

3

Entering the Stream

The fundamentals of spiritual attainment here and now (a textual survey)
Pali passages selected and translated by Piya Tan ©2003

0 Introduction

0.1 THE MIDDLE WAY

Nowadays, there is a proliferation of books on the Buddha's Teachings. Studying these books would inevitably result in imbibing some of the views and interpretations of the various writers on what the Buddha actually taught, which would result in some wrong views. On the other hand, there are some meditation teachers who advise their students not to study at all but to only meditate. In effect, what they are suggesting is for their students to listen to them only.

(Dhammavuddho Thera, "Liberation: Relevance of Sutta-Vinaya," 1997:2)

And the "middle way," avoiding these two extremes, Dhammavuddho proposes, is to investigate the Buddha's discourses and practise his noble eightfold path, "whether by lay people or by monks."

0.2 In December 1997, **Dhammavudho Thera** gave a talk entitled "Importance of the Buddha's Discourses" to the Theravada Society of Australia. This talk was revised into an article entitled "Liberation: Relevance of Sutta-Vinaya" and published in *Theravada*, the journal of the Theravada Society of Australia (March 1999). The most significant statement that Dhammavudho makes in his article is that "it is clear that hearing Dhamma can make one an Ariyan disciple" (1997:6). Dhammavuddho bases all his arguments on the teachings of the Pali Canon.

0.3 Of special interest, for example, are his references to **the (Sekha) Uddesa Sutta** (A 3.85) [2] and **the Sa, upadisesa Sutta** (A 9.12) [3],¹ which in essence state that the streamwinner and the once-returner do not need perfect concentration, that is, they do not need dhyana (jhāna), nor even need to "meditate" (as the term is popularly taken today).² Two essential qualities we need to cultivate to prepare for stream-winning are moral virtue and mindfulness, especially the perception of impermanence.³

Bodhi, in an article based on a careful study of the Pali suttas, entitled "The Jhānas and the lay disciple" (2001:36-64) makes this important statement:

All noble disciples acquire the right concentration of the Noble Eightfold Path, which is defined as the four *Jhānas*. This need not be understood to mean that stream-enterers and once-returners already possess *Jhāna* before they reach stream-entry. The formula for right concentration may imply only that they must eventually attain the *Jhānas* in the course of developing the path to its culmination in *arahantship*.
(Bodhi 2001:62)

0.4 In this study I have selected those references that Dhammavuddho has quoted without giving them in full, and which I will here provide within the scope of this study. In most cases, I have let the texts speak for themselves, or serve as bases for discussion and reflection. Read through each passage or those of your choice, making sure you understand every word (looking up difficult words, if necessary)

¹ A 3.85/1:231 f (SD 3.3(2)) & A 9.12/4:378-382 (SD 3.3(3)): see below.

² On dhyana not necessary for streamwinning, see SD 8.5 (2) & SD 23.6 (4); also Dhammavuddho 1997:7.

³ See **(Anicca) Cakkhu S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

and have some idea of the passage's import. Then spend a quiet moment (for even a few minutes), not thinking anything, simply letting the Dharma settle in your mind, as it were.⁴

1 Right View

1.1 (Magga) Vibhaṅga Sutta (S 45.8)

4 And what, bhikshus, is right view?⁵

The knowledge that is suffering.

The knowledge that is the arising of suffering.

The knowledge [9] that is the ending of suffering.

The knowledge that is the path leading to the cessation of suffering.

—This is called right view. (S 45.8,4/5:8 f); full translation, see SD 14.5

1.2 Niṭṭha Sutta (A 10.63)

1.2.1 Wordplay

1.2.1.1 In the **Niṭṭha Sutta** (A 10.63) below], the word **niṭṭhā** (Vedic *niṣṭhā*) is translated as “(spiritual) goal,” but it has a double sense, a wordplay. Here, the phrase **mayi niṭṭhaṅ, gatā** can mean (1) “who have won their goal under me” or (2) “who have found certainty in me”—both are equally applicable here [§1]. In other words, these saints have attained to their respective levels, and they show wise, joyful and utter faith in the Buddha, too.

1.2.1.2 The word **niṭṭhā** (f) means “fulfillment, completion, perfection, culmination point; achieved the aim; reached the goal.” In different contexts, it can mean any of the heavenly destinations in outside systems (“the many goals”), or to nirvana (“the one goal”) in Buddhism, as stated in the **Cūḷa Sīha, nāda Sutta** (M 11).⁶ Its simplest sense is “fulfilment,” as in “where do hope and its fulfilment ... have their origin here (in the world) ... and in the hereafter” (Sn 864).⁷

1.2.1.3 The other meaning of **niṭṭha** is “attained nirvana.” The commentary on the **Niṭṭha Sutta** explains the phrase, “**win their goals here**” (*idha niṭṭhā*) as “attain final nirvana in this world itself” (*imas-mim̐ yeva loke parinibbānaṃ*) (AA 5:44). It should, however, be noted that the Sutta applies **niṭṭha** to streamwinning, once-returning, and non-returning, too. In these cases, **niṭṭhā** simply means “**goal**,” that is, the spiritual fruitions, respectively, of the 3 earlier paths.

The “**world**” (indicated by *idha*, “here,” in the Sutta) is clearly the sense-sphere,⁸ since streamwinners and once-returners may “reach their goal” (*niṭṭhaṅgata*) either as humans or as heavenly beings.

⁴ For a very short guide—a spiritual exercise—in aspiring to streamwinning, see Reflection, “**Awaken in this life**,” R442, 2016: <http://dharmafarer.org/wordpress/weekly-reflections-by-piya-tan>.

⁵ Cf (Avijjā) **Paccaya S** (S 12.27): “... a noble disciple thus understands the condition (*paccaya*); thus understands the arising of the condition; thus understands the cessation of the condition; thus understands the way leading to the cessation of the condition: one is then called a noble disciple who is accomplished in right view ...” (S 12.27, -15/2:43), SD 39.12.

⁶ M 11,5/1:65 (SD 49.2).

⁷ *Lokasmim̐ ... | āsā ca niṭṭhā ca kuto, indānā | ye samparāyāya* (Sn 864). See Sn:N 358 n864.

⁸ On the sense-sphere, see **Buddhist cosmology**, SD 57.10.

The same commentary says that “after leaving this world” (*idha vihāya*) means “in the pure abodes of the brahma world” (*suddh’āvāsa, brahma.lokam*) (AA 5:44).

In **Dh 351**, in the phrase, “having reached perfection, fearless” (*niṭṭhaṅgato asantāsī*), *niṭṭhaṅgata* refers to arhathood, as evident from the context of the verse, and also confirmed by its commentary (DhA 4:70,19-21).

SD 3.3(1.2)

Niṭṭha Sutta

The Discourse on the Certain | **A 10.63/5:119 f** [A:B 3.86]

Theme: Common qualities that unify the saints in their spiritual goals

1 Bhikshus, all those who have won their goal⁹ under me [who have found certainty in me] are those **accomplished in right view**.¹⁰

Of those accomplished in right view, five win their goals here (in this life), five win their goals on leaving (here).

Who are the 5 who win their goals here? **[119]**

2 THE STREAMWINNERS. (Those who win their goal) *here and now* are:¹¹

- (1) the seven-at-most,¹²
- (2) the clan-to-clan-goer,¹³
- (3) the single-seeder,¹⁴
- (4) the once-returner,¹⁵ and
- (5) the arhat [worthy one].¹⁶

These are the 5 who win their goals here.

2.2 Who are those who win their goals *after leaving this world?*

3 THE NON-RETURNERS. (Those who win their goals after leaving here are):¹⁷

- (1) An attainer of nirvana in the interval [the intermediate state],¹⁸
- (2) an attainer of nirvana upon landing,¹⁹

⁹ “Who have won their goal,” *niṭṭhaṅ, gatā*. There is a wordplay on *mayi niṭṭhaṅ, gatā*, which can mean (1) “who have won their goal under me” or (2) “who have found certainty in me” [1.2.1].

¹⁰ “Accomplished in right view,” *diṭṭhi, sampanna*.

¹¹ The differences amongst the first 3 kinds of streamwinners prob arise from the relative strengths of their spiritual faculties (*indriya*) of concentration and wisdom are: see **Sikkhā S 1** (A 3.89,2.1) [SD 3.3(2)]; also **Sikkhā S 2** (A 3.86/1:231), SD 80.13.

¹² *Satta-k, khattu, parama*. “Having re-arisen and wandered amongst gods and humans for 7 lives at the most, (one) makes an end of suffering.” (**Sa, upadisesa S** A 9.12,10/4:381), SD 3.3(3): see below.

¹³ *Kolaṃ, kola*. “Having re-arisen and wandered amongst two or three families, (one) makes an end of suffering.” (A 9.12,9 /4:381), SD 3.3(3): see below.

¹⁴ *Eka, bījī*. “Having taken only one more human rebirth, (one) makes an end of suffering.” (A 9.12,8/4:380 f): see below.

¹⁵ *Sakad-āgamī: sakad = sakid or sakim* (“once”) + *āgamī* (“return”).

¹⁶ *Arahā* here (as at Sn 1003) is 3 sg nom: see Geiger & Norman, *A Pāli Grammar*, 2000 §98.1.

¹⁷ For the distinctions amongst these 5 kinds of non-returners, see **Purisa, gati S** (A 7.52/4:73 f), SD 82.10. They are mentioned in connection with the 3 trainings in (**Sekha**) **Uddesa S 3** (A 3.87), SD 80.14 & (**Ti**) **Sikkhā S** (A 3.88), SD 24.10c.

¹⁸ *Antarā, parinibbāyī* (D 3:237). For a discussion of the doctrinal problem here and on the intermediate state, see **Is rebirth immediate?** SD 2.17 (4-5).

(3) an attainer of nirvana without exertion,²⁰

(4) an attainer of nirvana with exertion,²¹

(5) one bound upstream, heading for the Akaniṭṭha realm.

3.2 These are the 5 who win their goals after leaving this world.²²

3.3 Bhikshus, all those who have won their goals under me are those accomplished in right view.

Of those accomplished in right view, 5 win their goals here (in this life), 5 win their goals after leaving this world.

— evaṃ —

2 The 3 trainings and the 4 saints

The (Sekha) Uddesa Sutta (A 3.85) is a definitive discourse on how the 3 trainings²³ are related to the attaining of sainthood.²⁴ The streamwinner is clearly defined here:

SD 3.3(2)

Sikkhā Sutta 1

The First Discourse on the Training | **A 3.85/1:231 f** [A:B 3.86]

Also **Paṭhama (Sekha) Uddesa Sutta** or **(Sekha) Uddesa Sutta 1** =

The First Discourse on the (Learner's) Teaching

Theme: The 3 trainings and the 4 saints

1 Bhikshus, sons of family, desiring spiritual welfare, train in these training rules numbering more than 150 that are recited fortnightly.

1.2 Bhikshus, all these combine to form the 3 trainings.

1.3 What are the three?

The training in higher moral virtue, the training in higher mind, the training in higher wisdom.²⁵

(1) THE STREAMWINNER

2 Here, bhikshus, a monk is **fully accomplished in moral virtue but gains only limited concentration, gains only limited wisdom**.

2.2 Whatever lesser and minor rules that one might transgress, one rises above them.²⁶

¹⁹ *Upahacca, parinibbāyī* (D 3:237), one who while living beyond half of the life-span, or at the moment of death, attains the holy path for overcoming the higher fetters (Pug 1.43). See **Is rebirth immediate?** SD 2.17 (4-5).

²⁰ *Asañkhāra, parinibbāyī* (D 3:237), one who overcomes the higher fetters without exertion (Pug 1.44). See **Is rebirth immediate?** SD 2.17 (4-5).

²¹ *Sa, sañkhāra, parinibbāyī* (D 3:237), one who overcomes the higher fetters with some exertion (Pug 1.45). See **Is rebirth immediate?** SD 2.17 (4-5).

²² On “after leaving this world,” see (1.2.1.3).

²³ On the 3 trainings, see **Sīla samādhi paññā**, SD 21.6 & **(Ti) Sikkhā S** (A 3.88/1:235), SD 24.10c.

