactly a “method” of overcoming drowsiness. Hence, the Sutta is not classed in the Aṭṭhaka Nikāta (the collection of eight).

4 Cūla Tānḥā, saṅkhaya Sutta

In the second section of the Sutta, Moggallāna asks the Buddha this question [§11.1]:

“In what way, bhante, in brief, is a monk freed through the destruction of craving, that is, one who has reached total perfection, the total security from bondage, the total holy life, the total consumption, the highest amongst gods and humans?”

In the Cūla Tānḥā, saṅkhaya Sutta (M 37), the same question is asked, on the instigation of Moggallāna, by Sakka, the king of the devas, and the Buddha’s answer is identical to the passage here. It is possible that this passage originally belongs to the Cūla Tānḥā, saṅkhaya Sutta, but is added here by the Aṅguttara recitors for a more complete Sutta.

The events of the Cūla Tānḥā, saṅkhaya Sutta are clearly later than those of the Pacalā Sutta since the Cūla Tānḥā, saṅkhaya Sutta records the awakened Moggallāna as using his psychic powers to visit Sakra in his heaven. In the Pacalā Sutta, Moggallāna is still struggling in his meditation.

4 “Nothing is worth clinging to”

5.1 In the conclusion of the Pacalā Sutta, Moggallāna asks the Buddha how one is awakened [§11.1]. The Buddha begins by answering that the awakened one has learned that “nothing is worth clinging to” (sabbe dhammā nāla abhinivesāya) [§11.2]. The whole section [§11] is well known as “the brief advice on liberation through the destruction of craving,” and runs thus:

11.2 Here, the monk has learned [heard] that nothing is worth clinging to. And a monk has learned that nothing is worth clinging to, thus: he directly understands all things [he directly understands the nature of the all]. Having directly understood all things, he fully understands all things.

---

14 M 74,14/1:500 f @ SD 16.1.
15 Sāriputta, on account of his consistently great compassion, should also be seen as the foremost of monks who are compassionate, as exemplified by stories about his acts in the Dhammapada Commentary. There is officially no monastic declared as the foremost of “those who are compassionate” because every monastic is expected to be so.
16 M 37,15/1:255 f. Requests for brief instructions are found elsewhere in the Canon, eg V 1:39 (Sāriputta to Assa-ji): S 22.1/3:1-5 @ SD 5.4 (Nakula, pīṭha to the Buddha).
17 Sankhittena tanhā, saṅkhaya, vimutto (ovādo).
18 M 37,3/1:251 = A 7.58,11/4:8.8. The vocatives have been omitted. For nn on key terms, see sutta §11 below.
19 “He directly understands all things,” so sabbaṁ dhammaṁ abhijñāti, alt tr, “he directly understands the nature of the all.” Here the “all” (sabba) refers to the 6 senses and their respective sense-objects (Sabba S, S 35.23/4:15 @ SD 7.1).
20 “He fully understands,” parijñāti, here meaning “he comprehends, knows fully for certain.” This spiritual knowledge is called “full understanding” (pariññā), of which there are 3 kinds: (1) Full understanding of the known (nāta, pariññā), ie the discernment of the specific characteristics of a phenomena (“Form has the characteristic of

http://dharmafarer.org
11.3 Having fully understood all things, he knows whatever feelings there are, whether pleasant, painful or neither painful nor pleasant.

As regards to those feelings, he dwells contemplating impermanence in them; he dwells contemplating dispassion [fading away of lust] in them; he dwells contemplating ending [of suffering] in them; he dwells contemplating letting go [of defilements].

When he dwells contemplating impermanence in them, contemplating dispassion [fading away of lust] in them, contemplating ending [of suffering] in them, contemplating letting go [of defilements], he does not cling to anything in the world; not clinging, he is not agitated; not agitated, he attains nirvana for himself.

