

# 16

## (Catukka) Appassuta Sutta

The (Fours) Discourse on Little Learning | A 4.6

Theme: Learning and spiritual progress

Translated by Piya Tan ©2017

### 1 Introduction

#### 1.1 SUTTA SUMMARY

**1.1.0 The (Catukka) Appassuta Sutta** (A 4.6) is a straightforward discourse on the relationship between learning and spiritual progress, thus:

- (1) One with little learning who has *not* progressed by his learning;
- (2) One with little learning who *has* progressed by his learning;
- (3) One with great learning who has *not* progressed by his learning; and
- (4) One with great learning who *has* progressed by his learning.

The “learning” (*suta*) here refers to that of the Dharma, represented by the 9 limbs of the Teacher’s teaching [2.1]. “Progress” or “spiritual progress” (*uppanna*) refers to the keeping to the 3 trainings in moral virtue, in mental concentration and in insight wisdom, and the attaining of the fruit of the noble path, that is, at least the attaining of streamwinning. (AA 3:5)

#### **1.1.1 One with *little* learning who has *not* progressed by his learning**

**1.1.1.1** “One with little learning” refers to one who has not mastered the Buddha’s teaching, or who has stopped learning the suttas and the Vinaya, and he is also not keeping up with the 3 trainings. As a result, he has neither attained any of the path fruitions nor aspires to any of them in this life itself. In other words, this person is neither at least a streamwinner nor aspires to be one: he has no love for the Buddha Dharma.

**1.1.1.2** “One with little learning” clearly implies that he is seriously hampered by **the 3 fetters** of self-identity view, doubt, and attachment to rituals and vows. Such a person is likely to be self-centred, even narcissistic, lacks faith and understanding of the Dharma, and superstitious—he tends to see the robe or religious life merely as a means of livelihood, and may endeavour to profit from religion in a worldly manner, or merely to have a comfortable life lacking diligence in spiritual training.

*Mâ-p,pamaññetha<sup>1</sup> pāpassa*  
*“na mañ tam āgamissati”*

*Uda,bindu,nipātena*  
*uda,kumbho pi pūrati*  
*pūrati bālo pāpassa*

*thoka,thokam pi ācinam*

(Dh 121)

Think not lightly of bad,  
 “It will not come to me!”

Even a water-pot is filled  
 with falling water, drop by drop:

A fool is filled with bad,  
 piled up, little by little.

*d*

*c*

<sup>1</sup> Be *māvamaññetha* = *mā avamaññetha* (from the DhA 3:16, glossed as *mā avajāneyya*, “do not look down.”) Uv 17.5-6 (Bernhard 1965): *nālpam manyeta pāpasya/puṇyasya*; (Nakatani 1987) *nālpā-manyeta*; Dh:P 193 f *nāppam pāpassa/puññassa manyeyā*. Dh:G 209 f *na apu mañe’a pavasa/puñasa* is ambiguous. It is clear, however, that Uv and Dh:P traditions assumed that the equivalent of *māppamaññati* which they inherited stood for *mā appam maññati*, rather than *māppamaññati*. See Dh:N 92 n121-22.

### 1.1.2 One with *little* learning who has progressed by his learning

**1.1.2.1** “One with little learning” refers to one who carefully learns, remembers and practises. The little that he learns, he makes every effort to understand so that he is motivated to live a morally virtuous life, cultivate his mind and win insight wisdom into the true reality of things. For example, he learns a key sutta—such as **the (Anicca) Cakkhu Sutta** (S 25.1) or any of the other 9 suttas in **the Okkanta Saṃyutta** (S 25.2-10)—and constantly reflects on impermanence.

**1.1.2.2** He also understands the nature of **streamwinning**—the first true step on the path of awakening—and aspires to be at least a streamwinner in this life. Hence, he is inspired to keep his precepts, whether as a monastic or a lay practitioner, constantly reflect on impermanence and do some meditation whenever he can, and questions experienced and virtuous teachers about the Dharma in connection with his practice and aspiration to streamwinning.

**1.1.2.3** Of such a person, **the Dhammapada** says:

<p><i>Appam pi ce sahitaṃ bhāsamāno dhammassa hoti anudhammacārī rāgañ ca dosaṃ ca pahāya moham samma-p, pajāno suvimutta, citto anupādiyāno idha vā huram vā sa bhāgavā sāmāññassa hoti</i></p>	(Dh 20)	<p>If one, reciting only a little of the texts,<sup>2</sup> lives in keeping with the Dharma, having abandoned lust, hate and delusion, knowing rightly, the mind well freed, unclinging here or hereafter, he partakes of reclusehood.</p>
<p><i>Mā-p, pamaññetha pūṇṇassa “na maṃ taṃ āgamissati” Uda, bindu, nipātena uda, kumbho pi pūrati dhīro pūrati puññassa thoka, thokam pi ācinam</i></p>	(Dh 122)	<p>Think not lightly of good, “It will not come to me!” Even a water-pot is filled with falling water, drop by drop: The wise is filled with good, piled up, little by little.</p>

### 1.1.3 One with *great* learning who has *not* progressed by his learning

**1.1.3.1** With easy access to information today about the Buddha Dharma, anyone who is able to read and quote the texts and teachings as if one has experienced and mastered them oneself. However, there is a vital difference between merely *knowing* the words and ideas, and truly tasting the liberating power of the Dharma.

To know is to believe: to have faith in a person. To understand and be free is to see the meaning and spirit of the teaching.

**1.1.3.2** Again, the imagery of **music** is helpful here. Let’s say many people can read music and play some musical instrument, or even form an orchestra, and there are very good scores of excellent music available. Anyone or any orchestra can play such pieces. However, without understanding the score, without practising, without proper mentorship, one would not produce good music.

<sup>2</sup> *Sa, hita* (lit, “that which has benefits”) refers not to the whole of the Tipiṭaka (Vinaya, Sutta and Abhidhamma), but only to the teaching and the discipline (*dhamma, vinaya*), especially the Dhamma of the suttas. Strictly speaking, the Abhidhamma is early post-canonical: see **Dhamma and Abhidhamma**, SD 26.1.

**1.1.3.3** The orchestra and choral concert, too, needs a good conductor, without whom it would not play in the best, or even right, way. **Conducting** is the art of directing a musical performance. The primary duties of the **conductor** are to interpret the score created by a composer in a manner which is reflective of the specific indications within that score, set the tempo (timing), ensure correct entries by various members of the ensemble, and to “shape” the phrasing where appropriate.<sup>3</sup>

To convey their ideas and interpretation, conductors communicate with their musicians primarily through hand gestures, typically, though not invariably, with the aid of a baton, and may use other gestures or signals, such as eye contact with relevant performers. A conductor’s directions will almost invariably be supplemented or reinforced by verbal instructions or suggestions to their musicians in rehearsal prior to a performance.<sup>4</sup>

**1.1.3.4** The true Dharma teacher is like a good conductor. He communicates mostly through speech, though sometimes with the aid of audio-visuals of some kind. Of vital significance are the teacher’s personality, calmness, patience, wisdom and compassion—above all, his love and passion for the Dharma. When a good Dharma teacher speaks the Dharma, we will *hear* or *see* ourself in it, which is the basis for our self-understanding and, in due course, our self-liberation, and our own ability to inspire others to turn to the Dharma, change themselves for the better, and head for the path of awakening.

