

6

Pāsādika Sutta

The Discourse on the Delightful | D 29/3:117-141

Theme: The conditions for failure and for success in a religion

Translated by Piya Tan ©2005, 2012

1 Sutta highlights

HOW TO STUDY THE PĀSĀDIKA SUTTA. After reading this section [1], go straight into the section on “The Sutta summary and paraphrase” [2]. Go through section by section (eg 2.1), and where a section arouses your interest, straightaway go to that part of the Sutta and read it. Even if you still do not understand what you have read, return to [2] and finish reading it. It is sufficient to read §12 (1) (on elder monk disciples), unless you wish to read *the full version* as a reflection.

1.1 Comprehensive list of teachings. The Pāsādika Sutta (D 29) is a record of some of the late or last teachings of the Buddha [§14.4], reminiscent of the instructions given in **the Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16) [7.3] and the later narrative suttas. The Pāsādika Sutta is important as one of the earliest documents, even *the* earliest that we have on early monastic attempts at giving a comprehensive list of the Buddha’s teachings. This famous list of the “7 sets” of teachings [§17.8] are better known as the 37 limbs of awakening (*bodhi,pakkiya dhamma*) [6.1.1].

The listing of key teachings by way of the “7 sets” [§17.8] has a clear purpose: to ensure that the saṅgha is neither divided nor confused over any teaching of the Buddha, as has occurred in the case of the followers of Nirgrantha Nāta,putta, following his death [§1]. This is to ensure internal unity of the Buddhist community itself, unified by a common standard of faith, as it were.

1.2 Two purposes of the Sutta. The Pāsādika Sutta first discusses how a religion fails, and then how it will succeed. Basically, when the teacher fails to systematize his teachings and have disciples who have realized the highest goals, the religion will fail. On the other hand, when the teacher clearly lays down what his teachings are, and ensures that there are competent disciples as spiritual exemplars and teachers, that religion will succeed.

As such, it has two clear purposes laid out:

- (1) the listing of the key teachings of the Buddha, and
- (2) discipleship and doctrinal training in answering any doctrinal challenges from outside.

While reinforcing the faith of their own community (apologetics) [4.2], the early Buddhists were also aware of the need to rectify wrong perceptions of the Buddha’s teachings (polemics) [4.3] and to propagate the true Dharma (missiology).¹

2 Sutta summary and paraphrase

2.1 A FAILED RELIGION. [§1] The Pāsādika Sutta opens with **the Buddha** residing in the Sakya Vedhañña’s mango grove. The narrator tells us that Nirgrantha Nāta,putta (Mahā,vīra) has just died, and there is confusion and disunity amongst his followers. [§2] **Cunda Samaṇ’uddesa** meets Ānanda at Sāma,gāma, and relates to him the sad events following Nāta,putta’s death. Ānanda proposed that they see the Buddha about this.

[§3] The Buddha agrees that where the Dharma,vinaya (the teaching and the discipline) were badly taught, such disasters would attend a religious community, and his teaching follows, forming the main bulk of the Pāsādika Sutta [§§3.4-40.3]. [§4] According to the Buddha, in a system where the teacher is not fully awakened, a disciple who deviates from such a system should be *praised*, since it is a wrong system. It is not “meritorious” to continue practising such teachings, unconcerned with those who deviate [§4.7]. [§5] Similarly, it is not meritorious to practise a teaching of an unawakened teacher, unconcerned with the positive aspects of the system [§5.8].

¹ On missiology, see **Udumbarikā Siha,nāda S** (D 25.23/3:56 f), SD 1.4 (2); also **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16) @ SD 9 App 1 (1); **Wanderers of today**, SD 24.6b (3); **The great commission**, SD 11.2 (6).

[§6] In the Buddha Dharma, however, the teacher is fully awakened. As such, a disciple who deviates from such a teaching is *blameworthy*. [§7] On the hand, one who keeps to the Dharma here is praiseworthy and generates merit [§7.9].

2.2 A SUCCESSFUL RELIGION, BUT WITHOUT SPIRITUALITY. [§8] A system where the Dharma is *not* well taught and well grounded (that is, with its wonders, leading to liberation), and the disciples have *not* grasped the meaning and purpose of the Dharma *before* the teacher passes away, is doomed to fail. [§9] Whereas, in a system where the Dharma is well taught and well grounded, and the disciples have a good grasp of the meaning and purpose of the Dharma while the teacher still lives, will succeed.

[§10] Even then, a system without a wise elder as teacher would not be able to produce awakened disciples. [§11] In terms of discipleship, a spiritual community must have a teacher who is a wise elder, so that there will be awakened disciples, that is, comprises the following:

- [§§12.1-4] elder monk disciples;
- [§§12.5-15] middling monk disciples;
- [§§12.16-29] novice monk disciples;
- [§§12.30-45] elder nun disciples;
- [§§12.46-63] middling nun disciples;
- [§§12.64-84] novice nun disciples;
- [§§12.85-105] celibate laymen disciples;
- [§§12.106-129] celibate laywomen disciples;
- [§§12.130-155] householder laymen disciples; and
- [§§12.156-183] householder laywomen disciples.

[§§12.184-197] However, even when there are all these 10 kinds of disciples, Buddhism may still be “merely an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, well proclaimed amongst devas and humans,”² *without* a holy life, that is, without training others for liberation, there will be “*no* attaining of the peak of gain, the peak of fame” [§12.197]—the holy life is still unaccomplished.

