16   Indriya Arahanta Suttā

The Indriya Discourses on the Arhat

Theme: Definitions of an arhat
Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2020

1 Suttas on the arhat and related suttas

1.1 This chapter (**SD 56.16**) comprises 5 short suttas <u>defining the arhat</u> in 3 ways, using well known stock phrases [1.1.2]. The first 4 suttas—S 48.4-5, 27-28—are from **the Indriya Vagga**, the chapter on the spir-itual faculties (S 48), while the last—S 22.110—is from **the Khandha Vagga**, the chapter on the aggregates.

1.2 In this study of the 5 suttas and others in this SD volume, we will examine not only the teachings contained therein, but also their formal structure. We will examine **the literary devices used in such suttas and in the Saṁyutta as a whole**. We will especially have a chance to see how <u>paradigms</u>, <u>tem-plate cycles</u> and <u>audience cycles</u> work in these suttas. This insight will expedite our study and practice of the Dhamma as taught by the Buddha when we aspire to attain streamwinning in this life itself. [2.1.1]

2 Literary devices of the Saṁyutta

2.1 STOCK PHRASES, TEMPLATES AND PARADIGMS

2.1.1 Literary devices

    2.1.1.1 The Saṁyutta Nikāya, the connected teachings, is especially interesting and valuable for its different ways of presenting the teachings by the use of **literary devices**. Clearly, the Buddha himself had used these literary devices, and it is likely, too, that the sutta redactors employed such devices to highlight the teachings with insightful and instructive details, and means of remembering the teachings.

    2.1.1.2 There are <u>2 important features</u> of the suttas in the Saṁyutta that employ such skilful means for our benefit, both in the theory and in the practice. These <u>literary devices and editorial conventions</u> are the "**template cycle**" [2.1.2] and the "**audience cycle**" [2.2.2]. The texts that exhibit these helpful features are collated in their respective Concordances [2.3]. We will first see how these skilful means work so that we can effectively put these suttas teachings into practice in the manner that they are taught and intended.

2.1.2 The template cycle

    2.1.2.1 A "**template**" is a formal sutta structural pattern upon which related teachings are presented in an exhaustive manner. Ideally, <u>a template cycle</u> [2.3.1] lays out all the vital aspects of a teaching for our mindful reflection or as a preamble to our meditation. The same or similar structure is used to pre-sent different teachings.

It's like a student's variations on <u>a musical theme</u> for familiarising himself with the maestro's music as well as building and showing his musical skills. These template cycles are instructive in showing how a teaching can be presented in various interesting ways, often connecting them to other teachings, giving us a bigger window into true reality and awakening.

2.1.2.2 The template cycle may present the same teachings *in different ways*, or connect *different teachings together* to present or highlight a common theme across each samyutta (collection). Hence, the same phrases may highlight a teaching, or connect teachings together, such as <u>the sense-bases</u> (*āyatana*), <u>the elements</u> (*dhātu*) and <u>the aggregates</u> (*khandha*), or <u>the path-factors</u> (*magg'aṅga*), <u>the awakening-factors</u> (*bojjhaṅga*) and <u>the spiritual faculties</u> (*indriya*).

The recurrence of <u>template parallels</u> throughout the Saṁyutta gives us important insights into the structure and style of the Buddha's teaching. It shows that the teaching comprises <u>two overlapping aspects</u>: a formal *structure* shown by the templates themselves, and the *teachings* themselves that each template arranges into individual **suttas**.

The application of the templates to the teachings hints to us, guides us, on how these teachings are to be treated and practised. We are made to see, in the template suttas, for example, that the constituents of existence are to be *understood* with wisdom; that the defilements are to be *abandoned*; that the path-factors are to be *cultivated;* and nirvana to be *realized*.[1] The suttas thus guide us in our practice of the teachings they preserve, as it were, in a "coded" manner, like **a computer programme** that must be properly run to work.[2]

2.1.3 Paradigms and parallels

2.1.3.1 The templates sometimes arise from **a paradigm** or scheme, that is, a broader view or perspective of the teaching as a whole based on a theme [2.1.3.2, 2.1.3.3]. Paradigms produce templates, and templates produce suttas. Hence, a **sutta**, by definition, comprises a teaching or set of teachings, structured on a template or templates, which, in turn, centres on a <u>paradigm</u>. To compose suttas, the redactors only need to put together various teachings to the same templates produced by a single paradigm.

2.1.3.2 The Saṁyutta abounds in examples of <u>paradigms</u>. One prevalent <u>paradigm</u> in the collection, central to the Dharma, is **the 3 characteristics** of existence: impermanence (*anicca*), suffering (*dukkha*), and non-self (*anattā*). This paradigm governs a whole series of suttas both in S 22 and S 35, the key divisions—**the Khandha Vagga** (the aggregates) and **the Saḷāyatana Vagga** (the 6 sense-bases), respectively. For, it is above, all the 5 aggregates and the 6 sense-bases and their objects that must be seen with insight so that we gain liberation.

 The "**3 characteristics paradigm**" generates 4 common <u>templates</u>: *impermanent*, etc, in the 3 times (past, future and present); the simple reflection on impermanence, etc; the impermanent, etc, through causes and conditions; and, most critical in the Buddha's soteriological plan, the "**what is impermanent is suffering**" template, which sets the 3 characteristics in relation to one another.[3]

---

[1] This fourfold sequence is that of the <u>practice model</u> of the 4 noble truths—arranged 1-2-4-3—an ancient sequence found, eg, in **Maha Saḷ-āyatanika S** (M 149, 11 passim) + SD 41.9 (2.4); SD 53.26 (2); SD 1.1 (6.2.2.2).

[2] See SD 30.8 (4.2.1); SD 49.10 (2.6.2.1).

[3] This last pattern is famously, eg, found in <u>the aggregate-characteristic pericope</u> in **Anatta Lakkhaṇa S** (S 22.59,-12-16), sd 1.2.