He understands. ‘Birth is destroyed, the holy life has been lived, done what is to be done, there is no more for this state of being.’ (M 37,3/1:251), SD 54.8 = (A 7.58,11/4:88), SD 4.11

5.2 This whole famous “brief advice on liberation through the destruction of craving” forms the main theme of the Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta (M 37), where the Buddha gives this teaching to Sakra, leader of the devas, in the presence of Moggallāna. To find out whether that Sakra remembered and understood the Buddha’s admonition, Moggallāna then visits the heaven of the thirty-three, where by a skillful means, Moggallāna reminds Sakra and the celestial king Vessavaṇa of the Buddha’s “brief advice” that nothing is worth clinging to. Moggallāna then returns to the Buddha to recount the incident to him. At that time, Sakra is already a streamwinner.

5.3 Passage 11.3 of the Pacalā Sutta is very close to that in the Avijjā Pahāna Sutta 2 (S 35.80). The ensuing passage [S 35.80.6b], however, is very different only in wording, but same in spirit, applying the teaching of “the all” (sabba): 25

6 Here, the monk has learned [heard] that nothing is worth clinging to. And if a monk has thus learned that nothing is worth clinging to, he directly knows all things. Having directly known all things, he fully understands all things.

6.2 Having fully understood everything, he sees all signs differently. 26

---

21 Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S (M 37,2-3/1:251), SD 54.8.
22 Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S (M 37,11-13/1:254 f), SD 54.8.
23 Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S (M 37,15/1:255), SD 54.8.
24 Sakkapaṇha S (D 21,2.10/2:289), SD 70.6.
25 Avijjā Pahāna 2 S (35.80,6/4:50), SD 16.9.
26 Here the “all” (sabba) refers to the 6 senses and their respective sense-objects (Sabba S, S 35.23/4:15 @ SD 7.1), here the respective consciousnesses are also included.
27 “He directly knows,” abhijñāṇī, ie through personal experience by way of spiritual insight. See sutta §11.2 n on abhijñāṇī.
28 “He fully understands,” pariññāṇī here, meaning “he comprehends, knows fully for certain.” See sutta §11.2 n on pariññāṇī.
29 “Sabbaṁ dhammaṁ pariññāyeva sahappacchitād paṇṇikkhāna aññato passati; cakkhum aññato passati, rūpe aññato passati, cakkhu,viññānam aññato passati;…yam p’idaṁ mano samphassa, paccayā uppajjati vedayitaṁ sukhāṁ va dukkhāṁ va adukkhāṁ asukhāṁ va. Tam pi annato passato.”
30 Comy: “He sees all signs differently” (sabba, nimmattā aññato passati) means that he sees the signs of formations (saṅkhāra, nimmattā) differently from those who have not fully understood the worldly inclinations (abhinivesā). For
He sees the eye differently; he sees forms differently; he sees eye-consciousness differently. Whatever feeling—whether pleasant, or painful, or neutral—that arises with eye-contact as condition, that, too, he sees differently.

He sees the ear differently; he sees sounds differently; he sees ear-consciousness differently. Whatever feeling—whether pleasant, or painful, or neutral—that arises with ear-contact as condition, that, too, he sees differently.

He sees the nose differently; he sees smells differently; he sees nose-consciousness differently. Whatever feeling—whether pleasant, or painful, or neutral—that arises with nose-contact as condition, that, too, he sees differently.

He sees the tongue differently; he sees tastes differently; he sees tongue-consciousness differently. Whatever feeling—whether pleasant, or painful, or neutral—that arises with tongue-contact as condition, that, too, he sees differently.

He sees the body differently; he sees touches differently; he sees body-consciousness differently. Whatever feeling—whether pleasant, or painful, or neutral—that arises with body-contact as condition, that, too, he sees differently.

He sees the mind differently; he sees mind-objects differently; he sees mind-consciousness differently. Whatever feeling—whether pleasant, or painful, or neutral—that arises with mind-contact as condition, that, too, he sees differently.

Monk, when a monk knows and sees thus, ignorance is abandoned by him and true knowledge (vijjā) arises. (S 35.80/4:50), SD 16.9

6 Related suttas

6.1 There are a number of suttas, like the Pacalā Sutta, giving practical steps in overcoming distractions to meditation and spiritual development. The (Thīna,middha) Tissa Sutta (S 22.84) also deals with overcoming sloth and torpor, but through the application of insight.

