

14

Uddesa Vibhaṅga Sutta

The Discourse on a Summary and an Analysis | M 138/3:223-229

Theme: How to be mindful externally and internally

Translated by Piya Tan ©2010

1 Sutta summary and highlights

1.1 SUTTA SUMMARY. The **Uddesa Vibhaṅga Sutta** (M 138), which has a parallel in the Chinese Āgamas and some Sanskrit fragments,¹ gives a summary of dhyana meditation practice. It opens with the Buddha giving a summary of the teaching [§3] by way of the usual syllabus that often opens the teachings of the Majjhima Nikāya.² What is briefly stated by the Buddha is then elaborated by **Mahā Kaccāna**.³

The monks, wishing to know the details of what is briefly stated by the Buddha, approaches Māha Kaccāna [§§5-6]. Out of respect for the Buddha, Kaccāna, using the heartwood parable, replies that they should have asked the Buddha to do so earlier, as he is the best teacher to do [§7a]. The monks retort that Mahā Kaccāna has been praised by the Buddha as being the foremost of those monks who is capable of elaborating on what is briefly taught by the Buddha [§8]. This is a case where the Dharma or Teaching is presented as being above the teacher (however, since the Buddha is still living, he is approached after Kaccāna's discourse for endorsement).

Mahā Kaccāna begins his discourse by explaining the meaning of the mind is distracted externally, that is, when we are caught up with our sense-experiences [§10]. Conversely, when we let go of such experiences, we undistracted externally [§11]. Next, Kaccāna speaks on how the mind is slack internally, that is, in looking to dhyana for its pleasurable aspects [§12-15]. Conversely, in letting go of the grosser dhyana factors, there is spiritual progress [§§16-19].

For details on meditation progress through dhyana-factor reduction, it is helpful to look at **the (Pañcācāla,canda) Sambādha Sutta** (A 9.42).⁴ Up to this point, Kaccāna's exposition clearly points to the "calm" (*samatha*) aspect of meditation practice [§§10-19], while the rest of it deals with the cultivation of "insight" (*vipassanā*) [§§20-21].

Again, out of respect to the Buddha, Kaccāna announces that he has exposition is in keeping with what the Buddha has taught, and that he (the Buddha) should be approached for endorsement [§22]. When the monks approach the Buddha, he not only endorses Kaccāna's teaching [§23] but also praises his wisdom [§24].

1.2 SUTTA HIGHLIGHTS

1.2.1 Uddesa,vibhaṅga. The expression, *uddesa,vibhaṅga*, needs some explanation. If taken as a dvandva (copulative compound),⁵ it is resolved as *uddesa* and *vibhaṅga*. *Uddesa* (n) literally means "pointing out"), but here it means "teaching" (usually by way of a formula or recitation). It comes from the verb *uddisati* ("he stretches forth (a hand); he points at; points out; specifies; declares; has in mind"), derived from the prefix *ud-* ("out, up (subjective sense)") + √DIŚ, "to show, point out."

¹ MĀ 164 = T1.26.694b-696b, titled 分別觀法 *Fēnbiéguānfǎ* "exposition on contemplating dharmas," gives the same venue. Part of the opening narrative is preserved in Skt, in SHT V 1141 (p138, identified in SHT VIII 196), which parallels the account of the monks approaching Mahā Kaccāna for a detail exposition (M 138.5-6/1:223-224).

² For discourses opening with a thesis or syllabus, see eg **Mūla,pariyāya S** (M 1.2/1:1), **Sabb'āsava S** (M 2.2/-1:6), **Anāṅga S** (M 5.2/1:24), **Cūḷa siha.nāda S** (M 11.2/1:64 f), **Vana,pattha S** (M 17.2/1:104), **Vitakka Saṅghāna S** (M 20.2/1:119). See foll n.

³ **Mahā Kaccāna** (or Kaccāyana) is the foremost amongst monks who are able to expound in detail what has been taught in brief (A 1:23). **Madhu,piṇḍika S** (M 18/1:108-114 = SD 6.14), **Mahā Kaccāna Bhadd'eka,ratta S** (M 133/3:194 f) and **Uddesa,vibhaṅga S** (M 138/3:223-229 = SD 33.14) record teachings by him under similar circumstances.

⁴ A 9.42/4:449-451 = SD 33.2.

⁵ A **dvandva** (Skt; P *dvanda*) is a copulative cpd, the meaning of which is clarified by inserting "and" (or equivalent) btw the cpd's components, eg *assasa,passasa*, "in-breathing *and* out-breathing" or "inhaling *and* exhaling" | *aho,ratti*, "night *and* day."

Vibhaṅga (n), “analysis, classification, division, distribution,” is made up of the prefix *vi-* (“two, asunder”) + $\sqrt{\text{BHAJ}}$, “to divide, share.” The Sutta Nipāta Commentary contextually defines *vibhaṅga* as the opposite of *uddesa* (SnA 422), which is one way the expression is used here in the Uddesa Vibhaṅga Sutta.

Apparently, in the Uddesa Vibhaṅga Sutta we have two meanings of *uddesa, vibhaṅga*. At the Sutta opening, the Buddha’s short statement (*uddesa, vibhaṅga*) is a “summarized analysis” (a *tatpurusha*),⁶ while Mahā Kaccāyana’s elaboration is the “summary analysis,” or better, an “analysis of the summary.” The Commentary glosses *uddesa, vibhaṅga* as “meaning (a *dvandva*) *uddesa* and *vibhaṅga*, that is, the headings (*māṭikā*) and analysis” (*uddesañ ca vibhaṅgañ ca, māṭikañ ca vibhajanañ cāti attho*) (MA 5:28).

With the above word analysis, we can resolve an apparent problem. The Buddha, announcing that he would give an *uddesa, vibhaṅga* [§2], expounds only a “summary” (*māṭikā*), and then enters his dwelling. This only appears as a problem if we accept the Commentary’s gloss of *uddesa, vibhaṅga* as a *dvandva*—“summary *and* exposition” (MA 5:28)—but we can take it as a *tatpurusha*, meaning “a summarized exposition,” as is done here.

1.2.2 Sanṭhita. The phrase “the mind is said to be unslack internally (*ajjhataṃ asaṅṭhitaṃ*)” is first mentioned in the Buddha’s summary [§3] and then elaborated by Mahā Kaccāna [§12], and its positive counterpart is *saṅṭhita* [§16]. Most translators have rendered *saṅṭhita* as “stuck” and its antonym, *asaṅṭhita* as “unstuck.”⁷ The word also appears in a parallel discourse, **the Upaparikkha Sutta** (It 3.5.5) [2], where translators have rendered it as “fixed” or “fixed.”⁸

While IB Horner (in her Majjhima translation, 1959) was probably aware of the derivations of *asaṅṭhita*, only Peter Masefield has noted them in his translations (It:M, 2001; ItA:M 2009) that “this [*asaṅṭhita*] is the equivalent of Skt *aśranthita*, rather than *asaṅṭhita*” (It:M 96 n186), and he alludes to the Critical Pali Dictionary (CPD) entry under *asaṅṭhita*.² The CPD defines the two words as follows:

- (1) ¹**a-saṅṭhita** [Skt a + *saṅsthita*], not standing, not remaining (in);
- (2) ²**a-saṅṭhita** [Skt a + *aśranthita*, cf *saṅthāna*] not loose or slackened (steadfast).