**1.1.3.5** One of “the great unmentionable of orchestral playing” is **faking**, the process by which an orchestral musician gives the “... impression of playing every note as written,” typically for a very challenging passage that is very high or very fast, while not actually playing the notes that are in the printed music part.<sup>5</sup>

One reason that musicians “fake” is because they have not had enough rehearsals. Another factor is the extreme challenges in contemporary pieces. Professionals interviewed by *the Strad* magazine said that “faking” may be “acceptable” when a part is not written well for the instrument, but faking “just because you haven’t practised” the music is not acceptable.<sup>6</sup>

Similarly, a lot of **faking** occurs in teachers and believers of religion which is not “well-written,” that does not really reflect the true reality of life, but is rooted in dogma and faith, and where followers are compelled to follow a church or preacher, but not allowed to truly see their own inner good and genius for peace, joy and wisdom. In fact, *faking* is the norm when we do not or cannot really understand or accept such teachings, but desire to be accepted as part of the religious tribe and not be ostracized in any way. In other words, this is about crowd control, not personal salvation or liberation.

**1.1.3.6** Of such a person with great learning who has not progressed spiritually, **the Dhammapada** says:

*Bahum-pi ce sahitam bhāsamāno  
na tak,karo hoti naro pamatto  
gopo va gāvo gaṇayam paresam  
na bhāgavā sāmāññassa hoti*

(Dh 19)

If, reciting much of the texts,  
a man but acts not accordingly, heedless,  
he is like a cowherd who counts others’ cows:  
he partakes not of reclusehood.

<sup>3</sup> Michael Kennedy & Joyce Bourne Kennedy, “Conducting,” in *Oxford Concise Dictionary of Music* (5<sup>th</sup> ed), Oxford: Oxford Univ Press, 2007.

<sup>4</sup> Raymond Holden, “The technique of conducting”, p. 3 in *The Cambridge Companion to Conducting*, ed José Antonio Bowen, Cambridge, Cambridge Univ Press, 2003:3. See <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Conducting>.

<sup>5</sup> Alice McVeigh, “Faking it—the great unmentionable of orchestral playing,” in *The Strad*, June 2006: <http://www.thestrads.com/faking-it-the-great-unmentionable-of-orchestral-playing/>.

<sup>6</sup> See <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Orchestra>.

<p><i>Na tena paṇḍito hoti yāvatā bahu bhāsati khemī averī abhaya paṇḍito ti pavuccati</i></p>	(Dh 258)	<p>One is not wise [learned] merely because one speaks much. Who is secure, anger-free, fear-free, is called wise.</p>
<p><i>Na tāvatā dhamma, dharo yāvatā bahu bhāsati yo ca appam pi sutvāna dhammaṃ kāyena passati sa ve dhammadharo hoti yo dhammaṃ na-p, pamajjati</i></p>	(Dh 259)	<p>One is not a Dharma-bearer [Dharma-expert] merely because one speaks much. But who, having heard even a little, sees the Dharma with his body— he is truly a Dharma-bearer, one who is not heedless of the Dharma.</p>

### **1.1.4 One with great learning who has progressed by his learning**

**1.1.4.1** We are fortunate today to still have an intact and authentic collection of **Pāli suttas**, which is “the first known and most complete extant early Buddhist canon.”<sup>7</sup> The Pali suttas are the best working records of the historical Buddha, his awakening and the early saints and disciples, and the background of early Buddhism. Working with such suttas—along with proper training in early Buddhism meditation—we will benefit from the two arms of early Buddhism, working like the two wings of a flying bird. These are the texts that we should master as well as we can—as living tradition and liberating experience.

**1.1.4.2** The one “with great learning who has *not* progressed by his learning” refers, as a rule, to most of the great saints of the Buddha’s time. In an important sense, the great saints of **the 1<sup>st</sup> period**,<sup>8</sup> especially the arhats of the 1<sup>st</sup> 10 years of the ministry and those converted by the Buddha himself and who become arhats by their ensuing practice, technically, do *not* progress by “great learning” of the texts—for the simple reason that there are not much texts to learn from during those early years.

Those early saints do not study the texts, but receive direct instructions from the Buddha himself or from their teachers. It is often recorded that such saints would approach the Buddha when they feel ready, and ask the Buddha for “brief instruction,” which they will use as the basis for their meditation in solitary practice. Such a request—as that of the elder **Māluṅkya,putta**—goes thus:

Bhante, it would be good if the Blessed One would teach me a teaching in brief.

Having heard such a teaching from the Blessed One, I might dwell alone, aloof, diligent,  
exertive and resolute.<sup>9</sup>

**Māluṅkya,putta Sutta** (S 35.95,3.5) SD 5.9

**1.1.4.3** Here is a list of suttas and their respective protagonists who request for a brief instruction before going into solitary retreat and emerging as arhats, except in the case of Ānanda, who attains only streamwinning (the last case listed here):

<b>Puṇṇ’ovāda Sutta</b>	M 145/3:267 = S 35.88	Puṇṇa (Suṇāparantaka)	SD 20.15
<b>(Rāhula) Cakkhu Sutta</b>	S 18.1/2:244	Rāhula	
<b>Aññātara Bhikkhu Sutta 1</b>	S 22.35/3:35	a certain monk	SD 31.4

<sup>7</sup> Harvey 1990:3; Maguire 2001:68.

<sup>8</sup> See foll n.

<sup>9</sup> *Sādhu me bhante bhagavā saṅkhittena dhammaṃ desetu, yam ahaṃ bhagavato dhammaṃ sutvā eko vūpak-aṭṭho appamatto ātāpī pahit’atto vihareyyan’ti*. This is the *saṅkhitta, dhamma* pericope. These meditators all end up as arhats, except for Ānanda, who attains streamwinning: (**Ānanda**) **Saṅkhitta Dhamma S** (S 35.86,1), SD 50.15.

<b>Aññatara Bhikkhu Sutta 2</b>	S 22.36/3:36	a certain monk	SD 31.14
<b>Upādiyamāna Sutta</b>	S 22.63/3:73	a certain monk	
<b>(Khandha) Ānanda Sutta</b>	S 22.158/3:187	Ānanda	
<b>Upanissina Vagga</b>	S 23.23-34/3:198 f	Rādha (12 occasions) <sup>10</sup>	
<b>Miga,jāla Sutta 2</b>	S 35.64/4:37	Miga,jāla	SD 44.7
<b>Rādha Anicca Sutta</b>	S 35.76/4:48	Rādha	
<b>(Ānanda) Saṅkhitta Dhamma Sutta</b>	S 35.86,1/4:54	Ānanda (streamwinner)	SD 50.15
<b>(Saḷāyatana) Puṇṇa Sutta</b>	S 35.88/4:60 = M 145	Puṇṇa (Suṇāparantaka)	SD 20.15
<b>(Anatta) Bāhiya Sutta</b>	S 35.89/4:63 f	Bāhiya 3	SD 93.14
<b>Māluṅkya,putta Sutta</b>	S 35.95,3.5/4:72	Māluṅkya,putta	SD 5.9
<b>Koṭṭhika Anicca Sutta 1-3</b>	S 35.162-164/4:145-147	Koṭṭhika (3 occasions)	
<b>(Anubaddha) Bhikkhu Sutta<sup>11</sup></b>	S 47.3/5:143	a certain monk	SD 24.6a
<b>(Satipaṭṭhāna) Bāhiya Sutta</b>	S 47.15/5:165	Bāhiya 2	SD 47.10
<b>(Arahatta) Uttiya Sutta</b>	S 47.16/5:166	Uttiya	SD 47.11(12)
<b>Pātimokkha Saṁvara Sutta</b>	S 47.46/5:187	a certain monk	
<b>(Satipatthāna) Duccarita Sutta</b>	S 47.47/5:188	a certain monk	
<b>(Taṇhā) Māluṅkya,putta Sutta</b>	A 4.254/2:248	Māluṅkya,putta	SD 84.10
<b>Satthu,sāsana Sutta</b>	A 7.79/4:143	Upāli (the Sakya)	SD 104.1
<b>Saṅkhitta (Desita) Dhamma Sutta</b>	A 8.63 /4:299	a certain monk	SD 46.6

