1 Sutta summaries, key words and significance

1.1 SUTTA SUMMARIES AND THEMES

1.1.1 Sutta summaries

The title (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Sutta refers to these two discourses, both found in the Pañcāla Vagga (dealing with nirvana) of the Aṅguttara [2.1]:

1. (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika 1 or Dhamma Sandiṭṭhika Sutta (A 9.46) SD 50.25a, and
2. (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika 2 or Nibbāna Sandiṭṭhika Sutta (A 9.47) SD 50.25b.

Sutta (1) deals with dhamma, which here means broadly “teaching, truth, reality,” but can also include nirvana, and should be understood as a synonym for nibbāna [3.1]. Sutta (2) clearly refers to nirvana or aspects of it. Both dhamma as teaching, experience and reality on the one hand, and as nibbāna, on the other, are said to be “seen for oneself” (sandiṭṭhika) [1.2].

1.1.2 Main sutta theme

The main theme of the two (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Suttas is the same—the 9 progressive stages of cessation (anu,pubba nirodha). These are the 4 form dhyanas (rūpa jhāna), the 4 formless attainments (arūpa samāpatti) and the attainment of cessation (nirodha samāpatti). They are also listed as such in the Anupubba Nirodha Sutta (A 9.31).3

1.2 SANDIṬṬHIKA

1.2.1 Both the titles share the keyword, sandiṭṭhika (BHS sandṛṣṭika), which the Commentary explains as meaning “that which is to be seen for oneself” (sayaṁ passitabbako, AA 4:207). The word sandiṭṭhika is derived from “seen (diṭṭhika) for oneself (saṁ).”

1.2.2 The grammar compendium, Sadda,nīti, gives more technical details, explaining that “sandiṭṭhika means that the noble path [1.3] is to be seen by oneself with the review knowledge” (ariya,maggo,paccavekkhāna,ñāṇena sayāṁ datṭhabbo ‘ti sandiṭṭhiko) (Sadd 787,14-15).4 This refers to the attaining of nirvana by an arhat, who ascertains his awakening by reviewing his spiritual progress—just as we, having passed an examination, examines the details of the results.

1.2.3 In practical terms, sandiṭṭhika has two important senses. The first is that the Dharma as the teaching (dhamma) points out how we create our own understanding of things by projecting our perceptions

---

1. On dhamma as “teaching, truth, reality,” see Udumbarikā S (D 25,6.3) SD 1.4; SD 3.13 (3.2.3-4). For further details, see under DEB: dhamma.
2. On dhamma as referring to nirvana, see Mahālī S (D 6,13) SD 53.4.
3. On anupubba,vihara, see A 9.31/4:409 (SD 33.6 (3.2.2+3.2.3)). Further see SD 50.25 (1.3.2.2).
4. For further analysis of sandiṭṭhika, see SD 15.9 (2.2). See also Sn:N 280 n567.
onto our experiences. The world “out there” is neither good nor bad; it is our perception of it that gives it moral value in a positive way or a negative way.\(^5\)

Secondly, we can only grow through seeing for oneself directly into the true nature of things (dhamma). Although we can learn a lot from the teachings from others and from outside information, true knowledge only arises in us through our own experience of things, and understanding the patterns that underlie all such experiences.\(^6\) That universal pattern of things is that of impermanence, which we need to observe and understand. This is the understanding that will free us from suffering.\(^7\)

1.3 The Noble Path

1.3.1 “Seen for oneself”

The noble path (ariya, magga) is “seen for oneself” because it can be seen by a noble individual for himself when he has done away with lust (rāga), etc, in his (mind-body) continuity (santāna) (Sadd 787-12-13).

As such, it is said [the Sandiṭṭhika Dhamma Brāhma Sutta, A 3.53]:

Brahmin, when a person is dyed with lust, overcome by it, his mind obsessed by it, then he thinks of his own affliction, he thinks of other’s affliction, he thinks of the affliction of both, and he feels mental pain and grief.

But when he has abandoned lust, then he thinks not of his own affliction, he thinks not of other’s affliction, he thinks not of the affliction of both, and he does not feel mental pain and grief. (A 3.53/1:156 f), SD 15.8a

1.3.2 Those who see the path

1.3.2.1 The “noble path” (ariya, magga) refers both to the supramundane eightfold path as well as the 8 kinds of saints and nirvana itself—as a set called the “9 supramundane dharmas” (nava lok’uttara dhamma), that is, the 4 paths and the 4 respective fruits and nirvana. The 4 paths (magga) and the respective fruits are the streamwinner, the streamwinner-to-be, the once-returner, the once-returner-to-be, the non-returner, the non-returner-to-be, and the arhat and the arhat-to-be—these are “the 8 individuals” (atṭha purisa, puggala)—and with nirvana, they form the 9 supramundane dharmas.