The first form is the opposite of *saṅṭhita*, meaning “standing, remaining, fixed, set, composed,” often used in the positive sense (Sn 755). It is itself the past participle of *santiṭṭhati*, with these more common senses:

- (1) “he stands, stands still, remains, continues” (A 4:101);
- (2) “it is established, put into order” (V 2:11);
- (3) “it stick to, is fixed to, settled, composed” (D 2:206; S 5:321; It 43).

In translation, determining the meaning of a word, phrase, or sentence is like getting the right tool for the work: its success lies in teasing out the context faithfully and correctly. Here, in the Uddesa Vibhaṅga Sutta (M 138) and the Upaparikkha Sutta (It 3.5.5), the context is the same: *dhyana*.

The suttas remind us not to be *saṅṭhita* in the *dhyanas*. Discourses such as **the Raho, gata Sutta** (S 36.11) and **the (Āsava-k, khaya) Jhāna Sutta** (A 9.36) remind us that we need to progress through the *dhyanas*, and not revel in *dhyanic* bliss for the sake of it.⁹ In a sense, we should not remain “stuck” (*saṅṭhita*) in any *dhyana*. Yet any experienced *dhyana* master would tell you that we can never be *stuck* in a *dhyana* for the simple reason that *dhyanas* are “stages of letting go.”¹⁰ As such, while “stuck” (the first sense) is a *right* translation of *saṅṭhita*, it does not *fit* the context well.

⁶ A *tatpurusha* (Skt *tatpuruṣa*; P *tappurisa*, lit “that person”) is a dependent cpd with its first constituent as a noun or noun stem that qualifies the second constituent in the form of a possessor (eg “yak-skin”), or thing possessed (eg “chariot-wheel”), object of action (“garland-maker”), location or habit (eg “tree-deva”), agent (eg “mind-made”), instrument (eg “water-logged”), etc.

⁷ So Nāṇamoli/Bodhi (M:ÑB 1075 f), Analayo 2006:600 & n154. Thanissaro attempts an almost technical and literal tr as “positioned” (ie “internally positioned”) (<http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.138.than.html>). Only IB Horner has rendered it as “slackened” (M:H 3:273) and “unslackened” (M:H 3:274) respectively.

⁸ FL Woodward (It:W 182), “set”; JD Ireland (It:I 71).

⁹ See **Raho, gata S** (S 36.11/4:216-218) = SD 33.6 Intro (3.2) (The 9 successive stages of deep meditation) & **(Āsava-k, khaya) Jhāna S** (A 9.36/4:422-426) = SD 33.8 Intro (2) (The progressive abodes).

¹⁰ Brahmavamso 2006:130 f.

In dhyana practice, the dhyana teachers often tell us to master the dhyana well fast—in other words, simply and thoroughly *enjoy* it—so that we can easily attain it, remain in it, and emerge at the right time.¹¹ In other words, we need to apply some wisdom in how we can use dhyana as a door to spiritual awakening¹²—that is to say, we should not *slacken* in our dhyana practice, or any meditation practice, for that matter. As such, the second sense of *asañhita* should be applied here.

POSITIVE USAGE OF SAÑHITA. It is useful to contrast the often negative sense of *sañhita*, as we have seen above, with its positive usage (the first sense). In **the Kāya,gata,sati Sutta** (M 119), for example, the samadhi refrain states that when thought about the household life is abandoned in a meditator, “the mind steadies itself internally” (*ajjhattam eva cittaṃ santiṭṭhati*).¹³

In another context, **the Cūla Suññata Sutta** (M 121) describes how a meditator, having gained concentration through the earth kasina, and progressively through each of the four formless spheres, “the mind plunges (into that sphere), brightens up, steadies and frees itself” (*cittaṃ pakkhandati pasidati santiṭṭhati vimuccati*).¹⁴

The Kuṇḍaliya Sutta (S 46.6) records the Buddha explaining how meditation leads to liberation, beginning with how sense-restraint leads to the meditator’s mind becoming “well settled within and well liberated” (*cittaṃ ajjhattam susañhitaṃ suvimuttam*).¹⁵

In all these examples of the positive usage of *sañhita*, by way of sense (2) above, shows that the mind should be inwardly settled (MA 164). Here we see *sañhita* has a positive sense of the mind settling down through sense-restraint, and with the abandoning of the mental hindrances, to go on to attain samadhi.

1.2.3 Anupāda or upāda? §20 of **the Uddesa Vibhaṅga Sutta** (M 138) has a problematic reading: *Kathaṅ c’āvuso anupādā paritassanā hoti*, “And how, avuso, is these agitation due to non-clinging?” The reading *anupādā* (“through non-clinging”) is clearly uncharacteristic of the Buddha’s teaching. Apparently, this is an ancient pre-commentarial reading or error. Although the Commentary notes this reading against that of **the Arahata Sutta 2** (S 22.7), which reads correctly as *upādā, paritassanā hoti*,¹⁶ it still keeps to the reading *anupādā*, explaining that “the agitation arises through non-existence of nothing to cling to” etc (MA 5:28).

The same reading is found in Uddesa Vibhaṅga Sutta’s counterpart in MĀ 164, which reads 不受而恐怖 *bùshou’érkóngbù*, “not clinging [there] is agitation.” This text comes from the Madhyama Āgama of the Sarvāstivāda, translated into Chinese by Saṅghadeva (僧伽提婆 *Sēngjiātípó*) in the Eastern Jin dynasty (東晉 *Dòng Jin*, 397-398 CE). This means that the error is an ancient one, going back to a time when there was still a common canon of texts, certainly not later than the 3rd-4th century CE.

All major modern translators, however, follow the Saṃyutta reading.¹⁷ This passage is found almost verbatim in **the Upādā Paritassanā Sutta 1** (S 22.7), but where the reading is *upādā*, instead of *anupādā*—which makes better sense.¹⁸ This section is also found in **the Arahata Sutta 2** (S 22.7) as stated. As already stated, an abridged version is found in **the Gaddula Sutta 1** (S 22.99).¹⁹

The parallel to SN 22:7, SA 43 at T II 10c22, does indeed speak of “clinging”, though it relates this to attachment instead of agitation, 取故生著 (*qǔ gù shēng zhù*).

¹¹ See **Pabbateyya Gavī S** (A 9.35/4:418-422) = SD 24.3 Intro (2) (The fivefold mastery).

¹² See **Aṭṭhaka,nāgara S** (M 52/1:349-353) = SD 41.2; also **Samadhi** = SD 33.1a (2) (right samadhi); **The Buddha discovers dhyana** = SD 33.1b (6.4)..

¹³ M 119.4/3:89,22 = SD 12.21.

¹⁴ M 121.5/3:105,7 etc (8 occurrences) = SD 11.3.