2.1.3.3 Another key paradigm is **the *assāda* triad** of <u>gratification, danger and escape</u> (*assāda*, *ādīna-va*, *nissaraṇa*), which produces 3 templates. Hence, they produce 3 suttas, all having the common theme of "<u>the world</u>" (*loka*) as a whole, that is, **the Pubb'eva Sambodha Sutta** (A 3.101a), **the (Tika) Assāda Sutta 1** (A 3.101b) and **the (Tika) Assāda Sutta 2** (A 3.102a).[4]

The Saṁyutta, apparently drawing upon certain ways of understanding the concept of <u>the world</u>, contains 12 suttas produced by these templates: 3 each on <u>the elements</u> and <u>the aggregates</u> (**S 14.31-33, 22.26-28**), and 6 on <u>the sense-bases</u> (**S 35.13-18**; 6 each, because the internal and external sense-bases, are treated separately).

2.1.4 The stock phrases in the Saṁyutta

2.1.4.1 The teaching paradigm is, in turn, connected to another, on <u>the qualities of true recluses and brahmins</u>, and together they produce 3 more *recurrent templates* on how true recluses and brahmins understand things by way of <u>stock phrases</u>: **the *assāda* (gratification) triad** and **the *samudaya* (arising) pentad**. The *samudaya* pentad simply adds to it the "arising and ceasing" of things; and by way of **the *sacca* (noble-truth) tetrad** (based on the 4 noble truths: suffering, its arising, its cessation, and the way to its cessation), that is, the state itself, its arising, its ending, and the way to its ending.[5]

These templates generate suttas on <u>the 4 elements; gain and honour; the 5 aggregates; feelings; and the 5 faculties</u>. The last template is also applied several times to *the links of dependent arising*, but, curiously, are all missing from the Saḷāyatana Saṁyutta.

2.1.4.2 The cause of **suffering**, according to the Buddha, is <u>craving</u> (*taṇhā*), also called "lustful desire" or "desire and lust" (*chanda,rāga*). In the Saṁyutta, the task of <u>removing craving</u> occasions the use of <u>a paradigm</u> [2.1.2.1] which produces another set of <u>templates</u> [2.1.3.1]: the components of the teaching are rearranged for a new perspective: abandon desire, abandon lust; abandon desire and lust.

These 3 perspectives are each connected separately to whatever is *impermanent*, whatever is *suffering*, and whatever is *non-self* (from the 3 characteristics paradigm), thereby giving rise to 9 templates. These are then extended to *the aggregates*, and to *the internal* and *the external sense-bases*, producing respectively 9 and 18 suttas (**S 22.137-145, 35.168-185**).

2.1.4.3 It is likely that some templates must have emerged from <u>the conversations amongst monastics in their daily lives</u>, such as the ones based on the question why the holy life is lived under the Blessed One (**S 35.81, 152; 38.4; 45.5, 41-48**). **The Mahā,vagga** (S 5), on the groups pertaining to the path, employs a number of <u>new templates</u>, yet has no single dominant paradigm.

Many of these templates occur in repetition cycles (*peyyāla*), elaborated in full only in **the Magga Saṁyutta** (S 45), and then abridged in mnemonic verses. The more significant templates, however, do produce suttas preserved in the various samyuttas.[6]

2.2 Editorial devices

2.2.1 Template parallels
If we closely examine <u>the concordance of template parallels</u> [2.3.1], we will notice that certain possible templates do not produce any cycle of suttas. Such is the case, when, for example, **the "recluses and brahmins"** (*samaṇa,brāhmaṇa*) template is applied to <u>the 6 sense-bases</u>, or the "**noble and liberating**"

---

[4] Respectively: A 3.101a/1:258 f (SD 14.6a), A 3.101b/1:259 (SD 14.6b) and A 3.102a/1:260 (SD 14.7a).
[5] For comy details on these key terms, see SD 14.6 (1.1.2).
[6] For a discussion on Magga Saṁyutta, see S:B 1494-1499.

(*ariya niyyānika*) template applied to *the 5 spiritual faculties*, or the "**7 fruits and benefits**" (*satta phala sattânisaṁsa*) template applied to *the 4 focuses of mindfulness*.

We may wonder whether these omissions were deliberate, or because their applications were over-looked, or because suttas were lost during oral transmission. A comparative study of the Pali version of the Saṁyutta with its Chinese translation, the Saṁyukta Āgama, sometimes show that there are Chinese translations not found in the Pali (and vice versa, too).[7] It is likely that we have lost a significant amount of sutta materials, but what we have today is sufficient for our careful study, diligent practice and certain reaching of the path of awakening.

2.2.2 The audience cycle

2.2.2.1   Another literary device characteristic of the Saṁyutta that reflects the teaching method o the Buddha and the early arhats is **the "audience cycle**." This refers to suttas that are *identical or similar* in <u>contents</u>, but *differ* in terms of their <u>audience</u>, or in <u>the protagonist</u> (in a narrative sutta), or in <u>the occasion</u>. This device is, for example, used in 7 different suttas recounting <u>how a person attains or fails to attain nirvana</u>, in exactly the same words, but addressed to different protagonists, thus:

		protagonists	
S 35.118	**Sakka,pañha Sutta**	Sakka, lord of the devas	SD 74.1
S 35.119	**Pañca,sikha Sutta**	Pañca,sikha	SD 74.1(3)
S 35.124	**(Ugga) Vesāli Sutta**	Ugga of Vesālī	SD 74.17
S 35.125	**(Ugga) Vajjī Sutta**	Ugga the Vajjī	SD 74.18
S 35.126	**(Upāli) Nālandā Sutta**	Upāli	SD 74.19
S 35.128	**(Parinibbāna) Soṇā Sutta**	Soṇa the houselord's son	SD 74.2
S 35.131	**Nakula,pitu Sutta**	Nakula,pitā	SD 74.2

2.2.2.2 The Rādha Saṁyutta (S 23), for example, includes two vaggas of 12 suttas each identical in all respects except that in <u>the first</u> (**S 23.23-34**) Rādha asks for a teaching while in <u>the second</u> (**S 23.35-46**) the Buddha initiates the teaching.