[§§12.198-212] Furthermore, under these positive conditions, if there is “*no* attaining of the peak of gain, the peak of fame,” that is, the attaining of the various stages of sainthood, the holy life is still *unaccomplished*.

[§13] On the other hand, if the holy life is widespread, successful and wealthy, and there are *also* those attaining the four stages of sainthood, then the holy life *is* accomplished [§12.212].

2.3 THE BUDDHA’S TEACHING IS AN ACCOMPLISHED SYSTEM. [§§14-15] The Buddha then declares that his Dharma, vinaya has all these positive qualities. [§16.1-4] The Buddha, dharma “is accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more.” In other words, the Buddha’s teachings as recorded in the early Buddhist canon is quite complete in itself and does not need any new texts or teachings.

The Buddha explains that **Uddaka Rāma,putta** does not understand his own riddle, “Looking, one sees not” [§§16.5-8]. The *not seeing* refers to not seeing the completeness of the holy life itself [§§16.9-15].

[§17] The Buddha then lists the 7 sets of key teachings [§17.8] that *should be recited, remembered and understood*, so that the holy life lasts for a long time for the benefit of all beings.

[§§18-21] The Buddha then explains three proper ways for resolving differences in opinion over the Dharma. Whether the difference is over its meaning [§18] or its wording [§19] or both [§20], “neither dismissing nor disparaging” anyone, we should carefully and attentively make him fully understand what he has proposed. On the other hand, if his presentation is right both ways [§21], we should openly show our gladness to him.

[§22] Next the Buddha reminds the monks to be contented with the four supports by properly reflecting on them.

2.4 PREVENTING MISCONCEPTIONS OF THE DHARMA

2.4.1 Wholesome pleasures. [§§23-25] In these sections, the Buddha explains the types of pleasure (*sukha*) in terms of the spiritual life. Unwholesome pleasure is connected with habitual killing, stealing,

² On *yāva deva, manussehi suppakāsitaṃ*, see §8.3 ad loc n.

lying and sensual indulgence [§23.4], which are to be avoided [§23.5]. The pleasures of the 4 dhyanas [§24.4], on the other hand, are wholesome, and should be praised and encouraged [§24.7]. [§25] The benefits of dhyanic pleasure are good insofar as they lead to the attainment of any of the 4 kinds of sainthood.

2.4.2 The consistency of the Buddha's teachings.

[§26] If other religionists question the authenticity of the Buddha's teaching, they should be told that the Buddha Dharma is taught by the fully awakened Buddha in a complete and systematic way, so that its reliability and truth are unshakeable [§§26.1-4]. The highest fruit of this teaching is **the arhat**, who is incapable of killing, stealing, sexual intercourse, lying, enjoying pleasures like a layman, or acting out of greed, or hate, or delusion or fear [§26.6], in other words, he is pure in both body and mind.

[§27] If outsiders should accuse the Buddha of lacking future knowledge or the power of prophecy, they should be told that he is able to recall the past as far back as he wishes [§27.3]. As regards future knowledge, he is certain that he has overcome rebirth [§27.4]. Since the future has not yet happened, we can have no real knowledge of it (otherwise, it would be determinism, and the spiritual life would be useless).

[§28] The Buddha has full knowledge of the past, present and future, as far as knowing goes. What is *not* connected with the goal of awakening, he would not reveal or teach. He would only reveal and teach at the proper time what is true, real and connected with the goal.

2.5 THE TATHAGATA AND REALITY

2.5.1 The Tathagata. The Buddha is called Tathagata (thus come, who knows reality) for these reasons:

[§28.10] Concerning the past, the future and the present, he speaks at the right time, what is true, on the goal, what is Dharma (the teaching), and what is Vinaya (the discipline).

[§29.1] He has understood all that can be experienced, bodily and mentally.

[§29.2] He is fully awakened and all that he has taught are real and true.

[§29.3] His words and actions are true and consistent.

[§29.4] He has "conquered" the world, and hence understands everything.

2.5.2 What is unrelated or related to spirituality

2.5.2.1 POINTS UNDETERMINED AND DETERMINED. [§30] The postmortem state of a *tathāgata* (here referring to an arhat)³ cannot be described in any logical way because he is beyond existence and non-existence. [§31] The Buddha leaves such issues unanswered as they are not related to the spiritual training and goal.

[§32] What the Buddha has determined and taught are the 4 noble truths, [§33] because they are directly related to the spiritual life and goal.

2.5.2.2 VIEWS CONNECTED WITH THE PAST. [§34] Next, the Buddha rejects **the 16 wrong views** regarding the past, based on these notions:

(1-4) whether the world is eternal, not eternal, both, or neither; [§34.7-10]

(5-8) whether the self and the world are self-made, other-made, both or neither; [§34.11-14]

(9-12) whether happiness and sorrow are eternal, not eternal, both, or neither; [§34.15-18]

(12-16) whether happiness and sorrow are self-made, other-made, both or neither; [§34.19-22].

[§35] The Buddha rejects all such notions because "beings (are) with different perceptions," that is, to say, they are all based on personal opinions (since they all have no direct personal experience of such things). [§36] Similarly, these are views that we should not entertain as they are undeterminable (and not related to the spiritual training).

