

5

(Yuga,naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta

The Discourse on the (Twin) Practice | **A 4.170**
or **Yuga,naddha Sutta** The Discourse on the Twin

Theme: The 4 modes of progress in terms of samatha and vipassana
Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2007, 2013

1 Sutta summary and highlights

1.1 THE 4 METHODS. The **(Yuga,naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta** (A 4.170) takes its title from the third of the meditative “modes of progress” (*paṭipadā*) to awakening.¹ The first three modes or methods deal with the balancing of samatha and vipassana [§§3.2, 4, 5], while the fourth deals with overcoming mental restlessness [§6]. Briefly, these are the 4 modes of meditation progress mentioned in the Sutta, namely:

- | | | |
|--|---|------|
| (1) “insight preceded by calm” | <i>samatha,pubb’aṅgama vipassanā</i> | [§2] |
| (2) “calm preceded by insight” | <i>vipassanā,pubb’aṅgama samatha</i> | [§3] |
| (3) “calm coupled with insight” | <i>samatha,vipassanā,yuga.naddha</i> ² | [§4] |
| (4) “a mind seized by dharma-restlessness” | <i>dhamm’uddhacca,viggahita mānasa</i> | [§5] |

These 4 modes of meditation progress in such a manner that “the mental fetters are abandoned and the latent tendencies are destroyed” [§§3.4, 4.3, 5.3, 6.3]. In other words, arhathood is attained. In fact, Ānanda, the teacher in this Sutta, says that all the monastics who have declared their arhathood before him, have won full awakening through one of these 4 modes of progress [§3.1].

1.2 MAGGA. In the first 3 modes—calm first, then insight; insight first, then calm; both together—it is said that “**the path arises in him**” (*tassa...maggo sañjayati*). It is clear here that “the path” (*magga*) has no technical meaning as the moment of only experiencing the supramundane path, as found in the Abhidhamma and Commentaries. It has “a more extended sense of a path of practice that is being developed over a period of time (which is in fact the connotation of *magga* in the early discourses)” (Analayo 2009z: 816).³

This general non-technical meaning of “path” (*magga*) is confirmed by the subsequent passage, which says that “**[t]hen he pursues, cultivates and develops that path**” (*taṃ maggaṃ āsevatī bhāvetī bahulī,karoti*) [§3.4 etc]. The “path” here definitely cannot refer to arhathood, in which case, there is nothing further to do. In fact, the Commentary says that the “path” here refers to streamwinning (AA 2:-157).⁴

For the first 3 modes, the Sutta goes on to say, “**and while he does so, the mental fetters are abandoned and the latent tendencies are destroyed**” [§3.5]. With sustained effort, the meditator goes on to attain arhathood (as declared by Ānanda at the start of the Sutta). The last mode, however, works very differently [4.1; 5].

1.3 PAṬISAMBHIDĀ,MAGGA’S EXPLANATIONS. The (Yuga,naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta is quoted in full in **the Paṭisambhidā,magga** comprising its Yuga,naddha Vagga, the Chapter on the Twin (Pm 2:92 f), followed by its own detailed commentary on the Sutta (Pm 2:93-103). The following explanations of the 4 modes of progress [2-5] are based on the Paṭisambhidā,magga Commentary and other Commentaries.⁵

¹ On *paṭipadā* (*paṭi*, directional prefix: “towards” + √PAD, “to go”), “(fig) path, way; means of reaching a goal; (mode of) progress, practice” see **(Vitthāra) Paṭipadā S** (A 4.162/2:149 f), SD 18.3.

² **Yuga,naddha** (*yuga*, “yoke; pair” + *naddha* or *nandha*, “tied, bound, put on”), “putting a yoke, yoke together: Pm 2:92 f; KhpA 27; (adj) congruous, harmonious: UA 153, 398; (neut) congruity, association, common cause”: KhpA 27; Pm 2:98 = Vism 682.

³ Analayo, “Yuganaddha Sutta,” in *Encyclopaedia of Buddhism*, Colombo, 2009z 8:815-817.

⁴ *Paṭhamo lokuttara,maggo nibbattati* (AA 2:157).

⁵ PmA 3:583-586. On a summary of these 4 types of practice, see **Dhyana**, SD 8.4 (10).

2 Calm first, then insight (*samatha,pubb’āṅgama vipassanā*)

According to **the Majjhima Commentary**, the one who practises “calm first, then insight” (*samatha,pubb’āṅgama vipassana*) is called a calmness practitioner (*samatha,yānika*), that is, one who first cultivates access concentration (*upacāra,samādhi*), the dhyanas or the formless attainments, and then takes up insight (*vipassanā*) meditation. “Access concentration” is the concentration gained just before attaining dhyana (MA 1:108).

According to **the Paṭisambhidā,magga**, this first mode of meditation involves first establishing a basis for meditative concentration, and then follows the insight contemplation. Such a “concentration” refers to the one-pointedness of the mind and absence of distraction (*cittassa ekaggatā avikkhepo samādhi*), whereas “insight” here refers to contemplating the 3 characteristics of impermanence, unsatisfactoriness and non-self (Pm 2:93).