1.3.2.2 All the suttas of the Pañcāla Vagga (A 4:449-454) follow the framework of the 9 progressive abodes (nava anupubba, vihāra) [§§3-11]. The first 8 stages—the 4 form dhyanas, the 4 formless attainments—are X-axis of the bases for the attaining of the 9 supramundane dharmas [1.3.2.1]. The unique stage of the 9 progressive abodes is the 9th and last abode, which is that of the cessation of perception of feeling (saññā, vedayita, nirodha).

While the 9 supramundane dharmas or states [1.3.2.1] refers to the stages of noble sainthood, the 9 progressive abodes refer to the dhyana meditations that act as the springboard or springboards to nirvana, represented by the 9th and last stage, called “cessation” in brief. The last stage—cessation—is the actual experience of nirvana for the arhat or the non-returner in this life itself.

---

\(^5\) Nibbedhikā Pariyāya S (A 6.63,3.4) SD 6.11.

\(^6\) This patent is known as the 3 characteristics (ti, lakkhana) of impermanence, suffering and non-self: see Atam-, mayatā, SD 19.13 (1).

\(^7\) That stage of spiritual understanding that is truly liberating is called streamwinning (sotāpatti): see (Anicca) Cakkhu S (S 25.1), SD 16.7
It is important to understand that cessation does not exist in itself: it is a conditioned and impermanent experience that is experience when the arhat or the non-returner is able to free himself from all defilements and all views, especially that of the self (at least temporarily, for the duration of the cessation, in the case of the non-returner).

1.4 **Pariyāyena and nippariyāyena**

1.4.1 **Usages of the terms**

The pair of terms—pariyāyena and nippariyāyena—are key words in both the Suttas (A 4.96 + 4.97). In the (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Sutta 1 (A 4.96), pariyāyena qualifies the first 8 stages of meditation as occasions of dhamma (as teachings and practices) that are “directly visible” [§§3.2, 4.2 etc], and similarly in the (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Sutta 2 (A 4.97), in connection with the first 8 stages of meditation that are “directly visible” in terms of nibbāna [§§3.2, 4.2 etc]. The term nippariyāyena applies only to the last—the 9th—stage in either Sutta [§11.2 respectively].

1.4.2.1 **Pariyāyena** qualifies the first 8 stages of meditation as occasions of dhamma (as teachings and practices) [§3.1] that are “directly visible” in the (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Sutta 1 [§§3.2, 4.2, 5.2 etc], and similarly the first 8 stages of meditation that are “directly visible” in relation to nibbāna [§4.1] in the (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Sutta 2 [§§3.2, 4.2, 5.2 etc]. The Commentary explains it as (literally) “by one way of reasoning, ground or motive” (ekena kāraṇena, AA 4:205), that is, “in a manner of speaking” or “in a provisional manner,” as it is translated here.

1.4.2.2 In the two Suttas mentioned [1.4.2.1], pariyāyena, “in a provisional manner,” is applied to all the first 8 stages of spiritual progress [§§3-10 respectively], that is, except the 9th or last stage, namely, nirvana or its equivalent [§11 respectively]. Only nirvana, the goal of the series of stages, is described “in a non-provisional manner,” that is, in the ultimate sense.

1.4.3.3 The theme of A 9.46 is the “direct visibility” (sandiṭṭhika) of all the 9 stages of spiritual progress, ending in nirvana. The first 8 stages (the 4 form dhyanas and the 4 formless attainments that is, the first 8 stages) are described by the Buddha as “the directly visible dharma” (dhamma, here meaning “state” or “condition”) in a provisional [relative] manner (pariyāyena).

1.4.3.2 The Commentary, as we have noted [1.4.2.1], explains pariyāyena as “in a manner of speaking,” “relatively speaking,” or “in provisionally manner.” This means that each of the 8 meditative stages—the 4 form dhyanas [§§3-6] and the 4 formless dhyanas [§§7-10]—does not in itself constitute nirvana. Each of these preliminary meditative stages work in a relatively conditional manner—the preceding conditioning the next—as the conditions for the arising of the 9th and last “stage,” that is, nirvana.

1.4.3.3 The theme of A 9.46 is the “direct visibility” (sandiṭṭhika) of all the 9 stages of spiritual progress, ending in nirvana. The first 8 stages (the 4 form dhyanas and the 4 formless dhyanas) are described as being “directly visible” in a provisional sense, that is, none of them by itself brings about the last or 9th stage, nirvana. In this context, nirvana arises in one of two ways:

http://dharmafarer.org
(1) with the completion of the whole series of the 8 dhyanas, or
(2) at any of these meditative stages (including the 8th), the practitioner, at the proper time, applies
his mind to reflect on the 3 characteristics (the impermanence, suffering and non-self) of the
meditations and their respective experiences and benefits.

