

# 15

## (Sāriputta) Nirodha Sutta

The (Sāriputta) Discourse on Cessation | A 5.166  
Theme: How a quarrelsome monk should be dealt with  
Translated by Piya Tan ©2014

### 1 Sutta summary and significance

**1.1 The (Sāriputta) Nirodha Sutta** (A 5.166) has three interlinked themes, one social, the doctrinal, and the spiritual. The social theme reflects the difficulties that a Dharma teacher may face, such as being harassed by a dense and presumptuous member of the audience, with a sub-theme of fellowship [2.1]. The doctrinal theme is the set of 5 qualities of a worthy elder monk [§§30, 39]. And the spiritual theme is that of the attaining of cessation by non-returners and arhats [§31].

**1.2** The Sutta opens with Sāriputta teaching a congregation of monks, presumably including Ānanda and Upavāṇa. Sāriputta teaches that it is possible for a monk who is accomplished in the 3 trainings to attain the cessation of perception and feeling (or, simply “cessation”) [2.2], that is, attain arhathood or non-return [§2]. If such a person does not attain arhat in this life, then he would be reborn in the Pure Abodes [§§3 etc, 14 etc, 31], as a non-returner, and there be able to attain cessation [§3]

**1.3** However, the monk Udāyī [3], hearing the term “mind-made,” thinks that it should be the formless world, where no one is able to attain cessation [§27]. So he rudely contradicts Sāriputta’s teaching thrice successively [§§4-11]. Hoping that Udāyī would change his mind before the Buddha, Sāriputta and the congregation approach the Buddha [§§12-13], and there again Sāriputta repeats this same teaching, and again Udāyī contradicts him thrice [§14-23].

**1.4** Sāriputta then decides to stop teaching because no other monk stands up for him [§24], and to simply remain silent [§25].

**1.5** The Buddha then asks Udāyī what he understands by the term “mind-made host” (*mano,maya kāya*),<sup>1</sup> and he replies that they are the formless devas, made of subtle consciousness [§27], and is reprimanded by the Buddha for his wrong view [§28].

Then the Buddha chides Ānanda, “the treasurer of the Dharma” and Sāriputta close friend (*piya,sahaya*), for not coming to Sāriputta’s aid [§29], and goes on to address the monks, firstly to declares Sāriputta’s 5 worthy qualities [§30], and secondly, to affirm Sāriputta’s teaching [§31]. Then, he retires to his quarters [§32].

**1.6** Then, Ānanda approaches Upavāṇa [§33], confesses his lapse [§34], and knowing the Buddha well enough, tells Upavāṇa that the Buddha, after his evening solitary retreat, will raise the matter again and question Upavāṇa [§35].

**1.7** True enough, when the Buddha, after his solitary retreat, questions Upavāṇa in the service-hall [§36], on the qualities of an elder monk that makes him worthy of respect [§37]. Upavāṇa repeats the Buddha’s teaching on the 5 worthy qualities, giving them in detail [§§38-40] on the 5 worthy qualities of an elder monk [§30]. He earns the Buddha’s praise [§40].

**1.8** At the Sutta’s close, the Buddha indirectly chides Udāyī, highlighting his unpleasant personality [§41]. The significance here is not that he is unpleasant-looking, but that he has an unpleasant personality [§42]. Obliquely, this admonition implies that even if we are not Dharma teachers, we should at least give them due respect, especially when they are worthy elder monastics [§43].

### 2 Sutta highlights

#### **2.1 THE HUMAN SIDE**

**2.1.1 A Dharma teacher does not fret.** The (Sāriputta) Nirodha Sutta (A 5.166) is, amongst other things, a touching record of the human sides of unawakened monks during the Buddha’s own time, and his response to them. Sāriputta gives a deep teaching on cessation, a state that only arhats and non-returners are able to attain [§27; 2.2]. An ignorant but presumptuous monk, Udāyī, misunderstanding what is

<sup>1</sup> This explanatory phrase from Comy (AA 3:298).

taught, simply contradicts Sāriputta [§§4-11], and no one in the congregation intercedes on Sāriputta's behalf. Again the same happens even when the congregation is before the Buddha [§§14-23]. Sāriputta, calmly noting the situation decides to remain silent [§25] as he has done his best.

The Buddha, of course, notices this and responds [2.1.2]. What's interesting here is that Sāriputta does not refer the matter directly to the Buddha, but only brings the congregation before the Buddha, and Sāriputta himself continues with the same teaching. This attitude is highly significant as Sāriputta, in another way, is acting on behalf of all Dharma teachers, especially those in our own time, who have no Buddha or Dharma authority to turn to, and when no one intercedes on our behalf.

The lesson here is that no Dharma teacher should fret when the true Dharma that he teaches is rejected by others. Those who reject the Dharma do so for various reasons, often unknown even to them. In this case, we have the ignorant and presumptuous Udāyī, who instead of questioning Sāriputta further, jumps into his own wrong conclusions, and disrespectfully contradicts Sāriputta, a worthy elder monk.

**2.1.2 The Buddha's response.** After noting the significance of the occasion, the Buddha first questions Udāyī to discover the reason for his conduct. When asked on what he understands by "mind-made host" (*mano, maya kāya*) [§26], he wrongly says that it refers to the "formless devas" who are made of subtle consciousness (*saññā, maya*) [§27], and is chided by the Buddha for his wrong view [§28].

It is interesting here that the Buddha, instead of correcting Udāyī's wrong view, goes on to point out how a worthy elder monk (or any worthy Dharma teacher, for that matter) should be shown respect, especially when the Dharma is being taught. On the other hand, this teaching on cessation is probably well known enough as not to warrant any elaboration on that occasion. Moreover, the really pressing issue at that moment is that of Udāyī's presumptuousness that needs to be addressed and corrected, especially for our sakes.

### **2.1.3 Ānanda's responses**

#### 2.1.3.1 The Buddha sternly chides Ānanda:

"Ānanda, how can you just look on as an elder monk is being harassed?  
Is there no compassion, Ānanda, for an elder monk who is being harassed?" [§29]

The Buddha's response to the situation here gives us a wonderful opportunity to see the remarkably "human" (or compassionate) side of the Buddha in contrast to unremarkable human failings on the side of Udāyī and Ānanda. Instead of reprimanding the congregation (probably comprising junior monks), the Buddha instead chides Ānanda. This, explains the Commentary, is because Ānanda is "the Treasurer of the Dharma" (*dharmā, bhaṇḍāgārika*), whose task is to prevent or deal with such talk (*evaṃ vadanto paṭibāhitum bhāro*), and also that he is Sāriputta's close friend (*piya, sahāya*) (AA 3:298).

2.1.3.2 The Commentary paraphrases the Buddha's reprimand as follows: "This the import here, 'Ānanda, how can you look on as an elder monk is being harassed? You should have thought: 'I cannot suffer this (person),' or 'I will not endure this,' or 'I will not bear this.'"<sup>2</sup> On the other hand, we should wonder, too, why Ānanda, or anyone in the congregation, does not speak up or intervene.