¹⁵ S 46.6/5:74,7.

¹⁶ S 22.7/3:15-18 = SD 42.9.

¹⁷ See M:H 3:275+n4 & M:NB 1077+n1253 (qv).

¹⁸ S 22.7/3:15-18.

¹⁹ S 22.99.7a+8a/3:150) = SD 28.7a.

2 The Upaparikkha Sutta

SD 33.14(2)

Upaparikkha Sutta

The Discourse on Examining | It 94/93 f

Traditional: It 3.5.5 Khuddaka Nikāya, Iti, vuttaka 3, Tika Nipāta 5, Pañcama Vagga 5

Theme: How to be mindful externally and internally

1 This was indeed spoken by the Blessed One, spoken by the Arhat [worthy one], thus have I heard.²⁰

2 “Bhikshus, a monk [93] should examine²¹ things in such a way that, as he is doing so, his consciousness would neither be distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, would be unagitated.²²

3 Bhikshus, if his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, is unagitated, then there is in him no further arising or producing of suffering, that is, of birth, decay and death.²³

4 This is the meaning of what the Blessed One said. The meaning here is spoken thus:

*Satta, saṅga-p, pahīnassa
netti-c, chinnassa bhikkhuno
vikkhīṇo jāti, saṃsāro
n’atthi tassa punabbhavōti*

For a monk who has abandoned the seven bonds,
who has cut himself off from the leader,
totally finished with the cycle of births—
there is no more rebirth for him.

This matter [meaning] too was spoken by the Blessed One. Thus I have heard.²⁴

— evaṃ —

2.1 The main text (in prose) of **the Upaparikkha Sutta** (It 94) [§§2-3] is the summary (*māṭikā*) spoken by the Buddha at the start of **the Uddesa Vibhaṅga Sutta** (M 138) [§3]. The verse [§4], however, is not found in the Uddesa Vibhaṅga Sutta. This is the teaching as remembered by the laywoman Khujj’uttarā, who compiled these teachings into the Iti, vuttaka.

²⁰ *Vuttam h’etaṃ bhagavatā. Vuttam arahatā’ ti me sutam.* This is said to be spoken by the laywoman **Khujj’uttarā**: see SD 16.14 Intro (1).

²¹ “Should examine,” **upaparikkheyya**, from *upa-parikkhati*, “he examines, investigates,” from *upa* (“close up to”) + *pari* (“around, complete”) + √IKṢ, “to see.” Comys glosses: “should weigh, should measure, should fully grasp, should carefully determine” (**upaparikkheyyāti tuleyya tīreyya pariggaṇheyya paricchindeyya**, MA 5:28); “should investigate, should thoroughly weigh, should fully master” (**upaparikkheyyāti vīmaṃseyya parituleyya samaseyya vā**, ItA 2:119). See **Caṅkī S** (M 95), where *upaparikkhati* is applied to “examining the Dharma” (M 95.-20/2:173 etc) = SD 21.15; **Pheṇa, piṇḍa S** (S 22.95) admonishes us to “wisely examine” (*yoniso upaparikkheyya*) the nature of impermanence in our daily experience (S S 22.95/3:140-142) = SD 17.12. Comy glosses as “should weigh, measure, explore, mark out” (MA 5:28; cf MA 1:114). Cf It 3.94 whose title is **Upaparikkha S** (It 3.94/93 f), which is a brief statement on the Uddesa Vibhaṅga S (M 138) teachings.

²² *Tathā tathā, bhikkhave, bhikkhu upaparikkheyya yathā yathā* [Ee *yathā yathāssa*] *upaparikkhato bahiddhā c’assa viññānaṃ avikkhittaṃ avisaṭaṃ ajjhataṃ asaṅghitaṃ anupādāya na paritasseyya.*

²³ *Bahiddhā, bhikkhave, viññāne avikkhite avisaṭe sati ajjhataṃ asaṅghite anupādāya aparitassato āyatim jāti, -jarā, maraṇa, dukkha, samudaya, sambhavo na hotīti.*

²⁴ *Ayam pi attho vutto bhagavatā. Iti me sutan ti.*

2.2 “The seven bonds” (*satta saṅga*) [§3] are those of craving, view, conceit, anger, ignorance, defilement, and moral misconduct. The Commentary notes that they are also a synonym for the seven latent tendencies (ItA 121). Here is their comparative table:

The 7 bonds (<i>saṅga</i>)		The 7 latent tendencies (<i>anusaya</i>)	
(1) craving	(<i>taṅhā</i>)	(1) sensual lust	(<i>kāma,rāga</i>)
(2) view	(<i>diṭṭhi</i>)	(2) aversion	(<i>paṭigha</i>)
(3) conceit	(<i>māna</i>)	(3) conceit	(<i>māna</i>)
(4) anger	(<i>kodha</i>)	(4) views	(<i>diṭṭhi</i>)
(5) ignorance	(<i>avijjā</i>)	(5) doubt	(<i>vicikicchā</i>)
(6) defilements	(<i>kilesa</i>)	(6) lust for existence	(<i>bhava,rāga</i>)
(7) moral misconduct	(<i>duccarita</i>)	(7) ignorance	(<i>avijjā</i>)

(D 3:254, 282; M 3:285; A 4:9; Pm 123; Vbh 341, 383; Yam 68); also *Anusaya* = SD 31.3 (1)

This set of seven latent tendencies is found in **the Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 33),²⁵ **the Cha, chakka Sutta** (M 148),²⁶ **the Anusaya Suttas** (A 7.11+12),²⁷ **the Paṭisambhidā, magga** (Pm 123),²⁸ **the Vibhaṅga** (Vbh 341, 383),²⁹ and **the Yamaka** (Yam 68).³⁰

2.3 “The leader” (*netti*) [§4] here refers to “the leader to existence (or existence leader)” (*bhava, netti*, ItA 121) or “the craving for existence” (*bhava, rāga*, UA 272). Existences lead us away on a leash, as it were, by keeping us within samsara (cyclic existence), so that we keep running on and are deprived of spiritual liberation and awakening (ItA 121). When the leash is severed, we are liberated; for, craving has been abandoned (UA 272).

The parable of a leashed animal, which is germane to the above passage, is found in **the Gaddula, baddha Sutta** (S 22.99).³¹

— — —

The Discourse on A Summary and An Analysis M 138/3:223-229

1 Thus have I heard.

At one time the Blessed One was staying in Anātha, piṇḍika’s park in Jeta’s grove³² near Sāvattihī.³³ There the Blessed One addressed the monks thus, “Bhikshus!”

²⁵ D 33.2.3(12)/3:254, 282.

²⁶ M 148.28/3:285 = SD 26.6.

²⁷ A 7.11-12/4:9.

²⁸ Pm §587/123.

²⁹ Vbh §816/341, §949/383.

³⁰ Yam 268; cf Nyanatiloka 1971: 104.

³¹ S 22.99.7a/3:150 = SD 28.7a.

