

13

(Ānanda) Subha Sutta

The Discourse to Subha (by Ānanda) | D 10/1:204-210

Theme: The three trainings

Translated by Piya Tan ©2007

1 Subha and the Subha Suttas

1.1 TEACHINGS GIVEN TO SUBHA. Subha is a “young brahmin” (*māṇava*), son of the brahmin Todeyya, “the one from the village of Tudi” (*todeyya,putta*).¹ Apparently, at first, Subha has no faith in the Buddha, and is even antagonistic to him. This is evident especially from the accounts of teachings given to him in the first two suttas, as given below.

At least three well known suttas record such meetings between Subha and the Buddha or his disciple:

Cūḷa Kamma Vibhaṅga Sutta ²	karma and its fruition	M 135/3:202-206 ³ = SD 4.15
(Brahma,vihāra) Subha Sutta	Godliness is within us	M 99/2:196-206 = SD 38.6
(Ānanda) Subha Sutta	a conversation between Subha and Ānanda, soon after the Buddha’s passing	D 10/1:204-210 = SD 40a.13

1.2 CŪḶA KAMMA VIBHAṄGA SUTTA. It is likely that Subha’s first meeting with the Buddha is recorded in **the Cūḷa Kamma Vibhaṅga Sutta** (M 135), by which time Subha’s father, Todeyya, has already died. When the Buddha points out that the dog in Subha’s house, which he is fond of, is actually Todeyya himself reborn, Subha is understandably very upset, claiming that his father, like any brahmin, has been reborn in the brahma world.

The Buddha then confirms the dog’s identity by getting it to show where some of his erstwhile father’s treasure are buried. The dog is later reborn in hell. To refute the Buddha, Subha visits the monastery, and this is the occasion for the teaching of the Subha Sutta, better known as **the Cūḷa Kamma Vibhaṅga Sutta** (M 135).⁴ According to Buddhaghosa, the actual title of this discourse is **the Subha Sutta** (MA 5.15), which then should be properly called “the (Kamma) Subha Sutta,” to differentiate it from the other two Subha Suttas.

1.3 SUBHA’S REFUGE-GOING. Although Subha goes for refuge at the end of the Cūḷa Kamma Vibhaṅga Sutta, he continues to debate with Buddha, as recounted in **the (Brahma,vihāra) Subha Sutta** (M 99). This suggests that the refuge-taking is probably merely a convention for showing acquiescence to the teacher whose answers one has accepted, that is, an acknowledgement that the Buddha is right. It is no indication whether Subha has spiritually matured in any way.

In fact, in the (Brahma,vihāra) Subha Sutta, too, we see, a hostile Subha, at least at the start of the Buddha’s instructions. When the Buddha compared the brahmins to a file of the blind leading the blind, Subha, visibly upset, “simply scolded and reviled the Blessed One, saying, ‘The recluse Gotama will be proven wrong!’ (*samaṇo gotamo pāpito bhavissatīti*).”⁵ However, as he listens to the Buddha clear arguments and teachings, he becomes more convinced.

1.4 (BRAHMA,VIHĀRA) SUBHA SUTTA.⁶ This Sutta shows Subha continuing to debate with the Buddha, but on a broader and deeper level. In the first part of the Sutta, the Buddha refutes Subha’s charge that the recluses, especially the Buddha’s monastics, are not “gainfully employed.” The Buddha’s res-

¹ See **Cūḷa Kamma Vibhaṅga S** (M 135) @ SD 4.15 (1) & **(Brahma,vihāra) Subha S** (M 99) @ SD 38.6 (3)..

² Buddhaghosa calls it **Subha S** (MA 5:15 colophon). See foll n & M:H 3:248 n1.

³ Also called **Subha S** (DA 384 f); in which case, it should be disambiguated as **(Kamma) Subha S**.

⁴ DA 2:384; MA 5:8 f. See further **(Brahma,vihāra) Subha S** (M 99/2:196-209), SD 38.6 (1.2).

⁵ Subha’s reaction can be colloquially rendered as, “The recluse Gotama is wicked in saying so!” M 99.9.10/

⁶ The refs in italicized [square brackets] are to **(Brahma,vihāra) Subha S** (M 99) itself.

ponse is that his monastics are renunciants who have given up the world so that they can achieve what the world cannot give them, that is, true happiness and mental liberation.⁷

Subha then presents a set of special virtues (truth, austerity, celibacy, study and charity) held by the brahmins. The Buddha then asks Subha if he sees such qualities in any of the brahmins, even the great sages of the past, that they have realized these qualities through “direct knowledge” or personal attainment. Subha has to answer no. The Buddha goes on to discourse in the vitality of direct knowledge, especially through deep meditation, and how this is done.

The brahmins, the Buddha points out, are seen to show rivalry and anger, vying even for something as mundane as the best offerings in the refectory. Hence, they need to add a sixth virtue, “compassion.”⁸ Having softened Subha’s mind, the Buddha goes on to deeper teachings of the mind, beginning with “a gladness connected with the wholesome as a support for the mind, that is, a basis for dhyanic meditation [§21.3].

Using a parable of a village native, the Buddha declares that he has full direct knowledge [§22]. Subha then invites the Buddha to instruct him on the divine abodes [§23], which the Buddha does [§24]. In the **(Brahma, vihāra) Subha Sutta** (M 99), we see Subha presenting before the Buddha the external “virtues” by which the brahmins try to promote themselves, the Buddha carefully explains that it is the *internal and spiritual* qualities that really matter.⁹

Subha goes for refuge in the Buddha again (for the third time) [§28] and leaves [§29]. On his way, he meets the brahmin Jāṇussoṇi, who asks after him. Subha exults in the Buddha’s teachings, and Jāṇussoṇi responds with his own exultation. [§§30-31].¹⁰ This is probably Subha’s last meeting with the Buddha. The next time we see him, after the Buddha’s passing, inviting Ānanda to his house, and asking about the central teaching of the Buddha. This is recorded in the (Ānanda) Subha Sutta, where we see him as a more receptive listener, even follower

2 The (Ānanda) Subha Sutta and its teachings

2.1 THE SUTTA BACKGROUND. The historical background to the **(Ānanda) Subha Sutta** is given in the Vinaya Commentary, which says that, some months after the Buddha’s passing, when the rains retreat was over, while Mahā Kassapa headed for Rājagaha, Ānanda, too, left with a company of monk for the same destination, by way on a Dharma tour heading for Sāvattihī first, giving Dharma teachings along the way to console those who mourn the Buddha’s death.

As soon as he arrived in Sāvattihī, Ānanda cleans up the Buddha’s fragrant cell, such as arranging the seats and putting it in order, as if the Buddha were still alive. On the next day, the elder took some purgative in milk (*khīra, virecana*) for his health because “his bodily humours were disturbed on account of the sedentary life he had led from the time of the Buddha’s passing away.”¹¹

It is on this day that the brahmin youth Subha’s messenger comes to invite him [§§1.1-1.3], but he turns down the invitation that day [§§1.4], saying, “It is not the right time, boy. Today, I have taken [drunk] some medicine” [§1.4.1]. On the following day, accompanied by the elder Cetaka as his attendant monk, he visits Subha and gives him the teachings [§1.5], as recorded in the (Ānanda) Subha Sutta. (VA 1:8 f).

1.2 SUTTA HIGHLIGHTS. The (Ānanda) Subha Sutta is straightforward. Soon after the Buddha’s passing, the brahmin youth Subha invites Ānanda to his house. There he asks Ānanda regarding “the teachings that the master Gotama speaks in praise of, and in what does he rouse, instill and establish these people” [§1.5.8-9], that is, the Buddha’s key teachings for the public.

⁷ M 99.3-7/2:197 f = SD 18.6.

⁸ M 38.6.9-20/2:199-204 = SD 38.6.

⁹ M 99/2:196-209 + SD 38.6 (1.1.1 & 1.1.9).

¹⁰ For more details, see **(Brahma, vihāra) Subha S** (M 99) @ SD 38.6 (1.1).

¹¹ *Atha therō bhagavato parinibbānato-p, pabhuti thāna, nisajja, bahulattatā ussanna, dhātukam kāyam samassāsetum, dutiya, divase khīra, virecanam pivivā vihāre yeva nisidi* (VA 1:9).

The teachings given by Ānanda, as recounted in the Sutta, is almost verbatim to that of **the Sāmañña-phala Sutta** (D 2), that is, on the three trainings (*ti,sikkhā*) or the fruits of recluseship (*sāmañña,phala*). After the introductory summary (*uddesa*) [§1.6], there is the teaching on the first training, that on “the aggregate on moral virtue” (*sīla-k,handha*), otherwise famously known as “the moralities” (*sīla*)¹² [§§1.2-18], followed by the second training, “the aggregates on mental concentration” (*samādhi-k,khandha*), mostly on the preparations for meditation and details on the four dhyanas [§§2.2-20], and then the third training, “the aggregate on wisdom” (*pañña-k,khandha*) [§§2.21-38].

The (Ānanda) Subha Sutta differs from the Sāmañña,phala Sutta in that at the end of each teaching on the three aggregates, Subha exults that the teaching give is complete in every way, unlike that of those outside of the Buddha Dharma [§§1.32, 2.19, 2.39]. Subha then goes for refuge with Ānanda as his witness [§§2.40-42].

1.3 THE SUTTA’S THREE TRAININGS. The benefits of being *well purified in moral virtue* are often stated in the Suttas in a progressive manner leading up to spiritual liberation. **The Cetanā’karaṇīya Sutta** (A 10.2), for example, states that when we are morally virtuous, the other spiritual states arise naturally, without even the need for cultivating them volitionally (*cetanā’karaṇīya*), thus:

(1) For the virtuous (<i>sīla,vata</i>),	there arises freedom from remorse	(<i>appaṭisāra</i>).
(2) For the remorseless,	there arises joy	(<i>pamudita</i>).
(3) For the joyful,	there arises a zestful mind	(<i>pīta,mana</i>).
(4) For the zestful minded,	there arises a calm body	(<i>passaddha,kāya</i>).
(5) For the calm-bodied,	there arises happiness	(<i>sukha</i>).
(6) For the happy,	there arises concentration	(<i>samādhi</i>).
(7) For the concentrated,	there arises the vision of true reality	(<i>yathā,bhūta</i>).
(8) For one who sees true reality,	there arises revulsion	(<i>nibbidā</i>).
(9) For the revulsed,	there is the knowledge and vision of liberation	(<i>vimutti,ñāṇa.dassana</i>)

(A 10.2/5:2-4) = SD 41.6 (abridged)¹³

This statement elaborates the threefold training (*ti,sikkhā*) into their various progressive stages, centred around meditation, that is to say, based on moral virtue (*sīla*) (1-2), we have good mental concentration (*samādhi*) (3-7), which in turn bring us liberating wisdom (*paññā*) (8-9).¹⁴

— — —

The Discourse to Subha (by Ānanda)

D 10/1:204-210

1.1 [204] Thus have I heard.

At one time, the venerable Ānanda was staying in Anātha,piṇḍika’s park in Jeta’s grove [Jeta,vana] outside Sāvathī, not long after the Blessed One had passed into final nirvana.

Subha invites Ānanda to his house

1.2 Then the brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta [son of Todeyya] addressed a certain boy:

“Come now, boy, approach the recluse Ānanda with this word of mine, asking after his health, that he has good health, mental ease, vigour, strength and comfort,¹⁵ saying thus:

¹² See **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2), SD 8.10 (3).

