13

Bhandana, kāraka Sutta

The Discourse on the Strife-bringer | A 5.212
Theme: Social strife hinders spiritual development
Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

1 Introduction

1.1 The Bhaṇḍana.kāraka Sutta¹ (A 5.212) lists 5 kinds of disadvantages (ādīnava) or dangers to the sangha [§2], and hence to the Dharma, which inevitably affects the personal and spiritual training of monastics. Such warnings recorded in the suttas are clearly the trends or bases for the composition of rules and regulations that in due course (by Asoka's time, that is, 3rd century BCE) became systematized as the Vinava.

1.2 RELATED TEXTS

- <u>1.2.1 The Vinaya</u>. These same **5 terms** are mentioned at the opening of **the Culla,vagga** of the Vinaya as being stirred up by the monks Paṇḍuka and Lohitaka and their followers (Cv 1.1 @ V 2:1). **The Mahā,vagga** lists "dissension" (*mithu,bheda*), that is, breaking of alliance, enmity, and strife, as one of <u>the 3 dangers</u> threatening Pāṭali,putta (capital of Magadha, near modern Patna), the other two being fire and water (Mv 6.28.8 @ V 1:229).
- 1.2.2 Expanded parallels. The Bhaṇḍana,kāraka Sutta should be studied with the Akkosaka Sutta (A 10.88), which is, in turn, expanded in the Vyasana Sutta (A 11.6). The Akkosaka Sutta expands the 5 disadvantages of a strife-bringer to 10,² while the Vyasana Sutta gives a list of 11 disadvantages.³
- 1.2.3 Monastic themes. The closing sections of the Book of Fives (pañcaka nipāta) of the Anguttara (A 5.201-1152)—beginning with the "fifth fifties" (pañcama paṇṇāsaka)—deal exclusively with the conduct of monastics in terms of the 3 doors of actions (body, speech and mind). Many of the sutta themes, even the suttas themselves, are expanded in the Book of Tens (dasaka nipāta), which are then further expanded in the Book of Elevens (ekā,dasaka nipāta). Some others are parallels, repetitions or combinations found in other Nikāyas. Here are some of the related suttas:

		Expanded parallels ⁴		
Mora Nivāpa Sutta 1	A 3.143]	the 3 trainings		
Mora Nivāpa Sutta 2	A 3.144	combined as	the 3 higher knowledges	
Mora Nivāpa Sutta 3	A 3.145	A 11.10	the 3 qualities for liberation	
Kesi Sutta	A 4.111	A 5.201, 6.40, 7.59	how the true Dharma lasts or not	
Dussīla Sutta	A 5.24	A 6.50, 7.65,		
		8.81,10.3, 11.3	morally virtuous conduct	
Vaḍḍhi Suttas 1+2	A 5.63-64	A 10.74	spiritual growth	
(Pañcaka) Ceto,khila Sutta	A 5.203	= M 16,2-7	mental barrenness	
Vinibandha Sutta	A 5.206	= M 16,8-12	mental bondages	
(Agata,phala) Mahānāma Sutta	A 6.10	A 11.11	spiritual faculties & 6 meditations	
Miga,sālā Sutta	A 6.44	[A 10.75]	measure not others	
(Aṭṭha) Mettânisaṁsa Sutta	A 8.1	A 11.15	benefits of lovingkindness	

¹ The word **bhaṇḍana** (nt) [from √внаṇṇ, "to reprove"; cf BHS ts, bhāṇḍana Divy 164] quarrel, quarrelling, strife (lt 11,4; J 3:149; Nm 196; DhA 1:55, 64).

² A 10.88/5:169 (SD 46.20).

³ A 11.6/5:317 (SD 46.21).

⁴ Part parallels are given within [square brackets]. The symbol || means "parallel(s)." For a list of suttas and their expanded parallels in Anguttara, see A:B 2865 f.

