

60.1

Handbooks of Meditation in Society 1-6

by Piya Tan ©TAN Beng Sin, 2022, 3rd rev ed 2023

20 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching
by Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin)
assisted by Ratna Lim and family
2002-2023

SD 60.1 • Handbooks of Meditation in Society (series title = HMS)

SD 60.1a • How to be mindful: character analysis (HMS 1)

An analytical study of Buddhaghosa's 6 character types, especially in relation of meditation

SD 60.1b • Types of meditation: Samatha, Vipassana, Kammathana (HMS 2)

A contemporary study of Samatha and Vipassana.

Burmese Vipassana: its origins and developments

Thai Kammathana: its main teachers and traditions

SD 60.1c • Modern meditation: the rhetoric of Buddhist experience (HMS 3)

Why and how Buddhism is successful in the West

How some Japanese teachers are reinventing Buddhism

Why some people are leaving Buddhism and Vipassana

SD 60.1d • An evolutionary psychology of mindfulness (HMS 4)

How Asian teachers are teaching mindfulness and meditation

How meditation can deceive us and how not to be deceived

Modern forms of Theravāda meditations

Self-deception and how to avoid it

(HMS 5)

SD 60.1e • Delusion and experience: epistemology, psychology, Abhidhamma

McMindfulness & Buddhist delusion

How psychology is taking over Buddhism

How Abhidhamma can help us

(HMS 6)

SD 60.1f • Psychopathology of mindfulness: when religion and meditation fail

The Buddhist roots of TM (Transcendental Meditation)

Altered states of consciousness (ASC) in Buddhism

Why many Buddhists are narcissists

Early Buddhism and the extended mind

How streamwinners, once-returners, non-returners and arhats are certified today

The difficulties and dangers with Buddhist meditations: how to avoid them

Respecting the past and learning from the present for a Dhamma future

SUTTAdiscovery 60.-1ab

3rd rev ed 2023

Character analysis; Samatha, Vipassanā, Kammaṭṭhāna

THE LIVING WORD OF THE BUDDHA
The Buddha's Teachings in the Oldest Texts
Celebrating 20 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching, 2002-2022
Translations, essays and notes by Piya Tan ©Tan Beng Sin, 3rd rev ed 2023

Handbook of Meditation in Society 1+2

Sutta Discovery vol 60.1ab

Themes: Character analysis; and Samatha, Vipassana, Kammaṭṭhāna

Page

A.	TEXTUAL CONVENTIONS. (The Pali Canon, etc.) See the SD Guide
B.	TECHNICAL CONVENTIONS. (Abbreviations, etc.) See the SD Guide
<i>i-vi</i>	Detailed Table of Contents
SD 60.1a	Character analysis. Visuddhi,magga ch 3 and Vimutti,magga ch 6
1	(1) Meditation and character types. Temperament and meditation.
8	(2) Character typology. Upatissa and Buddhaghosa.
15	(3) The 6 character types. Temperament, character types, roots, faculties.
21	(4) Conclusion.
SD 60.1b	Samatha, Vipassanā, Kammaṭṭhāna
22	(1) Modern meditation and Burmese Vipassana. 1.1 Religion and Buddhism. 1.2 An outsider's view of Buddhist meditation.
26	(2) Vipassana. 2.1 Vipassana scholars. 2.2 Samatha-Vipassana terminology.
30	2.3 Burmese Vipassana. Ledi Sayadaw. Vipassana teachers and groups.
36	2.4 Vipassanā, Ledi Sayadaw and the "new Burmese meditation."
50	2.5 Developments in the Vipassana movement.
54	(3) Siamese Kammathana. Boran Kammaṭṭhāna.
57	3.2 The rhetoric of Kammaṭṭhāna.
59	(4) Samatha. Siamese Samatha tradition. Siamese meditation masters.
65	4.2 Early history of Siamese Kammaṭṭhāna and other developments.
67	4.3 Boran Kammathān. Esoteric Theravāda. Yogāvacara.
73	4.4 The old Siamese meditation. 4.5 History and Buddhism, lost and found.
78	4.6 The Siamese Samatha tradition.
79	(5) The "new Siamese meditation."
84	5.6 Ajahn Buddhadāsa. 5.8 Buddhadāsa's breath meditation teaching.
106	5.12 Ajahn Chah Subhaddo.
109	(6) The Samatha Trust. Boonman Poonyathiro.
121	(7) Samatha-vipassana variations. Insight, "dry" and "wet."
128	(8) Pa-Auk Sayadaw. Samatha and vipassana. 8.4 Breath meditation up to dhyana.
154	8.7 The 4 elements (kasiṇa).
161	(9) The 4 divine abodes. 168 (10) The 4 protective meditations.
170	(11) Discerning materiality in Vipassana. Buddhist atomism. <i>Kalāpa</i> .
186	(12) Discerning materiality (rūpa kammaṭṭhāna).
205	(13) Discerning mentality (nāma kammaṭṭhāna). Mental factors. Mental processes.
217	(14) Discerning the links of dependent arising. Buddha's & Sāriputta's method.
225	(15) Cultivating Vipassana. Vipassana knowledge. The 10 imperfections of insight.
239	A select bibliography

Meditation is the ground from which we rise into the space of freedom

Sutta translations & study: <http://dharmafarer.org>; Online sutta classes: t.me/suttasangha

ISBN 978-981-18-5504-7 (digital); ISBN 978-981-18-5505-4 (physical)

3rd revised edition ©2023 TAN Beng Sin
All rights reserved
Printed in Singapore

THE MINDING CENTRE, based in Singapore, is part of Piya Tan's Dharma ministry. It was founded in 2006 to provide non-religious Dharma-based services to those in need of counsel and solace. It also serves as a haven and hub for those seeking Dharma by way of critical thinking, creative feeling, meditation, sutta translation and study, spiritual experience, and sharing that light and joy. The Centre also supports and promotes Piya Tan in his full-time Buddhist and related work.

Courses: <http://themindingcentre.org>

THE SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES is part of the Living Word of the Buddha project which aspires to present and encourage an exploration of early Buddhism, both in a Dharma-inspired and academic manner for personal development as well as outreach work on a local and global scale. The Minding Centre and the Living Word of the Buddha project are motivated and guided by a quest for the historical Buddha and a vision of mere Buddhism.

Suttas: <http://dharmafarer.org>

THE MERE BUDDHIST VISION. We aspire to learn, teach and practise mere Buddha Dharma, or “non-religious Buddhism,” that is, Buddhism as simple as possible, as the teaching of the historical Buddha, so that it is open to all who seek true stillness and liberating wisdom. We aspire to compassionately and joyfully proclaim the possibility, necessity and urgency of gaining spiritual liberation in this life itself—at least as streamwinners, with or without dhyana—in keeping with the spirit of the Okkanta Saṃyutta (S 25). ***Mere Buddhism is easy: live it and be free.***

Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin), 1949-
SD 60 series theme: Meditation in society
SD 60.1ab: Character analysis; and Samatha, Vipassana, Kammaṭṭhāna
Series: The living word of the Buddha (2002-)
First published 2022; 3rd rev 2023; publisher: the author
ISBN 978-981-18-5504-7 (digital)
ISBN 978-981-18-5505-4 (physical)

YOU can help Buddhism grow

Your pledge & support bring Dharma to others:

- Print Dharma and related books, and Internet Dharma
- Support our sutta translation: <http://dharmafarer.org>
- Sponsor our full-time Dharma work and global ministry

WE GIVE
*for the sake of a beautiful mind,
as a support for the mind (in inner peace).*
(Aṭṭha Dāna Sutta, A 8.31/4:236)

60.1ab

Handbook of Meditation in Society 1+2

A brief historical and psychological survey by Piya Tan ©TAN Beng Sin, 2022, 3rd rev ed 2023

SD 60ab, Character analysis; Types of Meditation, is part of the multi-volume SD 60 Handbook of Meditation in Society: comprising (to date):

SD 60.1a	Character Analysis	SD 60.1d	An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness
SD 60.1b	Samatha, Vipassana, Kammatthana	SD 60.1e	Delusion and Experience
SD 60.1c	The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience	SD 60.1f	Psychopathology of Mindfulness

SD 60.1a Character analysis. Detailed Table of Contents (rev ed)

