6

Pāsādika Sutta
The Discourse on the Delightful | D 29/3:117-141
Theme: The conditions for failure and for success in a religion
Translated by Piya Tan ©2005, 2012

1 Sutta highlights

HOW TO STUDY THE PĀSĀDIKA SUTTA. After reading this section [1], go straight into the section on “The Sutta summary and paraphrase” [2]. Go through section by section (eg 2.1), and where a section arouses your interest, straightaway go to that part of the Sutta and read it. Even if you still do not understand what you have read, return to [2] and finish reading it. It is sufficient to read §12 (1) (on elder monk disciples), unless you wish to read the full version as a reflection.

1.1 Comprehensive list of teachings. The Pāsādika Sutta (D 29) is a record of some of the late or last teachings of the Buddha [§14.4], reminiscent of the instructions given in the Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta (D 16) [7.3] and the later narrative suttas. The Pāsādika Sutta is important as one of the earliest documents, even the earliest that we have on early monastic attempts at giving a comprehensive list of the Buddha’s teachings. This famous list of the “7 sets” of teachings [§17.8] are better known as the 37 limbs of awakening (bodhi,pakkhiya dhamma) [6.1.1].

The listing of key teachings by way of the “7 sets” [§17.8] has a clear purpose: to ensure that the sangha is neither divided nor confused over any teaching of the Buddha, as has occurred in the case of the followers of Nirgrantha Nāta,putta, following his death [§1]. This is to ensure internal unity of the Buddhist community itself, unified by a common standard of faith, as it were.

1.2 Two purposes of the Sutta. The Pāsādika Sutta first discusses how a religion fails, and then how it will succeed. Basically, when the teacher fails to systematize his teachings and has disciples who have realized the highest goals, the religion will fail. On the other hand, when the teacher clearly lays down what his teachings are, and ensures that there are competent disciples as spiritual exemplars and teachers, that religion will succeed.

As such, it has two clear purposes laid out:

(1) the listing of the key teachings of the Buddha, and
(2) discipleship and doctrinal training in answering any doctrinal challenges from outside.

While reinforcing the faith of their own community (apologetics) [4.2], the early Buddhists were also aware of the need to rectify wrong perceptions of the Buddha’s teachings (polemics) [4.3] and to propagate the true Dharma (missiology).

2 Sutta summary and paraphrase

2.1 A FAILED RELIGION. [§1] The Pāsādika Sutta opens with the Buddha residing in the Sakya Vedhañña’s mango grove. The narrator tells us that Nirgrantha Nāta,putta (Mahā,vīra) has just died, and there is confusion and disunity amongst his followers. [§2] Cunda Samanuddesa meets Ānanda at Sāma, gāma, and relates to him the sad events following Nāta,putta’s death. Ānanda proposed that they see the Buddha about this.

[§3] The Buddha agrees that where the Dharma,vinaya (the teaching and the discipline) were badly taught, such disasters would attend a religious community, and his teaching follows, forming the main bulk of the Pāsādika Sutta [§§3.4-40.3]. [§4] According to the Buddha, in a system where the teacher is not fully awakened, a disciple who deviates from such a system should be praised, since it is a wrong system. It is not “meritorious” to continue practising such teachings, unconcerned with those who deviate [§4.7]. [§5] Similarly, it is not meritorious to practise a teaching of an unawakened teacher, unconcerned with the positive aspects of the system [§5.8].

1 On missiology, see Udumbarikā Siha,nāda S (D 25.23/3:56 f), SD 1.4 (2); also Mahā,parinibbāna S (D 16) @ SD 9 App 1 (1); Wanderers of today, SD 24.6b (3); The great commission, SD 11.2 (6).

http://dharmafarer.org
In the Buddha Dharma, however, the teacher is fully awakened. As such, a disciple who deviates from such a teaching is blameworthy. On the hand, one who keeps to the Dharma here is praiseworthy and generates merit.

2.2 A SUCCESSFUL RELIGION, BUT WITHOUT SPIRITUALITY. A system where the Dharma is not well taught and well grounded (that is, with its wonders, leading to liberation), and the disciples have not grasped the meaning and purpose of the Dharma before the teacher passes away, is doomed to fail. Whereas, in a system where the Dharma is well taught and well grounded, and the disciples have a good grasp of the meaning and purpose of the Dharma while the teacher still lives, will succeed.

Even then, a system without a wise elder as teacher would not be able to produce awakened disciples. In terms of discipleship, a spiritual community must have a teacher who is a wise elder, so that there will be awakened disciples, that is, comprises the following:

- Elder monk disciples
- Middling monk disciples
- Novice monk disciples
- Elder nun disciples
- Middling nun disciples
- Novice nun disciples
- Celibate laymen disciples
- Celibate laywomen disciples
- Householder laymen disciples
- Householder laywomen disciples

However, even when there are all these 10 kinds of disciples, Buddhism may still be “merely an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, well proclaimed amongst devas and humans,” without a holy life, that is, without training others for liberation, there will be “no attaining of the peak of gain, the peak of fame” —the holy life is still unaccomplished.

Furthermore, under these positive conditions, if there is “no attaining of the peak of gain, the peak of fame,” that is, the attaining of the various stages of sainthood, the holy life is still unaccomplished.

On the other hand, if the holy life is widespread, successful and wealthy, and there are also those attaining the four stages of sainthood, then the holy life is accomplished.

2.3 THE BUDDHA’S TEACHING IS AN ACCOMPLISHED SYSTEM. The Buddha then declares that his Dharma, vinaya has all these positive qualities. The Buddha, dharma “is accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more.” In other words, the Buddha’s teachings as recorded in the early Buddhist canon is quite complete in itself and does not need any new texts or teachings.

The Buddha explains that Uddaka Rāma, putta does not understand his own riddle, “Looking, one sees not” and the not seeing refers to not seeing the completeness of the holy life itself.

The Buddha then lists the 7 sets of key teachings that should be recited, remembered and understood, so that the holy life lasts for a long time for the benefit of all beings.

The Buddha then explains three proper ways for resolving differences in opinion over the Dharma. Whether the difference is over its meaning or its wording or both, neither dismissing nor disparaging anyone, we should carefully and attentively make him fully understand what he has proposed. On the other hand, if his presentation is right both ways, we should openly show our gladness to him.

Next the Buddha reminds the monks to be contented with the four supports by properly reflecting on them.

2.4 PREVENTING MISCONCEPTIONS OF THE DHARMA

2.4.1 Wholesome pleasures. In these sections, the Buddha explains the types of pleasure (sukha) in terms of the spiritual life. Unwholesome pleasure is connected with habitual killing, stealing,
lying and sensual indulgence [§23.4], which are to be avoided [§23.5]. The pleasures of the 4 dhyanas [§24.4], on the other hand, are wholesome, and should be praised and encouraged [§24.7]. [§25] The benefits of dhyanic pleasure are good insofar as they lead to the attainment of any of the 4 kinds of sainthood.

2.4.2 The consistency of the Buddha’s teachings.

[§26] If other religionists question the authenticity of the Buddha’s teaching, they should be told that the Buddha Dharma is taught by the fully awakened Buddha in a complete and systematic way, so that its reliability and truth are unshakeable [§§26.1-4]. The highest fruit of this teaching is the arhat, who is incapable of killing, stealing, sexual intercourse, lying, enjoying pleasures like a layman, or acting out of greed, or hate, or delusion or fear [§26.6], in other words, he is pure in both body and mind.

[§27] If outsiders should accuse the Buddha of lacking future knowledge or the power of prophecy, they should be told that he is able to recall the past as far back as he wishes [§27.3]. As regards future knowledge, he is certain that he has overcome rebirth [§27.4]. Since the future has not yet happened, we can have no real knowledge of it (otherwise, it would be determinism, and the spiritual life would be useless).

[§28] The Buddha has full knowledge of the past, present and future, as far as knowing goes. What is not connected with the goal of awakening, he would not reveal or teach. He would only reveal and teach at the proper time what is true, real and connected with the goal.

2.5 THE TATHAGATA AND REALITY

2.5.1 The Tathagata. The Buddha is called Tathagata (thus come, who knows reality) for these reasons:

[§28.10] Concerning the past, the future and the present, he speaks at the right time, what is true, on the goal, what is Dharma (the teaching), and what is Vinaya (the discipline).

[§29.1] He has understood all that can be experienced, bodily and mentally.

[§29.2] He is fully awakened and all that he has taught are real and true.

[§29.3] His words and actions are true and consistent.

[§29.4] He has “conquered” the world, and hence understands everything.

2.5.2 What is unrelated or related to spirituality

2.5.2.1 POINTS UNDETERMINED AND DETERMINED. [§30] The postmortem state of a tathāgata (here referring to an arhat) cannot be described in any logical way because he is beyond existence and non-existence. [§31] The Buddha leaves such issues unanswered as they are not related to the spiritual training and goal.

[§32] What the Buddha has determined and taught are the 4 noble truths; [§33] because they are directly related to the spiritual life and goal.

2.5.2.2 VIEWS CONNECTED WITH THE PAST. [§34] Next, the Buddha rejects the 16 wrong views regarding the past, based on these notions:

(1-4) whether the world is eternal, not eternal, both, or neither; [§34.7-10]

(5-8) whether the self and the world are self-made, other-made, both or neither; [§34.11-14]

(9-12) whether happiness and sorrow are eternal, not eternal, both, or neither; [§34.15-18]

(12-16) whether the self and the world are self-made, other-made, both or neither; [§34.19-22].

[§35] The Buddha rejects all such notions because “beings (are) with different perceptions,” that is, to say, they are all based on personal opinions (since they all have no direct personal experience of such things). [§36] Similarly, these are views that we should not entertain as they are undeterminable (and not related to the spiritual training).

2.5.2.3 VIEWS CONNECTED WITH THE FUTURE. [§37] The Buddha also rejects the 8 wrong views regarding the future, based on these notions:

(1-4) that the posthumous unimpaired self has form, is formless, both or neither;

---

3 On the trs of tathāgata, see Aggi Vaccha, gotta S (M 72) @ SD 6.15 (3.2). On the tetralemma, see Unanswered questions, SD 40a.10 (4.2): Describing an arhat’s after-death state.
(5-8) that the posthumous unimpaired self is conscious, unconscious, neither; that the self perishes after death.

[§38] The Buddha rejects such views as people “have different perceptions,” that is, they are subjective, without any reality of their own. [§39] Similarly, these are views that we should not entertain as they are undeterminable (and not related to the spiritual training).

2.6 THE WAY OUT. [§40] The way of all such views is the mind-training based on the 4 foundations of mindfulness.

[§41] On account of Upāṇa’s remark, the Buddha calls this exposition “delightful” (pāsādika).

3 Cunda Samaṇ’uddesa

3.1 FAMOUS SIBLINGS. At the opening of the Pāsādika Sutta, Cunda Samaṇ’uddesa (“the novice”) is said to have just moved from the rains retreat at Pāvā. He meets Ānanda and reports to him Nirgrantha Nāta,putta’s death and the consequent dissension amongst the Nirgrantas. On Ānanda’s suggestion, they visit the Buddha at Sāma, gāma to hear his response. [§§1-2]

Cunda is Sāriputta’s younger brother, and is himself the elder brother of Revata Khadira,vaniya, the youngest of the siblings, the acacia-forest dweller, renowned for his solitary life style, and is the foremost of those monks who are forest-dwellers (ārañña). Anāna is Cunda’s preceptor (SA 3:221), and it is to Ānanda that he first brings the news of Sāriputta’s death, at which time he is his personal attendant. Cunda Samaṇ’uddesa is, for a time, the Buddha’s personal attendant (SA 1:258, 3:213).

3.2 MAHĀ CUNDA. The Commentaries identify Cunda Samaṇ’uddesa with Mahā Cunda (ThaA 3:111), which is probably his alternate name in his senior years. Mahā Cunda is evidently a very eminent monk, as he is often mentioned by the Buddha in the company of the two chief disciples (Sāriputta and Mogallāna), Mahā Kassapa, Mahā Koṭṭhita, Mahā Kaccāna, and other elders. Cunda is one of the 80 great elders (ThaA 3:205).

Cunda is mentioned in the Chann’ovāda Sutta (M 114) and the Ovāda Channa Sutta (§4.87) as having accompanied Sāriputta to visit the sick Channa at the squirrels’ feeding ground outside Rājagaha, just before Channa’s suicide. Once when the Buddha lies ill in the squirrels’ feeding-ground near Rāja-gaha, Cunda visits him and they discuss the awakening-factors (bojjhāṅga), and promptly the Buddha recovers.

The Sallekha Sutta (M 8) records the Buddha’s teaching on the holy life by way of “effacement” (sallekha), that is, the removal of defilements, to Mahā Cunda. Mahā Cunda has given a number of teachings to the monks, including these:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(Dullāha) Mahā Cunda Sutta</th>
<th>A 6.46/3:355 f</th>
<th>SD 4.6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mahā Cunda Sutta</td>
<td>A 10.24/5:41-45</td>
<td>SD 72.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katthī Sutta</td>
<td>A 10.85/5:157-161</td>
<td>SD 68.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All of these are given while he is residing among the Cetiś at Saha-jāti, probably after the Buddha’s parinirvana. The Mahā parinibbāṇa Sutta (D 16) records Cunda or Cundaka, as he is called here, as

---

4 A 1.14/1:24; cf M 32.5-6/1:213; MA 2:247 (the 2 Revatas); AA 1:223; ThaA 1:117. For Chin sources: MĀ 184 = T1.727b3; EĀ 37.3 = T2.710c24; T154 = T3.81a27, which record his praises in favour of living in seclusion. See Anaṅga S (M 5) @ SD 37.7 (3.3.3.3).
5 Cunda S (§4.73/5:161 f).
6 Dh Comy tells how a 7-year-old novice (sūmanera) Cunda offers to perform a psychic wonder for the Buddha (DhA 3:211), but this is prob another namesake.
7 Eg DA 3:907; AA 3:379; DaH 2:188; ThaA 2:18.
8 M 118.1/3:78; A 6.46/3:355, 10.24/5:41, 10.85/5:157; U 1.5/3.
9 M 144.2-3/3:263 f = S 35.87/4:50f = SD 11.12
10 Gilāna S 3 (S 46.16/5:81), SD 43.13. The Samyukta Âgama version (in Chinese tr), however, says this other monk is Mahā Koṭṭhita [Chin 摩訶拘絺羅] (SĀ 1266 = T2.347b,18).
11 M 8/1:40-46 = SD 51.2.

http://dharmafarer.org
accompanying the Buddha in his last journey to Kusinārā. He spreads a bed for the Buddha in the mango grove by the Kakuṭṭhā river.12

4 Polemics and apologetics in early Buddhism

4.1 DEFENDING and ADVANCING THE FAITH. While during the early period, especially the first two decades of the Buddha’s ministry,13 the Buddha teaches mainly to the spiritually ripe and ready,14 during the later years, after the core of the spiritual community, the sangha, has been established, he teaches the Dharma to anyone who would listen. Through his peripatetic life of teaching,15 wherever he goes, and as his fame as a wise teacher spreads, various individuals often debate with him16 or simply meet to question him,17 or raise an issue by proxy.18 Such occasions often open the Dharma-doors to others, both the Buddha’s followers as well as the unconverted public.19

The Dīgha Nikāya20 is a collection of “long discourses” of the Buddha, mostly recording such debates with outsiders, on various points and issues relating to “the good life” (true happiness here and now) and spirituality (true goodness and liberation). Such suttas generally present aspect of Buddhism by way of an interesting or challenging narrative with strategic highlights of certain attractive doctrines to inspire the outsiders to join the order, or take refuge, if not at least not to belittle the Buddha Dharma.21

4.2 APOLOGETICS. Technically, apologetics (Greek, “speaking in defence”), is an intellectual defence of the faith,22 a skill in defending a position (such as a religious one) through the systematic use of information and argumentation. The word apologetic or apologetics comes from the Greek adjective, ἀπολογία (apologia = apo, “away from” + logos, “word”) “verbal defence, speech in defence.” In simpler terms, apologetics refers to a systematic way of explaining the teaching and correcting wrong views to both the converted and the unconverted, who are willing to learn the Dharma.