**1.1.4.4** From the above list of suttas [1.1.4.3] relating to various monks' personal requests to the Buddha for "brief instructions" for purposes of personal solitary retreats, we can deduce 3 things, that is:

**(1)** All these monks received meditation teachings and instructions, and then went into solitary practice. In most cases, these meditators then reported as having attained arhathood in **the full arhat-hood pericope**,<sup>12</sup> thus:

Then, that monk, dwelling *alone, aloof, diligent, exertive, and resolute*,<sup>13</sup>  
in no long time at all, having right here and now realized it for himself through direct knowledge,<sup>14</sup>  
attained and dwelt in the supreme goal of the holy life,<sup>15</sup>  
for the sake of which sons of family<sup>16</sup> rightly go forth from the household life into homelessness.<sup>17</sup>

THE ARHAT'S REVIEW KNOWLEDGE. He directly knew:

"Birth is destroyed,	<i>khīṇa,jāti</i>
the holy life has been lived,	<i>vusitam brahma,cariyaṃ</i>
done what is to be done,	<i>kataṃ karaṇīyaṃ</i>

<sup>10</sup> This special chapter has a total of 12 suttas recording the occasions when Rādha asks the Buddha for a brief teaching: **Māra S** (S 23.23), **Māra,dhamma S** (S 23.24), **Anicca S** (S 23.25), **Anicca,dhamma S Dukkha S** (S 23.27), **Dukkha,dhamma S** (S 23.28), **Anattā S** (S 23.29), **Anatta,dhamma S** (S 23.30), **Khaya,dhamma S** (S 23.31), **Vaya,-dhamma S** (S 23.32), **Samudaya,dhamma S** (S 23.33), **Nirodha,dhamma S** (S 23.34).

<sup>11</sup> Also called **(Satipaṭṭhāna) Bhikkhu S**.

<sup>12</sup> For details, see **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9,56.2+56.3), SD 7.14.

<sup>13</sup> *Atha kho so bhikkhu eko vūpakaṭṭho appamatto ātāpī pahit'atto viharanto*. This is stock: see §3.1 above n.

<sup>14</sup> *Na cirass'eva ... diṭṭh'eva dhamme sayarṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja*.

<sup>15</sup> *Tad anuttaraṃ brahma,cariya,pariyosānaṃ ... vihāsi*.

<sup>16</sup> *Kula,puttā* are of 2 kinds: those who are born so (*jāti kula,putta*), and those who are so by conduct (*ācāra kula,putta*). Either the second (which is all inclusive) is meant (DA 2:363), or both is meant (MA 1:180).

<sup>17</sup> *Yass'atthāya kula,puttā sammad-eva agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajanti*,

there is no more of this state of being.”<sup>18</sup>  
And that certain monk became one of the arhats.

*nâparam itthattâyâti*

(2) A few of the monks mentioned in (1.1.4.4) approach the Buddha more than once for “brief instructions,” before going into solitary retreats. In other words, they went into a number of solitary meditation sessions before attaining arhathood, or in the case of Ānanda, before attaining streamwinning (while the Buddha is still alive). From the above list [1.1.4.3], we have this list of those who go for multiple requests for “brief instructions” from the Buddha going into solitary retreats:

Koṭṭhika (or Koṭṭhita)	3 occasions	S 35.162-164	
Mālunkya,putta	2 occasions	S 35.95; A 4.254	
Rādha	15 occasions	S 23.23-34; S 35.76-78	
Ānanda	2 occasions	S 22.83; S 35.86	attains only streamwinning.

It should be noted that in the case of **Puṇṇa Sunāparantaka**, his 2 suttas (M 145 = S 35.88) record the same teaching. In the cases of “**a certain monk**” (*aññatara bhikkhu*), it refers to different monks for each sutta. In the case of **Bāhiya**—S 35.89 and S 47.15—we have 2 different individuals, that is, Bahiya 2 (also known as Bāhika) and Bāhiya 3.<sup>19</sup>

(3) Apparently, the occasions for monastics asking for brief teachings and then going into solitary retreats to attain arhathood [1.1.4.3] are less common than the occasions for individuals or groups listening to the Dharma, then going for the 3 refuges (as a rule), following which they go into solitary retreat to emerge as arhats. The latter, more common, process, in fact, applies to almost all the other converts other than those listed above [1.1.4.3].

More often, the convert listens to the Dharma, rightly sees the Dharma, goes for refuge, renounces, and then departs. This departure, as a rule, refers to the entry into solitary retreat and emerging as an arhat. **The Poṭṭhapāda Sutta** (D 9), for example, records how Citta, the son of the elephant trainer, *listens to the Dharma, rightly sees the Dharma, goes for refuge, renounces (in this case receives the going-forth and the ordination), and then departs*, thus:

Then, Citta, the son of the elephant trainer, satisfied, rejoiced in the Blessed One’s word,  
rose from his seat and, after paying homage to the Blessed One, keeping him on his right,  
departed. (D 9,56.2), SD 7.14

Immediately after this, the sutta lists **the full arhathood pericope** [1.1.4.4(1)]. The occasion when such a convert goes for refuge up to the attaining of arhathood (as just mentioned) is known as the full going-forth and arhathood pericope.<sup>20</sup>

**1.1.4.5 The arhat** is said to have a wide variety of **wisdom**—which is attained not through *textual study* but through personal realization, as mentioned earlier [1.1.4.4.(3)]. In the definitions of the “truth-follower” and the “faith-follower,” it is said that “he is not one of joyous wisdom, nor of quick wisdom” [1.2.3.3]. These 2 wisdoms—joyous wisdom and quick wisdom—are part of a list of the 4 wisdoms of an arhat, explained in **the Paṭisambhidā, magga** and mentioned in the Commentaries, thus:

<sup>18</sup> On this para and the next (the attainment of arhathood), see **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9,56.2/1:203) n, SD 7.14.

<sup>19</sup> See SD 47.10 (3).

<sup>20</sup> See **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9,54) SD 7.14 (floating header).

- (1) “Joyous wisdom” or “of laughing wisdom” (*hāsa,pañña* or *hassa,paññā*; from *hasa*, “laughter, mirth, joy”). “Here one with much joy [laughter], mirth, contentment and gladness perfects the virtues: this is joyous wisdom” (Pm 21.17/2:199 f; cf PmA 3:640).
- (2) “Quick wisdom” (*javana,paññā*), by which one who quickly understands that the 5 aggregates are all impermanent, suffering and non-self (Pm 21.18/2:200).
- (3) “Sharp wisdom” (*tikkha,paññā*), which cuts off all defilements (Pm 21.19/2:200 f), and
- (4) “Penetrating wisdom” (*nibbedhika,paññā*), by which one maintains dispassion towards all formations (Pm 21.20/2:201 f).<sup>21</sup>

**1.1.4.6 The Appassuta Sutta** (A 4.6)—we must therefore conclude—does not refer to the converts *who listen to the Dharma, rightly see the Dharma, go for refuge, renounce, then depart* to enter into solitary retreat and emerge as arhats—as clearly is the rule for the early converts (especially those of the 1<sup>st</sup> period) [1.1.4.2]. This is a time when the converts are truly “hearers” (*sāvaka*): they listen and hear the Dharma, and hearing, they see true reality, and so attain nirvana. This direct experience of the awakening process is, of course, rooted in past practice and good karma cultivated in previous lives fruiting in the conducive present conditions of being taught by the Buddha himself.

