

# 21

## Two Discourses on Losses

(1) (Pañcaka) Akkosaka Sutta, The (Fives) Discourse on the Reviler | A 5.211

(2) (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta, The (Tens) Discourse on the Reviler | A 10.88

Theme: The disadvantages of reviling one another in the sangha  
Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

### 1 The (Pañcaka) Akkosaka Sutta

While the **Saṅgha, bheda Sutta** (It 18) warns of mutual abusing, disdain and rejecting in the sangha can lead to a schism,<sup>1</sup> the **(Pañcaka) Akkosaka Sutta** (A 5.211) speaks of 5 kinds of disadvantages (*ādīnavā*) that befall a monk who reviles or abuses another. While the former addresses a broader danger —that of a schism in the sangha—the latter deals with failure on a more personal level.

#### SD 46.21(1)

### (Pañcaka) Akkosaka Sutta

The (Fives) Discourse on the Reviler | A 5.211/3:252

Theme: The disadvantages of reviling and abusing in the sangha

Traditional: A 5.5.2.1 = Āṅguttara 5, Pañcaka Nipāta 5, Pañcama Paṇṇāsaka 2, Akkosaka Vagga 1

1 Bhikshus, when a monk is one who scolds and abuses his fellow brahmacharis [celibates], faulting the noble ones, these 5 disadvantages can be expected to fall on him. What are the five?

#### 2 THE 5 DISADVANTAGES (*pañca ādīnavā*)

- (1) He commits a defeat offence or cuts off the outlets.<sup>2</sup>
- (2) Or, he commits one or other defiling offence.
- (3) Or, he will have a serious disease or ill health.
- (4) He dies confused.
- (5) With the body's breaking up, after death,<sup>3</sup> he is reborn in a plane of misery, a bad destination, a lower realm, in hell.

*pārājiko vā hoti chinna,paripantho.  
aññataram vā saṅkiliṭṭham āpattim āpajjati  
bālham vā rog'ātāṅkam phusati  
sammūlho kālam karoti  
kāyassa bheda param marañā  
apāyam duggatim vinipātam nirayam  
Papajjati*

3 Bhikshus, when a monk is one who scolds and abuses his fellow brahmacharis [celibates], faulting the noble ones, these 5 disadvantages can be expected to fall on him. — evam —

<sup>1</sup> **Saṅgha, bheda S** (It 18), SD 46.19.

<sup>2</sup> Comy explains that he has cut off the outlet (from the world) to the supramundane (*lok'uttara,paripanthassa chinna,paripantho*) (AA 3:327), meaning that, on account of these disadvantages, he is unable to attain any level of sainthood, not even streamwinning. However, we can also take the expression to mean that, having committed the offence of “defeat” (*pārājika*), he is completely cut off from the *bhikkhu* state.

<sup>3</sup> “With the body's breaking up, after death,” **kāyassa bheda param, marañā**. Buddhaghosa explains this phrase as follows: “With the body's breaking up” (*kāyassa bheda*) means on abandoning the aggregates that are clung to; “after death” (*param, marañā*) means that in-between state (*tad-antaram*), in the grasping of the aggregates that have been generated (*abhinibbatta-k, khandha, gahaṇe*). Or, “with the body's breaking up” means the interruption of the life-faculty, and “after death” means after the death-consciousness” (*cuti, cittato uddham*). (Vism 13.91/427; cf NcA 69). See **Deva, dūta S** (M 130,2/3:178), SD 2.23.

## 2 The (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta

### SD 46.21(2)

## (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta

The (Tens) Discourse on the Reviler | A 10.88/5:169  
Theme: The disadvantages of reviling one another in the sangha

**2.1 The (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta** (A 10.88) seems to be an expanded version of the (Pañcaka) Akkosaka Sutta (A 5.211), except for a significant difference in the first factor. Moreover, the latter (A 5.211) uses the term “disadvantage” (*ādīnava*) while the former (A 10.88) speaks of “losses” (*vyasana*), which sounds more grave. The gravity, understandably, is contributed by the presence of the additional 5 kinds of losses in A 10.88.

