

16

(Dasaka) Uttiya Sutta

The (Tens) Discourse on Uttiya | A 10.95¹
 Theme: How much of the world is liberated?
 Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

1 Which Uttiya?

1.0 The Pali canonical texts list at least 4 persons named Uttiya. All of them are arhats, but only the first three are monks, while the fourth is a layman. Here we put together the texts related to them to have a better idea of each of them.²

1.1 UTTIYA 1 or Uttika (of Sāvattihī) is the son of a Sāvattihī brahmin. When he comes of age, he renounces as a wanderer seeking “the death-free.” In his wanderings, he meets the Buddha teaching, and decides to join the order. However, because of lack of moral virtue, he is unable to attain his goal.

Seeing other monks who have attained their goal, he asks the Buddha for a brief teaching. The Buddha gives him a brief teaching which he uses for his practice. In the course of his practice, he falls ill, but anxious not to fail, he exerts all his effort and becomes an arhat.³

In the time of the past buddha Siddhattha,⁴ he was a crocodile in the river Canda, bhāgā. One day, seeing the Buddha wishing to cross the river, the crocodile offered him its back to sit on and took him across. After his death, he was king of the devas seven times, and a wheel-turner on earth thrice.⁵

This Uttiya is evidently his namesake in the Saṃyutta Nikāya. In **the (Kāma,guṇa) Uttiya Sutta** (S 45.30), in answer to his question, the Buddha explains the nature of the 5 cords of sensual pleasures, and the necessity of abandoning them.⁶

In **the (Arahatta) Uttiya Sutta** (S 47.16), he is recorded as asking the Buddha for a brief teaching. Having received it, he dwells in solitude to meditate on it, and in due course becomes an arhat.⁷

He is probably the same person as the wanderer (*paribbājaka*) Uttiya of **the (Dasaka) Uttiya Sutta** (A 10.95), where he is recorded as asking the Buddha various undetermined questions, and as helped by Ānanda to understand the real meaning and purpose of the Buddha’s answers.⁸

1.2 UTTIYA 2 (of Pāvā) is one of four friends, the others being Godhika, Subahu and Valliya. They are born at Pāvā as the sons of four Malla rajahs. They are close friends, and once go together on some mission to Kapila, vatthu. There they witness the Buddha’s twin wonder, and join the order becoming arhats in due course.

When they visit Rāja, gaha, the rajah Bimbi, sāra invites them to spend the rains there and builds for each of them a hut. However, he fails to put roofs on the huts. So the elders dwell in the huts unsheltered. On account of their virtue, it fails to rain for a long time. The king then realizes his neglect and at once has the huts thatched, plastered and painted. Then he holds a dedication festival and gives alms to the monks. The elders go into their huts and cultivate lovingkindness. The sky then darkens in the west and rain falls.

In the time of Siddhattha Buddha, the four were householders and friends. One of them gave the Buddha a ladleful of food; another prostrated before the Buddha and saluted him; the third gave him a handful

¹ The Pali text of the (Dasaka) Uttiya S (along with its commentarial notes) are found in Dines Andersen, *A Pali Reader*, vol 1 text & notes, 1901; repr New Delhi, 1979: 89 (ch 51) & 127 (nn). Download from <https://mywebspace.wisc.edu/jrblack/web/BU/PDF/andersen1.pdf>.

² For more details on these individuals along with their stories and teachings, see SD 47.11 Intro.

³ Tha 30; ThaA 1:95.

⁴ He is the 19th of the 29 buddhas in the Pali tradition, and no 9 from our own Gotama Buddha: see SD 36.2 (3.4)

⁵ Ap 1:79-80; ApA 348 f.

⁶ S 45.30/5:22 @ SD 91.1.

⁷ S 47.16/5:166 @ SD 47.11.