³² *Jeta, vana*, so called, says Comy, because it is “grown, maintained and guarded by prince Jeta” (*tañ hi Jetena rāja, kumārena ropitaṃ samvaddhitāṃ paripālitaṃ*) (MA 1:60; KhpA 111; PmA 3:533). As such, it is not an ordinary wild forest, but a cultivated grove.

³³ On *tr sāvattihiyāṃ* as “near (*samīpe*) Sāvattihī,” rather than “in Sāvattihī,” see Comys, eg SA 1:13; AA 1:15; KhpA 112; UA 57; PmA 3:534.

“Bhante!” the monks answered the Blessed One in assent.
The Blessed One said this:

The Buddha’s summarized analysis

2 “Bhikshus, I shall teach you a summarized analysis (*uddesa, vibhaṅga*).³⁴

Listen, monks, pay close attention to it, I will speak.”

“Yes, bhante!” the monks replied the Blessed One.

The Blessed One said this:³⁵

3 “**Bhikshus, a monk should examine³⁶ things in such a way that while he is doing so, his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, would be unagitated.**³⁷

Bhikshus, if his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally,³⁸ and by not clinging, is unagitated, then there is in him no further arising or producing of suffering, that is, of birth, decay and death.”³⁹

4 The Blessed One said this. Having said this, the Well-gone [Sugata] rose from his seat and entered his dwelling [vihara].⁴⁰

The monks are perplexed

5a Then, not long after the Buddha had left, the monks thought:

“Now, friends, the Blessed One rose from his seat and entered his dwelling after giving only a teaching in brief, without giving its meaning in detail, that is to say: [CS 3:266]

‘Bhikshus, a monk should examine things in such a way that while he is doing so, his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, would be untroubled.

Bhikshus, if his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, is unagitated, then there is in him no further arising or producing of suffering, that is, of birth, decay and death.’

Now, who will expound the detailed meaning of this teaching given in brief by the Blessed One?”

5b Then the monks thought:

“The venerable Mahā Kaccāna is praised by the Teacher and held in high esteem by wise companions in the holy life.⁴¹ He would be capable of giving the detailed meaning of this teaching given in brief, whose meaning is not given in detail by the Blessed One. Let us approach [224] the venerable Mahā Kaccāna and question Mahā Kaccāna over and again⁴² regarding this matter.”

³⁴ *Uddesa, vibhaṅga* (m): see Intro (1.2.1).

³⁵ The foll 2 paras (the *māṭikā*) is preserved in **Upararikkha S** (It 3.5.5/94/93 f): see Intro (2).

³⁶ “Should examine,” *upaparikkheyya*: see Intro (2), **Upararikkha S** (It 3.5.5.2/93) n.

³⁷ Be *Tathā tathā bhikkhave bhikkhu upaparikkheyya, yathā yathā* [Ce Ke Ee Se *yathā yathā’ssa*] *upaparikkhato bahiddhā c’assa viññānaṃ avikkhittaṃ avisaṭaṃ ajjhattaṃ asaṅghitaṃ anupādāya na paritasseyya.*

³⁸ “Not slack internally,” Comy: “(The mind) does not slacken by virtue of longing for internal resorts [mind-objects]” (*ajjhattaṃ asaṅghitaṃ ti gocar’ajjhatte nikanti, vasena asaṅghitaṃ*, MA 5:28). See CPD sv ²a-saṅghita. So M:H 272, “unslackened”; It:M 80 (n186), “non-abated.” But M:ÑB 1074: “stuck”; It:W 182: “set” & It:I 71: “fixed.”

³⁹ *Bahiddhā bhikkhave viññāṇe avikkhitte avisaṭe sati ajjhattaṃ asaṅghite anupādāya aparitassato, āyatim jāti, -jarā, maraṇa, dukkha, samudaya, sambhavo na hoti ti. Asaṅghita* (Skt *a-sraṅghita*) means “not loose or slackened (ie steadfast)” (M 3:223,22 = It 94,3).

⁴⁰ The Buddha, after announcing that he would give an *uddesa, vibhaṅga* [§2], expounds only a “summary” (*māṭikā*), and then enters his dwelling: see Intro (1.2.1).

⁴¹ **Mahā Kaccāna** (or Kaccāyana: see Intro (1.1)).

⁴² “Question...over and again,” *paṭipuccheyyāma*, lit “we will counter-question (him).”

6 Then the monks approached the venerable Mahā Kaccāna and exchanged greetings with him. When this courteous and friendly exchange was concluded, they sat down at one side. Seated thus at one side, they said this to the venerable Mahā Kaccāna:

“Friend Kaccāna, the Blessed One rose from his seat and entered his dwelling after giving only a teaching in brief, without giving its meaning in detail, that is to say:

‘Bhikshus, a monk should examine things in such a way that while he is doing so, his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, would be unagitated.

Bhikshus, if his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, is unagitated, then there is in him no further arising or producing of suffering, that is, of birth, decay and death.’

Now, who will expound the detailed [CS 3:267] meaning of this teaching given in brief by the Blessed One?

Then, avuso Kaccāna, it occurred to us:

‘The venerable Mahā Kaccāna is praised by the Teacher and held in high esteem by wise companions in the holy life. He is capable of giving the meaning in detail of this teaching given in brief, without giving the meaning in detail, by the Blessed One. Let us approach the venerable Mahā Kaccāna and question Mahā Kaccāna over and again regarding this matter.

May the venerable Mahā Kaccāna give us a detailed analysis [of this matter]!’”

The heartwood simile

7a “Avuso, just as a person needing heartwood,⁴³ seeking heartwood, wandering in search of heartwood, after passing over the root and trunk of a great tree that stands full of heartwood, were to think that heartwood would be found amongst its branches and leaves; even so it has come to this, venerable sirs,

even so it is with you, that you think I should be asked about the meaning of this matter when you were right before the Teacher himself.⁴⁴

For, avuso, the Blessed One knows the known, sees the seen; he is the eye, he is knowledge, he is Dharma, he is Brahmā; he is the instructor of spiritual duties,⁴⁵ the shower of meanings, the giver of the deathless, the lord of truth, the Tathāgata [thus come].⁴⁶

That was indeed the time when you should have asked the Blessed One over and again regarding the meaning [of the Blessed One’s statement]. As he explained to you, so you should have remembered it.”

7b “Truly, friend Kaccāna, the Blessed One knows the known, sees the seen; he has become the eye, become the knowledge, become the Dharma, become Brahmā; he is the instructor of spiritual duties, the shower of meanings,⁴⁷ the giver of the deathless, the lord of truth, the Tathāgata [thus come].

That was indeed the time when we should have asked the Blessed One over and again regarding the meaning [of the Blessed One’s statement]. As he [225] explained to us, so we should have remembered it.

⁴³ “Heartwood,” *sāra*, ie, the core or essence of anything; the pith or the best of wood—a simile for spiritual strength and attainment. See **Udumbarikā Sīhanāda S** (D 25), where the Buddha’s humour is evident in such a simile given in the latter (D 25.15-19/3:47-53) = 1.4. In (**Saṅgha**) **Uposatha S** (A 4.190.1b/2:182) = SD 15.10b, *sāra* means “essence,” in the sense of accomplished in moral virtue, etc (AA 3:168).