Here I have used the terms polemics and apologetics in a Buddhist context for the purpose of a better understanding of the proper argumentation in the defence and propagation of the Dharma. While apolo-

12 D 16.4.39n/2:134 f = SD 9; also at U 8.5/84.7.
13 This alludes to the notion of the “two periods” of the Buddha’s ministry: see Notion of dīṭhi, SD 40a.1 (1.3) & SID sv.
14 Eg Pukkusāti in Dhātu Vibhaṅga S (M 140/3:237-247), SD 4.17; Aṅguli,māla in Aṅguli,māla S (M 86/2:97-195), SD 5.11.
15 On the Buddha’s annual tours, see Arhats who became Bodhisattvas, SD 27.6b (3.2.1.2).
16 Upāli S (M 56/1:371-387), SD 27.1; Assalāyana S (M 93/2:147-157), SD 40a.2.
17 Eg Dīgha,nākha (Śāriputta’s nephew) who claims he “does not accept everything” (ie, he holds no views), Dīgha,nakha S (M 74/3:1497), SD 16.1.
18 Kamma Vibhaṅga S (M 136), eg, contains the Buddha’s teaching on karma, in response to Samiddhi’s inability, earlier on, to properly instruct and convince the wanderer Poṭṭa,putta on it (M 136/3:207-214), SD 4.16.
19 Śāriputta, eg, gains arhathood while standing fanning the Buddha and listening to the Buddha teaching on feelings to his (Śāriputta’s) nephew, Dīgha,nakha: Dīgha,nakha S (M 74/14:1501), SD 16.1. While the Buddha is addressing a certain monk before others, a by-stander, the cowherd Nanda, is inspired to ordained: Dāru-k,khandha S (S 35.24.14-15/4:181), SD 28.5.
20 To a much lesser extent, similar suttas are found in the Majjhima Nikāya (eg Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S, M 38/1:256-271 = SD 7.10), and other Nikāyas (eg Kesa,puttiya S, A 3.65/1:188-193 = SD 35.4a), but these are not debates—not polemical—but generally tend to be more apologetical, that is, a defence and rectification of the Dharma.
21 In Cūḷa Hatthi, padopana S (M 27), the wanderer Pīlotikā, although unconverted, shows a high regard for the Buddha (M 27.2-7/1:175-177), SD 40a.5. Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S (D 25) describes how the wanderer Nigrodha challenges the Buddha, who responds by discussing with Nigrodha his own faith and so besting him, although he remains unconverted (D 25/3:36-57), SD 1.4. On the probable purpose of the Dīgha Nikāya as a sort of Buddhist prospective for the outsider, see Joy Manné, 1990, 1992.
22 The German theologian and icon of Protestant Christianity, Martin Luther’s On the Bondage of the Will (De Servo Arbitrio 1525) is an example of polemic theology. It was written in answer to another polemic work, The Freedom of the Will (De libero arbitrio diatribe sive collatio 1524) by Desiderius Erasmus, the Dutch Renaissance humanist and theologian.
getics is a defence or advancement of Buddhist ideas amongst the ripe and ready, polemics is, as a rule, exchanges between two opposing parties (not necessarily present before one another).

The Pāsādika Sutta (D 29) is a good example of an early canonical work where the Buddha lays down the ground rules for proper argumentation of the Dhamma in response to outside criticisms. In other words, it is a locus classicus for the early Buddhist principles of apologetics. The Sutta however goes beyond apologetics and instructs on what apologetics points to, that is, a wholesome and effective system of spiritual training.

A number of other suttas, to a lesser extent, deals with apologetics, too. Similar suttas are found in the Majjhima Nikāya (eg the Mahā Taṇhā,sankhaya Sutta, M 38), and other Nikāyas (eg the Kesa,puttiya Sutta, A 3.65): these are not debates, but apologetical instructions on seeing the Dhamma rightly.23 The Alagaddūpama Sutta (M 22), like the Mahā Taṇhā,sankhaya Sutta, deals with a monk’s wrong view, which, in each case, is carefully disproven and the right view carefully presented.24

In the Kesa,puttiya Sutta, the Buddha basically speaks on the nature of beliefs and how they arise, how to avoid blind beliefs and false views, and to keep to a safe and sure religious life.25 In other words, these are not polemical texts; they generally tend to be apologetical, that is, a defence and righting of the Dhamma.

4.3 POLEMICS. A polemic is a contentious argument that is intended to establish the truth of a specific teaching and the falsity of the contrary notion. Polemic or polemics (“war of words”) is the art or presentation of convincing arguments regarding controversial topics. The word polemic is derived from the Greek adjective πολεμικός (polemikos), meaning “warlike, hostile,” which in turn comes from the feminine noun, πόλεμος (polemos), “war” (OED).

Polemics is common and vital as one of the most common form of argumentation in any field of learning, especially philosophy, politics, science and religion. It is closely related to debate, but if debate often seeks a common ground between the opposing sides, polemic intends only to establish the truth of a point while refuting the opposing view. In the field of religion, polemic theology is that branch of theological argumentation devoted to the history or conduct of controversy over religion. Polemic theology is the branch of theological argumentation devoted to the history or conduct of controversy over religious matters.

Kumāra Kassapa’s debate with prince Pāyāsi, as recorded in the Pāyāsi Sutta (D 23), is a canonical example of Buddhist polemics. In these interesting, often humorous, series of arguments, we see how Kumāra Kassapa rebuts Pāyāsi point by point on his wrong views regarding karma and rebirth,[3] [3.3]

The best known Buddhist work on polemics clearly is the Milinda,pañha (c100 BCE), purportedly a dialogue and debate, in which Milinda (Menander, the Indo-Greek king of Bactria, reigned 2nd cent BCE) questions, sometimes challenges, the monk Nāgasena.27 In our own times, various Buddhist scholars and writers have written apologetical works rebutting attacks on Buddhism and on religious ideas that are negative or exploitative, especially against evangelical systems.28

23 Respectively, M 22/1:130-142 = SD 3.13 & A 3.65/1:188-193 = SD 35.4a.
24 In M 22, the errant monk Ariṭṭha claims that sensuality (meaning “sex”) is not an obstruction to the holy life, against what the Buddha has frequently stressed and warned that sense-indulgence is a great hindrance to the holy life (M 22/1:130-142), SD 3.13. In M 38, the confused monk Sāti holds the wrong views that it is the “same” consciousness that is reborn and continues after death, when the Buddha actually teaches that consciousness is not a fixed entity, but a process that arises depending of conditions (M 38/1:256-271), SD 7.10.
25 A 3.65/1:199-193 = SD 35.4a.
26 D 23/2:316-357 = SD 39.4.
27 See K R Norman, Pali Literature, 1983:110-113. See also SD 36.9 (4.2.3) n on Nāgasena Bihku Sūtra.
28 Apologetical works that are directed against antagonists or other religions, incl Gunapala Dhamarsi, A Buddhist Critique of the Christian Conception of God, Antioch, CA, 1988, and A L de Silva, Beyond Belief: A Buddhist Critique of Fundamentalist Christianity, Sydney, 1994; on polemics against Buddhism, see Richard Fox Young & G P V Somaratna, Vain Debates: The Buddhist-Christian controversies of nineteenth-century Ceylon, Vienna: De Nobili Research Library, 1996.
4.4 KUMĀRA KASSAPA AS POLEMICIST. The elder Kumāra Kassapa\(^\text{29}\) is declared by the Buddha to be the foremost of the monks who have the gift of variegated or versatile discourse (\textit{citta,kathikānāṁ}).\(^\text{30}\) Understandably, Kumāra Kassapa is also skilled in debate, and this is shown in his responses to Pāyāsi’s wrong views, as recorded in the \textit{Pāyāsi Sutta} (D 23), which is replete with parables and various argumentations styles.\(^\text{31}\)

Kumāra Kassapa’s argumentative style, as evident from the Pāyāsi Sutta, shows an effective application of polemical skills. In modern literary style, however, Kumāra Kassapa’s argumentation style might be viewed as being prolix, but considering the cultural context, it is an effective, even popular style, as it wins prince Pāyāsi over to right view. In fact, Pāyāsi admits that “Even with master Kassapa’s first parable, I am already convinced,” but he continues playing an adversary because he desires “to hear [Kumāra Kassapa’s] ready wit in answering diverse questions,” and regards him as “a worthy adversary.”\(^\text{32}\)

5 The three trainings in the Pāsādika Sutta

5.1 The three trainings. The Pāsādika Sutta (D 29) is often cited in the Commentaries as an example of where the three trainings (sikkha-\text{-t},taya), that is, the whole of the teaching (sakala,sāsana), is called “the holy life” (brahma,carīyā).\(^\text{33}\) quoting this stock passage from the Sutta: “Indeed, Cunda, today [now] (etataṁ) this holy life of mine is truly an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, only so far as it is well proclaimed among humans.”\(^\text{34}\)

In a practical worldly sense, the three trainings are those of the body and speech, of the mind, and of wisdom. The “3 trainings” model leads us from our present state, through a cultivated state, into a liberated state (“higher mind”), albeit a temporary one, that is, until we attain sainthood. A saint, in other words, is simply someone who is spiritually mature or clearly and certainly free of mental defilements.\(^\text{35}\)

In the first chapter (the Sīla-khanda Vagga) of the \textit{Dīgha Nikāya}, each of its 13 suttas has the threefold training pericope laid out in the form of the “fruits of reclusehood” (sāmañña,phala), that is, the progress of a true disciple, also known as the gradual training or the disciple’s progress. It begins with moral virtue or “moralties” (sīla),\(^\text{36}\) followed by mental cultivation, the knowledge of supernormal powers,\(^\text{37}\) and the cultivation of liberating wisdom.\(^\text{38}\)

5.2 The three trainings in the Sutta. In the Pāsādika Sutta, there is a very long preamble on the failed religion and the accomplished teaching [§§3.4-21]. The rest of the Sutta then deals with the three trainings and concludes with Upavāṇa’s exultation. The three trainings of the Sutta can be listed as follows:

\begin{align*}
§22 & \text{Moral virtue: Proper use of the four permitted life-supports (robes, almsfood, lodging and medicine)} \\
§23-25 & \text{Mental cultivation: The devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure (that is, dhyana meditation)} \\
§26-38 & \text{Wisdom: The righting of wrong views, the nature of the Buddha and the arhat.}
\end{align*}

---

\(^{29}\) Kumāra Kassapa: for details, see SD 28.13 (2).
\(^{31}\) D 23/2:316-357 = SD 39.4 (1.2).
\(^{32}\) See nn at D 23.30.1/3:352 = SD 39.4. A similar sentiment is expressed by the erstwhile Jain follower, Upāli, to the Buddha, in \textit{Upāli Sutra} (M 56.15/1:378), SD 27.1.
\(^{34}\) §§12.197+212, 13.14, 15.11.
\(^{35}\) On the 3 trainings, see \textit{Silā samādhi paṁña} = SD 21.6 & SID: ti,sikkha..
\(^{36}\) See esp Sāmañña,phala (S D 2.43-68/1:63-70) & SD 8.10 (3), = \textit{Brahma,jāla S} (D 1.8-27/1:4-11), SD 25.2.
\(^{37}\) Eg D 2.87-96/1:77-82 = SD 8.10.
\(^{38}\) Eg D 2.97-100/1:83 = SD 9.10. On sāmañña,phala, see also Gethin 2001:195 f.
§40 lists the 4 focusses of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*) as the way to transcending all views and to liberation. In this sense, these four focusses are taken as the epitome of wisdom itself, that is, the practice of the arhat himself.

Perhaps, on account of the Sutta’s emphasis on the teacher’s clear and careful teaching, and the overcoming of wrong views, the Commentary remarks that “the Pāsādika Sutta speaks of the four paths (of sainthood, that is, streamwinning, once-return, non-return and arhathood) in terms of insight.”

Indeed, the Pāsādika Sutta is predominantly an instruction on the Buddha Dharma’s success in having a good foundation in insight and wisdom at all levels of the spiritual life.

6 The 7 sets & standardizing the doctrines

6.1 Significance of the Pāsādika Sutta

6.1.1 Authenticating the teachings. One of the most important developments in the religious history of Buddhism occurred during the “second period” of the Buddha’s ministry, especially the last two and a half decades of the Buddha’s life. This was the systematization of the teachings into the “7 sets,” which was the closest that early Buddhism came to the canonizing some kind of “standards of faith” or “canon of scripture.” The earliest records we have of such a development are found in at least three discourses, the most detailed of which is the Pāsādika Sutta (D 29), where the Buddha declares:

You should gather together and recite them [the 7 sets], comparing meaning with meaning, comparing text with text [comparing spirit with spirit, letter with letter], without quarrelling [without dissension].

[§18]

The Sutta opens immediately after the death of Nirgrantha Nāta,putta, when quarrels and disagreement split the Jain community. In this connection, the Buddha exhorts Cunda Saman’uddesa [3] thus:

If anyone, Cunda, speaking rightly, were to speak of a well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed, accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more,

speaking rightly, he would speak of this very well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed, accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more.

Therefore, Cunda, all of you to whom I have taught these truths that I have directly known should gather together and recite them, comparing meaning with meaning, comparing text with text [comparing spirit with spirit, letter with letter], without dissension [without quarrelling],

so that this holy life might endure, stand long,

and this is for the good of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of compassion for the world, and for the benefit, profit and happiness of devas and humans.

And what, Cunda, are these teachings, directly understood by me, that I have shown you, that all, having gathered and assembled, should not quarrel, but rehearse [recite] meaning for meaning, word for word?

They are (the 37 limbs of awakening) namely (the seven sets):^3^,

the 4 focusses of mindfulness, \( \text{cattāro satipaṭṭhāna} \)

the 4 right efforts, \( \text{samma-p. padhāna} \)

^3^ Pāsādika,sutte catūhi maggehi saddhim vipassanā kathitā. (DA 2:380)

^4^ Cf §4.1: on the “two periods” of the Buddha’s ministry: see Notion of diṭṭhi = SD 40a.1 (1.3) & SID sv.


^6^ D 29.18/3:128 = SD 40a.6.

^7^ These 7 sets are listed in Mahā,parinibbāna S (D 19.3.50b/2:120 & SD 9 (10c)) given in full in Sakul’udāyi S (M 77.15-21/2:11 f = SD 6.18) and as practised by various monks, in Ānāpāna, sati S (M 118.13/3:81 = SD 7.13).

the 4 paths to spiritual power, the 5 spiritual faculties, the 5 spiritual powers, the 7 awakening-factors, the noble eightfold path.

