

Kandaraka Sutta

The Kandaraka Discourse | M 51/1:339-349

Theme: Four kinds of persons in terms of tormenting

Translated by Piya Tan ©2006, 2010

1 KEY TEACHINGS

The Kandaraka Sutta or Kandaraka Discourse presents four types of persons:

- (1) those who torment themselves,
- (2) those who torment others,
- (3) those who torment both, and
- (4) those who torment neither themselves nor others.

This discourse does not seem to have a parallel in the Chinese Āgamas. Similar expositions of these four types of person recur in other Pali discourses, and parts of such expositions have also been preserved in Sanskrit fragments.¹

A more detailed exposition of the four types of persons is given in **the Apaṇṇaka Sutta** (M 60).² A similar list is given in **the Ghoṭa, mukha S** (M 94),³ **the Attan Tapa S** (A 4.198)⁴ and **the Puggala Pañ-ñatti** (Pug 4.21).⁵ A brief exposition is found in **the Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 33).⁶

2 Kandaraka

2.1 CLOTHED WANDERER. The Kandaraka Sutta opens with Kandaraka visiting the Buddha. The Commentary says that he was a clothed wanderer (*channa, paribbājaka*, MA 3:2). The Commentary says that the assembled monks sit silently, not even clearing their throats, out of respect for the Buddha and also because of their training. Unmoving in body, undistracted in mind, they sit around the Buddha like ruddy clouds around the peak of Mt Sineru.

Kandaraka's surprise and exultation are apparently the result of his comparing the well disciplined assembly of monks with the rowdy companies of wanderers he is familiar with. The suttas record a number of other wanderers who are aware of this. The wanderer Sandaka in **the Sandaka Sutta** (M 76), noticing Ānanda approaching, requests that the wanderer's gathering be silent, so that Ānanda would join them.⁷ The wanderer Nigrodha, too, in **the Udumbarikā Sihanāda Sutta** (D 25), is recorded as telling his colleagues to be silent at the approach of the householder Sandhāna, who is also a non-returner.⁸

2.2 KANDARAKA'S PRAISE. Kandaraka actually only compliments the Buddha on the discipline of the community of monks. He calls them "arhats," here clearly meaning simply "holy men" [§§ 1-2]. Kandaraka's compliment reminds us of a similar, but more elaborate, compliment by Pasenadi, the rajah of Kosala, as recorded in **the Dhamma Cetiya Sutta** (M 89).⁹

Kandaraka's jubilant compliment further positively and starkly contrasts with Ajāta, sattu's terrified apprehension when he is engulfed by the stillness of the Sangha, "calm as a lake," as recorded in **the Sā-**

¹ The Skt fragments are SHT I 422:189-190; SHT III 879 (pp. 128-129); SHT III 996:257-258; SHT IV 165 folio 27:200-203; SHT V 1153:152 & SHT V 1359:244-245. SHT I 422 parallels M 51.8/1:342,23: "who torments himself, intent on self-torment," *attan, tapa atta, paritapanānyoga*, while SHT III 879 parallels M 51.9/1:343,21: "tormenting others, intent on tormenting others," *paran, tapa para, paritapanānyoga*. SHT III 996; SHT IV 165 fol 27 & SHT V 1359 describe practices of self-mortification, such as found in M 51.9/1:343 and also in other similar passages, eg D 8/1:166,2; D 25/3:40,26; A 3.151/1:295,8. SHT = *Sanskrihandshriften aus den Turfanfunden*, Teil 1-8, edd Ernest Waldschmidt et al, 1965-2000.

² M 60.36-56/1:412 f = SD 35.5, with 6 additional observance.

³ M 94.10-30/2:161 f = SD 77.2.

⁴ A 4.198/2:205-211 = SD 56.7.

⁵ Pug 4.21/55-61.

⁶ D 33.1.11(47)/3:232.

⁷ M 76.4/1:513 = SD 35.7.

⁸ D 25.3/1:37 = SD 1.4.

⁹ M 89.9-19/2:120-124 = SD 64.10.

mañña,phala (D 2). Ajāta,sattu, ridden with guilt for having killed his own father, the virtuous Bimbisāra, actually feels that the silence portends an imminent ambush and attempt on his life!¹⁰

2.3 KANDARAKA’S WORDS AND POSTURE. This is all that Kandaraka is reported to have spoken, and he is no more mentioned thereafter. It is Pessa’s remark [§4a] that actually sets forth the Buddha’s teaching as recorded in the rest of the Sutta. As such, this is more appropriately a discourse *prompted* by Kandaraka.

The Buddha nevertheless endorses Kandaraka’s compliment, and adds that there are in the assembly before them, both arhats (the adepts) and the learners (the other kinds of saints on the path), and they all dwell practising the four foundations of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*) [§3].¹¹

Notice that while Pessa sits, just as the Buddha is sitting, but Kandaraka stands. It is thus clear that Pessa either has deep respect for the Buddha or is a follower. Kandaraka, on the other hand, despite his exultation, belongs to a different religious community.

3 Pessa

3.1 LAY PRACTITIONER. At this point, Pessa the mahout’s son, exults that “we, bhante, as white-dressed householders, from time to time dwell with our minds well-established in the four focusses of mindfulness” [§4a]. He praises the Buddha for prescribing satipatthana practice, saying that the Buddha well understands human nature, that is, “human tangles, such human vices, such human wiles” [§4b]. As a mahout or elephant driver, he well knows the wily ways of animals, despite which he could train them to do his bidding.

Humans, being more devious than animals, are able to “act in one way, speak in another way, and think in yet another way.” As such, it is remarkable, he proclaims, that the Buddha is able to come up with such an effective mind-training method for humans as the satipatthana [§4b]. Apparently, this is the only mention we have of Pessa. His name simply means “messenger,” but the Commentary says that it is here his name (MA 2:1).

3.2 PESSA’S POTENTIAL. The Buddha endorses Pessa’s remarks [§5a], and then, in this connection, speaks of four kinds of person: those who torment themselves, who torment others, who torment both, and who do neither [§5b]. Then he asks Pessa which of these four appeals to him [§5c]. Pessa answers that only the last kind of person appeals to him.

When the Buddha asks Pessa for the reason of his choice, he replies to the effect that *everyone desires pleasure and loathe pain*, so that pain is undesirable. Having said that he abruptly takes leave [§6]. The Buddha then praises Pessa before the assembly, saying that he is a wise man, that is, in terms of practising satipatthana, adding that he would have attained a higher spiritual state if he has stayed for the Buddha to complete his teaching [§7].

The Commentary explains that Pessa would have become a streamwinner if he has stayed to listen to the Buddha’s full teaching on the four kinds of persons (MA 3:10 f). Nevertheless, he has gained two benefits: he has greater faith in the Sangha, and he has given rise to a new angle to the benefit of practising the focusses of mindfulness (MA 3:11).

4 The four kinds of persons

4.1 THE FIRST KIND OF PERSON. The key teaching of the Kandaraka Sutta is about the four kinds of persons, the first of which is the self-tormentor, that is, the one who “**who torments himself, intent on self-torment**” [§8]. Such austerities are simply self-mortifying ritual, whose sole purpose is to inflict pain upon the physical body, since it is regarded as intrinsically evil.

The physical body was regarded by the ancient brahmins as the source and manifestation of all desire. An early Upaniṣad, the Bṛhad aranyaka, says, “When all desires in the heart are released, then the mortal

¹⁰ D 2.10+12/1:49 f) = SD 8.10.

¹¹ See **Sāla S** (S 47.4) where both learners and arhats are stated as regularly practising satipatthana, and that the newly ordained monks, too, should do so (S 47.4/5:144 f) = SD 62.15.

becomes immortal and he attains Brahman” (BĀU 4.4.7).¹² Ascetics who subscribe to such beliefs often led lives of self-mortification, working to free themselves from the physical body to merge with the celestial soul.

Jainism regards every living soul as potentially divine. When the soul sheds its karmic bonds completely, it attains divine consciousness. It prescribes a path of non-violence to progress the soul to this ultimate goal.¹³ The parents of Mahāvīra, the Jain founder,¹⁴ were said to have committed religious suicide by **self-starvation** (*saṃlekhaṇa*, *sallekhaṇa*). This practice is done when a Jain is unable to keep to his religious vows due to serious illness and impending death, so as to conclude his life a minimum of karmic accumulation, or by a Jain practitioner in his final stages of spiritual development to hasten the release of his soul from its bodily (karmic) prison. Such persons are highly respected and venerated by his fellow Jains.¹⁵

The Buddha, in his past lives and last life,¹⁶ has tried all such ascetic and self-mortifying methods, but found them ineffective in bringing about direct insight into true reality, much less liberate him from suffering. As such, after his awakening, he unequivocally denounces such harmful and ineffective practices as being “painful, ignoble, not connected with the goal [unprofitable].”¹⁷ The spiritual path does not lie in tormenting the body, but in knowing, training and freeing the mind.

4.2 THE SECOND KIND OF PERSON. This is the one “**who torments others**,” defined as keeping to wrong livelihood [§9], that is, earning a living that breach the five precepts, or harms self, others or the environment.¹⁸ It is important to note here that it is not the person who is rejected, but the unwholesome occupation or preoccupation with harmful activities that needs to be corrected. The early Suttas record how even a serial killer,¹⁹ or a drunkard,²⁰ or even a public executioner²¹ could find salvation and awakening in the Buddha Dharma.

In a significant way, the kind of work we are employed in or habitually do, are shaped by our past karma and present conditions. Yet, no matter how we are caught up with our work, if we are determined enough, we can still find the occasion for doing wholesome deed, such as spending time meditating, or doing charitable works. However, as soon as we understand the unwholesome nature or aspects of our occupation, we should take steps to free ourselves from that situation and elevate ourselves to a more wholesome activity.