2.5.2.3 VIEWS CONNECTED WITH THE FUTURE. [§37] The Buddha also rejects **the 8 wrong views** regarding the future, based on these notions:

(1-4) that the posthumous unimpaired self has form, is formless, both or neither;

³ On the trs of *tathāgata*, see **Aggi Vaccha,gotta S** (M 72) @ SD 6.15 (3.2). On the tetralemma, see **Unanswered questions**, SD 40a.10 (4.2): Describing an arhat's after-death state.

(5-8) that the posthumous unimpaired self is conscious, unconscious, neither; that the self perishes after death.

[§38] The Buddha rejects such views as people “have different perceptions,” that is, they are subjective, without any reality of their own. [§39] Similarly, these are views that we should not entertain as they are undeterminable (and not related to the spiritual training).

2.6 THE WAY OUT. [§40] The way of all such views is the mind-training based on the 4 foundations of mindfulness.

[§41] On account of Upavāṇa’s remark, the Buddha calls this exposition “delightful” (*pāsādika*).

3 Cunda Saman’uddesa

3.1 FAMOUS SIBLINGS. At the opening of the Pāsādika Sutta, Cunda Saman’uddesa (“the novice”) is said to have just emerged from the rains retreat at Pāvā. He meets Ānanda and reports to him Nirgrantha Nāta,putta’s death and the consequent dissension amongst the Nirgranthas. On Ānanda’s suggestion, they visit the Buddha at Sāma,gāma to hear his response. [§§1-2]

Cunda is Sāriputta’s younger brother, and is himself the elder brother of **Revata Khadira,vaniya**, the youngest of the siblings, the acacia-forest dweller, renowned for his solitary life style, and is the foremost of those monks who are forest-dwellers (*āraññika*).⁴ Ānanda is Cunda’s preceptor (SA 3:221), and it is to Ānanda that he first brings the news of Sāriputta’s death, at which time he is his personal attendant.⁵ Cunda Saman’uddesa is, for a time, the Buddha’s personal attendant (SA 1:258, 3:213).⁶

3.2 MAHĀ CUNDA. The Commentaries⁷ identify Cunda Sama’uddesa with Mahā Cunda (ThaA 3:111), which is probably his alternate name in his senior years. Mahā Cunda is evidently a very eminent monk, as he is often mentioned by the Buddha in the company of the two chief disciples (Sāriputta and Moggallāna), Mahā Kassapa, Mahā Koṭṭhita, Mahā Kaccāna, and other elders.⁸ Cunda is one of the 80 great elders (ThaA 3:205).

Cunda is mentioned in **the Chann’ovāda Sutta** (M 114) and **the (Ovāda) Channa Sutta** (S 4.87) as having accompanied Sāriputta to visit the sick Channa at the squirrels’ feeding ground outside Rājagaha, just before Channa’s suicide.⁹ Once when the Buddha lies ill in the squirrels’ feeding-ground near Rājagaha, Cunda visits him and they discuss the awakening-factors (*bojjhaṅga*), and promptly the Buddha recovers.¹⁰

The Sallekha Sutta (M 8) records the Buddha’s teaching on the holy life by way of “effacement” (*sallekha*), that is, the removal of defilements, to Mahā Cunda.¹¹ Mahā Cunda has given a number of teachings to the monks, including these:

(Dullābha) Mahā Cunda Sutta	A 6.46/3:355 f	SD 4.6
Mahā Cunda Sutta	A 10.24/5:41-45	SD 72.12
Katthī Sutta	A 10.85/5:157-161	SD 68.8

All of these are given while he is residing among the Cetīs at Saha,jāti, probably after the Buddha’s parinirvana. **The Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16) records Cunda or Cundaka, as he is called here, as

⁴ A 1.14/1:24; cf M 32.5-6/1:213; MA 2:247 (the 2 Revatas); AA 1:223; ThaA 1:117. For Chin sources: MĀ 184 = T1.727b3; EĀ 37.3 = T2.710c24; T154 = T3.81a27, which record his praises in favour of living in seclusion. See **Anaṅgaṇa S** (M 5) @ SD 37.7 (3.3.3.3).

⁵ **Cunda S** (S 47.13/5:161 f).

⁶ Dh Comy tells how a 7-year-old novice (*sāmaṇera*) Cunda offers to perform a psychic wonder for the Buddha (DhA 3:211), but this is prob another namesake.

⁷ eg DA 3:907; AA 3:379; DhA 2:188; ThaA 2:18.

⁸ M 118.1/3:78; A 6.46/3:355, 10.24/5:41, 10.85/5:157; U 1.5/3.

⁹ M 144.2-3/3:263 f = S 35.87/4:50f = SD 11.12

¹⁰ **Gilāna S 3** (S 46.16/5:81), SD 43.13. The Saṃyukta Āgama version (in Chinese tr), however, says this other monk is **Mahā Koṭṭhita** [Chin 摩訶拘絺羅] (SĀ 1266 = T2.347b,18).