It is likely that the Buddha would have **repeated** <u>the more important teachings</u>, or the more import-ant parts of his teachings. However, we must imagine that it is unlikely that the Buddha would have spok-en his teaching exactly in the formal repetitive style that we often see in the suttas. The sutta compiler—like a modern transcriber of a taped lecture or talk—edited such teachings into a formal framework that repeats the key teachings for our reflection and so that we remember them.

2.2.2.3 Understandably, the Buddha must have **repeated** <u>his teachings on various occasions</u>, as experienced Dharma teacher often do even today. Such a repetition of teachings is done for at least <u>2 reasons</u>. Firstly, the teachings are repeated for the benefit of those who have *not heard* them yet. Sec-ondly, it is to ensure that the listener or audience *remembers* the teaching, which is, after all, important enough to be repeated.

We may then wonder why a certain teaching is repeated more than others, or a certain sutta is given special treatment. Clearly, the Buddha is emphasizing a teaching or a point, or that he is reminding us that it's all right to fail or face difficulties in our quest for awakening, or to aspire to reach the path in this

---

[7] See eg Analayo, *On the Five Aggregates* (1-5)—*A translation of Saṁyukta-āgama Discourses … Dharma Drum Journal of Buddhist Studies* 11, 2012:1-61; 12, 2013:1-69; 13, 2013:1-65; 14, 2014:1-71; 15, 2014:1-64. New Taipei City: Dharma Drum Buddhist College, 2012-2014; repr; *Saṁyukta-āgama Studies,* Taipei, 2015. <u>download</u>

life itself, and to never give up trying. Or, perhaps, it is to remind those who are heedless, that they are unlikely to attain the path, that they will lose their way, falling into difficulties and suffering.

Here, too, we see the occasions when the Buddha gives a teaching a *first* time in response to a question from Ānanda; then, a *second* time to him on his own initiative; a *third* time in response to a question from a group of monks; and a *fourth* time to a group of monks on his own initiative (**S 36.15-18, 54.13-16**).

2.2.3 Sutta recursions

2.2.3.1 A 3rd literary device found in the Saṁyutta, different from the audience cycle [2.2.2], is the occurrence of "**recursions**," chains of suttas centering on a simple or basic teaching by phrasing or concatenating (stringing) them in different ways. At times, such arrangements result in a kind of "ring composition."[8]

The Diṭṭhi Saṁyutta (S 24), for example, contains 4 "cycles" (*gamana*) on speculative views—(1) S 24.18, (2) S 24.19-44, (3) S 24.45-70, (4) S 24.71-96)—differing only in the formal structure that frames the list of views. However, the first cycle, oddly, lacks the list of views recurring in the other three.

2.2.3.2 In **the Vaccha,gotta Saṁyutta** (S 33), the wanderer Vaccha,gotta approaches the Buddha 5 times with the same question, about the reason why the 10 speculative or "undetermined" views arise in the world. Each time, the Buddha answers that it arises from *not knowing* one of the 5 aggregates, mentioning each in its sequence. Each question and answer form a separate sutta.

Vaccha,gotta is depicted as being adamant in his desire for answers to his questions—or perhaps he is fascinated by how the Buddha patiently comes up with an answer by the use of a different synonym for *lack of knowledge*! Thus, the saṁyutta comprises 10 variations on the 1st pentad, identical in every way except for the change of synonyms.

2.2.3.3 In an interesting way, **the Vaccha,gotta Saṁyutta** [2.2.3.2] epitomizes the oral tradition where the Buddha, instead of his characteristic silence[9] on these speculative views, actually answers quite comprehensively. This exchange also suggests a subtle humour on the Buddha's part as well as his analytic skills (*paṭisambhidā*)[10] in communication wisdom and resolving tricky questions.

2.2.3.4 **The Jhāna Saṁyutta** (S 34) evinces yet another literary device, the "**wheel**" (cakka) of permutations, whereby a chain of terms is taken in *paired combinations*, seemingly exhausting all the possibilities of exposition. Here again, we see an interesting display of linguistic flourish characteristic of the Saṁyutta Nikāya.

2.2.4 The "faculty" cycles

2.2.4.1 In **the Mahā,vagga** (S 5), the closing "Great Chapter" of the Samyutta Nikāya, **the 5 faculties** alone, among the 37 awakening-factors (*bodhi,pakkhiya dhamma*),[11] are treated in terms of the following paradigms:[12]

---

[8] See SD 32.14 (1.2); SD 55.12a (5.1.3.2).

[9] In **(Vaccha,gotta) Ānanda S** (S 44.10), when Vaccha,gotta asks the Buddha about the soul or self (*attā*), the Buddha remains famously silent (SD 2.16(5)). **Aggi Vaccha,gotta S** (M 72) recounts another dialogue the Buddha has with Vaccha,gotta on the same subject, with the Buddha answering in an apophatic (negative) manner, but ending with a fire parable (SD 6,15). See **Māluṅkya,putta S** (M 63), SD 5.8, where the Buddha famously gives *no* answer to any of the 10 speculative views. See also **Silence and the Buddha**, SD 44.1.

[10] The 4 analytic skills (*paṭisambhidā*) are those in meanings (*attha p.*), in teachings (*dhamma p.*), in language (*nirutti p.*) and in ready wit (*paṭibhāna p.*): SD 56.15 (1.2.1.5) n; SD 28.4 (4); SD 41.6 (2.2).