²⁴ A 3.85/1:231 f, also called **(Mattaso, kāri) Sikkhā S**. See SD 21.6 for a discussion.

²⁵ That is, *adhi, sīla, sikkhā adhi, citta, sikkhā adhi, paññā, sikkhā*. Alt tr: “training in terms of moral virtue, training in terms of the mind, training in terms of wisdom” (here, the training aspect is emphasized against the theoretical moral virtue (*sīla*), concentration (*samādhi*), wisdom (*paññā*). Traditionally, the “higher training” (*adhi, sikkhā*) leads to the attainment of dhyana (*jhāna*).

²⁶ Take, eg, Sarakāṇi who, despite breaching the precept against intoxicants in due course dies a streamwinner. See **Sarakāṇi S 1** (S 55.24/5:375-377), SD 3.6.

2.3 What is the reason for this?

Here, bhikshus, there is no incapability, I say.

2.4 For, here, one is consistently *virtuous*, established in moral virtue and undertakes to train in the training-rules that are fundamental to the holy life²⁷ and that befit the holy life.²⁸

2.5 With the total destruction of the 3 lower fetters,²⁹

he is a **streamwinner**, no longer bound for the lower world,³⁰ sure of going over to self-awakening.

(2) THE ONCE-RETURNER

3 Here, bhikshus, a monk is **fully accomplished in moral virtue**³¹ **but gains only limited concentration, gains only limited wisdom.**

3.2 Whatever lesser and minor rules that one might transgress, one rises above them.

3.3 What is the reason for this?

Here, bhikshus, there is no incapability, I say.

3.4 For, here, one is consistently *virtuous*, established in moral virtue and undertakes to train in training-rules that are fundamental to the holy life and that befit the holy life.

3.5 With the destruction of the 3 fetters and with the diminishing of lust, hate and delusion,

he is a **once-returner**, returning only once to this world to make an end of suffering.

(3) THE NON-RETURNER

4 Here, bhikshus, a monk is **fully accomplished in moral virtue, is fully accomplished in concentration, but gains only limited wisdom.**

4.2 Whatever lesser and minor rules that one might transgress, one rises above them.

4.3 What is the reason for this?

Here, bhikshus, there is no incapability, I say.

4.4 For, here, one is consistently virtuous, established in moral virtue and undertakes to train in training-rules that are fundamental to the holy life and that befit the holy life.

4.5 With the destruction of the 5 lower fetters,³²

²⁷ "That are fundamental to the holy life," *ādi, brahma, cariyika*. BDict: *ādi, brahma, cariyaka sīla* = "morality of genuine pure conduct." This comprises right speech, right action, right livelihood (the 3rd 4th and 5th factors of the noble eightfold path. See SD 10.16 (1.6.3).

²⁸ "That befit the holy life (pl)," *brahma, cariya, sārappa*, ie, it conduces to the moral virtue connected with the 4 paths. (AA 2:349)

²⁹ On the (first) 3 fetters, see **Emotional independence**, SD 40a.8. The fetters are broken by the practice of the perception of impermanence, see (**Anicca**) **Cakkhu S** (S 25.1) + SD 16.7 (5) & **Mahā Rāhu'ovāda S** (M 62,23), SD 3.11.

³⁰ *Avinīpāta*, alt tr "not fated for birth in a suffering state"; opp of *vinīpāta*, "the world of suffering," another name for the 4 woeful courses (*duggati*) or the 4 lower worlds (*apāya*) (Vism 13.92 f). Sometimes 5 woeful courses (*pañca, gati*) (D 33,2.1(4)/3:234; A 11.68) are mentioned: the hells (*niraya*), the animal birth (*tirachāna, yoni*), the ghost realm (*pitti, visaya*), the human world (*manussa*) and the heavenly world (*deva*). Of these, the first three are woeful, with the asura-demons (*asura, kāya*) as the fourth woeful course. The remaining two are "happy courses" (*sugati*). For a discussion, see Nyanaponika & Bodhi (tr), *Numerical Discourses of the Buddha*, 1999:14-19. See **Pañśa, gati S** (A 9.68/4:459), SD 2.29.

³¹ "He possesses virtue dear to the noble ones, unbroken, untorn, unmixed, spotless, liberating, praised by the wise, untarnished, giving rise to concentration": see **Pañca Vera Bhaya S** (S 12.41/2:70), §4.1.14 below.

³² **The 10 fetters** (*dasa saṃyojana*) are: (1) self-identity view (*sakkāya, diṭṭhi*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rules and vows (*sīla-b, bata, parāmāsa*), (4) sensual lust (*kāma, rāga*), (5) repulsion (*paṭigha*), (6) greed for form existence (*rūpa, rāga*), (7) greed for formless existence (*arūpa, rāga*), (8) conceit (*māna*), (9) restlessness (*uddhacca*), (10) ignorance (*avijjā*) (S 5:61; A 5:13; Vbh 377). In some places, no 5 (*paṭigha*) is replaced by ill will (*vyāpāda*). The first 5 are the lower fetters (*oram, bhāgiya*), so called because they bind us to the lower

he is **spontaneously reborn** (in the Pure Abodes)³³
and there attains final nirvana without ever returning from there.

(4) THE ARHAT

5 Here, bhikshus, a monk is **fully accomplished in moral virtue, is fully accomplished in concentration, is fully accomplished in wisdom.**

5.2 Whatever lesser and minor rules that one might transgress, one rises above them.

5.3 What is the reason for this?

Here, bhikshus, there is no incapability, I say.

5.4 For, here, one is consistently virtuous, established in moral virtue and undertakes to train in training-rules that are fundamental to the holy life and that befit the holy life.

5.5 By realizing for himself through direct knowledge, right here and now,
with **the destruction of the mental influxes**,³⁴

he attains and dwells in the influx-free freedom of mind, freedom by wisdom.³⁵

6 Thus, bhikshus, those who train partially gain partial result,³⁶ those who train fully gain full results. These training-rules are not fruitless,³⁷ I say!

— evaṃ —

3 The 9 kinds of saints

The Sa,upādi,sesa Sutta (A 9.12) mentions 4 kinds of non-returners, and, for our purposes here, lists the 4 kinds of streamwinners [§§8-10], as well as stressing the ease of attaining spiritual awakening through proper practice.

realms, ie, the sense-worlds. The rest are the higher fetters (*uddham, bhāgiya*), that bind us to the higher realms, ie, the form world and the formless worlds. On these worlds, see SD 1.7 (Table 1.7).

³³ That is, reborn in the Pure Abodes (*suddh'āvāsa*), the 5 highest heavens of the form world (*rūpa, loka*) inhabited only by non-returners who assume their last birth to become arhats and attain nirvana. These worlds are Āviha ("Non-declining"), Ātappa ("Unworried"), Sudassā ("Clearly Visible"), Sudassī ("Clear-visioned") and Akaṇiṭṭhā ("Highest") (D 3:237, M 3:103, Vbh 425, Pug 42-46).

³⁴ "Mental influxes destroyed," *khīṇ'āsava*. The term *āsava* (lit "in-flow, out-flow") comes from *ā-savati* "flows towards" (ie, either "into" or "out" towards the observer). It has been variously translated as taints ("deadly taints," RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, bad (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists 4 *āsava*: the influxes of (1) sense-desire (*kām'āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav'āsava*), (3) views (*diṭṭh'āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijj'āsava*) (D 16,2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These 4 are also known as "floods" (*ogha*) and "yokes" (*yoga*). The list of 3 influxes (omitting the influx of views) [43] is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 33,1.10(20)/3:216; M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these *āsava*s is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict: *āsava*.

³⁵ The one freed of mind has destroyed all the mental hindrances, and as such could attain dhyana at will. The one freed by wisdom "may not have reached the 8 liberations (*vimokkha = jhāna*) in his own body, but through seeing with wisdom, his mental influxes are destroyed" (M 70,16/1:478): see SD 11.1 (5.2) for details; also **Mahā Suññata S** (M 122), SD 11.4 (3.3).

³⁶ "Those who train partially gain partial result," *padesaṃ padesa, kāri*.

³⁷ "Not fruitless (pl)," reading *avañjhāni*.

SD 3.3(3)**Sa,upādi,sesa Sutta**The Discourse on Those with Residues | **A 9.12/4:378-382**

Traditional: A 9.1.2.2 = Aṅguttara 9, Navaka Nipāta 1, Paṭhama Paṇṇāsaka 2, Sīhanāda Vagga 2

Theme: The non-returner, the once-returner and the streamwinner

- 1 At one time, the Blessed One was dwelling in Anātha,piṇḍika's Park in Jeta's grove near Sāvattḥī.
- 1.2 Then, in the morning, the venerable Sāriputta, having dressed himself and taking robe and bowl, entered Sāvattḥī for alms.
- 1.3 Then, the venerable Sāriputta thought,
"It is too early to go into Sāvattḥī for alms. What if I were to go to the sectarian wanderers' park?"³⁸
- 1.4 Then the venerable Sāriputta went into the sectarian wanderers' park and exchanged greetings with them. When this courteous and friendly exchange was concluded, he sat down at one side.

Those with clinging residues

- 2 Now at that time, this topic of conversation arose amongst the wanderers of other sects who had gathered together there,
- 2.2 "Avuso, those who die with residues of clinging³⁹ are
not freed from hell,
not freed from the animal birth,
not freed from the ghost realm,
not freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state."
- 3 Then the venerable Sāriputta, neither approving nor disapproving of the word of the wanderers of other sects, rose from his seat and left, thinking,
"I will learn the truth of this matter from the Blessed One himself."
- 3.2 Then the venerable Sāriputta, having gone into Sāvattḥī for alms, having returned from alms-round [379] and finished his meal, approached the Blessed One, saluted him and sat down at one side.
- 3.3 Sitting thus at one side, the venerable Sāriputta *related to the Blessed One what had happened at the sectarian wanderers' park, and* this topic of conversation that arose amongst the wanderers of other faiths who had gathered together there,
- 3.4 'Avuso, those who die with residues of clinging⁴⁰ are
not freed from hell,
not freed from the animal birth,
not freed from the ghost realm,
not freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.'
- 3.5 Then, neither approving nor disapproving of the word of the wanderers of other sects, I rose from my seat and left, thinking,
'I will learn the truth of this matter from the Blessed One himself.'

³⁸ "Sectarian wanderers," *nānā,titthiyā paribbājakā*, lit "other-fording wanderers"; fully: "the wanderers of other sects" or "heterodox wanderers," ie, non-Buddhist wanderers. It is interesting that this is the closest that the Buddhist texts have for "gentile" (a non-Jew), ie, an "outsider."

³⁹ "With residues of clinging," *sa,upādi,sesa*, ie, "with remains of material support to which one grasps (for rebirth)," viz, **the 5 aggregates** (*pañca-k,khandha*): form, feeling, perception, mental formations, and consciousness. This is clearly a broad term referring to those beings who are neither arhats nor learners (streamwinners, etc). See SD 50.13 (1.3.1.7).

⁴⁰ "Those who dies with residues of clinging," *sa,upādi,seso kālaṃ kurumāno*: see SD 50.13 (2.5.2.1).

The 9 who die with clinging residues

4 “Sāriputta, some of the wanderers of other sects are foolish and unintelligent; some will know those with residues of clinging as those with residues of clinging; some will know those without aggregates of clinging remaining as those without the aggregates of clinging remaining.

4.2 Sāriputta, there are these **9 persons**, who, having died with residues of clinging, are fully freed from hell, *parimuttā nirayā*
 fully freed from the animal birth, *parimuttā tiracchāna,yoniyā*
 fully freed from the ghost realm, *parimuttā pitti,visayā*
 fully freed from the state of misery, *parimuttā apāya*
 the bad destination, the suffering state. *duggati,vinipātā*

4.3 What are the nine? [380]

(1) THE IN-BETWEEN ATTAINER

5 Here, Sāriputta, a certain person is fully accomplished in moral virtue, is fully accomplished in concentration, but *does not gain wisdom completely*.