⁸ A 10.95/5:193-195 @ SD 44.16.

of flowers; and the fourth paid him homage with sumana flowers. In Kassapa Buddha's time, too, they were friends and joined the order together (Tha 51-54; ThaA 1:94 f).⁹

1.3 UTTIYA 3 (of Kapila,vatthu) is a Sakya. When the Buddha visits his kinsmen and shows them his powers, Uttiya is converted and renounces. One day, while on his alms-around in the village, he hears a woman singing and he is distracted. Restraining himself, he enters his dwelling, deeply agitated and spends the siesta seated, earnestly striving so that he attains arhathood (Tha 99; ThaA 1:215).

In the time of Sumedha Buddha, he was a householder and gave to the Buddha a bed, complete with canopy and rug. Twenty world-cycles ago he was thrice a king named Suvannābha. He is probably identical with **Pallanka Dāyaka** of the Apadāna (Ap 1:175).

1.4 UTTIYA 4 (of Kapila,vatthu). The Kathā,vatthu (Kvu 1:268) mentions a householder Uttiya who, along with the youth Yasa (*yasa kula,putta*) and brahmin youth Setu (*setu mānava*), as having attained arhathood while still living as laymen. The Kathā,vatthu does not tell us anything more except mentioning the fate of a lay person who attains arhathood, hinting that they need to renounce if they are to continue living.¹⁰

1.5 Here is a list of the suttas and verses related to those individuals named Uttiya, as mentioned above:

<u>Uttiya 1</u> of Sāvathī	(Kāma,guṇa) Uttiya Sutta	S 45.30/5:22	SD 91.1
	Uttiya Thera,gāthā 1	Tha 1.3.10/30	SD 47.11(3)
	(Arahatta) Uttiya Sutta	S 47.16/5:166	SD 47.11
	(Dasaka) Uttiya Sutta	A 10.95/5:193-195	SD 44.16
	Uttiya Thera Apadāna	Ap 3.8/169-179	SD 47.11(10)
<u>Uttiya 2</u> of Pāvā	Uttiya Thera,gāthā 2	Tha 1.6.4/51-54	SD 47.11(8)
<u>Uttiya 3</u> of Kapilavatthu	Uttiya Thera,gāthā 3	Tha 1.10.9/99	SD 47.11(9)
	Pallaṅka Dāyaka Thera Ap	Ap 14.10/1:175	SD 47.11(11)
<u>Uttiya 4</u> of Kapilavatthu	The houselord Uttiya	Kvu 1:268	SD 44.16 (12)

2 Sutta highlights

2.1 This short Sutta probably records the wanderer Uttiya's first meeting with the Buddha. The theme is straightforward: he asks the Buddha the notorious 10 questions on the undeclared theses (*dasa avyākata pañhā*). The Buddha of course simply replies to each that its thesis is “**undeclared or undetermined**” (*avyākata*) [§1].

2.2 Uttiya, like Māluṅkyā,putta,¹¹ is dissatisfied with the Buddha's answers. However, he does not directly challenge the Buddha, as Māluṅkyā,putta does, but is curious why the Buddha does not answer them [§2.1-2.2]. In reply, the Buddha says that he teaches through his “**direct knowledge**” (*abhiññā*), that is, personal realization and awakening, and that the Dharma which he teaches is for the sake of liberation (that is, not about speculating on such things as the 10 undeclared theses) [§2.3].

2.3 Uttiya then retorts with a strange question wondering whether on account of the Buddha's teaching, “**Is the whole world led out [liberated] by this, or only half of it, or a third of it?**” (*sabbo vā tena loko nīyati upaḍḍho vā ti,bhāgo vā'ti vadehi*)—to which the Buddha famously remains silent [§2.5]. It is possible that Uttiya is being sarcastic, because he feels that the Buddha has not answered “the supreme question regarding everything” [3].