¹³ The **Parivāra**, a late Sinhala appendix to the Vinaya, has a similar list: Par 12.2 = V 5:164.

¹⁴ On the three trainings (*sikkhā*), see **(Ti) Sikkhā S** (A 3.88/1:235), SD 24.10c.

‘The brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta asks after master Ānanda’s health, that he has good health, mental ease, vigour, strength and comfort.’

And saying thus: ‘It would be good if master Ānanda were, out of compassion, to come to the brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta’s house.’

1.3 “Yes, sir,” the boy replied in assent to the brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta, and approached the venerable Ānanda.

Having approached the venerable Ānanda, he exchanged greetings with him. When this courteous and friendly exchange was concluded, he sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, the boy said this to the venerable Ānanda:

“The brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta asks after master Ānanda’s health, that he has good health, mental ease, vigour, strength and comfort.

And he says thus: ‘It would be good if master Ānanda were, out of compassion, to come to the brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta’s house.’” [205]

Ānanda is unwell

1.4.1 When this was said, the venerable Ānanda said this to the boy:

“It is not the right time, boy. Today, I have taken [drunk] some medicine.¹⁶ Perhaps tomorrow would be a good time for me to pay a visit, if the time and occasion permit.”¹⁷

“Yes, sir,” the boy replied to the venerable Ānanda in assent, rose from his seat and approached the brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta.

1.4.2 Having approached the brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta, he said this to him:

“The master’s word has been conveyed to the master Ānanda, that the brahmin Subha Māṇava Todeyya,putta¹⁸ asks after his health, that he has good health, mental ease, vigour, strength and comfort.¹⁹

1.4.3 And when this was said: ‘It would be good if master Ānanda were, out of compassion, to come to the brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta’s house,’

1.4.4 the master recluse Ānanda said this to me: ‘It is not the right time, boy. Today, I have taken [drunk] some medicine. Perhaps tomorrow would be a good time for me to pay a visit, if the time and occasion permit.’

1.4.5 To that extent, sir, this task has been accomplished. That being the case, the master Ānanda, sir, there is the chance that he will be coming tomorrow.”²⁰

1.5.1 When the night had passed [at dawn], the venerable Ānanda, having dressed himself in the morning and taking robe and bowl, went, with the monk Ceṭaka [Cetiya] as attendant monk,²¹ to the house of the brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta.

1.5.2 When he arrived, he sat down on the arranged seat.

1.5.3 Then the brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta approached the venerable Ānanda.

¹⁵ “Asks after his health...etc,” *app’ābādham app’ātākaṃ lahu-ṭ,ṭhānaṃ balaṃ phāsu,vihāraṃ pucchati*, lit “ask (if) he is free from sickness, free from illness, in a state of lightness, having strength, dwelling in comfort.” This is stock: **V** 2:127 f×4; **D** 10.1.2/1:204×2, 10.1.4/1:205, **12.4-6/1:225 f×3**, **16.1.2(×2)+3/2:72 f**; **M** 85.32:91×3, **87.6/-2:108×3**, **90.2-4/2:125 f×6**, **91.26/2:141×3**; **A** 7.20.1/4:17 f×2; **U** 2.8/15×3, **5.6/58×3**; **Miln** 14×2.

¹⁶ *Atthi me aṭṭha bhesajja,mattā pītā*. *Pītā* is pp of *pīvati*, “he drinks,” seems to be found only here (D 1:205,6+19), other occurrences are comy; VA 1:9, 5:1144×2, 1145; DA 1:7, 2:665; SA 1:316, 3:295; KhpA 94; DhA 3:101; CA 49; not to be confused with the more common *pītā* (n & adj), “yellow” (V 1:198, 199×5, 220, 221, 231, 275×3, 276; D 2:96; A 3:239, 4:263, 264; Vv 26, 76, 114; Ap 1:1, 308)

¹⁷ *App’eva,nāma sve’pi upasaṅkameyyāma kālaṃ ca samayaṃ ca upādāyāti*.

¹⁸ “Subha Māṇava Todeyya,putta.” This is a more polite form of address which the servant boy is likely to use.

¹⁹ *Avocumha kho mayam bhoṭo vacanena taṃ bhavantam ānandaṃ, subho māṇavo todeyya,putto bhavantam ānandaṃ app’ābādham app’ātākaṃ lahu-ṭ,ṭhānaṃ balaṃ phāsu,vihāraṃ pucchati*.

²⁰ *Ettāvata’pi kho bho katam eva etaṃ, yato so bho bhavaṃ ānando okāsam akāsi svātānāya’pi upasaṅkamanāya*.

²¹ *Cetakena bhikkhunā pacchā,samaṇena*.

1.5.4 Having approached, he exchanged greetings with the venerable Ānanda. When this courteous and friendly exchange was concluded, he sat down at one side.

1.5.5 Sitting thus at one side, the brahmin youth Subha Todeyya,putta said this to the venerable Ānanda: [204]

1.5.6 “The master Ānanda had for a long time been the master Gotama’s personal attendant, often in his presence, living near him.²²

1.5.7 The master Ānanda would know what teachings [dharma] that the master Gotama spoke in praise of,²³ in which he would rouse, instill and establish these people.²⁴

1.5.8 What, master Ānanda, are the teachings that the master Gotama speaks in praise of,

1.5.9 and in what does he rouse, instill and establish these people?”

1.6.1 “The Blessed One, young brahmin, speaks in praise of the three aggregates, And it is here that he rouses, instills and establishes these people.

1.6.2 In what three?

- | | |
|--|--------------------------------|
| (A) The noble aggregate of moral virtue, | <i>ariya sīla-k,khandha</i> |
| (B) the noble aggregate of mental concentration, | <i>ariya samādhi-k,khandha</i> |
| (C) the noble aggregate of wisdom. | <i>ariya pañña-k,khandha</i> |

These, young brahmin, are the three aggregates that the Blessed One rouses, instills and establishes these people in.”

1.6.3 “But what, master Ānanda, is the noble aggregate of moral virtue that the master Gotama speaks in praise of, and rouses, instills and establishes these people in?”

(A) MORAL CULTIVATION

[§§2-18 as at Sāmañña,phala Sutta (D 2.40-63/1:62-70) = SD 8.10]

THE TRUE PURPOSE OF RECLUSESHIP²⁵

1.7.1 [D 2.40] “Here, young brahmin, there arises in the world the Tathagata [the Buddha thus come], an arhat, fully self-awakened one, accomplished in knowledge and conduct, well-gone [Sugata], knower of worlds, unexcelled trainer of tamable people, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.

1.7.2 Having realized by his own direct knowledge, this world with its gods, its Maras [evil tempters] and its Brahmas [high gods], this generation, with its recluses and brahmins, its rulers²⁶ and people, he makes it known to others.

1.7.3 He teaches the Dharma, good in the beginning, good in the middle, good in the end, endowed with meaning and phrasing. He proclaims the holy life that is entirely complete and pure.

1.7.4 [D 2.41] A householder or a householder’s son, hearing the Dharma, [D 1:63] gains faith²⁷ in the Tathagata and reflects thus:

²² *Bhavaṃ hi ānando tassa bhoto gotamassa dīgharattaṃ upaṭṭhāko santikāvacarō samīpa,cārī.*

²³ *Bhavaṃ etaṃ ānando jāneyya yesaṃ so bhavaṃ gotamo dhammānaṃ vaṇṇavādī ahoṣi*
Bhavaṃ etaṃ ānando jāneyya yesaṃ so bhavaṃ gotamo dhammānaṃ vaṇṇavādī ahoṣi,

²⁴ *Yattha ca imaṃ janataṃ samādapesi nivesesi paṭiṭṭhāpesi* (aor), D 1:206×3, 208, 209. Elsewhere, as **1.6.1/**: establishing parents in the Dharma, A 2.33/1:62×4, qu at ItA 2:160×2; the 4 beneficial conduct (*attha,cariya*): faith, moral virtue, charity, wisdom, A 9.5/4:364; as *samādapetabba nivesetabba paṭiṭṭhāpetabba* (fpp, opt): of faith in the 3 jewels, A 3.75/1:222×4, 223; of 4 satipatthanas, S 5:144, 145, 189; of the 4 streamwinner’s factors, S 5:364, 365×3; of the 4 noble truths, S 5:435; of the monastic code (5 aspects), A 5.114/3:138×6, 139×1.

²⁵ This important section [§§40-42] shows the true motivation for renunciation and becoming monastics. The first two immediate benefits of renunciation [§§35-38] are motivated by worldly desires, and as such are not the true reasons for becoming a monastic. For the Skt version of this section, see Mvst 1:332-334.

²⁶ *Deva*, here in the sense of “gods by convention” (*sammati,deva*), ie kings or rulers. The other 2 types of *deva* are “gods by rebirth” (*upapatti,deva*) and “gods by purification” (*visuddhi,deva*), ie the Buddhas, pratyeka-buddhas and arhats. (Nc 307, KhpA 123). See §2 & n where the voc “your majesty” is *deva*.

‘The household life is stifling, a dusty path.’²⁸ The life of renunciation is like the open air. It is not easy living in a house to practise the holy life fully, in all its purity, like a polished conch-shell.

What if I were to shave off my hair and beard, put on the saffron robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?

1.7.5 Then, after some time, he abandons all his wealth and relatives, shaves off his hair and beard, puts on the saffron robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness.

1.8 [D 2.42] When he has thus gone forth, he lives restrained by the rules of the monastic code [Pāṭimokkha], possessed of proper conduct and resort.²⁹

Having taken up the rules of training, he trains himself in them, seeing danger in the slightest faults.

He comes to be accomplished in wholesome bodily and verbal deeds, his livelihood is purified, and he is possessed of moral virtue.

He guards the sense-doors, is accomplished in mindfulness and full awareness, and is content.³⁰

THE SHORT SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE

OR, THE LESSER [SHORT] MORALITIES (CŪḲA, SĪLA)

[The moralities §43-62³¹ = Brahma.jāla Sutta (D 1.8-27/1:4-11) = SD 25.2]

Right bodily conduct [D 1.1.8/1:4]

1.9 [D 2.43] **And how, young brahmin, is a monk accomplished in moral virtue?**

²⁷ “Faith,” *saddhā*. There are 2 kinds of faith (*saddhā*): (1) “rootless faith” (*amūlika, saddhā*), baseless or irrational faith, blind faith. (M 2:170,21); (2) “faith with a good cause” (*ākāravati, saddhā*), faith founded on seeing (M 1:320,-8 401,23); also called *avecca-p, pasāda* (S 12.41.11/2:69). “Wise faith” is syn with (2). *Amūlika* = “not seen, not heard, not suspected” (V 2:243 3:163 & Comy). **Ledi Sayadaw** speaks of 2 kinds: “ordinary faith” (*pakati saddhā*) and “faith through cultivation” (*bhāvanā saddhā*) (*The Manuals of Buddhism*, 1965:339 f). “Ordinary faith” is mainly based on giving and pious acts (which can be either wholesome or unwholesome, depending on the intention). “Faith through cultivation” is founded on mindfulness practice and meditation. **Gethin** also speaks of 2 kinds of faith: the cognitive and the affective (eg ERE: Faith, & Jayatilleke, *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge*, 1963:387): “Faith in its cognitive dimension is seen as concerning belief in propositions or statements of which one does not—or perhaps cannot—have knowledge proper (however that should be defined); cognitive faith is a mode of knowing in a different category from that knowledge. Faith is its affective dimension is a more straightforward positive response to trust or confidence towards something or somebody...the conception of *saddhā* in Buddhist writings appears almost, if not entirely affective, the cognitive element is completely secondary” (Gethin 2001:207; my emphases).