5.2 With the utter destruction of the 5 lower fetters, one becomes **an attainer of nirvana in the intermediate state**.⁴¹

5.3 This, Sāriputta, is **the 1st person**, who, having died with residues of clinging, is fully freed from hell,
 fully freed from the animal birth,
 fully freed from the ghost realm,
 fully freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

(2) THE ATTAINER UPON LANDING

6 Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person is fully accomplished in moral virtue, is fully accomplished in concentration, but *does not gain wisdom completely*.

6.2 With the utter destruction of the 5 lower fetters, one becomes **an attainer of nirvana upon landing**.⁴²

6.3 This, Sāriputta, is **the 2nd person**, who, having died with residues of clinging, is fully freed from hell,
 fully freed from the animal birth,
 fully freed from the ghost realm,
 fully freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

(3) THE ATTAINER WITHOUT EXERTION

Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person is fully accomplished in moral virtue, is fully accomplished in concentration, but *does not gain wisdom completely*.

⁴¹ *Antarā,parinibbāyī* (D 3:237).

⁴² *Upahacca,parinibbāyī* (D 3:237).

6.4 With the utter destruction of the 5 lower fetters, one becomes **an attainer of nirvana without exertion**.⁴³

6.5 This, Sāriputta, is **the 3rd person**, who, having died with residues of clinging, is fully freed from hell,
fully freed from the animal birth,
fully freed from the ghost realm,
fully freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

(4) THE ATTAINER WITH EXERTION

Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person is fully accomplished in moral virtue, is fully accomplished in concentration,
but *does not gain wisdom completely*.

6.7 With the utter destruction of the 5 lower fetters, one becomes **an attainer of nirvana with exertion**.⁴⁴

6.8 This, Sāriputta, is **the 4th person**, who having died with residues of clinging is fully freed from hell,
fully freed from the animal birth,
fully freed from the ghost realm,
fully freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

(5) THE AKANIṬṬHA-BOUND

Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person is fully accomplished in moral virtue, is fully accomplished in concentration,
but *does not gain wisdom completely*.

6.9 With the utter destruction of the 5 lower fetters, one becomes **one bound upstream, heading towards the Akaniṭṭha realm**.⁴⁵

6.10 This, Sāriputta, is **the 5th person**, who, having died with residues of clinging, is fully freed from hell,
fully freed from the animal birth,
fully freed from the ghost realm,
fully freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

(6) THE ONCE-RETURNER

7 Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person is fully accomplished in moral virtue,
but *gains only limited concentration, does not gain wisdom completely*.⁴⁶

⁴³ *Asañkhāra, parinibbāyī* (D 3:237).

⁴⁴ *Sa, sañkhāra, parinibbāyī* (D 3:237).

⁴⁵ *Uddhamsoto akaniṭṭha.gāmī* (D 3:237). The **Suddh'āvāsa** or "Pure Abodes" are a group of 5 heavens in the formless realm populated only by non-returners, and where they attain arhathood and nirvana. The 5 Pure Abodes, ie, their inhabitants and respective lifespans, are: Āviha ("Non-declining," 1000 MK), Ātappa ("Unworried," 2000 MK), Sudassā ("Clearly Visible," 4000 MK), Sudassī ("Clear-visioned," 8000 MK) and Akaniṭṭhā ("Highest," 16000 MK) (D 3:237, M 3:103, Vbh 425, Pug 42-46). MK = *Mahā Kappa*, ie, a full cycle of a world-period or cycle of the universe (V 3:4 = D 3:51, 111 = It 99; D 1:14; A 2:142). For celestial map, see **Kevaḍḍha S** (D 11), SD 1.7; for world cycle, see **Aggañña S** (D 27), SD 2.19.

⁴⁶ *Puna ca param sariputta idh'ekacco puggalo silesu paripūra, kāri hoti, samādhismiṃ mattaso, kāri* [PTS wr *samādhismiṃ na paripūra, kāri*], *paññāya na paripūra, kāri. So tiṇṇaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ parikkhaya, rāga, dosa, mohānaṃ tanuttā sakadāgāmī hoti.*

7.2 With the destruction of the 3 lower fetters and with the diminishing of lust, hate and delusion, one is a **once-returner**, returning only once to this world to make an end of suffering.

7.3 This, Sāriputta, is **the 6th person**, who, having died with residues of clinging, is fully freed from hell,
fully freed from the animal birth,
fully freed from the ghost realm,
fully freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

(7) THE SINGLE-SEEDER

8 Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person is fully accomplished in moral virtue, but *gains only limited concentration, gains only limited wisdom*.⁴⁷

With the total destruction of the 3 lower fetters,⁴⁸
one is a **single-seeder**,⁴⁹

having taken only one more human birth, **[381]** makes an end of suffering.⁵⁰

8.2 This, Sāriputta, is **the 7th person**, who, having died with residues of clinging, is fully freed from hell,
fully freed from the animal birth,
fully freed from the ghost realm,
fully freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

(8) THE CLAN-TO-CLAN GOER

9 Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person is fully accomplished in moral virtue, but *gains only limited concentration, gains only limited wisdom*.⁵¹

With the total destruction of the 3 lower fetters, one is a **clan-to-clan-goer**,⁵²
having re-arisen and wandered amongst two or three families, makes an end of suffering.⁵³

This, Sāriputta, is **the 8th person**, who, having died with residues of clinging, is fully freed from hell,
fully freed from the animal birth,
fully freed from the ghost realm,
fully freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

(9) THE SEVEN-AT-MOST

10 Furthermore, Sāriputta, here a certain person is fully accomplished in moral virtue, but *gains only limited concentration, gains only limited wisdom*.⁵⁴

⁴⁷ *Idh'ekacco puggalo sīlesu paripūra,kārī hoti, samādhismiṃ mattaso,kārī* [PTS wr *samādhismiṃ na paripūra,-kārī*], *paññāya mattaso,kārī*.

⁴⁸ They are the first 3 of the 10 fetters (*saṃyojana*), viz: (1) self-identify view (*sakkāya,ditṭhi*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*) and (3) attachment to rituals and vows (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*). On the **10 fetters**, see (2(4)) n above.

⁴⁹ *Eka,bījī*.

⁵⁰ *Puna ca param̃ sārīputta idh'ekacco puggalo sīlesu paripūra,kārī hoti, samādhismiṃ mattaso,kārī, paññāya mattaso,kārī. So tinnam̃ saṃyojanānam̃ parikkhayā eka,bījī hoti ekañ-ñeva mānusakam̃ bhavam̃ nibbattetvā dukkhass'antam̃ karoti*.

⁵¹ *Idh'ekacco puggalo sīlesu paripūra,kārī hoti, samādhismiṃ mattaso,kārī, paññāya mattaso,kārī*.

⁵² *Kolaṃ,kola*.

⁵³ *Puna ca param̃ sārīputta idh'ekacco puggalo sīlesu paripūra,kārī hoti, samādhismiṃ mattaso,kārī, paññāya mattaso,kārī. So tinnam̃ saṃyojanānam̃ parikkhayā kolaṅkolo hoti, dve vā tīṇi vā kulāni sandhāvitvā saṃsaritvā dukkhass'antakaro*.

⁵⁴ *Idh'ekacco puggalo sīlesu paripūra,kārī hoti, samādhismiṃ mattaso,kārī, paññāya mattaso,kārī*.

With the total destruction of the 3 lower fetters, one is a **seven-at-most**,⁵⁵ having re-arisen and wandered amongst gods and humans for 7 lives at the most, makes an end of suffering.⁵⁶

10.2 This, Sāriputta, is **the 9th person**, who, having died with residues of clinging, is fully freed from hell,

fully freed from the animal birth,

fully freed from the ghost realm,

fully freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

10.3 *Sāriputta, some of the wanderers of other sects are foolish and unintelligent; some will know those with residues of clinging*

as those with residues of clinging;

some will know those without aggregates of existence remaining

as those without aggregates of existence remaining.

10.4 Sāriputta, these are the 9 persons who, having died with residues of clinging, are fully freed from hell,

fully freed from the animal birth,

fully freed from the ghost realm,

fully freed from the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

Sāriputta rejoices

11 Not until now, Sāriputta, has this Dharma discourse been declared to bhikshus, nuns, laymen or laywomen.

11.2 What is the reason for this?

So that after hearing this Dharma discourse, *they do not bring heedlessness upon themselves!* **[382]**

11.3 Moreover, Sāriputta, this Dharma discourse has been given by me *simply because of my being questioned.*

— evaṃ —

⁵⁵ *Satta-k,khattu,parama.*

⁵⁶ *Puna ca paraṃ sāriputta idh'ekacco puggalo sīlesu paripūra,kārī hoti samādhismimṃ mattaso,kārī, paññāya mattaso,kārī. So tinnarṃ samyojanānarṃ parikkhayā satta-k,khattu,paramo hoti, satta-k,khattu,paramarṃ deve ca mānuse ca sandhāvitvā saṃsaritvā dukkhass'antarṃ karoti.*

4 The characteristics of streamwinning

4.1 THE LIMBS FOR STREAMWINNING (*sotāpatti-y-aṅga*)

SD 3.3(4.1)

(Sotāpatti) Phala Sutta

The Discourse on the Fruit (of streamwinning)

Ee **Paṭhama Caturo Phalā Sutta** The First Discourse on the 4 Fruits

Theme: The 4 limbs for streamwinning⁵⁷ | **S 55.55/5:410 f**

1 Bhikshus, these 4 things when cultivated, often developed, bring about the realization of the fruit of streamwinning.⁵⁸

2 What are the four? [411]

(1) Association with true individuals.⁵⁹

sappurisa,saṁseva

(2) Hearing the true teaching.

saddhamma,savana

(3) Wise attention.

yoniso,manasikāra

(4) Practice of the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.

dhammānudhamma,paṭipatti

3 These 4 things, when cultivated, often developed, lead to the realization of the fruit of streamwinning.

— evaṃ —

4.1.1 Description of the 4 limbs for streamwinning

(1) **Associating with true individuals** (*sappurisa,saṁseva*), those who know and practise the true teachings, and are filled with wisdom and compassion, inspire us to emulate them. In this way, we begin to know and understand the Buddha as the ideal of self-awakening, the Dharma as the true path to that awakening, and the sangha as the holy community of noble saints who have followed the Buddha's teaching to become self-awakened. In short, we have wise faith in the 3 jewels.⁶⁰

(2) **Hearing the true teaching** (*saddhamma,savana*), that is, the teaching of the Buddha, especially as recorded in the early Buddhist texts, in all their simplicity and clarity. The teaching trains us to harmonize our actions and speech with the people around us and with our environment. Such a harmonious life is the basis for mental cultivation, which in turn develops both our body and mind, so that we are

⁵⁷ *Sotāpatti-y-aṅga*, alt tr "limbs [factors] for streamwinning" (D 33,1.11(13)/3:227; Pm 2:189 f). These are preliminary practices that lead to the attainment of streamwinning. In **Paññā,vuḍḍhi S** (A 4.246) these same 4 qualities are called *vuḍḍhi,dhamma*, "virtues conducive to growth" (A 4.246/2:245); cf the 4 factors of noble growth (*ariya,-vuḍḍhi*): [4.1.3]. See S:B 762 n120. Cf "the limbs of streamwinning," *sotāpannassa aṅgāni* (4.2). For a more detailed analysis of both *sotāpatti-y-aṅga* and *sotāpannassa aṅga*, see SD 47.1 (2).

⁵⁸ *Cattāro'me bhikkhave dhammā bhāvitā bahulī,katā sotāpatti,phala,sacchikiriyāya saṁvattanti*.

⁵⁹ "True individuals," *sappurisa*, also "virtuous persons" or "ideal persons," ie, true spiritual practitioners. On the true individual's qualities, see **Sappurisa S** (M 113/3:37-45), SD 29.6. They are also given at **D 33,2.2(6)/3:252, 34,1.8(7)/ 3:283; M 110,14-24/3:23 f; A 7.64/4:113, 8.38/4:144**.