§	Topic	§	Topic
1	MEDITATION AND CHARACTER TYPES	3.1.1	Teachings on the character types
1.1	THE 4 MODES OF MEDITATION	3.1.2	Structure analysis of the types
1.1.1	The (Yuga,naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta (A 4.170)	3.2	AN ANALYSIS OF THE 6 CHARACTER TYPES
1.1.2	“Dharma-restlessness”	3.2.1	The lustful and the faithful
1.1.3	Samatha-vipassana and the 5 spiritual faculties	3.2.2	The hating and the intellectual
1.2	EXISTENTIAL ROOTS OF THE TYPES: CRAVING & IGNORANCE	3.2.3	The deluded and the speculative
1.2.1	Craving encompasses both lust and hate	3.2.4	Craving and views
1.2.2	Craving and view	3.3	THE 6 TYPES AND THE 5 FACULTIES
1.3	BUDDHAGHOSA’S PERSONALITY PSYCHOLOGY	3.3.1	The 5 faculties
2	CHARACTER TYPOLOGY: Upatissa and Buddhaghosa	3.3.2	Cultivating the faculties
2.1	UPATISSA’S TYPOLOGY (Vimutti,magga, ch 6)	3.3.3	The 4 right efforts
2.1.1	Upatissa’s character typology	3.3.4	The lustful
2.1.2	The 3 basic types and the 7 types of persons	3.3.5	The hating
2.2	BUDDHAGHOSA AND UPATISSA	3.3.6	The deluded
2.2.1	Buddhaghosa: the 7 types and the 3 types	3.3.7	The faithful
2.2.2	Elements and humours	3.3.8	The intellectual
3	THE 6 KINDS OF CHARACTER TYPES	3.3.9	The speculative
3.1	STRUCTURE OF THE 6 CHARACTER TYPES	4	CONCLUSION

SD 60.1b Types of meditation: Samatha, Vipassana, Kammatthana. Detailed contents

§	Topic	§	Topic
1	MEDITATION: MODERN, BURMESE & SIAMESE	2.1.1	Scholars’ views on meditation
1.1	RELIGION AND BUDDHISM	2.2	SAMATHA-VIPASSANA TERMINOLOGY
1.1.1	Academic study of religions	2.2.1	On the terms Samatha and Vipassana
1.1.2	Academic study of Buddhism	2.2.2	What is <i>vipassana</i> ?
1.1.3	Meditation studies	2.3	BURMESE VIPASSANA
1.1.4	Views on meditation: professional, practical	2.3.1	Burmese Buddhism and early Vipassana
1.2	AN OUTSIDER’S VIEW ON BUDDHIST MEDITATION	2.3.2	Pre-modern Vipassana in Burma
2	VIPASSANA	2.3.3	Ledi Sayadaw’s early years
2.1	VIPASSANA SCHOLARS	2.3.4	Ledi Sayadaw’s monastic learning

2.3.5	Ledi Sayadaw's writings	4.5.3	Monastic reforms in Siamese Buddhism
2.4	LEDI SAYADAW & THE “NEW BURMESE MEDITATION”	4.5.4	Modern Siamese monastic education
2.4.1	Vipassana, pure and dry	4.6	THE SIAMESE SAMATHA TRADITION
2.4.2	Ledi Sayadaw's influence	4.6.1	Bangkok was far away
2.4.3	Lone-star Vipassana teachers	5	THE “NEW SIAMESE MEDITATION”
2.4.4	Mohnyin Sayadaw (1872-1964)	5.1	MASTERS OF SIAMESE KAMMATTHANA
2.4.5	Mahasi Sayadaw (1904-1982)	5.2	AJAHN MUN BHURIDATTO (1870-1949)
2.4.6	Saya Thetgyi (1873-1945)	5.3	AJAHN LEE DHAMMADHĀRŌ (1907-1961)
2.4.7	U Ba Khin (1899-1931)	5.4	AJAHN KHAMDEE PABHASO (1902-1984)
2.4.8	Ledi Sayadaw and U Ba Khin compared	5.5	AJAHN SIM BUDDHĀCĀRŌ (1909-1992)
2.4.9	A practical Buddhism	5.6	AJAHN BUDDHADĀSĀ (1906-1993)
2.4.10	S N Goenka (1924-2013)	5.7	BUDDHADĀSĀ’S MEDITATION TEACHINGS
2.4.11	Goenka’s Vipassana rhetoric	5.7.1	Good meditation and its healthy habits
2.5	DEVELOPMENTS IN THE VIPASSANA MOVEMENT	5.7.2	The 8 supports (<i>paccaya</i>) of meditation
2.5.1	Goenka and the IMC teachers	5.7.3	Chasing the breath, counting the breath
2.5.2	Vipassana in the US	5.8	BUDDHADĀSĀ’S BREATH MEDITATION TEACHING
3	SIAMESE KAMMATTHANA	5.8.1	(1) Contemplation of the body
3.1	ADAPTING BUDDHISM, ADAPTING TO IT?	5.8.2	(2) Contemplation of feelings
3.1.1	From Burmese Vipassana teachers	5.8.3	(3) Contemplation of the mind
3.1.2	Nature of Buddhist meditation	5.8.4	(4) Contemplation of Dharma
3.1.3	Nature of Thai Kammathana	5.8.5	From samatha to vipassana
3.2	THE RHETORIC OF KAMMATTHANA	5.9	AJAHN THATE DESARANSI (1902-1994)
3.2.1	Practice-centred meditation	5.9.1	Friendship: Thammayut and forest monks
3.2.2	Meditation-centred network	5.10	AJAHN FEUANG JOTIKO (1915-1986)
3.2.3	Keeping to the suttas	5.10.2	His works
4	SAMATHA	5.11	AJAHN MAHA BUA (1913-2011)
4.1	SAMATHA IN EARLY BUDDHISM	5.11.1	The early years
4.1.1	Historical trend	5.11.5	Narrative propensity
4.1.2	Early Buddhist trends	5.12	AJAHN CHAH SUBHADDO (1918-1992)
4.1.3	Samatha, samadhi and dhyana	5.12.1	Chah’s meditation training
4.1.4	Meditations leading to dhyana	5.12.2	Training western monks
4.2	SIAMESE KAMMATTHANA: EARLY HISTORY	5.12.3	Ajahn Chah’s teachings
4.2.1	Pre-Siamese Buddhism	5.12.4	Associated monasteries of Chah lineage
4.2.2	Sukhothai and Ayutthaya	5.13	AJAHN SUWAT SUVACO (1919-2002)
4.2.3	Sri Lanka: The uses of ordination	6	THE SAMATHA TRUST
4.2.4	The rise of Siam	6.1	BOONMAN POONYATHIRO (1932-)
4.3	BORAN KAMMATTHANA	6.1.1	Youth
4.3.1	The “old Siamese meditation”	6.1.2	Boonman’s monkhood
4.3.2	Esoteric Theravada	6.1.3	As a layman: India and the west
4.3.3	The Yogāvacara tradition	6.1.4	The Tibetan connection
4.3.4	Shamanic meditation mantras	6.2	SAMATHA TRUST: BUDDHISM FOR TODAY
4.4	THE OLD SIAMESE MEDITATION	6.2.1	Early history of the Samatha Trust
4.4.1	Developments	6.2.2	Samatha Trust meditation
4.5	HISTORY, LOST AND FOUND	6.2.3	The Samatha Trust spirit
4.5.1	Burmese-Siamese hostilities	6.3	SAMATHA IN THE US
4.5.2	State and sangha	6.4	REFLECTIONS: BOONMAN, SAMATHA TRUST