1.4.3.4 It should be noted here that those arhats “freed by wisdom” (paññā,vimutta) attain nirvana
by gaining insight through the understanding of the 3 characteristics of their experiences and of true
reality itself with the help of the 4 form dhyanas (rūpa jhāna) or some form of dhyana-related mental
focus. However, they do not attain any of the formless dhyanas.9

Those arhats who are “freed both ways” (ubhato.bhāga,vimutta), simply put, are liberated from the
limitations of the physical body—that is, the 5 physical senses (like the wisdom-freed arhat) [1.4.3.5],
and also enjoy the freedom of the mind. Based on their mastery of the 4th dhyana, they are able to go
into deeper meditative states of dhyana that transcend space and time in a progressively refined way.10

1.4.3.5 Both kinds of arhats—the wisdom-freed and the both-ways freed—are liberated from their
bodies. This means that they are neither limited nor defined by the 5 senses, that is, by what they see,
hear, smell, taste or touch. They have overcome all misperception of such sense-experiences so that
they are not in the least troubled by attractiveness or ugliness of such experiences. Hence, they do not
react to such experiences in terms of liking or disliking, but respond spontaneously with wise and joyful
equanimitv.11

1.4.3.6 Not all arhats or non-returners attain cessation (nirodha)12 or need to. The Kīṭā,giri Sutta
(M 70), for example, lists 7 kinds of noble individuals. Of these, only the both-ways-freed (ubhato.bhāga,-
vimutta) arhat and the body-witness (kāya,sakkhi) non-returner are said to be able to be able to expe-
rience the peaceful liberation (santā,vimokkha), the highest of which is cessation.13 We can take santā,-
vimokkha here to be synonymous with the 9 progressive abodes [1.3.2.2].

The Mahā Nidāna Sutta (D 15) mentions the 8 liberations (attha vimokkha) of which cessation is the
highest. Only the both-ways-freed arhat [1.4.3.4] is able to attain these stages in the ascending or direct
(anuloma) order, and in the descending or reverse (patiloma) order.14 The point here is that the both-
ways-freed arhat, having mastered the form dhyanas and the formless attainment, is able to attain the
cessation of perception and feeling. Conversely, some non-returners (those who have mastered the
formless attainments) are also able to experience cessation, but not in such a versatile manner as the
both-ways-free arhat does.

---

9 On the paññā,vimutta, see SD 4.25 (3.1); SD 10.16 (14.2).
10 On the ubhato.bhāga,vimutta, see SD 4.25 (3.2); SD 10.16 (14.3). On the necessity of both samatha and vipas-
sanā for experiencing cessation, see also Analayo 2003:88-91.
11 On how arhats respond to such experiences (the 5 perceptions), see Ti,kañḍaki S (S 5.144) + SD 2.12 (Table 4).
12 “Cessation” (nirodha) or “attainment of cessation” (nirodha,samāpatti) or, more fully, “cessation of perception
and feeling” (saññā,vedayita,nirodha), is essentially an experience of the bliss of the ending of all suffering in this
world itself—i.e., experiencing nirvana as a meditative state in this life itself. It is experienced only by some arhats
and some non-returners.
13 M 70,15+17/1:477 f (SD 11.1).
14 D 15,36/2:71 (SD 5.17).
15 On the cessation of perception and feeling (saññā,vedayita,nirodha), see SD 23.7 (2); SD 48.7 (3.2). See also
Somaratana 2006: saññāvedayitanirdha in Ency Bsm 7:748-750.
1.4.4 Usage of pariyāyena in A 9.47

1.4.4.1 In the (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Sutta 2 (A 9.47), each of the 4 form dhyanas and the 4 formless attainments (that is, the first 8 stages) are described by the Buddha as “the directly visible nirvana in a provisional [relative] manner (pariyāyena).” Note the sutta language: it does not say that we actually “attain nirvana,” but refers to the nirvana that is “directly visible,” which we can envision for ourself.

Even we, as unawakened beings, from our understanding of the suttas and our meditation, often think that we have some right idea of nirvana. However, the meditator with dhyana will have a much clearer vision and feel of nirvana. In fact, at any stage of the progressive cessation—any of the 4 form dhyanas or the 4 formless attainments—as meditator, we will be able to personally “see” or “feel” nirvana for ourself. However, since this vision is not the full attaining of nirvana (which entails the utter destruction of all defilements), it is said to be only in a “provisional manner” (pariyāyena).

1.4.4.2 The (Musila Nārada) Kosambī Sutta (S 12.68), for example, says that the non-returner is like one lost in the desert who comes to a well and sees water in it. However, he does not have a rope and pail to draw water to quench his thirst, and clean and cool himself (SA 2:123). However, with some effort, it is just a matter of time before he is able to draw some water and use it.