[11] See SD 56.8 (1.1.1).

the "*assāda* **triad**"	"gratification, danger, and escape"[13]	S 48.2+**4**
the "*sacca* **tetrad**"	"(the faculty) arising, ceasing, and the path"[14]	S 48.**30** + **35**
the "*samudaya* **pentad**"	"arising and ceasing, gratification, danger, and escape"[15]	S 48.3+**5**+6, 21, 26-29, **33**, 34

2.2.4.2 **The "*assāda* (gratification) triad**, also called the "*nissaraṇa* formula (after the last compo-nent), has 3 key terms beginning with "the gratification, the danger and the escape" (*assādañ ca ādīna-vañ ca nissaraṇañ ca*) applied to the realities. It is found, for example, in **the (Indriya) Sotāpanna Sutta 1** (S 48.2), **the (Indriya) Arahanta Sutta 2** (S 48.4), and **the (Indriya) Samaṇa,brāhmaṇa Sutta 2** (S 48.7).[16] These 3 Suttas are about the 5 spiritual faculties.[17]

An older version of the *assāda* triad is probably the *nissaraṇa* triad: "the danger, the gratification, the escape" (*ādīnava, assāda, nissaraṇa*). This triad refers respectively to *the truth* that is suffering, the truth that is its *arising* (craving), and the truth that is its *escape* (nirvana). Apparently, as the *assāda* triad be-came more popular, the *nissaraṇa* formula fell out of use.[18]

2.2.4.3 **The "*sacca* (noble-truth) tetrad"** applies the paradigm (theme) of the 4 noble truths to the realities, thus: "(the faculty) arising, ceasing, and the path" (… *pajānāti, … samudayaṁ … nirodhaṁ … nirodha,gāmini,paṭipadaṁ …*). The 1st noble truth is the reality itself, that is, each of the 5 faculties. The other 3 truths then follow in the usual sequence. It is found, for example, in **the (Cha-ḷ-indriya) Samaṇa,-brāhmaṇa Sutta 2** (S 48.30), where it works with the 6 sense-bases;[19] And **the (Sukh'indriya) Samaṇa,-brāhmaṇa Sutta 2** (S 48.35), where the tetrad is applied (in a rare case) to each of the 5 feeling facul-ties.[20]

2.2.4.4 **The "*samudaya* (arising) pentad"** is an extended version of the *assāda* triad [2.2.4.2], to which is added "arising and cessation," which characterizes the nature of all formations or conditioned reality, that is, all our worldly existence. Hence, it applies 5 terms—"arising and ceasing, gratification, danger, and escape" (*samudayañ ca atthagamañ ca assādañ ca ādīnavañ ca nissaraṇañ ca*)—to the realities.

This pentad paradigm is the most common of these 3 paradigms, and is found in the following suttas:

(Indriya) Sotāpanna Sutta 2	S 48.3/5:193 f	SD 101.7b
(Indriya) Arahanta Sutta 2	S 48.5/5:194	SD 56.16b
(Indriya) Samaṇa,brāhmaṇa Sutta 1	S 48.6/5:195 f	SD 56.18a
(Indriya) Punabbhava Sutta	S 48.21/5:203 f	SD 56.14
(Cha-ḷ-indriya) Sotāpanna Sutta	S 48.26/5:205	SD 10.16(11.1)
(Cha-ḷ-indriya) Arahanta Sutta	S 48.27/5:105	SD 56.16c
(Cha-ḷ-indriya) Buddha Sutta	S 48.28/5:205 f	SD 56.17
(Cha-ḷ-indriya) Samaṇa,brāhmaṇa Sutta 1	S 48.29/5:206	SD 56.19a
(Sukhíndriya) Arahanta Sutta 1	S 48.33/5:208	SD 56.16d
(Sukhíndriya) Samaṇa,brāhmaṇa Sutta 1	S 48.34/5:208	SD 56.20b

---

[12] For a similar list, see SD 56.8 (1.1.2.3).

[13] *Assādañ ca ādīnavañ ca nissaraṇañ ca.*

[14] *-indriyaṁ pajānāti, -indriya,samudayaṁ … -indriya,nirodhaṁ … -indriya,nirodha,gāmini,paṭipadaṁ … .*

[15] *Samudayañ ca athagamañ ca assādañ ca ādīnavañ ca nissaraṇañ ca.*

[16] See respectively **S 48.2**/5:193 (SD 101.7b); **S 48.4**/5:194 (SD 56.16a); **S 48.7**/5:195 f (SD 56.18b).

[17] For the application of the gratification triad, see S:B 38.

[18] On the *nissaraṇa* triad, see SD 14.6 (2). On the *assāda* triad and the *samudaya* pentad, see SD 56.19 (2).

[19] S 48.30/5:206 f (SD 56.19b).

[20] S 48.35/5:208 f (SD 5.20c).

2.3 CONCORDANCES OF TEMPLATE CYCLES AND AUDIENCE CYCLES[21]

2.3.1 A concordance of template cycles

2.3.1.1 The term "template cycle" has been explained above [2.1.2]. This is a concordance of suttas that fully or very much display the **templates** or structural patterns, and includes suttas from different saṁyuttas. As noted by Bodhi, this concordance does not include suttas within the same saṁyutta that show variations peculiar to that saṁyutta, or the repetition series at the end of saṁyutta 45-51 and 54 of **the Mahā,vagga** (ch 5, the Saṁyutta's closing chapter).[22]

2.3.1.2 While Bodhi's concordance is indexed by the English translated terms, here it is listed by <u>the Pali terms</u> themselves. Hence, it is advantageous to have access to both concordances. The references below are to **sutta numbers** in the Saṁyutta:

