

9

(Iti) Vitakka Sutta

The (Iti,vuttaka) Discourse on Thoughts | It 28
 Theme: The essence of Buddhist discipleship
 Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2008, 2019

1 Summary and significance

1.1 THE 2 THOUGHTS

1.1.1 Safety and solitude. The (Iti) Vitakka Sutta (It 28) is about the 2 thoughts of the Buddha, that is, those on safety (*khema*) and in solitude (*paviveka*) [§2]. They respectively refer to the Buddha's *compassion* and *wisdom* [1.2.1.1]. The Buddha's **compassion** is shown in his non-ill will" (*avyāpajjha*) towards all beings [§§3-5]; his **wisdom** arises from his having abandoned all that is unwholesome [§§6-7].

1.1.2 Compassion and wisdom. The Buddha then exhorts us likewise to cultivate **non-ill will**, that is, lovingkindness [§§8-10], and **solitude**, that is, to work on abandoning all unwholesomeness in us [§§11-13]. The Sutta then closes with the Buddha's 3 verses that give their own take on the Sutta [§§14-17]. [1.2.1]

1.1.3 Discipleship. Essentially, **the (Iti) Vitakka Sutta** (It 38) is a teaching—even the locus classicus—on Dharma-based discipleship. Hence, the Sutta is divided into 3 almost equal parts:

- (1) **The Buddha** has himself won the safety and solitude of the liberating Dharma. [§§2-7]
- (2) By his own example, the Buddha now exhorts us to **follow** the Dhamma in the same way. [§§8-13]
- (3) The Buddha then utters **the 3 verses on discipleship** to close his teaching. [§§15-17]

Following the Dharma like the Buddha does, we are then his true followers (masc *upāsaka*, fem *upāsikā*), ready to become his disciples (*sāvaka*) in due time. First, the Buddha shows that he himself enjoys both **the safety** (*khema*) and **the solitude** (*paviveka*) that is the Dharma [1.1.1]. By exhorting us, the Buddha at once offers us *both safety and solitude* [1.2.2]. The 3 verses of uplift that close the Sutta affirm the Buddha as the fully self-awakened and the teacher of gods and humans, whose teaching is still with us [1.2.1.1].

1.2 SUTTA SIGNIFICANCE

1.2.1 Compassion and wisdom

1.2.1.1 The Buddha is usually said to be "**accomplished in wisdom and conduct**" (*vijjā,carāṇa,sampanna*)—which is part of the well-known recollection on the Buddha (*buddhānussati*), which also means that what he understands is reflected in his unrelenting and purposeful conduct (his Bodhisattva quest), and his present conduct (the Buddha quest) reflects true and beautiful wisdom: true because it *is*; beautiful because it *fre*es. This is a spiritual play between wisdom and compassion, self and other, in letting us see our potential be like Buddha, even becoming buddha. Hence, the Buddha is here epitomized as **the teacher**,¹ and we, the disciple to be, following the same path to nirvana.

¹ See *Buddhānussati*, SD 15.7 (3.3).

1.2.1.2 The (Iti) Vitakka Sutta (It 38) presents the Buddha as highlighting his twin qualities of **safety** (*khema*) and **solitude** (*paviveka*). The usual sense of *khema* is the “safe and secure,” that is, nirvana, which the Buddha has attained. In the Sutta, however, he is depicted as *giving* this sense of safety to others by joyfully showing others his lovingkindness and compassion [§§3-5], teaching **the Dharma** (*pariyatti*), and *showing his wisdom* by instructing us its **practice** (*paṭipatti*), that is, how to cultivate *moral virtue* (to give up unwholesomeness of body and speech) and cultivate *the mind* (to give up unwholesomeness of the mind). [§§6-7]

1.2.1.3 Hence, the Sutta *reverses* the sequence of the Buddha’s twin qualities of wisdom and compassion by first highlighting the Buddha’s **compassion** by way of the gift of **safety**, also called “fearlessness,” *abhaya*), that is, the gift of fearlessness (*abhaya,dāna* or *abhaya,dakkhiṇā*),² through our Dharma understanding. Through this **wisdom**, we learn to master our body and speech to be morally virtuous (*bhāvita,kaya*), and mentally cultivated (*bhāvita,citta*).³

1.2.2 Teaching by example

1.2.2.1 Having himself won **the safety** (*khema*) that is nirvana—“safety” in the sense of freedom from suffering and mental defilements—the Buddha teaches us that *we, too, can enjoy this safety*: this is his great compassion. The Buddha begins by accepting us *just as we are*—ignorant and full of craving. When we are ready, he *compassionately* shows us the Dharma that awakens us. He *rejoices* in our awakening, even when we only listen to the Dharma mindfully—what more when we follow it. Even to this day, the Buddha Dhamma is present in our lives through his *equanimity*, that is, the Dharma he has bequeathed us.

1.2.2.2 Having himself gained **the solitude** (*paviveka*), that is, his enjoyment of true aloneness in inner space in a crowded world, free of greed, hate and delusion, he teaches us the path of *self-reliance* of the “one-going” way⁴ to nirvana: this is his wisdom. When we understand the Buddha Dharma, we are filled with moral courage (*vesārajjā*), the heart of Dharma, to head for the path of awakening, and to move up that path to the same awakening as the Buddha himself has gained.

1.3 THE 3 VERSES OF UPLIFT (§15-17)

1.3.1 Verse 1 (§15)

1.3.1.1 “To the Tathagata, the Buddha” [§15a]

The term **tathagata** is usually used by the Buddha to address himself [2.1]. He is **buddha**, “awakened,” in the sense of having fully understood true reality, as he states in this verse from **the Sela Sutta** (M 92; Sn 3.7):

² SA 1:346,14; AA 4:186,26; ThaA 2:259,21; ItA 2:81,7; J 3:274,6; CA 303.

³ On the terms *bhāvita,kāya* and *bhāvita,citta*, see **Pinḍola Bhāra,dvāja S** (S 35.127,7), SD 27.6a.

⁴ The “one-going” way (*ek’āyana*) is specifically the 4 satipatthanas (mindfulness of the body, of feelings, of the mind, and of realities); broadly, it refers to stilling the body to clear the mind for liberating insight to arise. This is, of course, the noble eightfold path, the best of paths (Dh 273a). See SD 13.1 (3.2.4).

*Abhiññeyyaṃ abhiññātāṃ⁵
bhāvetabbañ ca bhāvitāṃ
pahātabbaṃ pahīnaṃ me
tasmā buddho'smi brāhmaṇa⁶*

What is to be known is known,
what is to be cultivated is cultivated,
what is to be abandoned has been abandoned by me—
therefore, brahmin, awakened [the Buddha]⁷ am I.⁸
(M 92,19.2 = Sn 558 = Tha 828 = VA 1:115,21-22*), SD 45.7a

1.3.1.2 “who endures the unendurable” (*asayha sāhinaṃ*) [§15a]

The Iti,vuttaka Commentary explains this phrase in 3 ways. Only the great bodhisattva (the Buddha-to-be) is said to be so, on account of:

- (1) enduring (*sahanato*), bearing (*vahanato*), all the ingredients of awakening (*bodhi,sambhāra*) and being disposed to great compassion;
- (2) defeating (*sahanato*), overpowering the 5 Māras [SD 19.17 (3.2)];
- (3) enduring, carrying out (*vahanato*), the Buddha-duties with competence. (ItA 149,15-24)

Dhammapāla, explaining *asayha,sāhino* (Tha 536a), adds that the 1st reason here applies to the time before the awakening; the other two to that after the awakening (ThaA 2:226).

1.3.1.3 The 2 thoughts of the Buddha [§15cd] are those of safety and of solitude.

“The thought of safety” (*khema,vitakka*) is connected with compassion (a concern for others who are insecure and suffering); hence, it is also connected with lovingkindness and joy. These are the first 3 of the 4 divine abodes (*brahma,vihāra*): *mettā, karuṇā* and *muditā*, where the 2nd abode is mentioned first, since the Buddha is looking out into the suffering world with active compassion, ready to help those who need his help.

The 4th, equanimity, is the basis for “the thought of solitude” (*paviveka,vitakka*), that is, mental solitude, that of a mind free of the 3 poisons (*visa*) or unwholesome roots (*mūla*).⁹ This is, technically, the forerunner and concomitant of his attainment of fruition (living experience of nirvana), but it also arises in connection with his attainment of dhyanas (ItA 143,3-14).

The Commentary lists 89 ways in which the world is afflicted (ItA 143,21-145,8), on account of which the Buddha arises and works to free us of them. [2.2]

1.3.2 Verse 2 (§16)

1.3.2.1 “The great seer, darkness-dispeller, gone beyond” (*tamo,nudaṃ pāragataṃ mahesiṃ*) [§16a].

(A) The “darkness” (*tama* or *tamo*) is a mental darkness, the blindness of those with eyes but who see not: it is ignorance (*avijjā*), especially of true reality.¹⁰ The “eye” here is another word for the mind: the “mind’s eye,” if you like. The Buddha has dispelled this darkness with his awakening. Hence, he has “gone beyond” (*pāragata*) this darkness, crossed over the waters of craving and ignorance, and safely

⁵ Here, we must take *abhiññeyyaṃ abhiññātāṃ* as tt, as the whole verse refers to the 4 truths. However, the sequence here is 1-4-2-3, which seems unique to this verse, a poetic licence. For the traditional truth sequence and other details, see **Dhamma,cakka Pavattana S** (S 56.11,5-8) + SD 1.1 (6.2). See Cousins’ useful n, 1997:274.

⁶ On *brāhmaṇa* not making position, see Tha:N lxii §50(a) n.

⁷ Here *buddho* can be either a noun (“the Buddha”) or a past participle (“awakened”), as in M 92,15 (SD 456.7a).

⁸ Lines cd here recur in **Brahmāyu S** (M 91,31/2:143), SD 63.8.

⁹ The 3 unwholesome roots (*akusala,mūla*) are greed, hate and delusion: (**Tika**) **Mūla S** (A 3.69), SD 18.2.

¹⁰ Comys: *tamo-k,khandho ... avijjā'nusayo* (a mass of darkness ... the latent tendency that is ignorance, ThaA 2:9,6 f at Tha 128d); *tamo-k,khandho'ti avijjā-k,khandho* (SA 1:191,22 on S 5.3/1:130,22*).

(*khema*) reached nirvana's shore. This is a "journey" imagery, followed immediately by another imagery of "the path," although this is not at once apparent [1.3.2.3]

(B) Let us now examine the last word: *mahesi*. It can be taken as *mah'esi* (*mahā*, "great" + *esi*, "seeker" or as *mahêsi* (*mahā*, "great" + *isi*, "seer"). Both apply to the Buddha. **The Mahā,niddesa** glosses *mah'esi* as the "great seeker,"¹¹ which characterizes the Bodhisattva (the Buddha-to-be) from the time of his seeing the 4 sights¹² to his attaining of buddhahood.

Hence, the Buddha is a "great seeker" (who "sees" the way out): his "greatness" (*mahatta* or *mahan-ta*) is that he is one who **seeks** (*esī = gavesī = pariyesī* by way of the full practice of moral virtue, mental concentration, wisdom, freedom, and the knowledge and vision of freedom. He wins these by dispersing his mass of inner darkness (*tama* or *tamo*), by breaking up mental perversion (*vipallāsa*), by extracting the dart that is craving, and so on. Finally, he is the great seeker of the solitude that is the state of peace (called nirvana).¹³

As one fully awakened, the Buddha teaches the Dharma, "seeking after our welfare" (*hit'esī*), out of compassion (*anukampaṃ upādāya*) for us, such as stated in **the Kin'ti Sutta** (M 103) and elsewhere.¹⁴ When we seek inner peace, especially through understanding the Dhamma through the suttas, and aspiring to attain streamwinning, we are also seekers (*esi*,¹⁵ *gavesī*,¹⁶ *pariyesī*¹⁷).

(C) "**The great seer**" (*mahêsi*) refers to the fully awakened one, the Buddha. The ancient Indian word *isi* (Skt *ṛṣī*) refers to a forest-dwelling seeker and meditator. This kind of spiritual renunciation is reflected in the word **paviveka**, or simply, *viveka*, both of which mean "solitude."

At the opening of **the Tuvaṭaka Sutta** (Sn 4.14), the Buddha is addressed as the "great seer" (*mahêsi*), and a question is asked about "the solitude and state of peace" (*vivekaṃ santi,padañ ca*, Sn 915b).

The canonical Commentary **Mahā Niddesa**, on the Tuvaṭaka Sutta (Sn 4.14), in the Aṭṭhaka Vagga, explains that there are 3 kinds of solitude (*tayo vivekā*), that is, bodily solitude (*kaya,viveka*), mental solitude (*citta,viveka*), and solitude from acquisitions (*upadhi,viveka*):¹⁸ which the commentator, Upasena, explains as follows:¹⁹

1.3.2.2 [Mahā Niddesa commentary:] [1.3.2.1(C)]

There are 3 kinds of solitude: bodily solitude, mental solitude, and solitude from acquisitions.

(1) What is **bodily solitude** (*kaya,viveka*)?

Here, a monk abides in solitude when he resorts to a solitary lodging, such as a forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a gorge, a mountain cave, a cemetery,

¹¹ Mahā,niddesa take *mah'esi* (not as the usual Skt *mahā ṛṣī*) but from the verb *esati*, "to seek."

¹² The 4 sights or signs (*nimitta*) are those of an old man, a sick man, a corpse and a renunciant: SD 1.11 (3.2). These are also called "divine messengers" (*deva,dūta*) since it is said they were actually devas appearing in those roles to inspire the Bodhisattva into renouncing the world, and to remind us of the true reality of life: **Sukhumāla S** (A 3.38), SD 5.16 (19.4.2). The 1st 3 sights represent the "3 great bads" or 3 D's: decay, disease, death (inspiring "urgency," *saṃvega*), while the 4th is the way out; hence, it inspires radiant faith (*pasāda*).

¹³ Nm 2:343,8-28.

¹⁴ M 103,2/2:238,14 (SD 85.14); S 43.1/4:359,18.

¹⁵ On the "faithful seeker of the household life" (*saddhassa gharaṃ esino*): S 1:215,3* = A 4:285,11*.

¹⁶ On seeking the self (*attānaṃ gaveseyyātha*), see **Bhadda,vaggiya Sahāyaka Vatthu** (Mv 1.4.3), SD 48.3.

¹⁷ On the 2 kinds of quest, the ignoble and the noble, see **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 28), SD 1.11.

¹⁸ "Acquisition(s)," *upadhi*, the "things" that we have or want that *define* us; hence, to which our craving is directed. *Upādi* refers to what we are (the 5 aggregates). When the two terms refer to the aggregates, *upadhi* objectifies them, while *upādi* subjectifies them. On *upadhi* or *upādi*?, see SD 53.5 (4.2.3.2); SD 54.3b (2.2.3.1).

¹⁹ On the 3 kinds of solitude, see **Viveka,nissita**, SD 20.4 (4.2), where the sutta explanation is given.

a remote forest, the open air, or a heap of straw, abiding in physical solitude.

He goes alone, stands alone, sits alone, makes his bed alone,
enters the village for almsround alone, returns alone, seats himself in a hidden place alone,
does his pacing up and down (for exercise or meditation) alone,
and he wanders, dwells, moves about, departs himself, proceeds,
protects himself, sustains himself, maintains himself, alone.

This is bodily solitude.

(2) What is **mental solitude** (*citta, viveka*)?