A famous example of such a meditator is **Subhūti**, who is said to have first cultivated “mettā dhyana” (dhyana based on the practice of lovingkindness) and, on the basis of that clear bliss, goes on to cultivate insight wisdom. In due course, he attains arhatood. (AA 1:223)⁶

3 Insight first then calm (*vipassanā,pubb’āṅgama samatha*)

The second mode of progress—where insight is cultivated first, then calm (*vipassanā,pubb’āṅgama samatha*)—refers to a practitioner who naturally gains insight, with which he cultivates one-pointedness of the mind⁷—this is the insight practitioner (*vipassanā,yānika*) (MA 1:112). According to **the Paṭisambhidā,magga**, this second mode of meditation begins right away with the contemplation of the 3 characteristics. This is followed by the cultivating of “letting go” (*vossagga*), perhaps as a result of the detachment arising from insight (Pm 2:96).

4 Both calm and insight together (*samatha,vipassanā,yuga.naddha*)

4.1 CALM AND INSIGHT PRACTISED TOGETHER. In the third method—calm and insight practised together (*samatha,vipassanā,yuga.naddha*)—we enter the first dhyana, and emerging from it, apply insight to that experience, that is, see all that we have experienced as being nothing but the 5 aggregates (form, feeling, perceptions, formations, consciousness) that are in turn impermanent, subject to suffering, and are such non-self. Then we enter the 2nd dhyana, emerge and apply insight to it. This twofold reflection is applied to the other dhyanas in the same manner until the path of streamwinning, or higher, is realized (AA 3:142).⁸

The Paṭisambhidā,magga treats this twin practice from a total of 16 perspectives (Pm 2:97-99), the key idea of which is to highlight the role of calm and insight during the experience of the supramundane path, where the two are conjoined (*yuga,naddha*) in the sense of converging on cessation or non-arising (*nirodha*). However, if we are to carefully follow the (Yuga,naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta, it is uncertain if this is its actual import. We should at best regard the Paṭisambhidā,magga explanation here as an Abhidhamma development.

This twin method of meditation describes the experience and development of the path (*magga*) just as in the previous two modes, where calm and insight are practised one after the other. Since the formulation for all these 3 modes are identical, it is to be expected that this twin practice of calm and insight is done *before* or leading to the arising of the supramundane path.

Hence, as we have noted [1.2], the word “path” (*magga*) in all the cases here has a general non-technical sense, especially when it is immediately said that “[t]hen he pursues, cultivates and develops that

⁶ See SD 45.1 (3.1.14).

⁷ MA 1:108 f; AA 3:143.

⁸ Analayo 2009z:815 (col 2) gives “MA III, 142” which should read “AA 3:142.”

path” [§3.4 etc]. The “path” here definitely cannot refer to arhathood, in which case, there is nothing further to do, but refers to at least streamwinning (AA 2:157).⁹

4.2 THE TWIN PRACTICE AND THE 7 SETS. The Māha Saḷ-āyatanika Sutta (M 149) mentions the twin practice of calm and insight. It describes the cultivation of insight in terms of sense-experiences, which then leads to the cultivating of the noble eightfold path, which is, in fact, what calm and insight here represent. With the cultivation of the noble eightfold path, all the other 6 sets of teachings—the 4 focusses of mindfulness, the 4 right strivings, the 4 bases of spiritual power, the 5 spiritual faculties, the 5 spiritual powers, and the 7 awakening-factors—all arise, too. These 7 sets comprise the 37 limbs of awakening (*bodhi, pakkhiya dhamma*).¹⁰

The Mahā Saḷ-āyatanika Sutta says this is how the two practises of calm and insight work together (*tass’ime dve dhammā yuganaddhā vattanti samatho ca vipassanā ca*, M 3:289,16). The Sutta’s commentary, however, explains that this refers to the supramundane path (that is, sainthood itself) (MA 5:104). So here again, we see a new development in the commentarial tradition in how the teaching on the twin meditation is viewed.

The two perspectives—those of the Paṭisambhida, magga [4.1] and the Majjhima commentary on M 149—are, however, best seen as being complementary. Thus, according to **Analayo**, the perspective on *Yuga, naddha* in these two texts “could be seen as highlighting the culmination point that would be the result of a previous meditative development that combines these two over a more or less extended period of time.” (2009z:816)

4.3 YUGA, NADDHA AND DHYANA

4.3.1 Dhyaana or no dhyana. The main distinction between the practice of calm (*samatha*) and of insight (*vipassana*) is often said to that between concentration (*samādhi*) and wisdom (*paññā*). While **calm** brings about concentration so that *the mental hindrances* are removed at least temporarily,¹¹ **insight** then reflects on our experience of wisdom in terms of *the 3 characteristics*.¹²

In practice, calm and insight, or samatha and vipassana, have come to refer specifically to the presence or absence of dhyana. If we cultivate calm or samatha, we will in due course attain the 4 dhyanas (or at least the first one). On attaining the fourth dhyana, we can choose to cultivate various kinds of psychic powers (*iddhi*). Or, we could go on to refine our dhyana meditation and go on to the 4 formless attainments (*arūpa, samāpatti*).

Then, having emerged from such a state, we turn to the cultivation of insight. However, if we choose to start with insight, or focus on insight practice, it would require only a level of concentration less than that needed for attaining dhyana or we might not need to attain such a concentration at all. The (Yuga, naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta, as we know, allows any of 4 “intermediate” possibilities:

- (1) calm first, then insight [2];
- (2) insight first, then calm [3];
- (3) both calm and insight together [4]; and
- (4) a mind seized by restlessness [5].