6.2 The Vitakka Saṇṭhāna Sutta (M 20) teaches 5 methods of “stilling the mind,” that is, ridding of distracting thoughts, namely:

(1) applying a different meditation sign (thought displacement);
(2) examining the dangers of the distracting thought (aversion therapy);
(3) disregarding the distracting thought (non-attention or avoidance);
(4) identifying the causes of the distraction (thought reduction); and
(5) sustained effort.

In regards to method (3), the Majjhima Commentary suggests 6 other methods:

(1) occupy ourselves with something else;
(2) recite some work explaining a doctrine;
(3) read a Dharma text (like a pūjā book);
(4) examine the parts of an object from his bag, like fire-sticks (“this is the upper stick; this is the lower stick”);
(5) carefully and reflectively examine his requisites (“this is the awl; this is a pair of scissors; this is the nail cutter; this is the needle”);
(6) darn the worn-out parts of the robe. (MA 3:90 f).

6.3 The Āghāta Paṭivinaya Sutta (A 5.161) gives 5 methods for putting away ill will:

(1) by cultivating lovingkindness (towards the person);
(2) by cultivating compassion;

such people see all signs as self, but one who has fully understood the worldly inclinations, sees them as not-self, not as a self. Thus is the characteristic of not-self discussed in this sutta (SA 2:370). On “sign” (nimitta), see SD 19.7.

31 (Thīna,middha) Tissa S (S 22.84/3:106-109), SD 32.12.

32 See Vitakka Saṇṭhāna S (M 20/1:118-122), SD 1.6.
(3) by cultivating equanimity;  
(4) by simply disregarding the person;  
(5) by applying the thought that we are each the owner of our karma, the heir to our karma, karma is the source (“womb”) of our being, karma is our real relations, karma is our refuge, and that we are responsible for our deeds. (A 5.161).

---

The Discourse on Nodding Off
A 7.58

[85]
1 Thus have I heard.  
At one time the Blessed One was staying in the Deer Park in the Bhesakā Forest at Suṅsumāra, giri in the Bhaggā country.  

MAHĀ MOGGALLĀNA’S DROWSINESS

1.2 At that time the venerable Mahā Moggallāna was sitting and nodding [while trying to meditate] in the village of Kallavā, mutta in Magadha. Through the divine eye [clairvoyance], purifying and surpassing the human, the Blessed One saw the venerable Mahā Moggallāna sitting and nodding in the village of Kallavā, mutta in Magadha.  
1.3 Then, just as a strong man would stretch his bent arm or would bend his stretched arm, the Blessed One disappeared from the Deer Park in the Bhesakā Forest at Suṅsumāra, giri in Bhaggā country and immediately appeared before the venerable Mahā Moggallāna sitting and nodding in the village of Kallavā, mutta in Magadha.  
The Blessed One sat down on the prepared seat.  

The 8 ways of overcoming drowsiness
1.4 Having sat down, the Blessed One said this to the venerable Mahā Moggallāna:  
“Are you nodding, Moggallāna? Are you nodding, Moggallāna?”  
“Yes, bhante.”

---

33 Comy: Gladness is omitted here since it is very difficult for such a person to cultivate it at this point. (AA 3:294).  
34 Āgīṭha Paṭivinaya S (A 5.161/3:186), SD 12.23.  
35 So called because it is the home of the yakshinī Bhesakalī (SA 2:249). The house of Nakula, pitā and Nakula, mātā is nearby.  
36 Sunsumāra,giri: see Nakula, pitā S (S 22.1), SD 5.4(1).  
37 For details regarding Bhaggā, see Nakula, pitā S (S 22.1), SD 5.4 Intro & Appendix.  
38 See Intro (1) above.  
39 Dibba,cakkhu, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (dhamma,cakkhu) (D 2.95/1:82), which is an advanced form of clairvoyance, but it is inferior to the wisdom eye (paññā,cakkhu) which is the wisdom of the arhat. The Cūḷa Nidāsa mentions 5 kinds of eyes: (1) the physical eye (maṇīsa,cakkhu); (2) the divine eye (dibba, cakkhu); (3) the wisdom eye (paññā,cakkhu) of the arhats; (4) the Buddha eye (Buddha-cakkhu); and (5) the universal eye (saṃanta, cakkhu), the omniscience of the Buddhas (Ne 235; nos 1-2 are at It 52). On the Buddha’s omniscience, see Kaṇṇaka-t,thala S (M 90/2:125-133), SD 10.8 (2) & Sandaka S (M 76), SD 35.7.
2 (1) MENTAL NOTING. “In that case, Moggallāna, when you perceive that drowsiness is descending upon you, you should make a mental note of that perception; [86] frequently make that perception. It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away. [41]