²⁸ *Sambādhō gharavāso rajā, patho*. There is a wordplay on *sambādhā*, “crowded, stifling, narrow, full of hindrances,” which also refers to the sexual organ, male (V 1:216, 2:134) or female (V 4:259; Sn 609; J 1:61, 4:260). *Rajā, patha*, “a dusty path,” here refers to “the dust of passion,” and to “the path of returning” (*āgamana, patha*), ie rebirth (DA 1:180,17 = MA 2:179,20; UA 237,27).

²⁹ *Go, cara*, lit “a cow’s habitual path or pasture.” Here it refers to 2 aspects of the renunciant’s life. In the Canon, it refers to places that are regarded as suitable for collecting almsfood (V 2:208). In this sense, *agocara* refers to places that are unsuitable for renunciant’s as resort (whether for alms or otherwise) (D 1:63 = It 118; M 1:33, S 5:187; It 96; cf Dh 22). In Comys, *go, cara* refers to places suitable for meditation (Vism 127). We can also take *go, cara* here in a psychological sense of *ārammaṇa*, ie, sense-objects. In other words, one “possessed of proper conduct and resort” (*ācāra, gocara, sampanna*) can also incl the meaning “accomplished in proper conduct of body and of mind.”

³⁰ On this section, cf **Cha-ḷ-ābhijāti S** (A 6.57): “While living thus as a renunciant, having abandoned the 5 hindrances, the mental impurities that weaken wisdom, his mind well established in the four focusses of mindfulness, having cultivated the seven awakening-factors according to reality, he is reborn in nirvana...” (A 6.57.7+10/3:386+387), SD 23.10.

³¹ These three sections (comprising 13 items or groups) on moral virtue occur verbatim (in whole or with some omissions) in all of the first 13 suttas and may once have formed a separate “tract” (D:RD 1:3 n1). See Gethin 2001:195 f. See Intro (3) above.

(1) Here, young brahmin, having abandoned the destruction of life, a monk³² abstains from destroying life. He dwells with rod and weapon laid down, conscientious,³³ merciful, compassionate for the welfare of all living beings.

This is part of his moral virtue.³⁴

(2) Having abandoned the taking of what is not given, he abstains from taking what is not given. He takes only what is given, accepts only what is given, lives not by stealth but by means of a pure mind.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

(3) Having abandoned incelibacy, he lives a celibate life, living apart, abstaining from the sexual act,³⁵ the way of the village.³⁶

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

Right Speech [D 1.1.9/1:4]

1.10 [D 2.44] (4) Having abandoned false speech, he abstains from false speech. He³⁷ speaks the truth, keeps to the truth as his bond, trustworthy, reliable, no deceiver of the world.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

(5) Having abandoned divisive speech he abstains from divisive speech. What he has heard here he does not tell there to break those people apart from these people here. [D 1:64] What he has heard there he does not tell here to break these people apart from those people there.

Thus reconciling those who have broken apart or consolidating those who are united, he loves concord, delights in concord, enjoys concord, speaks words of concord.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

(6) Having abandoned abusive speech, he abstains from abusive speech. He speaks words that are humane, soothing, loving, touching, urbane, and delightful and pleasant to the multitude.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

(7) Having abandoned idle chatter, he abstains from idle chatter. He speaks in season, speaks what is true, what is beneficial. He speaks on the Teaching [the Dharma] and the Discipline [the Vinaya]. He speaks words worth treasuring, seasonable, [D 1:5] backed by reason, measured, connected with the goal.³⁸

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

General [D 1.1.10/1:5,4]

1.11 [D 2.45] (8) He abstains from damaging seeds and plant life.³⁹

Sāmaṇera, sikkhā 6-10 [D 1.1.10/1:5,5-12]

(9) He eats only once a day, abstaining from the evening meal and from food at improper times.⁴⁰

(10) He abstains from dancing, singing, music and from watching shows.

(11) He abstains from wearing garlands and from beautifying himself with scents and make-up.

(12) He abstains from high and luxurious beds and seats.

(13) He abstains from accepting gold and silver [money].

³² *Bhikkhu*: in **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1.8-28/1:3-13), SD 25.2, the reading is *samaṇo Gotamo* throughout.

³³ *lajjī*, “feel shame, modest,” explain in the Comy on S 1:73 as “one who has moral shame (*hiri*) and moral fear (*ottappa*).” Opp *alajjī*, shameless.

³⁴ **Brahma, jāla S** refrains: *Thus, bhikshus, would the worldling speak when praising the Tathagata* (D 1.8).

³⁵ *Brahma, cariya* is the supreme conduct or holy life, ie celibacy. DA points out that it involves abstaining from other forms of erotic behaviour besides intercourse.

³⁶ *gāma, dhamma*, ie the way of the householder, vulgar (in the sense of being associated with the masses).

³⁷ PTS ed has *samaṇo Gotamo* here, which seems rather abrupt.

³⁸ *attha, samhitam*.

³⁹ Curiously, this replaces the precept against intoxicants which is omitted.

⁴⁰ “Improper times” here means between noon and the following dawn (V 1:83).

General [D 1.1.10/1:5,12-27]

- (14) He abstains from accepting uncooked grain; raw meat; women and girls; male and female slaves; goats and sheep, fowl and pigs; elephants, cattle, horses, and mares.
- (15) He abstains from accepting fields and lands [property].⁴¹
- (16) He abstains from running messages [or errands].
- (17) He abstains from buying and selling.
- (18) He abstains from dealing with false scales, false metals, and false measures.
- (19) He abstains from bribery, deception, and fraud.
- (20) He abstains from wounding, executing, imprisoning, highway robbery, plunder, and violence. This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**THE MEDIUM SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE
OR, THE MEDIUM MORALITIES (MAJJHIMA, SĪLA)**

1.12 [D 2.46]⁴² [D 1.1.11] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on damaging seeds and plant life such as these: plants propagated from roots, stems, joints, buddings, and seeds [D 1:65]—he abstains from damaging seeds and plant life such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue. [D 1:6]

1.13 [D 2.47 = D 1.1.12] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on consuming stored-up goods such as these: stored-up food, stored-up drinks, stored-up clothing, stored-up vehicles, stored-up bedding, stored-up scents, and stored-up meat—he abstains from consuming stored-up goods such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.14 [D 2.48 = D 1.1.13] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on watching shows such as these: dancing, singing, music, plays, ballad recitations, hand-clapping, cymbals and drums, painted scenes,⁴³ acrobatic and conjuring tricks,⁴⁴ elephant fights, horse fights, buffalo fights, bull fights, goat fights, ram fights, cock fights, quail fights; fighting with staves, boxing, wrestling, war-games, roll calls, battle arrays, and troop movements—he abstains from watching shows such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.15 [D 2.49 = D 1.1.14] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on heedless and idle games such as these—eight-row chess, ten-row chess, chess in the air, hopscotch, spillikins [or jackstraws], dice, stick games, hand-pictures,⁴⁵ ball-games [marbles], blowing through toy pipes [playing whistling games with folded leaves], playing with toy ploughs, turning somersaults [acrobatics], playing with toy windmills, toy measures, toy chariots, toy bows, guessing letters drawn in the air or on one's back, guessing thoughts, mimicking deformities—[D 1:7] he abstains from heedless and idle games such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.16 [D 2.50 = D 1.1.15] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on high and luxurious furnishings such as these—over-sized couches, couches adorned with carved ani-

⁴¹ The Buddha however accepted land from rajahs like Bimbisāra and Pasenadi, and others like Anāthapiṇḍika and Visākhā, which were received in the sangha's name. What is connoted here is accepting land on a personal basis.

⁴² From here on, the numberings of PTS ed & Bodhi's tr (1989) agree: see D 2.17a n = SD 8.10.

⁴³ *Sobha, nagarakam*, "of the city of Sobha" (the city of the Gandharvas or heavenly musicians). RD thinks it refers to a ballet with fairy scenes. Bodhi: "art exhibitions."

⁴⁴ *Caṇḍālam vamsam dhopanam*, an obscure phrase. The performers were presumable of the lowest caste. DA thinks of an iron ball (used for juggling?). Cf **Citta Sambhūta J** (J 4:390) where the phrase appears.

⁴⁵ The hand is dipped in paint or dye, then struck on the ground or a wall, so that the player creates the figure of an elephant, a horse, etc. In classical Thai literature, the artful trickster Sī Thanonchai (Skt, Śrī Dhanāñjaya) is well known for this skill.

mals, long-haired coverlets, multi-colored patchwork coverlets, white woollen coverlets, woollen coverlets embroidered with flowers or animal figures, stuffed quilts, coverlets with fringes, silk coverlets embroidered with gems; large woollen carpets; elephant, horse, and chariot rugs, antelope-hide rugs, deer-hide rugs; couches with awnings, couches with red cushions for the head and feet—[66] he abstains from using high and luxurious furnishings such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.17 [D 2.51 = D 1.1.16] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, enjoy scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these: rubbing powders into the body, massaging with oils, bathing in perfumed water, kneading the limbs, using mirrors, ointments, garlands, scents, creams, face-powders, mascara [darkening one's eye-lashes], bracelets, head-bands, decorated walking sticks, ornamented water-bottles, swords, fancy sunshades, decorated sandals, turbans, gems, yak-tail whisks, long-fringed white robes—he abstains from using scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.18 [D 2.52 = D 1.1.17] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on low chatter,⁴⁶ such as these: talking about kings, robbers, ministers of state; armies, dangers, and wars; food and drink; clothing, furniture, garlands, and scents; relatives; vehicles; villages, towns, cities, the countryside; women [D 1:8] and heroes; the gossip of the street and the well; tales of the dead; tales of diversity [philosophical discussions of the past and the future], the creation of the world and of the sea, and talk of whether things exist or not [or, talk about gain and loss]⁴⁷—he abstains from talking about low topics such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.19 [D 2.53 = D 1.1.18] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on debates such as these—

‘You do not understand this Dharma [Teaching] and Vinaya [Discipline]. I understand this Dharma and Vinaya. What could you understand of this Dharma and Vinaya? You are practising wrongly. I am practising rightly. I am being consistent. You are inconsistent. What should be said first you said after. What should be said after you said first. What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your viewpoint has been overthrown. You are defeated. Go and try to salvage your viewpoint; extricate yourself if you can!’⁴⁸

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.20 [D 2.54 = D 1.1.19] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, [D 1:67] are bent on relaying messages and running errands for people such as these: kings, ministers of state, noble warriors, brahmins, householders, or youths (who say),

‘Go here, go there, take this there, fetch that here’—he abstains from running messages and errands for people such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.21 [D 2.55 - D 1.1.20] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, engage in deceitful pretensions (to attainments), flattery (for gain), subtle insinuation or hinting (for gain), pressuring (for offerings), and pursuing gain with gain, he abstains from such pretensions and flattery.⁴⁹

This, too, is part of his moral virtue. [D 1:9]

⁴⁶ *Tiracchāna, kathā*, lit animal talk. As animals mostly walk parallel to the earth, so this kind of talk does not lead on upwards. Cf Lohicca S (D 1:228).