Having said that, while we have a choice of 4 modes or aspects of meditation, it is not feasible to practise only *one* mode exclusively, that is, if we wish to attain awakening.

4.3.2 Thinking and sensing suspended in dhyana. Bhikkhu Bodhi, in his note on “samatha and vipassana as the twin practice,” in his (Yuga, naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta (A 4.170) translation, makes this interesting note:

[The Aṅguttara Commentary] says that each time he [the meditator] attains a meditative attainment (*samāpatti*), he explores it by way of its conditioned phenomena. And having explored

⁹ Paṭhamo lokuttara, maggo nibbattati (AA 2:157).

¹⁰ M 149/3:287-290 @ SD 41.9. On the 7 sets, see **Bodhi, pakkhiya, dhamma**, SD 10.1.

¹¹ See SD 41.1 (3.2) Samatha.

¹² See SD 41.1 (3.3) Vipassana.

the conditioned phenomena, he enters the next attainment. Thus, having attained the first jhāna, he emerges and explores the conditioned phenomena as impermanent, etc. Then he enters the second jhāna, emerges and explores its conditioned phenomena, and so on up to the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception.

Since, however, *yuga,naddha* means literally “yoked together,” some interpret the term to mean that in this mode of practice serenity and insight occur simultaneously.¹³ The commentarial system does not acknowledge this possibility but several suttas might be read as suggesting that insight can occur within the jhāna and does not require the meditator to emerge before beginning contemplation. [The suttas are then listed as A 9.36, M 52 and M 64.] (A:B 1707 n861)

If we accept that in *dhyana* all thinking and pondering (*vitakka,vicāra*) have been transcended, then it is obvious that *neither* thinking *nor* knowing, as we understand them, would occur in the 2nd dhyana upwards. Even in the first dhyana, which is said to be characterized by the presence of “initial application” (*vitakka*) and “sustained application” (*vicāra*), such conceptual, even linguistic, processes cease. The *vitakka,vicāra* of the first dhyana is not that of the everyday non-meditative thinking or knowing processes. They are very subtle cognitive processes when we are beginning to fully experience the mind without any intervening conceptualization. The mind is beginning to fully see and feel itself.¹⁴

5 A mind seized by mental restlessness (*dhamm'uddhacca,viggahitaṃ mānasa*)

5.1 SIGNIFICANCE OF DHAMM'UDDHACCA

5.1.1 Meaning of *dhamm'uddhacca*

The description of the fourth meditation mode—the combined practice of calm and insight—includes an interesting term, *dhamm'uddhacca*, “dharma-restlessness.” Its context is that of a mind “seized by dharma-restlessness” (*dhamm'uddhacca,viggahitaṃ mānasaṃ hoti*) [§6.1]. The meditator’s mind is here distracted by excitement in terms of mental states. When the mind settles down, becomes steady, unified and concentrated, the path of sainthood arises.

5.1.2 How *dhamm'uddhacca* arises

The Paṃsu,dhovaka Sutta (A 3.100a) gives us a very good idea of the levels of defilements that hinder our spiritual progress, as follows:

- the gross defilements, by way of misconduct the body, of speech, of the mind;
- the middling defilements, by way of thoughts of sensual pleasure, of ill will, of violence;¹⁵
- the subtle defilements, by way of thoughts of relatives, of home [his country], and of reputation.

The intent and capable meditator overcomes these defilements, so that there only remains what is known as **dharma-restlessness**, defined by the Sutta as follows:

Thereafter, only dharma-thoughts remain.¹⁶ And that concentration [samadhi] is not yet peaceful and sublime. It has neither won full tranquillity nor come to mental unification. It is maintained by suppressing the defilements through strenuous effort.¹⁷

(A 3.100a,4.1/1:254), SD 19.11; cf §6 below

The Sutta then continues to say that the meditator’s minds gains greater focus so that such defilements can be suppressed “without strenuous effort.”

¹³ See SD 41.1 (2.2.2): Can calm and insight occur simultaneously?

¹⁴ See SD 33.1b (6.2): While in dhyana can we examine our own mind?

¹⁵ These 3 are the opposites of the 3 aspects of right thought (*sammā saṅkappa*), the 2nd factor of the noble eight-fold path. See (**Magga**) **Vibhaṅga S** (S 45.8/5:8-10), SD 14.5.

¹⁶ *Athāparam dhamma,vitakkāvasissanti*. Here, during meditation, *dhamma* can mean either “mental state” or “teaching.” See SD 41.4 (2.2). On *dhamm'uddhacca*, see **Uddhacca,kukkucca**, SD 32.7 (2.1), esp (2.1.4).

¹⁷ *Sa,saṅkhāra,niggayha,vārita,vato*. Here *sa,saṅkhāra* means “with effort,” as in *sa,saṅkhāra parinibbāyī*, descriptive of a non-returner who “attains nirvana with some effort”: see **Saṅkhāra**, SD 17.6.5 (5).