6.4.1	The ideal lay teacher	8.7.1	The earth element (<i>pathavī dhātu</i>)
6.4.2	The ideal lay Buddhist community	8.7.2	The water element (<i>āpo dhātu</i>)
7	SAMATHA-VIPASSANA VARIATIONS	8.7.3	The fire element (<i>tejo dhātu</i>)
7.1	INSIGHT, "DRY" AND "WET"	8.7.4	The wind element (<i>vāyo dhātu</i>)
7.1.1	"Dry" insight	8.8	THE 2 INDEPENDENT "ELEMENTS"
7.1.2	The "wet" approach	8.8.1	The perception of light (<i>āloka saññā</i>)
7.2	SAMATHA-BASED VIPASSANA	8.8.2	The perception of space (<i>ākāsa saññā</i>)
7.2.1	Vipassana based on the divine abodes	8.9	THE 4 FORMLESS ATTAINMENTS (SAMĀPATTI)
7.3	VIPASSANA-BASED SAMATHA	8.9.1	The base of boundless space
7.3.1	Watching rise-and-fall	8.9.2	The base of boundless consciousness
7.3.2	The 3 characteristics	8.9.3	The base of nothingness
7.4	THE WINGS OF A FLYING BIRD	8.9.4	Neither-perception-nor-non-perception
7.4.1	Space and light	9	THE 4 DIVINE ABODES (<i>brahma, vihāra</i>)
7.4.2	The spirit of renunciation	9.1	CULTIVATION OF LOVINGKINDNESS
7.4.3	The 2 hands of meditation	9.1.1	How to cultivate lovingkindness
8	PA-AUK SAYADAW (1934-)	9.1.2	Cultivating lovingkindness by person
8.1	LIFE OF PA-AUK SAYADAW	9.1.3	Breaking the barriers
8.1.1	Early life and monkhood	9.1.4	The categories of beings
8.1.2	Pa Auk's teachings	9.1.5	Cultivating lovingkindness, 10 directions
8.1.3	Pa Auk's meditation methods	9.2	CULTIVATION OF COMPASSION
8.2	MINDFULNESS AND CLEAR COMPREHENSION	9.2.1	Compassion to the suffering
8.2.1	Mindfulness (<i>sati</i>)	9.2.2	Compassion to the unseen sufferer
8.2.2	The 4 focuses of mindfulness	9.3	CULTIVATION OF JOY
8.2.3	Clear comprehension	9.4	CULTIVATION OF EQUANIMITY
8.2.4	Concentration (<i>samādhi</i>)	10	THE 4 PROTECTIVE MEDITATIONS
8.2.5	The nature of dhyana (<i>jhāna</i>)	10.1	WHY THE 4 PROTECTIVE MEDITATIONS
8.3	SAMADHI WITHOUT DHYANA	10.1.1	Protect what from what?
8.3.0	The 3 kinds of samadhi	10.1.2	The 4 protective meditations
8.3.1	Momentary concentration	10.2	RECOLLECTION OF THE BUDDHA
8.3.2	Access concentration	10.3	THE PERCEPTION OF FOULNESS
8.3.3	Attainment concentration	10.3.1	Arousing the sign
8.4	BREATH MEDITATION UP TO DHYANA	10.3.2	The nature of the sign
8.4.1	What to focus on: The breath	10.4	THE RECOLLECTION OF DEATH
8.4.2	From sitting to dhyana	10.4.1	Attaining the 1st dhyana
8.4.3	Getting into dhyana	10.4.2	A sense of urgency
8.4.4	Remaining in dhyana	11	DISCERNING MATERIALITY IN VIPASSANA
8.4.5	Emerging from dhyana	11.1	BUDDHIST ATOMISM
8.5	ATTAINING DHYANA WITH OTHER METHODS	11.1.1	Developments in the <i>kalāpa</i> theory
8.5.1	The 32 body-parts meditation	11.1.2	The material clusters (<i>kalāpa</i>)
8.5.2	The skeleton meditation	11.2	THE 3 TYPES OF MATERIAL CLUSTERS
8.6	THE 10 KASINAS	11.2.1	Our 5-facultied existence
8.6.1	The 4 colour kasiṇas	11.2.2	Materiality of the 3 types of <i>kalāpa</i>
8.6.2	The white kasina	11.2.3	Sensitive matter (<i>pasāda</i>)
8.6.3	The other colour kasinas	11.3	THE 4 ORIGINS OF MATERIALITY
8.7	THE 4 ELEMENTS (KASINA)	11.3.0	How materiality arises
8.7.0	The element kasiṇas with dhyana	11.3.1	Karma-born materiality

11.3.2	Consciousness-born materiality	13.1.3	Discerning name and form
11.3.3	Temperature-born materiality	13.1.4	Discerning dhyana mental processes
11.3.4	Nutriment-born materiality	13.1.5	The mind-door process
11.3.5	Materiality in contemporary language	13.2	HOW TO DISCERN SENSE-SPHERE PROCESSES
11.4	THE 4 ELEMENTS (VIPASSANA)	13.2.1	Wise attention, unwise attention
11.4.1	The element kasiṇas	13.2.2	Discerning the mind-door process
11.4.2	The elements meditation, no dhyana	13.2.3	The 5-door process
11.5	DISCERNING THE 4 ELEMENTS	13.3	MENTAL, INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL
11.5.1	Sutta teachings on the 4 elements	13.3.0	How to discern external mentality
11.5.2	The 12 characteristics of 4 elements	13.3.1	Materiality internally/externally
11.6	MEDITATING ON MATERIALITY	13.3.2	Mentality internally/externally
11.6.1	10 ways of developing concentration	14	THE LINKS OF DEPENDENT ARISING
12	DISCERNING MATERIALITY	14.1	METHODS OF DISCERNING DEPENDENT ARISING
12.1	SEEING BODY TRANSLUCENCE AS A BLOCK	14.1.1	How <i>nāma,rūpa</i> arises
12.1.1	The 4 kinds of compactness	14.1.2	The 2 methods
12.1.2	Seeing through compactness	14.2	THE 5 TH METHOD OF DEPENDENT ARISING
12.1.3	How to see the material clusters	14.2.1	The 10 links and 3 cycles
12.1.4	Benefits of concentration	14.2.2	How to discern our past lives
12.2	ANALYSING THE MATERIAL CLUSTERS	14.2.3	Case study 1: A female meditator
12.2.1	The elements: sensitive, non-sensitive	14.2.4	Case study 2: A male meditator
12.2.2	How we see the 4 elements	14.2.5	How to discern more past lives
12.2.3	Seeing colour and smell of materiality	14.2.6	Discerning the future
12.2.4	How we “see” the taste of materiality	14.3	DEPENDENT ARISING: 1 ST METHOD
12.2.5	How we “see” nutritive essence	14.3.1	Dependent arising of the 18 elements
12.2.6	Seeing life-faculty & sex-faculty	14.3.2	The 3-life dependent arising
12.2.7	How we “see” the heart materiality	15	CULTIVATING VIPASSĀNA
12.3	ANALYZING THE SENSE-FACULTIES	15.1	VIPASSANA KNOWLEDGE
12.3.1	How we analyse the sensitivities	15.1.0	Introduction
12.3.2	How we analyse sex materiality	15.1.1	Cultivating Comprehension Knowledge
12.3.3	The 54 types of materiality of the eye	15.2	THE 40 PERCEPTIONS
12.4	SEEING CONSCIOUSNESS-BORN MATERIALITY	15.2.1	The 40 perceptions
12.5	SEEING TEMPERATURE-BORN MATERIALITY	15.3	THE 7 WAYS OF REFLECTING ON MATERIALITY
12.6	SEEING NUTRIMENT-BORN MATERIALITY	15.4	THE 7 WAYS OF REFLECTING ON MENTALITY
12.6.1	Nutriment and clusters	15.5	KNOWLEDGE OF ARISING AND CEASING
12.6.2	Eating and clusters	15.5.0	Introduction
12.7	OVERVIEW	15.5.1	Detailed dependent arising
12.7.1	The full practice	15.5.2	Discerning the nature of ceasing
12.7.2	Discernment of materiality: overview	15.5.3	The nature of arising and ceasing
12.8	MATERIALITY AND MENTALITY: AN OVERVIEW	15.5.4	Knowledge of arising and ceasing
12.8.1	Aggregates: materiality & mentality	15.6	THE 20 IMPERFECTIONS OF INSIGHT
12.8.2	No “radical pluralism”	15.6.2	The 10 imperfections of vipassana
13	DISCERNING MENTALITY	15.7	THE KNOWLEDGE OF DISSOLUTION
13.0	MENTAL FACTORS (<i>CETASIKA</i>)	15.8	THE 1 ST 11 KNOWLEDGES
13.1	THE 4 ASPECTS OF MENTALITY	15.9	KNOWING AND SEEING NIRVANA
13.1.1	Consciousness and mental factors	15.10	REVIEW KNOWLEDGE
13.1.2	Mental processes	15.11	THE ESSENCE OF SAMATHA-VIPASSANA

SUTTA DISCOVERY 60.1C 2022b

The rhetoric of Buddhist experience

THE LIVING WORD OF THE BUDDHA
The Buddha's Teachings in the Oldest Texts
Celebrating 20 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching, 2002-2022
©TAN Beng Sin (Piya Tan) 2022b

Handbook of Meditation in Society 3

Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1c *Theme: The rhetoric of Buddhist experience*

A psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism

For conventions (textual and technical) and bibliography, see **SD Guide**.

[PDF] To move around the book, click the BOOKMARK icon  on the far left panel; click the HEADINGS.

Page

1	<u>Detailed table of contents</u>
6 (1)	<u>A psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism.</u> Varieties of Buddhist modernism.
11 (2)	<u>Two areas of modern Buddhist experience.</u>
14 (3)	<u>The traditional Buddhist experience.</u>
18 (4)	<u>Western Buddhist experiences.</u>
19 (5)	<u>Revival of the “old meditations.”</u>
22 (6)	<u>How modern Buddhisms are created.</u>
28 (7)	<u>Buddhist modernism.</u>
35 (8)	<u>Buddhist ethnicism, Buddhist modernism: A few issues.</u>
49 (9)	<u>Modernized ethnic Buddhisms.</u>
71 (10)	<u>Japan: How Buddhism became a “religion.”</u>
88 (11)	<u>New Buddhisms: India, and the West.</u>
106 (12)	<u>Buddhist unbelief.</u>
128 (13)	<u>Leaving Theravāda.</u>
140 (14)	<u>Leaving Buddhism.</u>
142 (15)	<u>Religious intolerance.</u>
160 (16)	<u>Defending Buddhism against the Lotus Sutra.</u>
169 (17)	<u>Buddhism and affluence.</u>
178 (18)	<u>Pruning the Bodhi tree: Critical Buddhism.</u>
185 (19)	<u>When Zen is not Buddhism.</u>
194 (20)	<u>Vital conclusions:</u> Dialogue, ecumenism, communion, scholarship.