**2.2** The teachings of the **(Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta** (A 10.88) are expanded as the **(Ekādasaka) Vyasana Sutta** (A 11.6), which has an additional “loss,” that is, no. 7, “forsaking the training, he turns to the low life” (*sikkham vā paccakkhāya hīnāy’āvattati*).<sup>4</sup> In other words, the former (A 10.88) can be seen as a shorter version of the latter (A 11.6). Although the difference—the additional factor—is a new one, it similarly reflects the “loss” (*vyasana*) that the other ten factors entail. [3]

**2.3** The (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta is, in turn, expanded into the **(Ekādasaka) Vyasana Sutta** (A 11.6), with an additional “loss” (*vyasana*), that is, giving up the training and returning to the lay life.<sup>5</sup>

— — —

## (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta

### The (Tens) Discourse on the Reviler

A 10.88

**1 [169]** Bhikshus, when a monk is one who scolds and abuses his fellow brahmacharis [celibates], faulting the noble ones,<sup>6</sup>

it is impossible, there is no chance,<sup>7</sup> that he would not<sup>8</sup> incur one or other of these 10 kinds of losses [disasters].<sup>9</sup>

What are these ten?

**2 THE 10 LOSSES (*dasa vyasana*)**

- (1) He does not attain the unattained.
- (2) He loses what he has attained.
- (3) The good qualities are not purified in him.

*anadhigataṃ nādhigacchati*  
*adhigatā parihāyati*  
*saddhammassa na vodāyanti*<sup>10</sup>

<sup>4</sup> A 11.6 (SD 46.22).

<sup>5</sup> See A 11.6/5:317 (SD 46.22).

<sup>6</sup> *Yo so bhikkhave bhikkhu akkosaka, paribhāsako ariyūpavādī sabrahmacārīnaṃ.*

<sup>7</sup> *Aṭṭhānam etaṃ anavakāso*: Ce Ee Se so; Be *ṭhānaṃ etaṃ avakāso*. The phrase *aṭṭhānam etaṃ anavakāso* is stock: V 2:199; A 1:26, 5:169; Pug 11, 12; PvA 28.

<sup>8</sup> *Na*: Ce Ee Se so; Be omits.

<sup>9</sup> *Yaṃ so dasannaṃ vyaśanānaṃ aññataraṃ vyaśanaṃ na nigaccheyya.*

A 5.5.2.1  
A 10.2.4.8

Āṅguttara 5, Pañcaka Nipāta 5, Pañcama Paṇṇāsaka 2, Akkosaka Vagga 1  
Āṅguttara Nikāya 10, Dasaka Nipāta 2, Dutiya Paṇṇāsaka 4, Thera Vagga 8

- (4) Or, he thinks too highly of himself in terms of good qualities. *saddhammesu vā adhimāniko hoti*
- (5) Or, he does not delight in living the holy life.<sup>11</sup> *anabhirato vā brahmacariyaṃ carati*
- (6) Or, he commits one or other defiling offence. *aññataraṃ vā saṅkiliṭṭhaṃ āpattiṃ āpajjati*
- (7) Or, he will have a painful disease or bad health. *gāḷhaṃ vā rog'ātaṅkaṃ phusati*
- (8) Or, he goes out of mind or becomes deranged. *ummādaṃ vā pāpunāti citta-k,khepaṃ*
- (9) He dies confused. *sammūḷho kālaṃ karoti*
- (10) With the body's breaking up, after death,<sup>12</sup> he is reborn in a plane of misery, a bad destination, a lower realm, in hell. *kāyassa bhedaṃ paraṃ maraṇā apāyaṃ duggatiṃ vinipātaṃ nirayaṃ Upapajjati*

**3** Bhikshus, when a monk is one who scolds and abuses his fellow brahmacharis [celibates], faulting the noble ones, it is impossible, there is no chance, that he would not incur one or other of these 10 kinds of losses.

— evaṃ —

140903 140904 141215 150706 160430 180525

---

<sup>10</sup> Be Ce Se Comy so; Ee *vodayati* (sg). Hence, *saddhammassa* should be resolved as *saddhammā assa*, “the good qualities ... for him,” foll Comy which says, “The good qualities of the teaching, comprising the 3 trainings, are not purified [polished] for him” (*sikkhā-t.taya,saṅkhātā sāsana,saddhammā assa vodānaṃ na gacchanti*, AA 3:326).

<sup>11</sup> Lit, “He does not live the holy life [celibate monastic life] with joy.”

<sup>12</sup> “With the body's breaking up, after death,” *kāyassa bhedaṃ paraṃ, maraṇā*. Buddhaghosa explains this phrase as foll: “With the body's breaking up” (*kāyassa bhedaṃ*) means on abandoning the aggregates that are clung to; “after death” (*paraṃ, maraṇā*) means that in-between state (*tad-antaraṃ*), in the grasping of the aggregates that have been generated (*abhinibbatta-k,khandha,gahaṇe*). Or, “with the body's breaking up” means the interruption of the life-faculty, and “after death” means after the death-consciousness” (*cuti,cittato uddhaṃ*). (Vism 13.91/427; cf NcA 69). See **Deva,dūta S** (M 130,2/3:178), SD 2.23.