¹⁸Then when he directs his mind towards the attaining of any mental state attainable through direct knowledge, he gains the ability to witness [to personally experience] any aspect therein, whenever the conditions are right.¹⁹ (A 3.100a,4.2/1:255), SD 19.11

5.2 NATURE OF DHAMM'UDDHACCA

5.2.1 As an impurity of insight

According to the Paṭisambhidā,magga and the Sutta's commentary, the mental states are calm and insight, and the excitement is one of the 10 impurities of insight (*vipassanūpakilesā*), when they are wrongly taken as indicating path-attainment.²⁰ The Paṭisambhidā,magga commentary, on the other hand, says that this is pure insight (*suddha,vipassanā*) (PmA 584,32).

Not understanding these 10 mental impurities for what they are, we can be easily distracted by any of them, namely: (1)-(3) bad conduct of body, speech and mind; (4)-(6)sensual thoughts, thoughts of ill will, (7) violent thoughts; (8) thoughts about relatives, home country and reputation; (10) thoughts about higher mental states or the teachings (*dhamma,vitakka*).²¹ **The Visuddhi,magga** uses the term *dhamma,vitakka* ("thoughts about mental states") to refer to the same 10 impurities.²²

5.2.2 Modern views

5.2.2.1 The scholar monk, **Bodhi**, disagreeing with the commentarial explanation, suggests a simpler alternative for the meaning of *dhamm'uddhacca*, that "it seems more natural to understand it simply as obsessive reflections about the Dharma" (2005:440 n16), and further notes, "It is plausible, however, that the 'agitation caused by higher states of mind' is mental distress brought on by eagerness to realize the Dharma, a state of spiritual anxiety that sometimes can precipitate an instantaneous enlightenment experience" (A:ÑB 294 n69).

5.2.2.2 Such cases are in fact found in the suttas, but it remains to be seen how (or whether) they are related to the fourth meditation method of **the (Yuga,naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta**.²³ The story of how Bāhiya Dārucīriya awakens by just listening to the Buddha as related in **the (Arahata) Bāhiya Sutta** (U 1.10) should be carefully examined: note especially how the Buddha skillfully calmed Bāhiya's mind.

And then there is the famous case of how Sāriputta solved Anuruddha's meditation problems, which leads to Anuruddha's awakening in due course²⁴

5.3 DHAMM'UDDHACCA AND STREAMWINNING

5.3.1 The (Yuga,naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta's commentary, we have noted [1.2], says that the word "path" in the Sutta could possibly refer to streamwinning (AA 2:157). In the case of the fourth meditation mode [4], "dharma-restlessness" (*dhamma'uddhacca*) [5.1.1.2] could then be those occasions, such as *listening to a Dharma exposition*, when we could gain streamwinning.

¹⁸ From hereon throughout, it is the same as **Nimitta S** (A 3.12,14.2-20/1:257 f), SD 19.12.

¹⁹ *Yassa yassa ca abhiññā,sacchi,karaṇīyassa dhammassa cittaṃ abhininnāmeti abhiññā,sacchikiriyāya, tatra tatr'eva sakkhi,bhaddatāṃ pāpuṇāti sati sati āyatane*. The latter phrase—*tatra tatra...sati sati āyatane*—is a common stock phrase that introduces the attainment of the direct knowledges (*abhiññā*): **Mahā Vaccha,gotta S** (M 73,-19/1:494 @ SD 27.4); **Kāya,gata,sati S** (M 119,29 f/3:96 f @ SD 12.21); **Paṃsu,dhovaka S** (A 3.100a.4/1:255 @ SD 19.11a); **Upakkilesa S** (A 5.23/3:16-19); **Iddhi,pāda S 2** (A 5.68/3:82 f); **Sakkhi,bhabba S** (A 6.71/3:426 f); **Gāvī Upamā S** (A 9.35/4:421 f). It refers to the preliminary conditions (*āyatana*) for the 6 direct knowledges (*abhiññā*) which follow later. The preliminary condition for the first 5 knowledges (the mundane ones) is the 4th dhyana; for the 5th (the only supramundane one), it is insight. See SD 12.21 (6).

²⁰ Pm 2:100 f; AA 3:143.

²¹ **Paṃsu,dhovaka S** (A 3.100a.4.1/1:254), SD 19.11. For details, see Vism 105-128/633-638.

²² See Pm 2:92-103;Vism 20.105-128/633-638 & Vism:Ñ 739n; Mahasi Sayadaw 1965:10-13, 46-48.

²³ See Analayo 2009z:816.

²⁴ **(Arahatta) Bāhiya S** (U 1.10/6-9), SD 33.7. On Sāriputta's analyses of Anuruddha's meditation problems, see SD 19.4 (2.1) Anuruddha's awakening.

5.3.2 Such a teaching is, in fact, found in **the Vimutt'āyatana Sutta** (A 5.26), where these 5 “grounds for liberation” (*vimutt'āyatana*)—occasions when we could attain streamwinning or even arhathood itself could be attained, namely:

- (1) listening to the Dharma taught by the teacher or a fellow practitioner;
- (2) teaching the Dharma in detail that we have learned and mastered in theory;
- (3) reciting the Dharma in detail to others that we have learned and mastered in theory;
- (4) reflecting on the Dharma that we have learned and mastered in theory;
- (5) meditating by properly grasping the samadhi-sign, and reflecting on it with wisdom.