The 4 kinds of persons—their learning and how they spiritually benefit from it or not—clearly refer to those converts of **the 2<sup>nd</sup> period** [1.1.4.2], when the teaching is more established (as suggested by the listing of the 9 limbs of the Teacher’s teaching). By this process, the practitioner has to build a foundation of Dharma learning and understanding, along with meditation instructions. Applying both the wings of “study” (or theory, *pariyatti*) and “practice” (*paṭipatti*), one goes on to attain realization (*paṭivedha*) of arhathood and nirvana.

**1.1.4.7 The Nālaka Sutta** (Sn 3.11) closes with these two verses which describe the “silent sage” (*muni*) who lives in a time when the *Ti,piṭaka* has not yet been compiled, that is, during the first 10 years of the ministry (and perhaps a little later).<sup>22</sup> The “learning” of such a sage comes from his own self-awakening. He is described thus:

<p><b>44</b> <i>Yaṃ samaṇo bahu bhāsati upetaṃ attha,samhitam jānam so dhammam deseti jānam so bahu bhāsati</i></p>	<p><b>Sn 722</b></p>	<p>The recluse<sup>23</sup> speaks much, replete in sense and goal. Knowing, he teaches the Dharma, knowing, he speaks much.</p>
<p><b>45</b> <i>Yo ca jānam samyat’atto jānam na bahu bhāsati sa munī monam arahati sa munī monam ajjhagā’ti</i></p>	<p><b>Sn 723</b></p>	<p>For, he, knowing, is self-restrained; knowing, he speaks not much<sup>24</sup>— he’s a sage worthy of sagehood;<sup>25</sup> he’s a sage who’s reached sagehood.”</p>

<sup>21</sup> On the 4 wisdoms: DA 3:391-393, 4:84-86; MA 4:84; SA 1:120-123, 2:85 f; AA 2:85; ThaA 3:106 f; NmA 1:231 f.

<sup>22</sup> This is, of course, the beginning of the “1<sup>st</sup> period” of the ministry. On the “2 periods,” see SD 1.1 (2.2); SD 40a.1 (1.3).

<sup>23</sup> The “recluse” here is the “silent sage” (*muni*): SD 49.18 (1.1.2).

<sup>24</sup> **Sn 723b**: see SD 49.18 (6.2) ad loc.

<sup>25</sup> **Sn 723d**: see SD 49.18 (6.2) ad loc.

## 1.2 PROGRESSING TOWARDS THE PATH

### 1.2.1 The supermundane path

**1.2.1.1** From the Sutta’s last verse, it is clear that the practitioner described here is no ordinary practitioner, but one on the path of awakening, that is, one of the noble saints—a streamwinner, a once-returned, a non-returned or an arhat. This is, in fact, confirmed by both the Commentary (AA 3:6) and the Subcommentary (AAṬ:Be 2:225), which state that the practice is that of the “supramundane states” (*lok’uttara*), that is, the supramundane path.

**1.2.1.2** Understandably, it is difficult, if not impossible, for the average lay practitioner to attain arhathood or even non-returning. For one, to attain arhathood or non-returning entails our wholesome and natural inclination for celibacy—the abstinence from any kind of sexuality—and having nothing to do with wealth or money.<sup>26</sup>

### 1.2.2 The 4 kinds of students

**1.2.2.1** Of the 4 kinds of individuals listed by the **Appassuta Sutta**, only these two “have progressed” spiritually, that is: the “one of little learning who has *progressed* by his learning” (*appa-s,suto sutena uppanno*) and the “one of great learning who has *progressed* by his learning” (*bahu-s,suto sutena uppanno*).

We can further analyze these 2 “kinds of progressive” individuals into the **4 types of practitioners**, students or “learners,” thus:<sup>27</sup>

- |                                    |                     |  |
|------------------------------------|---------------------|--|
| (1) The intuitive student          | <i>ugghaṭitaññū</i> | a genius, who understands from only a brief instruction.   |
| (2) The diffuse student            | <i>vipañcitaññū</i> | the intellectual, one who needs some detailed explanation. |
| (3) The tractable student          | <i>neyya</i>        | one who is amenable or needs some guidance.                |
| (4) The rote-learner <sup>28</sup> | <i>pada,pārama</i>  | one who only knows a teaching at the word (literal) level. |
- (A 4.133/2:135; Pug 4.5/41; Nett 41/7, 743/125; MA 3:178, 5:60)<sup>29</sup>

**1.2.2.2** It is likely that the “one of great learning who *has* progressed by his learning” is either an intuitive student (a genius or very quick learner) or a diffuse student (an intellectual or a reasonably quick learner). The “one of little learning who *has* progressed by his learning,” on the other hand, is likely to be either a tractable student (one who needs some guidance) or a word-learner (who only knows the teaching on the word level). These are, of course, not fixed typologies, but can be progressive developmental phases for the word-learner and the tractable student, when they are properly guided and coached.

### 1.2.3 The 5 spiritual faculties

**1.2.3.1** How well a student can or will progress, to a significant extent, depends on his **5 spiritual faculties** (*pañc’indriya*)—those of faith (*saddh’indriya*), effort (*viriy’indriya*), mindfulness (*sat’indriya*), concentration (*samādh’indriya*) and wisdom (*paññ’indriya*). In doctrinal terms, while the “one of little

<sup>26</sup> See esp **Ghaṭikāra S** (M 81), SD 49.3.

<sup>27</sup> Here, “learner” simply means one who is able to understand the Dharma, and has no technical sense of *sekha*, which refers to the first 3 kinds of saints, and the arhat-to-be. See SD 10.16 (9.1).

<sup>28</sup> I.e., the student “of the word at best.”

<sup>29</sup> Also listed in **Ugghaṭitaññū S** (A 4.133), SD 3.13(3.3). On the psychological context of the 4 kinds of persons & the 5 spiritual faculties, see **Pubba,koṭṭhaka S** (S 48.44), SD 10.7 (2+3).

learning who has *not* progressed by his learning” lacks the faculty of wisdom, and the “one of great learning who has *not* progressed by his learning” is likely to lack the faculty of faith.

A good teacher will, in time, be able to gauge the student’s dominant faculty at that time, and help him remedy the imbalance to harmonize the faculties so that he is an effective learner. Firstly, what faculties are likely to dominate these 2 kinds of students? It is likely (not absolute) that we have the following patterns:

- |  |   |  |
|--|---|--|
| (1) The faculty of <u>faith</u>              | } | “one of <u>great faith</u> who <i>has</i> progressed by his learning”  |
| (2) The faculty of <u>effort</u>             |   |  |
| (5) <i>The faculty of</i> <u>mindfulness</u> | } | “one of <u>great wisdom</u> who <i>has</i> progressed by his learning” |
| (3) The faculty of <u>concentration</u>      |   |  |
| (4) The faculty of <u>wisdom</u>             |   |  |

**1.2.3.2** A wise teacher will help the student to harmonize these faculties, or a self-learner will need to understand himself honestly and well enough to harmonize them by himself. A student who is faith-inclined needs to strengthen his faculty of wisdom, and vice versa. A student who is effort-inclined needs to harmonize it with stronger concentration, and vice versa.<sup>30</sup>