It is the mind [the heart]

that, secluded from the hindrances, has attained

the 1st dhyana;

that, secluded from initial application and sustained application

the 2nd dhyana.

has attained

the 3rd dhyana;

that, secluded from zest, has attained

the 4th dhyana;

that, secluded from happiness and sorrow, has attained

that, secluded from the perception of form, from the perception

of sense-contact, from the perception of diversity, has attained

the base of boundless space;

that, secluded from the base of boundless space, has attained

the base of boundless

consciousness;

that, secluded from the base of boundless consciousness, has attained

the base of nothingness;

that, secluded from the base of nothingness, has attained

the base of neither-perception-

nor-non-perception;

of the streamwinner,

secluded from *self-identity view, doubt, and attachment to rituals and vows*, from the latent tendency towards them, and from the defilements associated with them;

of the once-returner,

secluded from the *gross* form of the fetter of lust for sense-desire, the *gross* form of the fetter of ill will, from the latent tendency towards them, and from the defilements associated with them;

of the non-returner,

secluded from the *refined* form of fetter of lust for sense-desire, the *refined* form of the fetter of sense-impingement, from the latent tendency towards them, and from the defilements associated with them;

of the arhat,

secluded from *lust for form existence*, from *lust for formless existence*, from *conceit*, from *restlessness*, from *ignorance*, from the latent tendency of conceit, from the latent tendency of becoming, the latent tendency of ignorance, from the defilements associated with them, and from all external signs.

This is mental solitude.

(3) What is **the solitude from acquisitions** (*upadhi, viveka*)?

“Acquisitions” (*upadhi*) refers to the defilements (*kilesa*), the aggregates (*khandha*), and formations (*abhisankhāra*).²⁰ “The solitude from acquisitions” refers to the death-free, nirvana. It is the stilling of all formations, the relinquishing of all acquisitions, the destruction of lust, fading away, cessation, nirvana.

This is the solitude from acquisitions.

Physical solitude is for those with bodily aloofness (*vūpakaṭṭha, kāya*), who delight in renunciation.

Mental solitude is for those whose minds are completely pure, who have reached the highest purification.

²⁰ *Upadhīti cattāro upadhayo kāmūpadhi khandhūpadhi kilesūpadhi abhisankhārūpadhīti.* (SnA 44,24)

Solitude from acquisitions is for those individuals who are acquisition-free, who have attained the freedom from formations (*visāṅkhāra,gata*). (Nm 1:26 f = 2:341 f, slightly abridged)²¹

1.3.2.3 “(who is) fully attained” (*taṃ patti,pattam*) [§16b]

(A) We have noted that this phrase is based on a “path” imagery, and follows one just before this [1.3.2.1]. The word **patti,patta** (*patti*, attainment + *patta*, who has attained) means “one who has attained what is to be attained.” This is Pali idiom for one who has attained nirvana, the highest state.

The phrase is uncommon but is old: it appears in the phrase, “who here has attained the highest in his conduct” (*yo idha caraṇesu patti,patto*, Sn 536a) in **the Sabhiya Sutta** (Sn 3.6), which the Commentary explains as “one who has attained what should be attained ... is said to have attained arhathood” (*pattabbarṃ patto ... arahattam patti’ti vuttam hoti*, SnA 433).

(B) Another helpful phrase that throws some light here is **yoga-k,khemassa pattiya**, “(meditating for) the safety from the yokes” (Sn 425d) [1.3.2.5]. That this refers to the attaining of nirvana is clear from a related verse from **the Suppiya Tha**, where the elder Suppiya beautifully says:

<p><i>Ajaram jiram,mānena tappa,mānena nibbutim nimisam²² paramam santim yoga-k,khemam anuttaram</i></p>	<p>(Tha 32)²³</p>	<p>I shall exchange the decaying for non-decay, c the burning for the quenched-cool, for the peace supreme, for the unsurpassed <u>safety from the yoke</u>.</p>
---	------------------------------	--

Clearly, **yoga-k,khema** in the verse (as in Sn 425d) is reference to nirvana. This is further supported by the explanations in the commentaries. **The Sutta Nipāta Commentary**, in fact, glosses *yoga-k,khemassa pattiya* with: “the benefit of attaining nirvana is that of the safety from the 4 yokes” (*catuhi yogehi khemassa nibbānassa adhigam’attham*, SnA 386,23 f). **The Thera,gāthā Commentary** on Tha 69, 171 and 415 all explain *yoga-k,khema* as safety from the “4 yokes.”²⁴ [1.3.2.5]

1.3.2.4 “a master (of meditation)” (*vasimā*) [§16b]

(A) Having spoken of the Buddha in general terms of his awakened state, the verse now comes down to more specific qualities. Here, the Buddha is said to be a master of meditation (*jhāna*). The old and broader sense of **jhāna**—anglicized as “dhyana”—is “meditation,” that is, as a distinct yogic discipline in ancient Indian spirituality of seeking divinity and liberation within oneself.

A more specific sense of *jhāna* is that of the attaining of a suprasensual (beyond the physical senses, even the mind as we know it), to fully experience inner space (resulting from being free of the physical body) and mental radiance, that is, clarity and bliss. Simply, this refers to the calm, clarity and bliss of the body-free mind, which is the basis for the Buddha’s awakening, and its attendant qualities and powers.²⁵ Hence, the Buddha is said to be a **master of meditation** (*vasi, vasī* or *vasimā*). (ItA 150,1-4)

(B) On the practical level of the unawakened meditator, this **mastery of meditation** refers to the key mechanics of mental cultivations, known as **the fivefold mastery** (*pañca vasī*) of dhyana. Experienced

²¹ For other trs, see UA:M 667 n263; Sn:B 1024 f.

²² *Nimissam*, emended (Be *nimiyam*; Ce Ee *nimmissam*; Se *nirāmisam*), 1 sg fut of *nimināti*, “exchanges for.”

²³ For helpful word analyses, see Tha:N 128 n32.

²⁴ Tha 69 (ThaA 1:167,7 f); 171 (2:47,10 f); 415 (2:176,14 f). On *yoga-k,khema*, see SD 51.11 (2.2.2).

²⁵ On the various qualities of the Buddha, see SD 2.24 (1.2).

meditation teachers often advise the beginner, on attaining dhyana, or some significant level of mental stillness, to keep it up for a sustained period, and not to spend too much time discerning it.²⁶

This “stoking” of the dhyana is kept up until we gain mastery (*vasī, bhāva*) over them. In this connection, the Commentaries and later meditation literature speak of the **fivefold mastery** (*pañca vasi*):²⁷

- | | |
|---|--|
| (1) Mastering the advertence (<i>āvajjana, vasī</i>): | the ability to bring the mind into dhyana; |
| (2) Mastering the attainment (<i>sampājjana, vasī</i>): | entering dhyana quickly and whenever we wish to; |
| (3) Mastering the resolution (<i>adhiṭṭhāna, vasī</i>): | staying in dhyana for as long as determined; |
| (4) Mastering the emergence (<i>vuṭṭhāna, vasī</i>): | easily emerging from dhyana at the appointed time; |
| (5) Mastering the review (<i>paccavekkhāna, vasī</i>): | discerning dhyana-factors after emerging from it. |
- (Pm 1.459/1:99 f; Vism 4.131/154, 23.27/704, etc)²⁸

An older teaching on this meditation master can be found in **the *jhāna, vimokkha, samādhi, samapatti* sequence** [1.3.2.7F].

1.3.2.5 “influx-free” (*anāsava*) [§16b]

(A) In line 2 of **verse 16**, the Buddha is described as being “influx-free” (*anāsava* = *na*, “not, without” + *āsava*, “influx(es)”). The term **āsava** (Skt, *āśrava, āśrāva*, literally, “inflow, outflow”) comes from *ā-sav-ati* “flows towards” (that is, either “into” or “out” towards the observer). They flow into our mind as defilements (how we regard the world) through our physical senses and thoughts.

They “ooze out” as delusion from our mind. However, we see them—as pleasant, unpleasant or neutral—their effect may seem deceptively pleasurable, but the reality is that they bring pain in the end. They ooze out like pus or discharge from a sore.²⁹

Hence, *āsava* has been variously translated as “taints (“deadly taints,” PED), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence),” or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists **4 āsavā**: the influx of:

- | | |
|--|--------------------|
| (1) sense-desire, | <i>kām’āsava</i> |
| (2) existence (desire for eternal life or present becoming), | <i>bhav’āsava</i> |
| (3) views, | <i>diṭṭh’āsava</i> |
| (4) ignorance. | <i>avijjāsava</i> |

(D 16,2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937)

These 4 are also known as “floods” (*oghā*) and “**yokes**” (*yoga*).³⁰

The list of 3 influxes (omitting *the influx of views*, subsumed under “ignorance”) is probably older and is found more frequently in the suttas.³¹

²⁶ See eg Pa Auk Sayadaw 1999:18, 2003:55.

²⁷ Pm 1:96 f, 100; Vism 4.131 f/154, 6.24-30/124-125; ApA 108; Abhs:BRS 342; VismṬ:Be 1:312. See Gunaratana 1985:74-77; Pa-Auk 2003:55-58. Besides these fivefold mastery, the meditator should also cultivate to gradually extend the counterpart sign (*nimitta, vaḍḍhana*) until it fills the “whole universe” (that is, becomes boundless) and beyond.

²⁸ Further see SD 24.3 (2); SD 33.1a (2.1.3).

²⁹ For details and refs, see PED & DP, sv *āsava* (2). See also BDict.

³⁰ On the 4 yokes (*yoga*), see SD 30.3 (1.4.2 n).

³¹ D 33,1.10(20)/3:216; M 9/1:55, 113/3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63.

(B) The destruction of these āsavas is equivalent to arhathood. Hence, those who have destroyed the influxes of sense-desire, existence and ignorance are called *khīṇ'āsava*—a technical form of *anāsava*—which is a common synonym for the arhat, like the Buddha.³²

The term *anāsava*, “influx-free”—descriptive of an arhat (*arahata*)—is very significant here. The Buddha, since he has destroyed all his influxes, is an “arhat.” Others who have done the same—whether monastic or lay—are also arhats, just like the Buddha. Hence, declares the Buddha in **the Sambuddha Sutta** (S 22.58), there is *no* difference, in terms of awakening, between the Buddha and the arhats, except that **the Buddha** arises first as the discoverer of the path who then shows it to others. **The arhats** are those who “follow that path, accomplishing it afterwards (after the Buddha)” (*maggānugā ... pacchā, samannāgatā*).³³

Some later Buddhists, influenced by outside teachings, rejected this key teaching to declare the arhats and other saints of the path were “unawakened,” and even thought that the Buddha himself did not “really” fully awaken. Hence, they rejected the noble eightfold path, and formed their own theologies that were foreign to early Buddhism.

1.3.2.6 “has crossed over disharmony” (*visan,taram*) [§16c]

(A) The Commentary explains this phrase *visantaram* in 2 ways (following the Burmese Commentary, which has a better reading):³⁴

1. one who “has crossed over disharmony” (*visan,taram*) on account of having vomited out (*vantattā*) disharmony of the bodily deeds and so on;

2. “one who has crossed over the poisons” (*vis'antaram*) on account of causing others to cross over all the stains of defilements, reckoned to be poison (*visa*), or the poison that is all the fears of the suffering of the samsaric cycle. (ItA:Be 24:144)

(B) *Visantara*—which can be read in at least 2 ways [A], is an example of wordplay (*silesa*; Skt *śleṣa*), well known in ancient Indian literature, including the Buddha texts. *Silesa* (Skt *śleṣa*, from √ŚLIṢ, to clasp) means “junction, embrace; a rhetoric figure, riddle, puzzle, pun.” The Jātaka Commentary on **the Kuṇāla Jātaka** (J 536), alluding to unfaithful women, explains *silesūpamā* in verse 30 (J 5:445,25) as follows: “the figure of *silesa* means that it’s like a wordplay with which the hearts of mean are bound” (*silesūpamā'ti purisānaṃ citta,bandhanena silesa,sadisā*, J 5:447,3).

This is, of course, a mundane usage, but often, too, we see the Buddha’s teaching enriched by word-play. One of the best known examples is clearly that of **Dh 97**, where the “normal” or literal translation sounds bizarrely unbuddhist, but when rendered into idiomatic English, it has a profoundly meaningful, even humorous, effect on us:

³² *Khīṇ'āsava*: V 1:183,24; D 29/3:133,14, 33/1.10(20)/3:216; M 2,99.3 (SD 8.10); M 9,70/1:55 (SD 11.14); M 121,12/3:108 (SD 11.3); A 3.58,5/1:165 (SD 94.5), A 3.59,4/1:167 (SD 80.16), A 6.63,9/3:414 (SD 6.11); Dh 89; Sn 471. See DP 1:764.

³³ S 22.58,12/3:66 (SD 49.10).

³⁴ *Kaya,visam'ādikassa visamassa vantattā vā visa,saṅkhataṃ sabbam kilesa,malaṃ taritvā vā visam sakala,vaṭṭa,dukkhaṃ sayam taritvā taraṇato visan,taro. taṃ visan,taram* (ItA:Be 24:144). Cf Ee which closes with *vissantaro, taṃ vissantaram* (ItA 150,8).

Pali:	<i>Assaddho akataññū ca hatâvakāso vantāso</i>	<i>sandhi-c,chedo ca yo naro sa ve uttama,poriso.</i>	(Dh 97; cf 383) ³⁵
Buddhist Sanskrit:	<i>Aśraddhas cākṛtajñāś ca hatâvakāśo vāntāśaḥ</i>	<i>saṁdhi-c,chetā ca yo naraḥ sa vai tūttama,puruṣaḥ</i>	(Udana,varga 29.23) ³⁶

Negative literal sense

The man without faith,
who knows no gratitude,
who is a house-breaker,
who has destroyed his opportunity,
who is an eater of vomit—
he is indeed one of extreme audacity.

Positive Dharma sense

The man without desire,
who knows the unmade,
who has cut off the link,
who has got rid of the occasions (for quarrels and rebirth),
who is an eater of what is abandoned by others—
he is indeed the highest person.

It is also possible to render the verse in idiomatic English as follows:

<i>Assaddho akataññū ca sandhi-c,chedo ca yo naro hatâvakāso vantāso sa ve uttama,poriso.</i>	Not through faith, but knowing the unmade, the man who has cut off the link, destroyed the opening (for rebirth), given up desire— he is indeed a supreme person. (Dh 97; cf Dh 383) ³⁷
---	---

1.3.2.7 “(having) destroyed craving, free” (*taṇha-k,khaye vimuttam*) [§16c]

(A) The root of suffering is said to be **craving** (*taṇhā*): this is the 2nd noble truth, that of the arising of suffering. Suffering arises from craving, that is, a profound and pervasive sense of “lack,” *of not having any thing*, rooted in ignorance.³⁸ **Ignorance** (*avijjā*), the real deep root of craving itself, is the habitual seeing of all (*sabba*) that there is—what our 6 sense-bases present before us as being fixed and measurable “things”; hence, they must be collected and appropriated.³⁹

Hence, we run after **sense-pleasures and goodness (merits)**, because we do not understand that they are all mind-made and thus impermanent. We seek to perpetuate *youth, health and life itself*, not understanding or accepting that we are all subject to decay, disease and death. We even believe in and seek **eternal life**, as if a logical possibility or something worth having: we do not realize that “eternal life” would only mean eternal suffering! Out of desperation, we, then, seek to end it all—annihilationism—that we should not exist at all, as if this is possible: that there is some kind of self or soul that we can put an end to.⁴⁰

To be fully free (*vimutta* = *vi*, “apart, away” + *mutta*, “freed”) means one has dispelled ignorance and uprooted craving to become an arhat. Such an awakened being is free from suffering and is no more reborn: he is awakened. **Vimutti** (n) is the freedom from suffering and rebirth, that is, attaining nirvana itself.