Buddhism is daily experience fully and joyfully understood

Sutta translations & study website: <http://dharmafarer.org>
Courses and messaging: <http://themindingcentre.org> & t.me/sutasangha

ISBN 978-981-18-5949-6 (Physical); ISBN 978-981-18-5950-2 (Digital)

All rights reserved
Printed in Singapore

THE MINDING CENTRE, based in Singapore, is part of Piya Tan's Dharma ministry. It was founded in 2006 to provide non-religious Dharma-based services to those in need of counsel and solace. It also serves as a haven and hub for those seeking Dharma by way of critical thinking, creative feeling, meditation, sutta translation and study, spiritual experience, and sharing that light and joy. The Centre also supports and promotes Piya Tan in his full-time Buddhist and related work.

Courses: <http://themindingcentre.org>

THE SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES is part of the Living Word of the Buddha project which aspires to present and encourage an exploration of early Buddhism, both in a Dharma-inspired and academic manner for personal development as well as outreach work on a local and global scale. The Minding Centre and the Living Word of the Buddha project are motivated and guided by a quest for the historical Buddha and a vision of mere Buddhism.

Suttas: <http://dharmafarer.org>

THE MERE BUDDHIST VISION. We aspire to learn, teach and practise mere Buddha Dharma, or “non-religious Buddhism,” that is, Buddhism as simple as possible, as the teaching of the historical Buddha, so that it is open to all who seek true stillness and liberating wisdom. We aspire to compassionately and joyfully proclaim the possibility, necessity and urgency of gaining spiritual liberation in this life itself—at least as streamwinners, with or without dhyana—in keeping with the spirit of the Okkanta Samyutta (S 25). ***Mere Buddhism is easy: live it and be free.***

Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin), 1949-

Title: Sutta Discovery 60.1c.

Theme: The rhetoric of Buddhist Experience: a psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism

Series: The living word of the Buddha (2002-)

First published 2022; publisher: the author

ISBN 978-981-18-5949-6 (physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-5950-2 (digital)



YOU can help Buddhism grow

Your pledge & support bring Dharma to others:

- Print Dharma and related books, and Internet Dharma
- Support our sutta translation: <http://dharmafarer.org>
- Sponsor our full-time Dharma work and global ministry

WE GIVE

*for the sake of a beautiful mind,
as a support for the mind (in inner peace).
(Attha Dāna Sutta, A 8.31/4:236)*

The essay **SD 60.1c, *The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience***, is part of the multi-volume **SD 60**, comprising (to date), with a related earlier essay:

- SD 56.22** Early Buddhist Psychology as experience (2020c)
- SD 60.1a** Character Analysis
- SD 60.1b** Samatha, Vipassana, Kammaṭṭhāna
- SD 60.1c** The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience
- SD 60.1d** An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness
- SD 60.1e** Delusion and Experience
- SD 60.1f** Psychopathology of Mindfulness

Detailed Table of Contents

Volume 60.1c	i
Theme: The rhetoric of Buddhist experience	i
Imprint page	ii
The Minding Centre: contacts and support	iii
Learning the Suttas & Piya Tan.....	iv
Sutta Discovery Series	vi
Detailed Table of Contents	1
1 A psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism	6
1.1 Modern Buddhist experience.....	6
1.1.1 Modernity and modernism.....	6
1.1.2 The 2 pairs of counter-currents.....	7
1.2 Varieties of Buddhist modernism.....	9
2 Two areas of modern Buddhist experience	11
2.1 Introduction.....	11
2.1.2 Buddhist studies	11
2.1.3 Buddhist scholarship.....	12
2.1.4 Scholars and practitioners	12
3 The traditional Buddhist experience	14
3.0 Introduction.....	14
3.1 Experience as currency.....	14
3.2 The modern Buddhist experience	15
3.3 Lights and shadows	16
4 Western Buddhist experience	18
4.0 Introduction.....	18
4.1 Buddhism, revised Westernized edition	18
5 Revival of the “old meditations”	19
5.0 Introduction.....	19
5.1 Contrasting responses to Buddhism	19

5.2 Buddhism as sexual experience	20
5.3 Samatha Kammaṭṭhāna.....	21
6 How modern Buddhisms are created.....	22
6.0 Introduction.....	22
6.1 The 2 roots of modern Buddhism	22
6.2 Psychology and Buddhism.....	23
6.3 The scholars' Buddhism.....	24
7 Buddhist modernism	28
7.0 Introduction.....	28
7.1 Modernism and modernity	28
7.2 Post-Buddha Buddhism and Protestant Buddhism	31
7.3 Buddhist modernism in Asia.....	33
8 Buddhist ethnicism, Buddhist modernism: A few issues.....	35
8.0 Introduction.....	35
8.1 Race, culture, empire	35
8.2 Liberation anthropology, liberation Buddhism	39
8.3 Liberating Zen.....	42
8.4 The Zen of modernism: D T Suzuki.....	46
9 Modernized ethnic Buddhisms	49
9.0 Introduction.....	49
9.1 Myanmar and Thailand: Sociocultural backgrounds.....	49
9.2 Burmese Buddhist modernism.....	52
9.3 Google Mindfulness: the ultimate modernist meditation	54
9.4 Thai Buddhism and modernism	56
9.5 Caste Buddhism and sectarian modernism in Sri Lanka	57
9.6 "Buddha relics" politics	59
9.6.1 Sinhala caste rivalry	59
9.6.2 Off-note on the world's largest Buddha relic !!!	59
9.6.3 Economics of ethnic Buddhism	60
9.7 Modernist Buddhist developments in education and scholarship	64
9.8 "Uncomfortable" English.....	67
10 Japan: How Buddhism became a "religion"	71
10.0 Introduction.....	71
10.1 The rise and fall of Buddhism.....	72
10.2 Japanese nationalism and "New Buddhisms"	73
10.4 Buddhism: The newer the better?	81
10.5 Reasons for the Meiji government's anti-Buddhist stance.....	82

10.6 How the Meiji Reformation transformed Japanese Buddhism.....	83
10.7 How Buddhism became a “religion” in Japan	86
10.8 Good scholars, true Buddhists	87
11 New Buddhsisms: India, and the West	88
11.0 Introduction.....	88
11.1 India: Neo-Buddhism.....	89
11.2 The Industrial Revolution and Buddhism	92
11.2.1 Reasons for the rise of the Industrial revolution.....	92
11.2.2 Energy	93
11.2.3 Agriculture	94
11.2.4 Dickensian insights	94
11.2.5 Western Buddhism as Neo-Buddhism.....	94
11.2.6 “Woke” Buddhism	95
11.3 Challenges to Neo-Buddhsisms	97
11.4 “Naturalized” Buddhism.....	99
12 Buddhist unbelief.....	106
12.0 Introduction.....	106
12.1 Leaving Buddhism: Unbelief and dissidence	106
12.1.3 Sāriputta’s faith	107
12.1.4 The houselord Citta’s faith	108
12.1.8 Principles of interfaith dialogue	111
12.2 Psychological aspects of leaving religion	112
12.3 Is Goenka’s Vipassana a New Religion?	114
12.3.9 Is Vipassana a religion?.....	118
12.3.11 The rhetoric of meditation experience	119
12.3.12 The “here and now”	120
12.3.13 Vipassana as a “tool”	120
12.3.14 The pure teachings of the Buddha	121
12.4 Leaving Vipassana	121
12.4.2 Drifting Through Samsara, 2002 ch 1 The conversion career	122
13 Leaving Theravāda	128
13.1 Leaving Theravāda in Myanmar	128
13.2 The Mopya Gaing (the Sky Blue Sect)	132
13.3 Types of informants	135
Table 13.4 List of deviant sects	140
14 Leaving Buddhism.....	140
14.1 We cannot leave when we have not reached.....	140