3 (2) REFLECTION. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should think about, ponder over, mentally attend to a teaching that you have learned, [42] that you have mastered.

It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.

4 (3) RECITATION. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should recite in detail a teaching that you have learned. It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.

5 (4) MASSAGE. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should rub both your ears [in a circular manner with your palms] and massage your limbs. [43]

It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.

6 (5) LOOK AROUND. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should rise, wash your eyes with some water, look around yourself [at the surrounding] and look up at the stars and constellations.

It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.

7 (6) PERCEPTION OF LIGHT. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should practise the perception of light, determine the perception of daylight: just as day is, so is night; just as night is, so is day. [44] Thus through a mind that is open and unhindered, you should cultivate a mind of bright light. [45] It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away. [46] [87]

---

40 “When you perceive...of that perception,” PTS yathā saññissa te viharato taṁ middham okkamati, taṁ saññāṁ manasākāsi taṁ saññāṁ bahulaṁ akāsi. Se yathā saññissa te viharato taṁ middham okkamati, taṁ saññāṁ manasi,-kareyyāsi, taṁ saññāṁ bahulaṁ kareyyāsi. But there are variants: Ce yathā saññino te viharato taṁ middham okkami ti taṁ saññāṁ mā manasikāsi taṁ saññāṁ mā bahulaṁ akāsi; Be yathā saññissa te viharato taṁ middham okkamati, taṁ saññāṁ mā manasākāsi, taṁ saññāṁ mā bahulam-akāsi. Bodhi, 1999: “At whatever thought drowsiness befalls you, you should not give attention to that thought.” (A:B). Thānissaro, 2002: “Whatever perception you have in mind when drowsiness descends on you, don’t attend to that perception, don’t pursue it.”

41 This method includes “labelling” it simply as “drowsy...drowsy...” or “sleepy...sleepy...”. Or, smiling at the sleepiness, showing it lovingkindness, and then reverting to the meditation-object.

42 “That you have learned,” yathā,sutam, lit “according to what you have heard.”

43 “Rub both your ears...massage your limbs,” tato tvam...ubho kamma,sotāṁ āvijeyyāsi pānīnā gattāni anumajjeyyāsi. I take āvijeyyāsi as pot 2nd sg of āvijjhati, to move in a circular motion (instead of āvijjhati, to pull, to draw, to attract). See CPD: āvijjhati, etc. The word anumajjeyasi, “you should massage,” is pot 2nd sg of anumajjati, (a) to rub along, to stroke; (b) to beat, flog, pound (CPD). For the first phrase, the Thai tr has แต่นั้นเธอพึงยอนช่องหูทั้งสองข้าง, “then you should put your fingers into both ears.”

44 Comy to Iddhi,pāda Vibhaṅga S (S 51.20/10/5:278), SD 28.14 on the perception of light (āloka,saññā), gives the foll instructions: “A monk [meditator] sits in an open space [ānigaṇa] attending to the perception of light, now shutting his eyes, now opening his eyes. When, having opened his eyes, he closes them and, it appears just as if he sees (olokentassa vīya), then the perception of light has arisen. It is also called the ‘perception of day’ (dvā,saññā), and with its arising in the night, it is said to be well mastered.” (SA:3:260).