¹¹ M 8/1:40-46 = SD 51.2.

accompanying the Buddha in his last journey to Kusi,nārā. He spreads a bed for the Buddha in the mango grove by the Kakutṭhā river.¹²

4 Polemics and apologetics in early Buddhism

4.1 DEFENDING AND ADVANCING THE FAITH. While during the early period, especially the first two decades of the Buddha’s ministry,¹³ the Buddha teaches mainly to the spiritually ripe and ready,¹⁴ during the later years, after the core of the spiritual community, the sangha, has been established, he teaches the Dharma to anyone who would listen. Through his peripatetic life of teaching,¹⁵ wherever he goes, and as his fame as a wise teacher spreads, various individuals often debate with him¹⁶ or simply meet to question him,¹⁷ or raise an issue by proxy.¹⁸ Such occasions often open the Dharma-doors to others, both the Buddha’s followers as well as the unconverted public.¹⁹

The *Dīgha Nikāya*²⁰ is a collection of “long discourses” of the Buddha, mostly recording such debates with outsiders, on various points and issues relating to “the good life” (true happiness here and now) and spirituality (true goodness and liberation). Such suttas generally present aspect of Buddhism by way of an interesting or challenging narrative with strategic highlights of certain attractive doctrines to inspire the outsiders to join the order, or take refuge, if not at least not to belittle the Buddha Dharma.²¹

4.2 APOLOGETICS. Technically, **apologetics** (Greek, “speaking in defence”), is an intellectual defence of the faith,²² a skill in defending a position (such as a religious one) through the systematic use of information and argumentation. The word **apologetic** or **apologetics** comes from the Greek adjective, ἀπολογία (*apologia* = *apo*, “away from” + *logos*, “word”) “verbal defence, speech in defence.” In simpler terms, apologetics refers to a systematic way of explaining the teaching and correcting wrong views to both the converted and the unconverted, who are willing to learn the Dharma.

Here I have used the terms polemics and apologetics in a Buddhist context for the purpose of a better understanding of the proper argumentation in the defence and propagation of the Dharma. While **apolo-**

¹² D 16.4.39n/2:134 f = SD 9; also at U 8.5/84,7.

¹³ This alludes to the notion of the “two periods” of the Buddha’s ministry: see **Notion of *diṭṭhi***, SD 40a.1 (1.3) & SID sv.

¹⁴ Eg Pukkusāti in **Dhātu Vibhaṅga S** (M 140/3:237-247), SD 4.17; Aṅguli,māla in **Aṅguli,māla S** (M 86/2:97-195), SD 5.11.

¹⁵ On the Buddha’s annual tours, see **Arhats who became Bodhisattvas**, SD 27.6b (3.2.1.2).

¹⁶ **Upāli S** (M 56/1:371-387), SD 27.1; **Assalāyana S** (M 93/2:147-157), SD 40a.2.

¹⁷ Eg Dīgha,nākha (Sāriputta’s nephew) who claims he “does not accept everything” (ie, he holds no views), **Dīgha,nakha S** (M 74.3/1:497), SD 16.1.

¹⁸ **Kamma Vibhaṅga S** (M 136), eg, contains the Buddha’s teaching on karma, in response to Samiddhi’s inability, earlier on, to properly instruct and convince the wanderer Poṭali,putta on it (M 136/3:207-214), SD 4.16.

¹⁹ **Sāriputta**, eg, gains arhathood while standing fanning the Buddha and listening to the Buddha teaching on feelings to his (Sāriputta’s) nephew, Dīgha,nakha: **Dīgha,nakha S** (M 74.14/1:501), SD 16.1. While the Buddha is addressing a certain monk before others, a by-stander, the cowherd Nanda, is inspired to ordain: **Dāru-k,khandha S** (S 35.24.14-15/4:181), SD 28.5.

²⁰ To a much lesser extent, similar suttas are found in the Majjhima Nikāya (eg **Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S**, M 38/1:256-271 = SD 7.10), and other Nikāyas (eg **Kesa,puttiya S**, A 3.65/1:188-193 = SD 35.4a), but these are not debates—not polemical—but generally tend to be more *apologetical*, that is, a defence and rectification of the Dharma.

²¹ In **Cūḷa Hatthi,padōpana S** (M 27), the wanderer Pilotikā, although unconverted, shows a high regard for the Buddha (M 27.2-7/1:175-177), SD 40a.5. **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25) describes how the wanderer Nigrodha challenges the Buddha, who responds by discussing with Nigrodha his own faith and so besting him, although he remains unconverted (D 25/3:36-57), SD 1.4. On the probable purpose of the Dīgha Nikāya as a sort of Buddhist prospective for the outsider, see Joy Manné, 1990, 1992.

²² The German theologian and icon of Protestant Christianity, Martin Luther’s *On the Bondage of the Will* (*De Servo Arbitrio* 1525) is an example of polemic theology. It was written in answer to another polemic work, *The Freedom of the Will* (*De libero arbitrio diatribe sive collatio* 1524) by Desiderius Erasmus, the Dutch Renaissance humanist and theologian.

getics is a defence or advancement of Buddhist ideas amongst the ripe and ready, polemics is, as a rule, exchanges between two opposing parties (not necessarily present before one another).

The Pāsādika Sutta (D 29) is a good example of an early canonical work where the Buddha lays down the ground rules for proper argumentation of the Dharma in response to outside criticisms. In other words, it is a locus classicus for the early Buddhist principles of apologetics. The Sutta however goes beyond apologetics and instructs on what apologetics points to, that is, a wholesome and effective system of spiritual training.