⁶⁰ On the Buddha's virtues, see **Buddhānussati**, SD 15.7; on the virtues of the Dharma, see **Dhammānussati**, SD 15.9; on the virtue of the Sangha, see **Aṭṭha,puggala S 1** (A 8.59), SD 15.10a(1).

physically and mentally healthy. With a healthy mind in a healthy body, we are more readily open to wisdom training.⁶¹ This is called the 3 trainings.⁶²

(3) **Wise attention** (*yoniso,manasikāra*) refers to the habitual practice of directing the mind or attention to see directly into the true nature of things, that they are all impermanent (*anicca*). As we see deeper into this recurring pattern, or “universal characteristic” (*sāmañña lakkhaṇa*), we begin to understand that they are also unsatisfactory (*dukkha*). In due course, we begin to see that what is impermanent and unsatisfactory has no abiding essence or eternal self or soul.⁶³

Wise attention, in other words, is our own effort at personal cultivation for the arising of liberating wisdom. The other way for liberating wisdom to arise is through wisely listening to others, or “the voice of another” (*parato ghosa*).⁶⁴

(4) **Practice of the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma** (*dhammānudhamma,paṭipatti*) to live a wholesome life in keeping with the teachings of the Buddha and his early saints. **The (Nibbidā) Dhamma, kathika Sutta** (S 12.16) defines this as practising the Dharma “for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation”⁶⁵ regarding any, a part or all of the 12 links, that is, decay-and-death, birth, existence, clinging, craving, feeling, contact, the 6 sense-bases, name-and-form, consciousness, decay and ignorance.⁶⁶

On a simpler level, this refers to renunciation (*nekkhamma*) in a spiritual sense, that is, in terms of the body, speech and mind.⁶⁷

Bodily renunciation refers to the habit of letting go of whatever is unwholesome and unhelpful to our physical health and wellbeing. Ethically, this means respecting life (ours and others), the happiness of others, and their personal space and freedom (these qualities are, in fact, embodied in the first three of the 5 precepts).⁶⁸

Verbal renunciation is the habit of refraining from speech that is false, divisive, harsh or unbeneficial, and the practice of right speech, that is, speech that is true, unifying, pleasant, and beneficial. In short, this is communication that is helpful and healing.

Mental renunciation is training ourselves to let go of negative ideas and views, and cultivating wholesome ones. This is best done through meditation and mindfulness practices.⁶⁹ Through meditation, we learn to let go of all thoughts, so that our mind is calm and clear, healing us and helping us to see people in a positive way, and see the true nature of life and the world so that we live truly happily and beneficially, evolving on the path of personal growth and spiritual liberation.⁷⁰

4.1.2 Identical teachings. The (Sotāpatti) Phala Sutta (S 55.55) is almost identical to a number of other suttas, where the 4 qualities are known by different names, such as:

⁶¹ For related suttas, see SD 3.3 (4.1.1+4.1.2).

⁶² See *Sīla samādhi paññā*, SD 21.6.

⁶³ These are the 3 characteristics (*ti,lakkhaṇa*): see *Atam,mayatā*, SD 19.13 (1); *Anatta Lakkhaṇa S* (S 22.59,12-16), SD 1.2.

⁶⁴ For further details, see *Yoniso Manasikāra Sampadā S* (S 45.55/5:31), SD 34.12 (2); *Nimitta and anuvyañjana*, SD 19.14 (5).

⁶⁵ See *Nibbidā*, SD 20.1.

⁶⁶ See *(Nibbidā) Dhamma,kathika S* (S 12.16), SD 46.18.

⁶⁷ These are the 3 doors of karma: see SD 5.7 (2.2.2).

⁶⁸ On the 5 precepts, see *Veḷu,dvāreyya S*, SD 1.5 (2); *Sīlānussati*, SD 15.11 (2.2); SD 21.6 (1.2); SD 37.8 (2.2).

⁶⁹ See *Bhāvanā*, SD 15.1.

⁷⁰ On renunciation (*nekkhamma*) as spiritual practice (esp meditation), see *Hālidakāni S 1* (S 22.3/3:9-12), SD 10.12; *Sexuality*, SD 31.7 (1.6.2); *Bhāvanā*, SD 15.1 (14.7).

- **(Sotāpatti-y-)Aṅga Sutta** S 55.50 the limbs for streamwinning (*sotāpatti-y-aṅga*)⁷¹
- **Pañña,vuddhi Sutta** A 4.246a said to “promote wisdom” (*paññā,vuddhi*)⁷²
- **(Manussa) Bahu,kāra Sutta** A 4.246b said to be “greatly beneficial to the human state” (*manussa,bhūtassa bahu,kāra*).⁷³

4.1.3 Related teachings. The set of 4 “limbs [factors] for streamwinning” are listed in **the Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 33) and **the Paṭisambhidā,magga**.⁷⁴ On the 4 factors of noble growth (*ariya,vuḍḍhi*), see the following suttas:

- **(Tadah’) Uposatha Sutta** A 3.70,8.2/1:210 SD 4.18
- **Sambadh’okāsa Sutta** A 6.26,8/3:316 SD 15.7a
- **(Sāvaka) Vaḍḍhi Sutta** A 5.63/3:80, with charity as 4th virtue SD 3.4(3)
- **(Sāvikā) Vaḍḍhi Sutta** A 5.64/3:80, with charity as 4th virtue SD 3.4(5)

4.1.4 The 4 qualities of a streamwinner

SD 3.3(4.1.4)

Ogadha Sutta

The Discourse on the Foothold⁷⁵ | S 55.2/5:343 f

or, **Brahma,cariy’ogadha Sutta**, The Discourse on the Foothold in the Holy Life

Traditional: S 5.11.1,2, Saṃyutta Nikāya 5, Mahā Vagga 11, Sotāpatti Saṃyutta 1, Veḷudvāra Vg 2

- 3 Bhikshus, a noble disciple who possesses 4 qualities is a streamwinner,⁷⁶
no longer bound for the lower world,⁷⁷ sure of going over to self-awakening.⁷⁸
What are the four?

(1) WISE FAITH IN THE BUDDHA

- 4 Here, Nandiya, a noble disciple has wise faith in the Buddha, thus:
‘So too, is he the Blessed One: for, he is

⁷¹ S 55.50/5:404 f.

⁷² A 4.246a/2:245 (A:B 2.248).

⁷³ A 4.246b/2:245 f (A:B 2.249).

⁷⁴ D 33,1.11(13)/3:227; Pm 2:189 f.

⁷⁵ The Sutta’s colophon (*uddāna*) gives *saṭṭayham*, whose meaning is unknown. See S:W 5:298 n1.

⁷⁶ Note here that no *tt* is used, only a ref to “qualities of a streamwinner” (**sotāpanna,dhamma*), which encompasses both the “limbs for streamwinning” (*sotāpatti-y-aṅga*) and the “limbs of streamwinning” (*sotāpannassa aṅga*).

⁷⁷ *Avinipāta*, alt tr “not fated for birth in a suffering state”; opp of *vinipāta*, “the world of suffering,” another name for the 4 woeful courses (*duggati*) or the 4 lower worlds (*apāya*) (Vism 13.92 f). Sometimes 5 “woeful” courses (*pañca,gati*) (D 33,2.1(4)/3:234; A 11.68) are mentioned: the hells (*niraya*), the animal birth (*tirachāna,-yoni*), the ghost realm (*pitti,visaya*), the human world (*manussa*) and the heavenly world (*deva*). Usually, the first three are woeful, with the asura-demons (*asura,kāya*) as the fourth woeful course—then they are known as the “4 woeful states.” The last two are usually “happy courses” (*sugati*). For a discussion, see Nyanaponika & Bodhi (tr), *Numerical Discourses of the Buddha*, 1999:14-19. See **Pañśa,gati S** (A 9.68/4:459), SD 2.29.

⁷⁸ The whole para: *Catūhi bhikkhave dhammehi samannāgato ariya,sāvako sotāpanno hoti avinipāta,dhammo niyato sambodhi,parāyaṇo*. “Sure (of liberation)” (*niyata*) here means that the streamwinner is sure of reaching final liberation in not more than 7 lives, lived either in the human world or in some heavenly realm, before attaining self-awakening (*sambodhi*), ie, the arhat’s final knowledge (*aññā*). On the 3 kinds of streamwinners, see **Sa,upādi,sesa S** (A 8,12,8-10), SD 3.3(3) above.

arhat [worthy],
 fully self-awakened one,
 accomplished in wisdom and conduct,
 well-farer,
 knower of worlds,
 peerless guide of persons to be tamed,
 teacher of gods and humans,
 awakened,
 blessed.⁷⁹

(2) WISE FAITH IN THE DHARMA

5 One has wise faith in the Dharma, thus:
 ‘Well-taught is the Blessed One’s true teaching,
 visible here and now,
 immediate [having nothing to do with time],
 inviting one to come and see,
 accessible [to bring oneself up to it],
 to be personally known by the wise.’⁸⁰

(3) WISE FAITH IN THE SANGHA

6 One has wise faith in the Sangha, thus:
 The Blessed One’s community of disciples is well-practised [keeps to the good way];
 the Blessed One’s community of disciples keeps to the straight way;
 the Blessed One’s community of disciples keeps to the right way;
 the Blessed One’s community of disciples keeps to the proper way.
 These are the 4 pairs of persons, the 8 individuals:
this Blessed One’s community of disciples is
 worthy of offerings,
 worthy of hospitality,
 worthy of gifts,
 worthy of salutation with the lotus-palms,
 a supreme field of merit for the world.⁸¹

(4) VIRTUES DEAR TO THE NOBLE ONES

7 One has virtues dear to the noble ones,⁸²
 unbroken, untorn, unmixed, spotless,
 liberating, praised by the wise, untarnished, giving rise to samadhi [stillness].⁸³ [344]
 8 Bhikshus, a noble disciple who possesses these 4 qualities is a streamwinner,
 no longer bound for the lower world, sure of going over to self-awakening.

⁷⁹ For details on each of these qualities, see *Buddhānussati*, SD 15.7.

⁸⁰ For details on this verse, see *Dhajagga S* (S 11.3,15), SD 15.5 & *Dhammānussati*, SD 15.9.

⁸¹ For details on each of these qualities, see *Aṭṭha, puggala S* (A 8.59), SD 15.10a.

⁸² “Virtues dear to the noble ones,” *ariya, kantāni sīlāni*. The noble one’s moral virtue is explained at *Vism* 7.101-106/221 f. SA says that the noble ones do not violate the 5 precepts; hence, this virtue is dear to them (SA 2:74).

⁸³ “Unbroken, ... giving rise to concentration,” *akhaṇḍehi acchiddehi asabalehi akammāsehi bhujissehi viññûpa-saṭṭhehi aparāmaṭṭhehi samādhi, sarivattanikehi*. See UA 268.

9 The Blessed One said this. Having said this, the well-gone, the Teacher, further said this:

10 *Yesaṃ saddhā ca sīlañ ca
pasādo dhamma,dassanaṃ
te ve kālena paccenti
brahma,cariy’ogadham sukhan’ti*

For whom there is faith and moral virtue,
bright with faith⁸⁴ in seeing the Dharma,
such a one indeed comes in time to realize
the joy⁸⁵ of a firm footing⁸⁶ in the holy life.

— evaṃ —

4.2 THE LIMBS OF A STREAMWINNER

4.2.1 The **Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 1** (S 12.41) is practically identical to the **(Dasaka) Bhaya Sutta** (A 10.92). The former, however, is slight abridged, omitting one or two lines, which are found in the latter, giving a more complete presentation [§5.2 n]. Another extended parallel is the **(Navaka) Vera Sutta 1** (A 9.27).⁸⁷

SD 3.3(4.2)

Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 1⁸⁸

Paṭhama Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta

The First Discourse on the 5 Kinds of Hate and Fear | S 12.41/2:68-70
S 2.1.5.1, Saṃyutta Nikāya 2, Nidāna Vagga 1, Nidāna Saṃyutta 5, Gahapati Vagga 1
Theme: The 4 limbs of a streamwinner

1 (The Blessed One was) staying at Sāvattihī.