anabhijānaṁ, abhijānaṁ, "without directly knowing; by directly knowing," 22.24; 35.111-112
anicca, dukkha, anattā, "impermanent, suffering, non-self":
  (1) what is impermanent is suffering, 22.15-17; 35.1-3, 4-6
  (2) past, future, present, 22.9-11; 35.7-9, 10-12
  (3) revulsion, dispassion, freedom, 22.12-14; 35.222-224, 225-227
  (4) the cause and condition for, 22.18-20; 35.140-142, 143-145
apārā pāraṁ gamanāya, "going from this shore to the far shore," 45.34; 46.17; 47.34; 51.1
ariya niyyānika, "noble and liberating," 46.19; 47.17; 51.3
avijjā, vijjā, "ignorance; knowledge," 22.113-114; 56.17-18
assāda, ādīnava, nissaraṇa, "gratification, danger, escape":
  (1) what is the gratification, etc? 14.31, 22.26, 35.13-14
  (2) I set out seeking, etc, 14.32; 22.27; 35.15-16
  (3) if there were no gratification, etc, 14.33; 22.28; 35.17-18
āditta, "burning," 22.61; 35.28
āsava-k,khaya, "destruction of the influxes," 48.20; 51.23
upādāna, upādāniyā dhamma, "clinging and the clung to," 22.121; 35.110, 123
ekanta,dukkhaṁ abhavissa, "if it were exclusively suffering," 14.34; 22.60
ekanta,nibbidāya saṁvattati, "it leads to utter revulsion," 46.20; 47.32; 51.4
kiṁ upādāya, "by clinging to what?" 22.150-158; 24.1-96; 35.105, 108
kim atthi brahma,cariyaṁ, "for what purpose is the holy life?" 35,81, 152; 38.4; 45.5, 41-48
ko hetu upapajjanti, "what is the cause that one rearises (is reborn)?" 29.7-10; 30.3-6; 31.2-12; 32.2-12
gaṅgā nadī na sukarā pacchā,ninnaṁ kātuṁ, "it is not easy to make the Ganges tend westwards,"
    35.244 (4:190,23-191,23); 45.160; 52.8
cakkhuṁ udapādi, "vision arose," 36.25; 47.31; 51.9; 56.11 (5:422,9-30); 56.12
tatra vo chando (rāgo) pahātabbā, "desire (and lust) should be abandoned," 22.137-145; 35.76-78, 162-
    164; 168-185
dān'upakāra, "with the support of giving," 29.11-50; 30.7-46; 31.13-112; 32.13-52
dukkhaṁ so abhinandati, "he delights in suffering" 14.35, 22.29; 35.19-20
dukkhass'eso uppādo, "the arising of suffering," 14.36; 22.30; 26.1-10; 35.21-22

---

[21] The concordances are based on those found in S:B 1986-1989, with some adjustments and corrections.
[22] "While the latter are molded upon templates, their schematic character and uniform position make it unneces-sary to include them." (S:B 1986). The dividing line between template parallels and suttas constructed from stock formulas is imprecise; hence, it would be nearly impossible to precisely classify such suttas by such templates alone.

dhamma,kathika, "on a Dharma speaker," 12.16, 67 (2:114,32-115,16); 22.115-116; 35.115
nakha,sikh'ādi,upamā, "the similes of the finger-nail, etc," 13.1-10; 56.51-60
nâññatra tathāgatassa pātubhāvā, "no one other than the Tathagata," 45.14-15; 46.9-10; 48.59-60
na tumhākaṁ, "not yours" 22.33-34; 35.101-102, 138-139
nandi-k,khaya, "destruction of delight," 22.51-52; 35.156-157, 158-159
paṭisallāne yogaṁ āpajjatha, "commit (ourself) to devotion to solitude," 22.6; 35.100, 161; 56.2
phala, "fruits":
   (1) "one of 2 fruits," 46.57 (ii); 47.36; 48.65; 51.25; 54.4
   (2) "7 fruits and benefits," 46.3 (5:69,16-70,27); 48.66; 51.26; 54.5
phassaṁ paṭicca uppajjati, "arises dependent on contact," 12.62 (S 2:96,26-97,29); 36.10;48.39
bhāvanā desanā, "a teaching on cultivation," 47.40; 51.19
micchā-/sammā,paṭipadā, "wrong way/right way," 12.3; 45.23
viraddha/āraddha ariyaṁ maggaṁ, "neglected/undertaken the noble path," 45.33; 46.18; 47.33; 51.2
saṁyojana, saṁyojaniyā dhammā, "the fetter, the state that fetters," 22.120; 35.109, 122
saṁyojana-p,pahān'ādi, "abandoning the fetters, etc," 48.61-64; 54.17-20
samaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā, "recluses or brahmins":
   (1) *assāda* triad, 14.37;17.25; 22.107; 23.5; 36.27; 48.6, 29, 34
   (2) "arising and ceasing," 14.38; 17.26; 22.108; 23.6; 36.28
   (3) 4-noble-truth pattern, 12.13, 14, 29, 30, 71-80; 14.39; 17.27; 22.50; 36.29; 48.7, 30, 35; 56.22
   (4) past, future, present, 51.5, 6, 16, 17; 56.5, 6
samādapetabba nivesetabba patiṭṭhāpetabba, "one should rouse, entreat, establish (them),"
samādhiṁ bhāvetha, "cultivate samadhi," 22.5; 35.99; 35.160; 56.1
suriyassa upamā, "simile of the sun," 45,49-55, 56-62; 46.12-13; 56.37
sotāpanna, arahaṁ, "streamwinner; arhat," 22.109-110; 23.7-8; 48.2-5, 26-27, 32-33
vibhaṅga, "a teaching through analysis," 12.2; 45.8; 47.40; 48.9-10, 36-38; 51.20

2.3.2 A concordance of audience cycles

     The suttas collated here are, in each case, almost identical in content, differing only in terms of the person to whom they are addressed, the protagonist, and/or the circumstance under which they are spoken:

11.1-2:	Sakka's advice on exertion
11.12, 13:	Sakka's names
12.4-10:	the buddhas discover dependent arising
12.35-36:	with ignorance as condition
12.41-42:	the 10 qualities of a streanwinner
18.21, 22.71, 22.124:	ending "I-making," and conceit
18.22, 22.72, 22.125:	transcending discrimination
22.106-112, 23.4-10:	discourses on the aggregates
22.115-116:	a Dharma-speaker
22.126, 127-128:	ignorance and knowledge (subject to arising pattern)
22.133, 22.131-132:	ignorance and knowledge (*assāda* triad)
23.23-24, 23.35-46:	the nature of the aggregates
35.76-78, 162-164, 168, 171, 174:	abandon desire and lust
35.81, 152:	or what purpose is the holy life?
35.118, 119, 124-126, 128, 131:	how a monk attains/fails to attain nirvana
36.15-18:	an analysis of feeling