Thus, the Buddha introduced agreement: the monks should not quarrel, and should not allow the teaching to be distorted. To prevent thus, the Buddha introduced the four great references, defined in the Vinaya.

The Mahāvagga of the Vinaya, however, has its own, probably older, “four great references,” comprising four criteria for judging the propriety of an act or situation that is not covered by current rules:

1. Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is not allowable (akappiya) and goes against what is allowable, that is not allowable.
2. Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is allowable (kappiya) and goes against what is not allowable, that is allowable.
3. Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is not allowable (akappiyānu) and goes against what is allowable, that is not allowable.
4. Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is allowable (kappiyānulomiya) and goes against what is not allowable, that is allowable.

6.1.2 The four great references. The emphasis here is on avoiding dispute and reaching harmonious agreement: the monks should not quarrel, and should not allow the teaching to be distorted. To prevent thus, the Buddha introduced the four great references, defined in the Vinaya.

The Mahāvagga of the Vinaya, however, has its own, probably older, “four great references,” comprising four criteria for judging the propriety of an act or situation that is not covered by current rules:

(1) Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is not allowable (akappiya) and goes against what is allowable, that is not allowable.
(2) Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is allowable (kappiya) and goes against what is not allowable, that is allowable.
(3) Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is not allowable (akappiyānu) and goes against what is allowable, that is not allowable.
(4) Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is allowable (kappiyānulomiya) and goes against what is not allowable, that is allowable.

(V 1:250)

Parallelizing the four great references are these procedures laid out by the Buddha in the Pāsādika Sutta, as follows:

And, Cunda, when you are gathered together harmoniously, you should train yourselves thus when a certain fellow in the holy life speaks the Dharma before the sangha.

Now, suppose he were to speak thus:

1. “You have grasped both the meaning and the wording of this wrongly,” or
2. “You have grasped the meaning wrongly but the wording rightly,” or
3. “You have grasped the meaning rightly but the wording wrongly.”

Neither approving nor disapproving, you should, with careful attention, make him comprehend only the disagreed points.

Now, suppose he were to speak thus:

4. “You have grasped both the meaning and the wording rightly,” then you should applaud him, saying,

“Sadhu! [Excellent!]...This is a great advantage to us all that you are so accomplished in its meaning and its wording!”

(D 29.18-21:3:129; abridged & paraphrased)

45 See V 1:22; D 2:120; M 1:396, 2:96; A 2:74, 15 f.
47 See M 1:295; S 3:46, 225, 4:168; A 2:151. See foll n.
48 See D 2:120, 239; M 2:12, 3:296; S 3:96, 153, 4:366; A 3:10, 12; Vbh 342.
50 See D 1:256 f., 165, 312; M 1:61, 118, 3:251; It 18; Sn 1130; Vbh 235.
52 On the 4 great references (mahā’padesa), see Mahāparinibbāna S (D 16.4.7-11:2:123 f) & SD 9 (11).
53 "That the bhikkhus should abide together harmoniously, united, and should keep unceasingly the vinaya, following the teaching of the Buddha. Suppose he were to speak thus:—(1) attaṁ c’eva micchā gaṅhāti, vāyājanāṇi ca micchā ropeṭi ti...; (2) attaṁ hi kho micchā gaṅhāti, vāyājanāṇi sammā ropeṭi ti...; (3) attaṁ hi kho sammā gaṅhāti, vāyājanāṇi micchā ropeṭi ti—tassa n’eva abhinanditaṁba na paṭikkositaṁba. Anabhinanditvā appaṭikkosītvā so evaṁ assa vacanīyo; (4) attaṁ n’eva sammā gaṅhāti, vāyājanāṇi sammā ropeṭi ti."
6.2 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE SĀMA,GĀMA SUTTA. The second of the three discourses relating to authenticating the teaching with harmony is the Sāma,gāma Sutta (M 104), where the Buddha warns:

A dispute about livelihood or about the Pātimokkha would be trifling.
But, Ānanda, should there arise in the sangha a dispute about the path or the way, such a dispute would be to the detriment of the many. …
(M 104.5/2:245) = SD 62.4

The Sāma,gāma Sutta (M 104)\(^{54}\) is effectively the Majjhima Nikāya counterpart of the Pasādika Sutta of the Dīgha Nikāya. Both suttas open with the Buddha dwelling among the Sakyas, immediately after the death of Nirgranta Nāta,putta, when quarrels and disagreements split the Jain community. In both suttas, both Cunda and Ānanda mention the incident to the Buddha. In the Sāma,gāma Sutta, however, Ānanda concludes with a more specific point, followed by the Buddha’s response, thus:

“This occurs to me, bhante: Let not a dispute arise in the sangha after the Blessed One’s passing away. Such a dispute would be to the detriment of the many, the unhappiness of the many, the loss, detriment and suffering of devas and humans.”

“What do you think, Ānanda? Those things that I have directly known and taught you, namely, the four focusses of mindfulness…the noble eightfold path—Ānanda, do you see any two monks who have differing opinions regarding them?”

(\(M 104.4/2:245\))

Ānanda replies no but suggests that after the Buddha’s passing those who live taking him as their refuge might become involved in dispute “in connection with livelihood” (\(ajjh’ājīva\)) and “in connection with the code of discipline” (\(adhipātimokkha\)),\(^{55}\) and that this would be to the disadvantage of the many. The Buddha, however, replies:

“Ānanda, a dispute about livelihood or about the Pātimokkha would be trifling. But, Ānanda, should there arise in the sangha a dispute about the path or the way, such a dispute would be to the detriment of the many, the unhappiness of the many, the loss, detriment and suffering of devas and humans!”

(\(M 104.5/2:245\))

6.3 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE KIN’TI SUTTA. The third discourse related to the harmonious authentication of the teachings is the Kin’ti Sutta (M 103), which similarly focusses on the centrality of the seven sets as the standards for overcoming any disagreement regarding the spirit and the letter of the Dharma. The Sutta opens with the Buddha declaring:

Bhikshus, what do you think of me? That the recluse Gotama teaches Dharma for the sake of robes? Or, that the recluse Gotama teaches Dharma for the sake of almsfood? Or, that the recluse Gotama teaches Dharma for the sake of lodgings? Or, that the recluse Gotama teaches Dharma for the sake of this or that existence [different states of being]?

(\(M 103.2/2:238\))

The monks reply that the Buddha “is compassionate, one who seeks after our good; he teaches the Dharma out of compassion.” the Buddha continues:

Therefore, monks, those things that I have directly known and taught you, namely, the four focusses of mindfulness…the noble eightfold path—in these things you should all train yourself in concord, with mutual appreciation, without disputing.

While you are training yourself in concord, with mutual appreciation, without disputing, let not any two monks differ in opinions regarding the Dharma (\(abhidhamme\)).

(\(M 103.3-4/2:239\))

The Buddha then declares:

\(^{54}\) M 104/2:243-251 = SD 62.4.

\(^{55}\) \(Ajjh’ājīva\) and \(adhipātimokkha\), see CPD which qu MA 4:38.

http://dharmafarer.org
You should all train yourself in concord, with mutual appreciation, without disputing ... let not any two monks differ in opinions regarding the Dharma. (M 103.4/2:239) = SD 85.14

The Buddha then shows us how to deal with possible areas of discord: where there is disagreement about the meaning (ātha) or the wording (vyañjana), that is, both together and each separately: where a monk commits some offence (āpatti) or transgression (vīkkama); where argument and ill feeling exist between groups.66

7 Related suttas

7.1 (SĀLAVATIKĀ) LOHICCA SUTTA. Besides the SĀMA,gāMA SUTTA (M 104) [6.2] and the Kin’ti SUTTA (M 103) [6.3] already mentioned, there are a number of other suttas which can be profitably studied with the Pāsādika Sutta. A key teaching of the Sutta concerns the effectiveness of the teacher, based on whose spirituality and teaching, the system succeeds or fails. If the teacher is not fully awakened and does not have disciples who are also awakened, the teaching would neither prosper nor last. This is essentially the same message of the (Sālava,tikā) Lohicca Sutta (D 12), where the ideal teacher is one who is fully awakened and his disciples listen to him and benefit from it.57

7.2 SĀMAṆṆA,PHALA SUTTA. The Pāsādika Sutta, as a whole, is said to present the “holy life,” that is, the training of a disciple for awakening. This is also known as the “fruits of reclusship” (sāmañña,-phala) [5.1], that is, the benefits of spiritual growth. The famous sāmañña.phala pericope is found in all the first 13 suttas of the Dīgha Nikāya, forming the Sīla-k,handha Vagga (The Chapter on the Moral Virtue Aggregates).58 More specifically, this deals with the three trainings [5.2], that is, in moral virtue, in mental cultivation and in wisdom.

7.3 MAHĀ,PARINIBBĀNA SUTTA. The Pāsādika Sutta records some of the Buddha’s “final instructions” dealing with the authenticity of the teaching [§§5-11], the true prosperity of the spiritual community [§§12-15] and the extended life and liberating wisdom of the Buddha Dharma for the benefit of all beings [§§16-40]. We see similar concerns shown in greater narrative detail in the Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta (D 16), which recounts the last days and final teachings of the Buddha.59

7.4 SUTTAS RELATED TO APOLOGETICS. We have already noted that the Pāsādika Sutta is the locus classicus for early Buddhist apologetics [4.3]. In this connection, we have related discourses such as the Mahā Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta (M 38), which corrects the confused monk Sāti, who holds the wrong view that it is the “same” consciousness that is reborn and continues after death, when the Buddha actually teaches that consciousness is not a fixed entity, but a process that arises depending of conditions.60

The Alagaddāpama Sutta (M 22), like the Mahā Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta, deals with the errant monk Ariṭṭha’s claims that sensuality (meaning “sex”) is not an obstruction to the holy life, against what the Buddha has frequently stressed, and warns that sense-indulgence is a great hindrance to the holy life.61

Another famous text on Buddhist apologetics is the Kesa.putiya Sutta (A 3.65), where the Buddha basically speaks on the nature of beliefs and how they arise, how to avoid blind beliefs and false views, and to keep to a safe and sure religious life.62 In other words, these are not polemical texts; they generally tend to be apologetical, that is, a defence and righting of the Dharma to an open and curious audience.

---

56 M 103.5-7/2:239-243 = SD 85.14.
57 D 12/1:224-234 = SD 34.8.
58 See Sāmañña.phala S (D 2) @ SD 8.10(3).
59 D 16/2:72-167 = SD 9.
60 M 38/1:256-27 = SD 7.10.
61 M 22/1:130-142 = SD 3.13.
62 A 3.65/1:199-193 = SD 35.4a.
The Discourse on the Delightful
D 29/3:117-141

1.1 Thus have I heard.
   At one time the Blessed One was staying amongst the Sakyas, in a terraced building in a mango grove of the Sakyas named Vedhañña.

Nirgrantha Nāṭaputta’s death
1.2 Now at that time, Nirgrantha Nāṭaputta had just died at Pāvā.
   On account of his death, the Nirgranthas split into two factions, fallen into strife, disputes and quarrels, and dwelt cutting and piercing one another with the weapons of words, thus:
   “You do not know this Dharma,vinaya [the teaching and the discipline]! I know this Dharma,vinaya! What would you understand of this Dharma,vinaya?
   You are practising wrong way! I’m practising the right way! Mine is beneficial [connected to the goal]; yours is not.
   You have said later what should be said first, and said first what should be said later!
   What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your viewpoint has been overthrown. You are defeated. Go and try to salvage your viewpoint; extricate yourself if you can!”
   Indeed, it seems that the followers of Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta were out to kill one another!
   Even Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta’s white-dressed laymen disciple, too, were disgusted with, displeased with, repelled by these followers of Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta.
   as to how the Dharma,vinaya was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened, stupa-breaking [undermining the very foundation], without any refuge.

---

63 Comy: It is a long terraced building built for the purpose of learning the arts (sippaṁ uggaṇh ‘atthāya kato dīgha, pāsādo atthi, DA 3:905).
64 Comy: Amongst those called Vedhañña are those trained in archery (“the bow”) (vedhañña nāma sakyāti dhanumhi kata, sikkhā vedhañña, nāmakā ēke sakyā, DA 3:905).
65 On Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta, see Uppali S (M 56), SD 27.1 (2.1).
66 According to Sāma,gāma S (M 104), which is the Majjhima account of the same event, at this time, the Buddha is staying with the Shakayas at the village of Sāma,gāma (M 104.2/2:243 f), SD 62.4. See below §2. This episode is recounted in Saṅgīti S (D 33.1.6/3:209 f).
67 Tassa kālan, kiriya bhinnā niganṭhā dve, dhika, jātā bhanḍana, jātā kalaha, jātā vivādā, pannā aññanaṁ-aññanaṁ mukha, sattāhi vigharanti.
68 Sahitam me, asahitam te, alt tr: “I’m consistent; you’re being inconsistent!”
69 This whole passage [§1.2] is stock: Pāsādi S (D 29.1.2/3:177 @ SD 40a.6) = Saṅgīti S (D 33.1.6/3:210) = Sāma,gāma S (M 104.2/2:243 @ SD 62.4). More briefly at Mahā Sakul’udāyi S (M 77.6/2:3+4 @ SD 49.5); Hä-liddakaṇī S 1 (S 22.3.24/3:12 @ SD 10.12) = Viggāhika Kathā S (S 56.9.2/5:419 = SD 65.13); Nm 1:173, 194, 200. For the Buddha’s warning on this, see Alagaddūpama S (M 22.10a/1:133), SD 3.13 (with comy); cf Kuṇḍāliya S (S 46.4.3/5:73), SD 35.3.
70 “Were disgusted with, displeased with, repelled by” (nibbinna, rūpā viratta, rūpā pativāna, rūpā), alt tr: “were revulsed at, feel alienated from, repelled by.”
71 Ye ‘pi niganṭhassā nāta, puttassa sāvakā gihānd odāta, vasanā, te ‘pi niganṭhesu nāta, puttiyesu nibbinna, rūpā viratta, rūpā pativāna, rūpā.
72 “Peace” (upaśama), a broad term meaning self-restraint, inner stillness through meditation and mindfulness, and eradication of defilements, resulting in spiritual calm and clarity.
73 Yathā tam durakkhaṁ dhamma, vinnay ānupavedite aniyāṇike anupasama, saṁvattanike asammā, saṁbuddha-p, ānupavedite bhinnā, thūpe appāṭhasaraṇe. Durakkhaṁ = du +r+ akkhāta (“shown, pointed out”) with r infix (by way of sandhi). Bhīnna, thīpa (lit, “breaking the stupa”) is figurative, alluding to forgetting the fundamentals, “undermining the very foundations” (bhīnda-p, patiṭhe, “breaking the base,” DA 3:905).

http://dharmafarer.org
Cunda Saman’uddesa meets Ānanda

2.1 Now Cunda Saman’uddesa,\(^{74}\) having emerged from his rains-retreat at Pāvā visited the venerable Ānanda at Sāma, gāma. Having approached the venerable Ānanda, he saluted him and sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, Cunda Saman’uddesa said this to the venerable Ānanda:

2.2 “Bhante, Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta has just died in Pāvā.