In other words, the streamwinner (and implicitly, the once-returner and the non-returner) have a vision (dassana) of nirvana, a clear idea of the peace and benefits of awakening. However, they have yet to attain nirvana itself, that is, to rid themselves of all their defilements. Only the arhat—the one with all his mental influxes destroyed (khīnāsava)18—has attained the full distinction of both “the knowledge and vision” (ñāṇa, dassana) of true reality and awakening.19

1.4.5 Meaning of nippariyāyena

1.4.5.1 The term, “in a non-provisional manner” (nippariyāyena), is used in both A 4.96 and A 4.97 [§3 respectively] to describe the 9th and last stage of the progressive stages of cessation [1.1.2]. This term is the opposite of pariyāyena, “in a provisional manner,” which describes the preceding 8 stages. While the preceding 8 stages are only provisional—they reflect the progress or positive changes in the meditator—the last or 9th stage is the actual goal in the ultimate sense, that is, there is nothing more beyond this. This summon bonum (the highest good or goal) is, of course, nirvana itself.20

1.4.5.2 The teaching on “the provisional” (pariyāyena) and “the non-provisional” (nippariyāyena) has interesting parallels with that on teachings that are “implicit” (neyy’attha) and that are “explicit” (nīt’attha), as given in the Neyy’attha Nīt’attha Sutta (A 2.3.5+6).21 The “provisional” and the “implicit”—in terms of teachings—have the same function in that the teaching’s meaning is not at once clear or complete, but needs to be teased out.

---

16 S 12.68/2:118 (SD 70.11).
17 On the saints and the fetters they overcome, see SD 10.16 (1.6.6-1.6.8).
18 There are the 4 “mental influxes” (āsava): sensual desire (kām’āsava), existence (bhav’āsava), views (diṭṭh’-āsava) and ignorance (avijj’āsava) (D 16.10.4 n @ SD 9). The older list omits views, see SD 30.3 (1.3.2).
19 See, eg, (Anuruddha) Upakkīlesa S (M 128,15), SD 5.18. The knowledge here is the arhat’s review knowledge (paccavekkhana, hāna), which is part of the full arhathood pericope: see, eg, Āngulimāla S (M 86,16), SD 5.11.
20 “In a non-provisional manner,” nippariyāyena, see also (Pañcāla, caṇḍa) Sambādha S (A 9.42/4:449-451), SD 33.2 (2.1).
21 A 2.3.5+6/1:60 (SD 2.6 b).
1.4.5.3 The “provisional,” however, also has its special sense of “means” or “purpose”: it is a both a necessary condition as well as a sufficient condition for the arising of nirvana which is “directly visible,” meaning “to be seen by oneself.” Even when we are inspired by, say, the Buddha himself, we (on account of our spiritual maturity and readiness) can see nirvana for ourself.

It is a necessary condition for the arising of nirvana in the sense that the 1st dhyana is the basis for all the higher dhyanas, up to the 4th formless attainment, the basis for cessation of perception (consciousness) and feeling. It is, however, a sufficient condition, in the sense that it can by itself be a springboard to nirvana. For example, when we attain the 1st dhyana (which overcomes all attachment to sensual pleasures), and we gain the necessary insight, we can attain nirvana (that is, without experiencing any of the formless attainments), as in the case of the wisdom-liberated (paññā, vimutta) non-returner or arhat.

1.4.5.4 With the ceasing of consciousness and feeling—the cognitive and the affective aspects of our being—nirvana arises. However, when we still have some defilements, no matter how subtle, left (as in the case of the non-returner, nirvana is only a temporary experience by way of transcending the dhyanas. In the case of the arhat, who has overcome all the mental fetters, and is free from rebirth. He is able to experience the bliss of nirvana here and now through attaining cessation. This is a subtle but vital point which attests to the natural fact that samsara is not nirvana, as notoriously claimed in later Buddhist theology.

1.4.5.5 The “non-provisional” (nippariyāyena), or ultimate level, of teaching is, in some sense, the same as the teaching that is “explicit” (neyy’‘attha) in the sense that it points to no other or further goal. The subtle difference between the two is that the former—the non-provisional—has the specific sense of experiencing nirvana here and now (dittha, dhammika), while the explicit teaching is simply just that, a clear and exact teaching.

Hence, the terms pariyya-nippariyāya refer both to both teaching and experience, while neyy’’attha-nīta’‘attha refer only to the teaching or theoretical aspects. In the Abhidhamma, however, pariyya-nippariyāya refers to the 2 kinds of teachings (desanā).

2 The 5th chapter of the Book of Nines

2.1 The 5th chapter of the Book of Nines (navaka nipāta), in the Pali Text Society (PTS = Ee) and the Siamese (Se) editions, is called “the Pañcāla chapter” (pañcāla vagga), after the first sutta of the chapter. The Burmese (Be) and the Sinhalese (Ce) editions call it “the chapter of similarities” (samañña vagga), based on its theme.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traditional</th>
<th>PTS</th>
<th>Pañcāla Vagga or Samañña Vagga (A 4:449-454)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A 9.1.5.1</td>
<td>(A 9.42)</td>
<td>(Pañcāla, caṇḍa) Sambādha Sutta “the confined” SD 33.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A 9.1.5.2</td>
<td>(A 9.43)</td>
<td>Kāya, sakkhi Sutta “the body-witness” SD 50.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A 9.1.5.3</td>
<td>(A 9.44)</td>
<td>Paññā, vimutta Sutta “the wisdom-liberated” SD 50.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A 9.1.5.4</td>
<td>(A 9.45)</td>
<td>Ubbho, bhāga, vimutta Sutta “the both-way liberated” SD 50.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A 9.1.5.5</td>
<td>(A 9.46)</td>
<td>Sandiṭṭhika Sutta 1 or Sandiṭṭhika Dhamma Sutta “the directly visible state” SD 50.25a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