36.19-20:	a gradation of happiness
36.23, 24, 26:	*more* analysis of feeling
38.1-16; 39.1-16:	question on nirvana, etc
40.10, 11:	to the devas, on going for refuge to the Buddha, etc
46.14, 15:	the awakening-factors and illness
47.18, 43:	the Buddha's reflections on mindfulness
47.22, 25:	how the true Dharma endures long
51.19, 27-30:	on cultivating the bases for spiritual power
54.13-16:	on cultivating the mindfulness of breathing
55.18, 20:	to the devas, on the factors of streamwinning
55.28, 29: the 10	the qualities of a streamwinner
55.46-49:	the 4 limbs of streamwinning

3 Related suttas

3.1 SUTTA LIST

Listed below (**S 5.4.1**) are the 10 suttas comprising **the Suddhika Vagga**—all dealing with the 5 spiritual faculties—the 1st chapter of **the Indriya Saṁyutta** (the connect teachings on the faculties). The last section (**S 3.1.3**) are 2 suttas from **the Khandha Vagga**, the chapter on the 5 aggregates, which are listed here because they are connected with the spiritual faculties.

All the related suttas are listed here according to their respective chapter, with the titles of those translated here given in **bold**, thus:

S 5.4.1[23]   **Suddhika Vagga** (the basic chapter)

5 5.4.1.1	S 48.1	**(Indriya) Suddhika Sutta**. The 5 mental faculties (basic list)	SD 10.4(1)
S 5.4.1.2	S 48.2	**(Indriya) Sotāpanna Sutta 1**. The 4 noble individuals in terms of faculties	SD 101.7a
S 5.4.1.3	S 48.3	**(Indriya) Sotāpanna Sutta 2**. The 6 individuals in terms of faculties	SD 101.7b
S 5.4.1.4	**S 48.4**	**(Indriya) Arahanta Sutta 1**. The arhat and faculties: *assāda* triad	**SD 56.16a**
S 5.4.1.5	**S 48.5**	**(Indriya) Arahanta Sutta 2**. The arhat and faculties: *samudaya* pentad	**SD 56.16b**
S 5.4.1.6	**S 48.6**	**(Indriya) Samaṇa,brāhmaṇa S 1**. Followers and outsiders: *samudaya* pentad	**SD 56.18a**
S 5.4.1.7	**S 48.7**	**(Indriya) Samaṇa,brāhmaṇa Sutta 2**. Followers & outsiders: *sacca* tetrad	**SD 56.18b**
S 5.4.1.8	S 48.8	**(Indriya) Daṭṭhabba Sutta.** Definitions of the 5 faculties	SD 10.4(1.1.3)
S 5.4.1.9	S 48.9	**(Indriya) Vibhaṅga Sutta 1.** The 5 spiritual faculties and freedom	SD 74.7a
S 5.4.1.10	S 48.10	**(Indriya) Vibhaṅga Sutta 2.** The 5 spiritual faculties and freedom	SD 74.7b

S 3.1.3

S 3.1.3.1.7 S 22.109   **(Khandha) Sotāpanna Sutta**. The 5 faculties and streamwinning   SD 17.1a(2.3)

S 3.1.3.1.8 **S 22.110   (Khandha) Arahanta S**. The aggregates + the arhat: *samudaya* pentad **SD 56.16e**

3.2 THE ARHAT AND THE STREAMWINNER

3.2.1 "Noble disciple" and "monk"

3.2.1.1 The streamwinner as described in **the (Khandha) Sotāpanna S** (S 22.109),[24] and the arhat of **the (Khandha) Arahanta S** (S 22.110),[25] share the same understanding of the 5 aggregates. They, how-

---

[23] This is the traditional sutta numbering, following Be Ce Se.

ever, differ in that the arhat has been able to use this understanding or wisdom to remove all his defile-ments, while the streamwinner (and other learners)[26] has yet to complete this task.

3.2.1.2 Further, note that while the streamwinner in **S 22.109** is addressed as "noble disciple" (*ari-ya,sāvaka*), the arhat in **S 22.110** is called a "monk" (*bhikkhu*). "Noble disciple" is a common term for any of the 4 kinds of noble individuals: the streamwinner, the once-returner, the non-returner and the arhat. **The arhat**, on the other hand, is here termed a monk for the reason that only monastic renunciants—monks and nuns who fully keep to the Dhamma,Vinaya—attain arhathood. However, "monk" here is *generic,* referring to "the renunciant," including lay practitioners who are able to attain dhyana and trans-cend the sense-world. [3.2.1.3]

3.2.1.3 As a rule, the Buddha, when teaching, often addresses "**the monks**" (with the vocative *bhikkhave* or *bhikkhavo*), reminding them that they are "the best field" for cultivating renunciation to reach the path and move towards awakening.[27] On the other hand, in the Commentary to **the Satipaṭ-ṭhāna Sutta** (M 10), tells us that the term "monks" in a teaching situation, as a rule, refers to all who meditate in keeping with the Dharma.[28]
It is, of course, *possible* for a layman or a laywoman to become **an arhat**, but this is *exceptional*. The reason for this is the moral and mental rigours of the renunciation of sense-pleasures that the path of arhathood entails. As a rule, an arhat should be able to attain dhyana to be able to free himself from the limitations of the physical senses. The arhat has also overcome all the 10 fetters.[29] When a lay practition-er is able to do so, he is able to attain arhathood. [3.2.2]

3.2.2 Layman arhats

3.2.2.1 The laity, on the other hand, even as **streamwinners** or as **once-returners**, need not experi-ence dhyana at all: they only need to overcome the 3 fetters,[30] and for the latter, weaken greed, hate and delusion.[31] It is also difficult for a lay person to become **a non-returner**, who must be able to attain dhyanas, and has broken all the 5 lower fetters.[32]

3.2.2.2 However, there are exceptional cases of **the laity** becoming non-returners,[33] even becoming arhats.[34] They are *lay practitioners* of exceptional moral virtue and masters of dhyana. It is not the rule that only monastics can become arhats or non-returners. Rather, only by diligently practising **renuncia-**

---

[24] S 22.109/3:160 f. This sutta's teaching is identical to that in **(Rādha) Sotāpanna S** (S 23.7/3:192 f), where it is addressed to the monk Rādha.