On account of his death, the Nirgranthas split into two factions, fallen into strife, disputes and quarrels, and dwelt cutting and piercing one another with the weapons of words, thus:

‘You do not know this Dharma,vinaya [the teaching and the discipline]! I know this Dharma,vinaya! What would you understand of this Dharma,vinaya?

You are practising wrong way! I’m practising the right way! Mine is beneficial [connected to the goal]; yours is not!

You have said later what should be said first, and said first what should be said later!

What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your viewpoint has been overthrown. You are defeated. Go and try to salvage your viewpoint; extricate yourself if you can!’

2.3 Indeed, it seems that the followers of Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta were out to kill one another!

Even Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta’s white-dressed laymen disciple, too, were disgusted with, displeased with, repelled by these followers of Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta,

as to how the Dharma,vinaya was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened, stupa-breaking [undermining the very foundation], without any refuge.’

2.4 When this was said, the venerable Ānanda said this to Cunda Saman’uddesa:

“This, avuso Cunda, is indeed a matter for clarification for which we should see the Blessed One.\(^{75}\)

Come, avuso, let us approach the Blessed One. Having approached the Blessed One, we will ask him.”

“So be it, bhante,” replied Cunda Saman’uddesa to the venerable Ānanda in assent.

They meet the Buddha

3.1 Then the venerable Ānanda and Cunda Saman’uddesa approached the Blessed One. Having approached him, they saluted him and sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, the venerable Ānanda said this to the Blessed One:

“Bhante, Cunda Saman’uddesa said this:

3.2 ‘Bhante, Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta has just died in Pāvā.

On account of his death, the Nirgranthas split into two factions, fallen into strife, disputes and quarrels, and dwelt cutting and piercing one another with the weapons of words, thus:

‘You do not know this Dharma,vinaya [the teaching and the discipline]! I know this Dharma,vinaya! What would you understand of this Dharma,vinaya?

You are practising wrong way! I’m practising the right way! Mine is beneficial [connected to the goal]; yours is not!

You have said later what should be said first, and said first what should be said later!

What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your viewpoint has been overthrown. You are defeated. Go and try to salvage your viewpoint; extricate yourself if you can!’

3.3 Indeed, it seems that the followers of Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta were out to kill one another!

Even Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta’s white-dressed laymen disciple, too, were disgusted with, displeased with, repelled by these followers of Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta,

---

\(^{74}\) Sāriputta’s youngest brother, and the foremost of monks who are forest-dwellers (3.1).

\(^{75}\) Atthi kho idaṁ āvuso cunda kathā, pābhataṁ bhagavantaṁ dassanāya.
as to how the Dharma, vinaya was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened, stupa-breaking [undermining the very foundation], without any refuge.'"

**THE BUDDHA’S TEACHING**

§§3.4-40.3

**The Dharma, vinaya rejected by the Buddha**

3.4 "Yes, indeed, Cunda, the Dharma, vinaya was badly taught, [119] poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened. [§1.5]  

4.1 Here, Cunda, the teacher was not fully self-awakened,  

4.2 and the Dharma was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not proclaimed by one fully self awakened,  

4.3 and the disciple in that Dharma does not dwell practising that Dharma in accordance with that Dharma, nor does he go about with proper practice, nor does he fare [live] in accordance with that Dharma, but he has deviated from that Dharma.  

4.4 This should be said to him: 78  

‘This, avuso, is good fortune [a gain] for you; this is very good fortune for you!’ 79  

4.5 Your teacher was not fully self-awakened,  

and the Dharma was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened.  

And, you, the disciple in that Dharma, do not dwell practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma. You do not go about with proper practice, nor do you fare [live] in accordance with that Dharma, but you deviate from that Dharma.  

4.6 Thus, indeed, Cunda, the teacher here is blameworthy and the Dharma here, too, is blameworthy, but the disciple here is thus praiseworthy. 80  

4.7 Indeed, Cunda, whoever were to speak thus to such a disciple: 81  

‘Come, venerable, practise whatever Dharma that has been taught and declared by your teacher!’ 82  

Whoever instigates, and whatever is instigated, and whomever is the instigated—let that be as it may. 83  

4.8 they all generate much demerit.  

4.9 Why is that?  

Because, Cunda, that Dharma, vinaya was so badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened. 84

**Turning to the right way**

5.1 Now, here, Cunda, the teacher was not fully self-awakened,  

5.2 and the Dharma was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened,

---

76 The closing of this open quote—ie the teaching by the Buddha—is found at §40.3.  

77 Sāvaka ca tasmiṁ dhamme na dhammānudhamma-paṭipanno viharati na sāmīci-paṭipanno na anudhamma-cārī, vokkamma ca tamhā dhāmmapātī.  

79 So evam assa vacanīyo.  

79 Tassa te, āvuso, lābhā, tassa te sulladdhāṁ, free tr: “You are fortunate, avuso, greatly fortunate.”  

80 Iti kho cunda satthā pī tattha gārayho, dhammo pī tattha gārayho, sāvako ca tattha evam pāsaṅko.  

81 Yo kho, cunda, eva, rīpaṁ sāvakāṁ evam vadeyya.  

82 Et’ āyasmā tatthā paṭipajjatu, yathā te saththārā dhāmno desito paññatto ’ti.  

83 Yo ca samādapi, yaṁ ca samādapi, yo ca samādapi tathattāya paṭipajjati.  

84 Evasi h’etani cunda hiti durakkhāte dhāmme, vinaye d uppavedite anissayānike anupasama, saṁvattanike asam-mā, sambuddha-paṭivede.
5.3 and the disciple in that Dharma dwells practising that Dharma in accordance with that Dharma. He goes about with proper practice, fares [lives] in accordance with that Dharma, and does not deviate from that Dharma.

5.4 This should be said to him:
‘This, avuso, is a misfortune [non-gain] for you; this, avuso, is a bad misfortune for you!’

5.5 Your teacher was not a fully [120] self-awakened one, and the Dharma was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened.

5.6 But, you, the disciple in that Dharma, dwell now practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma! Go about with proper practice, faring [living] in accordance with the Dharma, keeping to the Dharma!’

5.7 Thus, indeed, Cunda, the teacher here is blameworthy; the Dharma here, too, is blameworthy; but the disciple here is thus praiseworthy.

5.8 Whoever, Cunda, were to say this to such a disciple:
‘Surely, venerable, you will accomplish the right way if you were to keep to the right way. Whoever praises, and whatever the praise, and whomever the praised—let that be as it may,’ they all generate much demerit.’

5.9 Why is that?
Because, Cunda, that Dharma,vinaya was so badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened.

The Dharma,vinaya taught by the Buddha

6.1 But here, Cunda, there is the fully self-awakened Buddha,

6.2 and the Dharma is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self awakened,

6.3 but the disciple in that Dharma does not dwell practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma. He does not go about with proper practice, not faring [living] in accordance with the Dharma, but deviates from the Dharma.

6.4 This should be said to him:
‘This, avuso, is a misfortune [non-gain] for you; this, avuso, is a bad misfortune for you!

6.5 Your teacher is the fully self-awakened Buddha,

6.6 and the Dharma is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self awakened,

6.7 but you in this Dharma do not dwell practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma. You do not go about with proper practice, do not fare [live] in accordance with the Dharma, but deviate from the Dharma.’

6.8 Thus, indeed, Cunda, the teacher here is praiseworthy; the Dharma here, too, is praiseworthy; but the disciple here is thus blameworthy.

6.9 Whoever, Cunda, were to say this to such a disciple:
‘Come, venerable, practise whatever Dharma that has been taught and declared by your teacher!’

Whoever instigates, and whatever is instigated, and whomever is the instigated—let that be as it may,

they all generate much merit.’

85 Tassa te āvuso alābhā, tassa te dulladdham.
86 Tvañ ca tasmiṁ dhamme dhammānudhamma-patipanno viharasi sāmīci-patipanno amudhamma-cāri, samādāya taṁ dhammaṁ vattasīti.
87 Addhāyasmā ṛhaya-patipanno ṛhayan ārādhessati.
88 Et ‘āyasmaṁ tathā patipajatu, vathā te satthāra dhammo desito paññatto ’ti.
89 Yo ca samādapeti, vaṁ ca samādapeti, yo ca samādapito tathattāya patipajjati: as at §4.7
6.10 Why is that? Because, Cunda, that Dharma, vinaya is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self-awakened. [121]

7.1 Now, here, Cunda, there is the fully self-awakened Buddha, and the Dhamma is the well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self awakened, and the disciple in that Dharma dwells practising the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma. He goes about with proper practice, faring [living] in accordance with the Dhamma, and does not deviate from the Dhamma.

7.4 This should be said to him: ‘This, avuso, is good fortune [a gain] for you; this is very good fortune for you!’

7.6 and the Dhamma is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self awakened, and you, in this Dhamma, dwell practising the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma. You go about with proper practice, faring [living] in accordance with the Dhamma, and do not deviate from the Dhamma.

7.8 Thus, indeed, Cunda, the teacher here is praiseworthy; the Dhamma here, too, is praiseworthy; and the disciple here, too, is thus praiseworthy.

7.9 Indeed, Cunda, this should be said to him: ‘Surely, venerable, you will accomplish the right way in keeping with the right way. Whoever praises, and whatever the praise, and whomever the praised—let that be as it may. They all generate much merit.’

7.10 Why is that? Because, Cunda, Dhamma, vinaya was well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self-awakened.

The disciple’s regret in a teacher

8.1 Now, here, Cunda, a teacher arises in the world, an arhat, a fully self-awakened Buddha;

8.2 and the Dhamma is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self awakened;

8.3 but whose disciples have not been shown the meaning of the true Dhamma,

and to whom the holy life, complete and perfect, has not been presented or made clear,

with all the steps fully laid out, shown to be well grounded [shown with its wonders],[91] [122] well proclaimed amongst devas and humans—before their teacher’s passing away.

---

91 Aviññāpit’’athā c’assa honti sāvakā saddhamme.
92 Na ca tesaṁ kevalāṁ paripūraṁ brahma,cariyaṁ āvikataṁ hoti uttānī,kataṁ.
93 “Shown to be well grounded,” sa-pāṭihīra,katān, alt tr, “shown with its wonders,” often occurs here and elsewhere: Pāsadikā S (M 29/3:122×3, 123, 125 etc = SD 40a.6) & Puṭṭhapāda S (D 9.34/1:198×4, 199×2 = SD 7.14). Comy on both gloss it as niyānikāṁ, “leading to liberation” (DA 2:391, 910). The cpd is resolved as sa, “with” + pāṭihīra, “a wonder, marvel” (both as adj or adj) + kata (pp of karoti, “to do”), “what is done, performed, accomplished” (CPD sv). Opp: appāṭihīra,katā, “made unreliable” (D 1:193 passim = 239,17 = 244,4 = M 2:33,19 = 41,2-4); meaning unhelpful in bringing about liberation (niyānikā, DA 2:379; MA 3:273; cf DA 2:422, 429, 3:906; MA 3:93, 444 (micchā,patipadā, “the wrong path”), 4:34, 171; SA 1:23, 105; AA 2:216, 4:41). Pāṭihīra is a contracted form of pāṭihāriya, “marvel, miracle” (PED sv), esp as appāṭihīra,kathā, “foolish talk” (D 1:193, 239 vl; Kvu 361); opp sa-pāṭihīra,kathā (id). Sa-pāṭihāriya (with ref to Dhamma) means “wonderful, extraordinary” as opp to appāṭihāriya, “plain, ordinary, foolish; not convincing, without arguments” (M 2:9,27-33; A 1:276,18-21): PED: pāṭi-hāriya. See also §12.196 n.

http://dharmafarer.org
8.4 Indeed, Cunda, the death of such a teacher leaves his disciples with regrets [afflictions].

8.5 Why is this? Because it occurs to them:
‘The teacher, an arhat, fully self-awakened Buddha, has arisen in the world; and the Dharma is well taught, well proclaimed,
8.6 but the meaning [purpose] of the true Dharma has not been shown to us, and the holy life, complete and perfect, has not been presented or made clear to us, with all the steps fully laid out, well grounded [with its wonders], well proclaimed amongst devas and humans’—before our teacher’s passing away.

8.7 The death of such a teacher, Cunda, leaves his disciples with regrets [afflictions].

The disciple’s lack of regret in a teacher

9.1 Now, here, Cunda, a teacher arises in the world, an arhat, a fully self-awakened Buddha;
9.2 and the Dharma is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self awakened;
9.3 and whose disciples have been shown the meaning [purpose] of the true Dharma, and to whom the holy life, complete and perfect, has been presented or made clear, with all the steps fully laid out, well grounded [with its wonders], well proclaimed amongst devas and humans—before their teacher’s passing away.

9.4 Indeed, Cunda, the death of such a teacher leaves his disciples with no regrets [no afflictions].
9.5 Why is this? Because it occurs to them:
‘The teacher, an arhat, fully self-awakened Buddha, has arisen in the world; and the Dharma is well taught, well proclaimed,
9.6 and the meaning [purpose] of the true Dharma has been shown to us, and the holy life, complete and perfect, has been presented or made clear to us, with all the steps fully laid out, well grounded, well proclaimed [123] amongst devas and humans—before our teacher’s passing away.

9.7 The death of such a teacher, Cunda, leaves his disciples with no regrets [no afflictions].
Non-accomplishing the holy life

10.1 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished by these factors:
    but there is no teacher who is an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,101
    on account of this factor, the holy life is unaccomplished.

10.2 However, Cunda, to the extent that the holy life is accomplished by this factor—
    that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age—
    on account of this factor, the holy life is thus accomplished.102 [§14.4]

11.1 Also, Cunda, if the holy life is accomplished by these factors:
    that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,
    11.2 but there were no elder monk disciples, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke103—
    11.3 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others
        that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [with its wonders],104
        capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others
        that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded
        [with its wonders]105—
    on account of these factors, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.106

Accomplishment of the holy life

1. Elder monk disciples

12.1 [§14.4]107Now, Cunda, on account of these two factors, the holy life is accomplished:108

12.2 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.3 and that there are elder monk disciples (thera bhikkhu sāvaka) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.4 capable of speaking the true Dharma, capable of teaching of the Dharma that is well grounded
    [the Dharma with its wonders],
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that
have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded
    on account of this factor, the holy life is thus accomplished.

---

101 No ca kho satthā hoti therā ratt’aṅṇā cira,pabbajito addha,gato vayo,anupatto.
102 Evaṁ taṁ brahma,cariyaṁ paripūraṁ hoti ten ’āngenā.
103 No ca khv-assa therā bhikkhū sāvakā honti viyattā vinītā visāradā patta,yoga-k,khemā.
    “Who have attained security from the yoke,” patta,yoga-k,khemā (pl), those who are safe from the 4 yokes (yoga) (= āsava, “mental influxes”) [§22.1 n], ie the arhats (DA 3:910).
104 “Along with its wonders,” sa-p,pāṭihāriyaṁ: see §8.3 n.
105 Aḷāṁ samakkhātuṁ saddhammassa, aḷāṁ uppannaṁ parap-p,pavādaṁ saha,dhammehi suniggahitaṁ nigga-hevatā sappāṭihāriyaṁ dhammaṁ desetum.
106 Evaṁ taṁ brahma,cariyaṁ aparipūraṁ hoti ten ’āngenā.
107 For the whole of §12, I follow Ce which gives the full readings instead of the peyyālā. The extended passages here follow a concatenating (cumulative) pattern. See Intro (1) on “How to study the Pāśādika Sutta.”
108 Ce Yato ca kho cunda etehi dvehi pi āngehi samannāgataṁ brahma,cariyaṁ hoti. Only Ce has dvehi throughout.
(2) Middling monk disciples

12.5 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:
12.6 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,
12.7 and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.8 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
12.9 but there were no middling monk disciples (majjhima bhikkhu sāvaka) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.
12.10 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:
12.11 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,
12.12 and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.13 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],
12.14 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.15 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(3) Novice monk disciples

12.16 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:
12.17 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,
12.18 and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.19 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],
12.20 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.21 but, there were no novice monk disciples (nava bhikkhu sāvaka) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
thus, on account of this factor, the holy life is unaccomplished.