2 Then, the houselord Anātha,piṇḍika approached the Blessed One, saluted him and sat down at one side. As he was seated thus at one side, the Blessed One said this to him,

The 5 kinds of hate and fear

3 “Houselord, when a noble disciple’s 5 kinds of hate and fear⁸⁹ have been quelled, one is endowed with the 4 limbs of a streamwinner (*sotāpannassa aṅgāni*),⁹⁰

⁸⁴ This “bright faith” (*pasāda*) relates either to that of the confident joy of the path (*magga,pasāda*), or the review knowledge of one who has reached the path (*āgata,maggassa paccvekkhaṇa-p,pasāda*) (SA 3:277).

⁸⁵ Comy says that this is the joy (*sukha*) associated with the 3 higher paths (once-returning, non-returning and arhathood) (*upari,magga-t,taya,sampayuttam sukham*, SA 3:277).

⁸⁶ **Ogadha**, alt tr “being grounded (in), having a grounding (in).” *Ogādha* is a by-form of *ogādha* (“firm footing, solid ground (lit & fig),” eg, (a sandbank) in the water; cf *paṭigādha*, “firm ground”: A 7.15,7.2 (SD 28.6), from vb *ogādhati*, “stands firmly.” Comys consistently gloss *ogādha* with *patiṭṭhā*, “footing” (eg, ItA 1:112) or with *patiṭṭha-hati*, “to be established” (eg, AA 2:267; UA 345; PmA 1:108). On **ogadha**, see esp SD 49.8 (7.5.3.6(4)). See DP: *ogadha*¹; also S:B 1093 n243.

⁸⁷ S 12.41/2:68-70 = A 10.92/5:183; A 9.27/4:406 (without the section on dependent arising).

⁸⁸ Uddāna title reads *Saṭṭayham* (?); also called Pañca Bhera Bhaya S. The importance of this discourse is attested by the fact that it also appears as **Anātha,piṇḍika S 3** or **Pañca Vera S** (S 55.28/5:387-389), and **Bhaya Vera S** (A 10.92/5:182-184). It also has other names, such as **Pañca Bhaya Vera S**. Cf below, §10 n on **Anātha,piṇḍika S 1** (S 55.26), SD 23.2a & **Anātha,piṇḍika S 2** (S 55.27), SD 23.2b.

⁸⁹ “(Kinds of) hate and fear,” *bhayāni verāni*, or “terror and fear.” Comy glosses as “volitions of fear and hate” (*bhaya,vera,cetanāyo*) (SA 2:72). Cf A 9.27/4:405-407, 10.92/5:182-184, etc. “Hate” (*vera*) here I take as an emotion (expressed externally), while “fear” (*bhaya*) as an internal feeling (an unemoted or unexpressed mental state).

3.2 and has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way

3.3 —if one wishes⁹¹ one could by oneself declare of oneself,

‘I have destroyed hell, the animal birth, the realm of the departed [ghosts], the plane of misery, the bad destination, the lower realm. I’m a streamwinner, no longer bound for the lower world,⁹² sure of going over to self-awakening!’

4 What are the **5 kinds of hate and fear that have been quelled?**

5 (1) Householder, one who harms life, conditioned by *harming of life*, generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too— and one feels mental pain and unease, too.⁹³

5.2 But for one *who abstains from harming life*, hate and fear are quelled.

[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]⁹⁴

6 (2) Householder, one who takes the not-given, conditioned by *taking the not-given*, **[69]** generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too— and one feels mental pain and unease, too.

6.2 But for one *who abstains from taking the not-given*, hate and fear are quelled.

[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

7 (3) Householder, one who indulges in sexual misconduct, conditioned by *the indulging in sexual misconduct*, generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too— and one feels mental pain and unease, too.

7.2 But for one *who abstains from sexual misconduct*, hate and fear are quelled.

[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

8 (4) Householder, one who speaks falsely, conditioned by *speaking falsely*, generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too— and one feels mental pain and unease, too.

8.2 But for one *who abstains from speaking falsely*, hate and fear are quelled.

See also A 3:204 f, 4:405 f, 5:182; It 57 = Sn 167; Vbh 378. See also **(Bhaya) Vera S** (A 5.174/3:204-206), SD 6.4 Intro.

⁹⁰ *Sotāpannassa aṅgāni*, see §2.10 n here.

⁹¹ *Akaṅkhamāno*, also “being without doubt,” “not doubting.”

⁹² *Avinīpāta*, alt tr “not fated for birth in a suffering state”; opp of *vinīpāta*, “the world of suffering,” another name for the 4 woeful courses (*duggati*) or the 4 lower worlds (*apāya*) (Vism 13.92 f). Sometimes 5 courses (*pañca, gati*) (D 33.2.1(4)/3:234; A 9.68/4:459 @ SD 2.20) are mentioned: the hells (*niraya*), the animal birth (*tirachāna, yoni*), the ghost realm (*pitti, visaya*), the human world (*manussa*) and the heavenly world (*deva*). Of these, the first three are woeful, with the asura-demons (*asura, kāya*) as the fourth woeful course. The remaining two are “happy courses” (*sugati*). For a discussion, see Nyanaponika & Bodhi (tr), *Numerical Discourses of the Buddha*, 1999:14-19.

⁹³ *Yaṃ gahapati pāṇātipātī verāni, pāṇātipāta, paccayā bhayāni | diṭṭha, dhammikam pi bhayaṃ veram pasavati samparāyikaṃ pi bhayaṃ veram pasavati | cetasikam pi dukkham domanassaṃ paṭisaṃvediyati.*

⁹⁴ This line and that following each of the other four precept statements are missing here but found at A 10.92/5:183 f [4.2.1]. “It seems that the logic of the discourse requires this addition; its omission from the present text could be an early scribal error.” (S:B 761 n119).

[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

9 (5) Houselord, one who takes strong drinks, distilled drinks, fermented drinks and that which causes heedlessness, conditioned by indulging in strong drinks, distilled drinks, fermented drinks and that which causes heedlessness,

generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too—
and one feels pain and unease, too.

9.2 But for one who abstains from taking intoxicants hate and fear are quelled.

[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

These are the 5 kinds of hate and fear that have been quelled.

The 4 limbs of a streamwinner (*sotāpannassa aṅgāni*)⁹⁵

10 What are the 4 limbs of a streamwinner⁹⁶ that one possesses?

(1) WISE FAITH IN THE BUDDHA

11 Here, houselord, a noble disciple is accomplished with wise faith⁹⁷ in the Buddha thus:

‘So, too, is he the Blessed One:⁹⁸ for, he is
arhat,

⁹⁵ A parallel of this section appears in **Anātha,piṇḍika S 1** (S 55.26,6-9/5:381 f), SD 23.2a & **Anātha,piṇḍika S 2** (S 55.27,8/5:386 f), SD 23.2b.

⁹⁶ The “limbs of a streamwinner,” *sotāpannassa aṅgāni* (D 33,1.11(14)/3:227). Cf *sot’āpatti-y-aṅga*, “the limbs (or factors) for streamwinning” [4.1]. The two terms are sometimes interchangeable in the suttas, depending on the context: see SD 47.1 (2.1.1). On these terms, see SD 23.2b (1.3). For a shorter statement on the limbs of a streamwinner, see **Ogadha S** (S 55.2/5:343 f). For the streamwinner’s practice, see (**Agata,phala**) **Mahānāma S** (A 6.40/3:284-288), SD 15.3. On the streamwinner’s faith, see Gethin 2001:116.

⁹⁷ “Wise faith,” *avecca-p,pasāda*. This is a syntactical cpd with *avecca* (Sky *avetya*) absolutive of **aveti*, “he undergoes, knows, experiences”; see SD 49.2. [On syntactical cpds, see K R Norman, 1991a:3.] There are 2 kinds of faith (*saddhā*): (1) “rootless faith” (*amūlika,saddhā*), baseless or irrational faith, blind faith (M 2:170,21); (2) “faith with a good cause” (*ākāravati,saddhā*), faith founded on seeing (M 1:320,8, 401,23). “Wise faith” is syn with (2). *Amūlika* = “not seen, not heard, not suspected” (V 2:243 3:163 & Comy). **Gethin** speaks of two kinds of faith: the cognitive and the affective (eg, ERE: Faith & Jayatilleke, *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge*, 1963:387): “Faith in its cognitive dimension is seen as concerning belief in propositions or statements of which one does not—or perhaps cannot—have knowledge proper (however that should be defined); cognitive faith is a mode of knowing in a different category from that knowledge. Faith in its affective dimension is a more straightforward positive response to trust or confidence towards something or somebody ... the conception of *saddhā* in Buddhist writings appears almost, if not entirely affective, the cognitive element is completely secondary.” (Gethin 2001:107; my emphases). The streamwinner’s faith is defined in **Vimāṃsaka S** (M 47) as “his faith is strong, supported by reasons, rooted in vision” (*ākāra,vatī saddhā dassana,mūlikā dalhā*, M 47,16/1:320).

⁹⁸ Alt tr: “For the following reasons, too, he is the Blessed One [the Lord] ...” On the meaning of **iti pi so**, see CPD: **1iti**: ... *kitti-saddo abbhuggato*: “~ **pi so bhagavā**: *arahaṃ sammā-sambuddho ...* .” (“for the following reasons, too, he is a *bhagavā*: because he is *arahaṃ ...*”), V 3:1,13 = D 1:49,27 = M 2:133,22 = S 1:219,31 = A 3:312,8, qu Vism 198,4 and MahvṬ 26,11 (VA 112,4 = DA 146,5 ≠ Vism 198,8: *so bhagavā ~ pi arahaṃ ~ pi sammāsambuddho ... iminā ca iminā ca kāraṇenā ti vuttaṃ hoti*). Translating *iti pi so* this way explains the double occurrence of *Bhagavā*. See L S Cousins, “Review of *Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha*,” in *Journal of Buddhist Ethics* 4, 1997:165. The Skt parallel to this opening reads: *Iti hi sa bhagavāṃ tathāgato*, but **tathāgato** here is missing from the Pali version. See **Dhaj’agga S** (S 11.3), SD 15.5 (2).

fully self-awakened,
 accomplished in wisdom and conduct,
 well-farer,
 knower of worlds,
 peerless guide of tamable persons,
 teacher of gods and humans,
 awakened,
 blessed.’

(2) WISE FAITH IN THE DHARMA

12 One is accomplished with wise faith in the Dharma thus:

‘Well-taught is the true teaching of the Blessed One,
 to be self-realized,
 immediate [having nothing to do with time],
 for one to “come and see,”
 accessible [leading onward],
 to be personally known by the wise.’

(3) WISE FAITH IN THE SANGHA

13 One is accomplished with wise faith in the sangha thus:

‘Of good conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
 of upright conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
 of right conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
 of proper conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples.

These 4 pairs of persons, the 8 individuals, are this Blessed One’s **[70]** community of holy disciples:

worthy of offerings,
 worthy of hospitality,
 worthy of gifts,
 worthy of salutation with the lotus-palms,
 an incomparable field of merit for the world.’

(4) NOBLE MORAL VIRTUE

14 One is accomplished with moral virtues dear to the noble ones,⁹⁹ unbroken, untorn, unmixed, spotless, liberating, praised by the wise, untarnished, giving rise to concentration.¹⁰⁰

These, householder, are the 4 limbs of a streamwinner that one possesses.

The noble way

15 And what, householder, is **the noble way [method]**¹⁰¹ that one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom?

⁹⁹ “Moral virtue dear to the noble ones,” *ariya, kantāni sīlāni*. The noble one’s moral virtue is explained at Vism 7.101-106/221 f. SA says that the noble ones do not violate the 5 precepts because this virtue is dear to them (SA 2:74).

¹⁰⁰ *Akhaṇḍehi acchiddehi asabalehi akammāsehi bhujissehi viññūpasaṭṭhehi aparāmaṭṭhehi samādhi, saṁvattanakehi*. Found in 7 of the 10 suttas in **Veḷu, dvāra Vagga** (S 55.1-5, 7-8, ie, except nos 6, 9 ad 10); **Cundī Rāja, kumārī S** (A 5.32/3:36), SD 66.4; **(Agata, phala) Mahānāma S** (A 6.10/3:286), SD 15.3. Details at Vism 1.143-161/51-58, 7.101-106/221 f. See also **Virtue ethics**, SD 18.11 (2.2).