⁴⁷ *Iti, bhavābhāva, kathā*, may be rendered as “being and non-being” or as “profit and loss,” but according to Walsh, the philosophical sense (as in Horner and Ñāṇamoli trs of Sandaka S, M 76) is preferable.

⁴⁸ This is stock: **Brahmajāla S** (D 1:8), **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 1:66), **Pāsādika S** (D 3:117), **Saṅgīti S** (D 3:210), **Mahā Sakuludāyī S** (M 2:3), **Sāmagāma S** (M 2:245), **Hāliddakāni S 1** (S 3:12), **Viggāhika Kathā S** (S 5:418) and **Mahā Niddesa** (Nm 1:173). See *Brahmajāla S*, D 1:2 f. Cf **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22) where a similar statement is made regarding the wrong reason for learning the Dharma (M 22.10/1:133).

⁴⁹ For details, see *Vism* 1.61-82.

THE GREAT SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE⁵⁰
OR, THE GREAT [LONG] MORALITIES (*MAHĀ, SĪLA*)

1.22 [*D 2.56 = D 1.1.21*] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:
 reading marks on the limbs [eg, palmistry, sole-reading];
 reading omens and signs;
 interpreting celestial events [lightning, falling stars, comets];
 interpreting dreams;
 reading marks on the body [eg, physiognomy, phrenology];
 reading marks on cloth gnawed by mice;
 offering fire oblations, oblations from a ladle, oblations of husks, rice powder, rice grains, ghee, and oil;
 offering oblations using oral spells;
 offering blood-sacrifices;
 making predictions based on the fingertips;
 determining whether the site for a proposed house or garden is propitious or not [geomancy];
 making predictions for officers of state;
 laying demons in a cemetery;
 laying spirits;
 reciting house-protection charms [or using charms recited by those living in an earthen house];
 snake charming, treating poisoning, curing scorpion-stings and rat-bites;
 interpreting animal and bird sounds and the cawing of crows;
 foretelling the remaining duration of life;
 reciting charms for protection against arrows;
 reciting charms to understand the calls of birds and animals
 —he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.23 [*D 2.57 = D 1.1.22*] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:
 determining lucky and unlucky gems, staffs, garments, swords, arrows, bows, and other weapons;
 determining lucky and unlucky women, men, boys, girls, male slaves, female slaves;
 determining lucky and unlucky elephants, horses, buffaloes, bulls, cows, goats, rams, fowl, quails, lizards [or iguana], long-eared rodents,⁵¹ tortoises, and other animals
 —he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.24 [*D 2.58 = D 1.1.23*] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such [*D 1:68*] as forecasting thus: [*D 1:10*]

the leaders [rajahs]⁵² will march forth [advance];
 the leaders will return [retreat];
 our leaders will attack, and their leaders will retreat;
 their leaders will attack, and our leaders will retreat;

⁵⁰ For Pali listing and mn, see **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1.21-27), SD 25.2.

⁵¹ *Kaṇṇika, lakkaṇam*, from *kaṇṇa*, “ear.” DA thinks it means either ear-rings or house-gables, both of which do not fit here. Walshe follows the Thai tr which, probably following an old tradition, has *tun*, “bamboo-rat” (see McFarland, *Thai-English Dictionary*, p371). Franke says “an animal that is always mentioned with the hare” and considers that it must mean an animal with long ears.

⁵² *Raṇṇam* (gen pl), ie the joint leaders (rajah) of a republican state in ancient India.

there will be triumph for our leaders and defeat for their leaders;
 there will be triumph for their leaders and defeat for our leaders;
 thus there will be triumph, thus there will be defeat

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.25 [D 2.59 = D 1.1.24] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as forecasting thus:

there will be a lunar eclipse;
 there will be a solar eclipse;
 there will be an occultation of an asterism;
 the sun and moon will go their normal courses;
 the sun and moon will go astray;
 the asterisms will go their normal courses;
 the asterisms will go astray;
 there will be a meteor shower;
 there will be a darkening of the sky;
 there will be an earthquake;
 there will be thunder coming from a clear sky;
 there will be a rising, a setting, a darkening, a brightening of the sun, moon, and asterisms;
 such will be the result of the lunar eclipse, of the solar eclipse *and so on*

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these. [D 1:11]

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.26 [D 2.60 = D 1.1.25] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such [D 1:69] as forecasting thus:

there will be abundant rain; there will be a drought;
 there will be plenty; there will be famine;
 there will be rest and security; there will be danger;
 there will be disease; there will be health [freedom from disease];
 or they earn their living by counting, accounting, calculation,
 composing poetry, or teaching hedonistic arts and doctrines

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.27 [D 2.61 = D 1.1.26] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

calculating auspicious dates for marriages (where the bride is brought home or leaves the house), betrothals, divorces;
 calculating auspicious dates for collecting debts or making investments and loans; reciting charms for becoming attractive or unattractive;
 curing women who have undergone miscarriages or abortions [or, reviving the fetuses of abortive women];⁵³
 reciting spells to bind a man's tongue, to paralyze his jaws, to make him lose control over his hands, or to bring on deafness;
 getting oracular answers to questions addressed to a mirror, to a young girl, or to a spirit medium;
 worshipping the sun, worshipping Mahā Brahmā, bringing forth flames from the mouth, invoking the goddess of luck

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

1.28 [D 2.62 = D 1.1.27] Whereas some recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

⁵³ *Viruddha, gabbha, karaṇam.*

promising gifts to deities in return for favors; fulfilling such promises;
 demonology;
 teaching house-protection spells;
 inducing virility and impotence;
 consecrating sites for construction;
 giving ceremonial mouthwashes and ceremonial bathing;
 offering sacrificial fires;
 preparing emetics, purgatives, expectorants, diuretics, headache cures;
 preparing ear-oil, eye-drops, oil for treatment through the nose, collyrium [eye-wash] and counter-
 ointments;
 curing cataracts, practising surgery, practising as a children's doctor, administering medicines and
 treatments to cure their after-effects
 —he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.⁵⁴ [D 1.1.27 ends here.] [D 1:12]
 This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

Confidence through practising the above moralities

1.29 [D2.63] A monk, young brahmin, thus accomplished in moral virtue sees no danger anywhere owing to his restraint through moral virtue. Just as a head-anointed noble kshatriya rajah who has defeated his enemies sees no danger anywhere from his enemies, [D 1:70] in the same way the monk thus accomplished in moral virtue sees no danger owing to his restraint through moral virtue.

Possessing this aggregate of noble moral virtue, he feels within himself a blameless joy.⁵⁵
 This is how a monk is accomplished in moral virtue.

1.30 This, young brahmin, is the noble aggregate of moral virtue that the Blessed One speaks in praise of,
 and rouses, instills and establishes these people in.

1.31 But here, young brahmin, there is still something to be done.”

1.32 SUBHA'S EXULTATION (1). “Wonderful it is, master Ānanda! This noble aggregate of moral virtue is fully complete, not incomplete.

And, master Ānanda, I do not see such a fully complete noble aggregate [207] of moral virtue in the recluses and brahmins outside of this community.

And, master Ānanda, if these recluses and brahmins outside of this community were to see such a noble aggregate of moral conduct, they would say, ‘Enough done it is to this extent, Our goal of recluse-ship has been attained. There is no more to be done here by us.’

But the master Ānanda says thus: ‘But here there is still something to be done!’

[The first recital is concluded.]

2.1 And what, master Ānanda, is the noble aggregate of mental concentration that the Blessed One speaks in praise of,
 and rouses, instills and establishes these people in?”

(B) MENTAL CULTIVATION

[§§2.2-18 as at Sāmañña,phala Sutta (D 2.64-84/1:70-76) = SD 8.10]

⁵⁴ It is the practice of medicine for gain that is here condemned. (Walshe)

⁵⁵ “A blameless joy,” *anavajja,sukham*. Comy: “He experiences within himself a blameless, faultless, wholesome bodily and mental joy accompanied by such phenomena as non-remorse, gladness, rapture, and tranquillity, which are based on moral virtue as their proximate cause” (DA 1:183); “a joy free from faults” (*niddosa,sukha*, MA 2:214 = AA 3:198). Evidently, this joy arises on account of being free from the fear of being blamed of moral faults. Cf *avyāseka,sukha* below [§64].

Sense-restraint (Custody of the senses)

2.2 [D 2.64] “And how, young brahmin, does a monk guard the sense-doors?”

(1)⁵⁶ Here, young brahmin, when a monk sees a form with the eye, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**.⁵⁷

So long he dwells unrestrained in that eye-faculty, evil, unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure⁵⁸ might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the eye-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the eye-faculty.

(2) When he hears a sound with the ear, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**.

So long he dwells unrestrained in that ear-faculty, evil, unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the ear-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the ear-faculty.

(3) When he smells a smell with the nose, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**.

So long he dwells unrestrained in that nose-faculty, evil, unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the nose-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the nose-faculty.

(4) When he tastes a taste with the tongue, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**.

So long he dwells unrestrained in that tongue-faculty, evil, unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the tongue-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the tongue-faculty.

(5) When he feels a touch with the body, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**.

So long he dwells unrestrained in that body-faculty, evil, unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the body-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the body-faculty.

⁵⁶ This whole para: *Idha mahārāja bhikkhu cakkhunā rūpaṃ disvā na nimitta-g, gāhī hoti nānuyyañjana-g, gāhī. Yatvādhikaraṇaṃ enaṃ cakkhundriyaṃ asaṃvutaṃ viharantaṃ abhijjhā, domanassā pāpakā akusalā dhammā an-vāssaveyyuṃ, tassa saṃvarāya paṭipajjati, rakkhati cakkhundriyaṃ, cakkhundriye saṃvaraṃ āpajjati. On Na nimitta-g, gāhī hoti nānuyyañjana-g, gāhī, lit “he is not one who grasps at a sign, he is not one who grasps at a detail (feature),” see SD 19.14. Comys say that “**sign**”(nimitta) here refers to a grasping arising through one’s sensual lust (*chanda, rāga, vasena*) or on account of merely one’s view (*diṭṭhi, matta, vasena*); “**detail**” (*anuyyañjana*) here refers to finding delight by grasping at another’s limb or body part (eyes, arms, legs, etc) (Nm 2:390; Nc 141, 141; DhsA 400, 402; cf MA 1:75, 4:195; SA 3:4, 394; Nc 1:55; DhA 1:74). On other meanings of *nimitta*, see SD 13 §3.1a.*

⁵⁷ See *Nimitta & anuyyañjana* = SD 19.14.

⁵⁸ “Covetousness and displeasure,” *abhijjhā, domanassaṃ*, which Walshe (1995:335 & n632) renders as “hankering and fretting for the world”; alt tr “covetousness and displeasure” or “longing and loathing.” MA says that longing and displeasure signify the first two hindrances—sensual desire and ill will—principal hindrances to be overcome for the practice to succeed. They thus represent the contemplation of mind-objects, which begins with the five hindrances. Cf M 1:274/39.13; see also **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22.13) and **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.36) on how to deal with the hindrances in one’s meditation. The monk effects the abandoning of the hindrances by the contemplations of impermanence, fading away (of lust), cessation (of suffering) and letting go (of defilements), and thus comes to look upon the object with equanimity. On *abhijjhā, domanassa*, there is an interesting related passage from **Pubba or Pubb’eva Sambodha S** (A 3.101): “Bhikshus, before my awakening, when I was still a bodhisattva, this thought occurred to me... ‘Whatever physical and mental joy (*sukha, somanassa*) there is in the world, that is the gratification (*assāda*) in the world; that the world is impermanent, suffering and of the nature to change, that is the dangers (*ādīnava*) in the world—the removal and abandoning of desire and lust for the world, that is the escape from the world.’” (A 3.101/1:258, pointed out to me by Robert Eddison).