45 Iī vivaṭṭena [vī vivaṭṭena] cetasā aparīyodaddhena sappabbaśam cittan bhāveyyāsi. Here, “open and unhindered” (vivaṭṭena...aparīyonaddhena) alludes to avoiding the first 2 of the “4 faults” (catu,dosa) in meditation, ie, against being “too slack” (atilīna) or “too tense” (atipagghahita): see Iddhi,pāda Vibhaṅga S (S 51.20/5:276-281), SD 28.14. See §8n below on the last 2 of the 4 faults.

46 As at Samādi Bhāvanā S (A 4.41/3/2:45), SD 24.1, & (Anussatiṭṭhāna) Udāyi S (A 6.29/3:322-325), SD 24.8. See also Thīna,middha, SD 32.6 (3.2).
8 (7) WALKING MEDITATION. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should, perceiving before and after, be resolute in walking back and forth,\textsuperscript{48} with the senses turned inward, with the mind not straying outward.\textsuperscript{49}

It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.\textsuperscript{50}

9 (8) REST. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, mindful and fully aware, you should lie down lion-like on your right side, placing foot on foot, keeping in mind the time for rising; and on awaking, Moggallāna, you would rise quickly, thinking, ‘I will dwell without indulging in the pleasure of sleep, or in the pleasure of reclining, or in the pleasure of drowsiness.’\textsuperscript{51}

Thus, Moggallāna, you should train yourself.

CONDITIONS CONducive to Concentration

Humility

10 Therefore, Moggallāna, you should train yourself, ‘I shall not approach families [for alms] with my nose in the air.’\textsuperscript{52} Thus, Moggallāna, you should train yourself.

10.2 If, Moggallāna, a monk approaches a family with his nose in the air—and Moggallāna there are families that are busy with various kinds of business who do not think about a monk who has come—then such a monk might think, ‘Who I wonder has cut me off from this family. Now these people seem to be displeased with me.’\textsuperscript{53}

10.3 Thus through not receiving [almsfood], he becomes discontented; being discontented, he becomes restless; being restless, he becomes unrestrained [in his senses]; being unrestrained, his mind will be far from attaining concentration.

Non-confrontational speech

10.4 Therefore, Moggallāna, you should train yourself thus, ‘I shall not speak in a confrontational manner.’ Thus, Moggallāna, you should train yourself.

\textsuperscript{47}This whole para: No ce te evah viharato taṁ middhaṁ pahīyetha, tato tvaṁ moggallāna pacchā, pure saṁñī [v1 pacchā, pure tathā, saṁñī] cañkamaṁ adhiṭṭhahiyāyā anto gatehi indriyehi abahigatena mānasena. Ṭhānaṁ kho paṁ 'etaṁ viṁjitā, yaṁ te evah viharato taṁ middhaṁ pahīyetha.

\textsuperscript{48}Pacchā,pure saṁñī cañkamaṁ adhiṭṭhahiyāyā. Here pacchā,pure saṁñī can have a simple spatial meaning: be mindful of what is behind you, what is in front of you. The important phrase pacchā,pure is also found in Ādhiṭṭhā Vībhāṅga S (S 51.20), where it simply refers to the whole practice, from beginning to end: S 51.20/5:277 f @ SD 28.14. This sense also applies here. For effective practice, both senses should be applied (albeit, noting that the latter meaning prevails: see foll n).

\textsuperscript{49}Anto,gatehi indriyehi abahi,gatena manasena. “with senses turned inward” (adhiṭṭhahiyāyā...anto,gatehi indriyehi) is actually synonymous with the fol phrase, “with the mind not straying outwards” (adhiṭṭhahiyāyā...abahi,gatena manasena), to avoiding it from being “distracted externally” (bahiddhā vikkhita). Comy explains “with the senses turn inward” as follows: “What is internal is not distracted with the external, with the pervasion of the 5 sense-faculties” (anto,gatehi indriyehi abahi avikkhittehi anto anupavīṭṭheh ‘eva pāñcahi indriyehi, AA 4:41). On the 5 benefits of walking meditation, see Cañkamana S (A 5.29/3:29 f), SD 76.3.