SPECIFIC DEPENDENT ARISING

16 Here, houselord, one properly and skillfully attends to dependent arising¹⁰² itself thus:

| | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| When this is, that is; | <i>imasmim̐ sati idaṃ hoti</i> |
| When this is not, that is not. | <i>imasmim̐ asati idaṃ na hoti</i> |
| With this arising, that arises; | <i>imass'uppādā idaṃ uppajjati</i> |
| With this ceasing, that ceases. | <i>imassa nirodhā idaṃ nirujjhati</i> ¹⁰³ |

DEPENDENT ARISING¹⁰⁴

17 That is, with ignorance as condition, mental formations (arise);

| | |
|--|--------------------|
| 17.2 With mental formations as condition, there is | consciousness; |
| with consciousness as condition, there are | name-and-form; |
| with name-and-form as condition, there are | the 6 sense-bases; |
| with the six sense-bases as condition, there is | contact; |
| with contact as condition, there is | feeling; |
| with feeling as condition, there is | craving; |
| with craving as condition, there is | clinging; |
| with clinging as condition, there is | existence; |
| with existence as condition, there is | birth; |
| with birth as condition, there are | decay-and-death. |

There also arise

despair.

Such is the arising of this whole mass of suffering.

DEPENDENT ENDING

17.3 But with the remainderless fading away and cessation of ignorance,

| | |
|---|--------------------------|
| with the cessation of mental formations as condition, | mental formations cease; |
| with the cessation of consciousness as condition, | consciousness ceases; |
| with the cessation of name-and-form as condition, | name-and-form cease; |
| with the cessation of the 6 sense-bases as condition, | the 6 sense-bases cease; |
| with the cessation of contact as condition, | contact ceases; |
| with the cessation of feeling as condition, | feeling ceases; |
| with the cessation of craving as condition, | craving ceases; |
| with the cessation of clinging as condition, | clinging ceases; |
| with the cessation of existence as condition, | existence ceases; |
| | birth ceases; |

¹⁰¹ *Ariya ñāya*, or “noble method.”

¹⁰² *Paṭicca.samuppāda*: see n after next.

¹⁰³ In his *What the Buddha Taught* (2nd ed 1967), W Rahula has rearranged the “specific dependent arising” in this formula, thus:

| | |
|-------------------------------|--|
| When this is, that is; | <i>imasmim̐ sati idaṃ hoti</i> |
| This arising, that arises | <i>imass'uppādā idaṃ uppajjati</i> |
| When this is not, that is not | <i>imasmim̐ asati idaṃ na hoti</i> |
| This ceasing, that ceases | <i>imassa nirodhā idaṃ nirujjhati.</i> (1967:53) |

In his n (same page) he says: “To put it into a modern form: When A is B is; A arising, B rises; When A is not, B is not; A ceasing, B ceases.” (id). Such a presentation, however, is unattested in the early Buddhist texts.

¹⁰⁴ *Paṭicca,samuppāda*: V 1:1; S 11:1; Vbh 135; Vism 517; Abhs 8.2. See **Dependent Arising**, SD 5.16, esp (1.4) for def of each of the 12 links.

with the cessation of birth as condition,
There also cease

decay-and-death cease.
sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief
and despair.

Such is the cessation of this whole mass of suffering.’

This is the noble way that one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom.

18 Houselord, when the noble disciple’s 5 kinds of hate and fear have been quelled,
one is accomplished in the 4 limbs of streamwinning, and
one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way
—if one wishes one could by oneself declare of oneself:

‘I have destroyed hell,
the animal birth,
the ghost realm,
the state of misery,
the bad destination, the suffering state.

I am a streamwinner,
no longer bound for the lower world,
sure of going over to self-awakening!’”

— evaṃ —

THE POSSIBILITY OF STREAMWINNING

4.3 In the Sarakāni Sutta 1 (S 55.24), the Buddha speaks of the ease and possibility of attaining streamwinning, hinting that anyone with a mind has the potential for attaining it, thus,

Even these great sal trees,¹⁰⁵ Mahānāma, if they could understand¹⁰⁶ what is well spoken and what is ill spoken, I would declare them to be streamwinners, no longer bound for the lower world, sure of going over to self-awakening!
(S 55.24,13/5:377)

SD 3.3(4.4)

(Sotāpanna) Ānisaṃsā Sutta

The Discourse on (a Streamwinner’s) Benefits | A 6.97/3:441

Theme: The benefits of streamwinning

1 Bhikshus, there are these 6 benefits in realizing the fruit of streamwinning. What are the six?

2 THE 6 BENEFITS OF BEING A STREAMWINNER:

- | | |
|--|---|
| (1) One is sure of the true teaching | <i>saddhamma,niyato hoti</i> |
| (2) One does not fall away from true reality | <i>aparihānam,dhammo hoti</i> |
| (3) There is a limit to one’s suffering | <i>pariyanta,katassa dukkhaṃ na hoti</i> |
| (4) One is endowed with uncommon knowledge | <i>asādhāraṇena ñāṇena samannāgato hoti</i> |

¹⁰⁵ Comy says that the Buddha was pointing to 4 sal trees (*Shorea robusta*) nearby (AA 3:288).

¹⁰⁶ “Could understand,” *ājāneyyurū* (lit “were to understand”), pot 3rd pl of *ājānāti*, “to know, to understand, to learn, to realize; to understand, to perceive” (CPD). This verb refers to seeing through illusion directly at reality, a vision that would surely lead to the wisdom called *aññā*, “final knowledge,” the wisdom of the arhats.

- (5) One has clearly understood causes, and *hetu c'assa sudiṭṭho*
 (6) One has clearly understood phenomena arising
 from causes. *hetu,samuppannā ca dhammā sudiṭṭho*

— evaṃ —

- (1) The streamwinner is sure of the true teaching because the fetter of doubt has been broken.
 (2) He does not fall back from true reality because he sees the true nature of reality through understanding impermanence.
 (3) His suffering is limited because he has only 7 more rebirths at the most.
 (4) His “uncommon knowledge” is the supramundane knowledge with nirvana as the mind’s object, which is not shared by the common untutored worldling.
 (5) The understanding of causes relates to the application of specific conditionality¹⁰⁷ in daily life.
 (6) The understanding of phenomena arising from causes is the understanding of dependent arising.¹⁰⁸

5 The streamwinner’s faith

5.0 The streamwinner is closely associated with the faculty of faith (*saddh’indriya*), so it is useful to understand it more fully.¹⁰⁹ The streamwinner is said to have abandoned **the 3 fetters** of self-identity view (or more simply, self-view) (*sakkāya,diṭṭhi*), doubt (*vicikicchā*), and attachment to rituals and vows (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*).¹¹⁰

5.1 SELF-IDENTITY VIEW. The Pārīleyya Sutta (S 22.81) defines and discusses the self-identity view and its abandonment in some detail as a means for “the immediate destruction of the mental influxes.” A being who holds such a view is said to be “trapped in self-identity” (*sakkāya pariyāpanno*),¹¹¹ which literally means “included in self-identity” or “enmeshed in self-identity.”

In **the Sī ha Sutta** (S 22.78), the devas who regard themselves as permanent, stable and eternal are really “impermanent, unstable, not eternal, trapped in self-identity” (S 3:85). The Commentary there explains the expression as “included in the 5 aggregates.” Thus, when the Buddha teaches them the Dharma sealed with the 3 characteristics (impermanence, unsatisfactoriness, non-self), exposing the faults in the round of existence, the fear of knowledge enters them. (SA 2:288).

The self-identity view is also *the wrong view* that any of the 5 aggregates is permanent or the self. Each of the 5 aggregates—form, feelings, perception, formations and consciousness—is, in turn, taken as self, as what self possesses, as being in the self, and as what the self is in, totalling 20 types of self-

¹⁰⁷ *Idap,paccayatā*, ie, “When this is, that is; with this arising, that arises. When this is not, that is not; with this ending, that ends” (S 12.21/2:28), or more briefly, “Whatever is of the nature to arise, all that is of the nature to cease” (V 1:11; D 1:110; M 3:280; S 4:47, 214, 330, 5:423; A 4:143 f), or “Just as this is, so is that. Just as that is, so is this” (Sn 203 = Tha 396). See SD 5.16(2).

¹⁰⁸ *Paṭicca,samuppāda*, ie, the 12 links. See (**Kāya**) **Na Tumha S** (S 12.37), SD 5.14; (**Paṭicca,samuppāda**) **Vibhaṅga S** (A 5.57), SD 5.15; **Mahā Nidāna S** (D 15), SD 5.17. See esp SD 5.16.

¹⁰⁹ See (**Indriya**) **Daṭṭhabba S** (S 48.8) where the faculty of faith is def as “the 4 limbs of streamwinning” (*sotāpat-ti-y-aṅga*) (S 48.8,3), SD 10.4(1.1.3).

¹¹⁰ M 1:9; S 5:357; Dhs 182. For a study of the 3 fetters, see **Emotional independence**, SD 40a.8.

¹¹¹ (**Mahānāma**) **Gilayāna S** (S 55.54) says that even the highest heavens are “trapped in self-identity” (*sakkāya,-pariyāpanno*), and when we direct our mind to the cessation of self-identity, we gain the “cessation of self-view” (*sakkāya,nirodha*) (S 55.54.17/2:410), SD 4.10.

identity views.¹¹² In each case, the Buddha points out that it is only formations (*saṅkhāra*), craving (*taṇhā*), feeling (*vedanā*), contact (*phassa*) and ignorance (*avijjā*) that add up to a self-identity view. but they are all “impermanent, constructed, and arise by way of conditions” (*aniccā saṅkhatā paṭicca,sam-uppannā*).

It is knowing and seeing this truth that leads to the immediate destruction of the mental influxes. Technically, this is known as “the ending of self-view” (*sakkāya,nirodha*), and is a synonym for the third noble truth. In **the (Mahā,nāma) Gilayāna Sutta** (S 55.54), the Buddha teaches the layman Mahānāma how to give counselling to a dying person so that one attains awakening, that is, by directing the mind to the cessation of self-identity.¹¹³ The abandoning of the self-identity view, in other words, leads to stream-winning.¹¹⁴

5.2 DOUBT. The Dhamma,saṅgaṇī explains both self-identity view and attachment to rituals and vows as examples of wrong view (*micchā,diṭṭhi*) only associated with a mind (*citta*) that has greed (*lobha*) as a component,¹¹⁵ and that these two fetters are particular manifestations of that greed (or attachment).

Doubt (*vicikicchā*) is defined by **the Dhamma,saṅgaṇī** as follows:

- doubt regarding the Teacher (more specifically, the Buddha’s awakening),
- doubt regarding the Dharma (as the path to awakening),
- doubt regarding the Sangha (that is, the community of saints),
- doubt regarding the spiritual training,
- doubt regarding the past,
- doubt regarding the future,
- doubt regarding the past and future, and
- doubt regarding the way in which states arise according to various conditions.¹¹⁶

It is clear here that doubt is defined in an exactly opposite manner to faith (*saddhā*) and joyful faith (*pasāda*). While faith here is the steady confidence and lucid joy with regard to the Buddha, the Dharma and the Sangha, doubt is uncertainty about them.

In **the Ceto,khila Sutta** (M 16), the 5 types of mental hardness (*cetokhila*), or spiritual barrenness, are defined as uncertainty and hostility regarding the Teacher, the Dharma, the Sangha, the training and fellow practitioners (*brahma,carī*).¹¹⁷ The removal of these 5 types of mental hardness conduces to spiritual development, beginning with the arising of faith that is lucid, joyful and wise. Gethin adds a helpful note:

The thinking behind the association of *sotāpatti* and *saddhā* can perhaps be expressed in the following way. The relinquishing of attachment to individuality [*sakkāya,diṭṭhi*] and precept and vow [*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*] makes way for the establishing of firm confidence (regarded as having a psychological affinity with attachment); this in turn disperses doubt and uncertainty. The proper establishing of *saddhā*, the abandoning of *sakkāya-diṭṭhi*, *vicikicchā* and *sīla-b,bata,-parāmāsa* are, according to the logic of the dynamics of Buddhist thought, different aspects of the same process, each one involving each of the others. (Gethin 2001:116)

¹¹² See Gethin 1986:44 f.