12.22 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished these two factors:109
12.23 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age.
12.24 and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke.
12.25 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],
12.26 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.27 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.28 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.29 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.30 but there were no elder nun disciples (therā bhikkhuṇī sāvikā) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

(4) Elder nun disciples
12.31 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age.
12.32 and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke.
12.33 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.34 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.35 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.36 but there were no elder nun disciples (therā bhikkhuṇī sāvikā) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

109 Ce Yato ca kho cunda etehi dvehi pi anāhehi samamāgataṁ brahma, cariyāṁ hoti.
on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.37 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:
12.38 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,
12.39 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.40 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],
12.41 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.42 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.43 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.44 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.45 and there are elder nun disciples (therā bhikkhunī sāvikā) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.46 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(5) Middling nun disciples
12.46 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:
12.47 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,
12.48 and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.49 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.50 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.51 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.52 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.53 but there were no **middling nun disciples** (majhimā bhikkhuṇī sāvikā) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.54 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.55 **that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,**

12.56 **and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,**

12.57 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],

12.58 **and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,**

12.59 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.60 **and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,**

12.61 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.62 **and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,**

12.63 **and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,**
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(6) Novice nun disciples

12.64 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.65 **that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,**

12.66 **and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,**

12.67 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.68 **and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,**
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.69 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.70 and there are elder nun disciples (therā bhikkhuṇī sāvikā) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.71 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.72 but there were no novice nun disciples (navā bhikkhuṇī sāvikā) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.73 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.74 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.75 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.76 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],

12.77 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.78 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.79 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.80 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.81 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.82 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.83 and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(7) Celibate laymen disciples
12.84 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:
12.85 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,
12.86 and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.87 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.88 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.89 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.90 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.91 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.92 and there were novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.93 but there were no white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

110 Upāsaka sāvakā gīhā odāta,vasanā brahma,cāri, lit “a layman disciple, householder dressed in white, living the holy life (ie observing celibacy).”
12.94 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.95 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.96 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.97 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],

12.98 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.99 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.100 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.101 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.102 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.103 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.104 and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.105 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

—on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(8) Celibate laywomen disciples

12.106 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.107 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.108 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.109 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.110 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.111 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.112 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.113 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.114 and there are no novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.115 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.116 but there were no white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.117 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.118 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.119 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.120 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],

12.121 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

111 Upāsika sāvikā gīthi odāta,vasanā brahma,cārinī, lit “a laywoman disciple, householder dressed in white, living the holy life (ie observing celibacy).”
12.122 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.123 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.124 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.125 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.126 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.127 and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.128 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.129 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

(9) Householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures

12.130 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.131 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.132 and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.133 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.134 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.135 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.136 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.137 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.138 and there are no novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.139 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.140 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.141 but there were no white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyer of sense-pleasures, 112 who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.142 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.143 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.144 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.145 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],

12.146 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

112 Upāsaka sāvaka gihī odāta, vasana kāma, bhogī, lit “a layman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”
12.147 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.148 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.149 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.150 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.151 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.152 and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.153 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.154 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.155 but there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyer of sense-pleasures, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(10) Householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures

12.156 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.157 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.158 and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.159 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.160 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.161 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.162 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.163 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.164 and there are no novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.165 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.166 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.167 and there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,¹¹³ who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma, along with its wonder—

12.168 but there were no white-dressed householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,¹¹⁴ who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

¹¹³ Upāsaka sāvaka gihī odāta,vasana kāma,bhogī, lit “a layman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”
¹¹⁴ Upāsikā sāvikā gihī odāta,vasanā kāma,bhoginī, lit “a laywoman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”
on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.169 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:
12.170 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,
12.171 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.172 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.173 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.174 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.175 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.176 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.177 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.178 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.179 and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.180 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.181 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.182 and there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.183 but there are white-dressed householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(11) Wealth and plenty
12.184 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:
12.185 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,
12.186 and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.187 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.188 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.189 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.190 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.191 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.192 and there are no novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.193 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.194 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.195 and there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,115 who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.196 and there are white-dressed householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,116 who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.197 but if there were no holy life—merely an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, well proclaimed amongst devas and humans,117 on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

(12) The peaks of gain and fame
12.198 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:
12.199 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,
12.200 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.201 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.202 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.203 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];
12.204 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
12.205 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

---

115 Upāsaka sāvaka gihī odāta,vasana kāma,bhogī, lit “a layman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”
116 Upāsikā sāvikā gihī odāta,vasanā kāma,bhogīnī, lit “a laywoman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”
117 No ca khvassa brahma,carīyaṁ hoti iddhaṁ ca pitthaṁ ca viṭṭhāritaṁ bāhu,jaññaṁ patu,bhūtāṁ yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitāṁ: Pāsāsika S (D 29.12.196 etc @ 3:124-126×4), SD 40a.6; here no can be read as “our” (1 gen pl of aham, “I”) or as an affirmative indecl (Sn 457, 875, 1077; J 5:343 = nu, 435); it can also be taken as a negating word, “no, not,” as a wordplay. My tr is contextual. The famous phrase appears in variant forms elsewhere, but similar in sense; yāva me idaṁ brahma,carīyaṁ na iddham ca vā bhavissati pitthaṁ ca viṭṭhārikaṁ bāhu,-jaññaṁ patu,bhūtāṁ yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitāṁ: Mahā,parinibbāna S (D 16/2:106, 113, 114×2), Cetiya S (S 51.10/5:262), Bhūmi,cāla S (A 8.70/8:311,18), Āyu,saṅkhār’ossajjana S (U 6.1/64); Tavidaṁ brahma,carīyaṁ,...suppakāsitāṁ: Jana,vasabha S (D 18.29/2:219,10); Nagara S (S 12.65.33/2:107,2), Cetiya S (S 51.10/4/5:-262,9). On yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitāṁ, see §8.3 ad loc n.
12.206 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.207 and there are [124] middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.208 and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.209 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.210 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.211 and there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.212 and if the holy life is an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, well proclaimed amongst devas and humans\(^\text{118}\) — but there is no attaining of the peak of gain, the peak of fame,\(^\text{119}\) on account of these factors, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

(13) Attaining the peaks of gain and fame

13.1 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these factors,\(^\text{120}\)

13.2 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

13.3 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

\(^{118}\) Brahma, cariyāṁ c’assa hoti āddhāṅ ce ‘va phītaṅ ca vitthāritaṁ bāhu, jaññāṁ puthu, bhūtaṁ yāva deva, manussehi suppakāsitāṁ. On yāva deva, manussehi suppakāsitāṁ, see §89.3 ad loc n.

\(^{119}\) No ca kho lābh’agga, yas’agga-p, pattāṁ. Comy glosses lābh’agga, yas’agga in a spiritual sense to refer to the destruction of the mental influxes (āsava) [§22.1 n], ie, the attainment of arhathood. More specifically, lābh’agga refers to the rules the Buddha introduced concerning food, while yas’agga refers to the rule against taking intoxicating drinks (DA 3:156, cf 1:445).

\(^{120}\) Etehi ce pi cunda aṅgehi samannāgataṁ brahma, cariyāṁ hoti.
13.4 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

13.5 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

13.6 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

13.7 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

13.8 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

13.9 and there are no novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

13.10 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples [125] who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

13.11 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

13.12 and there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,122 who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

13.13 and there were to be no white-dressed householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,122 who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

---

121 Upāsaka sāvaka gīhī odāta,vasana kāma,bhogī, lit “a layman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”

http://dharmafarer.org
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

13.14 The holy life is an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, well proclaimed amongst devas and humans 123—
and there is the attaining of the peak of gain, the peak of fame, [§12.211] on account of this factor, the holy life is thus accomplished.

The accomplishment of the Buddha Dharma

14.1 Now, Cunda, I am the teacher today, having arisen in the world as the arhat, the fully self-awakened one. 124 [§6.1]

14.2 and the Dharma is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, proclaimed by one fully self-awakened, 125

14.3 and my disciples have been shown the meaning [purpose] of the true Dharma, 126 and to whom the holy life, complete and perfect, has been presented or made clear, with all the steps fully laid out, well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders] [presented with wonders], 127 well proclaimed amongst devas and humans 128—

14.4 But, Cunda, I am now the teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age. 129 [§10.1]

15.1 (1) There are, indeed, today, Cunda, my elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.2 (2) There are, indeed, today, Cunda, my middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.3 (3) There are, indeed, today, Cunda, my novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.4 (4) There are, indeed, today, Cunda, my elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

122 Upāsikā sāvikā gihī odāta,vasanā kāma,bhoginī, lit “a laywoman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”
123 On yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitaṁ, see §8.3 ad loc n.
124 Kho pana cunda etarahi satthā thero rattaññū cira,pabbajito addha,gato vayo,anuppatto.
125 Dhammo ca svākkhāto suppavedito niyyāniko upasama,
126 This line and the 2 foll: Viññāpit’ athā ca me sāvakā saddhamme, | kevalaṁ ca tesaṁ paripūrṇaṁ brahma,cari-
127 “Well grounded,” sa-p, pāṭihīra, katoṁ; see §8.3 n.
128 On yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitaṁ, see §8.3 ad loc n.
129 Ahaṁ kho pana, cunda, etarahi satthā therā rattaññū cira,pabbajito addha,gato vayo,anuppatto.
15.5 (5) There are, indeed, today, Cunda, my middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.6 (6) There are, indeed, today, Cunda, my novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.7 (7) There are, indeed, today, Cunda, my white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.8 (8) There are, indeed, today, Cunda, my white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.9 (9) There are, indeed, today, Cunda, my white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.10 (10) There are, indeed, [126] today, Cunda, my white-dressed householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.11 (11) Indeed, Cunda, today [now] this holy life of mine is truly an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, only so far as it is well proclaimed amongst humans.  

Nothing to minus, nothing to add

16.1 Cunda, as regards teachers that have arisen in the world today, Cunda, I do not see a single teacher who has attained to the peak of gain, the peak of fame, as I have.  

16.2 Also, Cunda, as regards any sangha or group that has arisen in the world, I do not see a single sangha that has attained to the peak of gain, the peak of fame, Cunda, compared to this bhikkhu-sangha [the community of monks].

---

130 Etarahi kho pana me cunda brahma, cariyani iddhami c'eva phita ca vitthiritum bahu jajjma pamhu, bhutam yavadd-eva manussehi suppakasita. See Intro (1.1.2).
131 Yayata kho cunda etarahi satthuro loko uppanno, nanham cunda ajanam eka sattharam pi samanussami evam labh aggaya, yas 'aggap, patta pam yathar-ivahita.
132 Yayata kho cunda etarahi sajho vana gano loko uppanno, nanham cunda ajanam eka saingham pi samanupassami evam labh aggaya, yas 'aggap, patta pam yathar-ivaya cunda bhikku, sajho.
16.3 Anyone speaking rightly of this, Cunda, would say that the holy life—the well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed—is accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more.\(^{133}\)

16.4 That one speaking rightly would be speaking of this very holy life—the well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed—is accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more.

**Uddaka Rāma,putta’s riddle**

16.5 Uddaka Rāma,putta,\(^ {134}\) Cunda, made this remark: ‘Looking, one sees not’ (passaṁ na passatīti).

Seeing what, does one not see?\(^ {135}\)

16.6 Of a well sharpened razor, one sees its blade [its surface], but not its edge.\(^ {136}\)

16.7 This is said: ‘Looking, one sees not,’

16.8 But, Cunda, this saying that was spoken by Uddaka Rāma,putta is low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal\(^ {137}\) merely in connection with a razor.

**Nothing to minus, nothing to add**

16.9 So Cunda, if one, speaking rightly, were to speak about this, that is to say, ‘Looking, one sees not,’ how, Cunda, how would one, speaking rightly, speak of [127] ‘Looking, one sees not.’\(^ {138}\)

16.10 This is just how that one speaking rightly, should speak of ‘Looking, one sees not’.\(^ {139}\)

16.11 Now, seeing what, one sees not?\(^ {140}\)

16.12 It is this very holy life—the well spoken, fully accomplished, that has been well proclaimed, accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more—this is what one sees.

16.13 There is nothing here that needs to be removed, so that it would be more pure: this is what one sees not.\(^ {141}\)

16.14 There is nothing here that needs to be added, so that it would be more pure: this is what one sees not.\(^ {142}\)

This is said to be ‘Looking, one sees not.’

16.15 If anyone, Cunda, speaking rightly, were to speak of a well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed, accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more, speaking rightly, he would speak of this very well spoken, fully accomplished holy life, that has been well proclaimed, accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more.

---

\(^{133}\) Yaṅ kho taṁ cunda samāvatamā vadeyya ṣabb ākāra,paripūram anūnaṁ anadhiham svākkhātam kevala,paripūram brahma,carīyaṁ suppakāsitām. “With nothing less, nothing more,” anūnaṁ anadhiham, meaning with nothing missing nor anything superfluous.

\(^{134}\) On Uddaka Rāma,putta, see *Uddaka S* (S 35.103/4:83 f), SD 94.2. He was the last of the 2 teachers that the Bodhisattva has before he turns to self-mortification: see *Ariya Pariyesanā S* (M 26.15/1:165) & SD 1.11 (4.2).

\(^{135}\) Khuṣassā sāduṁ nisattassa talam-assa passati, dhāraṁ ca kho-assa na passati.

\(^{136}\) “Low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble,” Cf fuller formula at §23.3 etc below. For details, see *The body in Buddhism = SD* 29.6a (1.2.2 + 4.1.1).

\(^{137}\) Yaṅ kho pan’etaṁ cunda udakena rāma,puttena bhāsiṁ hiṁnaṁ gammaṁ pothuṣjanikaṁ anariyaṁ anatthaṁ saṁ-hitaṁ khuṣraṁ eva sandhāya. The underscored phrase is stock, signifying an extreme to be avoided: see *Dhamma,acakka Pavattana S* (S 56.11.3/5:420), SD 1.1.

\(^{138}\) Ce Yaṅ ce taṁ cunda samāvatamā vadeyya passaṁ na passatīti,

\(^{139}\) Ce Idaṁ ev’etaṁ samāvatamā vadeyya ’passaṁ na passatīti.

\(^{140}\) Kiṁ ca passaṁ na passatīti?

\(^{141}\) Idaṁ etha apakādaṁheyya, evaṁ taṁ pariṣuddha,taraṁ assāti, iti h’etaṁ na passati, lit “If here, this were to be removed, so that it would be more pure, this indeed one does not see.”