⁴⁴ A slightly different version of this simile is found in **Mahā Sārôpama S** (M 29.3/1:193).

⁴⁵ “Instructor of spiritual duties,” *vattā pavattā*, lit “the turner of duties.” My tr is conjectural. This is a cryptic expression which can also be tr as “he is the propounder, the expounder” (M:H 1:144). The **Dhamma,saṅgaṇi Mūla Tīkā** explains *vattā* as *catu, sacca, dhamme*, “the four noble truth.”

⁴⁶ “[K]nows the known...the Tathāgata,” *jānam janāti passam passati cakkhu, bhūto nāṇa, bhūto dhamma, bhūto vattā pavattā atthassa ninnetā amatassa dātā dhamma-s, sāmī tathāgato*. Comy simply says that he knows and sees what is to be known and seen; knowing, he knows; seeing, he sees (MA 2:76).

⁴⁷ “The shower of meanings,” *atthassa ninnetā*, alt tr “the bringer of the goal” (M:H 1:144). I have rendered it to reflect the mood of the sutta (that of the full meaning of the Buddha’s brief statement).

8 But the venerable Mahā Kaccāna is praised by the Teacher and held in high esteem by wise companions in the holy life. He is capable of giving the meaning in detail of this teaching given in brief by the Blessed One. Let the venerable Mahā Kaccāna give us a detailed analysis [of this matter], if it is no trouble!”

Mahā Kaccāna’s response

9 “In that case, listen, avuso, pay close attention to it, I will speak.”

“Yes, bhante!” the monks replied the venerable Mahā Kaccāna.

The venerable Mahā Kaccāna said this:

“Avuso, the Blessed One rose from his seat and entered his dwelling after giving only a teaching in brief, without giving its meaning in detail, without giving its meaning in detail, that is to say:

‘*Bhikshus, a monk* [CS 3:268] *should examine things in such a way that while he is doing so, his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, would be unagitated.*

Bhikshus, if his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, is unagitated, then there is in him no further arising or producing of suffering, that is, of birth, decay and death.’

Avuso, in regards to the meaning in detail of this teaching given in brief by the Blessed One, I understand its meaning in detail to be as follows:

CULTIVATING CALM (SAMATHA)

Internally distracted and scattered consciousness

10 And how, avuso, is **the consciousness said to be distracted and scattered externally**?⁴⁸

(1) Here, avuso, when a monk, having seen a form with the eye, if his consciousness follows after the sign of form,

bound⁴⁹ to gratification in the form-sign,⁵⁰

enthralled⁵¹ by gratification in the form-sign,

yoked⁵² to the fetter of gratification in the form-sign—

then, the consciousness is said to be distracted and scattered externally.⁵³

⁴⁸ *Kathaṅ c’āvuso bahiddhā viññānaṃ vikkhittaṃ visaṭṭaṃ ti vuccati.* Comy: Consciousness is “said to be distracted and scattered externally” when it is drawn to external objects (*bahiddhā ārammaṇesu*) (MA 5:28).

⁴⁹ “Bound,” *gadhita* (Be Se) = *gathitaṃ* (Ce Ee), tied, fettered; enslaved, bound to, greedy for, intoxicated with; pp of *ganthati* (“he ties”); *gantha* (m), a knot. Often used with ref to some object of desire (“wealth,” *bhoga*; “gain,” *lābha*; “sense-pleasures,” *kāma, guṇe*).

⁵⁰ Tīkā: “The form-sign is form itself as it is the cause for the arising of defilements. One runs pursues it on account of lust, etc, hence one follows after the form-sign (*Rūpaṃ eva kiles’uppattiyā kāraṇa, bhāvato rūpa, nimittatāṃ. Rāg’ādi, vasena taṃ anudhāvati rūpa, nimittānusārī*, MAT:Be 2:289).

⁵¹ “Enthralled,” *vinibandha* (Be Se) = *vinibaddha* (Ce Ee) or bondage: S 2:17, 3:135, 186; A 1:66; Sn 16. The 5 mental bondages (*cetaso vinibandhā*) are: (1) lust for sense-pleasures (*kāmesu rāga*), (2) lust for the body (*kāyesu rāga*), (3) lust for forms (*rūpe rāga*), (4) overeating and over-indulging in sleep (*yāvad-atthaṃ udarāvadehakaṃ bhujjivā seyya, sukhaṃ anuyogo*), and living the holy life, aspiring to be reborn in a heavenly realm (*aññataraṃ deva, nikāyaṃ pañidhāya brahma, cariyāṃ*) (D 33.2.1.20/3:238; A 5.205/3:248, 9.71/4:460, 9.72/4:463 f, 10.14/5:17; Vbh 377). See **Ceto, khila S** (M 16.8-13/1:103 = SD 32.14 Intro (2.3)).

⁵² “Yoked to the fetter” (*saṃyojana, saṃyutta*). Sensual lust is the 4th of **the 10 fetters** (*dasa saṃyojana*): (1) self-identity view (*sakkāya, diṭṭhi*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rituals and vows (*silā-b, bata, parā-māsa*), (4) sensual lust (*kāma, rāga*), (5) aversion (*paṭigha*), (6) greed for form existence (*rūpa, rāga*), (7) greed for formless existence (*arūpa, rāga*), (8) conceit (*māna*), (9) restlessness (or remorse) (*uddhacca*), (10) ignorance (*avijjā*) (S 5:61; A 5:13; Vbh 377). Breaking the first 3 fetters makes one a streamwinner. Sensual lust is only fully overcome by the non-returner and the arhat.

- (2) Having heard a sound with the ear, if his consciousness follows after the sign of sound,
 bound to gratification in the sound-sign,
 enthralled by gratification in the sound-sign,
 yoked to the fetter of gratification in the sound-sign—
 then, the consciousness is said to be distracted and scattered externally.
- (3) Having smelt a smell with the nose, if his consciousness follows after the sign of smell,
 bound to gratification in the smell-sign,
 enthralled by gratification in the smell-sign,
 yoked to the fetter of gratification in the smell-sign—
 then, the consciousness is said to be distracted and scattered externally.
- (4) Having tasted a taste with the tongue, if his consciousness follows after the sign of taste,
 bound to gratification in the taste-sign,
 enthralled by gratification in the taste-sign,
 yoked to the fetter of gratification in the taste-sign—
 then, the consciousness is said to be distracted and scattered externally.
- (5) Having touched a touch with the body, if his consciousness follows after the sign of smell,
 bound to gratification in the smell-sign,
 enthralled by gratification in the smell-sign,
 yoked to the fetter of gratification in the smell-sign—
 then, the consciousness is said to be distracted and scattered externally.
- (6) Having cognized a mind-object with the mind, if his consciousness follows after the sign of mind-object,
 bound to gratification in the mind-object sign,
 enthralled by gratification in the mind-object sign,
 yoked to the fetter of gratification in the mind-object sign—
 then, the consciousness is said to be distracted and scattered externally.
 Thus, avuso, is the consciousness said to be distracted and scattered externally.