A number of other suttas, to a lesser extent, deals with apologetics, too. Similar suttas are found in the Majjhima Nikāya (eg **the Mahā Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta**, M 38), and other Nikāyas (eg **the Kesa,puttiya Sutta**, A 3.65): these are not debates, but apologetical instructions on seeing the Dharma rightly.²³ **The Alagaddûpama Sutta** (M 22), like the Mahā Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta, deals with a monk's wrong view, which, in each case, is carefully disproven and the right view carefully presented.²⁴

In **the Kesa,puttiya Sutta**, the Buddha basically speaks on the nature of beliefs and how they arise, how to avoid blind beliefs and false views, and to keep to a safe and sure religious life.²⁵ In other words, these are not polemical texts; they generally tend to be *apologetical*, that is, a defence and righting of the Dharma.

4.3 POLEMICS. A **polemic** is a contentious argument that is intended to establish the truth of a specific teaching and the falsity of the contrary notion. **Polemic** or **polemics** (“war of words”) is the art or presentation of convincing arguments regarding controversial topics. The word polemic is derived from the Greek adjective πολεμικός (*polemikos*), meaning “warlike, hostile,” which in turn comes from the feminine noun, πόλεμος (*polemos*), “war” (OED).

Polemics is common and vital as one of the most common form of argumentation in any field of learning, especially philosophy, politics, science and religion. It is closely related to debate, but if debate often seeks a common ground between the opposing sides, polemic intends only to establish the truth of a point while refuting the opposing view. In the field of religion, polemic theology is that branch of theological argumentation devoted to the history or conduct of controversy over religion. Polemic theology is the branch of theological argumentation devoted to the history or conduct of controversy over religious matters.

Kumāra Kassapa's debate with prince Pāyāsi, as recorded in **the Pāyāsi Sutta** (D 23), is a canonical example of Buddhist polemics. In these interesting, often humorous, series of argumentations, we see how Kumāra Kassapa rebuts Pāyāsi point by point on his wrong views regarding karma and rebirth,²⁶ [3.3]

The best known Buddhist work on polemics clearly is **the Milinda,pañha** (c100 BCE), purportedly a dialogue and debate, in which Milinda (Menander, the Indo-Greek king of Bactria, reigned 2nd cent BCE) questions, sometimes challenges, the monk Nāgasena.²⁷ In our own times, various Buddhist scholars and writers have written apologetical works rebutting attacks on Buddhism and on religious ideas that are negative or exploitative, especially against evangelical systems.²⁸

²³ Respectively, M 22/1:130-142 = SD 3.13 & A 3.65/1:188-193 = SD 35.4a.

²⁴ In **M 22**, the errant monk Ariṭṭha claims that sensuality (meaning “sex”) is not an obstruction to the holy life, against what the Buddha has frequently stressed and warned that sense-indulgence is a great hindrance to the holy life (M 22/1:130-142), SD 3.13. In **M 38**, the confused monk Sāti holds the wrong views that it is the “same” consciousness that is reborn and continues after death, when the Buddha actually teaches that consciousness is not a fixed entity, but a process that arises depending of conditions (M 38/1:256-271), SD 7.10.

²⁵ A 3.65/1:199-193 = SD 35.4a.

²⁶ D 23/2:316-357 = SD 39.4.

²⁷ See K R Norman, *Pali Literature*, 1983:110-113. See also SD 36.9 (4.2.3) n on Nāgasena Bhikṣu Sūtra.

²⁸ Apologetical works that are directed against antagonists or other religions, incl Gunapala Dharmasiri, *A Buddhist Critique of the Christian Conception of God*, Antioch, CA, 1988, and A L de Silva, *Beyond Belief: A Buddhist Critique of Fundamentalist Christianity*, Sydney, 1994; on polemics against Buddhism, see Richard Fox Young & G P V Somaratna, *Vain Debates: The Buddhist-Christian controversies of nineteenth-century Ceylon*, Vienna: De Nobili Research Library, 1996.

4.4 KUMĀRA KASSAPA AS POLEMICIST. The elder Kumāra Kassapa²⁹ is declared by the Buddha to be the foremost of the monks who have the gift of variegated or versatile discourse (*citta,kathikānam*).³⁰ Understandably, Kumāra Kassapa is also skilled in debate, and this is shown in his responses to Pāyāsi's wrong views, as recorded in **the Pāyāsi Sutta** (D 23), which is replete with parables and various argumentations styles.³¹

Kumāra Kassapa's argumentative style, as evident from the Pāyāsi Sutta, shows an effective application of polemical skills. In modern literary style, however, Kumāra Kassapa's argumentation style might be viewed as being prolix, but considering the cultural context, it is an effective, even popular style, as it wins prince Pāyāsi over to right view. In fact, Pāyāsi admits that "Even with master Kassapa's first parable, I am already convinced," but he continues playing an adversary because he desires "to hear [Kumāra Kassapa's] ready wit in answering diverse questions," and regards him as "a worthy adversary."³²

5 The three trainings in the Pāsādika Sutta

5.1 THE THREE TRAININGS. The Pāsādika Sutta (D 29) is often cited in the Commentaries as an example of where the three trainings (*sikkha-t,taya*), that is, the whole of the teaching (*sakala,sāsana*), is called "the holy life" (*brahma,cariyā*),³³ quoting this stock passage from the Sutta: "Indeed, Cunda, today [now] (*etarahi*) this holy life of mine is truly an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, only so far as it is well proclaimed amongst humans."³⁴