Firstly, it is possibly because of Udāyī's old age (he has become a monk when he is very old) [3.3]. Secondly, Ānanda, still only a streamwinner, at this stage, still does not know what "cessation" (*nirodha*) really means, and so does not presume (unlike Udāyī) to intervene. However, we should understand that Ānanda is clearly sensitive to the feelings of others, and probably is quite concerned inwardly but does not show it [2.1.3.3].

2.1.3.3 Ānanda is recorded as being aware of his lapse, and feels bad about it. He tells Upavāṇa, "Here, avuso Upavāṇa, they were harassing other elder monks, (but) we did not question them." [§34]. Here "them" could refer either to the harassers or to the harassed teachers. In the case of the harasser, he should have been questioned why he is behaving so. If it the teacher, then he should be asked for clarification on his teaching.

<sup>2</sup> *Ayañ h'eth'attho: ānanda tumhe theram bhikkhum vihethiyamānam ajjupekkhatha, na vo etaṃ marisayāmi na sahāmi nādhivāsemīti.* (AA 3:298)

2.1.3.4 Ānanda then makes a dramatic confession, “Right now, I’ve fallen into apprehension [fearfulness]!” (*Idān’eva amhākaṃ sārājjaṃ okkantān’ti*) [§35]. We learn a valuable lesson here: Ānanda admits to lacking in moral courage or timidity (*sārājja*),<sup>3</sup> which is the closest of “Buddhist” emotions to the theistic conception of guilt (that is, falling short of the expectations of a higher authority or external power).

**The Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16) records how Ānanda is traumatized at the prospect of the Buddha’s passing away:

Bhante, I have seen the Blessed One in comfort, and I have seen the Blessed One enduring it. And, bhante, my body has become weak [unwieldy] as if drugged [drunk].<sup>4</sup> I’m disoriented and things are unclear to me as a result of the Blessed One’s illness.<sup>5</sup> (D 16,2.24), SD 9

Ānanda expresses the same sentiments at Sāriputta’s parinirvana, as recorded in **the Cunda (Samaṇ’-uddesa) Sutta** (S 47.13/5:162), and reflected in his **Thera,gāthā**:

All the quarters have become dim; the teachings are unclear to me.  
My spiritual friend has gone, and everything is cast in darkness. (Tha 1034)

The old ones have passed away. I do not get on with the new ones.  
Today I meditate all alone, like a bird gone to its nest. (Tha 1036)

2.1.3.5 Here, “**moral courage**” refers to an active compassion expeditiously shown towards a difficult person or situation, without any fear or favour. This is a natural interaction between compassion and wisdom, expressed as an effort to help or heal others, or, at least, declare what is really wrong so that it is not misconstrued otherwise.

By remaining silent, Ānanda (and the rest of the congregation) effectively become part of the problem. But why is Ānanda singled out, as it were, while the congregation is not chided at all? Although the Commentary hints at a lapse in performing his duty as Treasurer of the Dharma to help Sāriputta, who is declared to be “the General of the Dharma” (*dhamma,senāpati*).<sup>6</sup> These are late terms, where the roles reflect a more organized and settled monastic Buddhism.

The vital point here is that Ānanda is only a streamwinner. Hence, he has not overcome the subtler emotion of restlessness (*uddhacca*),<sup>7</sup> which is uprooted only in the arhat. In other words, we need not be “perfect” (like an arhat) as streamwinners. Being a streamwinner is the beginning of the “sure path” to awakening; we are, then, no more “outsiders” (*bahirika*)<sup>8</sup> to the noble eightfold path. No matter what happens (or does not), we will somehow progress spiritually as streamwinners.

As such, it is vitally urgent that we be courageous enough to aspire to at least attain streamwinning in this life itself. As **the (Anicca) Cakkhu Sutta** (S 25.1), and the other 9 suttas of the Okkanta Saṃyutta (S 25) declare, if we practise the perception of impermanence, whether with faith or with wisdom, we are assured of streamwinning in this life itself, if not surely at the moment of passing away. It begins with our thought, “I have enough of the frivolities and suffering of the world!”<sup>9</sup>

**2.2 CESSATION OF PERCEPTION AND FEELING.** The cessation of perception and feeling (*saññā,vedāyita,nirodha*), or briefly, attainment of cessation (*nirodha,samāpatti*), or contextually, simply “cessa-

<sup>3</sup> On *sārājja*, see **Sārājja S** (A 5.171), SD 84.3; SD 28.9a (3).

<sup>4</sup> “My body...is as if drugged,” *me...madhuraka,jāto viya kāyo*: see **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,2.24) n on “as if drugged,” SD 9.

<sup>5</sup> *Disā’pi me na pakkhāyanti, dhammā pi maṃ na paṭibhanti bhagavato gelaññena*: **D 16.2.24/2:99**; **S 22.84/3:106 f, 47.9/5:153, 47.13/5:162**; **A 5.56/3:70 f** (*madhuraka c’eva kāya*); also UA 246. See also S:W 3:90 n2 & S:B 1078 n149. On “things are unclear to me,” *dhammā pi maṃ na paṭibhanti*, cf A 5.56/3:69. For a psychological expl on Ānanda’s reaction, see **Udakūpama S** (A 7.15), SD 28.6 (1.2.5).

<sup>6</sup> U 17; Tha 1083; Ap 1:29; Miln 420; DA 2:551; MA 2:222; SA 3:216; DhA 2:74; UA 246; VvA 64.

<sup>7</sup> On restlessness (*uddhacca*), see SD 32.7 (2.1).

<sup>8</sup> On “outsiders” (*bahiraka*), see **(Sotāpanna) Nandiya S** (S 55.40), SD 47.1 (1.1.2, 1.2.2).

<sup>9</sup> See **(Anicca) Cakkhu S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7; **Entering the stream**, SD 3.3.

tion” (*nirodha*) is synonymous with arhathood or non-return. The necessary preconditions to the attainment of cessation are the perfect mastery of all the 8 dhyanas (the 4 form dhyanas and the 4 formless dhyanas) as well as the previous attainment of non-return or arhathood. In other words, only arhats or non-returners are able to attain the state of cessation.<sup>10</sup>

The Commentaries say that this state may last for 7 days or even longer.<sup>11</sup> Immediately at the arising of the state, however, there arises in the non-returner, the fruition of non-return (*anāgāmi, phala*), and in the arhat, the fruition of arhathood (*arahatta, phala*) (PmA 1:41, 321). On emerging from cessation, they experience the fruit of their respective attainments (Vism 708).<sup>12</sup>

**2.3 THE PURE ABODES** (*suddh’āvāsa*) are the highest of the form realms (that is, they are in the 4<sup>th</sup> dhyana), and are inhabited only by non-returners.<sup>13</sup> Here, in the (Sāriputta) Nirodha Sutta, the brahmas (*brahmā*, as they are often called, since they are spiritually higher than the devas) are described as a “mind-made host of devas” (*mano, maya, kāya deva*) who have transcended taking solid food. In other words, they are not of the sense-world, comprising beings who depend on the 5 physical senses, and some kind of solid food.