4.3 THE THIRD KIND OF PERSON. This is the one “**who torments himself...and torments others**,” that is to say, habitually does troublesome or painful tasks, which accumulates bad karma for himself, but also makes others experience the same thing [10]. The Kandaraka Sutta mentions the case where a person

¹² On Brahman, see A Hillebrandt, “Brahman,” Bonn, 1926, in *Kleiner Schriften*, 1987:254-259; J Gonda, *Notes on Brahman*, Utrecht, 1950; P Thieme, “Brahman,” 1952, in *Kleiner Schriften 2*, 1984:100-138.

¹³ Robert Kastenbaum, *Macmillan Encyclopedia of Death and Dying*, 2003:491.

¹⁴ On Nigāntha Nāta,putta, see **Upāli S** (M 56) @ SD 27.1 Intro (2.1).

¹⁵ See Tattvārthadhigama Sūtra: <http://www.digambarjainonline.com/litera/tattvd01.htm>. WM Braun, “Sallekhana: the ethicality and legality of religious suicide by starvation in the Jain religious community,” *Medicine and Law* 27,4 2008:913-924. Download from http://claremont.academia.edu/documents/0016/3792/IJLM_Sallekhana_Submission.doc.

¹⁶ See eg **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36.17-44/1:242-249) = SD 1.12 or 49.4; **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12.44-63/1:77-83) = SD 1.13 or 49.1.

¹⁷ *Yo cāyam ātta,kilamathānuyogo dukkho anariyo anatta,samhito* (S 56.11.3/5:420) = SD 1.1. See **The body in Buddhism**, SD 29.6a (4.1).

¹⁸ See **Right livelihood**, SD 37.8.

¹⁹ See **Aṅguli,māla S** (M 86/2:97-105) = SD 5.11. Aṅguli,māla is converted by the Buddha himself.

²⁰ See **Sarakāni S 1** (S 55.24), where the Buddha explains that “Sarakāni the Sakya kept the training (in moral virtue, concentration and wisdom) at the time of his death” (S 55.24/5:375-377) = SD 3.6, & **Sarakāni S 2** (S 55.-25), where the Buddha explains that “Sarakāni the Sakya fulfilled the training at the time of his death” (S 55.25/-5:378-380).

²¹ See **Tamba,dāṭhika Cora,ghātaka Vatthu** (DhA 8.1 ad Dh 100). The public executioner, Tamba,dāṭhika, through faithfully and attentively listening to Sāriputta’s admonition, is able to establish himself on the spiritual path (DhA 8.1/2:203-209).

performs a bloody sacrifice that involves the killing of numerous animals, and forces many others to painfully join him in doing so.

The bloody sacrifice mentioned by the Sutta in fact alludes to the one recounted in **the (Pasenadi) Yañña Sutta** (S 3.9),²² where Pasenadi, the rajah of Kosala, prepares 500 bulls, 500 bullocks, 500 heifers, 500 goats, and 500 rams for sacrifice. The Buddha teaches him a more wholesome and noble alternative.

A similar unwholesome and wasteful “great sacrifice” (*mahā yañña*) is described in **the Kūta,danta Sutta** (D 5), and it involves 700 of each kind of such animals, trees etc, planned by the brahmin Kūta,-danta.²³ The negative and immoral implications of such a sacrifice is clearly stated in **the (Uggata,sarīra) Aggi Sutta** (A 7.44).²⁴

4.4 THE FOURTH KIND OF PERSON. This person, “**who neither torments himself...nor does he torment others**” is the true saint, the arhat, who is the Buddhist ideal [§11]. This whole section is in fact a pericope or stock passage, which opens with a declaration of the presence of the Buddha and his Teaching in our own times, and the possibility of the holy life in its fullest [§§12-13].²⁵

The next sections (right to the end) is the well known “**fruits of recluseship**” (*sāmañña,phala*) passage. It opens with a list of basic precepts, followed wrong livelihoods and malpractices that a true practitioner avoids [§14]. This constitutes the early Buddhist monastic conception of basic moral virtue, and which forms the basis for mental cultivation, which follows.

The section on mental cultivation first defines “contentment” [§15], followed by “sense-restraint” [§16], and then “full awareness” [§17]. This sequence is meaningful as it leads on to “the overcoming of the five mental hindrances” [§§18-19], resulting in “the dhyanas” [§§20-23].

The list culminates in the best of all the fruits of recluseship, that “the three knowledges” [§§24-26], the last of which bring about arhathood [§§27-28].

5 The sequence of joy

A close examination of **the fruits of recluseship** (*sāmañña,phala*) passage of the Kandaraka Sutta, reveals a progressive refinement of spiritual joy. The first kind of happiness are those arising from blamelessness [§§14-15] by way of moral virtue, that is, keeping the precepts, and contentment, that is, being happy with what one has [§15]. In fact, this section of the *sāmañña,phala* pericope closes with the words, “possessing this aggregate of noble virtue, he experiences within himself a blameless joy (*anavajja sukha*).”

The Dīgha Commentary explains: “He experiences within himself a blameless, faultless, wholesome bodily and mental happiness accompanied by such phenomena as non-remorse, gladness, rapture, and tranquillity, which are based on moral virtue as their proximate cause” (DA 1:183). The Commentaries add that this is “a happiness free from faults” (*niddosa,sukha*).²⁶ Evidently, this joy arises on account of being free from the fear of being blamed for moral weakness.

On the basis of this blameless happiness, there follows the “undefiled joy” (*avyāseka sukha*), which is a more refined happiness arising from sense-restraint [§16] and full awareness [§17]. This is a bodily and mental preparation for stilling the mind. Even at this stage there is a wonderful sense of happiness as a prelude of the truly profound happiness to come.

But first this undefiled joy (the happiness that is untouched by any negative emotions) helps to clear away all the five mental hindrances—sensual desire, ill will, sloth and torpor, restlessness and worry, and doubt [§§18-19]—so that the mind elevates itself into the first dhyana, the joy of zest born of solitude (*viveka,ja pīti,sukha*), which arises when the mind is fully free of all bodily sensing [§20]. The second dhyana is characterized by the joy of zest born of concentration (*samādhi,ja pīti,sukha*), when the mind is fully focussed on its object [§21]. The third dhyana bliss is one that is free from the excitability of zest, so

²² S 3.9/1:75 f & SD 22.11 Intro.

²³ D 5.1/1:127 = SD 22.8.

²⁴ A 7.44.4-6/4:42 f = SD 3.16.

²⁵ From here right to the end [§§12-27] as in **Cūḷa Hatthi,paḍōpama S** (M 27.11-26/1:178-184) = SD 40a.5.

²⁶ MA 2:214 = AA 3:198.

that the meditator is said to be one who truly “dwells happily” (*sukha, vihārī*) [§22]. And the fourth dhyana culminates with the happiness of realization in the case of a saint, so that he is said to be one who is “quenched, cooled, feeling joy” (*nibbuto sīti, bhūto sukha, paṭisaṃvedī*) [§28].²⁷

*Cutā patanti patitā
giddhā ca punar-āgatā
kataṃ kiccaṃ rataṃ rammaṃ
sukhena ’nvāgataṃ sukhan ti.*

Having passed away, they fall; having fallen,
and being greedy, they have come back again.
Done what is to be done, enjoyed what is enjoyable,
Happiness after happiness follows. (Tha 22)

*Taṃ sukhena sukhaṃ laddhaṃ
passa dhamma, sudhammataṃ
Tisso vijjā anuppattā
kataṃ buddhassa sāsanaṃ*

This happiness is won through happiness,
see the true nature of the Dharma!
Attained are the three knowledges,
done is the Buddha’s teaching. (Tha 220)

— — —

²⁷ See Analayo 2003:167 & n51.

The Kandaraka Discourse

M 51/1:339-349

1 Thus have I heard.

At one time the Blessed One was staying with a large community of monks on the shore of the Gaggara lotus lake²⁸ near Campā.²⁹

Then Pessa, the mahout's [elephant driver's] son, and Kandaraka the wanderer,³⁰ approached the Blessed One. Having saluted the Blessed One, Pessa the mahout's son sat down at one side.

But, Kandaraka the wanderer exchanged greetings with the Blessed One, and then stood at one side.³¹

Standing thus at one side, Kandaraka the wanderer surveyed the community of monks who were complete silent,³² and then said this to the Blessed One:

2 “It is wonderful, master Gotama! It is marvellous, master Gotama! How this community of monks is made by master Gotama to rightly keep to the way [made to follow the right way]!³³

Those who *were* arhats, fully self-awakened ones, master Gotama, in the distant past, too, these Blessed Ones, too, must have had a perfect community of monks such as this, rightly keeping to the way—that is to say, just as this community of monks is *now* made by master Gotama to rightly keep to the way.³⁴

Those who *will be* arhats, fully self-awakened ones, master Gotama, in the distant future, too, these Blessed Ones, too, will surely have a perfect community of monks such as this, rightly keeping to the way—that is to say, just as this community of monks is *now* made by master Gotama to rightly keep to the way.”³⁵

3a “So it is, Kandaraka! So it is, Kandaraka!

Those who *were* arhats, fully self-awakened ones, master Gotama, in the distant past, too, these Blessed Ones, too, must have had a perfect community of monks such as this, rightly keeping to the way—that is to say, just as this community of monks is *now* rightly keeping to the way on my account.

²⁸ “The Gaggara lotus lake” (*gaggara pokkharani*), a lotus lake outside Campā. See **Soṇa,daṇḍa S** (D 4) = SD 30.5 Intro (2.2).

²⁹ **Campā**, the capital of Aṅga (one of the 16 Great States: see **Soṇa,daṇḍa S** (D 4) = SD 30.5 Intro (2.1).