A 5.26/3:21-24 @ SD 21.5, excerpts at SD 3.2 (5.2)

Examples for (1)—that of awakening arising from listening to the Dharma taught by the Buddha himself—are especially significant for our purposes here, and can be found in these cases in the early texts:

- | | |
|--|-------------------------|
| • The depressed Yasa, and his father looking for him | Mv 1.7.1-14 @ V 1:15-18 |
| • Yasa's mother and erstwhile wife | Mv 1.8.1-4 @ V 1:18 |
| • Yasa's 4 laymen friends and the 50 youths | Mv 1.9-10 @ V 1:18-20 |
| • Devadatta's assassins who try to kill the Buddha | Cv 7.3.6-8 @ V 2:192 f |
| • Suppabuddha listening to the graduated teaching | U 5.3/49 |

5.3.3 From all such stories, it can be assumed that all these people clearly have not engaged in any proper meditation practice of samatha and vipassana. The stock passage on the attaining of streamwinning on account of a graduated discourse²⁵ given by the Buddha refers to the listener's mind becoming “ready, receptive, free from hindrances, uplifted and clear [faith-inspired],”²⁶ when he would then teach them the 4 noble truths, and as a result,

having thus seen the Dharma, attained to the Dharma, understood the Dharma, fathomed the Dharma, crossed beyond doubt, cast off uncertainty, gained fearless confidence, independent of others, dwell in the Teacher's teaching.²⁷

6 The twin practice and streamwinning

6.1 From the teachings of the (Yuga,naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta and related suttas, it is clear that both samatha and vipassana (or calm and insight) are necessary as a complete practice fruiting in due course in awakening to some level. It is also clear that there are situations when streamwinning can be attained *without* either samatha or vipassana, that is, by listening to the Dharma as taught by the Buddha himself or by an experienced saintly practitioner [5.1.2].

However, once we have become streamwinners (that is, we have attained the path), we still need to keep a proper balance of samatha and vipassana in our meditation, especially if we are to attain non-return or arhathood.²⁸ The reason for this is clear enough: to attain either non-return or arhathood, dhyana is necessary.²⁹ If the meditator who has attained dhyana and found his balance between samatha and vipassana, but he still has some mental restlessness on account of some dharma (mental state or teaching), he

²⁵ On the graduated discourse (*ānupubbī kathā*), see **The gradual way**, SD 56.1.

²⁶ *Kalla, cittaṃ mudu, cittaṃ vinīvaraṇa, cittaṃ udagga, cittaṃ pasanna, cittaṃ.* For refs, see foll n.

²⁷ **Kūṭa, danta S** (D 5.29/1:148), SD 22.8; **Mahā'padāna S** (D 14.3.11/2:41, 3.15/2:43, 3.19/2:44), SD 49.8; **Upāli S** (M 36.18/1:379 f), SD 49.4; **Brahm'āyu S** (M 91.36/2:145), SD 63.8; (**Licchavī**) **Siha S** (A 8.12.9/4:186), SD 71.5, (**Vesālīka**) **Ugga S** (A 8.21.5-6/4:209), SD 71.5; cf **Āvaraṇa Nīvaraṇa S** (S 46.38b/5:95 f), SD 3.2.

²⁸ On the necessity of dhyana for arhathood, see SD 41.1 (2.2.2.4).

²⁹ See **Kīṭā, giri S** (M 70.14-16/1:477 f), SD 11.1 (5.2); cf (**Arahatta**) **Bāhiya S** (U 1.10), SD 33.7; also **Samadhi** @ SD 33.1a (2.4) awakening *without* dhyana; & **Bhāvanā** @ SD 15.1 (13): Is dhyana necessary for awakening?

would become a non-returner, but if he is able to keep his mind calm and clear throughout, he would become an arhat.³⁰

6.2 Nowhere in the suttas or the Commentaries is it ever stated that *only* samatha or *only* vipassana could or should be practised on its own. On the contrary, as we have seen, we have numerous sutta teaching and commentarial support to show that *both* samatha and vipassana must be practised either one before the other, or together as a combined practice. In this way, we are assured of awakening in this life itself. **Analayo** ends his entry on “Yuga,naddha Sutta” in the Encyclopaedia of Buddhism with these cautionary words:

The Yuga,naddha [Paṭipadā] Sutta indicates that *samatha* neither leads on its own to awakening, nor is it an absolute requisite that need to be developed up to a certain degree before undertaking the development of insight...,³¹ nor can its development be completely neglected for the sake of insight. That is, the development of *samatha* is a necessary companion to the development of *vipassanā*, but the way in which this companion is related to the practice of insight is up to the individual choice. Monoculture, however, should definitely be avoided, in order to ensure that tranquillity and insight perform their purpose of leading to final liberation. (2009z:817)

Hence, the distinction between the practice of calm (*samatha*) and of insight (*vipassana*) is based on that between concentration (*samādhi*) and wisdom (*paññā*), two very fundamental concepts of early Buddhism. Naturally both are necessary for spiritual progress, their differences being only partly a matter of degree and partly the order of development. They are like the two wings of a flying bird (Dh 275).