³⁵ Cf *aśraddho* [...] *sa ve uttimaporuṣo* in **Patna Dharmapada** v333 in Cone (1989:191) or Roth (1980:127).

³⁶ For refs, see Biblio, under Udāna,varga. The Chinese version 無信 ... 是名為勇士 *wú xìn ... shì míng wéi yǒng shì* (T212/T4.750c4; T213/T4.793b16), has been tr Willemen (1978:132 [29.22]) as “he who is faithless [...] is called a valiant man”; and a Tibetan counterpart in *dad pa med cing* [...] *di ni skyes bu dam pa yin*, verse 29.23 in Beckh (1911:107) or Zongtse (1990:310). See Analayo 2010:18 n31.

³⁷ See **Dh 97 Religious language**, SD 10.6 esp (9).

³⁸ On ignorance and craving: SD 40a.8 (2.1.1.1).

³⁹ See **Sabba S** (S 35.23), SD 7.1.

⁴⁰ On the 3 kinds of craving—those for sense-pleasures, for eternal life, for self-annihilation—see SD 19.3 (2.2). On the 3 characteristics, ie, impermanence, suffering and non-self, see SD 1.2 (2); SD 18.2 (2.2); SD 26.8 (1.1.2).

(B) *Vimutti* as **freedom** (mental liberation) is also a synonym for the terms related to awakening: “cessation” (*nirodha*), “solitude” (*viveka*), “detachment” (*virāga*), and “relinquishment” (*vossagga*). Here, it depicts each stage of **the *viveka,nissita* series**, respectively, in terms of progressive freedom of the mind heading for awakening, by attaining the following freedoms:⁴¹

		mnemonic ⁴²
(1) freedom by suppression (of defilement),	<i>vikkhambhana vimutti</i>	<i>samatha</i> (calm)
(2) freedom by displacement,	<i>tad-aṅga vimutti</i>	<i>vipassana</i> (insight)
(3) freedom by cutting off,	<i>samuccheda vimutti</i>	<i>magga</i> (path)
(4) freedom by stilling,	<i>paṭipassaddhi vimutti</i>	<i>phala</i> (fruition)
(5) freedom by escape.	<i>nissaraṇa vimutti</i>	<i>nibbana</i> (nirvana)

(C) A better known sequence (perhaps, an older formula) depicting the progress of awakening is that of the “5 aggregates” (*pañca-k,khandha*), or more fully, **the “5 dharma aggregates”** (*pañca,dhamma-k,-khandha*), a listing based on the 3 trainings and beyond, found, for example, in **the Gāraṇa Sutta** (A 4.21), thus:

(1) the aggregate of moral virtue,	<i>sīla-k,khandha</i>
(2) the aggregate of concentration,	<i>samādhi-k,khandha</i>
(3) the aggregate of wisdom,	<i>pañña-k,khandha</i>
(4) the aggregate of freedom,	<i>vimutti-k,khandha</i>
(5) the aggregate of the knowledge and vision of freedom.	<i>vimutti,ñāṇa,dassana-k,khandha</i>

(A 4.21,2-8) + SD 12.3 (2)

In simple terms, the last aggregate, is also known simply (non-technically) as “review knowledge” (*pacca-vekkhaṇa,ñāṇa*), that is, when one, having attained the path or awakening, reviews that reality, and so ascertains it. In meditation, it refers to a “reviewing” of our own practice upon emerging from it.⁴³

(D) ***Vimokkha*** (or *vimokha*)—usually translated as “liberation”—is a synonym for *vimutti*, in the sense of arhathood.⁴⁴ *Vimokkha*, however, has a broader meaning in terms of **meditation**, which includes the sense of mental liberation⁴⁵ that may be temporary (*samaya vimokkha*) or permanent (*asamaya vimokkha*).⁴⁶ In deep **dhyana**, there are the 3 kinds of liberation—the empty (*suññata vimokkha*), the signless (*animitta vimokkha*) and the undirected (*appaṇihita vimokkha*),⁴⁷ mentioned in **the Dutiya Kāmabhū Sutta** (S 41.6,20).⁴⁸

⁴¹ SD 13.1 (4.2.3.3) the 5 kinds of abandoning; SD 54.5 (1.1.4.2 n).

⁴² “Mnemonic” here simply refers to the basic process that works on that level. In the first 2 stages, however, *samatha* and *vipassana* actually work together; one taking the active role, the other the passive (helping role).

⁴³ **Anāpāna,sati S** (M 118,21) n, SD 7.13; **Bhāvanā**, SD 15.1 (8.6), Fine-tuning dhyana.

⁴⁴ D 2:70, 111. Used in ref to meditative or spiritual states: D 3:34, 35, 230, 288; M 2:53, 123, 3:121, 4:33; A 2:87, 4:316, 5:11.

⁴⁵ Eg, *vimokkho cetaso* (S 6.15/1:159,6*); *cittassa vimokkha* (V 5:164,34).

⁴⁶ **Mahā Sārōpama S** (M 29,6/1:196), SD 53.8. Comy qu **Pm 2:40** for a def of *asamaya,vimokkha* (non-temporart, ie, permanent, liberation) as the 4 paths, 4 fruits and nirvana, and of *samaya,vimokkha* (temporary liberation) as the 4 dhyanas and 4 formless attainments. See also **Mahā Suññata S** (M 122,4.2/3”110 f), SD 11.4.

⁴⁷ In terms of attaining **arhathood**, one who overcomes *lust* by contemplating on suffering, develops undirected freedom; who overcomes *hate* by contemplating impermanence, develops signless freedom; and who overcomes *delusion* by contemplating non-self develops empty freedom: **Mūla,pariyāya S** (M 1,75-146) + SD 11.8 (4.3.3.3-5).

⁴⁸ S 46.6,20/495 (SD 48.7), stated as *phassa* instead of *vimokkha*; cf Tha 92cd; Dh 92cd, 93cd. Otherwise, the 3 liberations appear mostly in later texts: Pm 2:35; Vism 658.

(E) The best known use for *vimokkha* is in reference to **the 8 liberations** (*aṭṭha vimokkha*): those of form, the formless, the beautiful, the base of infinite space, the base of infinite consciousness, the base of nothingness, the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, and the cessation of perception and feeling.⁴⁹

(F) There is a little-known phrase found in **the Vinaya, the (Chakka) Sīha,nādā Sutta** (A 6.64) and **the (Dasaka) Sīha,nādā Sutta** (A 10.21), and explained in **the Vibhaṅga**. The Buddha is said to understand “according to reality, the corruption of, the purification of, emergence from dhyana, freedom, concentration and attainment” (*tathāgato jhāna,vimokkha,samādhi,samāpattinam saṅkilesam vodānam vuṭṭhānam yathā,bhūtaṃ pajānāti*)—**the “jhāna,vimokkha sequence,”** for short.⁵⁰ This is a statement on the final knowledge, a complete understanding and mastery [1.3.2.4] of meditation. This complex compound also gives us a good idea of the position and role of *vimokkha* in early Buddhist meditation.

“**Corruption**” (*saṅkilesa*) is what brings about the deterioration of these states.

“**Purification**” (*vodana*) is what makes for their distinction.

“**Emergence**” (*vuṭṭhāna*), says the *Vibhaṅga*, refers both to the process of purification (emerging from the corrupted state) as well as emerging from this or that state (Vbh §828/342 f).⁵¹

Otherwise, “purification” refers to one’s proficiency in a lower dhyana or stage that is the basis for the next higher dhyana or stage. The various components of the *jhāna,vimokkha* sequence are mentioned in the following places:

The 4 dhyanas (<i>jhāna</i>) ⁵²	Sāmañña,phala Sutta (D 2,76-84/1:73-76)	SD 8.10
The 8 liberations (<i>vimokkha</i>) [E]	(Aṭṭhala) Vimokkha Sutta (A 8.66/4:306)	SD 95.11
The 3 kinds of concentration (<i>samādhi</i>) ⁵³	Saṅkhitta Dhamma Sutta (A 8.63/4:299-302)	SD 46.6
The 9 attainments (<i>samāpatti</i>) = the 9 progressive abodes (<i>anupubba,vihāra</i>) ⁵⁴	(Navaka) Vihāra Sutta (A 9.32/4:420)	SD 95.1

1.3.2.8 “the sage” (*muni*) [§16d]

The Buddha is called the “**sage**” (*muni*), or the “silent sage,” one who has gained true sagehood (*moneyya*),⁵⁵ that is, the silence of body, speech and mind. In simple terms, this sagehood is the path itself: streamwinning, and so on. As a true sage, Gotama is the fully self-awakened (ItA 150,10-17).⁵⁶ Since he comes from the Sakya clan of Kapilavatthu, he is famously known as **Sakya,muni**, the Sakya sage.⁵⁷

⁴⁹ Respectively: *rupī, arūpī,saññī, subha, ākāsañāc’āyatana, viññāṇ’ānañc’āyatana, ākiñcaññ’āyatana, n’eva, -saññā,nāsaññ’āyatana, saññā,vedayita, nirodha*. D 3:262; A 1:40, 4:306; Vbh 362; explained in detail at Pm 2:38-40. Cf BHS *aṣṭau vimokṣāḥ*, eg Avś 2.69, 153. They are defined at SD 5.17 (10); SD 49.5b (3).

⁵⁰ V 1:97, 104, 3:91, 4:25; A 6.64/3:417 f, 419, 10.21/5:34, 10.22/5:38; Vbh 342.

⁵¹ For tr, see Vbh:T 448-450.

⁵² See **Dhyana**, SD 8.4.

⁵³ The 3 kinds are: (1) concentration accompanied by initial application and by sustained application (*sa,vitakka sa,vicāra samādhi*) = 1st dhyana; (2) concentration without initial application (*avitakka vicāra,matto samādhi*) = 2nd dhyana, (3) sustained application only; concentration with neither (*avitakka avicāra samādhi*) = 3rd+4th dhyana (or the last 3 dhyanas in the 5-dhyana system). (Vbh 343,7-9)

⁵⁴ **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,34.2-42), SD 1.11; **Jhānābhīññā S** (S 16.9), SD 50.7 (1.2.1.2); **(Navaka) Jhāna S** (A 9.36), SD 33.8; SD 33.8 (2); SD 1.8 (2.2.3) (3)n.

⁵⁵ See SD 44.1 (1.4.1).

⁵⁶ On the silent sage (*muni*), see **Muni S** (Sn 1.12), SD 49.20; SD 40a.1 (1.3.1).

⁵⁷ See eg **Ratana S** (Khp 4b/6,4* = Sn 225b/39*), SD 101.2; **Chatta Māṇava Vimāna,vatthu** (Vv 881b/53,1/80*), SD 101.3; **Nandaka Peta,vatthu** (Pv 698/38,42/82*), SD 101.4; Ap 1:41*, 42*; Nc:Be 207*; V 1:310*, 5:86*.

In the same verse-line, the sage is said to be “**bearing his last body**” (*antima,deha,dhārim*) [1.3.2.9]. “Sage” is a synonym for arhat, the one “whose influxes are destroyed” (*khīṇ’āsava*): he, too, is said to be “bearing his last body”: he will no more be reborn.

The **Araham Sutta** (S vv 61, 67) speaks of the sagely quality of the arhat, thus:

<p><i>Yo hoti bhikkhu araham katāvī khīṇāsavo antima,deha,dhārā aham vadāmī ti pi so vadeyya mamaṃ vadantī ti pi so vadeyya loke samaññaṃ kusalo viditvā vohāra,mattena so vohareyyāti</i></p>	<p>Whichever monk is an arhat, consummate, one with influxes destroyed, <u>who bears his final body</u>, might say, “I speak,” or he might say “They speak to me,”— skilful, knowing worldly conventions, he uses them only as mere expressions.</p>
---	--

(S 1.5/1:14)

1.3.2.9 “bearing his last body” (*antima,deha,dhārim*) [§16d]

This adjectival phrase **antima,deha,dhāra** (stem form) is resolved as follows: *antima*, “last” + *deha*, “body” + *dhāra*, “bearer.” It refers to a specific quality of the Buddha and the arhats: they are all “bearing the last body” (*antima,deha,dhāra*) since they will no more be reborn,⁵⁸ on account of the non-fruiting of past karma and non-arising of new ones. Hence, it is also possible to translate the phrase as “one bearing the last person,” since those reborn in the planes beyond the sense-world have subtle form or are formless.

We have already noted in the translation [§16d n] that this phrase recurs twice in the Iti,vuttaka itself: in **the Sikkhānisaṃsa Sutta** (It 46) and **the Brāhmaṇa,dhamma,yāga Sutta** (It 100).⁵⁹ It also occurs in **the Sesavatī Vimāna,vatthu** (Vv 35.12b/34,4).

1.3.2.10 “who has abandoned Māra” (*mārañ jaham*) [§16d]

The Buddha is one “who has abandoned Māra” since he has rightly and fully given up Māra, the personification of defilements and so on (*kilesa,mār’ādinam*, ItA 150,20). This is an allusion to the 5 kinds of Māra (*pañca māra*), the embodiment of all that prevents our self-awakening.⁶⁰

		Māra as:
(1) Māra as defilements	<i>kilesa,māra</i>	psychological unwholesomeness
(2) Māra as the 5 aggregates	<i>khandha,māra</i>	existential being
(3) Māra as karma-formations	<i>abhisankhāra,māra</i>	karmic constructions
(4) the deity Māra	<i>deva,putta māra</i>	a mythical being (narrative lesson)
(5) Māra as death personified	<i>maccu,māra</i>	personification of death (impermanence)

1.3.2.11 “gone beyond decay” (*jarāya pārāgum*) [§16d]

(A) While the previous phrases and epithets refer to the Buddha’s attaining of nirvana “with remains” (*sa,upādi,sesa nibbāna*),⁶¹ this last phrase of verse—**jarāya pārāgum** [§16]—refers to the Buddha’s attaining of final nirvana, the one “without remains” (*anupādi,sesa nibbāna*). He has “gone across (crossed over)” (*pāra-gū*) the floods of sense-desire, existence, views and ignorance [1.3.2.5A] and landed on

⁵⁸ ItA 1:150,18 f, 2:143,10 f; ThĀ 134, NmA 1:91,16 f. *Antima,deha,dhārī* occurs at M 3:70,22*; S 1:14,11*+18*+21* 53,8*; Sn 471; It 32,18*, 40,18*; J 1:183,23*

⁵⁹ Respectively, It 46/2.2.9/40,18 f & 100/4.1/101,15. Qu at Miln 215,11.

⁶⁰ See SD 19.17 (3.2); **Māra** SD 61.8.

⁶¹ See SD 45.18 (2.5.2.2).

nirvana’s safe shores. Here, *jarā*, “decay” is a synecdoche for “decay, disease, death” (the 3 D’s of life), or in a word, “suffering” (*dukkha*).

The 3 D’s are the passive aspects of suffering: they *happen* to us for the simple reason that we exist. Then, there are our 3 feelings—liking, disliking and neutral feeling—arising from our reactions, respectively, to what we perceive as pleasant, unpleasant and neither. This reactivity is rooted, respectively, in **greed, hate and delusion** (the 3 unwholesome roots of action): these are the active aspects of our suffering: our deliberate actions, karma, which, having arisen, feed our **latent tendencies** of lust, repulsion and ignorance.⁶²

Since these passive and active roots of suffering burn in us like fuel (*upādāna*), we need to completely douse them. When these powerful flames are “blown out,” we are “cooled”—both senses are found in the Pali word, *nibbuti*, the adjective for *nibbāna* (nirvana), “the cool.”⁶³ In this “cool” or “fire-free” state, we are free from the 3 D’s: there is no decay, disease or death.