14.2 "Outsider"	141
14.3 Keep going, we're not there yet.....	142
15 Religious intolerance	142
15.1 Blind faith and religious imperialism.....	142
15.2 The biological basis of religious intolerance	143
15.3 The psychological bases of religious intolerance	144
15.3.1 Defence mechanism	144
15.3.2 Cognitive dissonance	145
15.3.3 Conversion.....	145
15.3.4 Religion as power and prejudice	146
15.3.5 Power, plenty, pleasure.....	147
15.3.6 World religions	147
15.4 The historical basis of religious intolerance	148
15.5 The philosophical basis of religious intolerance	149
15.6 The scriptural basis of religious intolerance	150
15.7 The theological basis of religious intolerance	154
15.7.6 The Buddhist answers to Baha'i assimilation	156
15.7.7 The God-idea in Buddhism	157
15.7.8 Religious imperialism.....	158
15.7.9 God-religions and religious imperialism.....	158
15.8 Religious tolerance	159
16 Defending Buddhism against the Lotus Sutra	160
16.1 A Christianized Sutra?	160
16.2 Why was the Lotus Sutra written?	161
16.3 The Lotus Sutra rejects the path	161
16.4 An exception is <i>not</i> the rule	163
16.5 The arhat may be degraded, but not downgraded	166
16.6 One buddha is sufficient in our universe	166
16.7 The "polemic of accommodation"	167
16.8 The Lotus Sutra as a reaction against the Abhidharma	168
17 Buddhism and affluence	169
17.1 Affluence and religion	169
17.2 The Axial Age	170
17.3 The Iron Age and urbanization.....	171
17.4 Wealth and renunciation	172
17.5 Religious retirement plans	173
17.5.3 An ideal case?	174

17.6 Renunciation as self-reliance	177
18 Pruning the Bodhi tree	178
18.1 Critical Buddhism: origin, nature and significance.....	178
18.1.1 Machida Muneo	178
18.1.2 HAKAMAYA Noriaki	179
18.1.3 MATSUMOTO Shirō.....	180
18.2 "Original enlightenment"?	181
18.3 Buddha-nature	182
18.4 Questioning themselves.....	182
18.5 Buddha, sect and society.....	183
18.5.1 Paul Swanson.....	183
18.6 How critical is Critical Buddhism?	184
19 When Zen is not Buddhism.....	186
19.3 Suzuki Zen and after.....	187
19.4 Returning to early Buddhism.....	189
19.5 The inevitability of Critical Buddhism.....	190
19.6 Japanese Buddhist aesthetics contra Suzuki.....	192
19.7 After the storm.....	193
20 Vital conclusions (thus far)	195
20.1 Mythology	195
20.2 Dialogue and ecumenism	196
20.3 Dialogue: Interfaith, intrafaith	198
20.4 Communion and ecumenism	199
20.4.1 Definition of ecumenism	199
20.4.2 Ecumenism: 3 levels	200
20.5 Spiritual scholarship	203
Support our sutta translation work: reasons and history	204

SUTTA DISCOVERY 60.1d

2023a

An evolutionary psychology of mindfulness

THE LIVING WORD OF THE BUDDHA

The Buddha's Teachings in the Oldest Texts

Celebrating 20 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching, 2002-2022

Handbook of Meditation in Society 4

Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1d

Theme: An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness

Buddhist experience: The individual and society

©TAN Beng Sin (Piya Tan) 2023a

For conventions (textual and technical) and bibliography, see **SD Guide**.

[PDF] To move around the book, click the BOOKMARK icon  on the far left panel; click the HEADINGS.

Page

- | | |
|---------|--|
| 7 | <u>Detailed table of contents</u> |
| 12 (1) | <u>Mindfulness in daily life.</u> |
| 42 (2) | <u>The body-mind process.</u> |
| 61 (3) | <u>The social construct of Buddhism.</u> |
| 77 (4) | <u>Buddhist: religion or path?</u> |
| 113 (5) | <u>Approaches to Buddhism: the scholar and the practitioner.</u> |
| 161 (6) | <u>Teacher-constructed Buddhsisms.</u> |
| 196 (7) | <u>A moral psychology of self-deception.</u> |

Mindfulness is knowing ourself so that we awaken to true freedom

Sutta translations & study website: <http://dharmafarer.org>

Courses and messaging:

<http://themindingcentre.org>;

t.me/suttasangha (Global Sutta Community telegram)

ISBN 978-981-18-6493-3 (Physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-6494-0 (Digital)

©2023a TAN Beng Sin

All rights reserved
Printed in Singapore

THE MINDING CENTRE, based in Singapore, is part of Piya Tan's Dharma ministry. It was founded in 2006 to provide non-religious Dharma-based services to those in need of counsel and solace. It also serves as a haven and hub for those seeking Dharma by way of critical thinking, creative feeling, meditation, sutta translation and study, spiritual experience, and sharing that light and joy. The Centre also supports and promotes Piya Tan in his full-time Buddhist and related work.

Courses: <http://themindingcentre.org>

THE SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES is part of the Living Word of the Buddha project which aspires to present and encourage an exploration of early Buddhism, both in a Dharma-inspired and academic manner for personal development as well as outreach work on a local and global scale. The Minding Centre and the Living Word of the Buddha project are motivated and guided by a quest for the historical Buddha and a vision of mere Buddhism.

Suttas: <http://dharmafarer.org>

THE MERE BUDDHIST VISION. We aspire to learn, teach and practise mere Buddha Dharma, or “non-religious Buddhism,” that is, Buddhism as simple as possible, as the teaching of the historical Buddha, so that it is open to all who seek true stillness and liberating wisdom. We aspire to compassionately and joyfully proclaim the possibility, necessity and urgency of gaining spiritual liberation in this life itself—at least as streamwinners, with or without dhyana—in keeping with the spirit of the Okkanta Saṃyutta (S 25). ***Mere Buddhism is easy: live it and be free.***

Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin), 1949-

Title: Sutta Discovery 60.1d.

Theme: An evolutionary psychology of mindfulness: Buddhist experience – the individual and society

Series: The living word of the Buddha (2002-)

First published 2023; publisher: the author

ISBN 978-981-18-6493-3 (physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-6494-0 (digital)

YOU can help Buddhism grow

Your pledge & support bring Dharma to others:

- Print Dharma and related books, and Internet Dharma
- Support our sutta translation: <http://dharmafarer.org>
- Sponsor our full-time Dharma work and global ministry

WE GIVE

*for the sake of a beautiful mind,
as a support for the mind (in inner peace).
(Aṭṭha Dāna Sutta, A 8.31/4:236)*

The essay, **SD 60.1d, An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness**, is part of the multi-volume SD 60 Handbook of meditation in Society, comprising (to date):

- SD 60.1a** Character Analysis
- SD 60.1b** Samatha, Vipassana, Kammaṭṭhāna
- SD 60.1c** The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience
- SD 60.1d** An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness
- SD 60.1e** Delusion and Experience
- SD 60.1f** Psychopathology of Mindfulness

Detailed Table of Contents

SUTTA DISCOVERY VOL 60.1D	1
THEME: AN EVOLUTIONARY PSYCHOLOGY OF MINDFULNESS	1
IMPRINT PAGE	ii
THE MINDING CENTRE: CONTACTS AND SUPPORT	iii
LEARNING THE SUTTAS & PIYA TAN.....	iv
SOME SELECTED BOOKS BY PIYA TAN	v
SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES.....	vi
DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	7
1 MINDFULNESS IN DAILY LIFE	12
1.0 What is “evolutionary psychology”?	12
1.1 What is experience in early Buddhism?	12
1.1.1 Body and mind	12
Table 1.1.1.6 The 7 aspects of the mind. Cf SD 60.1e (Table 7.4) The 4 ultimates, sense-bases, and elements.	16
1.1.2 Experience and knowledge	18
1.2 The nature of experience.....	20
1.2.1 Experience and its objects	20
1.2.2 Supports for Buddhist experience	21
1.2.3 How do we know what we are experiencing?	25
1.2.4 How do we know it is a <i>Buddhist</i> experience?	25
1.2.5 Active and passive aspects of experience.....	26
1.2.5.1 The difference between experience and consciousness	26
1.2.5.2 A strong mind can grow in even a disabled body	27
1.2.5.3 How our body is connected with the mind.....	28
1.2.5.4 How we think	28
1.2.5.5 The 3 aspects of our mind: <i>Citta mano viññāṇa</i>	29
1.2.6 How our thinking process evolves	30
1.2.7 Vitakka,vičāra	31
Table 1.2.7.3. <i>Vitakka</i> and <i>vicāra</i>	33