³⁰ **Kandaraka**, says Comy, was a clothed wanderer (MA 3:2). He actually only compliments the Buddha on the spirituality of the community of monks (the “arhats,” here clearly meaning simply “holy men”). See Intro (2).

³¹ Notice that while Pessa sits, just as the Buddha is sitting, but Kandaraka stands. It is thus clear that Pessa either has deep respect for the Buddha or is a follower, whereas Kandaraka, despite his exultation, belongs to a different religious community. **Dīgha,nakha S** (M 74) famously records how Dīgha,nakha stands, while the Buddha sits, as he is *ashamed* that his uncle Sāriputta (they are brahmins) has become a monk (M 74.2a/1:497) = SD 16.1; MA 3:203 f. In **Upāli S** (M 56) the nirgrantha Dīgha,tapassī, after greeting the Buddha, remains standing, but sits down after the Buddha invites him to do so (M 56.2-3/1:371) = SD 27.1. Māra, when he appears before the Buddha, always stands, eg **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16. 3.7/2:104, 3.34/2:112) = SD 9. The most blatant case of uncivility on record is that shown by Ambaṭṭha, as recounted in **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 3), who, *walking up and down*, speaks to the seated Buddha (D 3.1.9-10/1:89 f) = SD 21.3 & Intro (3.2).

³² See Intro (2.1).

³³ *Yāvañ c'idaṃ bhotā gotamena sammā bhikkhu,saṅgho paṭipādito*. The word **paṭipādita** here is pp of *paṭipādeti* (caus of *paṭipajjati*, “he follows”), “to impart, bring into, give to, offer, present”; Comy: *ābhisamācārika,vattam ādim katvā sammā apaccanīka,paṭipattiyam yojito* “having fulfilled the duties of the minor precepts, etc, he is rightly intent on the practice of what is not contrary” (MA 3:3). Also Ap 6.138/47, 334.3/271, 484.28/427; B 33/3 (*khaṇo no paṭipādito*, “our moment has arrived”; *paṭipādito* = *paṭiladdho*, “received,” BA 40); Miln 375.

³⁴ *Ye'pi te, bho gotama, ahesuṃ atītam-addhānaṃ arahanto sammā,sambuddhā te'pi bhagavanto eta,paramam ye'va sammā bhikkhu,saṅgham paṭipādesuṃ—seyyathā'pi etarahi bhotā gotamena sammā bhikkhu,saṅgho paṭipādito*.

³⁵ Comy notes that Kandaraka does not have any direct knowledge of the Buddha of the past and future. He is simply expressing his admiration of the well-trained, disciplined and calm community of monks. The Buddha, however, confirms this. (MA 3:3 f)

Those who *will be* arhats, fully self-awakened ones, master Gotama, in the distant future, too, these Blessed Ones, too, will surely have a perfect community of monks such as this, rightly keeping to the way—that is to say, just as this community of monks is *now* rightly keeping to the way on my account.

The saints practise satipatthana³⁶

3b For, there are, Kandaraka, in this community of monks those who are **arhats with mental influxes**³⁷ destroyed, who have lived the holy life, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, reached their own goal, destroyed the fetters of being, completely liberated through direct knowledge.

3c For, there are, Kandaraka, in this community of monks those who are learners, of consistent virtue,³⁸ consistent living, prudent, living prudently.³⁹

3d They dwell with their minds well established in the four focusses of mindfulness.⁴⁰

What are the four?

Here, Kandaraka, [340]

- (1) a monk dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing [watching] the body in the body, removing covetousness and displeasure in the world,⁴¹
- (2) a monk dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing feelings in the feelings, removing covetousness and displeasure in the world;
- (3) a monk dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing the mind in the mind, removing covetousness and displeasure in the world;
- (4) a monk dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing dhammas in the dhammas, removing covetousness and displeasure in the world.”

Lay followers who practise satipatthana

4a When this was said, Pessa, the mahout’s [elephant driver’s] son, said this to the Blessed One:

“It is wonderful, master Gotama! It is marvellous, master Gotama! How well laid down are the four focusses of mindfulness for the purification of beings, for overcoming sorrow and lamentation, for the disappearance of physical and mental pain,⁴² for gaining the right way,⁴³ for realizing nirvana.⁴⁴

For, we, bhante, as white-dressed householders, from time to time dwell with our minds well-established in the four focusses of mindfulness.⁴⁵

³⁶ A fuller form of this brief section [§§3bc] on the 4 types of saints is given at **Ānāpāna,sati S** (M 118.9-12/-3:79) = SD 7.13. where see for expl of key expressions here.

³⁷ “**Mental influxes**,” *āsava*. The term *āsava* (lit “in-flow, out-flow”) comes from *ā-savati* “flows towards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously translated as influxes, taints (“deadly taints,” RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists 4 kinds of *āsava*: the influx of (1) sense-desire (*kām’āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav’āsava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭh’āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjāsava*) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These four are also known as “floods” (*oghā*) and “yokes” (*yogā*). The list of 3 influxes (omitting the influx of views) is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these *āsavas* is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict: *āsava*.

³⁸ *Santata,sīla*: Comy expls *santata* as “uninterrupted,” hence consistent, stable (MA 3:4).

³⁹ *Santi hi, kandaraka, bhikkhū imasmim bhikkhu,saṅghe sekkhā santata,sīlā santata,vuttino nipakā nipaka,-vuttino.*

⁴⁰ Comy says that these 4 focusses of mindfulness are mentioned to show the cause for the calm deportment of the monks. On *satipatthana*, see **Satipatṭhāna S** (M 10/1:55-63) = SD 13.3.

⁴¹ For expl of key expressions in the 4 paras, see **Satipatṭhāna S** (M 10) = SD 13.1 (4.2).

⁴² *Dukkha,domanassa*, sometimes tr as “pain and sadness.” See Walshe 1996 (D:W 589 n627). For a broader sense of *domanassa*, see §3 n on *abhijjhā,domanassa*.

⁴³ “For gaining the right way,” *ñāyassa adhiḡamāya*, ie, the noble eightfold path.

⁴⁴ This para as at **Satipatṭhāna S** (M 10.2/1:55) = SD 13.3.

⁴⁵ Comy: We are engaged in various duties to the monks, but from time to time, we find the occasion for practice. We do not completely neglect meditation. (MA 3:6).

(1) We dwell, bhante, exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing [watching] *the body in the body*, removing covetousness and displeasure in the world.⁴⁶

(2) We dwell, bhante, exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing *feelings in the feelings*, removing covetousness and displeasure in the world;

(3) We dwell, bhante, exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing *the mind in the mind*, removing covetousness and displeasure in the world;

(4) We dwell, bhante, exertive, clearly aware, mindful, observing *dharmas [phenomena] in the dharmas*, removing covetousness and displeasure in the world.

4b It is wonderful, master Gotama! It is marvellous, master Gotama!

For, bhante, how the Blessed One knows what is good or not for beings amidst such human tangles, such human vices, such human wiles.⁴⁷

For, humans, bhante, are this tangle; and animals, bhante, are this open clearing.⁴⁸

For, bhante, I can make an elephant in training on a journey to and from Campā, during which time, it will try to show every kind of deception, treachery, deviousness, and dishonesty.⁴⁹

But, bhante, as for those who are called our slaves, messenger, and workers—they act in one way, speak in another way, and think in yet another way.⁵⁰

It is wonderful, master Gotama! It is marvellous, master Gotama!

For, bhante, how the Blessed One knows what is good or not for beings amidst such human tangles, such human vices, such human wiles.

For, bhante, humans are this tangle; but animals, bhante, are this open clearing.⁵¹

The Buddha's assent

5a “So it is, Pessa! So it is, Pessa! [341]

For, humans, Pessa, are this tangle; and animals, Pessa, are this open clearing.

5b Pessa, there are these **four kinds of persons to be found in the world**.⁵² What are the four?

(1) Here, Pessa, a certain person is one who torments himself, intent on self-torment.⁵³

(2) Here, Pessa, a certain person is one who torments others, intent on tormenting others.⁵⁴

(3) Here, Pessa, a certain person is one who torments himself, intent on self-torment, and he torments others, intent on tormenting others.⁵⁵

⁴⁶ The 4 sentences are stock def of the 4 focusses of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*): see D 22.1c/2:290 = SD 13.2 & M 10.3/1:56 = SD 13.3

⁴⁷ *Yāvañ c'idaṃ, bhante, bhagavā evaṃ manussa, gahane evaṃ manussa, kasaṭe evaṃ manussa, sāṭṭheyye vatta-māne sattānaṃ hitāhitā jānāti.*

⁴⁸ *Gahanañ h'etaṃ, bhante, yad idaṃ manussā; uttānakañ h'etaṃ, bhante, yad idaṃ pasavo.*

⁴⁹ *Ahañ hi, bhante, pahomi hatthi, dammaṃ sāretuṃ, yāvatakena antarena campāṃ gatāgataṃ karissati sabbāni tāni sāṭṭheyyāni kūṭheyyāni vankeyyāni jimheyyāni pātukarissati.*

⁵⁰ Comy: An animal's guile and trickery is very limited, which those of a human is unlimited. (MA 3:7)

⁵¹ Dhammapada Comy quotes this as a scholium in the moving episode of the pratyeka-buddha and the faithful dog in **Sāmā, vaṭi Vatthu** (DhA 2.1): “Animals, they say, are straightforward, not given to deceit; but for humans, the heart thinks one way, the mouth speaks another. Hence, it is said, ‘For, humans, bhante, are this tangle; and animals, bhante, are this open clearing’” (*tiracchānā kira nāṃ'ete uju, jātikā honti akuṭilā. Manussā pana aññaṃ hada-yena cintenti, aññaṃ mukhena kathenti. Ten'ev'āha, “gahanañ h'etaṃ, bhante, yad idaṃ manussā, uttānakañ h'etaṃ, bhante, yad idaṃ pasavō ti*) (DhA 2.1/1:173).