The Pure Abodes actually comprises the 5 highest heavens of the form world (*rūpa, loka*). The non-returners who live out their last birth there to become arhats and attain nirvana. These worlds are known as Āviha (“Non-declining”), Ātappa (“Unworried”), Sudassā (“Clearly Visible”), Sudassī (“Clear-visioned”) and Akaniṭṭhā (“Highest”).<sup>14</sup>

The Pure Abodes are not regarded as “stations for consciousness” because they are inhabited by only non-returners (*anāgāmi*) who live out their last births to become arhats and attain nirvana. In other words, these state are no more “stations” or karmic supports for the consciousnesses of the non-returners once they attain arhathood. Even the Bodhisattva (the Buddha-to-be) is not ever reborn here (as he is not yet a non-returner!).

These planes are like the “camping-ground” (*khandha, vara-t, thāna*) for the Blessed One who, after he has set in motion the Dharma Wheel, often abides there in his meditation. They are not rebirth planes, but meditative states. As such, they are not assigned as a station of consciousness nor as an abode of beings, that is, as a karmic state for rebirth.<sup>15</sup>

## 2.4 THE INTERLOCUTORS

**2.4.1** The Sutta open with Sāriputta giving a teaching [§§1-3]. Then, the monk Udāyī thrice contradicts him [§§4-11], and again before the Buddha himself, he contradicts Sāriputta again as before [§§12-23]. The Buddha then chides Ānanda for not interceding [§29]. Ānanda then speaks with Upavāna [§33]. And in the background of this Dharma drama, is, of course, the congregation of monks and perhaps others, too (perhaps nuns, laymen and laywomen).

We will discuss Udāyī at some length below [3]. Since he is from Kapila, vatthu, it is likely that he joined the order quite early in the ministry, but probably only after unawakened candidates were allowed to be admitted by the sangha itself. This would probably be late in the first period,<sup>16</sup> but before the 20<sup>th</sup> year, which was when Ānanda became the Buddha’s personal attendant (ThaA 2:56 f).

Furthermore, the formulation of a set of worthy qualities of an elder monk suggests that there were a significant number of younger monks who needed to be constantly trained and disciplined. Putting it all together, we can hazard a surmise that the (Sariputta) Nirodha Sutta records an event that occurred within the middle two to three decades of the ministry.

<sup>10</sup> A 5.166/ 3:193 f; Vism 23.18/702, 23.49/708.

<sup>11</sup> MA 1:125, 152; AA 1:152; DhA 1:109; BA 163.

<sup>12</sup> **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,42) n, SD 1.11 (4.1); **Mahā Vedalla S** (M 43.25/1:296) + SD 30.2 (4); **Cūla Vedalla S** (M 44,16-21/1:301 f) + SD 40a.9 (2.5); **Sappurisa S** (M 113), SD 23.7 (2). Cf **Animitta Ceto, samādhi Pañha S** (S 40.9/4:268 f), SD 24.19 (4.2). On the differences btw cessation and death, see SD 33.6 (3.5).

<sup>13</sup> See **Kevaḍḍha S** (D 11), SD 1.7 Appendix: Table 1.2.

<sup>14</sup> D 3:237, M 3:103, Vbh 425, Pug 42-46. See **Saṅkhār’upapatti S** (M 120,28), SD 3.4.

<sup>15</sup> DA 2:511; AA 4:28, 190.

<sup>16</sup> On the 2 periods in the Buddha’s ministry, see **Notion of diṭṭhi**, SD 40a.1 (1.3).

## 2.4.2 Upavāna

2.4.2.1 **Upavāna** or Upavana, whom the Buddha addresses towards the end of the Sutta [§37], is an elder of Sāvattthī and one of the Buddha's attendants during the first 20 years of the ministry. The Buddha's attendants then are as follows: Nāga, samāla, Nāgita, Upavāna, Sunakkhatta, Cunda the novice, Sāgata and Meghiya, probably in that sequence.<sup>17</sup>

His elder's verses are at **Tha 185 f.**<sup>18</sup> **The Deva,hita Sutta** (S 7.13) records how Upavāna, as the Buddha's attendant, mindfully attends to him when he is suffering from wind illness.<sup>19</sup>

In **the Upavāna Sutta** (S 35.70), he asks the Buddha on the meaning of *sandiṭṭhika* ("directly visible; seen for oneself") which the Buddha explains as that of direct awareness of lust as it arises through sense-experience.<sup>20</sup> In **the Pāsādika Sutta** (D 29), he fans the Buddha as he teaches, and the Sutta title is to his credit.<sup>21</sup> In the Buddha's last days, too, as recorded in **the Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16), Upavāna is seen fanning the Buddha, although Ānanda is the Buddha's personal attendant at that time.<sup>22</sup>

2.4.2.2 It is likely here, that Upavāna is the Buddha's personal attendant, which would explain why the Buddha singled him out to answer the question on an elder monk's worthy qualities [§37]. On the other hand, it is also possible that Ānanda (not Upavāna) is actually the Buddha's personal attendant then, which would explain why Ānanda is singled out by for blame by the Buddha [§29].

Then, we need to find some other reason for the Buddha abruptly, as it were, asking Upavāna to answer his question. It is possible that his past service as the Buddha's personal attendant merited him this privilege. From the Sutta teaching and the presence of the unawakened Udāyī [3], we can assume that the Sutta belongs to the second period of the ministry.<sup>23</sup>

## 3 Lāl'udāyī

**3.1 WHICH UDĀYĪ?** The Dīgha Commentary identifies three elders named **Udāyī**, that is, Lāl'udāyī, Kāl'udāyī, and Mahā Udāyī (DA 3:903). From his presumptuous conduct, we can identify the **Udāyī** of **the (Sāriputta) Nirodha Sutta** (A 5.166) as **Lāl'udāyī 1**, "Udāyī the foolish."<sup>24</sup> He contradicts the elder Sāriputta thrice on the first occasion, before an assembly of monks, presumably along with Ānanda, and perhaps, Upavāna, too [§§4-11]. And again he contradicts the elder Sāriputta thrice on the second occasion, this time, when the monks are assembled before the Buddha himself [§§13-23].