7 The purpose of dhyana

7.1 Let us now examine **the purpose of dhyana practice**. The first clear hint has to do with the 3 trainings, that is, in moral virtue, in mental cultivation, and in liberating wisdom. With this understanding, we can say, in simple terms, that the purpose of Buddhist training is to know the mind, tame the mind, free the mind. Without dhyana, we can never really know the mind; with dhyana we have a direct experience of our own mind, and if we cultivate that mind well enough, we will free it so that we can know the mind of others, too.

We can then ask: What kind of mind would we experience? The suttas often speak of such a mind as being “lucid,” a very apt English word since it means both “transparently clear” and “emanating light,” and if we have the benefit of both these senses, we will be able to see more directly and clearly, allowing a proper understanding of what we see.

7.2 In fact, this is exactly how the suttas describe the mind that experiences dhyana: “This mind, bhikkhus, is radiant but it is defiled by impurities that arrive (through the sense doors).”³² This is how the Commentaries understand this statement:

It is defiled by adventitious impurities [“arriving” at the sense-doors] such as covetousness (*āgantukehi abhijjhādīhi dosehi*). The “natural mind” (*pakati,mano*) is the *bhavaṅga,citta*,³³ which is undefiled. Just as clear water is tainted by (such colours as) blue and so on, flowing into it and becomes known as “blue water,” and so on, but not so the earlier clear water (before it was tainted by the colour) nor new (fresh) water.

In the same way, thought, too, becomes tainted by adventitious ills, such as covetousness and so on, but not the earlier *bhavaṅga,citta* nor a new thought (*navam cittam*). Hence, the Blessed One said,

³⁰ On the 2 possible path fruitions (non-return and arhathood), see SD 41.4 (2.2).

³¹ See Ency Bsm: Samatha & Vipassana (Analayo’s n).

³² A 1:10,11-13; according to AA 1:60,16 the “impurities” (*upakkilesā*) arrive at the moment of *javana*.

³³ Often tr as “life-continuum,” ie the underlying stream of consciousness that supervenes whenever active consciousness lapses, most notably in deep dreamless sleep. See A:ÑB 278 n13.

“This mind, bhikshus, is radiant, but it is defiled by adventitious impurities that arrive (through the sense-doors)” [A 1:10]. (DhA 1:23)³⁴

The Commentaries understand it to mean that the natural state of the mind (*pakati,mano*) is pure, still and bright, free from all impurities and unwholesome states.³⁵ The impurities are seen as being superimposed from outside. For the Theravada scholastics, this natural state of mind is called the “life-continuum” (*bhav’āṅga*, or more fully *bhav’āṅga,citta*), the state of the mind in deep, dreamless sleep.³⁶

7.3 The purpose of samadhi or mental concentration then is to “free the mind,” to experience this profound and boundless radiance that is the mind at its most natural state. Such a state is famously described in this well known parable for the fourth dhyana in **the Sāmañña,phala Sutta** (D 2):

...just as if a man were sitting covered from head to foot with a white cloth, so that there would be no part of his body to which the white cloth did not extend;
even so, the monk sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright mind. There is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded by pure, bright mind. (D 2,84/1:75 f), SD 8.10³⁷

7.4 As regards **freeing the mind**, it helps significantly to understand two important points here. Firstly, as instructed in **the Citta Hatthi,sāriputta Sutta** (A 6.60), even all the 4 form dhyanas, despite their boundless bliss and profound clarity, are mind-made and impermanent.³⁸ Secondly, that the defilements may not be destroyed at once, that is, they could be suppressed (*vikkhambhana*) momentarily or for a period, but effort must be made so that they are totally uprooted (*samuccheda*).³⁹ Dhyana, then, is not a goal in itself, but *a means*—and an effective and pleasant one—to calm and clear the mind, so as to prepare it for liberating wisdom and awakening.

8 The Sutta’s date

8.1 MONASTIC MODE OF ADDRESS. There are some helpful clues in the (Yuganaddha) Paṭipadā Sutta giving us an idea of its age. First of all, the Buddha is not mentioned at all, only Ānanda gives the instruction.⁴⁰ However, the fact that the vocative, *āvuso*, is used, may suggest that it refers to a time when the Buddha is still living. [8.2.2]

In §2, Ānanda addresses the assembled monks as *āvuso*, and they in turn respond similarly, addressing him as *āvuso*. This shows that while the Buddha is alive, there is *no* hierarchical mode of addressing one another amongst the monks. This new more monastic protocol was introduced by the sangha elders after the Buddha’s passing.

8.2 POSSIBLE DATE OF THE SUTTA

8.2.1 We know that in **the Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16), the Buddha gives this instruction:

Ānanda, now the monks address one another as “Āvuso” [Friend], but after my passing, they should not address one another so. Ānanda, the more junior monks should be addressed by the more senior monks by name, or by clan [gotra] or as “Āvuso.” The more senior monks should be addressed by the more junior monks as “Bhante” [Sir] or as “Āyasmā” [Venerable].

³⁴ See DhA 140,22-29; and *Viññāna*, SD 17.8a (4.5).

³⁵ Cousins parenthetically remarks that “One is almost tempted to refer to this as ‘the [Christian] Doctrine of Original Sinlessness.’” (1973:117). Actually, the proper term is “Original Righteousness”: see F L Cross (ed), *The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, NY: Oxford Univ Press, 1978:1010.