Bala Sutta 2	A 8.28	A 10.90	spiritual powers
Saddhā Sutta 1	A 8.71	A 10.8, [A 9.4]	faith and dhyana
Saddhā Sutta 2	A 8.72	A 10.9	qualities that inspire faith
(Aṭṭhaka) Puṇṇiya Sutta	A 8.82	A 10.83	when the Buddha teaches or not
(Navaka) Āhuneyya Sutta	A 9.10	A 10.16	those worthy of offerings
Vera Sutta 1	A 9.27	A 10.92; S 12.41 ⁵	the 4 limbs of streamwinning
(Navaka) Āghāta Vatthu Sutta	A 9.29	A 10.79	grounds for resentment
Āghātā Paţivinaya Sutta	A 9.30	A 10.80	ways of overcoming resentment
Kim Atthiya Sutta	A 10.1	A 11.1	purpose of moral virtue; liberation
(Dasaka) Cetanā'karaṇīya Sutta	A 10.2	A 11.2	no volition needed in meditation
Upanisa Sutta 1	A 10.3	A 11.3	[see under A 5.24 above]
Samādhi Sutta	A 10.6	A 11.7	the higher meditations & awakening
Ākaṅkha Sutta	A 10.71	abridged as M 6	arhats have no lustful wishes
Akkosaka (Paribhāsa) Sutta	A 10.88	A 11.6	a monk who causes strife
Kāma,bhogī Sutta	A 10.91	[S 42.12]	those who enjoy sense-pleasures
Adhamma Sutta 1 (briefly)	A 10.113	∥ A 10.171	what is Dharma and not Dharma
Adhamma Sutta 2 (detailed)	A 10.114	∥ A 10.173	what is Dharma and not Dharma
Adhamma Sutta 3 (Ānanda)	A 10.115	A 10.172	what is Dharma and not Dharma
Saṅgārava Sutta	A 10.117	A 10.169	moral conduct compared to shores
Orima,tīra Sutta	A 10.118	A 10.170	moral conduct compared to shores
Paccorohaṇī Sutta 1	A 10.119	∥ A 10.167	rituals versus the noble discipline
Paccorohaṇī Sutta 2	A 10.120	A 10.168	the highest ritual
Vyasana Sutta	A 11.6	M 33	factors limiting/promoting growth
Dasama Gaha,pati Sutta	A 11.17	= M 52	11 ways to awaken

Bhandana, karaka Sutta

The Discourse on the Strife-bringer

A 5.212

Originating in Sāvatthī.

1 Bhikshus, a monk who is a source of strife, a source of quarrels, a source of disputes, a source of legal [ecclesiastical] cases for the sangha,⁶ can expect to have **5** disadvantages.⁷

What are the five?

- 2 (1) He does not attain what has not been attained.8
 - (2) He falls away from what he has attained.
 - (3) His bad reputation is spread about.
 - (4) He dies confused.

anadhigatam nâdhigacchati adhigatam parihāyati pāpako kitti,saddo abbhuggacchati sammūļho kālam karoti

⁵ The section on dependent arising.

⁶ On these 5 kinds of disadvantages, see (1.1).

⁷ Yo so bhikkhave bhikkhu bhaṇḍana,kārako kalaha,kārako vivāda,kārako bhassa,kārako saṅghe adhikaraṇa,kārako, tassa pañca ādīnavā pāṭikaṅkhā.

⁸ That is, he has not attained those spiritual states that need to be attained.

(5) With the break-up of the body after death, he is reborn in a plane of misery, a bad destination, a lower realm, hell.

kāyassa bhedā param,maraṇā apāyaṁ duggatiṁ vinipātaṁ nirayaṁ upapajjati

3 Bhikshus, a monk who is a source of strife, a source of quarrels, a source of disputes, a source of legal [ecclesiastical] cases for the sangha, can expect to have these 5 disadvantages.

— evam —

080426 140612 140620 140627 160201 180525