Notice in the diagram [1.2.3.1] that “the faculty of mindfulness” straddles between the two pairs of faculties. This highlights the fact that it is our **mindfulness** that moderates our faculties so that we practise to get the greatest benefit, that is, at least the attaining of streamwinning. This mindfulness arises from “wise consideration” (*yoniso manasikāra*) or when we carefully reflect (*paṭisañcikkhati*). Such an exercise is best done after every meditation practice, during our “review” of it.<sup>31</sup>

**1.2.3.3** Considering the difficulties of attaining arhathood, or even non-returning, because it entails a mastery of dhyana meditation,<sup>32</sup> the more likely path of awakening for the lay person is that of **stream-winning** or **once-returning**, both of which can be gained without any dhyana, unlike the other two higher paths.<sup>33</sup>

According to **the Sarakāṇi Sutta 1** (S 55.24), when the intuitive student or the intellectual [1.2.2.1] properly practises, well harmonizing their 5 faculties—their strongest faculty being wisdom—they go on to become Truth-followers (*dhammānussarī*):

**The truth-follower.**<sup>34</sup> Here, Mahānāma, some person does not possess wise faith in *the 3 jewels*. He is not one of joyous wisdom,<sup>35</sup> nor of quick wisdom,<sup>36</sup> and he has not attained liberation.

<sup>30</sup> For details on the 5 faculties, see *Pañc’indriya*, SD 10.4.

<sup>31</sup> On review, see **Anāpāna,sati S** (M 118,21) n, SD 7.13; **Bhāvanā**, SD 15.1 (8.6) Fine-tuning dhyana.

<sup>32</sup> On the necessity of dhyana for the attaining of arhathood and non-returning, see **Samatha & vipassana**, SD 41.1 (2.2.2.4); **Bhāvanā**, SD 15.1 (13); **Samadhi**, SD 33.1a (2.2-2.5); **The layman and dhyana**, SD 8.5 (9).

<sup>33</sup> See (**Sekha**) **Uddesa S** (A 3.85), SD 3.3(2), and **Sa,upadi,sesa S** (A 9.12), SD 3.3(3): see SD 3.3 (0.3).

<sup>34</sup> The “truth-follower” or “Dharma-follower,” *dhammānussarī*, is, technically, a “path-streamwinner,” who will in time become full-fledged streamwinner, ie, attain the “fruition of streamwinning” (*sotāpatti,phala*). Although not mentioned here, this section describes the truth-follower, while the next section describes the faith-follower (*saddhā’nussarī*). See **Sarakāṇi S** (55.24/5:377); they are defined in **Kiṭṭā,giri S** (M 70,20-21/1:479). According to **Cakkhu S** (S 25.1/3:225), these two types of persons have reached the plane of the noble ones but have not yet realized the fruit of stream-winning, but will do so before they die. See S:B 1098 nn268-269

<sup>35</sup> “Of joyous wisdom,” *hāsa,pañña* or *hassa,pañña*, see (1.1.4.5).

<sup>36</sup> “Of quick wisdom,” *javana,pañña*, see (1.1.4.5).

However, he has these 5 things [the 5 spiritual faculties]—the faculty of faith, the faculty of effort, the faculty of mindfulness, the faculty of concentration, the faculty of wisdom. And he accepts the teachings proclaimed by the Tathāgata only after some pondering over it with wisdom.

This person, too, Mahānāma, is freed from hell, the animal kingdom, the preta realm and the suffering states. (Sarakāṇi Sutta, S 55.24/5:377), SD 3.6<sup>37</sup>

Similarly—according to the Sarakāṇi Sutta 1—when the student who needs guidance and the rote learner (who only knows the word of the teaching)—are fully spiritually developed, they are called faith-followers (*saddhānussarī*):

**The faith-follower.**<sup>38</sup> Here, Mahānāma, some person does not possess wise confidence in the Buddha, in the Dharma and in the Sangha. He is not one of joyous wisdom, nor of quick wisdom, and he has not attained liberation.

However, he has the 5 spiritual faculties. And he holds just a bit of faith in the Tathāgata, just a bit of love for him.<sup>39</sup>

This person, too, Mahānāma, is freed from hell, the animal kingdom, the preta realm and the suffering states.

Even these great sal trees,<sup>40</sup> Mahānāma, if they could understand what is well spoken and what is ill spoken, I would declare them to be streamwinners, no longer bound for the lower world, sure of going over to self-awakening!

(Sarakāṇi Sutta 1, S 55.24,12.6/5:377) + SD 3.6 (4)<sup>41</sup>

We can safely assume that both the “Truth-follower” (*dharmānussarī*) and the “faith-follower” (*saddhā’nusārī*) are, technically, “path-streamwinners”—sort of “undergraduate” streamwinners—who will in time become full-fledged streamwinners, that is, attain the “fruition of streamwinning” (*sotāpatti,phala*).<sup>42</sup>

### 1.3 RELATED SUTTAS

**1.3.1** The (Catukka) Appassuta Sutta recurs in **the Puggala Paññatti** without the closing verses (Pug 4.28/62 f).<sup>43</sup>

**1.3.2** The quatrain **§10cdef** recurs as the closing lines of **the Ariya,vaṁsa Sutta** (A 4.28)—verse 2 below—the whole verse of which runs thus (the lines without the Pali words are common lines):

<sup>37</sup> See SD 40a.4 (2.2.2).

<sup>38</sup> “Faith-follower,” *saddhā’nussarī*. See n1 on truth-follower.

<sup>39</sup> “Just a bit of faith ... just a bit of love,” *saddhā,mataṁ hoti pema,mattaṁ*. The “just a bit” here emphasizes the quality it qualifies. A similar statement is found in **Alagaddūpamā S** (M 22,4/1:141) & **Bhaddāli S** (M 65,27/1:444): “Those who have just a bit of faith in me and just a bit of love for me,” (*yesarī mayi saddhā,mattaṁ pema,mattaṁ*). Comy explains that this refers to the insight practitioners (*vipassaka puggalā*) who have not attained any supramundane state, not gaining even streamwinning, they are reborn in a heaven. On the other hand, we can take this passage as is, that is, anyone who has “just a bit of faith, just a bit of love” in the Buddha is reborn in a heaven, without going against the grain of early Buddhism. See M:ÑB 2001:1212 n274.

<sup>40</sup> Comy says that the Buddha was pointing to 4 sal trees nearby (*Shorea robusta*) (AA 3:288).

<sup>41</sup> See SD 40a.4 (2.2.4).

<sup>42</sup> For details, see SD 40a.4 (2).

<sup>43</sup> Comy at PugA 245.

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| <p>1 <i>Nâratī sahatī dhīraṃ<br/>nâratī dhīraṃ sahati.<br/>dhīro ca aratīṃ sahati<br/>dhīro hi aratīṃ,saho.</i></p> | <p>Discontent defeats not the steadfastly wise [the hero],<br/>nor does aversion defeat the wisely steadfast;<br/>and the wise overcomes discontent—<br/>for, the wise is a conqueror of discontent.</p>                                   |
| <p>2 <i>Sammā kamma,vihāyīnaṃ<br/>panuṇṇaṃ ko nivāraye</i></p>  | <p>Who has fully given up karma,<br/>who can hinder the dispeller?<br/>A gem<sup>44</sup> of Jambū river gold<sup>45</sup>—<br/>Who is worthy to blame him at all?<br/>Even the devas praise him,<br/>and he’s praised by Brahma, too.</p> |

(A 4.28/2:28 f\*), SD 71.1

**Verse 1** is a masterpiece of Pali polysemy.<sup>46</sup> It uses only 3 key words—*arati*, *sahati*, *dhīra*—and puns on them in 4 lines of śloka.<sup>47</sup> The positive key-word in the whole quatrain is **dhīra**. In line a, *dhīra* has been given an extended or “pregnant” translation, giving both its senses of “steadfast” (from √DHR, to hold or uphold, as in *dharati*) and of “wise” (from √DHĪ,<sup>48</sup> to think, understand).