22 These are the higher mental fetters (uddham, bhāgiya samyojana), see SD 10.16 (1.2.1.3-1.2.1.4).
23 SD 33.2 (2.1); SD 47.20 (1.3).
24 The basic abbreviations used here are Be = Burmese edition; Be:Ka = certain Burmese editions; Ce = Ceylonese (Sinhala) edition; Ee = European (PTS) editions; Ke = Khmer (Cambodian) edition; Se = Siamese edition.

http://dharmafarer.org
Since both Ānanda and Udayī address one another as āvuso, it is likely that the Buddha is still alive at that time. The fact that these suttas are located in Kosambī also suggests that they record teachings given by Ānanda when the Buddha is in solitary retreat in the Pārileyya forest during the 10th rains of the ministry (BA 3). In that case, these suttas clearly belong to the “Kosambi incident” cycle.26

3 The First (Nines) Discourse on the Directly Visible

3.1 Meaning of dhamma

3.1.1 The Commentary does not gloss on dhamma. From the Sutta context, dhamma clearly means “state” and its related teachings, and “state” here refers to each of the dhyanas described in the Sutta. This dhyana is that “the directly visible dharma” (sandiṭṭhika dhamma), meaning that it is experienced as part of our mental process of building up the conditions for the arising of nirvana in due course.

3.1.2 This “directly visible state,” that is, the dhyana, is also spoken of “in a provisional manner” (pariḥāyena) that is, in a relative way, in relation to nirvana. None of these dhyanas, either alone or in combination, can bring nirvana. However, at any of these stages, we can, having emerged from it, reflect on it as being mind-made, and hence, impermanent. In fact, this is what needs to be done for each of these dhyanas, if we are to progress through them. In this sense, they are “provisional.”

3.1.3 The 9th and last stage—cessation—is the only one said to be presented in a “non-provisional manner” (nippariyāyena), that is, as an experience of nirvana as “cessation,’ that is, the blissful end of all suffering, at least for its duration. It is important to note that we cannot define nirvana as being either in a provisional or a non-provisional way. We may only describe or refer to a concept of nirvana in either of these ways—that is, from the unawakened person’s viewpoint.

What is described here for the sake of our understanding, is give us an inspiring vision of the possibility of awakening to nirvana, liberation from suffering. Neither the provisional nor the non-provisional descriptions of nirvana is nirvana itself. We can only describe nirvana, but never really define it as we do with other words. After all, nirvana is unconditioned or non-conditioned.27

25 Or, “that-factored nirvana.” “By that means” or “that factor” (tad-aṅga) refers to the nirvana that has one or other dhyana as its factor, that is, the 1st dhyana and so on (Tad-aṅga, nibbāna ti paṭhama-j,jhān’adinā tena tena aṅgena nibbānam, AA 4:207). Here, the meditator attains by means of dhyana meditation. Tad-aṅga recurs at M 3:148,27 (MA 4:202,16); A 4:411,1 (AA 4:193,24).

26 The “incident” is the quarrel between the two parties of monks at Kosambi. When they refused to listen to the Buddha, he quietly leaves to spend the 10th rains in solitary retreat in the Pārileyya forest (BA 3): see SD 6.1 (6).

27 On the ineffability regarding nirvana and silence related to true reality, see Silence and the Buddha, SD 44.1, esp (1.1.2 + 5.4).

http://dharmafarer.org
(Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Sutta 1

Or Paṭhama (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Sutta The First (Nines) Discourse on the Directly Visible

Or Dhamma Sandiṭṭhika Sutta The Discourse on the Directly Visible State | A 9.46/4:453

Theme: The nature of the directly visible nirvana

1  (Originating in Kosambī,)²⁹
2  “‘Directly visible state. Directly visible state,’ avuso,³⁰ it is said.
How, avuso, has the Blessed One spoken of the directly visible state (sandiṭṭhika dhamma)?”

THE OPENING: THE 9 PROGRESSIVE ABODES [1.3.2.2]

The 4 dhyanas

(1) THE 1ˢᵗ DHYANA

3  Here, avuso, a monk,³¹ quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states, attains and dwells in the 1ˢᵗ dhyana,
  accompanied by initial application and sustained application, and with zest and happiness born of solitude.³²

3.2 He dwells, having touched that base³³ with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.³⁴

3.3 To that extent, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible dharma in a provisional [relative] manner.³⁵

(2) THE 2ⁿᵈ DHYANA

4  And, furthermore, avuso, a monk, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, attains and dwells in the 2ⁿᵈ dhyana,