In a practical worldly sense, the three trainings are those of the body and speech, of the mind, and of wisdom. The "3 trainings" model leads us from our *present* state, through a *cultivated* state, into a *liberated* state ("higher mind"), albeit a temporary one, that is, until we attain sainthood. A saint, in other words, is simply someone who is spiritually mature, or clearly and certainly free of mental defilements.³⁵

In the first chapter (the Sīla-k,khandha Vagga) of **the Dīgha Nikāya**, each of its 13 suttas has the threefold training pericope laid out in the form of the "fruits of recluseship" (*sāmañña,phala*), that is, the progress of a true disciple, also known as the gradual training or the disciple's progress. It begins with moral virtue or "moralities" (*sīla*),³⁶ followed by mental cultivation, the knowledge of supernormal powers,³⁷ and the cultivation of liberating wisdom.³⁸

5.2 THE THREE TRAININGS IN THE SUTTA. In **the Pāsādika Sutta**, there is a very long preamble on the failed religion and the accomplished teaching [§§3.4-21]. The rest of the Sutta then deals with the three trainings and concludes with Upavāṇa's exultation. The three trainings of the Sutta can be listed as follows:

- §22 Moral virtue: Proper use of the four permitted life-supports (robes, almsfood, lodging and medicine)
- §§23-25 Mental cultivation: The devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure (that is, dhyana meditation)
- §§26-38 Wisdom: The righting of wrong views, the nature of the Buddha and the arhat.

²⁹ Kumāra Kassapa: for details, see SD 28.13 (2).

³⁰ A 1:24; AA 1:283, 2:336.

³¹ D 23/2:316-357 = SD 39.4 (1.2).

³² See nn at D 23.30.1/3:352 = SD 39.4. A similar sentiment is expressed by the erstwhile Jain follower, Upāli, to the Buddha, in **Upāli S** (M 56.15/1:378), SD 27.1.

³³ *Pāsādika,sutte sikkha-t,taya,saṅgaham (sakalasmim) sāsanam [sakala,sāsanam] brahma,cariyan'ti vuttam*, DA 2:43, 3:79; MA 2:43; ItA 1:109.

³⁴ §§12.197+212, 13.14, 15.11.

³⁵ On the 3 trainings, see *Sīla samādhi paññā* = SD 21.6 & SID: ti,sikkhā..

³⁶ See esp *Sāmañña,phala S* (D 2.43-68/1:63-70) & SD 8.10 (3), = *Brahma,jāla S* (D 1.8-27/1:4-11), SD 25.2.

³⁷ Eg D 2.87-96/1:77-82 = SD 8.10.

³⁸ Eg D 2.97-100/1:83 f = SD 9.10. On *sāmañña,phala*, see also Gethin 2001:195 f.

§40 lists the 4 focusses of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*) as the way to transcending all views and to liberation. In this sense, these four focusses are taken as the epitome of wisdom itself, that is, the practice of the arhat himself.

Perhaps, on account of the Sutta's emphasis on the teacher's clear and careful teaching, and the overcoming of wrong views, the Commentary remarks that "the Pāsādika Sutta speaks of the four paths (of sainthood, that is, streamwinning, once-return, non-return and arhathood) in terms of insight."³⁹ Indeed, the Pāsādika Sutta is predominantly an instruction on the Buddha Dharma's success in having a good foundation in insight and wisdom at all levels of the spiritual life.

6 The 7 sets & standardizing the doctrines

6.1 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE PĀSĀDIKA SUTTA

6.1.1 Authenticating the teachings. One of the most important developments in the religious history of Buddhism occurred during the "second period"⁴⁰ of the Buddha's ministry, especially the last two and a half decades of the Buddha's life. This was the systematization of the teachings into the "7 sets," which was the closest that early Buddhism came to the canonizing some kind of "standards of faith" or "canon of scripture." The earliest records we have of such a development are found in at least three discourses,⁴¹ the most detailed of which is **the Pāsādika Sutta** (D 29), where the Buddha declares:

You should gather together and recite them [the 7 sets], comparing meaning with meaning, comparing text with text [comparing spirit with spirit, letter with letter], without quarrelling [without dissension]. [§18]⁴²

The Sutta opens immediately after the death of Nirgrantha Nāta,putta, when quarrels and disagreement split the Jain community. In this connection, the Buddha exhorts Cunda Samaṇ'uddesa [3] thus:

If anyone, Cunda, speaking rightly, were to speak of a well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed, accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more,

speaking rightly, he would speak of this very well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed, accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more.

Therefore, Cunda, all of you to whom I have taught these truths that I have directly known should gather together and recite them, comparing meaning with meaning, comparing text with text [comparing spirit with spirit, letter with letter], without dissension [without quarrelling],

so that this holy life might endure, stand long,

and this is for the good of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of compassion for the world, and for the benefit, profit and happiness of devas and humans.

And what, Cunda, are these teachings, directly understood by me, that I have shown you, that all, having gathered and assembled, should not quarrel, but rehearse [recite] meaning for meaning, word for word?

They are (the 37 limbs of awakening) namely (the seven sets):⁴³

the 4 focusses of mindfulness,	<i>cattāro satipaṭṭhāna</i> ⁴⁴
the 4 right efforts,	<i>samma-p, padhāna</i> ⁴⁵

³⁹ *Pāsādika, sutte catūhi maggehi saddhim vipassanā kathitā.* (DA 2:380)

⁴⁰ Cf §4.1: on the "two periods" of the Buddha's ministry: see **Notion of diṭṭhi** = SD 40a.1 (1.3) & SID sv.