1.2.8 Perception and conception.....	33
1.2.9 How does the mind construct our experiences?	36
1.2.10 The suffering pericope	38
1.3 Cognition: distributed and asymmetrical.....	39
1.3.1 The “arising-of-mind” pericope	39
1.3.2 Cognitive binding	40
1.3.3 Cognition: a structural symmetry	41
2 THE BODY-MIND PROCESS	42
2.1 Body-mind in Buddhist meditation.....	42
2.1.1 The conscious body.....	42
2.1.1.3 Mental object (<i>dhamma</i>).....	43
2.1.1.8 The body-based mind	45
2.1.1.9 The physical base of mind and mind-consciousness	46
2.1.2 What is the purpose of all this?	47
2.2 “All the elements”	48
2.2.0 Investigating reality.....	48
2.2.1 Form: Our conscious body; the 6 elements; the 18 elements.....	49
2.2.2 Feelings: The 6 elements	50
2.2.3 Formations: the 6 elements.....	52
2.2.4 Consciousness: The 3 elements	53
2.2.5 Samsara and nirvana: The 2 elements	54
2.2.6 Dependent arising as a conditioned element.....	55
2.2.7 Nirvana: the unconditioned element.....	58
2.2.8 Speaking of nirvana.....	60
3 THE SOCIAL CONSTRUCTION OF BUDDHISM	61
3.1 Buddhism and religion.....	61
3.1.1 Buddhism as self-development.....	61
3.1.2 Who invented religion?.....	63
3.2 Buddhism and its developments	66
3.2.1 What’s wrong with Buddhist modernism?	66
3.2.2 Buddhism before religion, as a non-religious “path”	67
3.2.3 Buddhism and the Axial Age	69
3.3 Buddhism as lay practice	70
3.3.1 The lay discipline (<i>gīhā.vinaya</i>)	70
3.3.2 The laity and moral training	72
3.3.3 Evolution of the 5 precepts.....	72
Table 3.3.3.2 The 10 courses of action [karma]	74
3.3.4 Laity as saints	75

4 BUDDHISM: RELIGION OR PATH?	77
4.1 Buddhism as a religion.....	77
4.1.1 Minding our own Buddhism.....	77
4.1.2 Out of the Buddha's hands?	80
4.1.3 Buddhism as a path.....	82
Table 4.1.3.1 The 3 trainings (basic practice) for laity and renunciants.....	82
4.1.4 The dynamics of Buddhist moral ethics	82
4.1.5 Buddhist spiritual psychology as mental health	85
4.2 McMindfulness [SD 60.1c (1.9.2)].....	85
4.2.1 Marketing mindfulness	85
4.2.2 Why McMindfulness is so successful.....	86
4.2.3 What's wrong with McMindfulness?	86
4.3 Aspects of modern lay Buddhism	89
4.3.1 Modern Buddhism in the US.....	89
4.3.2 Our real task as lay Buddhists	90
4.4 Buddhism and modern science	91
4.4.1 Is Buddhism scientific?.....	91
4.4.2 The Chicago World Fair: Race and religion	94
4.4.3 The doctrine of evolution	95
4.4.4 Protestant Buddhism?	97
4.4.5 Meditation and science.....	98
4.4.6 Where Buddhism and science may meet	100
4.4.7 Non-duality in early Buddhism	102
4.4.8 The teacher or the teaching?.....	104
4.4.9 Being <i>a</i> Buddhist, <i>being</i> Buddhist	105
4.5 Modern Buddhism in Malaysia.....	108
4.5.1 How other religions and cultures influence local Buddhism	108
4.5.2 Priestly politics	111
4.5.3 Buddhism and Buddha Dharma	112
5 APPROACHES TO BUDDHISM: THE SCHOLAR AND THE PRACTITIONER.....	113
5.1 Early Buddhism and cultural Buddhisms.....	113
5.1.1 Early Buddhism	113
5.1.2 Cultural Buddhisms	120
5.1.3 Textual Buddhisms	122
Figure 5.1.3.4 The development of later Buddhisms	124
5.2 Evolution of modern Buddhism.....	124
5.2.1 Texts and contexts: Historians and ethnographers	124
5.2.2 The vital role and need for textual Buddhism	126

5.2.3 Socio-karma (Group karma).....	129
5.3 Scholars' Buddhisms.....	132
5.3.0 Reynolds' 4 modes of scholarship.....	132
5.3.1 Mode I scholarship: The Pali Text Society and Max Weber.....	133
5.3.2 Mode II scholarship: Spiro in Burma	136
5.3.3 Mode III scholarship: Gombrich in Sri Lanka.....	138
5.3.4 Mode IV scholarship: Tambiah in Thailand.....	141
5.3.5 Professional courtesy and academic honesty.....	149
5.3.6 Schopen's Buddhism.....	151
5.3.7 The 2 duties of a practitioner.....	154
5.3.8 Practitioners and professors of Buddhism.....	157
5.4 Overview and recap.....	158
5.4.1 Early Buddhist Texts.....	158
5.4.2 Modern Buddhist studies.....	159
6 TEACHER-CONSTRUCTED BUDDHISMS	161
6.1 Privatization and certification	161
6.1.1 Measuring meditation	161
6.1.2 Measuring sainthood	163
6.1.3 The middle of the middle way	166
6.2 Measuring the breath (A modern account of the awakening process)	167
6.2.1 Sunlun Sayadaw (1878-1952)	167
6.2.2 Theinngu Sayadaw (1913-1973)	170
6.2.3 Sunlun Sayadaw's meditation practice and experience	172
6.2.4 Theinngu Sayadaw's meditation practice and experience	175
6.2.5 Authority and controversy	182
6.2.6 So, you're an arhat! Charisma and Dharma.....	186
6.3 Whose Buddhism?.....	188
6.3.1 Make my Buddhism	188
6.3.2 My Buddhism, your Buddhism.....	188
6.3.3 Creative teachers, creative misreadings	194
6.3.4 Buddhism as a conversation	196
7 A MORAL PSYCHOLOGY OF SELF-DECEPTION	197
7.1 Self-deception in Buddhism	197
7.1.1 How we deceive ourselves.....	197
7.1.2 Religious belief formation.....	199
7.2 Unwholesome religious belief formation process	201
7.2.1 Unwholesome religious beliefs.....	201
7.2.2 Religious belief and faith.....	201

7.2.3 Defence mechanisms and self-deception.....	203
7.2.4 All that we know is provisional	203
7.3 Developments in self-deception studies	205
7.3.1 Divided minds: Psychological definitions, philosophical difficulties.....	205
7.3.2 Robert Trivers' theory	207
7.3.3 Evolutionary aspect of self-deception	209
7.4 Deception and delusion	209
7.4.1 Delusion or self-deception?	209
7.4.2 Belief, delusion and beyond.....	213
7.5 Self-deception in modern Buddhism	216
7.5.1 Notions of Self and Soul	216
7.5.2 Self-view: The root of self-deception.....	218
7.6 The 3 fetters of self-deception	219
7.6.1 Why 3 fetters?.....	219
7.6.2 Self-identity view: The status is not the state.....	221
7.6.3 Historical and social bases for self-identity view	222
7.6.4 Attachment to rituals and vows: Seeking answers outside of us	227
7.6.5 Rituals and “make believe”	229
7.6.6 The benefits of wholesome rituals	231
7.6.7 Doubt: Words as truth	232
7.7 Resolving self-deception.....	235
7.7.1 Healthy self-formation and streamwinning.....	235
7.7.2 “Seven at most”: The significance of the number 7	236
7.7.3 Understanding the self.....	240
7.7.4 Seeing ourselves as we truly are	241
7.7.5 Understanding nonself.....	245
WHY SUPPORT OUR SUTTA TRANSLATION WORK: REASONS AND HISTORY	249

SUTTA DISCOVERY 60.1e

2023b

Delusion and Experience: epistemology, psychology and the Abhidhamma

THE LIVING WORD OF THE BUDDHA
The Buddha's Teachings in the Oldest Texts
Celebrating 21 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching, 2002-2023

Handbook of Meditation in Society 5

Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1e **Theme: Delusion and Experience**

Epistemology, psychology and the Abhidhamma
©TAN Beng Sin (Piya Tan) 2023b

For conventions (textual and technical) and bibliography, see **SD Guide**.
[PDF] To move around the book, click the BOOKMARK icon  on the far right or left panel; click the HEADINGS.

Page	
7	Detailed table of contents
14	(1) "Mindfulness" and Buddhist Meditation
36	(2) A brief history of mindfulness
46	(3) Mindfulness and awareness
68	(4) The versatility of mindfulness
79	(5) The nature of contemplative knowledge
90	(6) Mindfulness: from anchoring to plunging to floating
103	(7) A psychology of knowing
117	(8) Early Buddhist epistemology
136	(9) The 52 mental factors (<i>cetasikas</i>)
164	(10) Conceptual knowledge
182	(11) Wisdom and spiritual knowledge
191	(12) Delusion and mental aberration
213	(13) Delusion and Abhidhamma

"What we know is what we sense: thinking makes sense of it."

Sutta translations & study website: <http://dharmafarer.org>

Courses and messaging:
<http://themindingcentre.org>;
t.me/suttasangha (Global Sutta Community telegram)

ISBN 978-981-18-8013-1 (Physical)
ISBN 978-981-18-8014-8 (Digital)

©2023b TAN Beng Sin

All rights reserved
Printed in Singapore

THE MINDING CENTRE, based in Singapore, is part of Piya Tan's Dharma ministry. It was founded in 2006 to provide non-religious Dharma-based services to those in need of counsel and solace. It also serves as a haven and hub for those seeking Dharma by way of critical thinking, creative feeling, meditation,utta translation and study, spiritual experience, and sharing that light and joy. The Centre also supports and promotes Piya Tan in his full-time Buddhist and related work.