\(^{142}\) Idaṁ etha upakādāheyya, evaṁ taṁ pariṣuddha,taraṁ assāti, iti h’etaṁ na passati, lit “If here, this were to be added, so that it would be more pure, this indeed one does not see.”
Teachings to be recited (memorized)

17.1 Therefore, Cunda, I have here shown you these teachings that I have directly understood.\(^{143}\)

17.2 So here, all having gathered and assembled, you should not quarrel, but \textit{rehearse} [recite] meaning for meaning, word for word,\(^{144}\)

17.3 so that this holy life would endure, stand long.\(^{145}\)

and this is for the good of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of compassion for the world, for the benefit and happiness of devas and humans.

17.4 And what, Cunda, are these teachings, directly understood by me, that I have shown you,\(^{146}\)

17.5 that, all having gathered and assembled, should not quarrel, but \textit{rehearse} [recite] meaning for meaning, word for word.\(^{146}\)

17.6 so that this holy life would endure, stand long,

17.7 and this is for the good of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of compassion for the world, for the benefit and happiness of devas and humans?

17.8 \textbf{THE 7 SETS.}\(^{147}\) They are as follows:

\begin{itemize}
\item the four focusses of mindfulness, \textit{cattāro satipaṭṭhānā},
\item the four right efforts, \textit{cattāro samma-paadhānā},
\item the four paths of spiritual power, \textit{cattāro iddhi-pādā},
\item the five spiritual faculties, \textit{pañe ca indriyāni},
\item the five spiritual powers, \textit{pañe ca balāni},
\item the seven \([128]\) awakening-factors, \textit{satta bojjhaṅgā},
\item the noble eightfold path. \textit{ariyo aṭṭhāṅgiko maggo}
\end{itemize}

17.9 These, Cunda, are the teachings directly understood by me that I have shown you, wherein all having gathered and assembled, should not quarrel, but \textit{rehearse} [recite] meaning for meaning, word for word, so that this holy life would endure, stand long, and this is for the good of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of compassion for the world, for the benefit and happiness of devas and humans.

Resolving differences of opinions

18.1(1) \textbf{DISAGREEING ON BOTH MEANING AND WORDING.} And, Cunda, when you are gathered, when you are assembled, free from quarrelling [free from disputing], you should train yourselves thus when a certain fellow brahmachari [fellow in the holy life] speaks the Dharma before the sangha.\(^{148}\)

18.2 Now, if he were to speak, thus:

\begin{quote}
‘You, venerable, have grasped this meaning \textit{wrongly} and proposed the wording \textit{wrongly}, too!’\(^{149}\)
\end{quote}

---

\(^{143}\) Tasmā,\textit{t-}iha cunda ye vo mayā dhammā abhiññā desitā. Here \textit{abhiññā} is a pp (\textit{abhijanitvā}, DA 33.22) of \textit{abhi-jānati}, “to fully know (through experience),” acting as an adj, qualifying \textit{dhammā}, and means “having known (as a direct experience of true reality).”

\(^{144}\) Tattha sabbe h\textit{’eva saṅgagamma samāgamma athena attaṁ vyañjanaṁ vyañjanena saṅgāyitabbāṁ na vivadi-ttabbaṁ.}

\(^{145}\) Yatha-y-idaṁ brahma,carīyaṁ addhanīyaṁ assa cira-t,thitikaṁ.

\(^{146}\) Yattha sabbe h\textit{’eva saṅgagamma samāgamma athena attaṁ vyañjanaṁ vyañjanena saṅgāyitabbāṁ na vivadi-ttabbaṁ.}

\(^{147}\) The 7 sets—4 focusses of mindfulness, 4 right efforts, 4 paths to spiritual power, 5 spiritual faculties, 5 spiritual powers, 7 awakening-factors, the noble eightfold path—consisting of the 37 limbs of awakening (\textit{bodhi,pakkhiya dhamma}): see Intro (3).

\(^{148}\) Tesañ ca vo cunda samaggānaṁ sammodānaṁ avivadāmanānaṁ sikhītabbaṁ [Ce Ee Se; Be sikkha] aṇātaro sa,brahma,cāri sanghe dhammaṁ bhāseyya.

\(^{149}\) “Proposed the wording,” \textit{vyañajanāṁ...ropeti}, lit “propagated the phrase.”

\(^{150}\) Ayaṁ kho āyasmā attaṁ c’\textit{eva micchā ganhāti, vyañjanāṁ ca micchā ropetī.}
18.3 then, you should neither approve nor disapprove of him [of his words].
Neither approving nor disapproving, his word and expression, you should say this to him.\textsuperscript{151}
18.4 ‘Now, avuso, of this meaning, which of these wordings or those are the more suitable,\textsuperscript{152}
of these wordings, which meaning, this or that one, is the more suitable?’\textsuperscript{153}
18.5 If he were to say:
‘Avuso, for this meaning, only these wordings are truly more suitable, and only these;
for these wordings, only this meaning is truly more suitable, and only this,’
18.6 then, neither dismissing nor disparaging him at all, without dismissing him, without disparaging
him, you should, with careful attention, make him comprehend only those meanings and those word-
ings.\textsuperscript{154}

19.1 (2) DISAGREEING ON THE MEANING. Again, Cunda, when you are gathered, when you are assembled,
free from quarrelling [free from disputing],
you should train thus if [when] a certain fellow brahmachari [fellow in the holy life] were to speak
Dharma before the sangha.
19.2 Now, suppose he were to speak, thus:
‘You, venerable, have grasped this meaning wrongly but proposed the wording rightly!’ \textsuperscript{[129]}
19.3 Then, you should neither approve nor disapprove of him [his word].
Neither approving nor disapproving, you should say this to him:
19.4 ‘Now, avuso, of these wordings, which meaning, this or that, is the more suitable?’
19.5 If he were to say:
‘Avuso, for these wordings, only this meaning is truly more suitable, and only this,’
19.6 then, neither dismissing nor disparaging him, without dismissing him, without disparaging him,
you should, with careful attention, make him comprehend only those meanings.

20.1 (3) DISAGREEING ON THE WORDING. Again, Cunda, when you are gathered, when you are as-
sembled, free from quarrelling [free from disputing],
you should train thus if [when] a certain fellow brahmachari [fellow in the holy life] were to speak
Dharma before the sangha.
20.2 Now, if he were to speak, thus:
‘You, venerable, have grasped this meaning rightly but proposed the wording wrongly!’
20.3 Then, you should neither approve nor disapprove of him [his word].
Neither approving nor disapproving, you should say this to him:
20.4 ‘Now, avuso, as for this meaning, which of these wordings is the more suitable?’\textsuperscript{155}
20.5 If he were to say:
‘Avuso, for this meaning, only these wordings are truly more suitable, and only these,’
20.6 then, neither dismissing nor disparaging him, without dismissing him, without disparaging him,
you should, with careful attention, make him comprehend only those wordings.

21.1 (4) FULL AGREEMENT. Again, Cunda, when you are gathered, when you are assembled, free
from quarrelling [free from disputing],
you should train thus if [when] a certain fellow brahmachari [fellow in the holy life] were to speak
Dharma before the sangha.
21.2 Now, if he were to speak, thus:

\textsuperscript{151} Tassa n’eva abhinanditabbaṁ na paṭikkositabbaṁ, anabhinanditvā appaṭikkositvā so evam assa vacanīyo: also
at §§19.3+20.2+21.2. For similar instructions, see Mahāparinibbāna S (D 16.4.7-11/2:124+125, on the 4 great refer-
ces, catu mahā padesa) & SD 9 (11); Cha-b. bisodhana S (M 112/3:29), SD 59.7: Mahāpadesa S (A 4.180/-
2:168-x, 169-x, 170-x, 3.1 (2.2) (= D 16.4.7/2:123-126).
\textsuperscript{152} Imassa nu kho avuso atthassa imāni vā vyañjanāni etāni vā vyañjanāni katamāni opāyika,tarāṇī.
\textsuperscript{153} Imesaṁ vā vyañjanāni ayaṁ vā attho eso vā attho, katama opāyika,taro.
\textsuperscript{154} So n’eva ussādetabbo na apasādetabbo anussādetvā anapasādetvā sv-eva sādhukaṁ saññāpetabbo tassa ca
atthassa tesaṁ ca vyañjanānaṁ nisantāya.
\textsuperscript{155} Imassa nu kho avuso atthassa imāni vā vyañjanāni etāni vā vyañjanāni katamāni opāyikatarāṇī?
‘You, venerable, have grasped this meaning rightly and proposed the wording rightly, too!’

21.3 then, you should approve of him, rejoice in him, saying to him, ‘Sadhu!’ [Good!].

21.4 Having approved of him, rejoicing in him, saying sadhu, you should say these words to him:

21.5 ‘This is a gain for us, avuso, a good gain for us, avuso—that we see that the venerable to be such a brahmachari who is so accomplished in its meaning, accomplished in its wording!’

Proper use of permitted life-supports

22.1 Cunda, I teach the Dharma not merely for the restraint of mental influxes here and now, but I also teach the Dharma for the warding off of mental influxes in the next life.

22.2 (1) REFLECTION ON ROBES. As such, Cunda, whatever robes that have been allowed by me, let it be enough for you, thus:

only for warding off heat, for the sake of warding off cold,
for the sake of warding off the touch of mosquitoes, flies, the wind, the sun, and creeping creatures;
for the purpose of covering up the privies, out of moral shame.

(2) REFLECTION ON FOOD. Whatever almsfood that have been allowed by me, let it be enough for you, thus:

only for keeping this body going and enduring, for ending hunger pangs,
for the sake of supporting the holy life, considering,
‘Thus I shall get rid of an old feeling, and not let a new feeling arise,
so that I will be healthy and blameless, and live at ease.’

(3) REFLECTION ON LODGING. Whatever lodging that have been allowed by me, let it be enough for you, thus:

only for warding off cold, for warding off heat,
for warding off the touch of mosquitoes, flies, the wind, the sun, and creeping creatures,
only for avoiding weather hazards, for the purpose of enjoying solitude.

155 Tassa sādhūti bhāsitaṁ abhinanditvā anumoditvā.
156 Lābhā no āvuso suladdhaṁ no āvuso, ye mayaṁ āyasmantaṁ tādisaṁ brahma,cariya passāma evaṁ atth 'upe-taṁ vyañjanāpetaṁ.
157 “Mental influxes,” āsava. The term āsava (lit “in-flow, out-flow”) comes from ā-savati “flows towards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously translated as influxes, taints (“deadly taints,” RD); corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists 4 kinds of āsava: the influx of (1) sense-desire (kām āsava), (2) desire for eternal existence (bhav āsava), (3) wrong views (ditth āsava), (4) ignorance (avijj āsava) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These four are also known as “floods” (oghā) and “yokes” (yogā). The list of three influxes (omitting the influx of views) [43] is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these āsavas is equivalent to arhathood. See BDxt: āsava.
158 Na vo [Be Ce Se; only Ee Navaṁ] ahaṁ cunda dittha, dhammadānaṁ yeva āsavānaṁ saṁvarāya dhammaṁ ābhā no āvuso suladdhaṁ no āvuso, ye mayaṁ āyasmantaṁ tādisaṁ brahma,cariya; cāriṁ passāma evaṁ atth 'upe-taṁ vyañjanāpetaṁ.
159 “Mental influxes,” āsava. The term āsava (lit “in-flow, out-flow”) comes from ā-savati “flows towards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously translated as influxes, taints (“deadly taints,” RD); corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists 4 kinds of āsava: the influx of (1) sense-desire (kām āsava), (2) desire for eternal existence (bhav āsava), (3) wrong views (ditth āsava), (4) ignorance (avijj āsava) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These four are also known as “floods” (oghā) and “yokes” (yogā). The list of three influxes (omitting the influx of views) [43] is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these āsavas is equivalent to arhathood. See BDxt: āsava.
160 These follow 4 reflections on the use of life-supports [§22.2], here abridged, appear in full in Sabb āsava S (M 2) under the heading “influences to be abandoned by reflective use” (paṭisevana paḥatto āsava): M 2,13-17/1:10 & SD 30.3 (2.3)); also at Āsava S (A 6.58.4/3:388 f), SD 62.1; Nm 2:496. For details, see Vism 1.85-97/30-35.
161 This reflection is found by itself at Mahā Assa,pura S (M 39.9/1:273), SD 10.13; Sekha S (M 53.9/1:355), SD 21.14; Gaṇaka Moggallāna S (M 107,5/3:2), SD 56.3; Sāriputta Saddhi,vihārika S (S 35.129/4:104); Rathō-pama S (S 35.239/4:176, 177), SD 55.14; Apaṇṇaka Paṭipada S (A 3.16/1:114), SD 74.11; Aparīhāna S (A 4.37/4:20); (Taṅhā) Bhikkhuṇī S (A 4.159,4/2:145), SD 10.14; Nanda S (A 8.9,3/4:167); Nm 1:240, 241, 368× 2, 484; Nc:Be 292; Dhs 231; Vbh 249; Pug 25.
162 Vism 1.92/32.
163 Buddhaghosa distinguishes 2 kinds of holy life (brahma,cariya): the teaching (sāsana) as a whole, and the holy life of the path (magga brahma,cariya), ie sainthood (Vism 1.92/32).
(4) REFLECTION ON MEDICINE. Whatever medicine that have been allowed by me, let it be enough for you, thus:

only for warding off feelings of illness that have arisen,
only for the sake of non-affliction.

Devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure

23.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside sectarians might speak thus:

‘The recluses, sons of the Sakya, dwell devoted to the enjoyment of pleasure.’

23.2 These wanderers who are outside sectarians who speak thus should be asked:

‘What, avuso, is this devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure? For, there are many different ways of falling into devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure, which are of various forms.

23.3 Cunda, there are these four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure that are low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal, not conducive to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self.awakening, to nirvana. [§24.3]

23.4 What are the four?

(1) Here, Cunda, one who is foolish is pleased and gratified with himself in habitually killing and harming life.

This is the first kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

(2) Furthermore, Cunda, here a certain person is pleased and gratified with himself in habitually stealing and taking the not-given.

This is the second kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

(3) Furthermore, Cunda, here a certain person is pleased and gratified with himself in habitually speaking falsehood.

This is the third kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

(4) Furthermore, Cunda, here a certain person gives oneself over the 5 cords of sense-pleasures, fallen into them, overwhelmed by them.

This is the fourth kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

23.5 These, Cunda, are the four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure that are low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal, not conducive to revulsion, nor to dispassion, nor to cessation, nor to stilling, nor to knowledge, nor to self.awakening, nor to nirvana.

Dhyanic pleasures

24.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside sectarians might speak thus:

\[\text{\textbf{164} Sukh allikānyogam-anuyuttā āmañāna cikāyā paccakkāhī viharantā,} \]
\[\text{\textbf{165} Cunda, there are these four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure that are low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal, not conducive to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self.awakening, to nirvana.} \]
\[\text{\textbf{166} Sukh allikānyogā hi bahū anekadhi, vihārātī nānā-panālukkātā.} \]
\[\text{\textbf{167} “Low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal” (hīna gamma pathujjānīka anariya anatthā, saṁ.hita), also at §16.8 above: for explanation, see The body in Buddhism, SD 29.6a (1.2.2 + 4.1.1).} \]
\[\text{\textbf{168} “Having killed, having harmed.”} \]
\[\text{\textbf{169} Puna ca paraṁ cunda idh’ ekacco adinnaṁ ādiyīvā ātānaṁ sukkhī pīnī.} \]
\[\text{\textbf{170} Puna ca paraṁ cunda idh’ ekacco pañcāhi kāma, guṇehi samappito samaṅgī, bhūto paricāretī.} \]
‘The recluses, sons of the Sakya, dwell devoted to these four devotions to the enjoyment of pleasure!’