¹¹³ S 55.54/2:410 (SD 4.10).

¹¹⁴ See **Samanupassanā S** (S 22.47/3:46 f), SD 26.12.

¹¹⁵ Dhs 75-80, 182 f.

¹¹⁶ *Satthari kaṅkhati vicikicchati, dhamme kaṅkhati vicikicchati, saṅghe kaṅkhati vicikicchati, sikkhāya kaṅkhati vicikicchati, pubb’ante kaṅkhati vicikicchati, apar’ante kaṅkhati vicikicchati, pubb’antâparante kaṅkhati vicikicchati, idap,paccayatā,paṭicca,samuppannesu dhammesu kaṅkhati vicikicchati* (Dhs 183).

¹¹⁷ M 16,3-7/1:101.

5.3 ATTACHMENT TO RITUALS AND VOWS

5.3.1 The Caṇḍāla Sutta (A 5.175) speaks of a false layman—called an outcaste layman (*upāsaka, caṇḍāla*), a stained layman (*upāsaka, mala*), a low layman (*upāsaka, paṭikiṭṭho*)—in the following manner:

- (1) One lacks faith.
- (2) One lacks moral virtue.
- (3) One believes in rituals to invoke luck.
- (4) One relies on luck, not on karma.
- (5) One seeks the gift-worthy outside the teaching and there gives his priority.

The same Sutta then defines a true layman—called a jewel layman (*upāsaka, ratana*), a lotus follower (*upāsaka, paduma*), a white-lotus follower (*upāsaka, puṇḍarīka*)—in the manner contrary to those of a false follower, namely:

- (1) One has faith (*saddho*).
- (2) One has moral virtue (*sīlava*).
- (3) One does not believe in rituals to invoke luck (*akotuhala, maṅgaliko*).
- (4) One relies on karma, not on luck (*kammaṃ pacceti no maṅgalaṃ*).
- (5) One does not seek the gift-worthy outside the teaching but gives one’s priority here (in the teaching) (*na ito bahiddhā dakkhiṇeyyaṃ gavesati idha ca pubba, kāraṃ karoti*).

(A 5.175/3:206), SD 45.12¹¹⁸

Here, it is clear that **the true lay follower**, especially a streamwinner, is not superstitious. The third fetter—attachment to rituals and vows—in essence refers to relying on external means of dealing with problems, instead of looking within and understanding the nature of the mind, and dealing directly with it at the source (*yoniso, manasikāra*).

5.3.2 In the Mahā Parinibbāna Sutta (D 16), the Buddha tells Ānanda the spiritual destiny of various virtuous followers at Nādikā, and teaches him the Dharma mirror or mirror of the Dharma (*dharm-ādāsa*)—that is, *the 4 limbs of a streamwinner*¹¹⁹ [4.2]—by which if we wish, we could personally say of ourself,

“I have destroyed hell, the animal birth, the realm of the departed [ghosts], the plane of misery, the bad destination, the lower realm. I am a streamwinner, no longer bound for the lower world, sure of going over to self-awakening!”
(D 16,2.8/2:93)

6 The lesser streamwinner

If one thinks that even becoming a streamwinner in this life is difficult, if not impossible, then one could become a “lesser streamwinner.”¹²⁰ The term *cūḷa, sotāpanna* or *cullaka, sotāpanna* is a commentarial one, and is not found in the Canon. However, the notion of a “lesser streamwinner” is found in the

¹¹⁸ For a similar list, see **Parihāna S** (A 7.27/4:25), also called Hani S, and **(Upāsaka) Parābhava S** (A 5.176/4:26). See SD 12.14 (2). See also **Kiñci Saṅkhāra S** (A 6.93), SD 12.14.

¹¹⁹ See **Laymen saints**, SD 8.6(14).

¹²⁰ *Cūḷa, sotāpanna, culla, sotāpanna, or cullaka sotāpanna*. For further discussion on “lesser streamwinner,” see **Laymen saints**, SD 8.6(14b).

ten suttas of the **Okkanta Saṃyutta**,¹²¹ the key passages of which—as found in its first discourse, the **(Anicca) Cakkhu Sutta** (S 25.1), for example—runs as follows:

The eye, bhikshus, is impermanent, changing, becoming otherwise.

The ear is impermanent, changing, becoming otherwise.

The nose is impermanent, changing, becoming otherwise.

The tongue is impermanent, changing, becoming otherwise.

The body is impermanent, changing, becoming otherwise.

The mind is impermanent, changing, becoming otherwise.

Bhikshus, one who has faith thus, who firmly believes these truths [is convinced of these truths], is called a **faith-follower**, ...

Bhikshus, one who accepts these truths after pondering over them with some wisdom thus,¹²² is called a **truth-follower**,

one has entered the fixed course of rightness, entered the plane of superior persons, gone beyond the plane of the worldlings.¹²³

One is incapable of doing any intentional deed by which one might be reborn in hell, or in the animal birth, or in the ghost realm. One is incapable of dying without attaining the fruit of streamwinning.¹²⁴ (S 25.1/3:225), SD 16.7¹²⁵

7 The certainty of streamwinning

7.1 The purpose of practising the Buddha’s Dharma is to free oneself from suffering here and now. The main hindrance to this simple but vital truth is *the thought* that we are “incapable” of entering the stream to awakening in this life. As mentioned earlier [6], the ten suttas of the **Okkanta Saṃyutta** (S 25) guarantees our attaining of streamwinning *in this life itself* if we constantly practise the perception of impermanence.¹²⁶

7.2 The possibility of gaining streamwinning here and now is further supported by Nakula,mātā’s declaration to the severely ill Nakula,pitā (by way of bedside counselling), thus:

Now, houselord, it might be that you think, ‘After I am gone, the housewife Nakula,mātā might not find a footing, a foothold, and solace in the Teaching and Discipline, might not be one

¹²¹ The Connected Suttas on the Descent, S 25.1-10/3:225-228.

¹²² *Yassa kho bhikkhave ime dhammā evaṃ paññāya mattaso nijjhānaṃ khamanti.*

¹²³ *Yo bhikkhave ime dhamme evaṃ saddahati adhimuccati, ayaṃ vuccati saddhā’nusārī okkanto sammatta, niyāmaṃ sappurisa, bhūmiṃ okkanto vītivatto putthajjana, bhūmiṃ.* The operative verbs here are *saddahati* (“he has faith (in)”) and *adhimuccati* (“he resolves, adheres to, is sure of”). I have rendered *adhimuccati* here as “(he) firmly believes ...”

¹²⁴ *Abhabbo taṃ kammaṃ kātuṃ yaṃ kammaṃ katvā nirayaṃ vā tiracchāna, yoniṃ vā petti, visayaṃ vā uppajjeyya. Abhabbo ca tāva kālaṃ kātuṃ yāva na sotāpatti, phalaṃ sacchikaroti.*

¹²⁵ The other 9 discourses of **Okkanta Saṃyutta** (the Connected Suttas on the Descent), ie, ch 25 of the Saṃyutta Nikāya are: **(Anicca) Rūpa S** (S 25.2), **(Anicca) Viññāna S** (S 25.3), **(Anicca) Phassa S** (S 25.4), **(Anicca) Vedanā S** (S 25.5), SD 17.3(4.5a), **(Anicca) Saññā S** (S 25.6), SD 17.4(10), **(Anicca) Saṅkhāra S** (S 25.7), **(Anicca) Taṇhā S** (S 25.8), **(Anicca) Dhātu S** (S 25.9), and **(Anicca) Khandha S** (S 25.10) (S 25.1-10/3:225-229). All these suttas make a distinction between 2 types of individuals—the faith follower (*saddhā’nusārī*) and the truth-follower (*dhammānusārī*), who enter into “the certainty of rightness” (*sammatta, niyāma*), ie, the transcendent noble eightfold path, or the path of streamwinning (*sotāpatti, magga*). See SD 16.7 (1.1.3) & also Gethin 2001:133-138.

¹²⁶ S 25.1-10/3:225-228 (SD 16.7).

who has crossed over doubt, gone beyond uncertainty, won spiritual confidence, who, independent of others, dwells in the Teacher's teaching.¹²⁷

Houselord, you should not see things that way. Houselord, for as long as there are the white-clad female lay disciples of the Blessed One who shall find a footing, a foothold, and solace in this Teaching and Discipline, crossed over doubt, gone beyond uncertainty, won moral courage, who, independent of others, dwell in the Teacher's teaching, I am one amongst them.

If anyone should doubt or question this, let him go and ask the Blessed One who is residing in the Deer Park in the Bhesakaḷā Forest at Suṃsumāra,giri in the Bhaggā country.

(A 6.16,2.6/3:297), SD 5.2

At the end of the Sutta, the Buddha himself endorses Nakula,mātā's statement.¹²⁸

7.3 The message of the 10 short but remarkable suttas of **the Okkanta Saṃyutta** (S 25) is clear: whether we merely have *faith* in the impermanence of all that exists (the world) (that is, as a faith-follower, *saddhā'nusārī*), or accept this truth through *wisdom*, that is, after wisely examining (that is, as a truth-follower, *dhammānusārī*), we are assured of becoming a streamwinner. We would not die without having realized the fruit of streamwinning.¹²⁹

Each of the 10 suttas of the Okkanta Saṃyutta defines a **streamwinner** in the same way, as one who is "no longer bound for the lower world,¹³⁰ sure of going over to self-awakening."¹³¹ The alternative is surely devastating (rebirth in subhuman planes), but the blessings of streamwinning are immeasurable:

| | | |
|-------------------------------|--|-------------------------|
| <i>Pathavyā eka,rajjena</i> | Better than absolute power over the earth, | |
| <i>saggassa gamanena vā</i> | or even going to heaven, | |
| <i>sabba,lokādhupaccena</i> | or lordship over all the worlds, | |
| <i>sotāpatti,phalaṃ varaṃ</i> | is the blessed fruit of streamwinning. | (Dh 178) ¹³² |

8 The significance of streamwinning

8.1 THE BENEFITS OF STREAMWINNING. Streamwinning assures us of full awakening in not more than 7 lives. The streamwinner has 4 natural qualities called **the "streamwinner's limbs"** (*sotāpannassa aṅgāni*), that is, wise faith in the Buddha, wise faith in the Dharma, wise faith in the sangha, and virtues dear to the noble ones [4.1.4]. These same 4 qualities are declared by the Buddha, in **the Brāhmaṇā Sutta** (S 55.12) to conduce to the awakening process. In other words, this is a confirmation that streamwinning will

¹²⁷ "Find a firm footing ... in the Teacher's Teaching," *imasmim dhamma,vinaye ogādha-p,pattā paṭigādha-p,pattā assāsa-p,pattā tiṇṇa,vicikicchā vigata,kathaṃ,kathā vesārajjā-p,pattā apara-p,paccayā satthu sāsane viharantiyo*. This passage defines a streamwinner's qualities. On *ogādha-p,pattā*, cf UA 345.

¹²⁸ A 6.16,4/3:298 (SD 5.2).

¹²⁹ On the lesser streamwinner, see **(Anicca) Cakkhu S** (S 25.1/3:225), SD 16.7 (1) esp (1.6).

¹³⁰ *Avinīpāta*, alt tr "not fated for birth in a suffering state"; opp of *vinīpāta*, "the world of suffering," another name for the 4 woeful courses (*duggati*) or the 4 lower worlds (*apāya*) (Vism 13.92 f). Sometimes 5 woeful courses (*pañca,gati*) (D D 33,2.1/3:234; A 11.68) are mentioned: the hells (*niraya*), the animal birth (*tirachāna,yoni*), the ghost realm (*pitti,visaya*), the human world (*manussa*) and the heavenly world (*deva*). Of these, the first three are woeful, with the asura demons (*asura,kāya*) as the fourth woeful course. The remaining two are "happy courses" (*sugati*). For a discussion, see Nyanaponika & Bodhi (tr), *Numerical Discourses of the Buddha*, 1999:14-19.