Courses: <http://themindingcentre.org>

THE SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES is part of the Living Word of the Buddha project which aspires to present and encourage an exploration of early Buddhism, both in a Dharma-inspired and academic manner for personal development as well as outreach work on a local and global scale. The Minding Centre and the Living Word of the Buddha project are motivated and guided by a quest for the historical Buddha and a vision of mere Buddhism.

Suttas: <http://dharmafarer.org>

THE MERE BUDDHIST VISION. We aspire to learn, teach and practise mere Buddha Dharma, or “non-religious Buddhism,” that is, Buddhism as simple as possible, as the teaching of the historical Buddha, so that it is open to all who seek true stillness and liberating wisdom. We aspire to compassionately and joyfully proclaim the possibility, necessity and urgency of gaining spiritual liberation in this life itself—at least as streamwinners, with or without dhyana—in keeping with the spirit of the Okkanta Saṃyutta (S 25). ***Mere Buddhism is easy: live it and be free.***

Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin), 1949-

Title: Sutta Discovery 60e: Handbook of Meditation in Society 5

Theme: Delusion and Experience: epistemology, psychology and the Abhidhamma

Series: The living word of the Buddha (2002-)

First published 2023; publisher: the author

ISBN 978-981-18-8013-1 (physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-8014-8 (digital)

YOU can help Buddhism grow

Your pledge & support bring Dharma to others:

- Print Dharma and related books, and Internet Dharma
- Support ourutta translation: <http://dharmafarer.org>
- Sponsor our full-time Dharma work and global ministry

WE GIVE

*for the sake of a beautiful mind,
as a support for the mind (in inner peace).
(Aṭṭha Dāna Sutta, A 8.31/4:236)*

The essay, **SD 60.1e Delusion and experience**, is part of the multi-volume *SD 60 Handbook of Meditation in Society*, comprising (to date):

- SD 60.1a** Character Analysis
- SD 60.1b** Samatha, Vipassana, Kammaṭṭhāna
- SD 60.1c** The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience
- SD 60.1d** An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness
- SD 60.1e** Delusion and Experience
- SD 60.1f** Psychopathology of Meditation

Detailed Table of Contents

Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1e	i
Theme: Delusion and Experience	i
IMPRINT PAGE	ii
THE MINDING CENTRE: CONTACTS AND SUPPORT	iii
LEARNING THE SUTTAS & PIYA TAN	iv
SOME SELECTED BOOKS BY PIYA TAN	v
SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES.....	vi
Detailed Table of Contents	7
1 “Mindfulness” and Buddhist meditation	14
1.1 Buddhist meditation: Historical and social realities	14
1.1.1 Persistent influences of Buddhist meditation.....	14
1.1.2 Mindfulness as a product and its consequences	18
1.1.3 Plagiarism and disavowal?	21
1.1.4 Debates over Mindfulness	24
1.1.5 “Mindfulness”: Trait, state or intervention?.....	28
1.1.6 Mindfulness ^{KZ} as an intervention	31
1.1.7 Mindfulness-Based Interventions (MBIs).....	31
2 A brief history of mindfulness	36
2.1 Mindfulness: Right and wrong	36
2.2 What it means to be “mindful”	39
2.3 Mindfulness and memory	40
2.4 Mindfulness and perception	41
2.5 Attention and the past.....	42
3 Mindfulness and awareness	46
3.1 Clear awareness (<i>sampajañña</i>).....	46
3.2 The uses of mindfulness and awareness.....	48
3.3 The ethics of mindfulness and awareness	50
3.4 The gradual progress of mindfulness and awareness.....	51
3.5 Mental harmony in daily life	53

3.6 Mindfulness-awareness and sleeping.....	54
3.7 Mindfulness-awareness and positive emotions	55
3.8 Mindfulness-awareness and the 3 rd dhyana.....	56
3.9 Clear awareness of emptiness	57
3.10 Mindfulness and dying well	60
3.11 Mindfulness and penetration (<i>sati,nepakka</i>).....	61
Table 3.11.5 <i>Sati,nepakka</i> in dharma sets	66
4 The versatility of mindfulness	68
4.1 The 2 kinds of mindfulness	68
4.2 Location of mindfulness.....	71
Table 4.2 Location of <i>sati</i> among the dharma sets (based on Analayo 2003:50).....	71
4.3 To sense, to know or to cognize	73
4.4 The range of knowledge: <i>Ditṭha sutta muta</i> and <i>viññāta</i>	75
5 The nature of contemplative knowledge.....	79
5.1 Embodying the mind	79
5.2 Dimensions of mindfulness: The 4 satipatthanas	81
Table 5.2 Mindfulness and awareness.....	82
5.3 Dimensions of mindfulness: (1) Somatic awareness	82
5.4 Dimensions of mindfulness: (2) Hedonic awareness	84
5.5 Dimensions of mindfulness: (3) Conative awareness	85
5.6 Dimensions of mindfulness: (4) Dharma awareness.....	86
5.7 Metaphors for mindfulness and awareness	88
6 Mindfulness: From anchoring to plunging to floating	90
6.1 From anchoring to plunging.....	90
6.1.1 The Sotānugata Sutta (A 4.191)	90
6.1.2 Mindfulness in early Abhidhamma	91
6.1.3 Mindfulness and modern Vipassana meditation.....	92
6.2 From plunging to floating.....	94
6.2.1 Memory.....	94
6.3 Apilāpana and pilāpana.....	96
6.4 The wobble.....	98
6.5 The 3 friends of right cultivation.....	100
7 A psychology of knowing	103
7.1 Do we know what we are?.....	103
7.2 Experience and knowing	104
Table 7.2.3 The 18 elements of cognition.....	105
7.3 Contact and feeling	106
Table 7.3.3 The basic cognitive process leading up to feeling [SD 60.1d (1.1.1.3)].....	108

7.4 The aggregates and the sense-bases	111
Table 7.4.2 An event of seeing in terms of the aggregates and the sense-bases.....	111
Table 7.4.3 The 4 ultimates as aggregates, sense-bases, and elements	112
Table 7.4.4 The 7 consciousness elements (<i>viññāṇa,dhātu</i>) and 89 cittas [Table 7.4.3].....	114
7.5 Mental proliferation.....	115
8 Early Buddhist epistemology.....	117
8.1 Validity of knowledge.....	117
8.2 Perceptual knowledge	119
Table 8.3: The 28 forms of materiality [SD 17.2a (10)]	121
8.3 An Abhidhamma analysis of the Dharma	122
8.3.4 The Abhidhamma and mental programming.....	124
8.3.5 Derived matter.....	125
8.4 From Dhamma to dhammas	126
8.4.2 The dhamma theory.....	126
8.5 The <i>paññatti</i> theory	127
8.6 “Own-nature” (<i>sabhāva</i>).....	128
8.7 <i>Paññatti</i> : Naming and meaning	132
Table 8.7.1 Comparative table: <i>nāma,paññatti</i> and <i>attha,paññatti</i>	133
9 The 52 mental factors (<i>cetasika</i>).....	136
9.1 The nature of the cetasikas.....	136
Table 9.1 The 52 mental factors (<i>cetasika</i>).....	137
Table 9.1.3 Cittas, cetasikas, aggregates and knowledge [cf Table 5.2; 8.1.5]	138
9.2 The 7 universals	138
9.3 (I) The 13 moral variables (<i>añña,samāna cetasika</i>) [Table 9.1].....	139
9.4 (B) The 6 occasional cetasikas (<i>pakiṇṇaka cetasika</i>)	141
9.5 (II) The 14 unwholesome cetasikas (<i>akusala cetasika</i>) [Table 9.1].....	143
9.5.2 (C) The 4 unwholesome universal cetasikas: (14-17)	143
9.6 (D) The 10 unwholesome occasional cetasikas: (18-27)	144
9.6.1 (18) Greed	144
9.6.2 (19) Wrong view.....	145
9.6.6 Conceit, hatred, envy and avarice	146
9.6.7 Worry	148
9.6.8 Doubt about the wholesome	148
9.6.9 [25-26] Sloth, torpor, sloth and torpor	149
9.6.12 Doubt about the unwholesome	150
9.7 (III) The 25 beautiful factors (<i>sobhana cetasika</i>) [Table 9.1]	151
9.8 (E) The 19 beautiful universals (<i>sobhana sādhāraṇa</i>)	153
9.8.3 (28) 1 Faith (<i>saddhā</i>)	153