(6) When he cognizes a mind-object with the mind, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail.**

So long he dwells unrestrained in that mind-faculty, evil, unwholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the mind-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the mind-faculty.⁵⁹

Possessing this noble restraint over the sense-faculties, he feels within himself an undefiled joy.⁶⁰

This, young brahmin, is how a monk guards the sense-doors.

Mindfulness and full awareness⁶¹

2.3 [D 2.65] And how, young brahmin, is a monk possessed of mindfulness and full awareness?

Here, young brahmin,

- (1) while going forward or back, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
- (2) while looking forward or back, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
- (3) while bending or stretching, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
- (4) while carrying his upper robe, outer robe and bowl, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
- (5) while eating, drinking, chewing and tasting, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
- (6) while voiding or peeing, he is clearly aware of what he is doing;
- (7) while walking, while standing, while sitting, while asleep, while awake,⁶² while talking, or while remaining silent, he is clearly aware of what he is doing.

This, young brahmin, is how [D 1:71] a monk is possessed of mindfulness and full awareness.

Contentment

2.4 [D 2.66] And how, young brahmin, is a monk content?

Here, young brahmin, he is content with robes to protect his body and with almsfood to sustain his belly, and wherever he goes he sets out only with these with him.

2.5 Here, just as a bird, wherever it goes, flies with its wings as its only burden; so too is he content with robes to protect his body and with almsfood to sustain his belly, and wherever he goes, he takes only these with him.⁶³

This, young brahmin, is how a monk is content.

Abandoning the mental hindrances

2.6 [D 2.67] Possessing this aggregate of noble moral virtue, this aggregate of noble sense-restraint, this aggregate of noble mindfulness and full awareness, and this aggregate of noble contentment,

he resorts to a secluded dwelling: a forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a gully [gorge], a hillside cave, a cemetery, a remote forest [jungle grove], the open air, a heap of straw.⁶⁴

⁵⁹ D 2.64/1:70, 10.2.2/1:207, 33.1.11(10)/3:225; M 27.15/1:180, 33.20/1:223, 38.35/1:269, 51.16/1:346, 53.8/-1:355, 94.18/2:162, 101.33/2:226; S 35.120/4:104, 35.239/4:176; A 3.16/1:113, 4.14/2:16, 4.37/2:39, 4.164/2:152 (×4), 4.198.11/2:210, 5.76.12/3:99 f, 5.140.11/3:163, 10.99.6/5:206, 11.18.23/5:351. For a detailed analysis, see Vism 1.53-69/20-22. For a study, see *Nimitta & anuvyañjana* = SD 19.14.

⁶⁰ “A joy that is undefiled,” *avyāseka, sukham* [vī *abyāseka, sukham*]. Comy: “He experiences the purified joy of higher consciousness (*adhicitta, sukha*), which is undefiled, unblemished, since it is devoid of the blemish of the defilements” (DA 1:183; MA 2:213 = AA 3:198). Evidently, this joy arises from meditation and mindfulness; cf *ana-vajja, sukha* above [§63].

⁶¹ *Sati, sampajañña* = *sati*, “mindfulness,” *sampajañña*, “full awareness.” In *Satipaṭṭhānas Ss*, however, this section is “full awareness” (*sampajañña*); “mindfulness” (*sati*). See SD 13 (3.6abc).

⁶² “When asleep, when awake” *sutte jāgarite*. Comy glosses *sutte* as *sayane*, “lying down, sleeping.” See SD 13 (3.6c).

⁶³ The bird parable: D 2.66/1:71 = M 51.15/1:346 = 38.34/1:268 = 112.14/3:35 = A 4.198.10/2:209 f.

⁶⁴ *So iminā ca ariyena sīla-k, khandhena samannāgato iminā ca ariyena indriya, samvarena samannāgato iminā ca ariyena sati, sampajaññaena samannāgato imāya ca ariyāya santuṭṭhitāya samannāgato vivittam senāsanam bhajati, araññaṃ rukkhā, mūlam pabbatam kandaram giri, guham susānam vana, pattham abbhokāsam palāla, puñjanam*. This

Returning from his almsround, after his meal, he sits down, crosses his legs, keeps his body erect, and establishes mindfulness before him.⁶⁵

2.7 [D 2.68] (1) Abandoning **covetousness**⁶⁶ with regard to the world, he dwells with a mind devoid of covetousness. He cleanses his mind of covetousness.

(2) Abandoning **ill will and anger**,⁶⁷ he dwells with a mind devoid of ill will, compassionate in the welfare of all living beings. He cleanses his mind of ill will and anger.

(3) Abandoning **sloth and torpor**, he dwells with a mind devoid of sloth and torpor, mindful, alert, perceiving light. He cleanses his mind of sloth and torpor.

(4) Abandoning **restlessness and remorse**, he dwells undisturbed, his mind inwardly stilled. He cleanses his mind of restlessness and remorse.

(5) Abandoning **spiritual doubt**, he dwells having crossed over doubt, with no perplexity with regard to wholesome mental states. He cleanses his mind of doubt.

Similes for the hindrances⁶⁸

2.8 [D 2.69] (1) Suppose, young brahmin, that a man, taking a loan, invests it in his businesses. His businesses succeed. He repays his old debts and there is a surplus for maintaining his wife. The thought would occur to him,

‘Before, taking a loan, I invested it in my businesses. [D 1:72] Now my businesses have succeeded. I have repaid my old debts and there is a surplus for maintaining my wife.’ Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

2.9 [D 2.70] (2) Suppose, young brahmin, suppose that a man falls sick, in pain and seriously ill. He does not enjoy his meals, and there is no strength in his body. As time passes, he recovers from that sickness. He enjoys his meals and there is strength in his body. The thought would occur to him,

‘Before, I was sick. Now, I have recovered from that sickness. I enjoy my meals and there is strength in my body.’ Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

2.10 [D 2.71] (3) Suppose, young brahmin, suppose that a man is bound in prison. As time passes, he eventually is released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him,

‘Before, I was bound in prison. Now, I am released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.’ Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

2.11 [D 2.72] (4) Suppose, young brahmin, that a man is a slave, subject to others, not subject to himself, unable to go where he likes. As time passes, he eventually is released from that slavery, subject to himself, not subject to others, free, able to go where he likes. The thought would occur to him,

stock phrase of 9 places conducive to meditation is found at D 1:72, 207, 2:242, 3:49; M 1:181, 269, 274, 346, 440, 441, 2:162, 226, 3:3, 35, 115-117; A 2:210, 3:92, 100, 4:436, 5:207; Nm 1:26, 140, 2:341; Miln 369. A shorter list, probably later, is mentioned in **Anāpāna,sati S** (M 118): “Here, monks, a monk who has gone to the forest or to the foot of a tree or to an empty abode, sits down, and having crossed his legs and keeping his body upright, establishes mindfulness before him.” (M 118.17/3:82).

⁶⁵ Comy. He applies mindfulness towards his meditation subject; or he sets it up in the region of the mouth. As such, it is said in the Vibhaṅga: “This mindfulness is set up, set up well, at the tip of the nose or at the sign of the mouth” (Vbh §537/252). NṬ: The “sign of the mouth” (*mukha,nimitta*) is the middle region of the upper lip, against which the air strikes when it comes out of the nose.

⁶⁶ *Abhijjhā*, here is synonymous with “sense-desire” (*kāma-c,chanda*), which is the usual term in the set of 5 mental hindrances. *Kāma-c,chanda* is almost identical with “a lustful mind” (*sa,rāgaṃ cittam*) (M 10.12(1a)). Both refer to sensual desire in general, and arise from wrong reflection on a sensually attractive sense-object. The exercise in §12 is simply that of noting the presence of such a state of mind. Here, one goes on to investigate how it arises, how it can be removed, etc (through right effort). See eg **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.36(1)/1:60), SD 13.3 (5D.2).

⁶⁷ *Vyāpāda,padosa* (like *dosa*) here can be Skt cognate *pradoṣa* (fault) or *pradveṣa* (hatred). As *pradoṣa* at D: RD 1:82 & M:H 1:227; but as *pradveṣa* at M:ÑB 275, Vbh:T 319 & Bodhi, *The Discourse on the Fruits of Recluseship*, 1989: 40.

⁶⁸ These 5 similes are also found in **Mahā Assa,pura S** (M 39.14/1:275 f), SD 10.13 with some minor differences.

‘Before, I was a slave, subject to others, not subject to myself, unable to go where I like.

Now I am released from that slavery, subject to myself, not subject to others, freed, able to go where I like.’ [73] Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

2.12 [D 2.73] (5) Suppose, young brahmin, that a man, carrying money and goods, is journeying on a road through the wilderness. As time passes, he eventually emerges from the wilderness, safe and sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him,

‘Before, carrying money and goods, I was journeying on a road through the wilderness. Now I have emerged from the wilderness, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.’ Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

2.13 [D 2.74] In the same way, young brahmin, when these five hindrances are not abandoned in himself, the monk regards it as a debt, a sickness, a prison, slavery, a journey on a road through the wilderness.⁶⁹

[D 2.75] When he knows that these five hindrances are abandoned in him, he regards it as solvency, good health, release from prison, emancipation, a place of security.⁷⁰

Resultant joy and peace

2.14 [D 2.76]⁷¹ Seeing that they have been abandoned within him, he becomes glad. For one who is glad, zest arises. For one whose mind is zestful, the body becomes tranquil. One tranquil in body becomes happy. For one who is happy, the mind concentrates.⁷²

THE FOUR DHYANAS⁷³

(1) THE 1ST DHYANA

2.15.1 [D 2.77] Quite secluded [detached] from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states, he attains and dwells in the **first dhyana**, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, and with zest and joy born of solitude.⁷⁴

⁶⁹ MA 2:318-321 explains this section in some detail: see Appendix to **Mahā Assa,pura S** (M 39), SD 10.13.

⁷⁰ *Ānanyaṃ yathā ārogyaṃ yathā bandhanā mokkhaṃ yathā bhujissaṃ yathā khem’anta,bhūmimī*. This well known set of positive similes—embedded in the *peyyāla*—for one who has overcome the mental hindrances is also found in **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.69-73/171-73), (**Ānanda**) **Subha S** (D 10.2.6/1:207), SD 40a.13, **Mahā Assa,pura S** (M 39.14/1:275 f), and **Kandaraka S** (M 51.19/1:346 f). MA 2:318-321 gives a detailed account of each of the 5 similes. See Nyanaponika, *The Five Mental Hindrances*, BPS Wheel no 26, 1961:27-34. See also **Nīvaraṇa** = SD 32.1.

⁷¹ From here on, the numbering breaks off from the PTS ed and follows Bodhi’s (1989:40). See §46 n.