24.2 They should be told: ‘It is not so!’

For, if they were to speak thus they are not speaking rightly, they have misrepresented us with what is false, what is untrue.\(^{171}\)

24.3 There are, Cunda, these four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure that conduce [lead] to utter revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana.\(^{172}\)

24.4 What are the four?\(^{173}\)

(1) The first dhyana. Here, Cunda, a monk quite detached from sensual pleasures, detached from unwholesome mental states, he enters and dwells in the first dhyana, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and joy, born of seclusion.\(^{174}\)

This is the first kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

(2) The second dhyana. Furthermore, Cunda, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he enters and dwells in the second dhyana, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and joy born of concentration.\(^{175}\)

This is the second kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

(3) The third dhyana. Furthermore, Cunda, with the fading away of zest, he dwells equanimous, mindful and fully aware, and experiences joy with the body. He enters and dwells in the third dhyana, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’

This is the third kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.\(^{176}\)

(4) The fourth dhyana. Furthermore, Cunda, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain, and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure [132] and displeasure. He attains and dwells in the fourth dhyana that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.\(^{177}\)

This is the fourth kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

24.5 These, Cunda, are the four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure that conduce [leads] to utter revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana.

24.6 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside sectarians might speak thus:

‘The recluses, sons of the Sakya, dwell devoted to these four devotions to the enjoyment of pleasure!’

24.7 They should be told: ‘It is so!’ (evam)

For, if they were to speak thus they are speaking rightly, they have not misrepresented us with what is false, what is untrue.

\(^{171}\) Na te vo sammā vadamānā vadeyyuṁ, abbhācikkheyyuṁ asatā abhūtena.

\(^{172}\) Cattārōme cunda sukhassu allikānyogā ekanta,nibbidāya virāgāya nirodhāya upasamāya abhiññāya sambodhāya.

\(^{173}\)HE FOURTH DHYANA

HE THIRD DHYANA

HE SECOND DHYANA

HE FIRST DHYANA

\(^{174}\)T D 1:189; S 5:82, 179, 255, 361; A 3:83, 4:143, 5:216. These are the 7 criteria for the true Dharma-Vinaya (*dhamma, vinaya, jānana, lakkhaṇa, sāmañña, phala, jānana, sāmañña, phala). See *Nibbidā*, SD 20.1.

\(^{175}\)Sāmañña,phala S (D 2.77-84/1:73-76 = SD 8.10). For a fuller list of refs, see *Dhyana* @ SD 8.4 (1.2) n or SID: jhāna 4.

\(^{176}\)Idha cunda bhikkhu vivicce eva kāmehi vivicca akusalehi dhammehi dhāmanehi sa,vicāraṁ viveka,jaṁ pīti,-sukhaṁ, pāthamaṁ jhānaṁ upasampajja viharati. On the 1st dhyana, see *Dhyana* @ SD 8.4 (5.1) or SID: jhāna 4.

\(^{177}\)Puna ca paraṁ cunda bhikkhu sāmañña,phala S (D 2.77-84/1:73-76 = SD 8.10). For a fuller list of refs, see *Dhyana* @ SD 8.4 (1.2) n or SID: jhāna 4.
The benefits of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure

25.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside sectarians might speak thus:

“But, avuso, having lived these four devotions to the enjoyment of pleasure, how many fruits, how many benefits are to be expected?”

Cunda, when the wanderers who are outside sectarians say thus, they should be spoken to thus:

“Having lived these four devotions to the enjoyment of pleasure, avuso, four fruits, four benefits are to be expected.

What are the four?178

(1) STREAMWINNING. Here, avuso, a monk, whose three fetters179 are totally destroyed, is a stream-winner, not bound for the lower world,180 sure of liberation, destined for awakening.181

This is the first fruit, first benefit.

(2) ONCE-RETURN. Furthermore, avuso, a monk, whose three fetters182 are destroyed, and with the diminishing of lust, hate and delusion, is a once-returner, returning only once to this world to make an end of suffering.183

This is the second fruit, second benefit.

(3) NON-RETURN. Furthermore, avuso, a monk, with the destruction of the five lower fetters,184 is spontaneously reborn185 and there attain final nirvana, without ever returning from that world.186

This is the third fruit, third benefit.

(4) ARHATHOOD. Furthermore, avuso, a monk, with mental influxes187 destroyed, having lived the holy life, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, reached his own goal,188 destroyed the fetters of being, is completely liberated through direct knowledge.189

178 These 4 defs of sainthood are stock: see Ānāpāna,sati S (M 118.9-12/3:80), SD 7.13; also Kiṭṭhāgi S (M 70) @ SD 11.1 (5.1).
179 They are: (1) Personality view (sakkāya,diṭṭhi), (2) persistent doubt (vicikicchā), (3) attachment to rules and rites (sīla-b.bata,parāmāsa). They are part of the 10 mental fetters: see (3) n below.
180 Avinīpāta, alt tr “not fated for birth in a suffering state”; opp of vinīpāta, “the world of suffering,” another name for the 4 woeful courses (duggati) or the 4 lower worlds (apāya) (Vism 13.92 f). Sometimes 5 woeful courses (paṭika,gati) (D 33.21/3:234, A 11.68) are mentioned: the hells (niraya), the animal kingdom (tirachāna,yoni), the ghost realm (pitti,visaya), the human world (manussa) and the heavenly world (deva). Of these, the first three are woeful, with the asura-demons (asūra,kāya) as the fourth woeful course. The remaining two are “happy courses” (sugati). For a discussion, see Nyanaponika & Bodhi (tr), Numerical Discourses of the Buddha, 1999:14-19.
181 Idh āvuso bhikkhu tiṇṇaṁ saṁyojanānaṁ parikkhayā satāpanno hoti avinīpāta, dhammo nityo sambodhi,-pariyānā.
182 See (1) n above here.
183 Punca ca paramā āvuso bhikkhu tiṇṇaṁ saṁyojanānaṁ parikkhayā rāga,dosa,mohānaṁ tannutā sakadāgāmi hoti, sakid-eva imaṁ lokān āgantvā dukkhass'antaṁ karoti.
184 They fetter us to the lower realms of existence (the sense worlds). The 10 fetters (dasa,saṁyojanā) are: (1) Personality view (sakkāya,diṭṭhi), (2) persistent doubt (vicikicchā), (3) attachment to rules and rites (sīla-b.bata,parāmāsa), (4) sensual lust (kāma,rāga), (5) repulsion (paṭigha), (6) greed for form existence (rūpa,rāga), (7) greed for formless existence (arūpa,rāga), (8) conceit (māna), (9) restlessness (uddhacca), (10) ignorance (avijjā) (S 5:61, A 5:13, Vbh 377). In some places, no. 5 (paṭigha) is replaced by ill will (vyāpāda). The first 5 are the lower fetters (orambhāgiya), and the rest, the higher fetters (orambhāgāgiya).
185 As a non-returner, reborn in the Pure Abodes (suddh-āvāsa), the 5 highest heavens of the form world (rūpa-,loka) inhabited only by non-returners who assume their last birth to become arhats and attain nirvana. These worlds are Āvīha (“Non-declining”), Ātappa (“Unworried”), Sudassā (“Clearly Visible”), Sudassī (“Clear-visibility”) and Akaṇṭhī (“Highest”) (D 3:237, M 3:103, Vbh 425, Pug 42-46). It should be noted that one could become a non-returner in this world itself, but upon dying, one is reborn in the Pure Abodes.
186 Punca ca paramā āvuso bhikkhu paṭiccamaṁ orambhāgiyānaṁ saṁyojanānaṁ parikkhayā opapātiko hoti tattha parinibbāyī anāvatti, dhammo tasmā lokā.
187 “Mental influxes,” āsava: see §22.1 n.
188 Sadatthā, may be resolved as: (1) sa-d-atthā, “one own goal,” (2) sant + atthā, “the sublime goal,” “the ideal.”
This is the fourth fruit, fourth benefit.

25.2 Having dwelled with these four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure, avuso, these four fruits, these four benefits, are to be expected.

The consistency of the Buddha Dharma

26.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside [133] sectarians might speak thus: ‘The recluses, sons of the Sakya, dwell without a consistent teaching.’

26.2 Cunda, when the wanderers who are outside sectarians say thus, they should be spoken to thus:

26.3 ‘There is the Dharma, avuso, taught, laid out, by the Tathagata, who knows, who sees, worthy, fully self-awakened for the disciples, and which is not to be transgressed as long as life lasts.

26.4 Avuso, just as Indra’s pillar[191] or an iron pillar, deeply buried, well sunk, unshakable, immovable[192] —

even so, avuso, the Dharma, is taught, laid out, by the Tathagata, who knows, who sees, worthy, fully self-awakened for the disciples, and which is not to be transgressed as long as life lasts.

26.5 Such, avuso, is that monk who is an arhat, whose mental influxes are destroyed, having lived the holy life, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, reached his own goal, destroyed the fetters of being, is completely liberated through direct knowledge. [§25.1(4)]

26.6 He is incapable of committing nine things: Avuso,

1. a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of deliberately depriving beings of their life;
2. a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of taking the not-given by way of theft;
3. a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of indulging in sexual intercourse;
4. a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of consciously speaking falsehood.
5. a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of enjoying sensual pleasure from what he has stored up, just as he has done before as a householder;
6. a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of acting with the bias of greed;
7. a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of acting with the bias of hate;
8. a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of acting with the bias of delusion;
9. a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of acting with the bias of fear.

26.7 Such, avuso, is that monk who is an arhat, whose mental influxes are destroyed, having lived the holy life, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, reached his own goal, destroyed the fetters of being, is completely liberated through direct knowledge.

He is incapable of committing these nine things. [134]

http://dharmafarer.org
Ways of answering questions

27.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside sectarians might speak thus:

‘Now the recluse Gotama manifests unlimited knowledge and vision concerning the past, way back a long time, but he does not manifest knowledge and vision of the future, the way ahead.’

How is this so? What is the reason for this?’

27.2 But these wanderers, outside sectarians, like the foolish and ignorant, think that knowledge and vision concerning certain things should manifest itself in the same way as that concerning other things, too.

27.3 As regards the past, Cunda, the Tathāgata’s knowledge of the recollection and memory goes back a long way:

he is able to recall as far back as he wishes.

27.4 But as regards the future, the time way ahead, there arises in his knowledge born of awakening that

‘This is the last birth! There is no more rebirth now (for me)!’

Knowledge of the three times

28.1 If, Cunda, the past were untrue, unreal, not connected with the goal, then the Tathāgata will not reveal it.

28.2 If, Cunda, the past was true, real, but unconnected with the goal, then the Tathāgata will not reveal it.

28.3 If, Cunda, the past was true, real, connected with the goal, then the Tathāgata would reveal it at the right time when questioned.

28.4 If, Cunda, the future were untrue, unreal, unconnected with the goal, then the Tathāgata will not reveal it.

28.5 If, Cunda, the future will be true, real, unconnected with the goal, then the Tathāgata will not reveal it.

28.6 If, Cunda, the future will be true, real, connected with the goal, then the Tathāgata would reveal it at the right time when questioned.

28.7 If, Cunda, the present were untrue, unreal, unconnected with the goal, then the Tathāgata will not reveal it.

28.8 If, Cunda, the present is true, [135] real, but unconnected with the goal, then the Tathāgata will not reveal it.

---

195 Atītaṁ kho addhānaṁ ārabbha samaṇo gotamo atīrakaṁ ūṇaṃ, dassanaṁ paññapeti.

196 No ca kho anāgataṁ addhānaṁ ārabbha atīrakaṁ ūṇaṃ, dassanaṁ paññapeti.

197 Tay-idaṁ kiṁsu tay-idaṁ kathāṁsūti?

198 Te ca añña, titthiyā paribbājakā añña, vihitakena ūṇa, dassanena anāna, vihitakena ūṇa, dassanena paññapetabb-aṁ maññanti yatha-r-iva bālā avyattā.

199 Atītaṁ kho, cunda, addhānaṁ ārabbha tathāgatassa satānusāri, ūṇaṁ hoti.

200 So yāvatakanā ākanāhītā tāvatakaṁ anussarati.

201 Atītañ ce'pi cunda hoti bhūtaṁ tacchaṁ anattha, saṁhitaṁ, tatra kālaññū tathāgato hoti tassa pañhassa veyyāraṇāya.

202 On the Buddha’s prophecies on the future of Buddhism, see The Dharma-ending age, SD 1.10 (3).
28.9 If, Cunda, the present is true, real, connected with the goal, then the Tathagata will reveal it at the right time when questioned.

28.10 Thus, Cunda, concerning the past, the future and the present, the Tathagata is one who
speaks at the right time, kāla, vāḍi
speaks the truth, bhūta, vāḍi
speaks on the goal [the meaning], attha, vāḍi
speaks the Dharma, dhamma, vāḍi
speaks the Vinaya—vinaya, vāḍi
therefore he is called Tathāgata [thus come].

Why the Buddha is Tathāgata

29.1 And, Cunda, whatever that is what is seen, heard, sensed, cognized, attained [encountered], sought after, examined by the mind of those in this world with its devas [gods], with its Mara, with its Brahma, with its recluses and brahmins, this generation along with their rulers and humans—all that is comprehended by the Tathagata—therefore, he is called Tathāgata.

29.2 And, Cunda, the night that the Tathagata awakened to the supreme full self-awakening, and the night that he passed away into final nirvana without any remains—whatever in between them that he has spoken, conversed, expressed—all that is just as it is, not otherwise—therefore, he is called Tathāgata.

29.3 As he speaks, Cunda, that the Tathagata does; as he does, so he speaks. As he speaks, so he does; as he does, so he speaks—therefore, he is called Tathāgata.

29.4 As to the world, Cunda, with its devas [gods], with its Mara, with its Brahma, with its recluses and brahmins, this generation along with their rulers and humans, the Tathagata is the vanquisher, unvanquished, who sees all, overlord—therefore he is called Tathāgata.