**3.2 LĀL'UDĀYĪ'S CHARACTER.** In the suttas, **Lāl'udāyī 1** is generally depicted as being foolish (M 136,6),<sup>25</sup> ignorant (A 6.29),<sup>26</sup> or quarrelsome (A 5.166),<sup>27</sup> but never lascivious nor luxurious, like the Udāyī of the Vinaya.<sup>28</sup> The Commentaries present him as being slow-witted (DhA 11.7),<sup>29</sup> or as being very timid (*sāraṇja, bahula*) (J 126).<sup>30</sup> While the suttas tend to present his presumptuousness in a more serious way,<sup>31</sup> the commentarial stories generally depict him in more humorous light.<sup>32</sup>

**3.3 LĀL'UDĀYĪ'S PRESUMPTUOUSNESS** probably arises from the fact that

(1) he is, by nature, a dullard, timid, nervous, and quarrelsome person [3.2];

<sup>17</sup> On his origs, see Ap 22/70,22-74,7 (ApA 343,27 f). See also CPD: Upavāna.

<sup>18</sup> See also S 7.13; cf Miln 134, Miln:H 1:187 n8.

<sup>19</sup> S 7.13/1:174 f ≈ DhA 4:232,18.

<sup>20</sup> S 35.70/4:41-44 @ SD 62.7.

<sup>21</sup> D 29,41/3:141 n @ SD 40a.6.

<sup>22</sup> D 16,5.4 @ SD 9.

<sup>23</sup> On the 2 periods in the Buddha's ministry, see SD SD 40a.1 (1.3).

<sup>24</sup> For a detailed list of elders named **Udāyī** and related accounts, see SD 24.8 (1).

<sup>25</sup> **Mahā Kamma,vibhaṅga S** (M 136,6/3:208), SD 4.16.

<sup>26</sup> (**Anussati-ṭ,thāna**) **Udāyī S** (A 6.29,1.3/3:323), SD 24.8.

<sup>27</sup> (**Sāriputta**) **Nirodha S** (A 5.166/3:192-196 @ SD 47.15; AA 3:298.

<sup>28</sup> See SD 24.8 (1.1.4).

<sup>29</sup> DhA 11.7/3:124-126 @ SD 50.2(2).

<sup>30</sup> J 126,8/2:165 @ SD 50.2(3).

<sup>31</sup> See SD 24.4 (1.4).

<sup>32</sup> See SD 24.8 (1.2, 1.3, 1.5, 1.6, 1.7).

(2) he has become a monk in old age, and as such has difficulty learning the Vinaya and the Dharma; The Thera, gāthā Commentary says that he is *kovariya,putta*, which probably means “son of Kovariya” (ThaA 3:7). Hence, his father’s name is probably Kovariya, a brahmin of Kapila, vatthu.<sup>33</sup>

**3.4 A DEFERENT LĀḶ’UDĀYĪ.** In the **(Sāriputta) Nibbāna, sukha Sutta**, we see a rare occasion when LāḶ’udāyī humbly listens to a discourse by Sāriputta on nirvana, as the happiness that is not sensed (*avedayita, sukha*).<sup>34</sup> It is possible that either the subject is too profound for him to make any comment, or he has then mellowed with advanced age.

#### 4 On the morally virtuous

The **(Pañcaka) Sīla, vanta Sutta** (A 5.87) contains the essential teaching of the **(Sāriputta) Nirodha Sutta** (A 5.166), that is, the 5 qualities of an elder monk, couched in a narrative centering around Sāriputta. While A 5.87 gives only the 5 qualities, taught by the Buddha himself to the monks, A 5.166 has the Buddha asking Upavāṇa what the qualities of an elder monk are, and it is Upavāṇa who lists them in reply. Clearly here, the shorter A 5.87 is the older text, recording a teaching by the Buddha which is quoted by Upavāṇa.

#### SD 47.15(4)

### (Pañcaka) Sīla, vanta Sutta

The (Fives) Discourse on the Morally Virtuous | A 5.87/3:114

Traditional: A 5.2.4.7 = Aṅguttara Nikāya 5, Pañcaka Nipāta 2, Dutiya Paṇṇāsaka 4, Thera Vagga 7

Theme: The 5 qualities of an elder monk

1 Possessing 5 qualities, an elder monk is beloved and agreeable and respected and worthy of esteem to his fellow brahmacharis [celibates in the holy life].

What are the five?

2 THE 5 QUALITIES OF AN ELDER MONK

(1) He<sup>35</sup> is morally virtuous,  
dwells restrained in the keeping with the Pātimokkha,  
is accomplished in conduct and resort,  
sees dangers in the slightest fault,  
trains in the precepts he has undertaken.<sup>36</sup>

(2) He is deeply learned,  
remembers what he has heard [learned],  
a store of learning.

The teachings that are beautiful in the beginning, in the middle, in the end,  
along with their meanings and phrasings,  
which declare the holy life, wholly complete, utterly pure—  
these are what he is deeply learned in,  
he remembers, has mastered verbally,  
examined them in his mind,  
penetrated them rightly by view.<sup>37</sup>

<sup>33</sup> See SD 24.8 (1.1.2(4)). See also DPPN: 1. Udāyī Thera.

<sup>34</sup> A 9.34/4:414-418 @ SD 55.1; AA 4:194.

<sup>35</sup> Here, A 5.166 instead reads: “Here, bhante, an elder monk...”

<sup>36</sup> *Silavā hoti, pātimokkha saṃvara saṃvuto viharati, ācāra, gocara, sampanno, aṇumattesu vajjesu bhaya, dassāvī, samādāya sikkhati sikkhā, padesu.* Recurs mutatis mutandis in **Sekha S** (M 53), where it is the first quality of a noble disciple (M 53.7/1:355), SD 21.14; **(Ti) Sikkhā S** (A 3.88/1:235), SD 24.10c; **Yassa Disaṃ S** (A 5.134,2), SD 103.-4. See **(Sekha) Uddesa S** (A 3.85/1:231 f), SD 3.3(2) for a fuller def of the 3 higher trainings (*ti adhi, sikkhā*), in terms of the 4 types of saints. On an ancient list of ethical rules, see **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,43-62/1:63-69 @ SD 8.10).

(3) He has a good voice, a good delivery, endowed with urbane speech, distinctly clear, not driveling [faultless in speech], able to clarify any issue.<sup>38</sup>

(4) He attains at will, without trouble, without difficulty, the 4 dhyanas that constitutes the higher mind, an abiding that is pleasant here and now.<sup>39</sup>

(5) By realizing for himself through direct knowledge, right here and now, he attains and dwells in the liberation of mind and the liberation by wisdom<sup>40</sup> that are influx-free with the destruction of the mental influxes!<sup>41</sup>

**40** Possessing 5 qualities, bhante, an elder monk is beloved and agreeable and respected and worthy of esteem to his fellow brahmacharis [celibates in the holy life].”

— evam —

## The (Sāriputta) Discourse on Cessation

A 5.166

### Sāriputta’s teaching is rejected by Udāyī

**1** There<sup>42</sup> the venerable Sāriputta addressed the monks, thus, <sup>43</sup>“Avuso bhikshus!” “Avuso!” the monks replied to the venerable Sāriputta in assent.