Externally undistracted and unscattered consciousness

11 And how, avuso, is **the consciousness said to be undistracted and unscattered externally?**

- (1) Here, avuso, when a monk, having seen a form with the eye, his consciousness does not follow after the sign of form,
 not bound to gratification in the form-sign,
 not enthralled by gratification in the form-sign,
 not yoked to the fetter of gratification in the form-sign—
 then, the consciousness [226] is said to be undistracted and unscattered externally.
- (2) Having heard a sound with the ear, if his consciousness does not follow after the sign of sound,
 not bound to gratification in the sound-sign,
 not enthralled by gratification in the sound-sign,
 not yoked to the fetter of gratification in the sound-sign—
 then, the consciousness is said to be undistracted and unscattered externally.
- (3) Having smelt a smell with the nose, if his consciousness does not follow after the sign of smell,
 not bound to gratification in the smell-sign,
 not enthralled by gratification in the smell-sign,
 not yoked to the fetter of gratification in the smell-sign—

⁵³ Be Se *Cakkhunā rūpaṃ disvā rūpa, nimittānusārī viññāṇaṃ hoti rūpa, nimitt'assāda, gadhitam* [Ce Ee *gathitam*] *rūpa, nimitt'assāda, vinibandham* [Ce Ee *vinibaddham*] *rūpa, nimitt'assāda, samyojana, samyuttam bahiddhā viññāṇam vikkhittam visaṭaṇ ti vuccati*. On *nimittānusārī*, see **Animitta Ceto, samadhi Pañha S** (S 40.9), where Moggallāna is taught “non-attention to all signs” (S 40.9.5/4:269) = SD 24.19. See also **D 33.2.(17)/3:249** (DA 3:1036), 280; **S 35.93/4:268** (SA 3:90); **A 6.13.6/3:292** (AA 3:347); **Nett 25** (NettA:Be 88); **SnA 1:344**.

then, the consciousness is said to be undistracted and unscattered externally.

- (4) Having tasted a taste with the tongue, if his consciousness does not follow after the sign of taste, not bound to gratification in the taste-sign, not enthralled by gratification in the taste-sign, not yoked to the fetter of gratification in the taste-sign—

then, the consciousness is said to be undistracted and unscattered externally.

- (5) Having touched a touch with the body, if his consciousness does not follow after the sign of smell,

not bound to gratification in the smell-sign,
not enthralled by gratification in the smell-sign,
not yoked to the fetter of gratification in the smell-sign—

then, the consciousness is said to be undistracted and unscattered externally.

- (6) Having cognized a mind-object with the mind, if his consciousness does not follow after the sign of mind-object,

not bound to gratification in the mind-object sign,
not enthralled by gratification in the mind-object sign,
not yoked to the fetter of gratification in the mind-object sign—

then, the consciousness said to be distracted and scattered externally.

Thus, avuso, is the consciousness said to be undistracted and unscattered externally.

Internally slack consciousness

12 And how, avuso, is **the mind**⁵⁴ **said to be slack internally**?⁵⁵

- (1) Here, avuso, a monk, quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states, he attains and dwells in the **first dhyana**, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, and with zest and joy born of solitude.

When his consciousness follows after the zest and joy born of solitude,

bound	to gratification in	the zest and joy born of solitude,
enthralled	by gratification in	the zest and joy born of solitude, [CS 3:269]
yoked	to the fetter of gratification in	the zest and joy born of solitude —

then, the mind is said to be slack internally.

- 13** (2) Furthermore, avuso, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he attains and dwells in **the second dhyana**, free from initial application and sustained application, with zest and joy born of concentration.

When his consciousness follows after the joy born of concentration [samadhi],

bound	to gratification in	the joy born of concentration,
enthralled	by gratification in	the joy born of concentration,
yoked	to the fetter of gratification in	the joy born of concentration—

then, the mind is said to be slack internally.

- 14** (3) And furthermore, avuso, with the fading away of zest, he dwells equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and experiences joy with the body. He attains and dwells in **the third dhyana**, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’

When his consciousness follows after the equanimity,

bound	to gratification in	the joy of equanimity,
enthralled	by gratification in	the joy of equanimity,
yoked	to the fetter of gratification in	the joy of equanimity—

⁵⁴ Notice that Kaccāna switches from “consciousness” (*viññāṇa*) (in the Buddha’s summary) to “mind” (*citta*) here and at §16. The two words are synonyms/

⁵⁵ *Kathaṅ c’āvuso ajjhataṃ saṅghitanti vuccati*. Be *Kathaṅ c’āvuso ajjhataṃ* [Ce Ee Ke Se *ajjhataṃ cittam*] *saṅghitan ti vuccati*. On *saṅghita*, see §3n. Comy: “The mind is slack internally: it is slack on account of longing after internal resorts [mind-objects]” (*ajjhataṃ asaṅghitan ti gocar’ajjhatte nikanti,vasena asaṅghitam*, MA 5:28)

then, the mind is said to be slack internally.

15 (4) Furthermore, avuso, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain,⁵⁶ and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure, attains and dwells in **the fourth dhyana** that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.⁵⁷

When his consciousness follows after that which is neither pain nor pleasure,⁵⁸

bound	to gratification in	what is neither pain nor pleasure,
enthralled	by gratification in	what is neither pain nor pleasure,
yoked	to the fetter of gratification in	what is neither pain nor pleasure—

then, the mind is said to be slack internally. [227]

Internally unslack consciousness

16 And how, avuso, is **the mind said to be unslack internally**?⁵⁹

(1) Here, avuso, a monk, quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states, he attains and dwells in the **first dhyana**, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, and with zest and joy born of solitude.

When his consciousness does not follow after the zest and joy born of solitude,

not bound to gratification in the zest and joy born of solitude,
not enthralled by gratification in the zest and joy born of solitude, [CS 3:269]
not yoked to the fetter of gratification in the zest and joy born of solitude —

then, the mind is said to be unslack internally.

17 (2) Furthermore, avuso, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he attains and dwells in **the second dhyana**, free from initial application and sustained application, with zest and joy born of concentration.

When his consciousness does not follow after the joy born of concentration [samadhi],

not bound to gratification in the joy born of concentration,
not enthralled by gratification in the joy born of concentration,
not yoked to the fetter of gratification in the joy born of concentration—

then, the mind is said to be unslack internally.

18 (3) And furthermore, avuso, with the fading away of zest, he dwells equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and experiences joy with the body. He attains and dwells in **the third dhyana**, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’

When his consciousness does not follow after the equanimity,

not bound to gratification in the joy of equanimity,
not enthralled by gratification in the joy of equanimity,
not yoked to the fetter of gratification in the joy of equanimity—

then, the mind is said to be unslack internally.