²⁸ Ee Se so (after its 1ˢᵗ sutta); Be Če sāmañña, vagga, the chapter on similarities.
²⁹ Ce. On Kosambi, see SD 1 (1-2).
³⁰ Presumably, Ānanda is addressing the monk Udāyī—Kāl'udāyī, says Comy (AA 4:205)—in Ghoṣit’ārāma, outside Kosambi, far west of the “middle country” (majjhima, desa), ie, the central Gangetic plain. Since they address one another as āvuso (“Friend, brother”), this sutta—and the others of this Pañcāla Vagga [2.1]—record events while the Buddha is still living. The Buddha’s absence may be explained by the fact that he is away on solitary retreat for the rains of the 10ᵗʰ year of the ministry (BA 3): see SD 6.1 (2+6). Mahā Parinibbāna Sūtra (D 16) records the Buddha, in his last days, as instructing that senior monks should address juniors by name or as āvuso, while junior monks should address seniors as bhante (“sir”) or āyasmā (“venerable”) (D 16, 6.2), SD 9.
³¹ “A monk” (bhikkhu) in such contexts always refers to a meditator (Satipaṭṭhāna Sūtra, M 10,3A n, SD 13.3), or to the practitioner (SD 4.9 (5.3); SD 13.1 (3.1.1)).
³² “Born of solitude,” viveka,ja; ie it is the result of abandoning the hindrances: on the 3 kinds of solitude, see The body in Buddhism, SD 29.6a (1.5). On the omission of “one-pointedness of mind” (cittassa ek’aggatā) and “concentration” (samādhi) here, see The layman and dhyana, SD 8.5.
³³ “That base” (tad-ayatanam), ie, the meditation state.
³⁴ Yathā yathā ca tad-ayatanam tathā tathā naṃ kāyena phassīvā viharati, paññāya ca naṃ pajānāti.
³⁵ Ettāvatā'pi kho āvuso sandiṭṭhiko dhammo vutto bhagavatā pariyāya. “In a provisional manner,” pariyāya-ya, ie, in a restricted sense, “in a sense” [1.4.2-1.4.4]; cf nippariyāya [1.4.5].
4.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.

To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible Dharma in a provisional [relative] manner.

(3) The 3rd Dhyana

5 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, with the fading away of zest, he dwells equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and experiences happiness with the body.

He attains and dwells in the 3rd dhyana, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’

He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the happiness free from zest.

5.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.

To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible Dharma in a provisional [relative] manner.

(4) The 4th Dhyana

6 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, with the abandoning of joy and pain—

and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure—

attains and dwells in the 4th dhyana, that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.

6.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.

To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible Dharma in a provisional [relative] manner.

The 4 attainments

(5) The Sphere of Infinite Space

7 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, having completely transcended perceptions of form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, through non-attention to perceptions of diversity, contemplating, “Infinite space,” attains and dwells in the sphere of infinite space.38

---

36 On “initial application and sustained application” (vitakka, vicāra), see Vitakka, vicāra, SD 33.4; SD 8.4 (5.1.2).

37 The 2nd dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (ariya, tuññhā, bhūva) because within it initial application and sustained application (thinking and discursion, vitakka, vicāra) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur. (S 2:273); cf S 4:293 where vitakka and vicāra are called verbal formation (vaci, sānikhaṇa), the mental factors responsible for speech. In Ariya,parityesaṇa S (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate). See Dutiya Jhāna Pañha S (S 40.2/4:263 f), SD 24.12.
7.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.

To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible Dharma in a provisional [relative] manner.

(6) THE SPHERE OF CONSCIOUSNESS

8 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, having completely transcended the sphere of infinite space, contemplating, “Infinite consciousness,”
attains and dwells in the sphere of infinite consciousness.39

8.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.

To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible Dharma in a provisional [relative] manner.

(7) THE SPHERE OF NOTHINGNESS

9 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, having completely transcended the sphere of infinite consciousness, contemplating, “There is nothing,”
attains and [451] dwells in the sphere of nothingness.40

9.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.

To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible Dharma in a provisional [relative] manner.

(8) THE SPHERE OF NEITHER-PERCEPTION-NOR-NON-PERCEPTION

10 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, having completely transcended the sphere of nothingness, contemplating, “This is peaceful; this is sublime,”
attains to the sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception.41

10.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.

To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible dharma in a provisional [relative] manner.

The cessation of perception and feeling

11 (9) Furthermore, avuso, a monk, having completely transcended the sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, attains and dwells in the cessation of perception and feeling.

38 Sabbatha ṛūpa, saññānaṁ samatikkamā paṭigha, saññānaṁ atthaṅgamā nānatta, saññānaṁ amanasikārā ananto ākāso ti ākāsānañcâyatanaṁ upasampajja viharati.
39 Sabbatha ākāsānañc'āyatanaṁ samatikkama anantarit viññānati viññānañca ākāsānañcâyatanaṁ upasampajja viharati.
40 Sabbatha viññāṇañc'āyatanaṁ samatikkama n’atthi kiñci ti ākāsānañc'āyatanaṁ upasampajja viharati.
41 Sabbatha ākāsānañc'āyatanaṁ samatikkama santam etam etani paññitam etan ti n’eva, saññā, nāsaññā añc'āyatanaṁ upasampajja viharati.
11.2 And having seen it with wisdom, his mental influxes are fully destroyed. 
To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible dharma in a non-provisional manner.  