⁵² Comy explains that this passage is a follow-up to Pessa's statement that the Buddha knows what is good or bad for beings. For, the Buddha shows that the first 3 kinds of persons are practising in harmful ways, while the fourth is that of practising in a beneficial way. This passage also connects to Kandaraka's praise of the sangha, because the Buddha does not train the sangha in the first 3 ways, but all the Buddha train others in the fourth way. (MA 3:9). The 4 types of persons (elaborated in §§8-28), is mutatis mutandis also at **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.35-56/1:411-413 = SD 35.5, with 6 additional observances) = **Ghoṭa, mukha S** (M 94.10-30/2:161 f = SD 77.2) = **Attan Tapa S** (A 4.198/2:205-211 = SD 56.7) = **Pug** 4.21/55-61.

⁵³ *Idha, pessa, ekacco puggalo attan, tapo hoti atta, paritāpanāniyogam-anuyutto.*

⁵⁴ *Idha pana, pessa, ekacco puggalo paran, tapo hoti para, paritāpanāniyogam-anuyutto.*

(4) Here, Pessa, a certain person neither torments himself nor is intent on tormenting himself, and also neither torments others nor is intent on tormenting others.⁵⁶ Neither tormenting himself nor others, he is here and now hunger-free, quenched and cooled, and abides enjoying bliss, having himself become holy [supreme like Brahmā himself].⁵⁷

5c Of these four persons, Pessa, which one appeals to your mind?”

Pessa's choice of spiritual role model

5d “Bhante, as regards this person who torments himself, intent on self-torment—this person does not appeal to my mind.

Bhante, as regards this person who torments others, intent on tormenting others—this person, too, does not appeal to my mind.

Bhante, as regards this person who torments himself, intent on self-torment, and he torments others, intent on tormenting others—this person, too, does not appeal to my mind.

But, bhante, this person neither torments himself nor is intent on tormenting himself, and also neither torments others nor is intent on tormenting others. Neither tormenting himself nor others, he is here and now hunger-free, quenched and cooled, and abides enjoying bliss, having himself become holy [supreme like Brahmā himself]—only this person appeals to my mind.”

Pessa's explanation

6a “But why, don't these three persons appeal to your mind?”

“Bhante, as regards this person who torments himself, intent on self-torment, he, desiring pleasure, loathing pain, torments and torments himself⁵⁸—this person does not appeal to my mind.

Bhante, as regards this person who torments others, intent on tormenting others, he torments and torments others who desire pleasure and loathe pain—this person, too, does not appeal to my mind.

Bhante, as regards this person who torments himself, intent on self-torment, and he torments others, intent on tormenting others, he torments and torments himself and others, both of whom desire pleasure and loath pain—this person, too, does not appeal to my mind. [342]

But, bhante, this person who neither torments himself, not intent on self-torment, nor does he torment others, not intent on tormenting others; neither tormenting himself nor tormenting others, he is right here and now without hunger, quenched, cooled, experiences joy: by having perfected himself, he dwells; he neither torments nor torments himself or others, both of whom desire pleasure and loath pain—only this person appeals to my mind.”

6b Bhante, we must now take leave. Many are our duties; there is much to be done.”

“Please, householder, do as you deem fit here.”⁵⁹

⁵⁵ *Idha pana, pessa, ekacco puggalo attan, tapo ca hoti atta, paritāpanānuyogam-anuyutto, paran, tapo ca para, paritāpanānuyogam-anuyutto.*

⁵⁶ *Idha pessa ekacco puggalo n'ev'attan, tapo hoti natta, paritāpanānuyogam-anuyutto na paran, tapo na para, paritāpanānuyogam-anuyutto.*

⁵⁷ *So anattan, tapo aparan, tapo diṭṭh'eva dhamme nicchāto nibbuto sūti, bhūto sukha-p, paṭisaṃvedī brahma, bhūtena attanā viharati.* Comy explains this as meaning that the practitioner experiences the bliss of the dhyanas, the paths, the fruits and nirvana (MA 3:10). “By having become perfect [supreme] himself,” *brahma, bhūtena attanā* = “by becoming perfect [supreme] himself” (MA 3:10,9).

⁵⁸ *So attānam sukha, kāmam dukkha, paṭikkūlam ātāpeti paritāpeti.* See **Rāsiya Gāmaṇi S** (S 42.12.4-5/4:337-339).

⁵⁹ *Yassa dāni tvam gahapati kālam maññasī ti,* lit “Please do what you think it is now the time to do.” This is stock: **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2.103/1:85 = SD 8.10); **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16.3.6/2:104 = SD 13), **Kandaraka S** (M 51.6b/1:342 = SD 32.9), **Sekha S** (M 53.3/1:354 = SD 21.14), **Kaṇṇaka-t, thala S** (M 90.17/2:132 f = SD 10.8); **Puṇṇovāda S** (M 145.6/3:269 = S 35.88/4:62,31 = SD 20.15), **Avassuta S** (S 35.243/4:183,15, 30), **Khemā Therī S**

Then, Pessa the mahout's son, having approved and rejoiced in the Buddha's word, rose from his seat, saluted the Blessed One, and keeping the Buddha to his right, departed.

The Buddha praises Pessa

7a Then, not long after Pessa the mahout's son had left, the Blessed One addressed the monks, thus: "Wise,⁶⁰ bhikshus, is Pessa the mahout's son; of great wisdom, bhikshus, is Pessa the mahout's son.

If, bhikshus, Pessa the mahout's son, were to sit for just a moment longer so that I could have analysed the four kinds of persons in detail for him, he would have attained great good. Still, bhikshus, even to this extent, Pessa the mahout's son has attained great good."⁶¹

7b "This is the time, Blessed One, this is the time, Sugata [Well gone one], for the Blessed One to give a detailed analysis of these four kinds of persons. Having heard the Blessed One, the monks will bear it in mind."

"In that case, bhikshus, listen, pay careful attention, I will speak."

"Yes, bhante," the monks answered the Blessed One in assent.

The Blessed One said this.⁶²

(1) The self-tormentor

8 "And, bhikshus, what kind of person **torments himself, intent on self-torment?**⁶³

⁶⁴Here, bhikshus, someone is a naked ascetic,⁶⁵ of loose habits [flouting conventions],⁶⁶ licking his hands;⁶⁷

not coming when invited, not stopping when invited;

not accepting food that is brought nor food specially prepared nor a meal invitation;

accepting nothing from a pot, from a bowl, across a threshold, among the firewood, among the rice-pounders, from two eating together, from a pregnant woman, from a woman giving suck, from a woman in the midst of men,⁶⁸ from a food-distribution centre, from where a dog is waiting, from where flies are swarming;

(S 44.1/4:379,29), **Vesāli S** (S 54.9/5:321,16, 17) & **Thapatayā S** (S 55.6/5:348,27). See Joy Manné, "On a departure formula and its translation," *Buddhist Studies Review* 10, 1993: 27-43.

⁶⁰ Comy: Not in relation to the 4 kinds of persons, but to the 4 satipatthanas (MA 3:10).

⁶¹ Ce Ee *Mahatā atthena samyutta agamissa*; Be Se has *abhavissa* instead of *agamissa*, which is supported by Comy's *sotāpanno abhavissa* (MA 3:10 f). Comy explains that Pessa, if he had stayed on to listen to the Buddha's elaborate on the 4 kinds of persons, he would have attained streamwinning (MA 3:10). Nevertheless, he gained two benefits: he has greater faith in the Sangha, and he gave rise to a new angle to the benefit of practising the focusses of mindfulness (MA 3:11). Clearly, Comy is alluding to Pessa's statement that lay disciples, like himself, too, occasionally practise satipatthana.

⁶² The sections on the 4 types of persons [§§8-28], is mutatis mutandis identical as at **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.36-56/1:412 f = SD 35.5, with 6 additional observances) = **Ghoṭa, mukha S** (M 94.10-30/2:161 f = SD 77.2) = **Attan Tapa S** (A 4.198/2:205-211 = SD 56.7) = **Pug** 4.21/55-61.

⁶³ Such austerities are practised by the Buddha's contemporaries, and as a Bodhisattva, he himself practised them: see **Mahā Sīha, nāda S** (M 12.45/1:77 f) = SD 49.1.

⁶⁴ This whole section [§8] is, mutatis mutandis, at **Kassapa Sīha, nāda S** (D 8.14/1:165-167 = SD 77.1) = **Udumbarikā Sīha, nāda S** (D 25.8b/3:41 = SD 1.4), with 6 additional observances) = **Mahā Sīha, nāda S** (M 12.45/1:77 f = SD 49.1) = **Kandaraka S** (M 51.8/1:342 f = SD 32.9) = **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.36/1:412 = SD 35.5, with 6 additional observances) = **Paṭipadā Acelaka S** (A 3.141/1:295) = **Atta, daṇḍa Sutta Nd** (Nm 15/416 f). See prec n.

⁶⁵ "Naked ascetic" (**acelaka**), *a-celaka* = *acela*, "unclothed": (m) V 4:92,14; J 5:18,25; M 1:281,33, DhA 1:309,3, 400,13, 4:489,17; J 3:246,18, 6:229,7; (adj) M 1:307,23 = 342,25 = 412,4 = 2:161,26 = D 1:166,2 = 3:40,27 = A 1:295,8 = 2:206,7; (pl) M 1:238,15 (cf A 3:384,5); (titles) ~**vagga** A 1:295-299 = SD 72.4, V 4:91-108, 5:19-21, 39 f; ~**laddhi** J 3:246,19, 39 f; ~**sāvaka** (m pl) A 3:384,2; ~**sikkhāpada** = Pāc 41 (V 4:91 f).