³⁶ Miln 299,11-301,6.

³⁷ Also at **Mahā Assa,pura S** (M 39,18/1:277,33-278,5), SD 10.13; **Mahā Sakul’udāyi S** (M 77,28/2:16,29-17,1), SD 49.5; **Kāya,gatā,sati S** (M 119,21/3:94,15-21), SD 12.27; (**Samādhi**) **Pañc’āṅgika S** (A 5.28,9/3:27,5-10), SD 33.13.

³⁸ A 6.60/3:394-397, SD 51.3.

³⁹ Ed Nm 17,11 f.

⁴⁰ Of course, this is a very short Aṅguttara sutta, which assumes our knowledge of the other 3 earlier Nikayas.

(D 16,6.2/2:154), SD 9

It is therefore likely that this Sutta was compiled soon after the Buddha's passing. Furthermore, the Mahā,parinibbāna Suta is a composite work, and we are not certain when this particular section on the Buddha's instruction regarding the usage of *āvuso* was inserted. But we can be sure that this must have been done *after* his passing.

8.2.2 The point is that the monastics were probably still using *āvuso* even not too long after the Buddha's passing. However, if the Buddha has himself given this instruction, Ānanda would have surely followed it. This is one hint suggesting that our Sutta could have occurred while the Buddha is still alive (in the absence of the Buddha).

8.2.3 There is another possibility. The new way of monastics addressing one another according to rank was a notion introduced by the sangha elders after the Buddha's passing through the compilation of the Mahā Parinibbāna Sutta (which was compiled well after the Buddha's passing).⁴¹ This instruction would then surely need some time to filter down to the monastics scattered all over ancient India. This also means that it is possible then that our Sutta could have taken place soon after the Buddha's passing (that is, during Ānanda's life-time).

Putting all this together, and considering the drift of the Sutta, we could surmise that it was probably taught either very late in the Buddha's ministry or soon after his passing. Either way, Ānanda was by then a mature and accomplished teacher.

The Discourse on the (Twin) Practice

A 4.170

1 Thus have I heard.

The 4 modes of meditation practice

At one time, the venerable Ānanda was staying in Ghosita's Monastery, near Kosambī.

2 There the venerable Ānanda addressed the monks, thus: "Avuso bhikshus!"⁴²
"Avuso," the monks answered the venerable Ānanda in assent.

3 The venerable Ānanda said this: [157]

"Avuso, whichever monk or nun declares before me that he or she has attained arhathood,⁴³ all of them have done so by 4 paths,⁴⁴ or by one or other amongst them. What are the four?"

(1) Calm first, then insight

3.2 (1) Here, avuso, a monk cultivates **calm first, then insight** [insight preceded by calm].⁴⁵

While he thus cultivates insight preceded by calm, the path arises⁴⁶ in him.

⁴¹ Mahā Parinibbāna S (D 16) @ SD 9 (2+3).

⁴² Be Ce Se *bhikkhave*; Ee *bhikkhavo*.

⁴³ "Has attained arhathood," Be Ce Ee Se *arahatta-p,pattim*; vl *arahatta-p,pattam*.

⁴⁴ Here [§3] and below [§6] A 2:157,2+26: Be Ce Se *maggehi*, but Ee *aṅgehi* (prob wr); Pm 2:92,10 also reads *maggehi*; PmA 3:584,24-25: *catūhi maggehīti upari vuccamānehi catūhi paṭipadā,maggehi, na ariya,maggehi*, "by 4 paths: by the 4 paths of practice spoken of above, not by the noble paths."

⁴⁵ *Samatha,pubb'āngamanī vipassanā*. This refers to the calm practitioner (*samatha,yānika*), one who first cultivates access concentration (*upacāra,samādhi*), the dhyanas or the formless attainments, and then cultivates insight (*vipassanā*). "Access concentration" is the concentration gained just before attaining dhyana. See MA 1:112.

⁴⁶ "The path arises in him," *tassa...maggo sañjayati*. Clearly here that "the path" (*magga*) has no technical meaning as the moment of only experiencing the supramundane path, as found in the Abhidhamma and Commentaries. It

Then he pursues, cultivates and develops that path,
and while he does so, the mental fetters⁴⁷ are abandoned and the latent tendencies⁴⁸ are destroyed.⁴⁹

(2) Insight first, then calm

4 (2) Furthermore, avuso, a monk cultivates **insight first, then calm** [calm preceded by insight].⁵⁰
While he thus cultivates calm preceded by insight, the path arises in him.
Then he pursues, cultivates and develops that path,
and while he does so, the mental fetters are abandoned and the latent tendencies are destroyed.

(3) Both calm and insight together

5 (3) Furthermore, avuso, a monk cultivates **both calm and insight together** [calm and insight coupled together].⁵¹
While he thus cultivates calm and insight coupled together, the path arises in him.
Then he pursues, cultivates and develops that path,
and while he does so, the mental fetters are abandoned and the latent tendencies are destroyed.

has “a more extended sense of a path of practice that is being developed over a period of time (which is in fact the connotation of *magga* in the early discourses)” (Analayo 2009z:816). This is confirmed by the foll passage [§3.4]. Comy however takes this as the first supramundane path (*lok’uttara,magga*) (MA 1:109), which says the Tīkā is the path of streamwinning (*sotāpatti,magga*), but adds that the meaning of this passage can only be understood by way of the mundane path (*lokiya,magga,vasena*) (MAṬ:Be 2:344; cf DAT 2:409). See Intro (1.2).