9.8.6 (29) 2 Mindfulness (<i>sati</i>)	154
9.8.8 (30) 3 Moral shame (<i>hiri</i>) & (31) 4 moral fear (<i>ottappa</i>)	155
9.8.12 (32) 5 Non-greed (<i>alobha</i>), (33) 6 Non-hatred (<i>adosa</i>)	156
9.8.15 (34) 7 Neutrality of mind (<i>tatra,majjhattatā</i>).....	158
9.9 (35-46) The 6 <i>citta-kāya</i> pairs (<i>yugalaka</i>)	158
9.9.4 (35+36) The tranquillity pair (<i>passaddhi yugalaka</i>	160
9.9.5 (37+38) The lightness pair (<i>lahutā yugalaka</i>)	160
9.9.6 (39+40) The malleability pair (<i>mudutā yugalaka</i>).....	160
9.9.7 (41+42) The wieldiness pair (<i>kammaññatā yugalaka</i>)	160
9.9.8 (43+44) The proficiency pair (<i>paguññatā yugalaka</i>)	161
9.9.9 (45+46) The rectitude pair (<i>ujjukatā yugalaka</i>).....	161
9.10 (47-49) (F) The 3 abstinences (<i>virati</i>).....	161
9.11 (50+51) (G) The 2 illimitables (<i>appamañña</i>)	162
9.12 (52) Non-delusion (<i>amoha</i>).....	162
10 Conceptual knowledge.....	164
Table 10 Classes of knowledge (<i>khandha</i> -based) [cf Table 5.2]	164
10.1 The range and types of human knowledge.....	164
10.2 How do we know?.....	166
10.3 Theory of the 2 truths	170
10.4 The 2 truths in the suttas	172
10.5 The validity of the 2 truths.....	175
10.6 Sammuti and samutti,sacca	178
10.7 Two views of the same truth	179
10.8 The 2 teachings: <i>pariyāya</i> and <i>nippariyāya</i>	180
11 Wisdom and spiritual knowledge	182
11.1 Knowledge “to be developed”	182
11.2 Knowledge as perception (<i>saññā</i>)	182
11.3 Knowledge as view (<i>ditṭhi</i>).....	183
11.4 Direct knowledge (<i>ñāṇa</i>).....	184
11.5 The 3 kinds of wisdom	189
12 Delusion and mental aberration	191
12.1 Delusion as key motivator.....	191
12.2 The 3 kinds of mental aberration.....	192
12.3 Aberrant perception: Defective sensing	195
12.4 Aberrant mind: Defective thinking	201
12.5 Aberrant view: Defective knowing.....	202
12.5.4 Early Buddhist ontology	203
12.5.7 Skillful means	205

12.6 How science influences religion.....	206
12.7 The mind: Distributed and extended.....	209
12.7.1 Distributed mind	209
12.7.2 Extended mind	209
12.7.3 Early Buddhist theory of mind	210
12.7.4 The mind and other bodies.....	210
12.7.5 Nonself and the mind.....	211
13 Delusion and Abhidhamma.....	213
13.1 The nature of delusion.....	213
13.1.1 Delusion as a modern Buddhist term.....	213
13.1.2 Delusion and ignorance	213
13.1.3 Root of ignorance.....	214
13.1.4 Delusional belief.....	214
13.1.5 Sin-belief vs non-identification	215
13.1.6 The 6 wrong views	216
13.2 Delusion as a mental factor (<i>cetasika</i>).....	217
13.2.2 Citta and cetasikas	217
13.2.3 Association and inclusion.....	218
13.3 Unwholesome or pathological?	218
13.3.2 When is a delusion pathological?	218
13.3.3 Analysis of pathological delusion [Referring to 13.3.2]	219
13.4 Types of delusion	220
13.4.1 Delusion: bizarre or non-bizarre	221
13.4.2 Functional or organic	222
13.4.3 Genetic or biological	222
13.4.4 Motivated or defensive.....	222
13.4.5 Monothematic or polythematic.....	223
13.4.6 Circumscribed and elaborated.....	224
13.4.7 Primary and secondary	224
13.5 Delusion and irrationality.....	224
13.5.3 Merit-transfer as ego-defence	225
13.6 Overlapping of delusion and self-deception.....	226
13.6.3 An overlap between delusion and self-deception	228
13.7 Trajectories in modern Buddhism.....	228
13.7.1 Psychologization of Buddhism	228
13.7.2 “Judaification” of Buddhism	229
13.7.4 Tikkun olam, tikkun ha-olam.....	230
13.8 Delusion, belief, view	230

13.8.1 Belief, uncountable and countable.....	231
13.8.2 Cognitive faith, affective faith.....	231
13.8.3 The 4 influxes	231
13.8.4 <i>Ditṭhi</i> : wrong view(s), right view.....	232
13.9 The 12 unwholesome cittas	233
Table 13.9 The 89 and 121 cittas (a summary) (Abhs:BRS 1999:28)	234
13.9.1 The cittas rooted in greed (<i>lobha,mūla,citta</i>)	235
Table 13.9.1 The 8 types of cittas accompanied by greed.....	235
13.9.2 The cittas rooted in hatred (<i>dosa,mūla,citta</i>).....	237
13.9.3 Cittas rooted in delusion (<i>moha,mūla,citta</i>).....	237
Table 13.9.3 The 12 unwholesome cittas (Abhs:BRS 1999:35).....	238
13.10 The unwholesome cetasikas	239
13.11 The 2 roots and 12 links	241
Table 13.11 The 12 links over 3 consecutive lives [SD 8.2; SD 59.12 Table 3.1.2]	241
13.12 The 24 conditions (<i>paccaya</i>)	242
13.12.1 The root condition (<i>hetu,paccaya</i>).....	242
Table 13.12 The 24 conditions (<i>paccaya</i>) and their varieties	243
13.12.2 Object condition (<i>ārammaṇa,paccaya</i>)	244
13.12.3 Predominance condition (<i>adhipati,paccaya</i>).....	244
13.12.4 Proximity condition (<i>anantara,paccaya</i>) &.....	245
13.12.5 Contiguity condition (<i>samanantara,paccaya</i>)	245
13.12.6 Connascence condition (<i>sahajāta,paccaya</i>)	245
13.12.7 Mutuality condition (<i>aññām-añña,paccaya</i>)	245
13.12.8 Support condition (<i>nissaya,paccaya</i>).....	246
13.12.9 Decisive support condition (<i>upanissaya,paccaya</i>).....	247
13.12.10 Prenascence condition (<i>pure,jāta,paccaya</i>).....	248
13.12.11 Postnascence condition (<i>pacchā.jāta,paccaya</i>).....	249
13.12.12 Repetition [frequency] condition (<i>āsevana,paccaya</i>).....	249
13.12.13 Karma condition (<i>kamma,paccaya</i>)	250
13.12.14 Karma-result condition (<i>vipāka,paccaya</i>)	251
13.12.15 Nutriment condition (<i>āhāra,paccaya</i>)	252
13.12.16 Faculty condition (<i>indriya,paccaya</i>)	253
Table 13.12.16 The 22 faculties	254
13.13 The 24 conditions: A synthesis.....	257
13.13.1 Abhs 8.12 Summary	257
13.13.2 Abhs 8.13 The mind for the mind	257
13.13.3 Abhs 8.14 The mind for mind-and-matter	259
13.13.4 Abhs 8.15 The mind for matter.....	260

13.13.5 Abhs 8.16 Matter for the mind	261
13.13.6 Abhs 8.17 Concepts and mind-and-matter for the mind.....	261
13.13.7 Abhs 8.18 Mind-and-matter for mind-and-matter	262
13.13.8 Abhs 8.19 Predominant condition	262
13.13.9 Abhs 8.20 Predominant condition	263
13.13.10 Abhs 8.21 Mutuality condition.....	263
13.13.11 Abhs 8.22 Support condition	264
13.13.12 Abhs 8.23 Nutriment condition	264
13.13.13 Abhs 8.24 Faculty condition.....	265
13.13.14 Abhs 8.25 Dissociation condition.....	266
13.13.15 Abhs 8.26 Presence and non-disappearance conditions	267
13.13.16 Abhs 8.27 The synthesis of conditions.....	267
13.13.17 Abhs 8.28 Summary	268
13.14 The key problems with the Abhidhamma.....	268
13.14.2 The Abhidhamma, language and realism	269
13.14.3 We are always “conscious of something,” but not of some <i>thing</i>	271
13.14.4 The conditional relations (<i>paccaya</i>) are circular	273
13.15 Dharma and Abhidhamma in perspective	274
13.15.1 Relative teaching (<i>pariyāya</i>)	274
13.15.2 “Scientific” Buddhism?.....	274
13.15.3 Higher Dharma?	275
Why support our sutta translation work: Reasons and history.....	277