⁶⁶ *Mutt'ācāro*.

⁶⁷ *Hatthāpalekhano*. Cf Sekh 52 (V 4:98) which proscribes hand-licking; D 1:166, 3:40; M 1:77, 238, 307; A 1:295; Pug 55.

accepting neither fish nor meat; drinking no wine nor beer nor cereal brew.⁶⁹

He keeps himself to one house, to one morsel [when collecting alms]; he keeps himself to two houses, to two morsels...keeps to seven houses, to seven morsels;

He lives on one small serving (of food) a day; on two small servings a day...on seven small servings a day;⁷⁰

He takes food once a day; [343] once every two days...once every seven days—thus even up to a fortnight, he dwells pursuing the practice of taking of food at such regular intervals.

He is an eater of greens, or of millet, or of wild rice, or of hide-parings, or of water-lettuce,⁷¹ or of rice-bran, or of rice-remnants,⁷² or of sesamum flour, or of grass, or of cow-dung.

He lives on forest roots and fruits, a windfall-eater.

He clothes himself in hemp, in hemp-mixed cloth, in shrouds,⁷³ in refuse rags, in tree bark, in antelope hide, in strips of antelope hide, in kusa-grass fabric, in bark fabric, in wood-shaving fabric, in head-hair wool, in animal wool, in owl's wings.

He pulls out (his) hair and beard, and is devoted to this practice.

He stands continuously, rejecting seats.

He squats continuously, and is devoted to such a posture.

He uses a bed of spikes, making it his bed.

He engages in (the ritual of) bathing in water three times a day, including the evening.⁷⁴

Thus in these various ways he dwells devoted to the tormenting and tormenting of the body.⁷⁵

This person, bhikshus, is called one who torments himself, intent on self-torment.

(2) The other-tormentor

9 And, bhikshus, what kind of person **torments others, is intent on tormenting others?**⁷⁶

Here, bhikshus, a certain person is a sheep slaughterer, pig slaughterer, bird trapper [fowler], game hunter [animal stalker], hunter, fisherman, thief, thief killer [executioner], cattle killer, jailer, or one who performs any of such bloody deeds.⁷⁷

⁶⁸ *Puris'antara'gatā*. This phrase is used to define *gihī,gatā*, “gone gone to a layperson” (V 4:322); defines *itthī*, “woman” at MA 2:209, DA 78. Comys say that this is a danger to their pleasure (as such putting the ascetic at a disadvantage).

⁶⁹ *Na suraṃ, na merayaṃ, na thus'odakaṃ pivati*. “Rice-wine,” *thus'odaka* (Skt *tuṣodaka*, “rice chaff”) “sour rice- or barley-gruel” (SED, sv *tuṣāmbu*). Comys: “a drink called *Sovīraka* made from (the husk of) all kinds of grain” (*sabba,sassa,sambhārehi kataṃ sovīrakam*, DA 2:355 = NmA 431 = PugA 232; *sabba,sassa,sambhārehi kataṃ loṇa,sovīrakam*, MA 2:44); *sabba,sassa,sambhārehi kata,sovīrakam*, AA 2:385: all add that *thusodaka* is a strong drink and as such blamable (*ettha ca surā,pānam eva sāvajjam*). On “salted *Sovīraka* (sour gruel)” (*loṇa,sovīraka*); see Vinaya, where it is mentioned as a cure for stomach wind, and allowed as a beverage if mixed with water (Mv 6.16.3/V 1:210); mentioned in a list of drinks given to monks (Vv 177/2.2.6/23). **Suśruta Saṃhita** describes preparation of *tuṣodaka* as a medicine (SuśSaṃ 44, 40cd-44ab). It is said to be sour gruel prepared with unhusked cereals; in SuśSaṃ it refers to “fermented liquors of barley with husks” used as a purgative (G J Meulenbeld (tr), *Mādhvanidāna*, Leiden, 1974:408 f). When boiled with pulse and barley, it becomes an acetous fermentation called *tuṣāmbu*. D:RD 3:38, “gruel”; M:ÑB 1:104 “rice gruel.” See D:RD 1:229 n2, D:W n196. My tr is contextual which suggests some kind of fermented drink.

⁷⁰ “Small serving,” *datti*. Comy says that a *datti* is a small bowlful from which they leave out the main food (MA 2:45).

⁷¹ “Water-lettuce,” *haṭa*, a kind of water-plant, *Pistia stratiotes* (PED) of the Arales order.

⁷² “Rice-remnants,” *ācāma*, “the moisture of boiled rice, rice-scum, rice-water (without condiments, a mean un-savoury food—hence, prob interpreted as the burnt crust sticking to the pot” (CPD): DA 356,15 = MA 2:45,12 = AA 2:355,17 = PugA 232,25; ie “burnt rice remnants in a pot,” or “kerak nasi” in Malay.

⁷³ Shrouds collected from corpses in a charnel ground.

⁷⁴ Apparently to wash away his “sins” as related in (**Udaka Suddhika**) **Saṅgārava S** (S 7.2.11/1:182).

⁷⁵ This passage [§8] is at **Apaṇṇaka S** (M 60.36) = D 35.5, where this last sentence is replaced by “This is called the person who torments himself and is intent on tormenting himself.” (M 60.36/1:412)

⁷⁶ As at **Ghoṭa,mukha S** (M 94.10/2:162 = SD 77.2) = **Paṭipadā Acelaka S** (A 3.141/1:295)

This person, bhikshus, is called one who torments others, intent on tormenting others.

(3) The self-tormentor and other-tormentor

10 And, bhikshus, what kind of person **torments himself, intent on self-torment, and torments others, intent on tormenting others.**

Here, bhikshus, as certain person is a head-anointed king or a brahmin of the great halls.⁷⁸ Having had a new assembly hall [sacrificial pavilion]⁷⁹ built to the east of the city, having had his head and beard shaven, dressing himself in a rough hide, greased his body with ghee and oil, scratching his back with a deer's horn, he enters the new sacrificial hall with his chief queen and the brahmin purohit.⁸⁰

There, he lies down on the bare ground, freshly smeared with cow-dung.⁸¹

The king lives on the milk of the first udder of a cow with calf of the same colour. [344] The chief queen lives on the milk of the second udder. The brahmin purohit lives on the milk of the third udder. The milk from the fourth udder is offered to the fire, and the calf feeds on the remainder.

He says thus:⁸²

‘Let this many bulls be slaughtered for sacrifice!
 Let this many bullocks be slaughtered for sacrifice!
 Let this many heifers be slaughtered for sacrifice!
 Let this many goats be slaughtered for sacrifice!
 Let this many rams be slaughtered for sacrifice!
 Let this many horses be slaughtered for sacrifice!⁸³
 Let this many trees be cut down for the sacrificial posts!⁸⁴
 Let this much grass be cut for the sacrificial grass’⁸⁵

There were slaves, messengers, and labourers, but they did all their work being driven by the rod [by the fear of punishment], or driven by fear, or weeping, with tears in their faces.⁸⁶

This person, bhikshus, is called one who torments himself, intent on self-torment, and torments others, intent on tormenting others.

⁷⁷ *Idha, bhikkhave, ekacco puggalo orabbhiko hoti sūkariko sākuṇiko māgaviko luddo maccha, ghātako coro cora, ghātako go, ghātako bandhanā, gāriko, ye vā pan’ aññepi keci kurūra, kammantā.* These are examples of wrong livelihood: see also **Right Livelihood** = SD 37.8. Cf **Cha-ḷ-ābhijāti S** (A 6.57) where the heterodox sectarian teacher, Pūraṇa Kassapa, classifies this as the “dark class” (*kaṇhābhijāti*), the lowest of his six-class system (A 6.57.2/-3:383) = SD 23.5.

⁷⁸ This is where both the perpetrator himself suffers from loss of lives and wealth and impending bad karma, and those serving him also suffering in the process. For a very similar sacrifice, involving 500 animals each, see **(Paseṇadi) Yañña S** (S 3.9/1:75 f) & SD 22.11 Intro.

⁷⁹ Text has *santh’ āgāra*, “assembly hall,” while Comy has *yañña, sālā* (MA 3:12).

⁸⁰ *So puratthimena naḡarassa navam santh’ āgāram [yaññ’ āgāram, Pug 56, 13] kārapetvā kesa, massum ohāretvā, kharā, jinam nivāsetvā, sappitelena kāyam abbaññitvā, maga, visāṇena piṭṭhim kaṇḍuvamān, navam santh’ ā-gāram [yaññ’ āgāram, Pug 56, 15] pavisati saddhim mahesiyā brāhmaṇena ca purohitena.*

⁸¹ *So tattha anantara, hitāya bhūmiyā harit’ upalittāya seyyam kappeti.* CPD says that *harit’ upalitta* is a lectio faciliior (a “simplified” reading) of *haritūpatta* (Skt *harita* + *upākta*), “smeared with fresh cow-dung” (J-poṭa ad J 1:399, 15); M 1:343, 35 = A 2:207, 24 = Pug 56, 16 (AA = PugA); V 1:47, 2 (*na ca anantarahitāya bhūmiyā patto nikkhipitabbo*, “an alms-bowl is not to be left on the bare ground”), 3:14, 17.

⁸² **Kūṭa, danta S** (D 5) records such a great sacrifice (*mahā yañña*) involving 700 of each kind of such animals, trees etc, planned by the brahmin Kūṭa, danta (D 5.1/1:127) = SD 22.8. The negative moral implications of such a sacrifice is stated in **(Uggata, sarīra) Aggi S** (A 7.44.4-6/4:42 f) = SD 3.16.

⁸³ Only in Be.