[25] S 2.110/3:161 (SD 56.16e).

[26] On the learner (*sekha*), see SD 56.13a(7) (7.1.2); on the "non-learner" (*asekha*) (the arhat), see SD 56.13a (7.2.1).

[27] On the parable of the 3 fields, see **(Khetta) Desanā S** (S 42.7), SD 51.12.

[28] See M 10,3A n (SD 13.3). The vocative "monks," also refers to all attending or listening to the Dharma: SD 4.9 (5.3), SD 13.1 (3.1.1).

[29] On the 10 fetters, see SD 56.9 (2.3.2). On the 3 influxes and the 10 fetters, see SD 56.13a (1.0.3.20.

[30] On the streamwinner, see S 22.109, SD 17.1a(2.3); SD 52.10a (1.2.2.2-1.2.2.3). On the 3 fetters, see SD 56.1 (4.4.1). For an essay, see **Emotional independence**, SD 40a.8.

[31] On the once-returner, see SD 10.16 (12). On weakening the 3 roots, see SD 10.16 (12.1.2.1).

[32] On the non-returner, see SD 56.15 (1.2.2). On the 5 lower fetters, see SD 56.9 (2.3.2).

[33] On the layman non-returner, see **(Majjhima) Ghaṭīkāra S** (M 81,18.14), SD 49.3. For a list of layman non-re-turners, see **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,2.7), SD 9.

[34] On layman arhats, see **Naḷakapāna S** (M 68), SD 37.4 (4); SD 8.6 (15); SD 37.4 (4); SD 4.9 (5.3.5).

tion (*nekkhamma*), whether as monastics (which should be easier) or as lay practitioners (exceptional effort needed), we are able to become non-returners and arhats.[35]

3.3 RELATED SUTTAS

The (Indriya) Āsava-k,khaya Sutta (S 48.20),[36] like the (Indriya) Arahanta Sutta 1 (S 48.4), defines an arhat as one who has fully developed the 5 faculties, and calls him "one with influxes destroyed" (*khīṇ'-āsava*). However, here, in S 48.4, he is further described with 7 epithets beginning with *khīṇ'āsava,* that is, the *khīṇāsava* pericope (also called the "influx destroyed" septet) [SD 56.16a §3].

— — —

SD 56.16a   (Indriya) Arahanta Sutta 1

The 1st (Indriya) Discourse on the Arhat | S 48.4/5:194
Ee **Arahaṁ Sutta** The Discourse on the Arhat
S 5.4.1.4 Saṁyutta Nikāya 5, Mahāvagga 4, Indriya Saṁyutta 1, Suddhika Vagga 4
Theme: Defining an arhat in terms of the 5 spiritual faculties: the *assāda* triad

2   "Bhikshus, there are these **5 faculties**. What are the five?

(1) The faculty of faith.
(2) The faculty of energy.
(3) The faculty of mindfulness.
(4) The faculty of concentration.
(5) The faculty of wisdom.

THE *ASSĀDA* TRIAD
3   When, bhikshus, the noble disciple[37] having understood, as they really are,
the gratification, the danger and the escape regarding these 5 faculties—
    the monk is freed by non-clinging.
4   This, bhikshus, is called one[38] who is **an arhat**,

one whose influxes are destroyed,	*khīṇāsava*
who has lived the holy life,	*vusitavā*
done what had to be done,	*kata,karaṇīya*
laid down the burden,	*ohīta,bhāra*
reached his own goal,	*anuppatta,sad-attha*
utterly destroyed the fetters of existence,	*parikkhīṇa,bhava,saṁyojana*
one completely freed through final knowledge."[39]	*samma-d-aññā vimutta*

Catutthaṁ

---

[35] On laymen arhats, see **Naḷakapāna S** (M 68), SD 37.4 (4); SD 8.6 (15); SD 37.4 (4); SD 4.9 (5.3.5). On why there seems to be no mention of laymen arhats: SD 8.6 (13-20).

[36] S 48.20/5:203 (SD 56.13a(1)).

[37] "The noble disciple," Ee *ariya,sāvako*; Ce *bhikkhu,* "a monk" (cf foll).

[38] Ce *bhikkhu*; Ee omits (cf prec: *ariya,sāvako*).

[39] The difference here between the arhat and the streamwinner parallels that given in **(Khandha) Sotāpanna S** (S 22.109), SD 16.7(5) + **(Khandha) Arahanta S** (S 22.110), SD 56.16e. [3.2.1]

SD 56.16b   (Indriya) Arahanta Sutta 2

The 2nd (Indriya) Discourse on the Arhat | **S 48.5**/5:194
S 5.4.1.5 Saṁyutta Nikāya 5, Mahāvagga 4, Indriya Saṁyutta 1, Suddhika Vagga 5
Theme: Defining an arhat in terms of the 5 spiritual faculties: the *samudaya* pentad

2   **"**Bhikshus, there are these **5 faculties**. What are the five?

(1) The faculty of faith.
(2) The faculty of energy.
(3) The faculty of mindfulness.
(4) The faculty of concentration.
(5) The faculty of wisdom.