---

207 Iti kho cunda atī 'ānāgata, paccuppannesu dhāmmesu tathāgato kāla, vāḍi bhūta, vāḍi attha, vāḍi dhamma, vāḍi vinaya, vāḍi, tasmā tathāgato 'ti vuccati.
208 For a fuller comy set of defs, see Buddhānussati, SD 15.7 (2).
209 This whole section as at (Tathāgata) Loka S (A 4.23.2–3/2:23 f) = Loka S (It 4.1.13/121 f), SD 15.7(2.1.2).
210 Dīththiṃ sutam mutaṃ viññātaṃ. “Sensed” (muta) here includes the senses of smell, taste and touch. On dīthha sutta; muta viññāta, see SD 53.5.
211 Dīththiṃ sutam mutaṃ viññātaṃ pattam pariyesitaṃ anuvicaritaṃ manasaṃ. This refers to all that can be experienced bodily and mentally, and alludes to the Buddha’s quality of “knowing the world” (loka, vidū): see eg Buddhānussati, SD 15.7 (3.5).
212 Yām etasmīṃ antare bhāsati lapati niiddisati.
213 'Sabbaṁ tāṁ tathā eva hoti no aṇṇathā, tasmā tathāgato 'ti vuccati. This is an allusion to the Buddha’s quality of knowing the “all” (sabba): see 'Sabba S (S 35.23/4:15), SD 7.1.
214 Iti 'yathā, vāḍi 'tathā, kārī, yathā, kārī tathā, vāḍi, tasmā tathāgato 'ti vuccati. His words and actions are true and consistent.
215 'Aṇṇa-d-atthu, dasa, a difficult cpd. Probably aṇṇa (Skt aṇa, other, another, something, anything) + atthu (imp of athi, “let the rest be (as it will)”) + dasa (Skt dṛṣṭa, seeing, to be seen, to be perceived or understood, PED). Comys exp as one who sees everything (DA 1:67; SA 1:209; UA 132; NmA 1:183). CPD prefers “who only sees, the absolute seer, cf dṛṣṭa dṛṣṭimārtha, Yoga, sūtra 2.20. See also DP sv. The meaning here I think is that the Tathagata is one who sees all, and sees them only as they really are.
216 Tathāgato abhībhū abhābhūhītā aṇṇa-d-atthu, dasa vasa, vattī, tasmā tathāgato 'ti vuccati. This is stock: Pāsādika S (D 29.29/4/3:135,20 = Nc 276, attr to Buddha); (Tathāgata) Loka S (A 4.23.3/2:24,13 = It 4.1.13/122,7, attr to Buddha), SD 15.7(2.1.2). These are usu Mahā Brahma’s epithets: Brahma, jāla S (D 1.5/1:18,7), SD 25.2; Bhaddaji S (A 5.170/3:202.9); (Puñña) Mettā S (A 7.58a.3/4:89,9), SD 2.11a; (Satta) Suriya S (A 7.62.47/4:105,3), SD 67.3; Comy: DA 1:111.
The undetermined points

30.1 (1) Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:
‘What now, avuso—the tathagata exists after death—is only this true, all else false?’

30.2 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
Avuso, this is undetermined [136] by the Blessed One, that is:
‘The tathagata exist after death—only this is true, all else false.’

30.3 (2) Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:
‘What now, avuso—the tathagata does not exist after death—is only this true, all else false?’

30.4 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
Avuso, this is undetermined by the Blessed One, that is:
‘The tathagata does not exist after death—only this is true, all else false.’

30.5 (3) Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:
‘What now, avuso—the tathagata both exists and not exist after death—is only this true, all else false?’

30.6 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
Avuso, this is undetermined by the Blessed One, that is:
‘The tathagata both exists and not exist after death—only this is true, all else false.’

30.7 (4) Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:
‘What now, avuso—the tathagata neither exists nor not exist after death—is only this true, all else false.’

30.8 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
Avuso, this is undetermined by the Blessed One, that is:
‘The tathagata neither exists nor not exist after death—only this is true, all else false.’

31.1 REASON FOR NOT TEACHING THEM. Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:
‘But why, Cunda, have they been undetermined [unanswered] by the Blessed One?’

31.2 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
‘Because, avuso, they are not connected with the goal, not related to the fundamentals of the holy life, not conduce to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana. [§23.3]
Therefore, they are undetermined by the Blessed.’

The determined

32.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:
‘What now, avuso, is determined by the Blessed One?’

32.2 THE 4 NOBLE TRUTHS. Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
‘This is suffering’ has been determined, avuso, by the Blessed One.
‘This is the arising of suffering’ has been determined, avuso, by the Blessed One.
‘This is the ending of suffering’ has been determined, avuso, by the Blessed One.
‘This is the path leading to the ending of suffering’ has been determined, avuso, by the Blessed One. [137]

33.1 REASON FOR TEACHING THEM. Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:
‘But why, avuso, have these been determined [answered] by the recluse Gotama?’

33.2 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
‘Because, avuso, they are connected to the goal, it is connected to the Dharma, it is connected with the fundamentals of the holy life,
conducing [leading] to utter revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana. [§24.3]
Therefore, they have been determined by the Blessed One.’

Views connected with “finite past” beliefs

34.1 Whatever, Cunda, that are dependent on views connected with the finite past, they have been determined [declared] by me insofar as they are determinable.
34.2 And as for what you should not determine, what is there as such for me to determine for you?
34.3 Whatever, Cunda, that are dependent on views connected with the future, they have been revealed by me insofar as they are determinable.
34.4 And as for what you should not determine, what is there as such for me to determine for you?
34.5 And what are they, Cunda, that are dependent on views connected with the finite past that have been determined by me insofar as they are determinable,
34.6 and as for what you should not determine, what is there as such for me to determine for you?

THE 16 WRONG VIEWS REGARDING THE FINITE PAST

34.7 (1) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are eternal: only this is true, all else false.’
34.8 (2) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’
34.9 (3) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are both eternal and not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’
34.10 (4) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are neither eternal nor not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’
34.11 (5) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are self-made: only this is true, all else false.’
34.12 (6) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are other-made: only this is true, all else false.’
34.13 (7) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are both self-made and other-made: only this is true, all else false.’ [138]
34.14 (8) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are neither self-made nor other-made, but arise fortuitously: only this is true, all else false.’
34.15 (9) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are eternal: only this is true, all else false.’
34.16 (10) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’
34.17 (11) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are both eternal and not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’
34.18 (12) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are neither eternal nor not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’
34.19 (13) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view,

217 Ye ‘pi te cunda pubbh’ anta,saha,gata diṭṭhi,nissayā.
218 Yathā ca te na vyākātabbā, kiṁ vo ahaṁ te tathā vyākarissāmi?
219 These 16 views are also listed in Nāṇā Tīṭṭhīyā S 2+3 (U 6.5+6/69 f), SD 97.2+3.
220 Asayaṅ,kāro aparāṅ,kāro adhicca,samuppanno attā ca loko ca, idam eva saccaṁ mogham aññan ‘ti.
that ‘happiness and sorrow are self-made: only this is true, all else false.’

34.20 (14) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmans who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

34.21 (15) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmans who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are both self-made and other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

34.22 (16) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmans who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are neither self-made nor other-made, but arise fortuitously: only this is true, all else false.’

Rejecting the views connected with “finite past” beliefs

35.1 Here, Cunda, there are those recluses and brahmans who hold these doctrines, these views:

(1) ‘The self and the world are eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

35.2 Having approached them, I said this:

‘Now, avuso, is this what you said: “The self and the world are eternal.”

35.3 And they replied thus: “Only this is true, all else false!”

I do not grant them this. Why is the reason for this?

35.4 For here, Cunda, there are beings with different perceptions.221

35.5 Indeed, Cunda, in these declarations I see no one at all who is my equal, what more to say better.222

Moreover, here I am indeed the better at whatever concerning declarations [expositions].223

36.1 Here, Cunda, as regards those recluses and brahmans who hold these doctrines, these views,224

(2) that ‘the self and the world are not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(3) that ‘the self and the world are both eternal and not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(4) that ‘the self and the world are neither eternal nor not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(5) that ‘the self and the world are self-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(6) that ‘the self and the world are other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(7) that ‘the self and the world are both self-made and other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(8) that ‘the self and the world are neither self-made nor other-made, but arise fortuitously: only this is true, all else false.’

(9) that ‘happiness and sorrow are eternal: only this is true, all else false.’ [139]

(10) that ‘happiness and sorrow are not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(11) that ‘happiness and sorrow are both eternal and not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(12) that ‘happiness and sorrow are neither eternal nor not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(13) that ‘happiness and sorrow are self-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(14) that ‘happiness and sorrow are other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(15) that ‘happiness and sorrow are both self-made and other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(16) that ‘happiness and sorrow are neither self-made nor other-made, but arise fortuitously: only this is true, all else false.’

221 Aññathā, saṅñino ‘pi h’etha cunda sant’eke sattā.

222 Imāya ‘pi kho aham cunda paññattiya n’eva attanā sama, samaṁ samanupassāmi kuto bhīyyo. The comparison here, says Comy, is on the level of knowledge (ñāṇena) (DA 3:916). See foll n.

223 Atha kho aham eva tattha bhīyyo yad idam adhipaṅñatti. Here I take adhipaṅñatti as adhi, “concerning” + paññatti, “declaration, conception,” which Comy glosses as “view” (diṭṭhi, DA 3:916). Here again, we see the sangha fathers or sutta compilers presenting the Buddha as reassuring us of his full mastery of the doctrines (see DA 3:916). One way of interpreting this as a narrative skillful means of showing how comprehensive and authentic Buddhist philosophical analysis is. After all, this is a Dīgha sutta, often used as a Buddhist prospectus or advertisement for the unconverted: see Joy Manné, 1990, 1992.

224 Only Ce includes view no 1 (The self and the world are eternal), which is already addressed at §35 above; hence, should not be mentioned again.
36.2 Having approached them, I said this:

‘Now, avuso, there is this that you said: “Happiness and sorrow are neither self-made nor other-made, but arise fortuitously” —

36.3 And they replied thus: “Only this is true, all else false!”

36.4 I do not grant them this. Why is the reason for this?

36.5 For here, Cunda, there are beings with different perceptions.

36.6 These, Cunda, are what are dependent on views connected with the finite past, that have been determined [declared] by me insofar as they are determinable. [§34.1]

36.7 And as for what you should not determine, what is there as such for me to determine for you?

[§34.2]

Views connected with “future” beliefs

37.1 Whatever, Cunda, that are dependent on views connected with the future, they have been determined [declared] by me insofar as they are determinable.

37.2 And as for what you should not determine, what is there as such for me to determine for you?

37.3 Whatever, Cunda, that are dependent on views connected with the future, they have been revealed by me insofar as they are determinable.

37.4 And as for what you should not determine, what is there as such for me to determine for you?

The 8 Wrong Views dependent on views of the future

37.5 (1) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self has form and, after death, is unimpaired [intact]:’ 226 only this is true, all else false.’

(2) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

(3) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self both has form and is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

(4) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self neither has form nor is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’ [140]

(5) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self is conscious’ 227 and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

(6) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self is unconscious’ 228 and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

(7) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self is neither conscious nor unconscious and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

(8) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self perishes, is destroyed, does not exist after death: only this is true, all else false.’

Rejecting views connected with “future” beliefs

38.1 Here, Cunda, as regards those recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view,

\[\text{http://dhammfarer.org}\]
(1) ‘The self has form and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

38.2 Having approached them, I said this:
‘Now, avuso, there is this that you said: “The self has form and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.”’

38.3 And they replied thus: “Only this is true, all else false!”

I do not grant them this. Why is the reason for this?

38.4 For here, Cunda, there are beings with different perceptions.

38.5 Indeed, Cunda, in these declarations I see no one at all who is my equal, what more to say better. Moreover, here I am indeed the better at whatever concerning declarations [expositions]. [§35.5]

39.1 Here, Cunda, as regards those recluses and brahmans who hold these doctrines, these views,
(2) that ‘The self is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’
(3) that ‘The self both has form and is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’
(4) that ‘The self neither has form nor is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’
(5) that ‘The self is conscious and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’
(6) that ‘The self is unconscious and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’
(7) that ‘The self is neither conscious nor unconscious and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’
(8) that ‘The self perishes, is destroyed, does not exist after death: only this is true, all else false.’

THE BUDDHA REJECTS THESE VIEWS CONNECTED WITH FUTURE BELIEFS:

39.2 Having approached them, I said this:
‘Now, avuso, there is this that you said: “The self perishes, is destroyed, does not exist after death.”’

39.3 And they replied thus: “Only this is true, all else false!”

I do not grant them this. Why is the reason for this?

39.4 For here, Cunda, there are beings with different perceptions.

39.5 Indeed, Cunda, in these declarations I see no one at all who is my equal, what more to say better. Moreover, here I am indeed the better at whatever concerning declarations [expositions]. [§35.5]

39.6 These, Cunda, are what are dependent on views connected with the future, that have been determined [declared] by me [141] insofar as they are determinable.

39.7 And as for what you should not determine, what is there as such for me to determine for you?

Way out of the wrong view

40.1 Now, Cunda, for the abandoning, the crossing beyond, these dependence on views connected with the finite past, and this dependence on views connected with the future, I have thus taught and declared the four focuses [foundations] of mindfulness.

What are the four?229

40.2 Here, Cunda, a monk230

(1) dwells231 exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing [watching] the body in the body.232 remov-
ing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world; (2) dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing feelings in the feelings, removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world; (3) dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing the mind in the mind, removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world; (4) dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing dharmas in the dharmas, removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world.

40.3 And these, Cunda, are for the abandoning, the crossing beyond, these dependence on views connected with the finite past, and this dependence on views connected with the future. As such, I have taught and declared the four foundations of mindfulness.”

Conclusion
41.1 Now at that time, the venerable Upavāna was standing behind the Blessed One, fanning him. Then the venerable Upavāna said this to the Blessed One:

“It is wonderful, bhante! It is marvellous, bhante! How delightful, bhante, is this Dharma exposition! How greatly delightful, bhante, is this Dharma exposition! What is the name of this Dharma exposition, bhante?”

41.2 “In that case here, Upavāna, you indeed may remember this Dharma exposition as just that, that is, as “the delightful” (pāsādika).”

41.4 The Blessed One said this.
The venerable Upavāna joyfully approved of the Blessed One’s word.

— evaṁ —

Bibliography

Burma Piṭaka Association = BPA

Gethin, Rupert M

---

233 Vineyya can mean “should remove” (as pot, like vineyya, Sn 590) or as “having removed” (as ger, like vinaitvā, Pm 1:244), and both senses apply in Satipaṭṭhāna S. U Silananda similarly ends the sentence with “removing covetousness and grief in the world” (1990:177); also 1990:22-25. See SD 13.1 (4.2c) above.


236 An elder of Sāvatthī and one of the Buddha’s attendants. See Tha 185 f for his verses (also S 7.13; cf Miln 134, Miln:H 1:187 n8) & Tha:RD 350 for an allusion to this incident (ThaA 2:56 f). On his origs: Ap 2270,22-74,7 (ApA 343,27 f). Devahita S (S 7.13) records how Upavāna, as the Buddha’s attendant, attends to him when he was suffering from wind illness (S 7.13/1:174 f = Dha 4:232,18). In Upavāna S (S 35.70), he asks the Buddha on the meaning of sanditthika (directly visible; seen for oneself) which the Buddha explains it as that of direct awareness of lust as it arises through sense-experience (S 35.70/4:41-44). In Pāsādika S (D 29), he fans the Buddha as he teaches, and the Sutta title is to his credit (D 29,41/3:141), SD 40a.6. See CPD sv.

237 Pāsādiko vatāyaṁ, bhante, dhamma,pariyāyo; supāsādiko vatāyaṁ, bhante, dhamma,pariyāyo, ko nāmāyaṁ, bhante, dhamma,pariyāyo ‘ti?

238 Tasmā-t-īha tvaṁ upavāna imaṁ dhamma,pariyāyaṁ pāsādiko tv-eva naṁ dhārehiṁ. 
Manné, Joy
120918; 121002; 120221; 130226