— evaṁ —

4 The Second (Nines) Discourse on the Directly Visible

4.1 MEANING OF NIBBĀNA

4.1.1 The 2 kinds of nirvana

4.1.1.1 The Dīgha Commentary mentions 2 kinds of nirvana:  
(1) the nirvana of the defilements (kilesa, nibbāna), and  
(2) the nirvana of the aggregates (khandha, nibbāna). ([DA 899 f])  
According to the Commentary, nibbāna here refers to the “nirvana of the defilements” (kilesa, nibbāna), that is, the cessation of the 3 unwholesome roots (akusala, mūla) of greed, hate and delusion ([AA 4:205]).  
In the suttas, these 2 kinds of nirvana are respectively called “the nirvana with remains” (sa, upādi, sesa nibbāna) and “the nirvana without remains” (anupādi, sesa nibbāna). [SD 50.13 (1.3.2)].

4.1.1.2 In brief, “the nirvana of the defilements” entails the cessation of arising of new karma and refers to the arhat’s state while he still lives. This refers to the utter destruction of the roots (mūla) of greed, hate and delusion, the bases for our ignorance, craving, rebirth and suffering. This is the nirvana of the arhat who continues to live as long as his karmic aggregates last.  
At the moment of death and thereafter, the arhat is said to have attained “the nirvana of the aggregates,” which means that all his form, feeling, perception, formation and consciousness cease to arise any more. Like a fire that has gone, there is nothing more speak about it, except that it is “extinguished, quenched or cooled” (nibbuta). [SD 50.1 (2)].

4.2 THE “DIRECTLY VISIBLE” NIRVANA

4.2.1 Experiential

4.2.1.1 The key idea here is that nirvana is “directly visible” (sandiṭṭhika), which, as we have seen, means “that which is seen for oneself” [1.3.1], especially by review knowledge [1.2.2]. This understanding entails two important characteristics of the practice and result of the Buddha teachings. The first is that it is experiential, and second that it is verifiable.

4.2.1.2 True reality is experiential in the sense that we can only know is through our 6 sense-bases; what we can know—the objects of knowledge—are the sense-objects, or basically, our experiences. We can know nothing beyond this, and we don’t need to. This understanding is sufficient as the basis for

---

42 “In a non-provisional manner,” nippariyāyena, ie, in the ultimate sense [1.4.5].
43 SD 50.13 (1.3.2).
44 On the 5 aggregates (pañca-k, khandha), see SD 17, eg (Dve) Khandhā S (S 22.48), SD 17.1a.
45 On the nature of nirvana as a concept, see Nibbāna Paṭisaṁyutta S 1 (U 8.1) + SD 50.1 (2).
working for mental liberation. This is the teaching of the Sabba Sutta (S 35.23). What is experiential—based on personal experience—is also verifiable [4.2.2].

4.2.2 Verifiable

4.2.2.1 A teaching or truth that is experiential also means that it can and should be investigated and verified for ourself. In fact, investigation (vīmaṁsā) is the theme of such discourses as the Vīmaṁsaka Sutta (M 47), where the Buddha invites us to investigate even his own moral virtue and mental state—that is, to say, buddhahood itself.

4.2.2.2 The Buddha’s teaching is personally verifiable and realizable in this life itself (saсchikato sayam, Tha 331; diṭṭhe dhamme viditvā, Sn 1053). We can test it, understand it, and free our minds even here and now. In an important way, we can see how nirvana works here and now, such as when we understand the nature of anger, and so wisely overcome it. The anger, as it were, has been “cooled” (nibbuta). Our problem is that this is only a temporary measure. We need to learn how to make such a habit of it so that we will naturally have no anger at all.

SD 50.25b

(Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Sutta 2

Or Dutiya (Navaka) Sandiṭṭhika Sutta The Second (Nines) Discourse on the Directly Visible
Or Nibbāna Sandiṭṭhika Sutta The Discourse on the Directly Visible Nirvana | A 9.46+47/4:453

Theme: The nature of the directly visible nirvana

1 (Originating in Kosambī.)
2 “Directly visible nirvana. Directly visible nirvana,” avuso, it is said. How, avuso, has the Blessed One spoken of the directly visible nirvana (sandiṭṭhika nibbāna)?”