In line a, **arati** has been translated as “discontent,”<sup>49</sup> while in line b, it is rendered as “aversion.”<sup>50</sup> In most cases, either or both senses apply, depending on the context.

The only verb of the quatrain in **sahati**, “to conquer, overcome,” is used for both “discontent” and *the contented*. It appears as *sahati* in lines abc, and as the suffix *-saho* in line d. This verb unifies the 4 lines of the quatrain as well as distinguishes each line with its own statement.

## 2 The 9 limbs of the Teacher’s teaching

**2.1** This is an early division of the Dharma which the suttas, such as **the Dhammaññū Sutta** (A 7.64), calls the “9 limbs (or factors) of the Teacher’s teaching” (*nav’āṅga satthu,sāsana*)<sup>51</sup> [§3], which are defined as follows:<sup>52</sup>

- |                        |   |
|------------------------|---|
| (1) <b>sutta</b>       | the discourses, ie, prose passages; eg, Sutta Nipāta prose passages, Niddesa, Vinaya, Vibhaṅga, and texts with “Sutta” in their titles; |
| (2) <b>geyya</b>       | the “poems,” mixed prose and verse, such as the Sagāthā Vagga of Saṃyutta (S 1), Kasi Bhāra,dvāja Sutta (Sn 1.4/12-26);                 |
| (3) <b>veyyākaraṇa</b> | the expositions: elaboration of brief teachings of the Buddha; <sup>53</sup>  |

<sup>44</sup> “A gem of Jambū river gold,” *nekkham jambonadam*: as at **Saṅkhār’upapatti S** (M 120,18.4/3:102,17), SD 3.4. See foll n.

<sup>45</sup> “Jambū river gold,” *jambonada*: see (3).

<sup>46</sup> On the significance of Pali polysemy, see SD 1.1 (4.4.5); SD 10.16 (1.3.1-1.3.2).

<sup>47</sup> A *śloka* (P *siloka*) is a quatrain with each line containing 4 syllables. Line d should be read: *dhīro c’aratīṃ sahati* to get 8 syllables. See SD 49.13 (2.2).

<sup>48</sup> See root dhī<sup>2</sup> in PED & DP.

<sup>49</sup> *Arati* as “discontent”: M 55,11/1:370,32-34 (*rāgena ... dosena ... mohena vihesavā assa ~vā assa paṭighavā assa... etc*); S 696c (S 7.17/1:180: *eko rame ~im vippahāya*); Sn 436b (of Māra: *paṭhamā senā, dutiyā ~ī vuccati ca*).

<sup>50</sup> *Arati* as “aversion,” at S 712a (S 1:186,23\*: *~ñ ca ratiñ ca pahāya*; both senses of *arati* apply here); Sn 270a, 271b f (*~ratī loma,haṃso*).

<sup>51</sup> A 7.64 (SD 30.10).

<sup>52</sup> See eg DA 1:23; MA 1:133 f, 5:109; UA 4; ItA 1:2; VvA 4; PvA 2; ThaA 1:2; ApA 103; CA 2; NmA 1:10; PmA 1:4, 9; DhsA 26; Miln 263. On these 9 factors (*āṅga*), see **Mahā Vedalla S** (M 43), SD 30.2 (2.1) & **Listening Beyond the Ear**, SD 3.2 (1). See Norman 1983:15-17; Norman 2006a: 172 f.

- (4) ***gāthā*** the verses, eg, Dhammapada, Thera,gāthā, Therī,gāthā, Sutta Nipāta verses;  
 (5) ***udāna*** the inspired utterances, especially Udāna, also M 1:171, V 1:1 ff, etc;  
 (6) ***iti,vuttaka*** the sayings, ie, the Iti,vuttaka;  
 (7) ***jātaka*** the birth stories, such as those in Kūṭa,danta Sutta (D 5,10-20/1:134-143), Mahā Sudassana Sutta (D 17/2:169-199), Mahā,govinda Sutta (D 19,29-61/2:230-251), and the Jātaka verses;  
 (8) ***abbhuta,dhamma*** the extraordinary marvels, special qualities of disciples (eg, D 16,5.15-16/2:144 f; VA 1:28);<sup>54</sup> and  
 (9) ***vedalla*** the answers to questions (catechical suttas): Sakka,pañha Sutta (D 21), Mahā Vedalla Sutta (M 43), Cūḷa Vedalla Sutta (M 44), Sammā Diṭṭhi Sutta (M 9), Mahā Puṇṇama Sutta (M 109).<sup>55</sup>

SD 30.10 (4); SD 26.11 (3.2.1.5)

**2.2** Interestingly, the list is mentioned only thrice in the Majjhima Nikāya in **the Alagaddūpama Sutta** (M 22)<sup>56</sup>; once in a Sutta commentarial work, the Mahā Niddesa,<sup>57</sup> twice in the Abhidhamma (Vbh & Pug),<sup>58</sup> twice in the Vinaya,<sup>59</sup> but with the majority of references (over 30 times) in the Aṅguttara Nikāya.<sup>60</sup> The term ***nav'aṅga,satthu,sāsana*** is mentioned in the following places: Apadāna (Ap 1:45); Buddhavaṃsa (B 20, 22, 37, 40, 50); Iti,vuttaka (It 29);

What does this mean? The Aṅguttara Nikāya, or the numerical discourses, comprises mostly teachings for the laity, the group that the Buddha gives priority to after the monastics.<sup>61</sup> Understandably, the laity, being more worldly and busy than the more spiritually committed monastics, would need a more varied syllabus and sustained effort in their spiritual training. Their numbers only grew after the monastic community was established that is, after the first 20 years of the Buddha's ministry.<sup>62</sup>

**2.3** We should not assume that the titles listed above for each of the 9 limbs are the same as the texts that we now have. Even during the Buddha's own time, we can imagine the Buddha teaching the Dharma, and they were remembered by individuals, and recited and recalled by groups of monks.

<sup>53</sup> Eg the discourses of the Vibhaṅga Vagga (M 131-142) of the Majjhima Nikāya, namely, **Bhadd'eka,ratta S** (M 131/3:187-189), **Ānanda Bhadd'eka,ratta S** (M 132/3:189-191), **Mahā Kaccāna Bhadd'eka,ratta S** (M 133/3:192-199), **Lomasak'aṅgiya Bhadd'eka,ratta S** (M 134/3:199-203, taught by the Buddha himself), **Cūḷa Kamma Vibhaṅga S** (M 135/3:202-206), **Mahā Kamma Vibhaṅga S** (M 136/3:207-215), **Saḷāyatana Vibhaṅga S** (M 137/3:215-222), **Uddesa Vibhaṅga S** (M 138/3:223-229), **Araṇa,vibhaṅga S** (M 139/3:230-237), **Dhātu Vibhaṅga S** (M 140/3:237-247), **Sacca Vibhaṅga S** (M 141/3:248-252), **Dakkhiṇa Vibhaṅga S** (M 142/3:253-257).

<sup>54</sup> Here the example refers to the Buddha's referring to Ānanda's charisma as a "marvel" (*abbhuta,dhamma*). Very likely it is such passages (as D 16,5.15-16/2:144) that constitute "marvels" (*abbhuta,dhamma*), rather than miraculous stories: see eg **Abbhuta,dhamma Ss** (eg **Acchariya,abbhūta S**, M 123) mentioned in the nn there. It is possible to incl lion-roars (*sīha,nāda*) here, too: see SD 36.10 (3). See also Ency Bsm: Aṅga (under abbhutadhamma).