¹³¹ **Sotāpanno avinīpāta,dhammo niyato sambodhi,parāyano ti.** (S 25)

¹³² **Dh 178** is quoted at SD 3.3(7), SD 10.16 (1.6.6.6), SD 18.7(4.4), SD 36.10(2.1.3), SD 47.3a(4.2.2).

certainly lead to full awakening in this very life, or at the moment of death,¹³³ but not more than 7 lives (A 9.12,10). [3]

SD 3.3(8)

(Sotāpatti) Brāhmaṇā Sutta

The (Streamwinning) Discourse on the Brahmins | S 55.12/5:361 f

S 5.11.2.3, Saṃyutta Nikāya 5, Mahā Vagga 11, Sotāpatti Saṃyutta 2, Rājakārāma Vagga 2

Theme: The 4 limbs of a streamwinner conduce to the awakening process

1-2 Originating in Sāvattḥī.

3 “Bhikshus, the brahmins proclaim a path called “**the ascension**.”¹³⁴

3.2 They have their disciples undertake it, thus:

‘Come, my good man, as soon as you get up, go facing east!¹³⁵ Do avoid any pit, or any precipice, or any stump, or any brier [thorny spot], or any pool, or any cesspit.¹³⁶

3.3 Wherever you should fall, expect death right there.¹³⁷

Thus, my good man, with the breaking up of the body, after death, you will be reborn in a good destination, in a heavenly world.’

4 Now, bhikshus, this foolish way, this deluded way of the brahmins does not at all conduce to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana.

4.2 But, I, bhikshus, proclaim that in the noble one’s discipline there is the ascension that conduces to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana.

4.3 And what, bhikshus, is that ascension that conduces to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana? [362]

5 Here, bhikshus,¹³⁸

The 4 limbs of a streamwinner

(1) WISE FAITH IN THE BUDDHA

A noble disciple is accomplished with wise faith in the Buddha thus:

‘So, too, is he the Blessed One: for, he is
arhat,

¹³³ See (Anicca) Cakkhu S (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

¹³⁴ “The ascension,” *udaya, gāminim*, from *udaya* (“going upwards, ascending; prosperity”) + *gāmini* (“going”). The term “ascension” is representative of the theistic notions of the brahmins, as it is of theistic faiths today. This “natural adaptation” of the idea facilitates a Buddhist response to a closely related form of *udaya, gāmini paṭipadā* of the brahmins, that we can ascend to heaven by faith alone.

¹³⁵ *Ehi tvaṃ ambho purisa kālass’eva uṭṭhāya pācīna, mukho yāhi*. An ex-member of the inner circle of the Guru Mahesh cult (later 1960s-early 1970s) reported that Mahesh, in his later years, insisted that all buildings belonging to his organization should have only east-facing doors. Doors facing other directions would be detrimental to the success of his organization, he claimed.

¹³⁶ *So tvaṃ mā sobbhaṃ parivajjehi, mā papātaṃ, mā khāṇuṃ, mā kaṇḍaka, ṭhānaṃ, mā candaniyaṃ [Ee candanikaṃ], mā oḷigallaṃ.*

¹³⁷ *Yattha [Ke Se yatth’eva; Ce yāni ca] papateyyāsi tatth’eva maraṇaṃ āgameyyāsi [So Be; Ee Se āgacceyyāsi].* Comy explains “One should wish for, long for, death” (*marāṇaṃ iccheyyāsi pattheyyāsi vā*, SA 3:285).

¹³⁸ For nn on this Sutta, see S 12.41,10-14 [SD 3.3(4.2) above].

fully self-awakened,
 accomplished in wisdom and conduct,
 well-farer,
 knower of worlds,
 peerless guide of tamable persons,
 teacher of gods and humans,
 awakened,
 blessed.'

(2) WISE FAITH IN THE DHARMA

He is accomplished with wise faith in the Dharma thus:

'Well-taught is the true teaching of the Blessed One,
 to be self-realized,
 immediate [having nothing to do with time],
 for one to "come and see,"
 accessible [leading onward],
 to be personally known by the wise.'

(3) WISE FAITH IN THE SANGHA

He is accomplished with wise faith in the sangha thus:

| | |
|--------------------|---|
| 'Of good conduct | is the Blessed One's community of holy disciples; |
| of upright conduct | is the Blessed One's community of holy disciples; |
| of right conduct | is the Blessed One's community of holy disciples; |
| of proper conduct | is the Blessed One's community of holy disciples. |

These 4 pairs of persons, the 8 individuals, are this Blessed One's community of holy disciples:

worthy of offerings,
 worthy of hospitality,
 worthy of gifts,
 worthy of salutation with the lotus-palms,
 an incomparable field of merit for the world.'

(4) VIRTUES DEAR TO THE NOBLE ONES

He is accomplished with moral virtues dear to the noble ones,

unbroken, untorn,
 unmixed, spotless,
 liberating, praised by the wise, untarnished, giving rise to concentration.

6 This, bhikshus, is that ascension that conduces to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana."

— evaṃ —

8.2 ONE WHO SEES NIRVANA

8.2.1 First sight of nirvana

8.2.1.1 Streamwinners can be either monastics or lay followers who has attained the noble path to awakening. Hence, they are known as "noble ones" (*ariya*). They are also said to have "wise faith" (*avec-*

ca-p,pasāda), that is, joyful understanding, in the Buddha, the Dharma, and the sangha—since they have “reached certainty about the Tathagata” (*tathāgate nitthaṅgata*). The streamwinners’ joyful faith also arises on account their being “seers of the deathless” (*amata-d,dasa*), that is, nirvana. [8.2.2.3].

8.2.1.2 The Niṭṭha Sutta (A 10.63), where certainty about the Buddha is ascribed to disciples at levels lower than arahantship.¹³⁹ The statement that these people have noble liberation (*ariyena vimuttiyā*) is unusual, but the Aṅguttara Commentary (AA) glosses it “by the liberation of the fruit of trainees” (*sekha,phala,vimuttiyā*).

8.2.2 The figure of seeing

8.2.2.1 In the Udakūpama Sutta (A 7.15), in its parable of the shipwreck, describes the streamwinner as one “who, having emerged (from the waters), observes, looks around” (*ummujjitvā vipassati viloketi*).¹⁴⁰ As we know, all the 4 kinds of saints are described as “seeing the death-free (nirvana)” (*amata-d,dasa*) [8.2.2.3]. Hence, we can here interpret “surveys” (*viloketi*) as such a vision by the streamwinner: he sees nirvana.¹⁴¹

However, he does *not* touch it “with his own body” (*kāyena phusitvā*): he has not personally realized nirvana. Hence, the monk Nārada, in **(Musīla Nārada) Kosambī Sutta** (S 12.68), declares that, although he has seen, he is still “unable to dwell, having touch it with his own body” (*na kāyena phusitvā vihareyya*). In other words, he only *sees* the water, but he “is unable to draw out the water” and drink it to slake his thirst (SA 2:123). [8.2.3.1]

8.2.2.2 The verb *vipassati*, “observes,” is important, as it clearly denotes the practice of the perception of impermanence (*anicca,saññā*), which leads to streamwinning.¹⁴² This verb famously found in the sentence, “one sees them each of them [the present moment] with insight” (*tattha tattha vipassati*) in **the Bhadd’eka,ratta Suttas** (M 131), thus:

Only this present state
(as it arises) one sees that with insight;
immovable, unshakable,
having known that, let one be sure of it.

tattha tattha vipassati
asañhī raṃ asaṅkuppam
taṃ vidvā manubrūhaye

(M 131,3.3/3:187), SD 8.9

Here, the Bhadd’eka,ratta Sutta instructs us to see *only* the arising of the 5 aggregates (or any of them) in the present moment. More simply, this means seeing each moment of “rising and falling,” as being impermanent: this is a perception of impermanence (*anicca,saññā*).¹⁴³

8.2.2.3 The term *amata-d,dasa* (Skt *amṛta*, “non-death, immortality” + √DRṢ, to see) is a common attribute for all the 4 kinds of saints—they are said to “have seen the death-free,” that is, nirvana. It is found in **the Chakka Nipāta** of the Aṅguttara, in a series of suttas (including lay arhats), all of whom are said to be “seers of the death-free” (A 6.119-139/3:450 f).

¹³⁹ A 10.63/5:119 f (SD 3.3 (1.2)).

¹⁴⁰ **Udakūpama Sutta** (A 7.15,6), SD 28.6.

¹⁴¹ Here, “seeing” is also *dassana*, which refers to the destruction of the 3 fetters, ie, the “influxes to be abandoned by seeing” (*āsavaṃ dassanā pahatabbā*): see **Sabb’āsava S** (M 2,11/1:9), SD 30.3

¹⁴² See eg, **(Anicca) Saññā S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

¹⁴³ See **Mahā Rāhul’ovāda S** (M 62,23), SD 3.11.

In the **Thera,gāthā**, *amata-d,dasa* refers to the arhat who is a “three-knowledge seer of the death-free” (*te,vijjo amata-d,daso*), in the **Rāhula Thera,gāthā** (Tha 296) and the **Vaḍḍha Thera,gāthā** (Tha 336). In each case, the arhats Rāhula and Vaḍḍha speak in reference to their own attainment.

The term *amata,dasa*, “seer of the death-free,” is used by the devatā disciple, Sirimā, in her **Sirimā Vimāna,vatthu** (Vv 147): “Thus am I the deity who is a seer of the death-free,” in reference to her state of streamwinning.¹⁴⁴

The form *amata,dassī*, a synonym, is found in the **Apadāna** of Sāriputta (Ap 1.139). Here, it refers to Sāriputta’s attaining of arhathood.¹⁴⁵

8.2.3 Looking at the water in the well

8.2.3.1 The (Musilā Nārada) Kosambī Sutta (S 12.68) is an interesting discourse about how a monk named Nārada explains that although he has “seen” nirvana, he is *not* an arhat. He is only sees nirvana, but has not fully attained it—in other words, he is only a streamwinner “who has clearly seen as it really is with right vision that nirvana is the ending of existence”¹⁴⁶—but he has not himself “touched it with his own body” (*assa na ca kāyena phusitvā*), that is, not yet an arhat.

8.2.3.2 Using the parable of a desert well, he explains how a thirsty man, lost in the desert, finds a well, and looking into it, see water. However, he is unable to draw up the water to drink so that his thirst is slaked.¹⁴⁷ Although seeing or vision (*dassana*) is associated with streamwinning, it also describes the other three kinds of saints.

In fact, the Sutta Commentary says that the man afflicted by the heat represents the non-returner; the sight of the water in the well, his seeing of nirvana; and the water-bucket, the path to arhathood. Just as the man oppressed by the heat sees the water in the well, the non-returner knows by review knowledge, “There is a breakthrough to the path to arhathood.”¹⁴⁸

However, as the man lacks a rope and a bucket to draw the water so as to taste and drink it for himself, and quench his thirst, even so, the non-returner (or the streamwinner or the once-returner) is unable to personally touch [experience] awakening yet, because he has not reached the path of arhathood. So he is unable to sit down, absorbed in the attainment of the fruit of arhathood, which has nirvana as its object. (SA 2:123)

— — —

040719 rev061209 071202 081218 091118 101122 111207 120928 130620 141001 150526 161218 171208 181023

¹⁴⁴ *Evaṃ aham amata,das’amhi devatā* (Vv 147/1.16.11/18).

¹⁴⁵ Ap 1.139/24,21 = ThaA:Ce 2:103,24*.

¹⁴⁶ *Bhava,nirodho nibbānan’ti kho me āvuso yathā,bhūtaṃ samma.paññāya sudiṭṭhaṃ* (S 12.68/2:118,1), SD 70.11.

¹⁴⁷ **(Musilā Narada) Kosambū S** (S 12.68,60/1:118), SD 70.11.

¹⁴⁸ S 12.68/1:115-118 (SD 70.11).