The opening: The 9 progressive abodes

The 4 dhyanas

(1) The 1st dhyan

3 Here, avuso, a monk, quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states,

---

46 SD 35.23 (SD 7.1).
47 M 47/1:317-320 (SD 35.6).
48 SD 35.4a (4); SD 35.6 (3.4).
49 Ee Se so (after its 1st sutta); Be Ce sāmañña,vagga, the chapter on similarities.
50 Ce. See A 94.6 (SD 50.25a) n ad loc.
51 On this mode of address, see A 94.6 (SD 50.25a) n ad loc above.
52 Anupubba,vihāra, see (1.3.2.2).
53 “A monk” (bhikkhu) in such contexts always refers to a meditator (Satipaṭṭhāna S, M 10,3A n, SD 13.3), or to the practitioner (SD 4.9 (5.3); SD 13.1 (3.1.1)).

http://dhamfarer.org
attains and dwells in the 1st dhyana, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, and with zest and happiness born of solitude.\textsuperscript{54}

3.2 He dwells, having touched that base\textsuperscript{55} with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.\textsuperscript{56}

3.3 To that extent, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible nirvana in a provisional [relative] manner.\textsuperscript{57}

(2) The 2\textsuperscript{nd} Dhyana

4 And, furthermore, avuso, a monk, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, attains and dwells in the 2\textsuperscript{nd} dhyana, free from initial application and sustained application,\textsuperscript{58} with zest and happiness born of concentration.\textsuperscript{59}

4.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom. To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible nirvana in a provisional [relative] manner.

(3) The 3\textsuperscript{rd} Dhyana

5 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, with the fading away of zest, dwells equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and experiences happiness with the body. He attains and dwells in the 3\textsuperscript{rd} dhyana, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’ He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the happiness free from zest.

5.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom. To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible nirvana in a provisional [relative] manner.

(4) The 4\textsuperscript{th} Dhyana

6 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, with the abandoning of joy and pain— and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure— attains and dwells in the 4\textsuperscript{th} dhyana, that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.

6.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.

---

\textsuperscript{54} See A 94.6 (SD 50.25a) n ad loc above.

\textsuperscript{55} “That base” (\textit{tad-āyatanaṁ}), ie, the meditation state.

\textsuperscript{56} \textit{Yathā yathā ca tad-āyatanaṁ tathā tathā naṁ kāyena phassitvā viharati, paññāya ca naṁ pajānāti.}

\textsuperscript{57} \textit{Ettāvatā'pi kho āvuso sandiṭṭhiko dhammo vutto bhagavatā pariyāyena}. “In a provisional manner,” \textit{pariyāyena}, ie, in a restricted sense, “in a sense” [1.4.1-1.4.4]; cf \textit{nippariyāyena} [1.4.5].

\textsuperscript{58} On “initial application and sustained application,” see A 94.6 (SD 50.25a) n ad loc.

\textsuperscript{59} The 2\textsuperscript{nd} dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (\textit{ariya, tuññhi, bhūva}): see A 94.6 (SD 50.25a) n ad loc.

\url{http://dharmafarer.org}
To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible nirvana in a provisional [relative] manner.

The 4 attainments

(5) The sphere of infinite space
7 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, having completely transcended perceptions of form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, through non-attention to perceptions of diversity, contemplating, “Infinite space,” attains and dwells in the sphere of infinite space.\(^{60}\)
7.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.
To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible nirvana in a provisional [relative] manner.

(6) The sphere of consciousness
8 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, having completely transcended the sphere of infinite space, contemplating, “Infinite consciousness,” attains and dwells in the sphere of infinite consciousness.\(^{61}\)
8.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.
To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible nirvana in a provisional [relative] manner.

(7) The sphere of nothingness
9 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, having completely transcended the sphere of infinite consciousness, contemplating, “There is nothing,” attains and [451] dwells in the sphere of nothingness.\(^{62}\)
9.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.
To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible nirvana in a provisional [relative] manner.

(8) The sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception
10 And furthermore, avuso, a monk, having completely transcended the sphere of nothingness, contemplating, “This is peaceful; this is sublime,” attains to the sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception.\(^{63}\)

\(^{60}\) Sabbaso rūpa, saññānaṁ samatikkamā pāṭigha, saññānaṁ atthaṅgamā nānatta, saññānaṁ amanasikārā ananto ākāso ti ākāsānañc'āyaṇatam upasampajja viharati.

\(^{61}\) Sabbaso ākāsānañc'āyaṇatam samatikkama ananta viññāṇatam ākiñcaññ'āyaṇatam upasampajja viharati.

\(^{62}\) Sabbaso viññāṇañc'āyaṇatam samatikkama n'atthi kiñcī ti ākiñcaññ'āyaṇatam upasampajja viharati.

\(^{63}\) Sabbaso ākiñcaññ'āyaṇatam samatikkama santam etoṁ paññātmaṁ etoṁ ti n'eva, saññā, nāsaññ'āyaṇatam upasampajja viharati.

http://dhammfarer.org
10.2 He dwells, having touched that base with the body as it is attained, and he understands it with wisdom.

To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible nirvana in a provisional [relative] manner.

The cessation of perception and feeling

11 (9) Furthermore, avuso, a monk, having completely transcended the sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, attains and dwells in the cessation of perception and feeling.

11.2 And having seen it with wisdom, his mental influxes are fully destroyed.

To that extent, too, avuso, the Blessed One has spoken of the directly visible nirvana in a non-provisional manner.⁶⁴

— evāṁ —

170401 170417 170612

---

⁶⁴ “In a non-provisional manner,” nippariyāyena, ie, in the ultimate sense [1.4.5].