\textsuperscript{51}“Mindful and fully aware...or in the pleasure of reclining, or in the pleasure of drowsiness,” tato tvaṁ moggallāna dakkhiṇena passena sīha, sonyam kappeyyāsi pādena pādam adhāya santapaṇīyo utthāna, saṁñī ca manasa-sikarita, paṭiṭhuddhena ca te moggallāna khippaṁ yeva paccuṭṭhatuhabban ‘na seyya, dukhaṁ na passa, sukhaṁ na middha, sukhaṁ anuvutto viharissāmi ti. “Reclining” here is passa, lit “lying on the side.” On the significance of this passage, see SD 76.3 (1.2.2).

\textsuperscript{52}“With my nose in the air,” uccā, sonda, lit “(of an elephant) with the trunk raised high,” ie with pride, arrogantly. This could be the origin of this common saying.

\textsuperscript{53}“Now these people seem to be displeased with me,” viratta, ṛūpā dānime mayī manussā (following Be).

\textsuperscript{54}Na viggāhi,kathāṁ kathessāmi. On viggāhi, kathā, cf D 1:8; Sn 930; Nm 1:394 (which quotes this sutta). See also M 2:3; S 3:12.
10.5 When there is confrontational talk, there would surely be wordiness; with wordiness, there is restlessness; with restlessness, there is lack of restraint [of the senses]; when there is lack of restraint, the mind is far from concentration.

Suitable dwelling place

10.6 Moggallāna, neither do I praise all (worldly) engagements\(^55\) nor do I, Moggallāna, [88] blame all (worldly) engagements either.

Moggallāna, I do not praise the association between householders and renunciants; but as regards association with dwellings with few sounds, little noise, cooled by breezes, secluded from humans, suitable for solitude\(^56\)—this I praise.”

THE REALIZATION OF INSIGHT

“Nothing is worth clinging to”\(^57\)

11 When this was said, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna said this to the Blessed One:

“In what way, bhante, in brief, is a monk freed through the destruction of craving, that is, one who has reached total\(^58\) perfection, the total security from bondage, the total holy life, the total consummation, the highest amongst gods and humans?”\(^59\)

11.2 Here, Moggallāna, the monk has learned\(^60\) that nothing is worth clinging to.\(^62\) And, Moggallāna, a monk has learned that nothing is worth clinging to, thus: he directly knows\(^63\) all things [he directly knows the nature of the all].\(^64\) Having directly known the nature of all things, he fully understands\(^65\) all things.

---

\(^{55}\) “(Worldly) engagements,” \(\text{samsagga,}\) also “association, contact.”

\(^{56}\) This is stock: V 1:39; D 3:38; M 2:118, 3:13.

\(^{57}\) This section is known as “the brief advice on liberation through the destruction of craving.” This whole section is at \(\text{Cūḷa Tārā, saṅkhaya S}\) (M 37.2-3:1:251), SD 54.8, whose events are clearly set after those of the Paċcaḷā S since the Cūḷa Tārā, saṅkhaya S records the awakened Moggallāna as using his psychic powers to visit Sakra in his heaven. §§11.1–2 are found in \(\text{Avijjā Pahāṇa S 2}\) (A 35.80,6/4:88,11-15), SD 16.9. Their ensuing passages, however, are different. See Intro (5).

\(^{58}\) “Total,” \(\text{accaṇta,}\) also “absolute.”

\(^{59}\) In \(\text{Cūḷa Tārā, saṅkhaya S}\) (M 37.15/1:255 f), Sakra, the leader of the gods, on the instigation of Moggallāna, asks the same question and the Buddha’s answer is identical to the passage here. It is possible that this passage originally belongs to the Cūḷa Tārā, saṅkhaya S, but is added here by the Aṅguttara reciters for a more complete Sutta. Requests for brief instructions are found elsewhere in the Canon, eg V 1:39 (Sāriputta to Assaji); S 22.1/3:1-5 (Nakula, pitā to the Buddha).

\(^{60}\) This passage [11.2] is also found in \(\text{Avijjā Pahāṇa S 2}\) (A 35/80). The ensuing passages, however, are different [4].