The venerable Sāriputta said this:

**2** “Here, avuso, a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished in wisdom, might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is possible.<sup>44</sup>

**3** But if he does not win direct knowledge here and now, having been reborn [having arisen] in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,<sup>45</sup>

<sup>37</sup> *Bahu-s, suto hoti suta, dharo suta, sannicayo ye te dhammā ādi, kalyāṇā majjhe kalyāṇā pariyosāna, kalyāṇā sātthā sa, vyañjanā keval, paripunnā parisuddham brahma, cariyam abhivadanti. Tathā, rūpāssa dhammā bahu-s, sutā honti dhatā vacasā paricitā manasānupekkhitā diṭṭhiyā suppaṭividdhā.*

<sup>38</sup> *Kalyāṇa, vāco hoti kalyāṇa, vāk. karaṇo poriyā vācāya samannāgato vissatṭhāya anelagalāya atthassa viññāpaniyā.* This is stock: **Caṅkī S** (M 95,8(6)/2:165 f: Caṅkī’s quality, §9(7)/2:167: Buddha’s quality), SD 21.15; **Khippa Nisanti S** (A 4.97/2:97 f ×4); **(Pañcaka) Sila, vanta S** (A 5.87/3:114); **(Sāriputta) Nirodha S** (A 5.166,39(3)/3:195); **Āvāsika S** (A 5.231/3:261 positively stated, 3:262 negatively stated); **Piya S** (A 5.232/3:262); **Ovāda S** (A 8.52/4:279); **Alaṃ S** (A 8.62/4:295-298×5); **Alaṃ S** (A 8.78/4:328+331); **Puṇṇiya S** (A 10.83/5:155×2). Cf variants: **Sobhana S** (A 5.232/3:261+262); V 4:51, only *kalyāṇa, vāco hoti kalyāṇa, vākkaraṇo.*

<sup>39</sup> *Catunnam jhānaṇam ābhicetasikānam diṭṭha, dhamma, sukha, vihārānaṃ nikāma, lābhī hoti akiccha, lābhī akasira, lābhī.*

<sup>40</sup> “Liberation of mind and liberation by wisdom,” respectively, *ceto, vimutti* (or, liberation by concentration, ie through destruction of the mental hindrances) and *paññā, vimutti* (liberation through insight) (A 1:60). See n below at A 5.166(5) ad loc.

<sup>41</sup> *Āsavānaṃ khayā anāsavaṃ ceto, vimuttiṃ paññā, vimuttiṃ diṭṭh’eva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharati:* see n below at A 5.166 (6) ad loc.

<sup>42</sup> We are not told where *tatra*, “there,” refers to. The standard *evam me sutam*, “thus have I heard” formula, is only given once, right at the start of the Pañcaka Nipāta (the book of fives), which says that the Buddha is staying in Anātha, piṇḍika’s park in Jeta’s grove, outside Sāvattihī. So, we must surmise that Sāvattihī is meant here.

<sup>43</sup> From here to the rest of para, only Ce gives it fully; Be Ee Se has only *pe*.

<sup>44</sup> *Idh’āvuso bhikkhu sila, sampanno samādhi, sampanno paññā, sampanno saññā, vedayita, nirodham samāpajjeyya’pi vuṭṭhaheyya’pi, \*atth’etaṃ thānaṃ.* \*Throughout: Be *samāpajjeyyāpi vuṭṭhaheyyāpi*; Ce Ee Ke Se *samāpajjeyya’pi vuṭṭhaheyya’pi*. On cessation of perception and feeling, see **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,42), SD 1.11 (4.1); **Sappurisa S** (M 113), SD 23.7 (2); **Animitta Ceto, samādhi Pañha S** (S 40.9/4:268 f), SD 24.19.

he would attain the cessation of perception and feeling, too—this is possible.”<sup>46</sup>

4 When this was said, the venerable Udāyī<sup>47</sup> said this to the venerable Sāriputta:

“It is not possible, avuso Sāriputta, there is no chance that a monk, having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas<sup>48</sup> who have gone beyond feeding on material food,

he would attain the cessation of perception and feeling, too—this is impossible!”<sup>49</sup>

5 For the second time, the venerable Sāriputta addressed the monks, thus:

“Here, avuso, a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished in wisdom, might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is possible.

6 But if he does not win direct knowledge here and now,

having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,

he would attain the cessation of perception and feeling, too—this is possible.”

7 When this was said, for the second time, too, the venerable Udāyī said this to the venerable Sāriputta:

“It is not possible, avuso Sāriputta, there is no chance

that a monk, having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,

might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is impossible!”

8 For the third time, [193] the venerable Sāriputta addressed the monks thus:

9 “Here, avuso, a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished in wisdom, might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is possible.

10 But if he does not win direct knowledge here and now,

having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,

he would attain the cessation of perception and feeling, too—this is possible.”

11 When this was said, for the third time, too, the venerable Udāyī said this to the venerable Sāriputta:

“It is not possible, avuso Sāriputta, there is no chance

<sup>45</sup> “Feeding on material food” (*kabaḷikār’āhāra, bhakkhānaṃ*) refers to the beings (in this case, the devas) of the sense world (*kāmāvacara*) (AA 3:298), who depend on their physical senses and mind. The PTS tr (A:H 3:142) is wide off the mark, done by professional scholars who were not practitioners. Such a translation must not only understand of the letter, but more so the spirit of the Dharma (through personal practice and meditation).

<sup>46</sup> *No ce diṭṭh’eva dhamme aññaṃ ārādheyya, atikkamm’eva kabaḷikār’āhāra, bhakkhānaṃ devānaṃ saḥavyataṃ aññataraṃ mano, mayāṃ kāyaṃ upapanno saññā, vedayita, nirodhaṃ samāpajjeyya’pi vuṭṭhaheyya’pi, atth’etaṃ thānaṃ’ti.*

<sup>47</sup> Comy says that Lāl’udāyī, foolish Udāyī, is meant here (AA 3:298). In **Udāyī S** (A 5.159), he is shown to be a rather presumptuous monk.

<sup>48</sup> Comy explains this “mind-made host of devas” (*mano, mayā kāya deva*) to be a certain group of brahmas in the pure abodes, reborn there on account of the dhyana-mind (*aññataraṃ mano, mayāṃ kāyaṃ’ti jhāna, manena nibbatataṃ aññataraṃ suddh’āvāsa, brahma, kāyaṃ*, AA 3:298). Hence, Sāriputta is speaking of cessation here in reference to non-returners in the pure abodes.

<sup>49</sup> Comy: Udāyī, hearing “mind-made” (*mano, mayā*), disagrees, thinking, “It ought to be among the formless.” (AA 3:298). **Apāṇṇaka S** (M 60) gives the foll “sure teachings”: (1) If there were no formless realms, there are the form realms; if there are formless realms, they are made of subtle consciousness (§31); (2) if there were no cessation of being, I would be reborn in a formless realm; if there is cessation of being, then nirvana is possible (§34.2). **Manāpa, dāyī S** (A 5.44) records Ugga the Vesālī householder, after death, arising amongst a mind-made host (*mano, mayā kāya*) of devas (A 5.44/3:50). Culla Panthaka is the foremost of monks who are able to create a mind-made body (A 1:23): here it refers to a psychic manifestation in this world itself. For an occasion when he deferentially listens to Sāriputta, see Intro (3.4).