⁴¹ See Gethin 2001:232-240 for a useful discussion.

⁴² D 29.18/3:128 = SD 40a.6.

⁴³ These 7 sets are listed in **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 19.3.50b/2:120 & SD 9 (10c)) given in full in **Sakul'udāyī S** (M 77.15-21/2:11 f = SD 6.18) and as practised by various monks, in **Ānāpāna,sati S** (M 118.13/3:81 = SD 7.13).

⁴⁴ See D 1:56, 339, 2:83, 290-315, 3:101; S 3:96, 153; A 2:218, 3:12.

the 4 paths to spiritual power,	<i>cattāro iddhi,pādā</i> ⁴⁶
the 5 spiritual faculties,	<i>pañc 'indriya.</i> ⁴⁷
the 5 spiritual powers,	<i>pañca,bala</i> ⁴⁸
the 7 awakening-factors,	<i>satta bojjaṅga.</i> ⁴⁹
the noble eightfold path.	<i>ariyo aṭṭh 'aṅgiko magga</i> ⁵⁰

[§§16.15-27.8] (D 29/3:127 f)

6.1.2 The four great references. The emphasis here is on avoiding dispute and reaching harmonious agreement: the monks should not quarrel, and should not allow the teaching to be distorted.⁵¹ To prevent thus, the Buddha introduced the four great references, defined in the Vinaya.⁵²

The Mahā, vagga of **the Vinaya**, however, has its own, probably older, “four great references,” comprising four criteria for judging the propriety of an act or situation that is not covered by current rules:

- (1) Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is not allowable (*akappiya*) and goes against what is allowable, that is not allowable.
- (2) Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is allowable (*kappiya*) and goes against what is not allowable, that is allowable.
- (3) Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is not allowable (*akappiyānulomiya*) and goes against what is allowable, that is not allowable.
- (4) Whatever has not been ruled as not allowable, if it fits in with what is allowable (*kappiyānulomiya*) and goes against what is not allowable, that is allowable. (V 1:250)

Paralleling the four great references are these procedures laid out by the Buddha in **the Pāsādika Sutta**, as follows:

⁵³And, Cunda, when you are gathered together harmoniously,
you should train yourselves thus when a certain fellow in the holy life speaks the Dharma
before the sangha.

Now, suppose he were to speak thus:

- (1) “You have grasped *both* the meaning and the wording of this *wrongly*,” or
- (2) “You have grasped the meaning *wrongly* but the wording *rightly*,” or
- (3) “You have grasped the meaning *rightly* but the wording *wrongly*.”

Neither approving nor disapproving, you should, with careful attention, make him comprehend *only the disagreed points*.

Now, suppose he were to speak thus:

- (4) “You have grasped *both* the meaning and the wording *rightly*,”

then you should applaud him, saying,

“Sadhu! [Excellent!]...This is a great advantage to us all that you are so accomplished in its meaning and its wording!” (D 29.18-21/3:129; abridged & paraphrased)

⁴⁵ See V 1:22; D 2:120; M 3:296, 2:96; A 2:74, 15 f.

⁴⁶ See D 2:213, 221; M 1:103 = 2:11; A 1:39, 297, 2:256, 3:82; Vbh 213.

⁴⁷ See M 1:295; S 3:46, 225, 4:168; A 2:151. See foll n.

⁴⁸ See D 2:120, 239; M 2:12, 3:296; S 3:96, 153, 4:366; A 3:10, 12; Vbh 342.

⁴⁹ See D 2:79, 83, 120, 302, 3:101, 128, 251, 282; M 1:11, 2:12; S 1:54, 5:83; A 1:14, 4:23; Vbh 277.

⁵⁰ See D 1:256 f, 165, 312; M 1:61, 118, 3:251; It 18; Sn 1130; Vbh 235.

⁵¹ See Gethin 2001:232 f.

⁵² On the 4 great references (*mahā'padesa*), see **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16.4.7-11/2:123 f) & SD 9 (11).

⁵³ *Tesañ ca vo cunda samaggānañ sammodamānānañ avivadamānāñ sikkhitabbañ, aññataro sabrahmacārī saṅghe dhammañ bhāseyya. Tatra ce tumhākañ evaṃ assa—(1) atthañ c 'eva micchā gaṇhāti, vyañjanāni ca micchā ropetī ti...; (2) atthañ hi kho micchā gaṇhāti, vyañjanāni sammā ropetī ti...; (3) atthañ hi kho sammā gaṇhāti, vyañjanāni micchā ropetī ti—tassa n 'eva abhinanditabbañ na paṭikkositabbañ. Anabhinanditvā appaṭikkositvā so evaṃ assa vacanīyo; (4) atthañ ñ 'eva sammā gaṇhāti, vyañjanāni sammā ropetī ti.*

6.2 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE SĀMA,GĀMA SUTTA. The second of the three discourses relating to authenticating the teaching with harmony is **the Sāma,gāma Sutta** (M 104), where the Buddha warns:

A dispute about livelihood or about the Pātimokkha would be trifling.