It is possible that Uttiya is exasperated by the Buddha's silence, and asks the sarcastic question regarding how much of the world is saved by such a teaching. Of course, there is no answer to such a question. It might even be taken to be simply rhetorical (expressing disappointment). Hence, the Buddha does not answer. We can say that the Buddha is being patient with him and shows his silence of compassion.¹²

⁹ For their full verses, see SD 47.11 (4+5+6+7+) respectively.

¹⁰ On laymen arhats, see **Naḷaka,pāna S** (M 68), SD 37.4 (4). See SD 47.11 (11) + nn.

¹¹ **Cūḷa Māluṅkyā,putta S** (M 63), SD 5.8.

¹² See SD 44.1 (3.2).

2.4 Ānanda, sitting nearby, observes this whole dialogue, and noticing Uttiya’s satisfaction, decides to intercede before Uttiya entertains any wrong view, such as thinking that the Buddha is silent about the questions because he does not know the answer. This would of course be seriously detrimental to his own spiritual development.

Anyway, Ānanda is unable to read the Buddha’s mind, so that he does not really know the real reason for the Buddha’s silence. His main concern is that Uttiya’s disappointment does not go on to create bad karma in him, which would cut him off from benefitting further from the Dharma. Hence, he ventures to clarify the Buddha’s silence and wisdom to Uttiya.

2.5 THE PARABLE OF THE FORTIFIED FRONTIER CITY

2.5.1 Using the well known **parable of the fortified frontier city** [§3.3], Ānanda explains to Uttiya that while a lot of things can be known, some things are simply “undetermined” (that is, their questions are “wrongly put”), and these are things we would never “know” about (they are “unknowable,” having nothing to do with true knowledge). We only need just a bit of right knowledge for the purpose of liberation [§3.4], not with speculations and statistics [§3.5].

2.5.2 The Buddha, however, knows “all” (*sabba*), just as a royal frontier city is surrounded by a strong wall. Indeed, the Buddha is the first and only one who fully understands the nature of such questions—like the fortress city’s single gateway [§3.3]. He fully and clearly knows that all those beings who are liberated from the world, do so through spiritual wisdom, here defined as overcoming the 5 mental hindrances, and cultivating the 4 satipatthanas and the 7 awakening-factors [§3.6].

2.6 Finally, Ānanda explains that the Buddha is silent because Uttiya has not only asked the “wrong questions” (about the undeclared theses), but also repeated his question in a different form, so that it would be tedious for both questioner and respondent, especially because they would lead nowhere. [§3.7]

2.7 The Sutta seems to end abruptly: we do not know how Uttiya responds to Ānanda’s explanations. However, it is clear that the Buddha’s silence of compassion highlights the message to Uttiya that the Buddha does not entertain speculative views, but relies on direct knowledge, and trains his followers to do the same. In fact, Uttiya seems to get this message, for we have at least two other suttas recording his meeting the Buddha again, and in due course attaining arhathood.

The (Kāma,guṇa) Uttiya Sutta (S 45.30) records his asking the Buddha a more practical question—about the 5 cords of sense-pleasures. The Sutta presents him as a more tractable person, and the Buddha praises him for asking his question this time, and points out the noble eightfold path to him.¹³ Apparently, by this time, Uttiya has already gone forth in the order [1].

The (Arahatta) Uttiya Sutta (S 47.16) records, in close parallel with **the (Arahatta) Māluṅkyā-putta Sutta** (S 47.15) which precedes it, how Uttiya requests a brief teaching for his solitary meditation. Following the Buddha’s instructions, he practises and, in due course, becomes an arhat.¹⁴

— — —

The (Tens) Discourse to Uttiya

A 10.95

1 Then the wanderer Uttiya approached the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him. When this courteous and friendly exchange was concluded, the wanderer Uttiya sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, the wanderer Uttiya said this to the Blessed One:

¹³ S 45.30/5:22 @ SD 91.1.

¹⁴ S 47.16/5:166 @ SD 47.11.