⁸⁴ *Ettakā rukkā chijjantu yūpatthāya.*

⁸⁵ *Ettakā dabbhā lūyantū barihisatthāyā ti.*

⁸⁶ As at **(Paseṇadi) Yañña S** (S 3.9.4/1:76) = SD 22.11; but see **Kūṭa, danta S** (D 5.18b/1:141 & 20b/1:142) = SD 22.8 for the opp case.

(4) The one who does not torment himself or others

11 And, bhikshus, what kind of person **neither torments himself, not intent on self-torment, nor torment others, not intent on tormenting others;**

neither tormenting self nor tormenting others, he is right here and now without hunger, quenched and cooled, experiences joy—he dwells having perfected himself?⁸⁷

ENDING OF THE ROUND OF BIRTHS⁸⁸Turning to the Dharma

12 Here, bhiksus, there arises in this world the Tathāgata [Thus Come], an arhat, fully self-awakened, accomplished in knowledge and conduct, well-gone, knower of the worlds,⁸⁹ unexcelled trainer of tamable persons, teacher of beings human and divine, awakened, blessed.

Having realized by his own direct knowledge this world with its gods, its Māras [evil ones], and its Brahmās [high gods], this generation with its recluses and brahmins, its rulers⁹⁰ and people, he makes it known to others. He teaches the Dharma, good in its beginning, good in its middle, good in its end, endowed with meaning and phrasing. He proclaims the holy life that is entirely complete and pure.

13 A householder or householder's son, hearing the Dharma, gains faith⁹¹ in the Tathāgata and reflects:

‘The household life is stifling, a dusty path. The life of renunciation is like the open air. It is not easy living in a house to practise the holy life completely, in all its purity, like a polished conch-shell. What if I were to shave off my hair and beard, put on the saffron robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?’

So after some time he abandons his wealth, great or small,⁹² [345] and his circle of relatives, large or small, shaves off his hair and beard, puts on the saffron robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness.

Thus, too, bhikshus, is the exertion fruitful, the striving fruitful.

⁸⁷ Here, the arhat is meant. To stress that the Buddha does not torment himself nor anyone else, he next describes the path of practice by which he himself arrives at awakening.

⁸⁸ From here right to the end [§§12-27] as in **Cūḷa Hatthi, padōpa ma S** (M 27.11-26/1:178-184) = SD 40a.5.

⁸⁹ Comy mentions the 3 worlds—that of space (*okāsa*), that of beings (*satta*), that of formations (*saṅkhāra*)—and says that here, the world of beings (*satta, loka*) is meant (Vism 7.37/204 f; DA 1:173 f; MA 1:397, 2:200). For details, see **Rohitassa S** (S 2.26/1:61 f) in SD 7.1 Intro.

⁹⁰ *Deva*, here in the sense of “devas by convention” (*sammati, deva*), ie kings. The other 2 types of *deva* are “gods by rebirth” (*upapatti, deva*) and “gods by purification” (*visuddhi, deva*), ie the Buddhas, Pratyeka Buddhas and arhats. (NC 307 KhA 123).

⁹¹ “Faith,” *saddhā*. There are 2 kinds of faith (*saddhā*): (1) “rootless faith” (*amūlaka, saddhā*), baseless or irrational faith, blind faith. (M 2:170); (2) “faith with a good cause” (*ākāravati, saddhā*), faith founded on seeing (M 1:320, 8 401, 23); also called *avecca-p, pasāda* (S 12.41.11/2:69). “Wise faith” is syn with (2). *Amūlaka* = “not seen, not heard, not suspected” (V 2:243 3:163 & Comy). **Gethin** speaks of two kinds of faith: the cognitive and the affective (eg ERE: Faith & Jayatilleke, *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge*, 1963:387): “Faith in its cognitive dimension is seen as concerning belief in propositions or statements of which one does not—or perhaps cannot—have knowledge proper (however that should be defined); cognitive faith is a mode of knowing in a different category from that knowledge. Faith is its affective dimension is a more straightforward positive response to trust or confidence towards something or somebody...the conception of *saddhā* in Buddhist writings appears almost, if not entirely affective, the cognitive element is completely secondary.” (Gethin 2001:207; my emphases).

⁹² On the accumulation of wealth, cf **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16.1.23-24/2:85 f).

(A) MORAL VIRTUE
THE LESSER SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE⁹³

Purity of body

14 He is thus one gone forth and possessing the monk's training and way of life:

(1) Having abandoned the destruction of life, he abstains from destroying life. He dwells with rod and weapon laid down, conscientious,⁹⁴ merciful, compassionate for the welfare of all living beings.

(2) Having abandoned the taking of the not-given, he abstains from taking what is not given. He takes only what is given, accepts only what is given, lives not by stealth but by means of a pure mind.

(3) Having abandoned incelibacy, he lives a celibate life,⁹⁵ living apart, refraining from the sexual act, the way of the village.⁹⁶

Purity of speech

(4) Having abandoned false speech, he abstains from false speech. He speaks the truth, the truth is his bond,⁹⁷ trustworthy, reliable, no deceiver of the world.⁹⁸

(5) Having abandoned divisive speech he abstains from divisive speech. What he has heard here he does not tell there to break those people apart from these people here. What he has heard there he does not tell here to break these people apart from those people there.⁹⁹

Thus reconciling those who have broken apart or consolidating those who are united, he loves concord, delights in concord, enjoys concord, speaks things that create concord.

(6) Having abandoned harsh [abusive] speech, he abstains from harsh speech. He speaks words that are humane, soothing, loving, touching, urbane, and delightful and pleasant to the multitude.

(7) Having abandoned idle chatter, he abstains from idle chatter. He speaks in season, speaks what is true, what is in accordance with the goal [or, what is beneficial].¹⁰⁰ He speaks on the Dharma [Teaching]¹⁰¹ and the Vinaya [Discipline].¹⁰² He speaks words worth treasuring, seasonable, backed by reason, measured, connected with the goal.¹⁰³

General

(8) He abstains from damaging seeds and plant life.¹⁰⁴

⁹³ This section [33] as at **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1.8-27/1:4-11), **Mahā Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S** (M 37.33-39/1:267-270) = SD 7.10; cf **Sāleyyaka S** (M 41.7-14/1:287), **Kandaraka S** (M 51.14-19/1:345-7), **Cha-b,bisodhana S** (M 112.-13-17/3:33-36); also A 2:208, 4:249; Pug 56.

⁹⁴ *Lajjī*, "feel shame, modest", explain in the Comy on S 1:73 as "one who has moral shame (*hiri*) and moral fear (*ottappa*)."⁹⁹ Opp *alajjī*, shameless.

⁹⁵ *Brahma,cariya* is the supreme conduct or holy life, ie celibacy. Dīgha Comy points out that it involves refraining from other forms of erotic behaviour besides intercourse (DA 1:73).

⁹⁶ *Gāma,dhamma*, ie the way of the householder, vulgar (in the sense of being associated with the masses) (MA 2:206 = DA 1:72).

⁹⁷ "The truth is his bond," *sacca,sandha*. Comy glosses as *saccena saccam sandahati*, "he joins truth with truth" (MA 1:206 = DA 1:73).

⁹⁸ This verse as in **Lakkhaṇa S** (D 30.2.16/3:170).

⁹⁹ This verse as in **Sāleyyaka S** (M 41.9/1:286 f) & **Sevitabbāsevitabba S** (M 114.6/3:49).

¹⁰⁰ *attha,vādī*. That is, he speaks about what is connected with the spiritual goal here and now, and hereafter (MA 2:208; DA 1:76).

¹⁰¹ He speaks on the 9 supramundane things (*nava lok'uttara,dhamma*) (MA 2:208 = DA 1:76), ie the 4 paths, 4 fruitions, nirvana (Dhs 1094).

¹⁰² The discipline of restraint (*saṁvara*) [of the senses] and of letting go (*pahāna*) [of defilements] (MA 2:208 = DA 1:76).

¹⁰³ *Attha,samhitam*.

¹⁰⁴ Curiously, this replaces the precept against intoxicants, which is omitted. As at D 1:10. On *bīja,gāma,bhūta,-gāma*, see Pāc 11 (V 4:34); see also D 1:5; MA 2:208.

Novice's precepts 6-10

- (9) He eats only once a day, refraining from the evening meal and from food at improper times.¹⁰⁵
 (10) He abstains from dancing, singing, music and from watching shows.¹⁰⁶
 (11) He abstains from wearing garlands and from beautifying himself with scents and make-up.¹⁰⁷
 (12) He abstains from high and luxurious beds and seats.¹⁰⁸
 (13) He abstains from accepting gold and silver [money].¹⁰⁹

General

- (14) He abstains from accepting uncooked grain;
 (15) He abstains from accepting raw meat.¹¹⁰
 (16) He abstains from accepting women and girls.
 (17) He abstains from accepting male and female slaves.
 (18) He abstains from accepting goats and sheep.
 (19) He abstains from accepting fowl and pigs.
 (20) He abstains from accepting elephants, cattle, horses, and mares.
 (21) He abstains from accepting fields and lands [landed property].¹¹¹
 (22) He abstains from running messages [or errands].¹¹²
 (23) He abstains from buying and selling.
 (24) He abstains from dealing with false scales, false metals,¹¹³ and false measures.¹¹⁴ [346]
 (25) He abstains from bribery, deception, and fraud.
 (26) He abstains from wounding, executing, imprisoning, highway robbery, plunder, and violence.¹¹⁵

(B) MENTAL CULTIVATION

Contentment

15 He is content with robes to protect his body and with almsfood to maintain his belly, and wherever he goes he sets out only with these¹¹⁶ with him.

¹⁰⁵ "Improper times" here means between noon and the following dawn (V 1:83, 4:86); cf S 5:470; A 1:212; Kvu 2.6.

¹⁰⁶ A *dukkata* (wrong-doing) offence for monks (V 2:108); a *pācittiya* for nuns (V 4:267). Cf D 1:6, Kvu 2.7.