\(^{61}\) “Has learned,” \(\text{sutta,}\) lit “has heard.”

\(^{62}\) “Nothing is worth clinging to,” \(\text{sabbe dhammā nālāṁ abhinivesāyā,}\) lit “all things are not worthy of adhering to.”

\(^{63}\) “He directly knows,” \(\text{abhijñānāti,}\) here meaning to know for oneself by insight, ie through higher self-knowledge or \(\text{abhīnā.}\) Traditionally, there are 6 direct knowledges (\(\text{abhīnāā,}\)): (1) psychic powers (\(\text{iddhi, vidhā,}\)) (2) the “divine ear” or clairaudience (\(\text{dibba, sota,}\)), (3) mind-reading, ie the ability to read the thoughts of others (\(\text{parassa ceto, - partiya,nāṇā,}\)), (4) the recollection of one’s own past lives (\(\text{pubbe, nivāsānussati,}\)) (5) the “divine eye” (\(\text{dibba, cakkhu,}\)) ie the knowledge of the passing away and arising of beings, faring according to their karma, and (6) the destruction of mental influxes (\(\text{āsava-k, khaya,}\)) ie arhathood. Nos 4-6 are known as “the three knowledges (\(\text{te, vijjā,}\))” (D 3:281; A 3:280). Comy says that this knowledge here refers to \(\text{nīta, pariṇā,}\) (A 4:43): see foll n.

\(^{64}\) “He directly knows all things,” \(\text{so sabbaṁ dhammaṁ abhijñānāti,}\) alt tr, “he directly knows the nature of the all.” Here the “all” (\(\text{sabba,}\)) refers to the 6 senses and their respective sense-objects (\(\text{Sabba S, S 35.23/4:15 @ SD 7.1.}\)
11.3 Having fully understood all things, he knows whatever feelings there are, whether pleasant, painful or neither painful nor pleasant.

11.4 As regards to those feelings, he dwells contemplating impermanence in them;
    he dwells contemplating dispassion [fading away of lust] in them;
    he dwells contemplating ending (of suffering) in them;
    he dwells contemplating letting go (of defilements).66

11.5 When he dwells contemplating impermanence in them, contemplating dispassion in them, contemplating ending in them, contemplating letting go,
he does not cling to anything in the world.

    Not clinging, he is not agitated; being not agitated, he himself surely attains nirvana.67

11.6 He understands,
    ‘Birth is destroyed, the holy life has been lived, done what is to be done, there is no more for this state of being.’68

11.7 That, Moggallāna, is, in brief, how a monk is freed through the destruction of craving, that is, one who has reached total69 perfection, the total security from bondage, the total holy life, the total consummation, the highest amongst gods and humans.70

--- evam ---

040817 rev061023 071208 081228 091202r 100527 111031 121231 131015 141028 150612

--- notes ---

65 “He fully understands,” pariñāṇāti: see (6.1) (11.2) n.
66 The monk effects the abandoning of the mental hindrances by the contemplations of impermanence (anicānu-passanā), fading away (of lust) (viragānupassanā), cessation (of suffering) (nirodhānupassanā) and of letting go (of defilements) (pañīnissaggānupassanā), and thus comes to look upon feelings (all experiences) with equanimity.
67 Anupādiyaṁ na paritassati, aparitassaṁ paccattaṁ, eva parinibbāyati. On paccattaṁ eva parinibbāyati, cf Cūḷa Taṇhā.saṅkhaya S (M 37,3/1:251 f, by fully understanding “the all, sabba”), SD 54.8; Pacālā S (A 7.58/4:88, by contemplating “nothing is worth clinging to”), SD 4.11. Comy says that he brings himself to nirvana (ie by his own efforts) by the utter extinction of defilements (sayam eva kilesa, parinibbānena, MA 2:18, 299).
68 This para describing the arhat is stock: V 1:14; D 1:84; M 2:39; S 2:82.
69 “Total,” accanta, also “absolute.”
70 As a result of this teaching, Moggallāna is fully freed as an arhat (AA 4:44,23). On this passage’s significance, see Entering the stream, SD 3.3 (1.5).