(B) This “cool, fire-free” state or nirvana characterizes the Buddha and the arhats: they are the really “**cool**” saints—free from the fires of greed, hate and delusion, and all latent tendencies [A]. However, “decay, disease, death”—being the natural characteristics of our “**aggregate**” existence—comprising form, feeling, perception, formations and consciousness (the 5 aggregates, *pañca-khandha*)—are still subject to them.

Even buddhas and arhats, too, die: their death is the final evidence for the true reality of **impermanence**. The suttas describe the state of the living Buddha and arhats as being that of their enjoying nirvana “**with substrates remaining**” (*sa, upādi, sesa nibbāna, dhatu*):⁶⁴ the “substrates” (*upādi*) are the 5 aggregates. Very simply, this is their “body-mind” that are the remnants of the past good karma. They do not create any new karma, since they are free from ignorance and craving.

Upon “dying”—when their karmic body ceases to function—they are no more reborn like the unawakened. They “dissolve” (to us a convenient word) into what the suttas call “**the nirvana-element without substrates remaining**” (*anupādi, sesa nibbāna, dhatu*), or, simply, the “final” nirvana.⁶⁵ The Commentaries simplify these 2 terms, respectively, as the “**nirvana of the defilements**” (*kilesa, nibbana*) and the “**nirvana of the aggregates**” (*khandha, nibbana*).⁶⁶

In the **(Iti) Vuttaka Sutta** (It 38), *jarā*, “decay,” has a broad sense, encompassing all of life itself. After all, from the very moment we are born, we begin to decay, and it only gathers moment—we even fall sick—and in the end, we must die. However, with awakening, the Buddha and the arhats have “gone beyond decay.”

1.3.3 Verse 3 (§17)

1.3.3.1 The (Iti) Vitakka Sutta closes with a familiar sestet. Apparently, this 6-line verse is spoken by the Buddha is recorded only here, as if in response to a better-known counterpart spoken by Brahmā Sahampati when he entreats the Buddha to teach, an event recounted in the Vinaya and suttas.⁶⁷ The

⁶² On latent tendencies. See *Anusaya*, SD 31.3.

⁶³ SD 50.13 (1.3.1.2).

⁶⁴ The term *nirupādi, sesa nibbana(dhatu)* is sometimes used here, but it is non-canonical, found only in later literature.

⁶⁵ The 2 kinds of nirvana-elements are mentioned in **Sa, upādi, sesa Sutta** (A 9.12/4:378-382), SD 3.3(3), details; **Nibbāna, dhatu S** (It 44/2.2.7/38 f), SD 50.13; SD 45.18 (2.5).

⁶⁶ Only *kilesa, nibbāna* mentioned: DA 3:830,1; MA 2:117,7 *nikkilesa*; SA 1:275,17; AA 2:226,18 *kilesa, parinibbāna*, 4:207,7; UA 192,10; SnA 2:399,28; ThaA 3:193,25. Both *kilesa- + khandha-nibbāna*: UA 407,16 f. See SD 45.18 (2.5.2.4).

⁶⁷ See **Āyācana S** (S 6.1), SD 12.2: see foll n.

two verses are, in fact, almost identical: the only difference is that the (Iti) Vuttaka Sutta verse [§17] is spoken by the Buddha, while the other, more familiar, verse by Brahmā Sahampati.

Here are the 2 verses for a comparative study:

Ariya Pariyesanā Sutta (M 26,20.6) and elsewhere.⁶⁸ Spoken by Brahmā Sahampati:

<i>Sele yathā pabbata,muddhani-ṭ,ṭhito</i>	Just as one, standing on a mountain peak,	
<i>yathā'pi passe janataṃ samantato </i>	may see the people all around (below),	
<i>tathūpamaṃ dhamma,mayaṃ sumedha</i>	even so, O wise one , all-seeing eye,	<i>d</i>
<i>pāsādam āruyha samanta,cakkhu </i>	having ascended to the Dharma-made palace!	<i>c</i>
<i>sokāvatiṇṇaṃ janatam apeta,soko</i>	rid of sorrow, may he regard mankind,	<i>f</i>
<i>avekkhassu⁶⁹ jāti,jarā'bhibhūtaṃ </i>	sunk in sorrow, overcome by birth and decay!	<i>e</i>

(Iti) Vitakka Sutta (It 38,17). Spoken by the Buddha:

<i>Sele yathā pabbata,muddhani-ṭ,ṭhito</i>	Just as one, standing on a mountain peak,	
<i>yathā'pi passe janataṃ samantato </i>	may see the people all around (below),	
<i>tathūpamaṃ dhamma,mayaṃ sumedho</i>	even so, one truly wise , the all-seeing eye,	<i>d</i>
<i>pāsādam āruyha samanta,cakkhu </i>	having ascended the Dharma-made palace:	<i>c</i>
<i>sokāvatiṇṇaṃ janatam apeta,soko</i>	rid of sorrow, regards mankind, sunk in sorrow,	<i>f</i>
<i>avekkhati jāti,jarā'bhibhūtaṃ'ti. </i>	overcome by birth and decay.	

1.3.3.2 The differences between the two verses are as follows.

First, in line c the Buddha says **sumedho** (adjective, 2nd person singular) [§17c] but Brahmā says **sumedha** (2nd person vocative, M 26,20.6c). Brahmā is addressing the Buddha, who, in effect, replies him in the (Iti) Vitakka Sutta verse.

In line §17f of the (Iti) Vitakka Sutta, the verb **avekkhati** (present 3 singular) the Buddha speaks in the 3rd person (addressing himself). In the Ariya Pariyesanā Sutta, Brahmā addresses the Buddha in the imperative mode, inviting the Buddha to teach.

Hence, we can notice, at least in form, that **the Ariya Pariyesanā Sutta** verse is Brahma's invitation, and **the (Iti) Vitakka** verse is the Buddha's reply. It is, as if, the Buddha is addressing Brahmā (indirectly): "Here you are, I have taught the Dharma, as you have requested."

2 Sutta teachings

2.1 TATHĀGATA

2.1.1 The 8 etymologies

Tathagata [§2 etc] is often used by the Buddha to address himself. The Commentaries give 8 qualities or etymologies of *tathagata*: he is:⁷⁰

⁶⁸ M 26,20.6/1:169,32* (SD 1.11) = Mahā'padāna S (D 14,3.9/2:39,13*), SD 49.8 = S 6.1/1:137,28* (SD 12.2) = Nm 360,8* = V 1:5,35*.

⁶⁹ *Avekkhassu*, "may he consider," imper 2 sg med (Sn 1119 = Ap 488,5; V 1:61* = D 2:39,14* = M 1:168,34* = S 1:137,36*); see DP: avekkhati.

⁷⁰ ItA 117,19-121,11 :: tr ItA:M 1:290-357 (cf 291 n2); these 8 etyms (Buddhadatta) recur at BA 15,11-18,4. Buddhaghosa gives the same 8 etyms: DA 1:59,31-68,13 (cf Bodhi 1978:50-53, 331-344); MA 1:45,9-52,10 (cf Bodhi 1980:80 f); AA 1:103,10-112,12; KhpA 195,29-196,9 (KhpA:Ñ 217 f); UA 128,4-155,28 (UA:M 1:298-340); cf PvA 64,-

- | | |
|---|--|
| (1) <i>tathā āgato</i> , | “one thus come” (who arises when the time is right); |
| (2) <i>tathā gato</i> | “one thus gone” (who passes away without rebirth, upon attaining final nirvana); |
| (3) <i>tatha,lakkhaṇaṃ āgato</i> | who has understood the characteristics of reality; |
| (4) <i>tathā,dhamme yāthāvato abhisambuddho</i> | awakened to the truths of reality; |
| (5) <i>tathā,dassitāya</i> | who sees true reality; |
| (6) <i>tathā,vāditāya</i> | who speaks of true reality; |
| (7) <i>tathā kāritāya</i> | a doer of his word; |
| (8) <i>abhibhavan’atṭhena</i> | he is the overcomer. |

2.1.2 Dhammapāla’s 8 etymologies

Dhammapāla, at the start of his commentary on the (Iti) Vitakka Sutta (It 38), gives a lengthy dissertation on the 8 qualities (common) (ItA 117,19-121,11). Then, he adds 8 more qualities of *tathagata* (with his own elaborate explanations) of *tathāgata* (ItA 121,12-139,20); closing with an explanation of *sammā,sambuddha*. Dhamma,pāla’s **additional 8 etymologies on *tathagata*** are summarized as follows:⁷¹

- | | |
|--------------------------------|---|
| (9) <i>tathāya āgato</i> | in <u>accordant</u> (<i>tathā</i>) with his vows, he has <u>come</u> (<i>āgato</i>), fulfilling them; ⁷² |
| (10) <i>tathāya gato</i> | he <u>accordingly</u> show great compassion, fulfilling his tasks and is <u>gone</u> ; ⁷³ |
| (11) <i>tathāni āgato</i> | he <u>arrives</u> (<i>āgato</i>) at those things that are <u>truly real</u> (<i>tathāni</i>); ⁷⁴ |
| (12) <i>tathā gato</i> | he <u>goes</u> (<i>gato</i>) to <u>those</u> right and ready (<i>tathā</i>) for the Dharma and path; ⁷⁵ |
| (13) <i>tathā vidho</i> | he is the <u>kind</u> (<i>vidho</i>) who is <u>truly real</u> (<i>tathā</i>) (like the past buddhas); ⁷⁶ |
| (14) <i>tathā pavattiko</i> | he <u>proceeds</u> (<i>pavattiko</i>) thus <u>rightly</u> (<i>tathā</i>) in person and virtue; ⁷⁷ |
| (15) <i>tathehi agato</i> | he <u>goes not</u> (<i>agato</i>) with <u>such</u> (<i>tathehi</i>) (no bad qualities, rebirth etc); ⁷⁸ |
| (16) <i>tathā gatā bhāvena</i> | he is <u>so</u> (<i>tathā</i>) through <u>being</u> (<i>bhāvena</i>) having <u>thus gone</u> (<i>gatā</i>) to the Dharma, the truth and the teaching. ⁷⁹ |

2.1.3 Polysemy and plasticity

To us today, conditioned by various modern languages—to whom Pali is not our first language, and perhaps also that our mother-tongue is not one of the Indian languages—many of these derivations and etymologies of *tathagata* (and other such explanations) may read or sound “fanciful,” even bizarre. Language is an ethnic and cultural experience. We may not see such an exercise as being “disciplined” or “scientific” as, say, the way we compile dictionaries to define or debate the vocabulary and usages of our languages.

Much of the explanations of terms like *tathagata*, *arahata*, *bhikkhu* and so on are rooted in the Pali (and Indian) literary tradition of **polysemy**. The effect of the commentarial glosses and explanations of words and ideas attempt to show us, even playfully (what we imagine as being “fanciful”), the plasticity

1-16 (PvA:BM 67) etym only. SA 2:287,25-32, only cites the 8 reasons, then refers to DA. On *tathagata*, see SD 15.7 (2, esp 2.4).

⁷¹ ItA 121,18-139,20.

⁷² ItA 121,18-122,25.

⁷³ ItA 122,26-123,18.

⁷⁴ ItA 123,19-132,31.

⁷⁵ ItA 132,32-135,25.

⁷⁶ ItA 135,26-136,14.

⁷⁷ ItA 136,15-21

⁷⁸ ItA 136,22-136,32.

⁷⁹ ItA 136,32-139,20 with verses from UA 154 f.

of language, that we should not be bound by letters, words and ideas. They are mere tools for us to make visible, audible and sensible the nature of awakening, at least its joy and depth.⁸⁰

Ultimately, we should be able to see for ourselves that such words are more than mere marks or symbols in sound and writing. They point to the facility of language to free itself from the time and space that defined them, to reach our times and ears so that we can see them the way that the ancient teachers, arhats and the Buddha himself saw them, and wish to convey to us. This is a handy tool for nothing less than conveying the message of awakening down through the ages for our personal benefit and awakening.

2.2 The Buddha's exhortation

2.2.1 The twin practice

2.2.1.1 The (Iti) Vitakka Sutta's key teaching for our practice is found in the section subtitled, "**The Buddha's exhortation**" [§§8-13]. Basically, the Buddha exhorts us to cultivate **the positive emotions** [§10] —better known as "the divine abodes" (*brahma, vihāra*).⁸¹ Our twin practices are as follows:

- for our immediate **safety**, we should cultivate lovingkindness and compassion towards others [§§-10];
- for our **spiritual solitude** (personal development), we radiate gladness and equanimity: [§13]
 - (1) we identify what are (habitually) unwholesome within us (the 1st noble truth);
 - (2) we reflect on what is at the root or the condition(s) for such unwholesomeness (2nd noble truth);
 - (3) we work to abandon these unwholesome states at their root (how we think and feel) (3rd noble truth).⁸²

2.2.1.2 The Sutta closes with 3 verses of uplift (*udāna*), which essentially highlight the Buddha's compassion as a competent and concerned spiritual teacher. What is beautifully stated in 3 verses can be summarized in the Buddha's famous **exhortation as a teacher** or the *jhāyatha* pericope:

Bhikshus,⁸³ whatever a teacher should do out of compassion for the good of disciples, for the sake of their welfare, this has been done to you by me.

These, bhikshus, are the foot of trees; these are empty houses.⁸⁴ Meditate,⁸⁵ bhikshus! Be not heedless! Regret not later! This is our instruction to you."⁸⁶

⁸⁰ On Pali polysemy, see SD 1.1 (4.4.5); SD 10.16 (1.3.1-1.3.2; 2.2); SD 54.3b (2.1.1.4).

⁸¹ See *Brahma, vihāra*, SD 38.5.

⁸² This 3rd noble truth, following the old "teaching" model of the truths, is that of the path: **Mahā Saḷ-āyatanika S** (M 149,11 etc) + SD 41.9 (2.4); SD 53.26 (2).

⁸³ "Bhikshus" (*bhikkhave* etc) refers to meditators or those present: SD 4.9 (5.3); SD 13.1 (3.1.1); addresses all meditators who attain the bhikkhu-state: **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10,3A) n, SD 13.3; SD 13.1 (3.1.1.5); SD 16.7 (1.1.1.2).

⁸⁴ Sometimes rendered as "empty place".

⁸⁵ "Meditate!" *jhāyatha*, lit "cultivate *jhāna*" (M 1:46, 118; S 4:133, 4:359, 361, 362, 368, 373; A 3:87, 89, 4:139, 392). Syn *bhāvētha* (2nd pl), "cultivate!" On the refs, see foll n.