The 10 undeclared questions¹⁵

- (1) “What now, master Gotama, is the world eternal—only this is true, all else false?”
 “Uttiya, it has not been declared by me, ‘The world is eternal—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (2) “What then, master Gotama, is the world not eternal—only this is true, all else false?”
 “Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘The world is not eternal—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (3) “What then, master Gotama, is the world finite—only this is true, all else false?”
 “Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘The world is finite—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (4) “What then, master Gotama, is the world infinite—only this is true, all else false?”
 “Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘The world is infinite—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (5) “What then, master Gotama, are the soul and the body identical—only this is true, all else false?”
 “Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘The soul and the body identical—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (6) “What then, master Gotama, are the soul and the body different—only this is true, all else false?”
 “Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘The soul and the body are different—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (7) “What then, master Gotama, does a tathagata¹⁶ [a saint] exist after death—only this is true, all else false?”
 “Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘A tathagata [A saint] exists after death—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (8) “What then, master Gotama, does a tathagata not exist after death—only this is true, all else false?”
 “Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘A tathagata does not exist after death—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (9) “What then, master Gotama, does a tathagata both exist and not exist after death—only this is true, all else false?”
 “Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘A tathagata both exists and not exist after death—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (10) “What then, master Gotama, does a tathagata neither exist nor not exist after death—only this is true, all else false?”
 “Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘A tathagata neither exists nor not exist after death—only this is true, all else false.’”

Uttiya’s refrain: Why is the Buddha silent?

- 2 (1) “Why is it, master Gotama, when being asked thus,
 ‘What now, master Gotama, is the world eternal—only this is true, all else false?’ you say,
 ‘Uttiya, it has not been declared by me, ‘The world is eternal—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (2) When being asked thus, ‘What then, master Gotama, is the world not eternal—only this is true, all else false?’ you say,
 ‘Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘The world is not eternal—only this is true, all else false.’”
- (3) When being asked thus, ‘What then, master Gotama, is the world finite—only this is true, all else false?’

¹⁵ These 10 undeclared questions (*dasa avyākata pañhā*) are discussed in **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9,25-27/1:187 f) & SD 7.14 (3); **Cūḷa Māluṅkyāputta Sutta** (M 63 *passim*/1:426-437), SD 5.8; **Nānā Titthiya S 1** (U 6.4/67), SD 401.14; also **Avyākata Saṃyutta** (S 10/4:374-403). For more related suttas, see SD 7.14 (3).

¹⁶ On *tathāgata* as “saint,” see SD 5.8 (3). For a detailed discussion on *tathāgata*, see Toshiichi ENDO, *Buddha in Theravada Buddhism*, 1997:195-206 (ch 5), 305.

You say, ‘Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘The world is finite—only this is true, all else false.’

(4) When being asked thus, ‘What then, master Gotama, is the world infinite—only this is true, all else false?’

You say, ‘Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘The world is infinite—only this is true, all else false.’

(5) ‘What then, master Gotama, are the soul and the body identical—only this is true, all else false?’

‘Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘The soul and the body are identical—only this is true, all else false.’

(6) When being asked thus, ‘What then, master Gotama, are the soul and the body different—only this is true, all else false?’

You say, ‘Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘The soul and the body are different—only this is true, all else false.’

(7) When being asked thus, ‘What then, master Gotama, does a tathagata [a saint] exist after death—only this is true, all else false?’

You say, ‘Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘A tathagata [A saint] exists after death—only this is true, all else false.’

(8) When being asked thus, ‘What then, master Gotama, does a tathagata not exist after death—only this is true, all else false?’

You say, ‘Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘A tathagata does not exist after death—only this is true, all else false.’

(9) When being asked thus, ‘What then, master Gotama, does a tathagata both exist and not exist after death—only this is true, all else false?’

You say, ‘Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘A tathagata both exists and not exist after death—only this is true, all else false.’