⁴⁷ The 10 fetters (*dasa samyojana*) are: (1) self-identity view (*sakkāya,ditṭhi*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rituals and vows (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*), (4) sensual lust (*kāma,rāga*), (5) aversion (*paṭigha*), (6) greed for form existence (*rūpa,rāga*), (7) greed for formless existence (*arūpa,rāga*), (8) conceit (*māna*), (9) restlessness (*uddhacca*), (10) ignorance (*avijjā*). See **Kīṭa,giri S** (M 70) @ SD 11.1 (5.1); (**Sekha**) **Uddesa S** (A 4.85), SD 3.3(2); also S 5:61; A 5:13; Vbh 377.

⁴⁸ **Latent tendencies** (*anusayā*), alt trs “underlying tendencies,” “latent dispositions.” There are 7 of them: (1) sensual desire (*kāma-rāga*); (2) aversion (*paṭigha*); (3) wrong view (*ditṭhi*); (4) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*); (5) conceit (*māna*); (6) desire for existence (*bhava,rāga*); (7) ignorance (*avijjā*). They are also listed in **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,2.3-12)/3:254, 282), **Cha,chakka S** (M 148,28/3:285), **Anusaya S** (A 7.11 & 12/4:8 f) and **Vibhaṅga** (Vbh 383). They are deeply embedded in our minds through past habitual acts and can only be uprooted on attaining the path. Wrong view and spiritual doubt are eliminated at streamwinning; sensual desire and aversion at non-return; conceit, attachment to existence and ignorance, only at arhathood. See Abhs 7.9: “The latent dispositions (*anusayā*) are defilements which ‘lie along with’ (*anusenti*) the mental process to which they belong, rising to the surface as obsessions whenever they meet with suitable conditions. The term ‘latent dispositions’ highlights the fact that the defilements are liable to arise so long as they have not been eradicated by the supramundane paths. Though all defilements are, in a sense, *anusayas*, the seven mentioned here are the most prominent.” (Abhs:B 268). See also Abhs:SR 172. The first 3 latent tendencies are mentioned in **Sall’atthana S** (S 36.6/4:207-210), SD 5.5. See also **Madhu,piṇḍika S** (M 18), SD 16.3 (5). For a more detailed study, see **Anusaya**, SD 31.3.

⁴⁹ Comys says that because there is no cultivation and arising of the supramundane path, lasting only a thought-moment (*lok’uttara,magga-k,khaṇe*, MA 1:109), he cultivates the preliminary mundane path (*pubba,bhāgiyo lokiya,maggo*) for attaining the supramundane paths. The fetters are then abandoned and the latent tendencies destroyed by the subsequent paths (*magga-p,paṭipāṭiyā pahīyanti byanti honti*) (MAṬ:Be 2:344).

⁵⁰ *Vipassanā,pubb’aṅgamam samatham*. This refers to a practitioner who naturally gains insight, with which he cultivates one-pointedness of the mind*—this is the insight practitioner (*vipassanā,yānika*) (MA 1:112). According to **the Paṭisambhidā,magga**, this second mode of meditation begins right away with the contemplation of the 3 characteristics. This is followed by the cultivating of “letting go” (*vossagga*), perhaps as a result of the detachment arising from insight (Pm 2:96). *On “one-pointedness of the mind” (*cittassa ekagatā*), see **Samadhi**, SD 33.1a (1.2).

⁵¹ *Samatha,vipassanā,yuga.naddham*. Here, as “twin-method practitioners,” we enter the 1st dhyana and emerging from it, apply insight to that experience, ie we review the 5 aggregates within the dhyana (form, feeling, perceptions, formations, consciousness) as being impermanent, subject to suffering and is non-self. Then we enter the 2nd dhyana, emerge and apply insight to it. We apply the twofold reflection to the remaining 2 dhyanas in the same manner until we attain the path of streamwinning, or higher.

(4) A mind seized by dharma-restlessness

6 (4) Furthermore, avuso, **a monk's mind is seized by dharma-restlessness.**⁵²

But there comes a time when his mind is⁵³ internally steadied, composed, unified and concentrated.

Then the path arises in him,

*and while he does so, the mental fetters are abandoned and the latent tendencies are destroyed.*⁵⁴

7 Avuso, whichever monk or nun declares before me that he (or she) has attained arhathood, they all⁵⁵ have done this by these 4 paths,⁵⁶ or by one or other amongst them.”

— evaṃ —

121224 130107 130727a 140212 150614p 170211

⁵² *Dhamm'uddhacca, viggahitaṃ mānasam hoti*: all MSS so ; only Ee reads *viggahītaṃ mānā*. See Intro (5.1).

⁵³ All MSS except Se read *hoti* here.

⁵⁴ For an explanation, see **Paṃsu, dhovaka S** (A 3.100a/1:253-256), SD 19.11: see above Intro (5.1.1.2).

⁵⁵ “They all...this,” all MSS *sabbo so* throughout, except here Se *sabboso*.

⁵⁶ On reading *maggehi* here, see above §3 n on “the 4 paths.”