19 (4) Furthermore, avuso, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain, and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure, attains and dwells in **the fourth dhyana** that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.⁶⁰

⁵⁶ “Joy...pain,” *sukha...dukkha*: this refers to *physical* feelings. The next phrase—“pleasure and displeasure,” *domanassa...somanassa*—refers to *mental* feelings, transcended earlier. Mental feelings must be overcome first so that the mind is not distracted by itself, as it were. Then, all the other feelings (arising from the physical sense-contacts) are transcended. On the significance of this, see **Sall’atthena S** (S 36.6/4:207-210) = SD 5.5.

⁵⁷ Here, **Vibhaṅga** gives 3 factors of the 4th dhyana—equanimity (*upekkhā*), mindfulness (*sati*) and one-pointedness of mind (*cittassa ek’aggatā*)—according to the Sutta analysis (Vbh 261), and 2 factors—equanimity and one-pointedness of the mind—according to the Abhidhamma analysis (Vbh 164; Vism 4.183/165). See also **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.83/1:75) = SD 8.10 & **Dhyana** = SD 8.4 (5.4).

⁵⁸ *Tassa adukkham-asukhānusāri viññāṇam hoti.*

⁵⁹ Be *Kathaṇ c’āvuso ajjhataṃ* [Ce Ee Ke Se *ajjhataṃ cittam*] *asaṅghitan ti vuccati*. See Intro (1.2.2).

⁶⁰ For nn, see §15 above.

When his consciousness does not follow after that which is neither pain nor pleasure,
 not bound to gratification in what is neither pain nor pleasure,
 not enthralled by gratification in what is neither pain nor pleasure,
 not yoked to the fetter of gratification in what is neither pain nor pleasure—
 then, the mind is said to be unslack internally.

CULTIVATING INSIGHT (*VIPASSANĀ*)

Agitation due to clinging

20 And how, avuso, is there **agitation due to clinging**?⁶¹

(1) Here, avuso, an uninstructed worldly [ignorant ordinary] person, who has no regard for the noble ones and is unskilled and undisciplined in the Dharma of the noble ones, who has no regard for the true individuals and is unskilled and undisciplined in the Dharma of the true individuals, regards form as the self, or the self as possessing form, or form as in the self, or the self as in form. That form of his changes, becoming other.

When that form of his changes, becoming other, his consciousness is caught up with the form's changing.⁶²

Agitated mental states born of the preoccupation with that form's changes⁶³ arise together and continue to overwhelm his mind.⁶⁴

Because his mind is so overwhelmed, he is fearful, vexed, and full of longing,⁶⁵ and due to clinging, is agitated.⁶⁶ [228]

(2) He regards feeling as the self, or the self as possessing feeling, or feeling as in the self, or the self as in feeling;

That feeling of his changes, becoming other.

When that feeling of his changes, becoming other, his consciousness is caught up with the feeling's changing.

Agitated mental states born of the preoccupation with that feeling's changes arise together and continue to overwhelm his mind.

Because his mind is so overwhelmed, he is fearful, vexed, and full of longing, and due to clinging, he is agitated.

(3) He regards perception as the self, or the self as possessing perception, or perception as in the self, or the self as in perception;

That perception of his changes, becoming other.

⁶¹ *Kathaṅ c'āvuso anupādā* [read as *upādā*] *paritassanā hoti*. All the MSS we have read *anupādā* ("through non-clinging"), which seems problematic: see Intro (1.2.3).

⁶² *Tassa rūpa, vipariṇāma' aññathā, bhāvā rūpa, vipariṇāmānuparivatti viññāṇam hoti. Anuparivatti*, "follow in moving, conforming to"; only ifc. *rūpa, vipariṇāma~* (M 3:227,32 = S 3:16,10); *cittā~* (Dhs 671, 772, 1522), *ñāṇā~* (Nm 1:178, 2:357, 451; Pm 2:195; PmA 3:647).

⁶³ "Arising from the preoccupation," *paritassanā, dhamma, samuppādā*: Comys take this as a dvandva: "the agitation from craving and (various) unwholesome states that arise together" (*paritassanā dhamma, samuppādāti taṅhā, paritassanā ca akusala, dhamma, samuppādā ca*, MA 5:29 = SA 2:262). **Bodhi** points out that the cpd can also be a tatpurusha: "a constellation [variety] of states (arisen from, associated with) agitation." While both SA and SAPT take *paritassanā* as craving, "it seems to me that the text emphasizes *bhaya-paritassanā*, 'agitation through fear.'" (S:B 1050 n33). On how *paritassanā* can have 2 meanings, see S:B 75 n137.

⁶⁴ *Tassa rūpa, vipariṇāmānuparivatta, jā paritassanā, dhamma, samuppādā cittaṃ pariyādāya tiṭṭhanti*.

⁶⁵ "Full of longing," *apekḥavā*, which Comy reading as *apekkhavā*, glosses as "with attachment, with love [affection]" (*apekkhavāti s'ālayo sa, sineho*, MA 3:30).

⁶⁶ *Cetaso pariyādānā uttāsavā ca hoti vighātavā ca apekkhavā ca anupādāya ca paritassati*. "The agitation thus results from the lack of any permanent essence in things that could provide a refuge from the suffering precipitated by their change and instability." (M:ÑB 1350 n1255)

When that perception of his changes, becoming other, his consciousness is caught up with the perception's changing.

Agitated mental states born of the preoccupation with that perception's changes arise together and continue to overwhelm his mind..

Because his mind is so overwhelmed, he is fearful, vexed, and full of longing, and due to clinging, he is agitated.

(4) He regards formations as the self, or the self as possessing formations, or formations as in the self, or the self as in formations;

That formations of his change, becoming other.

When those formations of his changes, becoming other, his consciousness is caught up with the formations' changing.

Agitated mental states born of the preoccupation with those formations' changes arise together and continue to overwhelm his mind..

Because his mind is so overwhelmed, he is fearful, vexed, and full of longing, and due to clinging, he is agitated.

(5) He regards consciousness as the self, or the self as possessing consciousness, or consciousness as in the self, or the self as in consciousness.⁶⁷

That consciousness of his changes, becoming other.

When that consciousness of his changes, becoming other, his consciousness⁶⁸ is caught up with the consciousness's changing.

Agitated mental states born of the preoccupation with that consciousness's changes arise together and continue to overwhelm his mind..

Because his mind is so overwhelmed, he is fearful, vexed, and full of longing, and due to clinging, he is agitated.

Thus, avuso, is there agitation due to clinging.

Non-agitation due to non-clinging

21 And how, avuso, is there **no agitation nor clinging**?⁶⁹

(1) Here, avuso, an instructed noble disciple, who *has* regard for the noble ones and is skilled and [CS 3:271] well disciplined in the Dharma of the noble ones, who has regard for the true individuals and is skilled and well disciplined in the Dharma of the true individuals,

does *not* regard form as the self, or the self as possessing form, or form as in the self, or the self as in form.

That form of his changes, becoming other.

When that form of his changes, becoming other, his consciousness is not caught up with the form's changing.

No agitated mental states born of the preoccupation with that form's changes arise together and continue to overwhelm his mind.

Because his mind is not overwhelmed, he is not fearful, not vexed, not full of longing, and due to non-clinging, he is unagitated.