*that a monk, having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,  
might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is impossible!”*

### Sāriputta and the monks before the Buddha

**12** Then, it occurred to the venerable Sāriputta:

“Now, for the third time, the venerable Udāyī has rejected me, and not a single monk shows agreement with me.<sup>50</sup>

What now if I were to approach the Blessed One?”

**13** Then, the venerable Sāriputta approached the Blessed One, saluted him, and then sat down at one side. Sitting thus at one side, the venerable Sāriputta addressed the monks:<sup>51</sup>

**14** “Here, avuso, a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished in wisdom, might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is possible.

**15** But if he does not win direct knowledge here and now,  
having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,

*he would attain the cessation of perception and feeling, too—this is possible.”*

**16** When this was said, the venerable Udāyī said this to the venerable Sāriputta:

“It is not possible, avuso Sāriputta, there is no chance  
that a monk, having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,  
might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is impossible!”

**17** For the second time, the venerable Sāriputta addressed the monks, thus:

“Here, avuso, a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished in wisdom, might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is possible.

**18** But if he does not win direct knowledge here and now,  
having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,

*he would attain the cessation of perception and feeling, too—this is possible.”*

**19** When this was said, for the second time, too, the venerable Udāyī said this to the venerable Sāriputta:

“It is not possible, avuso Sāriputta, there is no chance  
that a monk, having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,  
might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is impossible!”

**20** For the third time, the venerable Sāriputta addressed the monks, thus:

**21** “Here, avuso, a monk, accomplished in moral virtue, accomplished in samadhi, accomplished in wisdom, [194] might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is possible.

**22** But if he does not win direct knowledge here and now,  
having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,

*he would attain the cessation of perception and feeling, too—this is possible.”*

**23** When this was said, for the third time, too, the venerable Udāyī said this to the venerable Sāriputta:

<sup>50</sup> *Tatiyam pi\* kho me āyasmā udāyī paṭikkosati, na ca me koci bhikkhu anumodati.* Throughout: *Be yāva, tatiyakam pi; Ce Ee Se yāva, tatiyam pi.*

<sup>51</sup> From the context, it is clear that Sāriputta has approached the Buddha along with the same congregation of monks, or at least with Udāyī.

“It is not possible, avuso Sāriputta, there is no chance that a monk, having been reborn in some mind-made host of devas who have gone beyond feeding on material food,

might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is impossible!”

24 Then, it occurred to the venerable Sāriputta:

“Even before the Blessed One, too, the venerable Udāyī rejects me for the third time, and not a single monk shows agreement with me.

25 What now if I were to be silent?”

Then, the venerable Sāriputta was silent.<sup>52</sup>

### The Buddha reprimands Udāyī and Ānanda

26 Then, the Blessed One addressed the venerable Udāyī:

“Now, Udāyī, what do you understand by a mind-made host (*mano,maya kāya*)?”<sup>53</sup>

27 “Bhante, they are the formless devas, composed of subtle consciousness.”<sup>54</sup>

28 “Now, Udāyī, what is this foolish and fumbling talk of yours, that you think that you should speak so?”<sup>55</sup>

29 Then, the Blessed One addressed the venerable Ānanda.<sup>56</sup>

“Ānanda, how can you just look on as an elder monk is being harassed?”<sup>57</sup>

Is there no compassion, Ānanda, for an elder monk who is being harassed?”<sup>58</sup>

### The Buddha’s endorsement of Sāriputta

30 Then the Blessed One addressed the monks:

“Here, bhikkhus, a monk,

accomplished in moral virtue,

accomplished in samadhi,

accomplished in wisdom,

might attain the cessation of perception and feeling—this is possible.<sup>59</sup>

31 But if he does not win direct knowledge here and now,

having been reborn [having arisen] in some mind-made host of devas

who have gone beyond feeding on material food,

he would attain the cessation of perception and feeling, too—this is possible.” [§§2-3]

32 The Blessed One said this. Having said this, the well-gone one (*suhata*) rose from his seat and entered his quarters.<sup>60</sup> ]195]

<sup>52</sup> *Atha kho āyasmā sāriputto tuṅhī ahoṣi.*

<sup>53</sup> *Kaṃ pana tvam udāyi mano,mayaṃ kāyaṃ paccesīti.*

<sup>54</sup> *Ye te bhante devā arūpino saññā,mayā’ti:* see **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60,31(2.2)/1:410), SD 35.5. Udāyī confuses the formless devas, who are said to be made of “consciousness” (*saññā*, here not tr as “perception”), with the form devas (incl the brahmas of the pure abodes), who are said to be mind-made (*mano,maya*). (AA 3:298)

<sup>55</sup> *Kim nu kho tuyham udāyi bālassa avyattassa bhaṇitena, tvam pi nāma bhaṇitabbaṃ maññasīti.*

<sup>56</sup> Comy: The Buddha chides Ānanda because he is the Treasurer of the Dharma (*dhamma,bhaṇḍāgārika*), whose task is to prevent or deal with such talk (*evam vadanto paṭibāhitum bhāro*), and also that he is Sāriputta’s close friend (*piya,sahāya*) (AA 3:298). [2.1.3]

<sup>57</sup> *Atthi nāma ānanda theram bhikkhum vihesiyamānam ajjupekkhissatha.* Comy explains “How can you,” *atthi nāma*, as a particle denoting indignation or impatience (*amarisan’atthe nipāto*), that is, you should have thought: “I cannot suffer this (person),” or “I will not endure this,” or “I will not bear this.” (*Na vo’etaṃ marisayāmi na sahāmi na adhivāsemiti*, AA 3:298).

<sup>58</sup> *Na hi nāma ānanda kāruṅṅāmpi bhavissati theramhi*<sup>58</sup> *bhikkhumhi vihesiyamānamhīti.*

<sup>59</sup> *Idh’āvuso bhikkhu sīla,sampanno samādhi,sampanno paññā,sampanno saññā,vedayita,nirodham samāpajjeyya’pi vuṭṭhaheyya’pi,\* atth’etaṃ ṭhānam.* \*Throughout: Be *samāpajjeyyāpi vuṭṭhaheyyāpi*; Ce Ee Ke Se *samāpajjeyya’pi vuṭṭhaheyya’pi*. On cessation of perception and feeling, see **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26.,42), SD 1.11 (4.1); **Sappurisa S** (M 113), SD 23.7 (2); **Animitta Ceto,samādhi Pañha S** (S 40.9/4:268 f), SD 24.19.