⁸⁶ The *jhāyatha* pericope: *Etāni bhikkhave rukkha, mūlāni, etāni suññ'āgārāni. Jhāyatha bhikkhave mā pamādattha, mā pacchā vippaṭṭisārino ahuvattha. Ayaṃ vo amhākaṃ anusāsanīti. Sallekha S* (M 8,18/1:46), SD 51.8; **Dvedhā, vitakka S** (M 19,27/1:118), SD 61.1; **Āneñja, sappāya S** (M 106,15/2:266 f), SD 85.13; **Indriya, bhāvanā S** (M 152,18/3:302), SD 17.13; **(Nava Purāṇa) Kamma S** (S 35.146/4:133), SD 4.12; **Kāya S** (S 43.1/4:359), SD 12.21; & all suttas in the same **Asaṅkhata Saṃyutta** (S 43.2-44/4:360-373); **Bhikkhuṇ'upassaya S** (S 47.10/5:157), **Dhamma, vihārī S 1** (A 5.73/3:87), SD 69.2; **Dhamma, vihārī S 2** (A 5.74/3:89), SD 69.3; **Araka S** (A 7.70,4/4:139), SD 16.17; cf **Mahā Palobhana J** (J 507). The sentence "regret not later" (*mā pacchā vippaṭṭisārino ahuvattha*), in the 2nd para, also occurs at **Mahā, parinibbāna S** (D 16,5.19+20/2:147, 16,6.5/2:155 ×3, the Buddha's last words) = **Kusinārā S** (A

2.2.2 The 90 sufferings of the world

2.2.2.1 To highlight **the Buddha's compassion**, the Sutta commentator, Dhammapāla quotes ch 71 of **the Paṭisambhidā, magga** passage on the Buddha's "knowledge of the attainment of great compassion" (*tathāgatassa mahā, karuṇā, samāpattiyā ñāṇa*), a list of some 90 conditions of the world that are the reasons for the Buddha's active compassion.⁸⁷

This long list of worldly conditions is quoted both in the Sutta's commentary on **the (Iti) Vitakka Sutta** (It 38; ItA 143-145) and the Udāna Commentary on **the Suppavāsā Sutta** (U 2.8; UA 142-144). Both these works were compiled by Dhammapāla.⁸⁸

2.2.2.2 According to **the Paṭisambhidā, magga** (quoted by Dhammapāla in his commentaries on the Iti, vuttaka and the Udāna) [2.2.2.1], the Buddha, seeing the conditions of the world, is moved by compassion towards it, thus:

"Great compassion⁸⁹ descends into the buddhas, the blessed ones, upon seeing beings in these **many modes (of suffering)**, thus:⁹⁰

- (1) one engaged with the world is **burning**.⁹¹ (*āditto loka, sannivāso'ti*).⁹²
- (2) one engaged with the world is (always) **busy**. (*uyyutto⁹³ loka, sannivāso'ti⁹⁴*).
- (3) one engaged with the world has **gone astray**. (*payāto loka, sannivāso'ti*).
- (4) one engaged with the world **follows a bad path**. (*kummagga, paṭipanno loka, sannivāso'ti*).
- (5) the world, being unstable, is **led on** (to death). (*upanīyati loko adhuvo'ti*).⁹⁵
- (6) the world, **without a protector**, has no guardian. (*atāno⁹⁶ loko anabhissaro'ti*).
- (7) the world with **nothing as its own**, has to abandon all and move on. (*assako loko sabbaṃ pahāya gamanīyan'ti*).⁹⁷

4.76/2:79 f); **Devatā S** (A 9.19/4:392), SD 57.14; cf **Mahā Palobhana J** (J 507). For comy, see MA 1:195 f; SA 3:111 f, 266 f.

⁸⁷ Pm 1:126,18-131,7.

⁸⁸ **Dhammapāla** (dates unknown) prob a few cent after Buddhaghosa. Said to have lived in Kanchipuram (75 km = 46 mi SE of Chennai, S India) and Badaratittha. Among his works are the Comys to the Theragāthā, the Therīgāthā, the Udāna, the Iti, vuttaka and the Cariyā, piṭaka. See Hinuber 1996:242, 167-170.

⁸⁹ Ee adds *ñānaṃ*, thus: *mahā, karuṇā, samāpattiyā ñāṇaṃ*, "the knowledge of the attainment of great compassion"" Be Ce Se omit.

⁹⁰ *Bahukehi ākārehi passantānaṃ buddhānaṃ bhagavantānaṃ sattesu maha, karuṇā okkamati* (Pm 1:126,20 f = UA 1:142,12 f = ItA 143,18 f *bahulehi*).

⁹¹ Alternatively, "the world one is engaged in is burning."

⁹² S 35.28, SD 1.3. On *loka, sannivāso*, see Pm:Ñ 137 n3. ItA, after stating this 1st reason for the Buddha's descent into compassion, only lists the key words in *peyyālā* (abridged form). **Sannivāso** (*sam*, "together" + *nivāso*, "who lives with") is sg; hence, the subject should be the world rather than another person. Moreover, the syntax is sg. It also makes good sense that one, as a rule suffers *alone*, even when the sorrow is common. The Buddha is here addressing us individually, with which all of us can relate to.

⁹³ Reading *uyyutto* with Be Ce Se Pm for Ee ItA *uyyoto*.

⁹⁴ Ee adds *loka, sannivāso'ti* here each time; Be Ce Se omit.

⁹⁵ M 2:68,18 *addhūvo*. Comy explains: one goes into death's presence, or is led so by the exhaustion of one's lifespan (*maraṇa, santikaṃ gacchati āyu-k, khayena vā tattha nīyati*, MA 3:306). On *upanīyati*, "is led near, passes away" (pass of *upaneti*, see ItA:M 1:287 n8).

⁹⁶ Pm *atāno*; UA *attāno*; ItA *aṭṭano*. M 2:68.

⁹⁷ M 2:68,22 *attāno*. KhpA:Ñ 251 n8.

- (8) the world is **wanting**, unsatisfied, a slave to craving. (*ūno loko atitto taṇhā,dāso'ti*).⁹⁸
- (9) one engaged with the world has **no protection**. (*atāṇo⁹⁹ loka,sannivāso'ti*).¹⁰⁰
- (10) one engaged with the world is **without “a cave”** (or safe harbour). (*aleṇo loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (11) one engaged with the world is **without refuge**. (*asaraṇo loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (12) one engaged with the world is (oneself) **no refuge**. (*asaraṇī,bhūto loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (13) the world is **distracted**, unsettled. (*uddhato loko avūpasanto'ti*).
- (14) one engaged with the world is **wounded by darts**, pierced by sundry darts. There is none other than myself to draw out the dart.¹⁰¹
(*sa,sallo loka,sannivāso viddho puthu,sallehi, loka,sannivāso. tassa n'atth'añño koci sallānaṃ uddhato aññatra mayā'ti*).¹⁰²
- (15) one engaged with the world is veiled by blindness that is **ignorance**, walled in by a prison of **defilements**. *There is none other than myself to shine the light*.¹⁰³
(*avijj'andha.kār'āvaraṇo loka,sannivāso¹⁰⁴ kilesa,pañjara,parikkhitto,¹⁰⁵ [tassa n'atth'añño koci ālokaṃ dassetā aññatra mayā'ti]¹⁰⁶*).
- (16) one engaged with the world has fallen into **ignorance**, become blind [as if egged in],¹⁰⁷ enveloped in darkness,¹⁰⁸ a tangled ball of thread, a knotted ball (of thread),¹⁰⁹ like muñja grass and reed; he goes not beyond a state of loss, a suffering state, the downfall, samsara.¹¹⁰
(*avijjāgato loka,sannivāso andha,bhūto¹¹¹ pariyonaddho¹¹² tanta,kula,jāto gulā,guṇṭhika,jāto¹¹³ muñja,pabbaja,bhūto, āpāyaṃ duggatim vinipātaṃ saṃsāraṃ nātivattatīti*).
- (17) one engaged with the world is smeared with the fault and poison that is **ignorance**, mired in **defilements**. (*avijjā,visa,dosa,sallito¹¹⁴ loka,sannivāso,¹¹⁵ kilesa,kalalī,bhūto'ti¹¹⁶*).

⁹⁸ M 2:68,29.

⁹⁹ UA:Be UA:Ce Pm (vl) *atāyano*; UA:Se *attāno*; Pm *atāṇo* Ee Ce; ItA omits.

¹⁰⁰ ItA omits this whole line.

¹⁰¹ Clearly, this is spoken by the Buddha as a reflection of compassion. See foll n on Pali.

¹⁰² Only Pm has this line throughout; ItA + UA omit.

¹⁰³ See prec n ad loc.

¹⁰⁴ Only Pm has *loka,sannivāso*; UA + ItA omit.

¹⁰⁵ UA ItA *kilesa,pañjara,parikkhitto*; *parikkhito*, “bounded by,” Pm *-pakkhitto*, “cast into the cage of defilements.”

Pm:Ñ 128: “with a locked dungeon of defilements.”

¹⁰⁶ Only in Pm.

¹⁰⁷ Reading *aṇḍa,bhūto* (V 3:3,39) with Be, Pm (vl), V, for Be Ce Se Pm *andha,bhūto*, “blinded.” It is possible to include both senses and tr “blinded, egged in.” Pm:Ñ 128 tr “it is blind, it is enclosed in an egg [of ignorance].”

¹⁰⁸ V 3:4,1.

¹⁰⁹ Cf DA 2:495,23-33. JPTS 1919:49 suggests that *gulā,guṇṭhika,jāto* means “covered with blight” but this is unsupported. See Pali n below ad loc.

¹¹⁰ *Tanta,kula,jāto* etc recurs at D 15/2:55,15-17 (SD 5.18) = S 12.60/2:92,15-17 (SD 105.7) = A 4.199/2:211,31-2:212,1 (SD 16.2). See D:RD 2:50 f nn.

¹¹¹ “As if egged in,” *aṇḍa,bhūto* (UA:Be UA:Ce, Pm vl, V for Pm UA:Se ItA *andha,bhūto*, “blinded”). Both senses connoted here.

¹¹² Pm *pariyonandho*; UA ItA *pariyonaddho*.

¹¹³ Pm ItA so; UA:Ce *-guṇḍika-*, UA:Be *kula,guṇḍika-*; UA:Se omits. See tr n above.

¹¹⁴ So Pm; UA *avijjā,visādo,sallīna*; ItA:Ce+Se Pm *avijjā,visa,dosa,sallito*; ItA:Ee *avijjā,visā,dosa,sallito*; Pm:Be *-sallitto*.

¹¹⁵ *Loka,sannivāso* only in Pm.

¹¹⁶ UA *kilesa,kalalī,bhūti*; ItA *kilesa,kalalī,bhūto*; Pm *kilesa,kalī,bhūto*, “is a mire of defilement” (Pm:Ñ 128). *Kalī* means “an unlucky throw (of dice); evil, vice (as in *kali,yuga*, last of the 4 world ages); saliva, spittle, froth.”

- (18) one engaged with the world is entangled in a tangle of **greed, hate, delusion**. There is no one apart from myself who can untangle this tangle.¹¹⁷
(*rāga,dosa,moha,jatā.jaṭito*¹¹⁸ *loka,sannivāso, tassa n'atth'añño koci jaṭam vijaṭitā aññatra mayā'ti*).
- (19) one engaged with the world is shrouded in a cloak of **craving**.
(*taṇhā,saṅghāṭa,paṭimukko*¹¹⁹ *loka,sannivāso'ti*).¹²⁰
- (20) one engaged with the world is cast over with a net of **craving**.
(*taṇhā,jālena otthato*¹²¹ *loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (21) one engaged with the world is carried away by **craving's current**.
(*taṇhā,sotena vuyhati loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (22) one engaged with the world is fettered by **craving's fetter**.
(*taṇhā,saññojanena saññutto loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (23) one engaged with the world is shadowed by the latent tendency of **craving**.
(*taṇhā'nusayena anusaṭo*¹²² *loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (24) one engaged with the world is tormented by the torment that is **craving**.
(*taṇhā,santappena santappati loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (25) one engaged with the world is burnt up by the fever that is **craving**.
(*taṇhā,pariāhena*¹²³ *parilayhati loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (26) one engaged with the world is shrouded in the cloak of **views**.
(*diṭṭhi,saṅghāṭa,paṭimukko loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- [27] (UA ItA)¹²⁴ one is cast over with a net of **views** (*diṭṭhi,jālena otato*).¹²⁵
- [28] (UA ItA) one is carried away by a current of **views** (*diṭṭhi,sotena vuyhati*).
- [29] (UA ItA) one is fettered by the fetter of **views** (*diṭṭhi,samyojanena samyutto*).
- [30] (UA ItA) one is shadowed by the latent tendency of **views** (*diṭṭh'anusayena anusahagato*).¹²⁶
- [31] (UA ItA) one is tormented by the torment of **views** (*diṭṭhi,santāpena santappati*).
- (32) one engaged with the world is burnt up by the fever that are **views**.
(*diṭṭhi,pariāhena parilayhati loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (33) one engaged with the world is dogged by **birth**. (*jātiyā anugato loka,sannivāso'ti*).¹²⁷
- (34) one engaged with the world is shadowed by **birth**. (*jarāya anusahagato*¹²⁸ *loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (35) one engaged with the world is overcome by **disease**. (*vyādhi*¹²⁹ *abhibhūto loka,sannivāso'ti*).

¹¹⁷ Only in Pm throughout.

¹¹⁸ *Jaṭā,jaṭito*: Pm has only *jaṭito*. Cf S 1:13, 165, qu at Vism 1.

¹¹⁹ Cf *mahā,taṇhā,jāla-taṇhā,saṅghāṭa,paṭimukkan'ti* (MA 2:311,30). However, *jāla* appears in (20).

¹²⁰ M 1:271,1; MA 2:311,30.

¹²¹ On *ottato*, see CPD sv. Reading *otthato* here and below with Be Ce ItA for text's *otato*, Se *otthataṃ*, Pm *ottato*. Cf VvA 88 f where the *samantaṃ oṭṭhataṃ* (by golden trees) is explained as *chāditaṃ*, "shaded."

¹²² Pm UA: Ee *anusahagato*; Pm vl, ItA UA: Be UA: Ce UA: Se *anusaṭo*, "followed by, covered up with."

¹²³ UA: Se read *diṭṭhi-* (views) (wr) for *taṇhā-*.

¹²⁴ These 5 sufferings [27-31] are listed only in the 2 Comys.

¹²⁵ ItA *diṭṭhi,jālena otthato*.

¹²⁶ ItA ... *anusaṭo*.

¹²⁷ For other trs of (33)-(36): cf respectively, Ñāṇamoli: "committed by birth ... underlain by ageing ... haunted by affliction ... struck down by death" (Pm:Ñ 129), but at Vism 232, as "procured by birth, haunted by ageing, surprised by sickness, and struck down by death" (Vism:Ñ 250); Pe MaungTin: "is followed by birth, approached by old age, oppressed by sickness, struck by death" (Vism:P 267).

¹²⁸ Pm UA *anusahagato*; ItA *anusaṭo*.

¹²⁹ Pm *byādhi*; UA *byādhinā*; ItA *vyādhinā*.

- (36) one engaged with the world is struck down by **death**. (*maraṇena abhīhato*¹³⁰ loka,sannivāso'ti).
- (37) one engaged with the world has fallen into **suffering**. (*dukkha,patito*¹³¹ loka,sannivāso'ti).
- (38) one engaged in the world is bound by **craving**. (*taṇhāya uḍḍito*¹³² loka,sannivāso'ti).
- (39) one engaged in the world is walled in by the wall of **decay**. (*jarā,pākāra*,¹³³*parikkhitto loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (40) one engaged in the world is surrounded by **Māra's snare**. (*maccu,pāsenā*¹³⁴ *parikkhitto loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (41) one engaged in the world is bound by a great bond [by Māra's bonds],¹³⁵ the bond of **lust**, of **hate**, of **delusion**, or **conceit**, of **views**, of **defilements**, of **misconduct**. *There is none other than myself who can reveal its opening.* (*mahā,bandhana,bandho*¹³⁶ loka.sannivāso rāga,bandhanena dosa,bandhanena moha,bandhanena māna,bandhanena diṭṭhi,bandhanena kilesa,bandhanena duccharita,bandhanena, tassa n'atthi añño koci bandham mocetā aññatra mayā'ti).
- (42) one engaged in the world follows the way of **great crowdedness**.¹³⁷ *There is none other than myself to reveal the opening* (to freedom). (*mahā,sambādha,paṭipanno loka,sannivāso, tassa n'atth'añño koci okāsam dassetā aññatra mayā'ti*).
- (43) one engaged in the world is obstructed by a **great obstruction**. *There is none other than myself who can cut through that obstruction.* (*mahā,palibodhena palibuddho loka,sannivāso, tassa natth'añño koci palibodham chedetā aññatra mayā'ti*).
- (44) one engaged in the world is one fallen down a **great precipice**.¹³⁸ *There is none other than myself who can pull me out.* (*mahā,papāte patito loka,sannivāso, tassa n'atth'añño koci aññatra uddhatā mayā'ti*).
- (45) one engaged in the world is going through a **great wilderness**. *There is none other than myself who can bring me across that wilderness.* (*mahā,kantāra,paṭipanno loka,sannivāso, tassa natth'añño koci kantāram tāretā aññatra mayā'ti*).
- (46) one engaged in the world is going through a **great samsaric cycle**. *There is none other than myself to free me from that samsaric cycle.* (*mahā,samsāra,paṭipanno loka,sannivāso, tassa n'atth'añño koci samsārā mocetā aññatra mayā'ti*).