¹⁰⁷ Cf Kvu 2.8.

¹⁰⁸ See Pāc 87; V 1:192, 2:163; D 1:7; A 1:181. Comy says that the "high beds" are those that exceed the prescribed measurements and the "large beds" are those that are not allowable (MA 2:209).

¹⁰⁹ See Nissagāya 18 (V 3:236 ff); Kvu 2.10. For detailed discussion, see "Money and Monastics" (essay) in SD 4.19-23.

¹¹⁰ "Raw meat." See V 3:208 where the nun Uppala.vaṇṇā prepares or roasts meat before offering to the Buddha.

¹¹¹ The Buddha however accepted land from rajahs like Bimbisāra and Pasenadi, and others like Anāthapiṇḍika and Visākhā, which were all received in the name of the Sangha. What is connoted here is accepting land on a personal basis.

¹¹² "Running messages." See D 1:8; S 3:239.

¹¹³ "False metals," *kaṁsa, kūṭa*. See Nun's Nis 11, 12 & n at V:H 3:230. Comy however says that *kaṁsa* refers to a bronze bowl with a veneer of golden colour presented as a golden bowl to mislead others. (MA 2:210 = DA 1:79).

¹¹⁴ Comys mention 3 methods: *hadaya, bheda* ("heartbreak"), used in measuring ghee, oil, etc; *sikhā, bheda* ("heap break"), used in measuring sesamum, husked rice, etc; *raju, bheda* ("cord break"), used in measuring fields and sites (MA 2:210 = DA 1:79). *Sikhā* refers to a pyramid-shaped heap of grain on a tray of prescribed measurements.

¹¹⁵ Dīgha Comy says that they kidnap victims by hiding in the snow and by hiding in a thicket (DA 1:80).

¹¹⁶ "These," ie the 8 requisites (*aṭṭha parikkhāra*): a small razor (*khuddaka, vāsi*), needle (*sūci*), water-strainer (*parissāvāna*), almsbowl (*patta*) with a shoulder-strap, the triple robe (*ti, cīvara*), belt (*kāya, paṭibandha*) (MA 2:213 = DA 1:297; DA 1:206 = J 1:65; DhA 2:61; J 4:342, 5:254). Explained in detail at DA 1:206 f.

Here, just as a bird, wherever it goes, flies with its wings as its only burden, so, too, he is content with robes to protect his body¹¹⁷ and with almsfood to maintain his belly, and wherever he goes, he takes only these with him.¹¹⁸

Possessing this aggregate of noble virtue, he experiences within himself a blameless joy.¹¹⁹

Sense-restraint

16¹²⁰ (1) Here, bhikshus, when a monk sees a form with the eye, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**, insofar as he dwells unrestrained in that eye-faculty

so that the evil, wholesome states of covetousness and displeasure¹²¹ might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the eye-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the eye-faculty.

(2) When he hears a sound with the ear, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**, insofar as he dwells unrestrained in that ear-faculty

so that the evil, wholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the ear-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the ear-faculty.

(3) When he smells a smell with the nose, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**, insofar as he dwells unrestrained in that nose-faculty

so that the evil, wholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

¹¹⁷ As in **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.66/1:71).

¹¹⁸ This whole section (Contentment) up to here as in “the mental development” section of **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.66/1:71).

¹¹⁹ “A blameless joy,” *anavajja,sukham*. Comy: “He experiences within himself a blameless, faultless, wholesome bodily and mental happiness accompanied by such phenomena as non-remorse, gladness, rapture, and tranquility, which are based on moral virtue as their proximate cause” (DA 1:183); “a happiness free from faults” (*niddosa,sukha*, MA 2:214 = AA 3:198). Evidently, this joy arises on account of being free from the fear of being blamed of moral faults. Cf *avyāseka,sekha* below [§16]. See Intro (5).

¹²⁰ This whole para: *Idha bhikkhave bhikkhu cakkhunā rūpaṃ disvā na nimitta-g,gāhī hoti nānuyyañjana-g,gāhī. Yatvādhikaraṇaṃ enaṃ cakkhundriyaṃ asaṃvutaṃ viharantaṃ abhijjhā,domanassā pāpakā akusalā dhammā anvāssaveyyuṃ, tassa sarivarāya paṭipajjati, rakkhati cakkhundriyaṃ, cakkhundriye sarivaraṃ āpajjati.* On *Na nimitta-g,gāhī hoti nānuyyañjana-g,gāhī*, lit “he is not one who grasps at a sign, he is not one who grasps at a detail (feature),” see SD 19.14. Comys say that “**sign**”(*nimitta*) here refers to a grasping arising through one’s sensual lust (*chanda,rāga,vasena*) or on account of merely one’s view (*diṭṭhi,matta,vasena*); “**detail**” (*anuyyañjana*) here refers to finding delight by grasping at another’s limb or body part (eyes, arms, legs, etc) (Nm 2:390; Nc 141, 141; DhsA 400, 402; cf MA 1:75, 4:195; SA 3:4, 394; Nc 1:55; DhA 1:74). On other meanings of *nimitta*, see SD 13 §3.1a.

¹²¹ “Covetousness and displeasure,” *abhijjhā,domanassam*, which Walshe (1995:335 & n632) renders as “hankering and fretting for the world”; alt tr “covetousness and displeasure” or “longing and loathing.” MA says that longing and displeasure signify the first two hindrances—sensual desire and ill will—principal hindrances to be overcome for the practice to succeed. They thus represent the contemplation of mind-objects, which begins with the five hindrances. Cf M 1:274/39.13; see also **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22.13) and **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.36) on how to deal with the hindrances in one’s meditation. The monk effects the abandoning of the hindrances by the contemplations of impermanence, fading away (of lust), cessation (of suffering) and letting go (of defilements), and thus comes to look upon the object with equanimity. On *abhijjhā,domanassa*, there is an interesting related passage from **Pubba or Pubb’eva Sambodha S** (A 3.101): “Bhikshus, before my enlightenment, when I was still a bodhisattva, this thought occurred to me... ‘Whatever physical and mental joy (*sukha,somanassa*) there is in the world, that is the gratification (*assāda*) in the world; that the world is impermanent, suffering and of the nature to change, that is the disadvantages (*ādīnava*) in the world—the removal and abandoning of desire and lust for the world, that is the escape from the world.’” (A 3.101/1:258, pointed out to me by Robert Eddison).

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the nose-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the nose-faculty.

(4) When he tastes a taste with the tongue, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**, insofar as he dwells unrestrained in that tongue-faculty

so that the evil, wholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the tongue-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the tongue-faculty.

(5) When he feels a touch with the body, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**, insofar as he dwells unrestrained in that body-faculty

so that the evil, wholesome states of covetousness and displeasure might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained.

He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the body-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the body-faculty.

(6) When he cognizes a mind-object with the mind, **he grasps neither its sign nor its detail**, insofar as he dwells unrestrained in that mind-faculty so that covetousness and displeasure, evil unwholesome states, might overwhelm him, to that extent, he therefore keeps himself restrained. He practises the restraint of it. He guards the restraint of the mind-faculty, he commits himself to the restraint of the mind-faculty.¹²²

Possessing this noble sense-restraint, he experiences within himself an undefiled joy.¹²³

Full awareness

17 When going forward and returning, he acts with full awareness.¹²⁴

When looking toward and looking away, he acts with full awareness.

When bending and extending his limbs, he acts with full awareness.

When carrying his outer robe, his upper robe, and his bowl, he acts with full awareness.

When eating, drinking, chewing, and tasting, he acts with full awareness.

When voiding and peeing, he acts with full awareness.

When walking, while standing, while sitting, while asleep, while awake, while talking, and while remaining silent, he acts with full awareness.

Possessing this aggregate of noble full awareness, he experiences within himself an undefiled joy.¹²⁵

ATTAINING THE DHYANAS

Overcoming the 5 mental hindrances¹²⁶

18 Possessing this aggregate of noble virtue and this aggregate of noble sense-restraint and this aggregate of noble full awareness,¹²⁷ he seeks out a secluded dwelling: a forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, a jungle grove, the open air, a heap of straw.¹²⁸

¹²² D 2.64/1:70, 10.2.2/1:207, 33.1.11(10)/3:225; M 27.15/1:180, 33.20/1:223, 38.35/1:269, 51.16/1:346, 53.8/1:355, 94.18/2:162, 101.33/2:226; S 35.120/4:104, 35.239/4:176; A 3.16/1:113, 4.14/2:16, 4.37/2:39, 4.164/2:152 (×4), 4.198.11/2:210, 5.76.12/3:99 f, 5.140.11/3:163, 10.99.6/5:206, 11.18.23/5:351. For a study, see SD 9.14.

¹²³ *So iminā ariyena indriya samivarena samannāgato ajjhataṃ abyāseka, sukhaṃ paṭisaṃvedeti.* Cf *Sāmañña-phala S* (D 2.63/1:70) = SD 8.10. Evidently, this undefiled joy (*abyāseka, sukha*) arises from meditation and mindfulness: also at §17 below; cf *anavajja, sukha* above [§15].

¹²⁴ “He acts with full awareness,” *sampajāna, kāri*, lit “he is one who works with full awareness.” *Sāmañña-phala S* (D 2.67/1:71) reading: *sati, sampajāna, kāri*, “he acts with mindfulness and full awareness,” so too below here [§36]. As in *Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S* (D 22.4/2:293) = *Satipaṭṭhāna S* (M 10.8/1:57).

¹²⁵ “A undefiled joy,” *avyāseka, sukhaṃ* [vl *abyāseka, sukhaṃ*]: see §16 n.

¹²⁶ As in *Satipaṭṭhāna S* (M 10.36/1:60). See details in *Mahā Assa, pura S* (M 39.12-18/1:274 f).