### Ānanda's concern

33 Then, not long after the Blessed One had left, the venerable Ānanda approached the venerable Upavāna,<sup>61</sup> and said this to him:

34 “Here, avuso Upavāna, they were harassing other elder monks, (but) we did not question them.”<sup>62</sup>

35 Now, avuso Upavāna, it would not be surprising that when the Blessed One emerges from his evening solitary retreat, he would raise this very same matter, and ask the venerable Upavāna here for a response.<sup>63</sup>

Right now, I've fallen into apprehension [fearfulness]!”<sup>64</sup>

### Upavāna on Sāriputta's 5 qualities

36 Then, in the evening, when the Blessed One had emerged from his solitary retreat, he went to the service-hall<sup>65</sup> and sat down on the prepared seat.

Sitting thus, the Blessed One said this to the venerable Upavāna:

37 “How many qualities, Upavāna, must an elder monk have so that he is **beloved and agreeable and respected and worthy of esteem** to his fellow brahmacharis [celibates in the holy life]?”<sup>66</sup>

38 “Bhante, possessing 5 qualities an elder monk have so that he is beloved and agreeable and respected and worthy of esteem to his fellow brahmacharis [celibates in the holy life].

What are the five?

39 Here, bhante, an elder monk

(1) is morally virtuous,  
dwells restrained in the keeping with the Pātimokkha,  
is accomplished in conduct and resort,  
sees dangers in the slightest fault,  
trains in the precepts he has undertaken.<sup>67</sup>

(2) He is deeply learned,  
remembers what he has heard [learned],  
a store of learning.

<sup>60</sup> *Idam avoca bhagavā, idam vatvāna sugato utthāy'āsanā vihāraṃ pāvīsi.*

<sup>61</sup> Ānanda's foresees this prob because Upavāna is the Buddha's personal attendant then. On **Upavāna**, see (2.4.2)..

<sup>62</sup> *Idh'āvuso upavāna aññe there bhikkhū vihesenti, mayam te na pucchāma.* Here, if “them” refers to the harassers, they should be asked to explain their conduct. If it refers to the teachers, then they should be asked to clarify their teachings. Ce Ee *mayam te na pucchāma*; Be Se *mayam tena na muccāma*, “we are not released/saved by them.” On *muccāma* (passive of *muccati*), see Sn 508.

<sup>63</sup> *Anacchariyam kho pan'etaṃ āvuso upavāna, yaṃ bhagavā sāyanha, samayam paṭisallānā vuṭṭhito etad eva ārabha udāhareyya yathā āyasmantaṃ yev'ettha upavānaṃ paṭibhāseyya.* Comy says that *yathā* here is a word for “cause” (*kāraṇa, vacanaṃ*), and adds that when the Buddha has said something about such a matter, one should think of a reply (*paṭivacana*) (AA 3:299). The Buddha is likely to ask Upavāna prob because he is the Buddha's personal attendant at that time. On Upavāna, see see **Pāsādika S** (D 29,41/3:141) n, SD 40a.6.

<sup>64</sup> *Idān'eva amhākaṃ sārājjaṃ okkantaṃ'ti.* On *sārājja*, see **Sārājja S** (A 5.171), SD 84.3; SD 28.9a (3).

<sup>65</sup> The “service-hall” (*upaṭṭhāna, sālā*; Skt *upasthāna, śālā*) is either the main assembly hall and/or the refectory of the monastery (UA 102,31): see V 1:49, 139, 2:153, 208, 3:70 (at Vesālī), 4:15, 42; D 2:119 (at Vesālī); S 2:280, 5:321; A 2:51, 197, 3:298; DhA 1:37, 38; 3:413.

<sup>66</sup> *Katīhi nu kho upavāna dhammehi samannāgato thero bhikkhu sa, brahma, cārīnaṃ piyo ca hoti manāpo ca garu ca bhāvanīyo cāti.* The 5 qualities recur by themselves at (**Pañcaka**) **Sīla, vanta S** (A 5.87/3:114), SD 47.15(4); **Piya S** (A 5.232/3:262).

<sup>67</sup> *Idha bhante thero bhikkhu sīlavā hoti, pātimokkha saṃvara saṃvuto viharati, ācāra, gocara, sampanno, aṇumat-tesu vajjesu bhaya, dassāvī, samādāya sikkhati sikkhā, padesu.* All MSS except Ce gives an abridged text. Recurs mutatis mutandis in **Sekha S** (M 53), where it is the first quality of a noble disciple (M 53.7/1:355), SD 21.14; (**Ti**) **Sikkhā S** (A 3.88/1:235), SD 24.10c; **Yassa Disaṃ S** (A 5.134,2), SD 103.4. See (**Sekha**) **Uddesa S** (A 3.85/1:231 f), SD 3.3(2) for a fuller def of the 3 higher trainings (*ti adhi, sikkhā*), in terms of the 4 types of saints. On an ancient list of ethical rules, see **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,43-62/1:63-69 @ SD 8.10).

The teachings that are beautiful in the beginning, in the middle, in the end,  
 along with their meanings and phrasings,  
 which declare the holy life, wholly complete, utterly pure—  
 these are what he is deeply learned in,  
 he remembers, has mastered verbally,  
 examined them in his mind,  
 penetrated them rightly by view.<sup>68</sup>

(3) He has a good voice, a good delivery, endowed with urbane speech, distinctly clear, not driveling [faultless in speech], able to clarify any issue.<sup>69</sup>

(4) He attains at will, without trouble, without difficulty, the 4 dhyanas that constitutes the higher mind, an abiding that is pleasant here and now.<sup>70</sup>

(5) By realizing for himself through direct knowledge, right here and now, he attains and dwells in the liberation of mind and the liberation by wisdom<sup>71</sup> that are influx-free with the destruction of the mental influxes!<sup>72</sup>

<sup>68</sup> *Bahu-s,suto hoti suta,dharo suta,sannicayo ye te dhammā ādi,kalyāṇā majjhe kalyāṇā pariyosāna,kalyāṇā sātthā sa,vyañjanā keval,paripuñṇā parisuddhaṃ brahma,cariyaṃ abhivadanti. Tathā,rūpāssa dhammā bahu-s,sutā honti dhatā vacasā paricitā manasānupekkhitā diṭṭhiyā suppaṭividdhā.* All MSS except Ce abridged. A common pericope along with (1) here.

<sup>69</sup> *Kalyāṇa,vāco hoti kalyāṇa,vāk.karaṇo poriyā vācāya samannāgato vissatṭhāya anelagalāya atthassa viññāpaniyā.* This is stock: **Caṅkī S** (M 95,8(6)/2:165 f: Caṅkī’s quality, §9(7)/2:167: Buddha’s quality), SD 21.15; **Khippa Nisanti S** (A 4.97/2:97 f ×4); **(Pañcaka) Sila,vanta S** (A 5.87/3:114); **(Sāriputta) Nirodha S** (A 5.166,39(3)/3:195); **Āvāsika S** (A 5.231/3:261 positively stated, 3:262 negatively stated); **Piya S** (A 5.232/3:262); **Ovāda S** (A 8.52/4:279); **Alaṃ S** (A 8.62/4:295-298×5); **Alaṃ S** (A 8.78/4:328+331); **Puṇṇiya S** (A 10.83/5:155×2). Cf variants: **Sobhana S** (A 5.232/3:261+262); V 4:51, only *kalyāṇa,vāco hoti kalyāṇa,vākkaraṇo*.