<sup>55</sup> On these 9 factors (*aṅga*), see **Mahā Vedalla S** (M 43), SD 30.2 (2.1) & **Listening Beyond the Ear**, SD 3.2 (1). See Norman 1983:15 f; Norman 2006a: 172 f.

<sup>56</sup> M 22/1:133,24, 134,6+25 (SD 3.13); **Mahā Suññata S** (M 122) mentions only *sutta, geyya* and *veyyakaraṇa* (M 122/3:115,18), SD 11.4.

<sup>57</sup> Nm:Be 224, 278×2.

<sup>58</sup> Vbh 294; Pug 43, 44×3, 62×4.

<sup>59</sup> Pār 1.3.1 (V 3:8, 9,3).

<sup>60</sup> **A 4.6/2:7×4, 4.102/2:102×4, 4.107/2:108×4, 4.186/2:178, 4.191/2:185×2, 186×4, 5.73/3:86, 87, 5.74/3:88×2, 5.155/3:177×2, 6.51/3:361+362, 7.64/4:113×3.**

<sup>61</sup> See the parable of the 3 fields: (Khetta) Desanā S (S 42.7/4:315 f), SD 12.1 (3.2).

<sup>62</sup> See **Language and Discourse**, SD 26.11 (3.2.1).

Surely there were some individuals who received teachings that were not recorded by the reciters. Such teachings sadly must be presumed lost for good. However, since these individual teachings are, as a rule, special variations on a familiar theme, we can also assume that the idea or meaning of the Dharma is still intact in the teachings as a whole.

**2.4** Moreover, as the teachings grew over time, they naturally were systematized. These 8 limbs of the Buddha’s teachings formed the bases for such later systematizations. The reciters, in fact, were like our modern transcribers and editors of scholarly lectures. These council elders (*saṅgīti,kāra*) and reciters (*bhāṇaka*), as they are called, edited these teachings, giving us the location, various narrative details and other literary notes and conventions so that we have a coherent and connected reading of these teachings.

It helps that we envision the Buddha as if teaching to us various musical themes and motifs, and composing a great number of masterpieces himself. The early monastics, as accomplished master musicians themselves, on their part, further compiled variations and cycles (*peyyāla*) on themes of the teachings in an effort to present the Dharma comprehensively.

The true teaching is not so much *what* the Buddha has taught, as *how* he teaches them, that is, their intention and intended effects on the listener and audience. It is this *meaning* and *purpose* of the Buddha Dharma that is being preserved in the Sutta Piṭaka. It is in this sense that we have the *living* word of the historical Buddha—the early teachings record the awakening experiences of the Buddha and the great saints, and we can, by understanding and practising this Buddha word, taste the very same awakenng.

### 3 Jambonada

**3.1** In the closing verse of the Appassuta Sutta, the learned and wise disciple of the Buddha is like “**a gem of Jambū river gold**” (*nekkharṃ jambonadaṃ*) [§14]. The figure, *nekkha jambonada*, occurs in the following suttas:

	<u>Lemma (key passage)</u>	<u>Commentary</u>	
<b>Saṅkhār’upapatti Sutta</b>	M 120/3:102,16	MA 4:147,19 [3.4]	SD 3.4
<b>(Sāriputta) Susīma Sutta</b>	S 2.29/1:65,3	SA 1 :125,18-20	SD 86.8
<b>Venāga,pura Sutta</b>	A 3.63/1:181,15	AA 2 :292,10	SD 21.1
<b>Appassuta Sutta</b>	A 4.6/2:8,5*	SA 1:125,17	SD 51.16
<b>Ariya,vaṃsa Sutta</b>	A 4.28 /2:29,2* (whole verse)	—	SD 71.1
<b>(Pañcaka) Sappurisa Sutta</b>	A 5.42/3:47,13	—	
<b>Dhammapada</b>	Dh 230a	DhA 3:329,13	
<b>Pāṭali,gāma Sutta</b> (Udāna)	(Quotes A 4.6,10*)	UA 416,5	
<b>Pīṭha Vimāna,vatthu 1</b>	(Vv 1.1,1) commentary only	VvA 13 [3.2+3.3]	
<b>Serissaka Vimāna,vatthu</b>	Vv 84.17	VvA 340	

The *jambonada* figure also occurs in **the Visuddhi,magga** (Vism 1.136/48).

**3.2** According to the Majjhima Commentary, a *nekkha* (vl, *nikkha*) is an ornament—“gem” is here used figuratively—made from *nikkha*, which is a combination of the 5 types of gold. These 5 probably are amongst the 7 kinds of gold mentioned in the Vimāna,vatthu Commentary, which also says that *jambonada*-gold is second only to *siṅgī*-gold (VvA 13). [3.3]

In Pali, the phrase, “**Jambū river gold**,” is *jambonada* (mfn; n), with the variants, *jambunada* and *jambūnada* (Skt *jāmbūnada*; BHS *jambūnada*). **Jambonada** has 2 senses: (1) (mfn) of gold or golden (from the river Jambū), (2) (n) gold (from the river Jambū).<sup>63</sup>

**3.3** The 7 kinds of gold include artificial gold, mined gold and celestial gold. Further, there are 4 kinds of celestial gold, that is, *cāmīkara*-gold, *sāta*, *kumbha*-gold, *jambunada*-gold and *siṅgī*-gold—the best of which is *siṅgī*-gold (VvA 13,12). When the Buddha first enters Rājagaha along with the newly converted erstwhile fire-worshipping matted-hair ascetics, his radiance is described to be like that of *siṅgī*-gold (V 1:38).<sup>64</sup> The 5 kinds of gold are special in that they are able to withstand impact and abrasion.

**3.4** Legend has it the great tree’s branches can grow up to 50 yojanas<sup>65</sup> long that drop its ripe fruits on both banks. They sprout into gold shoots, from which the jambū trees grow. Many of these are carried by the water-currents right down to the great ocean (MA 4:147).<sup>66</sup>

**3.5** The Jambu is probably the river today located in Jambu Dweep (20° 24' 00" N and 86° 44' 00" E), bound by Ratanpur in the north, Hukitola in the east, Batighara in the south, and Kochila in the west, about 60 km east of Cuttack and about 300 km SW of Kolkata. It flows into a cove on the Bay of Bengal coast.<sup>67</sup>

— — —

## (Catukka) Appassuta Sutta

### The (Fours) Discourse on Little Learning

A 4.6

**1**<sup>68</sup> Bhikshus, there are these 4 kinds of persons found in the world. What are the four?

- |                                   |  |   |
|-----------------------------------|--|---|
| (1) One of <u>little</u> learning | who has <i>not</i> progressed by his learning; | <i>appa-s,suto sutena anuppanno</i> <sup>69</sup> |
| (2) one of <u>little</u> learning | who has <i>progressed</i> by his learning;     | <i>appa-s,suto sutena uppanno</i> <sup>70</sup>   |
| (3) one of <u>great</u> learning  | who has <i>not</i> progressed by his learning; | <i>bahu-s,suto sutena anuppanno</i>               |
| (4) one of <u>great</u> learning  | who has <i>progressed</i> by his learning.     | <i>bahu-s,suto sutena uppanno</i>                 |

**2** (1) And what, bhikshus, is a person of **little learning who has not progressed by his learning?**

**[7]** Here, bhikshus, a certain person has little learning about the following:

- |                     |                    |
|---------------------|--------------------|
| 1. the discourses,  | <i>sutta</i>       |
| 2. the “songs”,     | <i>geyya</i>       |
| 3. the expositions, | <i>veyyākaraṇa</i> |

<sup>63</sup> For refs, see DP: jambonada.