⁷² *Tass’ime pañca nīvaraṇe pahīṇe attani samanupassato pāmojjaṃ jāyati. Pamuditassa pīti jāyati. Pītimanassa kāyo passambhati. Passaddha,kāyo sukhaṃ vedeti. Sukhino cittaṃ samādhiyati*. This important stock passage is found throughout the Nikāyas: **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.76/1:73), **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9.10a/1:182), **Subha S** (D 10.2.-21/1:207), **Kevalāḍḍha S** (D 11.44/1:214), **Tevijja S** (D 13/1:250), **Saṅgīti S** (D 33/3:241, 243), **Das’uttara S** (D 34/3:279 ×5), **Vatthūpama S** (M 7/1:38 ×3), **Cūḷa Assa,pura S** (M 40.8/1:283); **Ānāpāna,sati S** (M 118/3:86 ×2, 87 ×2); **Pamāda,vihārī S** (S 35.97/4:78 ×2, 79 ×2); **Paṭaliya S** (S 42.13/4:352 ×2, 353-358); **Sīla S** (S 46.3/5:69 ×2), **Upakkilesa S** (S 46.33/5:92), **Anupakkilesa S** (S 46.34/5:93 ×2), **Bhikkhuṇī Vāsaka S** (S 5:156 ×2), **Ānanda S** (S 54.13/5:332 ×2, *sambojjhaṅga*), **Bhikkhū S** (S 54.16/5:339 ×2, *sambojjhaṅga*), **Nandiya S** (S 55.40/5:398 ×3, 399); **Parisa S** (A 3.93/1:243), **Ājāniya S** (A 3.94/1:244), **Jāta,rūpa S** (A 3.100/1:254, 257, 258); **Vimuttāyatana S** (A 5.26/3:21, 22 ×2, 23 ×2); (**Agata,phala**) **Mahānāma S** (A 6.10/3:285 ×2, 286, 287 ×2, 288); (**Dasaka**) **Cetanā,karaṇīya S** (A 10.2/5:3); (**Eka,dasaka**) **Cetanā,karaṇīya S** (A 11.2/5:312), **Paṭhama Mahānāma S** (A 11.12/-5:329, 330 ×2), 331 ×2, 332), **Dutiya Mahānāma S** (A 11.13/5:334). This set is a shorter version of the 7 awakening-factors (*satta bojjhaṅga*): see (**Bojjhaṅga**) **Bhikkhu S** (S 46.5/5:72), SD 10.15 (2).

⁷³ See **Dhyana** = SD 8.4(5).

⁷⁴ “Born of solitude,” *viveka,ja*; ie it is the result of abandoning the hindrances: on the 3 kinds of solitude, see **The body in Buddhism**, SD 29.6a (1.5). On the omission of “one-pointedness of mind” (*cittassa ek’aggatā*) and “concentration” (*samādhi*) here, see **The layman and dhyana** = SD 8.5.

He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body⁷⁵ with the zest and joy born of solitude.⁷⁶
[D 1:74]

2.15.2 [D 2.78] Young brahmin, just as if a skilled bathman or bathman's apprentice would pour bath powder into a brass basin and knead it together, sprinkling it again and again with water, so that his ball of bath powder —saturated, moisture-laden, permeated within and without—would not drip;

even so, the monk permeates—this very body with the zest and joy born of solitude. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and joy born of solitude.

This, too, is part of his mental concentration.⁷⁷

(2) THE 2ND DHYANA

2.16.1 [D 2.79] Furthermore, young brahmin, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he attains and dwells in **the second dhyana**, free from initial application and sustained application, with zest and joy born of concentration.⁷⁸

He permeates and pervades, [D 1:75] floods and fills this very body with the zest and joy born of concentration.

2.16.2 [D 2.80] Young brahmin, just as a lake with spring-water welling up from within, having *no* inflow from the east, *no* inflow from the west, *no* inflow from the north, or *no* inflow from the south, and with the skies *not* bringing heavy rain over and again.⁷⁹ Yet the cool spring welling up from within the lake would permeate and pervade, flood and fill it with cool waters—there being no part of the lake unpervaded by the cool waters.

Even so, the monk permeates this very body with the zest and joy born of concentration. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and joy born of concentration.

This, too, is part of his mental concentration.

(3) THE 3RD DHYANA

2.17.1 [D 2.81] Furthermore, young brahmin, with the fading away of zest, he remains equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and feels joy with the body.⁸⁰ He attains and dwells in **the third dhyana**, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’

He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the joy free from zest.

2.17.2 [D 2.82] Young brahmin, just as in a pond of the blue lotuses, red and white lotuses, or red lotuses,⁸¹ born and growing in the water, stay immersed in the water and flourish without standing up out of the water, so that they are permeated and pervaded, flooded and filled with cool water from their roots to their tips, and none of those lotuses would be unpervaded with cool water;

even so, the monk permeates this very body with the joy free from zest, so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded with this joy free from zest.

⁷⁵ Here “body” (*kāya*) refers to the “mental body” (*nāma,kāya*), ie feeling (*vedanā*), perception (*saññā*), formations (*saṅkhāra*), and consciousness (*viññāna*) (Vism 4.175/169). AA however says that it refers to the “living physical body” (*karaja,kāya*, AA 3:232).

⁷⁶ These are the dhyana-factors: *vitakka vicāra pīti sukhasa ek’aggatā*, respectively.

⁷⁷ This concludes the Buddha’s answer to the first part of the question asked in §1.6.3.

⁷⁸ The 2nd dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (*ariya,tuṅhī,bhāva*) because within it initial application and sustained application (thinking and discursion, *vitakka,vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur. (S 2:273); cf S 4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī,saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. In **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate). See **Dutiya Jhāna Pañha S** (S 40.-2/4:263 f), SD 24.12.

⁷⁹ Be Ce M 39/1:277,4 = M:Be *devo ca na kālena kālaṃ sammā dhāraṃ anupaveccheyya*; Ce *devo ca kālena kālaṃ sammā dhāraṃ nānupaveccheyya*. Ee Se omit *na: devo ca kālena kālaṃ sammā dhāraṃ anupaveccheyya*. For preferring the *na* reading, see **Dhyana** = SD 8.4 (8.2).

⁸⁰ On this point, see **The Buddha discovers dhyana** = SD 33.1b (6.4.1) (On coming out of dhyana).

⁸¹ *uppala* (Skt *utpala*), *paduma* (*padma*) and *puṇḍarīka* respectively. This simile also found in **Kāya,gatā,sati S** (M 119.20/3:93 f), SD 12.21. See **Āyācana S** (S 6.1) where the simile of lotuses in a pond is applied to beings of different spiritual dispositions (S 6.1/1:138), SD 12.2.

This, too, is part of his mental concentration.

(4) THE 4TH DHYANA

2.18.1 [D 2.83] Furthermore, young brahmin, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain,⁸² and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure, attains and dwells in **the fourth dhyana** that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.⁸³

He sits, pervading the body with a pure, bright mind,⁸⁴ so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded by a pure, bright mind.

2.18.2 [D 2.84] Young brahmin, just as if a man were sitting covered from head to foot with a white cloth, [D 1:76] so that there would be no part of his body to which the white cloth did not extend;

even so, the monk sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright mind. There is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded by pure, bright mind.

This, too, is part of his mental concentration.

2.19 SUBHA'S EXULTATION (2). "Wonderful it is, master Ānanda! This noble aggregate of mental concentration is fully complete, not incomplete.

And, master Ānanda, I do not see such a fully complete noble aggregate of mental concentration in the recluses and brahmins outside of this community.

And, master Ānanda, if these recluses and brahmins outside of this community were to see such a noble aggregate of mental concentration, they would say, 'Enough done it is to this extent, Our goal of recluseship has been attained. There is no more to be done here by us.'

But the master Ānanda says thus: 'But here there is still something to be done!'

2.20 And what, Subha, is this noble aggregate of wisdom, that the Blessed One speaks in praise of, and rouses, instills and establishes these people in?"

(C) WISDOM CULTIVATION

[As at Sāmañña,phala (D 2.85-100/1:76-84) = SD 8.10]

Insight knowledge⁸⁵

2.21 [D 2.85]⁸⁶ With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects,⁸⁷ pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,

he directs and inclines it to **knowledge and vision.**

'This body of mine is form composed of the four great elements,⁸⁸ born from mother and father. He understands thus:

nourished with rice and porridge, subject to inconstancy, rubbing, pressing, dissolution, and dispersion.⁸⁹ And this consciousness of mine lies attached here, bound up here.'⁹⁰

⁸² "Joy and pain," *sukha-dukkha*: this refers to the physical feelings. The next phrase—"pleasure and displeasure," *domanassa-somanassa*—refers to mental feelings, which have been transcended earlier. Mental feelings need to be overcome first so that the mind is not distracted by itself, as it were. Then, all the other feelings (arising from the physical sense-contacts) are transcended: on its significance, see **Sall'atthana S** (S 36.6/4:207-210), SD 5.5.

⁸³ Here, **Vibhaṅga** gives 3 factors of the 4th dhyana—**equanimity** (*upekhā*), **mindfulness** (*sati*) and **one-pointedness of mind** (*cittassa ek'aggatā*)—according to the Sutta analysis (Vbh 261), and 2 factors—equanimity and one-pointedness of the mind—according to the Abhidhamma analysis (Vbh 164; Vism 4.183/165). See **Dhyana** = SD 8.4 (5.4).

⁸⁴ See **Accharā Vagga** (A 1.6.1-2): "Monks, this mind is radiant (*pabhassara*), but it is defiled by defilements from outside. The ignorant ordinary person does not understand this as it really is. As such, for him there is no personal development." (A 1:10). On reaching the 4th dhyana, the practitioner becomes directly aware of the truly and naturally pure nature of the mind. See also A:ÑB 1999 §4.

⁸⁵ As at Sāmañña,phala (D 2.85/1:76), SD 8.10

⁸⁶ This and foll passage = **Subha S** (D 10.2.21-22/1:209); also mutatis mutandis at **Mahā Sākul'udāyi S** (M 77.-29-36/2:17-22), SD 49.5.

⁸⁷ *Upakkilesa*: to be distinguished from *kilesa*, "defilement." Perhaps the 10 "imperfections of insight" listed in Vism 20.105-130/633-638 are meant here, but potential hindrances at a certain stage of insight meditation. (Walshe)

⁸⁸ The 4 great (or primary): earth (*mahā,bhūtā*), water, fire, wind (D 1:214; Vism 11.27; Abhs 154): see **Rūpa** = SD 17.2a.

2.22 [D 2:86]⁹¹ Young brahmin, just as if there were a beautiful beryl⁹² gem of the purest water—eight faceted, well polished, clear, limpid, consummate in all its aspects, through which runs a blue, or yellow, or red, or white thread, or brown thread⁹³—and a man with good eyesight, taking it in his hand, were to reflect on it thus:

‘This is a beautiful beryl gem of the purest water—eight faceted, well polished, clear, limpid, consummate in all its aspects, through which runs a blue, or yellow, or red, or white, or brown thread.’⁹⁴

Even so, young brahmin—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and utterly unshakable—he directs and inclines it to knowledge and vision.

He understands thus:

‘This body of mine is form, composed of the four great elements, born from mother and father, nourished with rice and porridge, subject to uncertainty, rubbing, pressing, breaking up and destruction. [D 1:77] And this consciousness of mine lies attached here, bound up here.’⁹⁵

This, too, is part of his wisdom.