¹³⁰ Pm *abhīhato*; UA *abbhāhato*; ItA *abbhāhaṭo*.

¹³¹ Pm Se ItA *patito*; UA *dukkhe patiṭṭhito*, "having stood (stands) on suffering."

¹³² Pm *uḍḍito*; UA: Ee+Se ItA *oḍḍito*. *Uḍḍita* (mfn) past part of *uḍḍeti* (1) (more often spelt *oḍḍita*), "bound, tied; stuck in a sling or net (S 1:40,9-16*; SA 3:201,10 ad S 5:148,28).

¹³³ *Pākāra*, "a wall," one forming the boundary of a house, vihara, village etc (Vism 394).

¹³⁴ UA ItA so; Pm *paccupāsenā*. On the usage of *pasa*, "snare," in similes, see JPTS 1907:111.

¹³⁵ Pm here combines what are 2 modes: (42) ending here, and (43) starting after this (and the numbering increases by number, seeming to end with mode (92)—but PM omits (27-31). [2.2.2.3]. See foll n.

¹³⁶ Pm so. Only UA: Ee *māra,bandhana,baddho* (bound by Māra's bond) ... *rāga,dosa,moha,māna,diṭṭhi,kilesa,- duccharita,bandhana,baddho*; UA: Be+Ce ItA *mahā,bandhanena baddho* ... *rāga,bandhanena dosa,moha,bandhanena māna,diṭṭhi,kilesa,duccarita,bandhanena baddho*. UA: Be ItA *mahā,bndhanena baddho*. UA: Se *mahā,bhandhanena bandho*. Comy on D 3:27,10 says that this is the "great bond" (*mahā,bandhanā*) of great defilements (*mahatā kilesa*, DA 829,22). PM hereon adds the phrase that follows that, as above, there is no one apart from oneself who can free oneself from this predicament.

¹³⁷ "The great crowdedness" (*mahā,sambādha*) is that of great suffering (*mahā,dukkha,sambādha*) (UA 134,20).

¹³⁸ In **Tissa S 2** (S 22.84), the precipice is a synonym for anger and despair (*kodhāpāyāsa*) (S 22.84/3:109), SD 32.12.

- (47) *one engaged in the world turns back and forth in a difficult great passage.*¹³⁹ *There is none other than myself who can pull me through such a difficult passage.*
(*mahā, vidugge samparivattati loka, sannivāso, tassa natth'añño koci viduggā uddhatā aññatra mayā'ti*).
- (48) *one engaged in the world is sunk into a great mire. There is none other than myself to lift me out of that mire.*¹⁴⁰
(*mahā, palipe palipanno loka, sannivāso, tassa natth'añño koci palipā uddhatā aññatra mayā'ti*).
- (49) *one engaged in the world is struck down.* (*abbhāhato loka, sannivāso'ti*).
- (50) *one engaged in the world is burning* with the fire of **lust**, of **hate**, of **delusion**, on account of birth, decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, despair.¹⁴¹ *There is none other than myself who can extinguish it.*
(*āditto loka, sannivāso rāg'agginā dos'agginā moh'agginā jātiyā jarā, maraṇena sokehi paridevehi dukkhehi domanassehi upāyāsehi, tassa natth'añño koci nibbāpetā aññatra mayā'ti*).
- (51) *one engaged in the world, ever without a protector, is led away, killed, meeting the punishment for their deeds.*
(*unnītako*¹⁴² *loka, sannivāso haññati niccama atāṇo*¹⁴³ *patta, daṇḍo takkāro*¹⁴⁴*'ti*).
- (52) *one engaged in the world is bound by the bonds of blame, bound for execution.*¹⁴⁵ *There is none other than myself to free myself from such bonds.*
(*vajja, bandhana, bandho*¹⁴⁶ *loka, sannivāso*¹⁴⁷ *āghātana, paccupaṭṭhito, tassa n'atth'añño koci bandhanam mocetā aññatra mayā'ti*).
- (53) *one engaged in the world is without refuge, worthy of the greatest compassion. There is none other than myself can protect (myself).*
(*anātho loka, sannivāso parama, kāruṇṇa-p, patto*¹⁴⁸ *tassa n'atth'añño koci tāyetā aññatra mayā'ti*).
- (54) *one engaged in the world is overwhelmed by suffering, oppressed for a long time (by it).*
(*dukkhābhituṇṇo*¹⁴⁹ *loka, sannivāso cira, ratta, pīlito'ti*).
- (55) *one engaged in the world is ever stuck to greed, ever thirsty.*

¹³⁹ Comy on **Pāṭika S** (D 24/3:27, SD 63.3) says that *vidugga* is name for the 4 floods [1.3.2.5A] (DA 3:829,23), SD 63.3. Cf (**Pañcaka**) **Mahā Cora S** (A 5.103) where *nadī, viduggam* is a "river difficult to cross" (A 5.103/3:128), SD 69.15.

¹⁴⁰ Cf Comy on **Sallekha S** (M 8/1:45,3-6) where *palipa* (mire) is said to be the "5 strands of sense-desires" (MA 1:193,19). *Palipanno* = *nimuggo* (those sunk into the mire) are the "foolish worldling" (*bāla, puthujjano*, MA 1:193,-20).

¹⁴¹ For defs on these, see D 22.18/2:306 (SD 13.2) = M 141,11-18/3:249 f (SD 11.11).

¹⁴² Pm UA *unnītako*; ItA *unnatiko*. *Unnītaka* = *unnīta* (pp of *ud + *neti*) + *ka*²), "led off, led away." (DPL sv).

¹⁴³ Pm *aṭṭāno*; UA ItA -*aṭṭāno*.

¹⁴⁴ Pm *takkāro* (Comy: *coro*, "a thief," PmA 413,33); UA:Ce *vatakkaro*; UA:Ee *takkaro*; UA:Se *vattakkāro*. The reading that fits the context best is: **tak, kara** (*tad + kara*¹; BHS *tatkara*) (mfn) "doer of the deed, one who does that, who follows that" (D 1:235,18; Dh 19b (D:Ñ 65 n19); J 6:397,3*); DP 2:267, sv.

¹⁴⁵ "Bound for execution" (*āghātana, paccupaṭṭhito*: CPD *āghātana*). Comy: "who stood upon reaching the executioner's block, facing death," (~o'ti *marāṇa, dhamma, gaṇḍika-ṭ, ṭhānam upecca ṭhito*, PmA 414,1-3; UA 143,19).

¹⁴⁶ Pm UA so; ItA *vatta, bandhana, baddho*.

¹⁴⁷ This phrase only in Pm for the rest of the text.

¹⁴⁸ Pm UA:Be+Ce+Se so; UA:Ee -*karuṇṇatam patto*; ItA -*karuṇṇatam patto*. Cf *parama, kāruṇṇatam* (UA 289,1, 292,19).

¹⁴⁹ *Abhituṇṇa*, past part of *abhitudati* (*abhi + VTURV* or *VTURV*, to overcome; not from *VTUD*, to push, thrust), "to overwhelm." See Kern, Toev 4.

- (*nicca,gathito*¹⁵⁰ *loka,sannivāso nicca,pipāsito'ti*).
- (56) *one engaged in the world is blind, eyeless. (andho loka,sannivāso acakkhukho'ti).*
- (57) *one engaged in the world is leaderless, lost its guide. (hata,netto loka,sannivāso aparīṇāyako'ti).*
- (58) *one engaged in the world has, missing the straight road, departed from the way.*¹⁵¹ *There is none other than myself who can bring one back to the noble path. (vipatha,pakkhanto loka,sannivāso añjasāparaddho, tassa natth'añño koci ariya,patham ānetā aññātra mayā'ti).*
- (59) *one engaged in the world has leapt (with delight)*¹⁵² *into a great flood. There is none other than myself who can pull one out of the water. (mah'ogha,pakkhanto loka,sannivāso, tassa natth'añño koci oghā uddhatā aññātra mayā'ti).*
- (60) *one engaged in the world is overwhelmed by the 2 views.*¹⁵³ (*dvīhi diṭṭhi,gātehi pariyuṭṭhito loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (61) *one engaged in the world has gone astray on account of the 3 kinds of misconduct.*¹⁵⁴ (*tīhi duccaritehi vippaṭipanno loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (62) *one engaged in the world is yoked to the 4 yokes.*¹⁵⁵ (*catūhi yogehi yutto*¹⁵⁶ *loka,sannivāso catu.yoga,yojito'ti*).
- (63) *one engaged in the world is knotted by the 4 knots.*¹⁵⁷ (*catūhi ganthehi ganthito loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (64) *one engaged in the world clings to the 4 clingings.*¹⁵⁸ (*catūhi upādānehi upādiyati loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (65) *one engaged in the world has climbed into the 5 destinies.*¹⁵⁹ (*pañca,gati,samārūḥo*¹⁶⁰ *loka,sannivāso'to*).
- (66) *one engaged in the world lusts after [is dyed in] the 5 cords of sense-pleasures.*¹⁶¹

¹⁵⁰ UA:Ee -*gadhito*; Pm UA:Ce ItA -*gathito* (which, at UA 210,17 f, is a gloss on *satto*, “attached to,” as a result of craving for existence).

¹⁵¹ Pm UA:Ce+Se *vipatha,pakkhanto*; UA:Be *vipatha,pakkhanto*; UA:Ee ItA *vipatha,pakkanto*. Cf *kupatha,pakkhanna*, “having taken a wrong path” (Miln 390,8). **Vipatha**, however, is glossed with *apatha*, “non-path” (VvA 212,19); moreover, *vi-* suggests “away.” Hence, the nuance here is more of “going away” from the path, rather than going on the wrong one. The “straight way” is, of course, the noble path (VvA 215,7-9).

¹⁵² “Leapt (with delight)” Be -*pakkhanto*. UA:Ee -*pakkanto*; Pm UA:Ce+Se -*pakkhanto*.

¹⁵³ **The 2 views** are those of eternalism (*sassata,diṭṭhi*) and annihilationism (*uccheda,diṭṭhi*) (It 43; ItA 1:177,31 - 178,9); SD 1.1 (3).

¹⁵⁴ **The 3 kinds of misconduct** (*ti duccarita*) are those of the body, of speech and of the mind: **(Vitthāra) Kamma S** (A 4.232/2:230-232), SD 4.13 (2); **Tika Deva S** (A 3.18,4), SD 54.14.

¹⁵⁵ These are **the yokes** (*yoga*), ie, influxes (*āsava*) of sensual lust (*kāma,yoga*), existence (*bhava,yoga*), views (*diṭṭhi,yoga*) and ignorance (*avijjā,yoga*) (D 33,1.11(31)/3:230).

¹⁵⁶ UA:Be+Ce+Se ItA *yojito*. UA omits the rest.

¹⁵⁷ **The 4 knots** (*gantha*) are the “body-knots” (*kaya,gantha*) of coveting (*abhijjhā kaya,gantha*), ill will (*vyāpāda kaya,gantha*), attachment to rituals and vows (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa kaya,gantha*), and self-belief (*atta,vāda kaya,gantha*) (D 33,1.11(34)/3:230). So called because they “:knot” or tie the body and mind together.

¹⁵⁸ **The 4 clingings** (*upādāna*) are those of sensual desire (*kāmūpādāna*), views (*diṭṭhūpādāna*), attachment to rituals and vows (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsūpādāna*), and self-belief (*atta,vādūpādāna*) (D 33,1.11(35)/3:230).

¹⁵⁹ **The 5 destinies** (*pañca gati*) are hell (*niraya*), the animal realm (*tiracchāna,yoni*), pretas (*petti,visaya*), humans (*manussa*) and gods (*deva*) (D 33,2.1(4)/3:234).

¹⁶⁰ Pm UA ItA *samārūḥo*; UA:Se *samākula*, “filled, crowded together” (B 2.4 = J 1:3; Miln 331, 342); “ruffled, confused, confounded by, jumbled together” (J 5:302).

¹⁶¹ **The 5 cords of sense-pleasures** (*pañca kāma,guṇa*) are those of sights, sounds, smells, tastes, and touches that are pleasant and lust-inducing (*paraphrased*) (D 33,2.1(3)/3:234); M 13,7 n (SD 6.9); A 6.63,3.2 + SD 6.11 (2.2.2.6).

- (*pañcahi kāma,guṇehi rajjati loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (67) *one engaged in the world is cast over with the 5 hindrances.*¹⁶²
(*pañcahi nīvaraṇehi otthato loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (68) *one engaged in the world quarrels by way of the 6 roots of dispute.*¹⁶³
(*chahi vivāda,mūlehi vivadatī loka,sannivāso,ti*).
- (69) *one engaged in the world is excited*¹⁶⁴ *by the 6 cravings.*¹⁶⁵
(*chahi taṇhā,kāyehi rajjati loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (70) *one engaged in the world is overwhelmed by the 6 views.*¹⁶⁶
(*chahi diṭṭhi,gatehi pariyuṭṭhito loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (71) *one engaged in the world is pursued*¹⁶⁷ *by the 7 latent tendencies.*¹⁶⁸
(*sattahi anusayehi anusaṭo loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (72) *one engaged in the world is fettered by the 7 fetters.*¹⁶⁹
(*sattahi saññojanehi saññutto loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (73) *one engaged in the world is puffed up by the 7 conceits.*¹⁷⁰
(*sattahi mānehi uṇṇato loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (74) *one engaged in the world rolls about in the 8 worldly conditions.*¹⁷¹
(*aṭṭhahi loka,dhammehi samparivattati loka,sannivāso'ti*).

¹⁶² The 5 hindrances (*pañca nīvaraṇa*) are (1) sensual desire (*kāma-c,chanda*), (2) ill will (*vyāpāda*), (3) restlessness and worry (*uddhacca,kukkucca*), (4) sloth and torpor (*thīna,middha*) and (5) doubt (*vicikicchā*) (D 33,2.1(6)/3:234); **Nīvaraṇa** SD 32.1; (**Nīvaraṇa**) **Saṅgārava S** (S 46.55), SD 3.12.

¹⁶³ The 6 roots of dispute (*cha vivāda,mūla*) are (summarized): (1) anger and resentment, (2) meanness and spitefulness, (3) envy and selfishness, (4) craftiness and deceit, (5) bad desire and wrong view, (6) holding hard to one's views (D 33,2.2(15)/3:246); (**Chakka**) **Vivāda,mūla S** (A 6.36), SD 47.14.