<sup>70</sup> *Catunnam jhānaṇaṃ abhīcetasikānaṃ diṭṭha,dhamma,sukha,vihārānaṃ nikāma,lābhī hoti akiccha,lābhī akasira,lābhī.* All MSS except Ce abridged.

<sup>71</sup> “Liberation of mind and liberation by wisdom,” respectively, *ceto,vimutti* (or, liberation by concentration, ie through destruction of the mental hindrances) and *paññā,vimutti* (liberation through insight) (A 1:60). One who is “liberated by wisdom” “may not have reached the 8 liberations (*vimokkha*) in his own body, but through seeing with wisdom, his mental influxes are destroyed” (M 70.16/1:478). All arhats are perfectly liberated in the same way from ignorance and suffering, but are distinguished into 2 types on the basis of their proficiency in concentration. Those who can attain the 8 liberations (*aṭṭha,vimokkha*), which include the 4 formless attainments and the attainment of cessation, are called “liberated both ways,” ie, liberated from the physical body by means of the formless dhyanas, and from all defilements by the path of arhathood. Arhats like Sāriputta and Moggallāna are “liberated both ways” (*ubhato,bhāga,vimutta*). The differences between the two types of liberation are given in **Mahā,nidāna S** (D 2:70 f) and **Kīṭāgiri S** (M 1:477 f). For a full list of the 8 deliverances, see **Mahā Nidāna S** (D 15,35/ 2:70 f), SD 5.17. See also D 3:262, 228; **Vimokkha S**, A 8.66/4:306; also M 120,37/3:103 @ SD 3.4.37.

<sup>72</sup> *Āsavānaṃ khayā anāsavaṃ ceto,vimuttiṃ paññā,vimuttiṃ diṭṭh’eva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharati.* **Mahāli S** (D 6,13/1:156), **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,2.7/2:92), **Cakka,vatti Siha,nāda S** (D 26,28/3:78); **Ākaṅkheyya S** (M 6,19/1:35), **Sekha S** (M 53,24/1:358), **Saṅkhār’upapatti S** (M 120,37/3:103); **Jhānābhiññā S** (S 16.27/2:214), **Āsava-k,khaya S** (S 48.20/5:203); **Sāraṇīya S** (A 3.12/1:107), **Anusota S** (A 4.1/2:6), **Upakkilesa S** (A 5.23,11/3:19), **Āhuneyya S 2** (A 6.2,6/3:281), **Udakūpama S** (A 7.15,9/4:13), **Saddhā S 1** (A 8.71,3/4:314), **(Navaka) Assa Khaluṅka S** (A 9.22.12/4:400), **Jhāna S** (A 10.8.2/5:10 f), **Subhūti S** (A 11.15.-12/5:340); **Nanda S** (U 3.2/23); **Deva Sadda S** (It 3.4.3/75). The more common pericope is this: “His mind, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the influx of sensual desire, the influx of existence, the influx of ignorance. With release, there is the knowledge, ‘Released (am I)!’ He knows that ‘Birth is ended, the holy life has been lived, done is that which needs to be done. There is nothing further beyond this,’” eg **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,99.3/1:84), SD 8.10.

“*Āsavānaṃ khayā anāsavaṃ ceto,vimuttiṃ paññā,vimuttiṃ diṭṭh’eva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharati.* All MSS except Ce abridged. **Mental influxes**,” *āsavā*: the oldest list is perhaps the set of **3 influxes** (*āsava*)—of sense-desire (*kāma’sava*), of existence (*bhava’sava*), and of ignorance (*avijjāsava*) (D 3:216, 33,1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63)—which are essentially the same as the **3 grasplings** (*ti,gaha*) of craving (*taṇhā*), conceit (*māna*) and views (*diṭṭhi*), on account of which arise, resp, the notions “this is mine,” “this I am,”

40 Possessing 5 qualities, bhante, an elder monk is beloved and agreeable and respected and worthy of esteem to his fellow brahmacharis [celibates in the holy life].” [196]

### The Buddha’s approval

41 “Sadhu! Sadhu! [Excellent! Excellent!], Upavāna. Indeed, possessing 5 qualities, Upavāna, an elder monk is beloved and agreeable and respected and worthy of esteem to his fellow brahmacharis.

42 If, Upavāna, these 5 qualities are not found in an elder monk—but his broken teeth, gray hair and wrinkled skin<sup>73</sup>—he would not be honoured, respected, esteemed, venerated by his fellow brahmacharis.<sup>74</sup>

43 However, Upavāna, when these 5 qualities are indeed found in an elder monk, he is, as such, honoured, respected, esteemed, venerated by his fellow brahmacharis.<sup>75</sup>

— evaṃ —

141105 141110 141119r

---

and “this is my self”): see **Vatthūpama S** (M 7.18/1:38), SD 28.12. The term *āsava* comes from *ā-savati* “flows towards or inwards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously tr as taints (“deadly taints,” RD), corruptions, cankers, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence), or simply left untr. The Abhidhamma lists 4 *āsavas*, which is also found in the Nikāyas: the influxes of (1) sense-desire (*kām’āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav’āsava*), (3) views (*diṭṭh’āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijj’āsava*) (D 16,1.12/2:82, 16.2.4/2:91, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These 4 are also known as “floods” (*ogha*) and “yokes” (*yoga*). See BDict: *āsava*.

<sup>73</sup> This must clearly refer to Udāyī. The significance here is not that he is unpleasant-looking, but this is besides his unpleasant personality. Obliquely, this is an admonition implies that even if we are not Dharma teachers, we should at least give them due respect, esp when they are worthy elder monastics.

<sup>74</sup> *Ime ce upavāna pañca dhammā therassa bhikkhuno na saṃvijjeyyūṃ, taṃ sa, brahma, cārī na sakkareyyūṃ na garuṃ kareyyūṃ na māneyyūṃ na pūjeyyūṃ khaṇḍiccena pāliccena vali-t, tacatāya.* The underscored is the Be reading. Ce Ee Se na saṃvijjeyyūṃ, kena naṃ sa, brahma, cārī sakkareyyūṃ garu, kareyyūṃ māneyyūṃ pūjeyyūṃ, “...not found, how can fellow brahmacharis honour, respect, esteem, venerate him?” This latter reading seems to suggest that it is desirable to look physically inviting.

<sup>75</sup> *Yasmā ca kho upavāna ime pañca dhammā therassa bhikkhuno saṃvijjanti, tasmā taṃ sa, brahma, cārī sakkaronti garuṃ karonti mānenti pūjenti.*