(10) When being asked thus, ‘What then, master Gotama, does a tathagata neither exist nor not exist after death—only this is true, all else false?’ [194]

You say, ‘Uttiya, it has not been declared so, too, by me, ‘A tathagata neither exists nor not exist after death—only this is true, all else false.’

2.2 What, then, has been declared by master Gotama?’¹⁷

What the Buddha has declared

2.3 “Uttiya, through direct knowledge, I show the Dharma to my disciples, for the purification of beings, for the overcoming of sorrow and lamentation, for the passing away of pain and displeasure, for the gaining of rightness, for the realization of nirvana.”¹⁸

2.4 “But when master Gotama, through direct knowledge, shows the Dharma to his disciples, for the purification of beings, for the overcoming of sorrow and lamentation, for the passing away of pain and displeasure, for the gaining of rightness, for the realization of nirvana,

2.5 is the whole world led out [liberated] by this, or only¹⁹ half of it, or a third of it?”²⁰

¹⁷ *Atha kiñcarahi bhotā gotamena vyākatan’ti.*

¹⁸ *Abhiññāya kho ahaṃ uttiya sāvakanāṃ dhammaṃ desemi sattānaṃ visuddhiyā soka, paridevānaṃ samatikkamāya dukkha, domanassānaṃ atthaṅgamāya ñāyassa adhiḅgamāya nibbānassa sacchikiriyāyāti.*

¹⁹ Reading *sabbo* as *sabbo* ‘va, ie *sabbo* + *eva*.

²⁰ *Sabbo vā* [Be (Ka) *sabbo ca*] *tena loko nīyati* [Ce *nīyissati*, Se *niyyāssati*, Ee *niyyissati*] *upaḍḍho vā ti, bhāgo vā tianda vadehi*. **Nīyati** (Skt *nīyati*, passive present of *nayati*, *neti*. 1 “he leads, guides, takes away (in marriage), carries off”) to be led or guided, to go, to be moved (S 1:39, *cittena nīyati loko*); Dh 175; Pv 1.11.1 (= *vahīyati*, PvA 56); J 1:264 (prp *nīyamāna*); PvA 4 (id); DhA 3:177; Sdhp 292, 302. 2 “he finds out, ascertains, determines,” S 2:-58,5; Dh 256; Vism 643,26*. Also spelt *niyyati* at Sn 851; Nm 1.223 (= *yāyati*, *vuyhati*), 395. Comys does not seem to differentiate btw *niyyati* < *nīyate* (the pass of √NĪ, “to lead” and *niyyati* < *niryati*, “to go out” (see Sn:N 354 n851). See Intro (2.3).

When this was said, the Blessed One was silent.²¹

Ānanda's intercession

3 Then it occurred to the venerable Ānanda,

“Let not the wanderer Uttiya fall into any bad false view, thinking thus, ‘Indeed, when I asked the recluse Gotama the supreme question regarding everything,²² he sets it aside, does not answer it. Is he faltering?’ This would not be good but painful for the wanderer Uttiya for a long time.”²³

3.2 Then the venerable Ānanda said this to the wanderer Uttiya,

“In that case, avuso Uttiya, let me give a parable. For, some of the wise here understand the meaning of what is said by way of a parable.”²⁴

The parable of the fortified frontier city

3.3 Suppose, avuso Uttiya, there were a royal frontier city,²⁵ with strong bastions and a strong encircling wall with an archway that has a single gateway,²⁶ and a moat around it.²⁷

The gate-keeper there, clever, experienced and wise, keeps out strangers [those whom he knows not], [195] lets in only those whom he knows.²⁸ He patrols along the pathway all around the city so that he would see no cracks or cavities in the wall, even large enough for a cat to pass through.²⁹

²¹ Comy explains the Buddha's silence as arising from Uttiya's "having asked about the whole world from a different angle, remaining stuck in the misunderstanding that there is a 'being'" (*sattūpaladdhiyaṃ yeva thatvā aññen' - ākārena pucchatīti dasseti*, AA 5:66). On the silence of compassion, see SD 44.1 (3.2.3).