Knowledge of the mind-made body⁹⁶

2.23 [D 2.87] With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,

⁸⁹ See **Vammika S** (M 23.4/1:144), SD 28.13 for parable of the anthill (representing the body).

⁹⁰ **D 2.85/1:76** (×2) = **M 109.9/2:17**; **M 23.4/1:144**, **74.9/500**; **S 35.105/4:83** = **A 9.15.2/4:386**; **S 55.21/5:369 f**; **Nigrodha,miga J 12/1:146**. Cf Divy 180: *śatana,patana,vikiraṇa, vidhvamsanā,dharmatā*. See **Dīgha,nakha S** (M 74.9/1:500), SD 16.1 tr & nn. This statement means that consciousness here (in a physical being) is dependent on the physical body. RD points out that this and other passages disprove the idea that the consciousness (*viññāṇa*) transmigrates. For holding such a view, Sāti was severely rebuked by the Buddha (M 38). A new re-linking consciousness (*paṭisandhi*) arises at conception, dependent on the old one (see Vism 17.164 ff).

⁹¹ This and prev passage = **Subha S** (D 10.2.21-22/1:209) = **Mahā Sakuludāyi S** (M 77.29/2:17). The beryl simile, relating to the Bodhisattva’s gestation period (as a foetus), at **Mahāpadāna S** (D 14.1.21/2:13) = **Acchariya Abbhūta S** (M 123.12/3:121).

⁹² *Veluriya*: from a metathesis of *veruliya* comes Greek *beryllos*, “beryl,” whence German *Brille*, “spectacles” (originally, of beryl) (Walshe).

⁹³ “Through which runs...etc.,” *tatra suttam āvutaṃ nīlaṃ vā pītaṃ vā lohitaṃ vā odātaṃ vā paṇḍu,suttam vā*. Rhys Davids tr *pīta* here as “orange-coloured,” and *paṇḍu* as “yellow” (D:RD 1:87), while Bodhi has as “yellow” and “brown” respectively (1989:44). Cf “clearly visible as if with a yellow thread strung through a jewel” (*vippasanne maṇi,ratne āvuta,paṇḍu,suttam viya*, J 1:51). *Paṇḍu,sutta* is found in **Vidhura Paṇḍita J** (J 545/6:305), where E B Cowell & W H D Rouse tr it as “white thread” (J:C&R 6:147). Both *pīta* and *paṇḍu* sometimes refer to “yellow.” SED def *pāṇḍu* as “yellowish white, white, pale.” Comys offer no explanation, except that the gem “is like the physical body, and the thread running through it, is like insight knowledge (*vipassanā,ñāṇa*)” (DA 1:211). DANṬ (New Subcomy) corrects “insight knowledge” to “insight consciousness” (*vipassanā,viññāṇa*, DANṬ:VRI 2:126). **Jothiko**: “Generally, ‘knowledge and vision’ is the ability, the state of clarity, enabling one to see even hidden things clearly. So the image of a transparent gem. It is both ‘higher than Jhāna’, if the absorptions are taken as ‘pleasant abiding in the here and now.’ And ‘less than the absorptions’ if they are used as a way of reaching full enlightenment. So, obviously, it is not the *sammā ñāṇa*—knowledge of liberation. The colors at old [sic] were often associated with natural phenomena. *Paṇḍu* is earthen colors, the word used even today to denote the dyeing of robes: various natural hues of brown, mostly. Just as *lohita* is both ‘blood’ and the color of ‘red,’ *pitta* [*pīta*] is ‘bile’ and its shades, mostly ‘light green,’ off yellow” (email 13 Nov 2006). It is possible that the six colours represent the six sense-consciousnesses. The first 4 colours are those of the colour *kaṣiṇa* meditations: see **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16.3.29-32/2:110 f), SD 9. See **Viññāṇa** = SD 17.8a (4.1).

⁹⁴ Close parallel in **Mahāpadāna S** (D 14.1.21/2:13), SD 49.8 & **Acchariya Abbhūta S** (M 123.12/3:121), SD 52.2.

⁹⁵ This statement means that consciousness here (in a physical being) is dependent on the physical body.

⁹⁶ As at *Sāmañña,phala* (D 2.87/1:77), SD 8.10

he directs and inclines it to creating a **mind-made body**.⁹⁷ From this body he creates another body, endowed with form,⁹⁸ mind-made, complete in all its parts, without defect in any faculty.⁹⁹

2.24 [D 2.88] Young brahmin, just as if a man were to draw a reed from its sheath, it would occur to him:

‘This is the sheath, this is the reed. The sheath is one thing, the reed another, but the reed has been drawn out from the sheath.’

Or, young brahmin, as if a man were to draw a sword from its scabbard, it would occur to him:

‘This is the sword, this is the scabbard. The sword is one thing, the scabbard another, but the sword has been drawn out from the scabbard.’

Or, young brahmin, as if a man were to pull a snake out from its slough, it would occur to him:

‘This is the snake, this is the slough. The snake is one thing, the slough another, but the snake has been pulled out from the slough’;

Even so, young brahmin, with his mind thus *concentrated*, from this body he creates another body, endowed with form, mind-made, complete in all its parts, without defect in any faculty.

This, too, is part of his wisdom.

KNOWLEDGE OF THE MODES OF SUPERNORMAL POWER

Mundane superknowledge [§89-98]

(1) PSYCHIC POWERS

2.25 [D 2.89] With his mind thus *concentrated*, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects,¹⁰⁰ pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,

he directs and inclines it to [78] the manifold psychic powers, thus:¹⁰¹

- (1) Having been one he becomes many; having been many he becomes one.
- (2) He appears, and vanishes.
- (3) He goes unhindered through walls, through ramparts, and through mountains as if through space.

⁹⁷ “Mind-made body,” *mano, mayā kāya*. **Peter Harvey**: “This shows that consciousness is seen as able to leave the physical body by means of a mind-made body. Such a body could be seen as a kind of ‘subtle body,’ for a being with a mind-made body is said to feed on joy (D 1:17), not on solid nutriment (D 1:195): it thus lacks the four great elements of the physical body (solidity, cohesion, heat and motion, D 1:195). As such a body relates to the ‘realm of (pure) form,’ the subtle matter composing it can only be visible and audible matter (Vbh 405). However, the mind-made body is invisible to the normal eye (Pm 2:209). [This is unattested: the passage actually says that the wonder worker could determine visibility or invisibility or any form (Piya)] It occupies space, but does not impinge on gross physical matter, for the ‘selfhood’ of a certain god with a mind-made body is said to be as large as two or three fields, but to cause no harm to anyone (A 3:122). With such a body, a person can exercise psychic powers such as going through solid objects, being in many places at once, or flying (D 1:78).” (1993:8 digital ed). Such a body, then could be called an “astral body,” but we need to take care not to read more than what the suttas tell us of it.

⁹⁸ Exactly the same as the physical body (but mentally created). This mind-made body is what is mistaken for a soul or self.

⁹⁹ *Ahīn-indriya*: D 2:13,17 (DA 11), 436,8-10 = M 3:121,20 (MA 4:181,11-13); D 1:77,11 ≠ M 2:17,26 (MA = AA), 18,6; Nm 340,15; Nc 209,21; D I 34,24 (= *paripunn’indriyo*, AA), 186,14 f, 195,26.

¹⁰⁰ *Upakkilesa*: see §85 n in D 2 @ SD 8.10.

¹⁰¹ *Eko’pi hutvā bahudhā hoti, bahudhā’pi hutvā eko hoti; āvibhāvaṃ tiro, bhāvaṃ tiro, kuṭṭaṃ tiro, pākāraṃ tiro, -pabbataṃ asajjamāno gacchati seyyathā’pi ākāse. Pathaviyāpi ummujj’animujjāṃ karoti seyyathā’pi udake. Udake’pi abhijjamāne gacchati [Ce Ke abhijjamāno] seyyathā’pi pathaviyā. Ākāse’pi pallaṅkena kamati seyyathā’pi pak-khī sakūṇo. Ime’pi candima, sūriye evam mah’iddhike evam mahā’nubhāve pāṇinā parāmasati parimajjati. Yāva brahma, lokāpi kāyena vasam vatteti. Buddhaghosa takes āvibhāvaṃ tiro, bhāvaṃ tiro to be a distinct power, giving a list of 8 powers (Vism 12.69). The syntax of the Sutta passage, **Gethin** notes, might be read as suggesting only 7 distinct powers (ie, taking powers 2+3 as one). (*The Buddhist Path to Awakening*, 2001: 82 n6). Cf **Kevaḍḍha S** (D 11) where the Buddha disapproves of exhibiting such powers (D 11.4-5/1:213 f), SD 1.7. See **Miracles** = SD 27.15a.*

- (4) He dives in and out of the earth as if it were water.
- (5) He walks on water without sinking as if it were earth.
- (6) Sitting cross-legged, he goes through the air like a winged bird.
- (7) With his hand he touches and strokes even the sun and the moon, so mighty, so powerful.
- (8) He has power over his body up to as far as the Brahmā world.

2.26 [D 2.90] Young brahmin, just as a skilled potter or his assistant could craft from well-prepared clay whatever kind of pottery vessel he likes,

or, young brahmin, as a skilled ivory-carver or his assistant could craft from well-prepared ivory any kind of ivory-work he likes,

or, young brahmin, as a skilled goldsmith or his assistant could craft from well-prepared gold any kind of gold article he likes—

even so, young brahmin, with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, he directs and inclines it to the manifold psychic power:

- (1) Having been one he becomes many; having been many he becomes one.
- (2) He appears, and vanishes.
- (3) He goes unhindered through walls, through ramparts, and through mountains as if through space.
- (4) He dives in and out of the earth as if it were water.
- (5) He walks on water without sinking as if it were earth.
- (6) Sitting cross-legged, he goes through the air like a winged bird.
- (7) With his hand he touches and strokes even the sun and the moon, so mighty, so powerful. [79]

This, too, is part of his wisdom.

(2) CLAIRAUDIENCE (DIVINE EAR)

2.27 [D 2.91] With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free of defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,

he hears, by means of the divine-ear element,¹⁰² purified and surpassing the human, both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far.

2.28 [D 2.92] Young brahmin, just as if a man travelling along a highway were to hear the sounds of bheri [conical drum], mridanga [tom-tom],¹⁰³ conch-shell, cymbals, and dindima [small drum], he would know,

‘That is bheri sound; that is mridanga sound; that is conch-shell sound; that is cymbal sound; that is dindima sound’—even so, young brahmin, with his mind thus *concentrated*, he hears, by means of the divine ear-element, purified and surpassing the human, both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far.

This, too, is part of his wisdom.

(3) MIND-READING

2.29 [D 2.93] With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free of defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,

he directs and inclines it to the knowledge of mind-reading.¹⁰⁴ He knows the minds of other beings, other individuals, having encompassed them with his own mind.¹⁰⁵

*He knows[understands] a mind with lust as a mind with lust,
and a mind without lust as a mind without lust. [D 1:80]*

¹⁰² “Divine-ear element,” *dibba,sota,dhātu*, clairaudience. See **Miracles**, SD 27.5a (5.2).

¹⁰³ “Mridanga,” *mutiṅgā*, v1 *mudiṅgā* (V 1:15, S 2:267). See **Āṇi S** (S 20.7.2), SD 11.13.