¹⁶⁴ Also at (80): "Excited (by)," **rajjati** (med of *rajati*, "to shine, to bleach"): to be excited, find pleasure in (S 4:74; Sn 160, 813). Sometimes confounded with *rajati*, "to dye, colour," which should be *rañjati*. However, *rañjeti* has both senses

¹⁶⁵ The 6 bodies of cravings (*cha taṇhā,kāya*) are those for forms (*rūpa,taṇhā*), for sounds (*sadda,taṇhā*), for smells (*gandha,taṇhā*), for tastes (*rasa,taṇhā*), for touches (*phoṭṭhabba,taṇhā*), and for thoughts (*dhamma,taṇhā*) (D 33,2.2(8)/3:244).

¹⁶⁶ The 6 views (*cha diṭṭhi,gata*) are thus: (1) "A self exists in me"; (2) "No self exists for me"; (3) "I perceive self with a self"; (4) "I perceive non-self with a self"; (5) "I perceive self with non-self"; (6) the eternal self exists and acts in me (paraphrased) (M 2,8/1:8 nn), SD 30.3.

¹⁶⁷ "Pursued by," *anusaṭo* (past part of *anusarati* = *anu*, "after" + *vsr*, to flow) which describe how we act towards an *anusaya* (latent tendency), while *anuseti* (truncated from **anusayati*: *anu* + *vśi*, to lie), "lies latent, lurks" is how it acts on us.

¹⁶⁸ The 7 latent tendencies (*satta anusaya*) are those of: (1) sensual lust (*kāma,rāgānusaya*), (2) repulsion (*paṭighānusaya*), (3) views (*diṭṭhānusaya*), (4) doubt (*vicikicchā'nusaya*), (5) conceit (*mānānusaya*), (6) existence (*bhavānusaya*), (7) ignorance (*avijjā'nusaya*) (D 33,2.3(12)/3:254).

¹⁶⁹ The 7 fetters (*satta saṃyojana*) are those of: (1) complaisance (*anunaya saṃyojana*), (2) repulsion (*paṭigha saṃyojana*), (3) views (*diṭṭhi saṃyojana*), (4) doubt (*vicikicchā saṃyojana*), (5) conceit (*māna saṃyojana*), (6) existence (*bhava saṃyojana*), (7) ignorance (*avijjā saṃyojana*) (D 33,2.1(13)/3:254); SD 2.1.2 n.

¹⁷⁰ The 7 conceits (*satta māna*) are (1) conceit (*māna*), (2) excessive conceit (*atimāna*), (3) super-conceit (*mānā-timāna*), (4) self-contempt (*omāna*), (5) over-conceit (*adhimāna*), (6) "I am" conceit (*asmi,māna*), (7) false conceit (*micchā,māna*) (Vbh 383,22-24).

¹⁷¹ The 8 worldly conditions (*aṭṭha loka,dhamma*) are: (1-2) gain and loss (*lābho ca alābho ca*), (3-4) fame and non-fame (obscurity or ill-fame) (*yaso ca ayaso ca*), (5-6) praise and blame (*nindā ca pasamsā ca*), (7-8) joy and sorrow (*sukhañ ca dukkhañ ca*) (D 33,3.1(9)/3:260); **Loka,dhamma S 1+2** (A 8.5+6), SD 42.2+3.

- (75) *one engaged in the world is fixated on [led by] the 8 wrongnesses.*¹⁷²
(*aṭṭhahi micchattehi niyato*¹⁷³ *loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (76) *one engaged in the world is flawed by a person's 8 defects.*¹⁷⁴
(*aṭṭhahi purisa,dosehi dussati loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (77) *one engaged in the world is resentful by way of the 9 grounds for resentment.*¹⁷⁵
(*navahi āghāta,vatthūhi āghātito loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (78) *one engaged in the world is puffed up by the 9 kinds of conceit.*¹⁷⁶
(*nava,vidha,mānehi*¹⁷⁷ *uṇṇato loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (79) *one engaged in the world is excited*¹⁷⁸ *by the 9 conditions rooted in craving.*¹⁷⁹
(*navahi taṇhā,mūlakehi dhammehi rajjati loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (80) *one engaged in the world is defiled by the 10 grounds for defilement.*¹⁸⁰
(*dasahi kilesa,vatthūhi kilissati loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (81) [Only in Pm and UA:Be] *one engaged in the world is resentful by way of the 10 grounds for resentment.*¹⁸¹ (*dasahi āghāta,vatthūhi āghātito loka,sannivāso'ti*).¹⁸²

¹⁷² The 8 wrongnesses (*aṭṭha micchatta*) are: (1) wrong view (*micchā diṭṭhi*), (2) wrong thought (*micchā saṅkappa*), (3) wrong speech (*micchā vācā*), (4) wrong action (*micchā kammantā*), (5) wrong livelihood (*micchā ājīva*), (6) wrong effort (*micchā vāyāma*), (7) wrong mindfulness (*micchā,sati*), (8) wrong concentration (*micchā,samādhi*) (D 33,3.1(1)-/3:254). On the eightfold path, see SD 10.16.

¹⁷³ Pm UA:Ce+Se *niyato* (restrained or restricted by); Pm vl, UA:Be ItA *niyyati* (given over to); UA:Ee ItA *niyyāto* (led or guided by). The amplified tr gives its alt sense.

¹⁷⁴ The 8 defects (*aṭṭha purisa,dosa*) are (summarized): (1) a monks denies his offence by claiming forgetfulness, (2) denies angrily, (3) angrily counter-accuses, (4) negatively evades the issue, (5) speaks with gesticulations before the order (to impress it), (6) ignores the matter (denial), (7) denies and keeps silent, (8) angrily leaves the order.

(Aṭṭha) **Khaluṅka S** (A 8.14), SD 7.9; Vbh 387,16-388,18.

¹⁷⁵ The 9 grounds for resentment (*nava āghāta,vatthu*) are (abridged): Resentment arises from the thought: (1) "He has injured me"; (2) "He is injuring me"; (3) "He will injure me"; (4) "He has injured someone dear to me"; (5) "He is injuring someone dear to me"; (6) "He will injure someone dear to me"; (7) "He has done a favour to someone I dislike"; (8) "He is doing a favor to someone I dislike"; (9) "He will do a favour to someone I dislike": (**Navaka**) **Āghāta S** (A 9.29/4:408,8-16 = D 33,3.1(1)/3:262; J 3:291,7', 3:404,29', 4:149,23'; V 5:137,25 :: VA 7:1342,26).

¹⁷⁶ The 9 kinds of conceit (*nava,vidha māna*) (summarized): (1-3) in one who is better the conceit thus: "I am better," "I am equal," "I am inferior"; (4-6) in one who is equal: "I am better," "I am equal," "I am inferior"; (7-9) in one who is inferior: "I am better," "I am equal," "I am inferior": (**Navaka**) **Āghāta S 1** (A 9.29/4:408) = Vbh 389,24-32.

¹⁷⁷ Pm UA so; ItA *navahi mānehi* ...

¹⁷⁸ See (70) n on *rajjati*.

¹⁷⁹ The 9 conditions rooted in craving (*nava taṇhā,mūlaka dhamma*) (abridged): the 9 conditions to be abandoned (*pahatabbā*): the craving (*taṇhā*) on which seeking depends; (1) the seeking (*pariyesanā*) on which gains depend; (2) the gains (*lābha*) on which discrimination depends; (3) the discrimination (*vinicchaya*) on which the will depends; (4) the will on which lustful desire depends; (5) the lustful desire (*chanda,rāga*) on which attachment depends; (6) the attachment (*ajjhosaṇa*) on which appropriation depends; (7) the appropriation (*pariggaha*) on which miserliness depends; (8) the miserliness (*macchariya*) on which guarding depends; and because of guarding (*ārakkha*), there is violence, quarrels, false speech, and many unwholesome states (D 34,2.2(4)/3:288,29-289,9).

¹⁸⁰ The 10 grounds for defilements (*dasa kilesa,vatthu*): (1) greed, (2) hate, (3) delusion, (4) conceit, (5) views, (6) doubt, (7) sloth, (8) restlessness, (9) lack of moral fear, (10) lack of moral shame (Vbh 391,10-13, cf 341,15-18).

¹⁸¹ The 10 grounds for resentment (*dasa āghāta,vatthu*): (1)-(9) as at (77), (10) one becomes angry without a reason (from impersonal or natural causes, such as stubbing one's toes) (A 10.79/5:150; Vbh 391,14-23).

¹⁸² So Pm UA:Be ItA; UA:Ce+Ee+Se omit this whole line.

- (82) *one engaged in the world is endowed with the 10 courses of unwholesome karma.*¹⁸³
(*dasahi akusala,kamma,pathehi samannāgato loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (83) *one engaged in the world is fettered by the 10 fetters.*¹⁸⁴
(*dasahi saññojanehi saññutto loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (84) *one engaged in the world is fixated by the 10 wrongnesses.*¹⁸⁵
(*dasahi micchattehi niyato*¹⁸⁶ *loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (85) *one engaged in the world is endowed with the 10-ground wrong view.*¹⁸⁷
(*dasa,vatthukāya micchā,diṭṭhiyā samannāgato loka,sannivāso,ti*).¹⁸⁸
- [86] [UA:Ce+Se only]¹⁸⁹ *one is endowed with the tenfold self-identity views.*¹⁹⁰
(*dasa,vatthukāya sakkāya,diṭṭhiyā samannāgato*)
- (87) *one engaged in the world is endowed with the 10-ground wrong view of the extremist.*¹⁹¹
(*dasa,vatthukāya anta-g,gahikāya diṭṭhiyā samannāgato loka,sannivāso'ti*).
- (88) *one engaged in the world mentally proliferates in the 108 mental proliferations rooted in craving.*¹⁹²
(*aṭṭha,sata,tanḥā,papañcehi*¹⁹³ *papañcito loka,sannivāso'ti*).

¹⁸³ The 10 courses of unwholesome karma (*akusala kamma,patha*): (1) taking life, (2) taking the not-given, (3) sexual misconduct, (4) lying, (5) slander, (6) harsh speech, (7) frivolous talk, (8) covetousness, (9) ill will, (10) wrong view (D 33,3.3(3)/3:269; Vbh 391,24-28).

¹⁸⁴ The 10 fetters (*dasa saṃyojana*) [*s = saṃyojana*]: (1) sensual lust (*kāma,raga saṃyojana*), (2) repulsion (*paṭigha s*), (3) conceit (*māna s*), (4) views (*diṭṭhi s*), (5) doubt (*vicikicchā s*), (6) attachment to ritual and vows (*sīla-b,-bata,parā,āsa s*), (7) lust for existence (*bhava.rāga s*), (8) envy (*issāsa s*), (9) miserliness (*macchariya s*), (10) ignorance (*avijjā s*) (A 10.213/5:17; Vbh 391,29-35).

¹⁸⁵ The 10 wrongnesses (*dasa micchatta*): (1)-(8) as for (75), (9) wrong knowledge (*micchā ñāṇa*), (10) wrong liberation (*micchā vimutti*) (D 34,2.2(4)/3:290; A 10.132/5:240; Vbh 391,35-392,2).

¹⁸⁶ Pm UA so: see (76) n.

¹⁸⁷ The 10-ground wrong view (*dasa,vatthuka micchā,diṭṭhi*): (1) there is nothing given; (2) there is nothing sacrificed; (3) there is nothing offered; (4) there is no karmic fruit, good or bad; (5) there is no this world; (6) there is no next world; (7) there is no mother; (8) there is no father; (9) there are no spontaneously born beings; (10) None who, living rightly and practising rightly, realize the here and hereafter, proclaim them. (Vbh 392,3-10); see SD 40a.1 (5.1.2).

¹⁸⁸ ItA omit this whole line.

¹⁸⁹ This line only found in UA Sinhalese ed and Siamese (Thai) ed. Pm UA:Be+Ee omit.

¹⁹⁰ The tenfold self-identity views (*dasa,vatthukāya sakkāya,diṭṭhi*): it is not possible to be certain what exactly this teaching is (but cf Nm 1:49, 113, 2:414, 458). This is only the reading in the UA, Sinhala and Siamese eds. It is possible that it should simply read *dasa,vatthukāya (micchā)diṭṭhim*, as in (85). The usu list here would be the set of 20 self-identity views (*vīsati,vatthukā sakkāya,diṭṭhi*: 4 views x 5 aggregates): mentioned at Nm 1:49,26, 113,29, 414,1, 458,18; AA 2:23,22; ThaA 3:29,13. On *sakkāya,diṭṭhi*: SD 40a.8 (3); SD 40a.12 (3.2.4); on the 20 views: "I": the nature of identity, SD 19.1 esp (2.2).

¹⁹¹ The 10-ground wrong view of the extremist (*dasa,vatthuka anta-g,gahika diṭṭhi*), viz, the views that: "the world is eternal," "the world is not eternal," "the world is finite," "the world is infinite," "the soul (*jīva*) and the body are the same," "the soul and body are different," "A being exists after death," "a being does not exist after death," "a being both exists and does not exist after death," "a being neither exist nor does not exist after death" (Vbh 392,11-18). These are also called the 10 "undetermined points" (*avyakata*): SD 5.8 (2).

¹⁹² The 108 mental proliferations rooted in craving (*aṭṭha,sata tanḥā,papañca*): they refer to 18 self-centred ("internal") preoccupations ("I am," "I am such," etc) and 18 "external" ("by means of this I am," etc), totaling 36 "thought-courses" (*vicarita*): these relate to the 3 times (the past, the present and the future), totaling 108 thought-courses or mental proliferations: see (Catukka) *Tanḥā S* (A 4.199/2:211-213), 31.15 (mentioned at DA 3:721,12; MA 1:183,4; PmA 2:427,1). On *papañca*, see Nm 280; Nett 37 f; on *vicarita*, see SD 31.15 (2). The 108 proliferations are detailed at Vbh §§973-974/392-396 (VbhA 514-516 & Mohv 222); see also AA 3:206; qu at MA 1:220.

¹⁹³ UA ItA so; Pm *aṭṭha,sata,tanḥā,papañca,satehi*.

(89) *one engaged in the world is overwhelmed by the 62 wrong views.*¹⁹⁴
(*dvā,saṭṭhiyā diṭṭhi,gatehi pariyuṭṭhito loka,sannivāso'ti*).

(90) Great compassion descends into the buddhas, the blessed ones, upon seeing beings in these many modes (of suffering), thus:

I've <u>crossed over</u> ,	but the world has <i>not</i> crossed over;	<i>ahañ c'amhi tiṇṇo loko ca atinṇo</i>
I'm <u>freed</u> ,	but the world is <i>not</i> freed;	<i>ahañ c'amhi mutto loko ca amutto</i>
I'm <u>tamed</u> ,	but the world is <i>not</i> tamed;	<i>ahañ c'amhi danto loko ca adanto</i>
I'm <u>at peace</u> ,	but the world is <i>not</i> at peace;	<i>ahañ c'amhi santo loko ca asanto</i>
I'm <u>relieved</u> ,	but the world is <i>not</i> relieved;	<i>ahañ c'amhi assattho</i> ¹⁹⁵ <i>loko ca anasattho</i>
I've won nirvana,	but the world has <i>not</i> won nirvana.	<i>ahañ c'amhi parinibbuto loko ca aparinibbuto</i>
Furthermore,		
having crossed over,	I'm able to cross them over;	<i>pahomi kvâharṇ</i> ¹⁹⁶ <i>tiṇṇo tāretuṃ</i>
freed,	I'm able to free them;	<i>mutto mocetuṃ</i>
tamed,	I'm able to tame them;	<i>danto dametuṃ</i>
at peace,	I'm able to pacify them;	<i>santo sametuṃ</i>
relieved,	I'm able to relieve them;	<i>assattho assāsetuṃ</i>
having won nirvana,	I can show them how to attain nirvana." ¹⁹⁷	<i>parinibbuto parinibbāpetun'ti</i> ¹⁹⁷
	This is the Tathagata's <u>knowledge of the attainment of great compassion.</u> ¹⁹⁸	

Thus, **the Udāna Commentary** says that there are a total of 89 (*ekūna,navutiya*) modes (UA 1:144,23).