¹²⁷ As in *Sāmañña, phala S* (D 2.67/1:71).

19 Returning from his almsround, after his meal, he sits down, crosses his legs, holds his body erect, and establishes mindfulness before him.¹²⁹

(1) Abandoning **covetousness** with regard to the world, he dwells with a mind devoid of covetousness. He cleanses his mind of covetousness. **[347]**

(2) Abandoning **ill will and anger**, he dwells with a mind devoid of ill will and anger, sympathetic with the welfare of all living beings. He cleanses his mind of ill will and anger.

(3) Abandoning **sloth and torpor**, he dwells with a mind devoid of sloth and torpor, mindful, alert, perceiving light. He cleanses his mind of sloth and torpor.

(4) Abandoning **restlessness and worry**, he dwells undisturbed, his mind inwardly stilled. He cleanses his mind of restlessness and worry.

(5) Abandoning **spiritual doubt**, he dwells having crossed over doubt, with no perplexity with regard to wholesome mental states. He cleanses his mind of doubt.

Thus, too, bhikshus, is the exertion fruitful, the striving fruitful.

The 4 mental dhyanas

20 (1) Having thus abandoned the five mental hindrances, impurities of the mind that weaken wisdom, quite detached from sensual pleasures, detached from unwholesome mental states, he enters and remains in **the first dhyana**, accompanied by initial application (*vitakka*) and sustained application (*vicāra*), accompanied by zest (*pīti*) and happiness (*sukha*) born of seclusion [ie *samādhī*].

Thus, too, bhikshus, is the exertion fruitful, the striving fruitful.

21 (2) Furthermore, bhikshus, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he enters and remains in **the second dhyana**, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration.¹³⁰

Thus, too, bhikshus, is the exertion fruitful, the striving fruitful.

22 (3) And furthermore, bhikshus, with the fading away of zest, he dwells equanimous, mindful and fully aware, and experiences happiness with the body. He enters and remains in **the third dhyana**, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’

Thus, too, bhikshus, is the exertion fruitful, the striving fruitful.

23 (4) And furthermore, bhikshus, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain,¹³¹ and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure, attains and dwells in **the fourth dhyana** that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.¹³²

Thus, too, bhikshus, is the exertion fruitful, the striving fruitful.

¹²⁸ “He seeks out... a heap of straw,” see **Mahā Assapura S** on wakefulness (M 39.12/1:274) & **Gaṇaka Moggallāna S** (M 107.8/3:3).

¹²⁹ Comy. He applies mindfulness towards his meditation subject; or he sets it up in the region of the mouth. As such, it is said in the Vibhaṅga: “This mindfulness is set up, set up well, at the tip of the nose or at the sign of the mouth” (Vbh §537/252). NT: The “sign of the mouth” (*mukha, nimitta*) is the middle region of the upper lip, against which the air strikes when it comes out of the nose.

¹³⁰ The 2nd dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (*ariya, tuṅhī, bhāva*) because within it initial application and sustained application (*vitakka, vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur (S 2:273); cf S 4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī, saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. In **Ariya, pariyesanā S** (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate).

¹³¹ “Joy... pain,” *sukha... dukkha*: this refers to *physical* feelings. The next phrase—“pleasure and displeasure,” *domanassa... somanassa*—refers to *mental* feelings, transcended earlier. Mental feelings must be overcome first so that the mind is not distracted by itself, as it were. Then, all the other feelings (arising from the physical sense-contacts) are transcended. On the significance of this, see **Sall’atthēna S** (S 36.6/4:207-210) = SD 5.5.

¹³² Here, **Vibhaṅga** gives 3 factors of the 4th dhyana—equanimity (*upekkhā*), mindfulness (*sati*) and one-pointedness of mind (*cittassa ek’aggatā*)—according to the Sutta analysis (Vbh 261), and 2 factors—equanimity and one-pointedness of the mind—according to the Abhidhamma analysis (Vbh 164; Vism 4.183/165). See also **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2.83/1:75) = SD 8.10 & **Dhyana** = SD 8.4 (5.4).

THE THREE KNOWLEDGES

The mundane direct knowledge [§89-98]

(1) The knowledge of the recollection of past lives [rebirth]

24 With his concentrated mind thus purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects,¹³³ pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, he directs it to **the knowledge of the recollection of past lives**.¹³⁴ He recollects manifold past existence, that is to say, one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births, ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births, one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births, many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion, many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-rose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, [348] such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-rose here.’

Thus,¹³⁵ bhikshus, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details.

Thus,¹³⁶ too, bhikshus, is the exertion fruitful, the striving fruitful.

(2) The knowledge of the rebirth of beings [karma]

25 With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, he directs it to **the knowledge of the passing away and re-arising of beings**.¹³⁷ He sees—by means of the divine eye [clairvoyance],¹³⁸ purified and surpassing the human—beings passing away and re-arising, and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma:

‘These beings, alas, sirs—who were endowed with evil conduct of body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—with the body’s breaking up, after death, have re-arisen in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell.

But these beings, sirs—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—with the body’s breaking up, after death, have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.’

Thus, by means of the divine eye, thus purified, surpassing the human, he sees beings passing away and re-arising, and how they fare according to their karma.

Thus, too, bhikshus, is the exertion fruitful, the striving fruitful.

¹³³ *Upakkileśa*: to be distinguished from *kileśa*, “defilement.” Perhaps the 10 “imperfections of insight” listed in *Vism* 20.105 ff are meant here, but potential hindrances at a certain stage of insight meditation. (Walshe)

¹³⁴ *Pubbe, nivāsanānussati*, lit “recollection of past abiding [existence].” The remainder of this is expanded into 4 sections in **Brahmajāla S** (D 1.1.31-34/1: 13-16 = SD 25.3(76.3)) and 3 sections in **Sampasādaniya S** (D 27.15-17/3: 107-112 = SD 10.12). In both cases, each explains how the eternalist view arose.

¹³⁵ *Iti*.

¹³⁶ *Evam*.

¹³⁷ *Cutūpapāta ñāṇa*, or “knowledge of rebirth according to karma” (*yathā, kammūpaga ñāṇa*), or “the divine eye” (*dibba, cakḅhu*): see foll n.

¹³⁸ *Dibba, cakḅhu*, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (*dhamma, cakḅhu*) (see n in §104). On the relationship of this knowledge to the 62 grounds for wrong views, see **Brahmajāla S** (D 1) = SD 25.3(76.3). See pre c.

(C) DEVELOPMENT OF WISDOM

The mundane direct knowledge [§44]

(3) The knowledge of the destruction of mental cankers

26 With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, the monk directs it to **the knowledge of the destruction of the mental cankers**.¹³⁹

He knows, as it is really is, “This is suffering (*dukkha*)”;
 He knows, as it is really is, “This is the arising of suffering”;
 He knows, as it is really is, “This is the ending of suffering”;
 He knows, as it is really is, “This is the path to the ending of suffering”¹⁴⁰

He knows, as it is really is, “These are mental cankers (*āsava*)”;
 He knows, as it is really is, “This is the arising of cankers”;
 He knows, as it is really is, “This is the ending of cankers”;
 He knows, as it is really is, “This is the path to the ending of cankers.”¹⁴¹

27 His mind, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the canker of sensual desire, the canker of existence, the canker of ignorance.¹⁴² With release, there is the knowledge, ‘Released (am I)!’ He knows that ‘Birth is ended, the holy life has been lived, done is that which needs to be done. There is nothing further beyond this.’¹⁴³

28 This person, bhikshus, is called one who neither torments himself, not intent on self-torment, nor torments others, not intent on tormenting others. Neither tormenting self nor tormenting others, he is right here and now hunger-free, quenched and cooled, and abides enjoying bliss, having himself become holy [supreme like Brahmā himself].¹⁴⁴

The Blessed One said this. The monks with joyful hearts approved of the Blessed One’s word.

— evaṃ —

¹³⁹ *Āsava-k, khaya, nāṇa*. The term *āsava* (lit “cankers”) comes from *ā-savati* “flows towards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously translated as taints (“deadly taints”, RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists four *āsava*: the canker of (1) sense-desire (*kāma’āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence or becoming (*bhav’āsava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭh’āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijj’āsava*) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These four are also known as “floods” (*oghā*) and “yokes” (*yogā*). The list of three cankers (omitting the canker of views) [43] is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these *āsavas* is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict under *āsava*.

¹⁴⁰ These 4 statements on suffering pose an interesting problem: they are not called “noble truths” here (nor in **Ariya, pariyesanā S**, M 26.43). Elsewhere, KR Norman (a non-Buddhist scholar) remarks that these four statements, which also likewise appear in **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36.42/1:249), but are not referred to as the noble truths about suffering, “and since they appear to be subordinate to the four statements about the *āsavas*, it is possible that the statements about misery are a later addition [here], which led to a parallel, but inappropriate, set of four statements being evolved about the *āsavas*, to provide a symmetry” (Norman 1990:26). For a discussion on the formulation of the noble truths, see Norman 1982:377-91 & also Schmithausen 1981:205.

¹⁴¹ As in **Ariya, pariyesanā S** (M 26.42) = SD 1. On the application of the four noble truth template to both *dukkha* and to *āsava* here, see Analayo 2003:224 n28 & SD 17.4(8.4)

¹⁴² See §97a n.

¹⁴³ *Nāparam itthatāya*: lit. “there is no more of ‘thusness.’” See **Mahānidāna S** (M 15.22) = SD 5.17.

¹⁴⁴ This is the closing of the passage of the 4th type of person which starts at §11.

M 2.1.1

Majjhima Nikāya 2, Majjhima Paṇṇāsa 1, Gahapati Vagga 1

070514; 070523; 100327; 100517; 101004; 101124