¹⁰⁴ “Knowledge of mind-reading,” *ceto,pariya,ñāna*.

¹⁰⁵ The foll section (italicized) is a list of mental states which apparently is taken from **Satipaṭṭhāna Ss** (D 22.12-/2:299 = M 10.34/1:59), where it fits more appropriately (Walshe, D:W 546 n131). For another def of mind-reading (4 kinds), see **Sampasādanīya S** (D 28.6/3:103 f), SD 14.10.

*He knows a mind with aversion as a mind with aversion,
and a mind without aversion as a mind without aversion.
He knows a mind with delusion as a mind with delusion,
and a mind without delusion as a mind without delusion.
He knows a contracted mind [due to sloth and torpor] as a contracted mind,
and a distracted mind [due to restlessness and remorse] as a distracted mind.
He knows an exalted mind [through the lower or higher dhyana] as an exalted mind,
and an unexalted mind [not developed by dhyana] as an unexalted mind.
He knows a surpassable mind as a surpassable mind,
and an unsurpassable mind as an unsurpassable mind¹⁰⁶.
He knows a concentrated mind as a concentrated mind,
and an unconcentrated mind as an unconcentrated mind.
He knows a released mind as a released mind,
and an unreleased mind as an unreleased mind.*

2.30 [D 2.94] Young brahmin, just as if **a man or woman, a youth or a maiden,**¹⁰⁷ **fond of ornaments,** examining the reflection of his or her own face in a bright mirror or a bowl of clear water would know ‘blemished’ if it were blemished, or ‘unblemished’ if it were not—

even so, young brahmin, with his mind thus *concentrated*, he knows the minds of other beings, other individuals, having encompassed them with his own mind.

*He knows [understands] a mind with lust as a mind with lust,
and a mind without lust as a mind without lust.
He knows a mind with aversion as a mind with aversion,
and a mind without aversion as a mind without aversion.
He knows a mind with delusion as a mind with delusion,
and a mind without delusion as a mind without delusion.
He knows a contracted mind [due to sloth and torpor] as a contracted mind,
and a distracted mind [due to restlessness and remorse] as a distracted mind.
He knows an exalted mind [through the lower or higher dhyana] as an exalted mind,
and an unexalted mind [not developed by dhyana] as an unexalted mind.
He knows a surpassable mind as a surpassable mind,
and an unsurpassable mind as an unsurpassable mind¹⁰⁸.
He knows a concentrated mind as a concentrated mind,
and an unconcentrated mind as an unconcentrated mind.
He knows a released mind as a released mind,
and an unreleased mind as an unreleased mind.*

—he knows each of them just as it is. [D 1:81]

This, too, is part of his wisdom.

(4) THE KNOWLEDGE OF THE RECOLLECTION OF PAST LIVES¹⁰⁹

2.31 [D 2.95] With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free of defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,

he directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the recollection of past lives.¹¹⁰ He recollects his manifold past existence, that is to say, one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births, ten births,

¹⁰⁶ Unsurpassable (*anuttaram*) mind, probably synonymous with “developed” mind. See D:W 592 n667.

¹⁰⁷ *Itthī vā puriso vā daharo yuvā.*, as at V 2:255, 3:68; **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.92/1:80); **Mahā Sakul’udāyī S** (M 77.19,31/2:19), **Ākañkheyya S** (M 5/1:32), **Vitakka,sañṭhāna S** (M 20/1:119); **Jātaka Nidāna,kathā** (J 1:5).

¹⁰⁸ Unsurpassable (*anuttaram*) mind, probably synonymous with “developed” mind. See D:W 592 n667.

¹⁰⁹ This knowledge and the foll two (ie 4-6) constitutes “the 3 knowledges” (*te,vijjā*) of the Buddha and the arhats (D 3:220, 275; A 5:211), and is a shorthand for “the 6 knowledges” (*cha-l-ābhiñña*) listed here and elsewhere.

twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births, one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births, many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion, many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’

Thus, young brahmin, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details.¹¹¹

2.32.1 [D 2.96] PARABLE OF THE TRAVELLER. Just as if a man were to go from his home village to another village, and then from that village to yet another village, and then from that village back to his home village. The thought would occur to him,

‘I went from my home village to that village over there. There I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way. From that village I went to that village over there, and there I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way. From that village I came back home’;¹¹² [D 1:82]

2.32.2 Even so, young brahmin, *with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free of defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the recollection of past lives. He recollects his manifold past existence, that is to say, one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births, ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births, one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births, many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion, many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’

Thus, young brahmin, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details.

This, too, is part of his wisdom.

(5) THE KNOWLEDGE OF DEATH AND BIRTH (THE DIVINE EYE)

2.33 [D 2.97] With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free of defects, pliant, [209] malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,

he directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the passing away and re-arising of beings.¹¹³ He sees—by means of the divine eye [clairvoyance],¹¹⁴ purified and surpassing the human—beings passing away and re-arising, and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma:

‘These beings—who were endowed with evil conduct of body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—after death, with the body’s breaking up, have re-arisen in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell.

¹¹⁰ *Pubbe,nivāsanānussati,ñāṇa*, lit “the knowledge of the recollection of past abidings [existences].” The remainder of this is expanded into 4 sections in **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1.1.31-34/1:13-16 = SD 25.3(76.3)) and 3 sections in **Sampasādaniya S** (D 27.15-17/3:107-112 = SD 10.12). In both cases, each explains how the eternalist view arose.

¹¹¹ This knowledge is detailed at Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

¹¹² The 3 villages represent the “three existences” (*tīsu bhavesu*), ie, the sense world, the form world, and the formless world (DA 1:224).

¹¹³ *Cutūpapāta ñāṇa*, “the knowledge of the falling away and rebirth (of beings),” or “knowledge of rebirth according to karma” (*yathā,kammūpaga ñāṇa*), or “the divine eye” (*dibba,cakkhu*): see foll n.

¹¹⁴ *Dibba,cakkhu*, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (*dhamma,cakkhu*) (see n in §104). On the relationship of this knowledge to the 62 grounds for wrong views, see **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1), SD 25.3(76.3). See prec n.

But these beings—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—after death, with the body’s breaking up, have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.’

Thus, young brahmin, by means of the divine eye, [D 1:83] he sees beings passing away and re-arising, and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma.

2.34 [D 2.98] PARABLE OF THE CITY SQUARE.¹¹⁵ Young brahmin, just as if there were a mansion in the central square [where four roads meet], and a man with good eyesight standing on top of it were to see people entering a house, leaving it, wandering along the carriage-road, and sitting down in the central square [where four roads meet]. The thought would occur to him,

‘These people are entering a house, leaving it, walking along the streets, and sitting down in the central square [where four roads meet].’¹¹⁶

2.35 Even so, young brahmin, with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free of defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, he directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the passing away and re-arising of beings. He sees—by means of the divine eye [clairvoyance], purified and surpassing the human—beings passing away and re-arising, and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma:

‘These beings—who were endowed with evil conduct of body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—after death, with the body’s breaking up, have re-arisen in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell.

But these beings—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—after death, with the body’s breaking up, have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.’

Thus, young brahmin, by means of the divine eye, he sees beings passing away and re-arising, and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma.

This, too, is part of his wisdom.

(6) THE KNOWLEDGE OF THE DESTRUCTION OF MENTAL INFLUXES

2.36 [D 2.99a] With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, the monk directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the destruction of the mental influxes.¹¹⁷

[D 2.99b]	He knows, as it is really is,	‘This is suffering’;
	he knows, as it really is,	‘This is the arising of suffering’;
	he knows, as it really is,	‘This is the ending of suffering’;
	he knows, as it really is,	‘This is the path to the ending of suffering’; ¹¹⁸

¹¹⁵ On this parable, see also SD 2.17(8).

¹¹⁶ On the significance of this simile in confirming canonical acceptance of the intermediate state (*antarā, bhava*), see “**Is rebirth immediate?**” SD 2.17.8.

¹¹⁷ *Āsava-k, khaya, nāṇa*. The term *āsava*, “mental influxes, or mental fluxes” (lit “inflow, outflow”) comes from *ā-savati* “flows towards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously translated as taints (“deadly taints,” RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists 4 *āsava*: the influx of (1) sense-desire (*kām’āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav’āsava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭh’āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijj’āsava*) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These four are also known as “floods” (*oghā*) and “yokes” (*yogā*). The list of 3 influxes (omitting the influx of views) is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these *āsavas* is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict under *āsava*.

¹¹⁸ These 4 statements on suffering pose an interesting problem: they are not called “noble truths” here (nor in **Ariya Pariyesanā S**, M 26.43). Norman remarks that these four statements, which also likewise appear in **Mahā**

he knows, as it really is,	‘These are mental influxes’;
he knows, as it really is,	‘This is the arising of influxes’;
he knows, as it really is,	‘This is the ending of influxes’;
he knows, as it really is,	‘This is the path to the ending of influxes.’ ¹¹⁹

[D 2.99c] His mind, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the influx of sensual desire, the influx of existence, the influx of ignorance.¹²⁰ With release, there is the knowledge, ‘Released (am I)!’ He knows that ‘Birth is ended, the holy life has been lived, done is that which needs to be done. There is nothing further beyond this.’¹²¹

This, young brahmin, is the noble aggregate of wisdom,

2.37 This, young brahmin, is the noble aggregate of wisdom that the Blessed One speaks in praise of, and rouses, instills and establishes these people in.

2.38 But here, young brahmin, there is nothing more to be done.” [210]

2.39 SUBHA’S EXULTATION (3). “Wonderful it is, master Ānanda! This noble aggregate of wisdom is fully complete, not incomplete.

And, master Ānanda, I do not see such a fully complete noble aggregate of wisdom in the recluses and brahmins outside of this community.

For, there is truly no more to be done here.”¹²²

Subha goes for refuge

2.40 “Excellent, Master Ānanda! Excellent, Master Ānanda!

2.41 Just as if, master Ānanda,

one were to place upright what had been overturned, or

were to reveal what was hidden, or

were to show the way to one who was lost, or

were to hold up a lamp in the dark so that those with eyes could see forms,

in the same way, in numerous ways, the Dharma has been declared by master Ānanda.

2.42 I, master Ānanda, go to Blessed Gotama for refuge, to the Dharma, and to the community of monks.

May the master Ānanda remember me as a layman who has gone to him for refuge from this day forth for life.”

— evaṃ —

121107; 121110; 130310

Saccaka S (M36.42/1:249), but are not referred to as the noble truths about suffering, “and since they appear to be subordinate to the four statements about the *āsavas*, it is possible that the statements about misery are a later addition [here], which led to a parallel, but inappropriate, set of four statements being evolved about the *āsavas*, to provide a symmetry” (Norman 1990:26). For a discussion on the formulation of the noble truths, see Norman 1982:377-91 & also Schmithausen 1981:205.

¹¹⁹ As in **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26.42), SD 1. On the application of the four noble truth template to both *dukkha* and to *āsava* here, see Analayo 2003:224 n28 + SD 17.4(8.4)

¹²⁰ See §99a n above on *āsava-k, khaya, ñāṇa*.

¹²¹ *Nāparam itthatāya*: lit. “there is no more of ‘thusness.’” See **Mahā, nidāna S** (M 15.22), SD 5.17.

¹²² *N’atthi c’ev’ettha uttarim karaṇīyan’ti*.