(2) He does *not* regard feeling as the self, or the self as possessing feeling, or feeling as in the self, or the self as in feeling;

That feeling of his changes, becoming other.

When that feeling of his changes, becoming other, his consciousness is not caught up with the feeling's changing.

⁶⁷ This is the first 5 kinds of self-identity view (*sakkāya, diṭṭhi*): see **Samanupassanā S** (S 22.47/3:46 f) = SD 26.12.

⁶⁸ "Consciousness," *viññāṇa*, here refers to "attention." On the 2 kinds of *viññāṇa*, see **The unconscious** = SD 17.8b (3).

⁶⁹ *Kathaṅ c'āvuso anupādānā aparitassanā hoti.*

No agitated mental states born of the preoccupation with that feeling's changes arise together and continue to overwhelm his mind.

Because his mind is not overwhelmed, he is not fearful, not vexed, not full of longing, and due to non-clinging, he is unagitated.

(3) He does *not* regard perception as the self, or the self as possessing perception, or perception as in the self, or the self as in perception.

That perception of his changes, becoming other.

When that perception of his changes, becoming other, his consciousness is not caught up with the perception's changing.

No agitated mental states born of the preoccupation with that perception's changes arise together and continue to overwhelm his mind.

Because his mind is not overwhelmed, he is not fearful, not vexed, not full of longing, and due to non-clinging, he is unagitated.

(4) He does *not* regard formations as the self, or the self as possessing formations, or formations as in the self, or the self as in formations.

That formations of his change, becoming other.

When those formations of his changes, becoming other, his consciousness is not caught up with the formations' changing.

No agitated mental states born of the preoccupation with those formations' changes arise together and continue to overwhelm his mind.

Because his mind is not overwhelmed, he is not fearful, not vexed, not full of longing, and due to non-clinging, he is unagitated.

(5) He does *not* regard consciousness as the self, or the self as possessing consciousness, or consciousness as in the self, or the self as in consciousness.

That consciousness of his changes, becoming other.

When that consciousness of his changes, becoming other, his consciousness⁷⁰ is not caught up with the consciousness's changing.

No agitated mental states born of the preoccupation with that consciousness's changes arise together and continue to overwhelm his mind.

Because his mind is not overwhelmed, he is fearful, vexed, and full of longing, and due to non-clinging, he is unagitated.

Thus, avuso, is there neither agitation nor clinging.

CONCLUSION

Mahā Kaccāna's lion-roar

22 Avuso, when the Blessed One rose from his seat and entered his dwelling after giving a summarized analysis in brief, without giving the detailed meaning, that is to say:

'Bhikshus, a monk should examine things in such a way that while he is doing so, his consciousness is not distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, would be unagitated.

Bhikshus, if his consciousness is not distracted, nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, is unagitated, then there is in him no further arising or producing of suffering, that is, of birth, decay and death.'

I understand [229] the detailed meaning of this summary to be so.

And, avuso, if you wish, you go to the Blessed One and ask him about the meaning of this.

Just as the Blessed One explains it to you, so should you remember it."

⁷⁰ This "consciousness," *viññāṇa*, here refers his "attention." See §20 (5) n.

The Buddha's endorsement

23 Then the monks, having joyfully approved of the venerable Mahā Kaccāna's word, rose from their seats and went to the Blessed One.

Having saluted the Blessed One, they sat down at one side. Sitting thus at one side, they said this to the Blessed One: [cs 3:272]

“Bhante, the Blessed One rose from his seat and entered his dwelling after giving a summarized analysis in brief, without giving the detailed meaning, that is to say:

‘*Bhikshus, a monk should examine things in such a way that while he is doing so, his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, would be unagitated.*

Bhikshus, if his consciousness is not distracted, nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, is unagitated, then there is in him no further arising or producing of suffering, that is, of birth, decay and death,’

Then, not long after the Blessed One had departed from us, we thought:

‘Now, the Blessed One rose from his seat and entered his dwelling after giving a summarized analysis in brief, without giving the detailed meaning, that is to say:

‘*Bhikshus, a monk should examine things in such a way that while he is doing so, his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, would be unagitated.*

Bhikshus, if his consciousness is neither distracted nor scattered externally, nor slack internally; and by not clinging, is unagitated, then there is in him no further arising or producing of suffering, that is, of birth, decay and death,’

Now, who will expound the detailed meaning of this teaching given in brief by the Blessed One?’

Then the monks thought:

‘The venerable Mahā Kaccāna is praised by the Teacher and held in high esteem by wise companions in the holy life. He would be capable of giving the detailed meaning of this teaching given in brief, whose meaning is not given in detail by the Blessed One. Let us approach the venerable Mahā Kaccāna and question Mahā Kaccāna over and again regarding this matter.’

Then, bhante, we approached the venerable Mahā Kaccāna. Having approached him we asked him the meaning of this. Its meaning, bhante, was explained by the venerable Mahā Kaccāna with these ways, these sentences, these words.”⁷¹

24 “Wise, bhikshus, is Mahā Kaccāna! Of great wisdom, bhikshus, is Mahā Kaccāna! If you were to ask me, bhikshus, I too would have [CS 3:273] would have answered in the same way, just as Mahā Kaccāna has explained it. Such is its meaning, and so should you remember it.”

The Blessed One said this. The monks joyfully approved of the Blessed One's word.

— evaṃ —

Bibliography

- Analayo [Theodor P Steffens, 1962-]
 2006 *A Comparative Study of the Majjhima-nikāya*. Habilitationsschrift dem Fachbereich Fremdsprachliche Philologien der Philipps Universität Marburg, Dec 2006. (Unpublished)
- Brahmavamso, Ajahn [Peter Betts, 1951-]
 2006 *Mindfulness, Bliss and Beyond: A meditator's handbook*. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2006:127-130. (Review by Piya Tan: <http://dharmafarer.googlepages.com>).
- SHT = Sanskrithandschriften aus den Turfanfunden,

⁷¹ “In these ways, these sentences, these words,” *imehi ākarehi imehi padehi imehi vyañjehi*. This is stock, as at **Vimāṃsaka S** (M 47.16/1:320) = SD 35.6.

1965-04 Sanskrithandschriften aus den Turfanfunden, Teil [Part] 1-9. Edd Ernest Waldschmidt, Lore Sander, Klaus Wille & Heinz Bechert. Verzeichnis der orientalischen Handschriften in Deutschland X:

- vol 1 edd W Clawiter, L Holzmann & E Waldschmidt 1965;
- vol 2 edd W Clawiter, L Sander-Holzmann & E Waldschmidt 1968;
- vol 3 edd W Clawiter, L Sander-Holzmann & E Waldschmidt 1971;
- vol 4 edd L Sander & E Waldschmidt 1980;
- vol 5 edd L Sander & E Waldschmidt 1985;
- vol 6 edd H Bechert & K Wille 1989;
- vol 7 edd H Bechert & K Wille 1995;
- vol 8 edd H Bechert & K Wille 2000;
- vol 9 edd H Bechert & K Wille 2004.

100612; 100616; 101004; 110212a; 121231; 130106