THE *SAMUDAYA* PENTAD
3   When, bhikshus, having understood, as they really are,
the arising and the ceasing, the gratification, the danger, and the escape regarding these 5 faculties—
4   a monk is <u>freed by non-clinging</u>—
this, bhikshus, is called a monk who is **an arhat**,

one whose influxes are destroyed,	*khīṇāsava*
who has lived the holy life,	*vusitavā*
done what had to be done,	*kata,karaṇīya*
laid down the burden,	*ohīta,bhāra*
reached his own goal,	*anuppatta,sad-attha*
utterly destroyed the fetters of existence,	*parikkhīṇa,bhava,saṁyojana*
one completely freed through final knowledge."[40]	*samma-d-aññā vimutta*

Pañcamaṁ

SD 56.16c   (Cha-ḷ-indriya) Arahanta Sutta

The (6-faculty) Discourse on the Arhat | **S 48.27**/5:205
S 5.4.3.7 Saṁyutta Nikāya 5, Mahāvagga 4, Indriya Saṁyutta 3, Chaḷindriya Vagga 7
Theme: Defining an arhat in terms of the 6 sense-faculties: the *samudaya* pentad

2   **"**Bhikshus, there are these **6 faculties**. What are the six?

(1) The eye faculty;	*cakkhu'ndriya*
(2) the ear faculty;	*sot'indriya*
(3) the nose faculty;	*ghān'indriya*
(4) the tongue faculty;	*jivh'indriya*
(5) the body faculty;	*kāy'indriya*
(6) the mind faculty.	*man'indriya*

---

[40] The difference here between the arhat and the streamwinner: [3.2.1].

THE *SAMUDAYA* PENTAD
    When, bhikshus, having understood as they really are
the arising and the ceasing, gratification, the danger, and the escape regarding these 6 faculties,
   a monk[41] is <u>freed by non-clinging</u>—
4   this, bhikshus, is called a monk who is **an arhat**,

one whose influxes are destroyed,	*khīṇ'āsava*
who has lived the holy life,	*vusitavā*
done what had to be done,	*kata,karaṇīya*
laid down the burden,	*ohita,bhāra*
reached his own goal,	*anuppatta,sad-attha*
utterly destroyed the fetters of existence,	*parikkhīṇa,bhava,saṁyojana*[42]
one completely [rightly] liberated through final knowledge."	*samma-d-aññā,vimutta*

— *paṭhamaṁ* —

SD 56.16d   (Sukh'indriya) Arahanta Sutta

The (Joy-faculty) Discourse on the Arhat | **S 48.33**/5:208
S 5.4.4.3 Saṁyutta Nikāya 5, Mahā,vagga 4, Indriya Saṁyutta 4, Sukhindriya Vagga 3
Theme: Defining an arhat in terms of the 5 feeling faculties: the *assāda* triad

2   "Bhikshus, there are these **5 faculties**. What are the five?

(1) The pleasure faculty,	*sukh'indriya*
(2) the pain faculty,	*dukkh'indriya*
(3) the joy faculty,	*somanass'indriya*
(4) the displeasure faculty,	*domanass'indriya*
(5) the equanimity faculty.	*upekkh'indriya*

THE *SAMUDAYA* PENTAD
2   When, bhikshus, having understood, as they really are,
the arising and the ceasing, the gratification, the danger, and the escape regarding these 5 faculties,
   <u>a monk is liberated by non-clinging</u>—
3   this, bhikshus, is called a monk who is **an arhat**,

one whose influxes are destroyed,	*khīṇāsava*
who has lived the holy life,	*vusitavā*
done what had to be done,	*kata,karaṇīya*
laid down the burden,	*ohīta,bhāra*
reached his own goal,	*anuppatta,sad-attha*
utterly destroyed the fetters of existence,	*parikkhīṇa,bhava,saṁyojana*
one completely freed through final knowledge."	*samma-d-aññā vimutta*

Tikaṁ

---

[41] All MSS read *bhikkhu* in this definition, and so too in **(Sukh'indriya) Arahanta S 2** (S 48.33), in contrast to *ariya,sāvaka* in the parallel texts, **(Indriya) Arahanta S 1** (S 48.4) and **(Indriya) Arahanta S 2** (S 48.5).
[42] Be Ee so; Ce Se *saññojano.*

SD 56.16e   (Khandha) Arahanta Sutta

The (Khandha) Discourse on the Arhat | **S 22.110**/3:161

S 3.1.3.1.8 Saṁyutta Nikāya 3, Khandha,vagga 1, Khandha Saṁyutta 3, Upari Paṇṇāsaka 1, Anta Vg 8

Theme: Defining an arhat in terms of the 5 aggregates: the *samudaya* pentad

1   [At one time, the Blessed One was staying in Anātha,piṇḍika's park-monastery in Jeta's grove outside Sāvatthī.

2   There, the Blessed One addressed the monks, thus:][43]

3   "Bhikshus, there are these **5 aggregates of clinging**. What are the five?

(1) the aggregate of clinging that is **form**,	*rūp'upadana-k,khandha*
(2) the aggregate of clinging that is **feeling**,	*vedan'upadana-k,khandha*
(3) the aggregate of clinging that is **perception**,	*saññ'upadana-k,khandha*
(4) the aggregate of clinging that are **formations**,	*saṅkhār'upadana-k,khandha*
(5) the aggregate of clinging that is **consciousness**.	*viññāṇ'upadana-k,khandha*

THE *SAMUDAYA* PENTAD

4   "When, bhikshus, having understood, as they really are,
the arising and the ceasing, the gratification, the danger, and the escape regarding these 5 aggregates of clinging,
   a monk is <u>freed by non-clinging</u>[44]—
5   this, bhikshus, is called a monk who is <u>an arhat</u>,

one whose influxes are destroyed,	*khīṇ'āsava*
who has lived the holy life,	*vusitavā*
done what had to be done,	*kata,karaṇīya*
laid down the burden,	*ohita,bhāra*
reached his own goal,	*anuppatta,sad-attha*
utterly destroyed the fetters of existence,	*parikkhīṇa,bhava,saṁyojana*[45]
one completely [rightly] liberated through final knowledge."	*samma-d-aññā,vimutta*

Aṭṭhamaṁ

200708 200730 200924

---

[43] This preamble is from S 22.83/3:105

[44] On the streamwinner in the prec sutta, (S 22.109), and the arhat share the same understanding of the 5 aggregates; and the streamwinner being referred to as a "noble disciple," and the as a "monk," see [3.2.1].

[45] Be Ee so; Ce Se *saññojano.*