<sup>64</sup> Qu at UA 13; PvA 22.

<sup>65</sup> A *yojana* is here 1.8 m = 6 ft: SD 47.8 (2.4.4.1).

<sup>66</sup> A similar but briefer account at SA 1:125,18-20 ad (**Sāriputta**) **Susīma S**, S 2.29/1:65,3 (SD 86.8).

<sup>67</sup> See satellite map [geographic.org](http://geographic.org).

<sup>68</sup> PED only numbers “1” here, and “2” below at the start of the verses.

<sup>69</sup> Be:K122 Ce Se *anupapanno* ; Ee *anuppanno*.

<sup>70</sup> Comy gloses *anuppanno* as *anupāgato* (AA 3:5, 2:328,13), “who has not come near or entered into” (CPD); “without competence” (CPD an-upapanna). *Uppanna* and *anuppanna* are sometimes confused with *upapanna* and *anupapanna*, respectively.

- |                               |                              |
|-------------------------------|------------------------------|
| 4. the verses,                | <i>gāthā</i>                 |
| 5. the inspired utterances,   | <i>udāna</i>                 |
| 6. the sayings,               | <i>iti,vuttaka</i>           |
| 7. the birth stories,         | <i>jātaka</i>                |
| 8. the extraordinary marvels, | <i>abbhuta,dhamma</i>        |
| 9. questions and answers.     | <i>vedalla</i> <sup>71</sup> |

3 Of the little he has learned, he knows neither its meaning *nor* its truth, nor does he practise the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.<sup>72</sup>

Such a person is one of little learning who has not progressed by his learning.

4 (2) And what, bhikshus, is a person **of little learning who has progressed by his learning?**

Here, bhikshus, a certain person has little learning about the following:

1. *the discourses,*
2. *the “songs”,*
3. *the expositions,*
4. *the verses,*
5. *the inspired utterances,*
6. *the sayings,*
7. *the birth stories,*
8. *the extraordinary marvels,*
9. *questions and answers.*

5 Of that little learning, he knows both its meaning *and* its truth, *and* he practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.

Such a person is one of little learning who has progressed by his learning.

6 (3) And what, bhikshus, is a person **of great learning who has not progressed by his learning?**

Here, bhikshus, a certain person has great learning in the following:

1. *the discourses,*
2. *the “songs”,*
3. *the expositions,*
4. *the verses,*
5. *the inspired utterances,*
6. *the sayings,*
7. *the birth stories,*
8. *the extraordinary marvels,*
9. *questions and answers.*

7 Of that great learning, he knows neither its meaning *nor* its truth, nor does he practise the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.

Such a person is one of great learning who has not progressed by his learning.

8 (4) And what, bhikshus, is a person **of great learning who has progressed by his learning?**

Here, bhikshus, a certain person has great learning in the following:

1. *the discourses,*
2. *the “songs”,*
3. *the expositions,*

<sup>71</sup> On the 9 limbs of the Teacher’s teaching, see (2).

<sup>72</sup> *So tassa appakassa sutassa na attham aññāya na dhammam aññāya dhammānudhamma,paṭipanno hoti.*

4. the verses,
5. the inspired utterances,
6. the sayings,
7. the birth stories,
8. the extraordinary marvels,
9. questions and answers.

9 Of that great learning, he knows both its meaning *and* its truth, *and* he practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.

Such a person is one of great learning who has progressed by his learning.

These, bhikshus, are the 4 kinds of persons found in the world

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| <p><b>10</b><sup>73</sup> <i>Appassuto pi ce hoti<br/>sīlesu asamāhito<br/>ubhayena naṃ garahanti<br/>sīlato ca sutena ca</i></p>              | <p>If one has but little learning,<br/>and not mentally still in conduct—<br/>they blame him on both counts:<br/>in conduct and in learning, too.</p>                     |
| <p><b>11</b> <i>appassuto pi ce hoti<br/>sīlesu susamāhito<br/>sīlato naṃ pasamsanti<br/>tassa</i><sup>74</sup> <i>sampajjate sutam</i></p>    | <p>One who has only a little learning,<br/>but is mentally well still in conduct—<br/>they praise him for his virtue<br/>(and) his learning is complete.<sup>75</sup></p> |
| <p><b>12</b> <i>Bahussuto pi ce hoti<br/>sīlesu asamāhito<br/>sīlato naṃ garahanti<br/>n’assa</i><sup>76</sup> <i>sampajjate sutam</i> [8]</p> | <p>One who has great learning,<br/>but not well still in conduct—<br/>they blame him for his conduct,<br/>(and) his learning is incomplete, too.</p>                      |
| <p><b>13</b> <i>Bahussuto pi ce hoti<br/>sīlesu susamāhito.<br/>ubhayena naṃ pasamsanti<br/>sīlato ca sutena ca</i></p>                        | <p>One who has great learning,<br/>and well still in conduct—<br/>they praise him in both,<br/>for his conduct and his learning.</p>                                      |
| <p><b>14</b> <i>Bahussutam dhamma, dharam<br/>sappaññam buddha, sāvakaṃ<br/>nekkham</i><sup>77</sup> <i>jambonadass’eva</i><sup>78</sup></p>   | <p>Greatly learned, the Dharma-bearer,<br/>wise disciple of the Buddha,<br/>a gem<sup>79</sup> of Jambū river gold<sup>80</sup>—</p>                                      |

<sup>73</sup> PED only numbers “2” here, and “1” right at the start. This verse section is not found in Pug 4.28.

<sup>74</sup> Be *tassa*; Be:K122 *n’assa*; Ce Ee Se *nāssa*.

<sup>75</sup> Be reads *tassa sampajjate sutam* in §7d and *n’assa* [or *nāssa*] *sampajjate sutam*, “his learning has not succeeded” in §8d. Ce Ee Se read *nāssa* ... in §7d, but Ee *n’assa* ... , and Ce Se has *tassa* ... . The prose section and Comy support Be readings (*tassa* in §7d, and *n’assa* or *nāssa* in §8d): Comy explains §7, thus: “His learning can be said to have succeeded because this person has used what he has learned to achieve the purpose of learning” (AA 3:7). Concerning §8d, Comy says: “It [his learning] does not succeed because he has not achieved the purpose of learning” (AA 3:7). The verses are qu at Vism 1.136/48, but with variant readings.

<sup>76</sup> Be *nāssa*; Be:K122; Ce Ce:Tr(enckner) Se *tassa*; Ee *n’assa*.

<sup>77</sup> Be:K122 *nikkham*; Be Ce Ee Se *nekkham*.

<sup>78</sup> §10cdef recurs in **Ariya, vaṃsa S** (A 4.28/2:29\*), SD 71.1. [1.2.2]

<sup>79</sup> “A gem of Jambū river gold,” *nekkham jambonadam*: as at **Saṅkhār’upapatti S** (M 120,18.4/3:102,17), SD 3.4. See foll n.

*ko taṃ ninditum arahati  
devâpi naṃ pasamsanti  
brahmunâ'pi pasamsito'ti.*

Who is worthy to blame him at all?  
Even the devas praise him,  
and he's praised by Brahma, too.

— evaṃ —

171006 171011 171228

---

<sup>80</sup> "Jambū river gold," *jambonada*: see (3).