²² "The supreme question regarding everything," *sabba, sāmukkaṃsikaṃ...pañham*. Comy explains that Uttiya thinks that he has "asked the supreme of questions that are asked" (*sabba, pucchānaṃ uttama, pucchāṃ pucchito*, AA 5:65), but without elaborating. Andersen has "most excellent, most essential" (*A Pali Glossary*, 1901:268). The term *sāmukkaṃsika* (BHS *sāmutkarṣikī*), "to extol, praise" (Sn 132, 438; M 1:498); usu appears as *buddhānaṃ ~ā dhamma, desanā*, "a Dharma-teaching peculiar to the Buddhas," ie, only the Buddhas discover, formulate and teach them: V 1:16, 18, 2:156; D 1:110, 148; M 1:380; A 3:184, 4:186, 5:194; DA 1:277 (explained) = AA 4:101 (ad A 4:186); MA 3:92,9 = UA 283,13: Comys resolve it as *sāmaṃ ukkaṃsika*, "drawn up or raised by oneself"; ThaA 137; PvA 38, 195; VvA 50. Only once it appears with *nāna* (DhsA 9). The form *sāmukkaṃsa* can mean either "(n) an extract" or "(adj) exalted," as in *vinaya, sāmukkaṃsā*: see SD 1.1 (8.2). On *sabba* as "the all," see **Sabba S** (S 35.23). SD 7.1. It is difficult to determine what Ānanda (speaking for Uttiya) exactly means by the term here, and our tr is at best conjectural.

²³ *Mā h' evaṃ kho uttiyo paribbājako pāpakam diṭṭhi, gataṃ paṭilabhi 'sabba, sāmukkaṃsikaṃ vata me samaṇo gotamo pañham puṭṭho samsādeti, no vissajjeti, na nūna visahatīti, tad-assa uttiyassa paribbājakassa dīgha, rattam ahitāya dukkhāyāti*. Comy says that Ānanda is concerned that Uttiya might think that the Buddha "is not up to it, and so is unable to answer" (*nūna na visahati na sakkoti vissajjetun' ti*), and so would fall into a bad wrong view (AA 5:65).

²⁴ *Tena h'āvuso uttiya upamaṃ te karissāmi, upamāya m' idhekacce viññū purisā bhāsītassa attham ājānanti: Pāyāsi S* (D 23/3:324, 330, 335, 337, 339, 342, 347, 348, 349), SD 39.4; **Uttara Vipatti S** (A 8.8/4:163), SD 73.9; (**Dasaka**) **Uttiya S** (A 10.95/5:194), SD 44.16. Cf ... *Upamāya p' idh' ekacce...: S 41.1.8/4:282. Ten'āvuso [Tena h'āvuso] upamaṃ te karissāmi...: M 24.14/1:148, 43.22/1:295, 76.52/1:523 (Tena hi sandaka upamaṃ te...), 127.16/3:151 (Tena āvuso kaccāna upamaṃ te ...); S 12.67.25/2:114. Elsewhere, the Buddha says, "Bhikkhus, I have made up this parable to make a point, and the meaning here is this" (*upamā kho my-āyaṃ, bhikkhave, katā atthassa viññāpanāya, ayaṃ c' ev' ettha attho*): S 22.84/3:108, 35.238/4:174, 35.245/4:194, 47.20/5:170 (qu J 1:394).*

²⁵ Parables of the city are popular in early Buddhism. See eg **Nagara S** (S 12.65) @ SD 14.2; **Kimśuka S** (S 35.-204/4:194 f), see SD 2.17 (8).