2.2.2.3 The number of the suffering modes vary from 89 to 92. There are **89 modes**, since **(81)** is found only in the Paṭisambhidā,magga (Pm) and the Burmese Udāna Commentary (UA:Be); and **(86)** only in the UA, Sinhala edition (Ce) and Siamese Edition (Se); but UA:Ee omits both. Hence, all UA editions, other than the European edition (Ee),¹⁹⁹ list all **90 modes** (including the last paragraph).

Pm, like UA:Be, mentions **(81)**, but, unlike all the UA editions, combines **(40)** and **(41)** into the one and same mode, namely, "one is bound by the great bond, the bond of lust, of hate, of delusion, or conceit, of views, of defilements, of misconduct." But Pm also omits 5 modes, (27)-(31), found only in the Commentaries. Hence, the Pm list is the shortest (and the oldest) with only **86 modes**.

Hence, Pm and UA:Ee, each in their own way, total **89** (including the last paragraph). UA:Be+Ce+Se each have **90**.

As for the Iti,vuttaka Commentary (ItA), it may be noted that ItA:Ee includes both **(81)** and **(86)**, but omits **(85)**. Hence, it is the same as UA:Be, Ce and Se, but for different reasons.²⁰⁰

Summary:

Pm 86 modes; UA:Ee 89 modes; UA:Be+Ce+Se 90 modes; ItA 90 modes. — — —

¹⁹⁴ The 62 grounds for wrong views (*dvā,saṭṭhi diṭṭhi,gata*): 4 eternalist theories; 4 partial eternalist theories; 4 finite and infinite theories; 4 eel-wriggling theories, 2 theories on causeless arisings; 16 theories on having perception; 8 theories on having non-perception; 8 theories on neither-perception-nor-non-perception; 7 annihilationist theories; 5 theories on nirvana here and now. **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1,28-1244/1:12-45, SD 25; Vbh 400,16-23).

¹⁹⁵ A wordplay: *assattha* (Pm UA:Be+Ce+Se) is also the name of Gotama's Bodhi tree, the *Ficus religiosa*! ItA *asattho*.

¹⁹⁶ So Pm UA:Be+Se ItA; UA:Ce *câharṇ*.

¹⁹⁷ Pm UA:Be+Ce+Se ItA *parinibbāpetun'ti*; UA:Ee ItA *pare ca nibbāpetun'ti*.

¹⁹⁸ Pm 1:130,32-131,7.

¹⁹⁹ This is also called the "Pali Text Society" (PTS) edition.

²⁰⁰ Cf UA:M 415 n813,

(Iti) Vitakka Sutta

The (Iti,vuttaka) Discourse on Thoughts

It 28

1 This was spoken by the Blessed One, spoken by the arhat, as heard by me.²⁰¹

Non-ill will and solitude

2 “For the Tathagata,²⁰² bhikshus, the arhat, the fully self-awakened one, 2 thoughts²⁰³ frequently arise: the thought of **safety** and the thought of **solitude**.²⁰⁴

3 One enjoying **non-ill will**,²⁰⁵ bhikshus, is the Tathagata, one delighting in non-ill will.²⁰⁶

4 To this very Tathagata, bhikshus, who enjoys non-ill will, one delighting in *non-ill will*, this very same thought often arises, thus:²⁰⁷

5 ‘By this gesture,²⁰⁸ **may I not afflict anyone**,²⁰⁹ be they trembling or still.’²¹⁰

6 One enjoying **solitude**, bhikshus, is the Tathagata, one delighting in solitude.²¹¹

7 To this very Tathagata, bhikshus, who enjoys solitude, one delighting in *solitude*, this very same thought often arises, thus: ‘Whatever is unwholesome has been abandoned.’²¹²

²⁰¹ *Vuttam h’etaṃ bhagavatā. Vuttam arahatā’ti me sutam.*

²⁰² **Tathagata** is often used by the Buddha to address himself. [2.1.1]

²⁰³ “Thoughts” (*vitakka*): the Buddha’s thoughts are “right thinking” (*sammā vitakkā*, ItA 142,22), meaning that they are free from *greed, hate and delusion* (the 3 unwholesome roots of karma). They arise naturally on account of the Buddha’s awakening, rooted in compassion and wisdom. Further see foll n on the 2 kinds of thoughts.

²⁰⁴ *Tathāgataṃ bhikkhave arahantaṃ sammā,sambuddhaṃ dve vitakkā bahulaṃ samudācaranti, khamo ca vitakko, paviveko** ca. Be Ce Ee *paviveko*; Se *viveko*. On the 2 thoughts of the Buddha: [1.3.1.3]

²⁰⁵ This foll passage [§§3-4] reiterate what is said earlier of the 2 kinds of thought. “**Non-ill will**” (*avyāpajjha*, *avyāpajja* or *avyābajjha*—Be, as a rule, labializes -v- and reads *abyāpajjha*, etc) is lovingkindness (*mettā*). “**Enjoying non-ill will**” (*avyāpajj’ārāma*) means that the Buddha’s mind is constantly filled with *lovingkindness*, ever ready to *joyfully* respond to others in difficulty. “**Delighting in non-ill will**” means the Buddha acts (or does not) with compassion. A time when he *does not act* (out of compassion) is in his famous silence [SD 44.1] and in **Bodhi Rāja,kumāra S** (M 85,7), SD 55.2.

²⁰⁶ *Avyāpajj’ārāmo* bhikkhave tathāgato avyāpajja,rato. Be abyāpajj’ārāmo; Ce Se itA:Be abyāpajjh’ārāmo. Ee abyābajjh’ārāmo* subsequently emended in its Errata to *avyāpajjhārāmo* throughout.

²⁰⁷ *Tam enaṃ bhikkhave tathāgataṃ avyāpajj’ārāmaṃ avyāpajja,rataṃ es’eva* vitakko bahulaṃ samudācarati.* Be Ee Se *es’eva*; Ce *eso’va*, then *es’eva* throughout.

²⁰⁸ “Gesture,” *iriyā*, usu means “posture” (as in our 4 postures: standing, walking, sitting, reclining), but Comy glosses it with action connected with the body or speech (*kiriyāya, kaya,vacī,payogenāti attho*, ItA 147,17). Hence, “gesture” best fits the context here, since any of these 4 postures is a *gesture* of non-ill will, or lovingkindness.

²⁰⁹ *Na kiñci* vyābādhemi. Be kañci; Ce Ee Se kiñci.*

²¹⁰ *Imāyāhaṃ iriyāya na kiñci* vyābādhemi tasmā vā thāvaraṃ vā’ti. Be kañci; Ce Ee Se kiñci.* The terms, *tasmā vā thāvarasm vā = tasa,thvāvara* refer to “the moving and the still,” which Comy says refers to those with craving, etc, and those without (the arhats) (ItA 143,18-20). Other interpretations are: in a historical sense (beings and plants) or a natural sense (the afflicted and the unafflicted); It: “either frail or firm (or “movable or immovable” (1997: 22 PDF): **Karaṇīya Metta S** (Khp 9,4b = Sn 146b) + SD 38.3 (5.3); **Nālaka S** (Sn 704b), SD 49.18.

²¹¹ On the 3 kinds of solitude: [1.3.2.2].

²¹² *Yaṃ akusalaṃ taṃ pahīnan’ti.* The Buddha is here speaking from his experience and example, which is the basis for his foll exhortation

The Buddha's exhortation

- 8 Therefore, you, too, bhikshus, must dwell enjoying **non-ill will**, delighting [31] in non-ill will.
- 9 To you, all the same, bhikshus, as you are dwelling enjoying in *non-ill will*, delighting in *non-ill will*, this very same thought will frequently arise:
- 10 'By this gesture, **we will not afflict anyone**, be they trembling or still.'
- 11 Dwell enjoying **solitude**, bhikshus, delighting in solitude.
- 12 To you, all the same, bhikshus, as you are dwelling enjoying in solitude, delighting in *solitude*, this very same thought will frequently arise:
- 13 'What is unwholesome? What is unabandoned? **What must we abandon?**'²¹³

The Buddha's verses of upift (*udāna*)

- 14 The Blessed One spoke on this matter. Then, he said this:²¹⁴
- 15 *Tathāgataṃ buddham asayha,sāhinam*²¹⁵ To the Tathagata,²¹⁶ the Buddha, who endures
duve vitakkā samudācaranti nam | the unendurable,²¹⁷ two thoughts, I say,²¹⁸ arise:
khemo vitakko paṭhamo udīrito the first thought roused²¹⁹ safety;
tato viveko dutiyo pakāsito. || then, the second proclaimed solitude.
- 16 *Tamo,nudaṃ pāragataṃ mahesim*²²⁰ The great seer, darkness-dispeller, gone beyond,²²¹
*taṃ patti,pattaṃ vasimaṃ anāsavaṃ*²²² fully attained,²²³ a master of dhyana,²²⁴ influx-free,²²⁵
*visan,taraṃ*²²⁶ *taṇha-k,khaye vimuttaṃ* | crossed over disharmony, in destroyed craving,²²⁷ free:

²¹³ *Kim akusalaṃ kiṃ appahīnaṃ kiṃ pajahāmāti.*

²¹⁴ *Etam atthaṃ bhagavā avoca. Tatth'etaṃ iti vuccati.*

²¹⁵ On this verse (§15): see [1.3.1].

²¹⁶ On *tathagata + buddha* [1.3.1.1].

²¹⁷ "Who endures the unendurable," *asayha,sāhinam* [1.3.1.2].

²¹⁸ Comy says that *brūmi* [§16e] is to be connected with *duve vitakkā samudācaranti*, "two thoughts arise" [§15b] (ItA 150,24 f). On the 2 thoughts [1.3.1.3].

²¹⁹ "Roused," *udīrito*, past part of *udīreti* or *udīrayati* (caus of *u/ud*, "out, away" + *iriyati*, to posture), causes to appear; rouses; raises one's voice; utters, speaks (Dh 408 = Sn 632; Vv 34.25). This is a typical pregnant (polysemic) Pali word: it means to say something in a manner to inspire zeal and zest. On Pali polysemy: SD 1.1 (4.4.5); SD 10.16 (1.3.1-1.3.2; 2.2); SD 54.3b (2.1.1.4).

²²⁰ On this verse (§15): see [1.3.1].

²²¹ On this verse (§16), see [1.3.2.1].

²²² The 3 aspects of §16b can be seen as referring to the 3 trainings: *patipattam*, "practised," refers to moral virtue; *vasimaṃ*, "mastered," refers to meditation or mental cultivation; and *anāsavaṃ*, "influx-free," refers to wisdom—all of which have completed and attained by the Buddha.

²²³ "Fully attained" (*taṃ patti,pattaṃ*): [1.3.2.3].

²²⁴ "A master (of meditation)," *vasimaṃ*, ie, who fully understands the mind and has freed it from all defilements; hence, he has fully mastered his own mind and understands those of others, too. [1.3.2.4]

²²⁵ "Influx-free," *anāsavaṃ* [1.3.2.5].

²²⁶ Be Se *vis'antaram*; Ce Be:Ka *vess'antaram*; Ee *viss'antaram*. Comy read *visantaro* (Be) and *vissantaro* (Ee), and gives 2 expl (Be). *Vissa* at Dh 266 is explained as "disharmony, rank smell (of the unwholesome)" (DhA 3:393); on its difficulties, see Dh:N 125 n266. [1.3.2.6]

²²⁷ On "destroyed craving, liberated" (*taṇha-k,khaye vimuttaṃ*): [1.3.2.7].

*taṃ ve munim antima,deha,dhārim*²²⁸ [33] he is indeed the sage²²⁹ bearing his last body,
*mārañ jaham*²³⁰ *brūmi jarāya pāragum* || who has abandoned Māra, I say, gone beyond decay!²³¹

17²³² *Sele yathā pabbata,muddhani-ṭ,ṭhito*²³³ Just as one, standing on a mountain peak,
yathā pi passe janatam samantato | may see the people all around (below),
tathūpamaṃ dhamma,mayaṃ sumedho even so, one truly wise, the all-seeing eye,²³⁴ *d*
pāsādam āruyha samanta,cakkhu | having ascended the Dharma-made²³⁵ palace: *c*
*sokāvatiṇṇam*²³⁶ *janatam apeta,soko* he regards mankind, sunk in sorrow, *f*
avekkhati jāti,jarā’bhibhūtan’ti. || overcome by birth and decay.

18 This, too, is a matter spoken by the Blessed One. Thus it was heard by me.²³⁷

— evaṃ —

191005 191018 191212

²²⁸ On “bearing his last body” (*antima,deha,dhārim*). Lines **16de** recur in **Sikkh’ānisaṃsa S** (It 46/2.2.9/40,18 f*). The cpd *antima,deha,dhāro* occurs at It 4.1/101,15. [1.3.2.9]

²²⁹ “Sage” (*muni*) [1.3.2.8]

²³⁰ Be *mārañ jaham*; Be:Ka Ce *māna,jaham*; Ee *mānam jaham*; Se *māra,jaham*. [1.3.2.10]

²³¹ “Gone beyond decay” (*jarāya pāragum*): [1.3.2.11].

²³² **§17**: This 6-line verse is apparently spoken by the Buddha only here, as if in response to a better known counterpart spoken by Brahmā Sahampati when he entreats the Buddha to teach [1.3.3].

²³³ *Muddhani-ṭ,ṭhito* resolved as *muddhāni* (loc, “top, peak, summit”) (Sn 689c, 987c || 682c) + *ṭhita* (“standing”).

²³⁴ This is the last of “**the 5 eyes**” (*cakkhu*). The Buddha eye (*buddha,cakkhu*) is a name for the knowledge of the degrees of maturity in the faculties of being (*indriya,paropariyatta,ñāṇa*) and the knowledge of the dispositions and latent tendencies of beings (*āsayānusaya,ñāṇa*). The “knowledge of omniscience” is called the universal eye (*samanta,cakkhu*) (S 559d*): see **Kaṇṇaka-t,thala S** (M 90/2:125-133), SD 10.8 (2) & **Sandaka S** (M 76), SD 35.7. The knowledge of the 3 lower paths is called the Dharma eye or “Dharma vision” (*dhamma,cakkhu*). Together with the divine eye or clairvoyance (*dibba,cakkhu*) (S 6.5/1:145, 12.70/2:121 f) and the physical eye (*maṃsa,cakkhu*), these make up the “5 eyes” of the Buddha (Nm 354-360; Nc 235; SA 1:200). See **Miracles**, SD 27.5a (5.5.1); SD 50.20 comy 14-15 (2).

²³⁵ “The palace that is the Dharma,” *dhamma,mayaṃ ... pāsādam*, ie, a beautiful mind comprising true wisdom (ItA 151,3).

²³⁶ “Sunk in sorrow,” *sokāvatinna* = *soka* (“sorrow”) + *avatiṇṇa* (“fallen into,” past part of *avatarati*, “descend into, dive into”). Cf vl *sokānutiṇṇo* (S 1:123,1).

²³⁷ *Ayam pi atthe vutto bhagavatā. Iti me sutan’ti.*