²⁶ Comy highlights this point: this single gateway (*eka, dvora*) refers to the Buddha's unparalleled wisdom, unlike those of others which are uncertain and unsecure like many gateways of a way. (AA 5:66)

²⁷ *Seyyathā pi āvuso Uttiya rañño paccantimam nagaram daḥ' uddāpam [Ce Ee; Be daḥ' uddhāpam] daḥa, pākāra, toranam eka, dvāram.*

²⁸ *Tatr'assa dovāriko paṇḍito vyatto medhāvī aññātānam nivāretā nātānam pavesetā.*

3.4 Now, he might not have such a knowledge, ‘So many people have entered or left the city.’
But here he knows this much, ‘Whichever large creatures that enter this city or leave it, all of them
have to enter or leave by this gateway.’³⁰

3.5 Even so, avuso Uttiya, the Tathagata is unconcerned³¹ whether the whole world is led out [liberated] by this, or only half of it, or a third of it.

3.6 But here the Tathagata thinks thus,

‘Whoever had been led out of [liberated from] the world, or are being led out, or will be led out³²—
they all have abandoned the 5 mental hindrances, the mental impurities that weaken wisdom,³³
their minds have been well established in the 4 focuses of mindfulness,³⁴ and
they have truly cultivated the 7 awakening-factors³⁵—

thus they had been led out of [liberated from] the world, or are being led out, or will be led out.’³⁶

3.7 Avuso Uttiya, you asked the Blessed One the very same question which you have already asked, only that you have put it to the Blessed One in another way—hence, the Blessed One did not answer you.’³⁷

— evaṃ —

140122 140123 141210e&r

²⁹ *So tassa nagarassa samantā anupariyāya, pathaṃ anukkamati, anupariyāya, pathaṃ anukkamamāno na passeyya pākāra, sandhiṃ vā pākāra, vivaraṃ vā antamaso biḷāra, nikkhamana, mattam pi.* For an application of this to meditation, see **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16,1.17/2:83), SD 9 = **Nālandā S** (S 47.12,8/5:160), SD 12.18.

³⁰ *Atha kho khv-assa evam ettha hoti “ye kho keci oḷārikā pāṇā imaṃ nagaraṃ pavisanti vā nikkhamanti vā, sabbe te iminā dvārena pavisanti vā nikkhamanti vā ’ti.* This sentence, the parable’s key-point, is found only here. It is not, eg, in the parable at **Mahā, parinibbāna S** (D 16,1.17/2:83), SD 9 = **Nālandā S** (S 47.12,8/5:160), SD 12.18.

³¹ *Evam evaṃ kho āvuso uttiya na tathāgatassa evaṃ ussukkaṃ hoti.*

³² *Ye kho keci lokamhā nīyimsu vā nīyanti vā nīyissanti vā.*

³³ On the 5 mental hindrances (*pañca nīvaraṇā*), see **Nīvaraṇa**, SD 32.1.

³⁴ On the 5 focuses of mindfulness (*catu satipaṭṭhāna*), see SD 13.1.

³⁵ On the 7 awakening-factors (*satta bojjaṅga*), see **(Bojjaṅga) Sila S**, SD 10.15.

³⁶ From “They all have abandoned...,” *sabbe te pañca nīvaraṇe pahāya cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalīkaṇe, catūsu satipaṭṭhānesu suppaṭiṭṭhita, citta, satta bojjaṅge yathābhūtaṃ bhāvetvā. Evam ete* [Be (Ka) *evam etena*] *lokamhā nīyimsu vā nīyanti vā nīyissanti vā ’ti.* See Intro (2.5)

³⁷ *Yad-eva kho tvaṃ* [Be (Ka) *yad-eva khv-ettha*] *āvuso uttiya bhagavantaṃ pañhaṃ* [Be (Ka) *Se maṃ pañhaṃ*] *apucchi, tad-ev’etaṃ pañhaṃ bhagavantaṃ aññena pariyaṇena apucchi, tasmā te taṃ bhagavā na vyākāsīti.*