But, Ānanda, should there arise in the sangha a dispute about the path or the way, such a dispute would be to the detriment of the many.... (M 104.5/2:245) = SD 62.4

The Sāma,gāma Sutta (M 104)⁵⁴ is effectively the Majjhima Nikāya counterpart of the Pāsādika Sutta of the Dīgha Nikāya. Both suttas open with the Buddha dwelling among the Sakyas, immediately after the death of Nirgrantha Nāta,putta, when quarrels and disagreements split the Jain community. In both suttas, both Cunda and Ānanda mention the incident to the Buddha. In the Sāma,gāma Sutta, however, Ānanda concludes with a more specific point, followed by the Buddha's response, thus:

“This occurs to me, bhante: Let not a dispute arise in the sangha after the Blessed One's passing away. Such a dispute would be to the detriment of the many, the unhappiness of the many, the loss, detriment and suffering of devas and humans.”

“What do you think, Ānanda? Those things that I have directly known and taught you, namely, the four focusses of mindfulness...the noble eightfold path—Ānanda, do you see any two monks who have differing opinions regarding them?” (M 104.4/2:245)

Ānanda replies no but suggests that after the Buddha's passing those who live taking him as their refuge might become involved in dispute “in connection with livelihood” (*ajjh'ājīva*) and “in connection with the code of discipline” (*adhipātimokkha*),⁵⁵ and that this would be to the disadvantage of the many. The Buddha, however, replies:

“Ānanda, a dispute about livelihood or about the Pātimokkha would be trifling. But, Ānanda, should there arise in the sangha a dispute about the path or the way, such a dispute would be to the detriment of the many, the unhappiness of the many, the loss, detriment and suffering of devas and humans!” (M 104.5/2:245)

6.3 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE KIN'TI SUTTA. The third discourse related to the harmonious authentication of the teachings is **the Kin'ti Sutta** (M 103), which similarly focusses on the centrality of the seven sets as the standards for overcoming any disagreement regarding the spirit and the letter of the Dharma. The Sutta opens with the Buddha declaring:

Bhikshus, what do you think of me? That the recluse Gotama teaches Dharma for the sake of robes? Or, that the recluse Gotama teaches Dharma for the sake of almsfood? Or, that the recluse Gotama teaches Dharma for the sake of lodgings? Or, that the recluse Gotama teaches Dharma for the sake of this or that existence [different states of being]? (M 103.2/2:238)

The monks reply that the Buddha “is compassionate, one who seeks after our good; he teaches the Dharma out of compassion.” the Buddha continues:

Therefore, monks, those things that I have directly known and taught you, namely, the four focusses of mindfulness...the noble eightfold path—in these things you should all train yourself in concord, with mutual appreciation, without disputing.

While you are training yourself in concord, with mutual appreciation, without disputing, let not any two monks differ in opinions regarding the Dharma (*abhidhamme*). (M 103.3-4/2:239)
The Buddha then declares:

⁵⁴ M 104/2:243-251 = SD 62.4.

⁵⁵ *Ajjh'ājīva* and *adhipātimokkha*, see CPD which qu MA 4:38.

You should all train yourself in concord, with mutual appreciation, without disputing ... let not any two monks differ in opinions regarding the Dharma. (M 103.4/2:239) = SD 85.14

The Buddha then shows us how to deal with possible areas of discord: where there is disagreement about the meaning (*attha*) or the wording (*vyañjana*), that is, both together and each separately; where a monk commits some offence (*āpatti*) or transgression (*vītikāma*); where argument and ill feeling exist between groups.⁵⁶

7 Related suttas

7.1 (SĀLA,VATIKĀ) LOHICCA SUTTA. Besides **the Sāma,gāma Sutta** (M 104) [6.2] and **the Kin'ti Sutta** (M 103) [6.3] already mentioned, there are a number of other suttas which can be profitably studied with the Pāsādika Sutta. A key teaching of the Sutta concerns the effectiveness of the teacher, based on whose spirituality and teaching, the system succeeds or fails. If the teacher is not fully awakened and does not have disciples who are also awakened, the teaching would neither prosper nor last. This is essentially the same message of **the (Sāla,vatikā) Lohicca Sutta** (D 12), where the ideal teacher is one who is fully awakened and his disciples listen to him and benefit from it.⁵⁷

7.2 SĀMAÑÑA,PHALA SUTTA. The Pāsādika Sutta, as a whole, is said to present the “holy life,” that is, the training of a disciple for awakening. This is also known as the “fruits of recluship” (*sāmañña,-phala*) [5.1], that is, the benefits of spiritual growth. The famous *sāmañña,phala* pericope is found in all the first 13 suttas of the Dīgha Nikāya, forming the Sīla-k,khandha Vagga (The Chapter on the Moral Virtue Aggregates).⁵⁸ More specifically, this deals with the three trainings [5.2], that is, in moral virtue, in mental cultivation and in wisdom.

7.3 MAHĀ,PARINIBBĀNA SUTTA. The Pāsādika Sutta records some of the Buddha’s “final instructions” dealing with the authenticity of the teaching [§§5-11], the true prosperity of the spiritual community [§§12-15] and the extended life and liberating wisdom of the Buddha Dharma for the benefit of all beings [§§16-40]. We see similar concerns shown in greater narrative detail in **the Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16), which recounts the last days and final teachings of the Buddha.⁵⁹

7.4 SUTTAS RELATED TO APOLOGETICS. We have already noted that the Pāsādika Sutta is the locus classicus for early Buddhist apologetics [4.3]. In this connection, we have related discourses such as **the Mahā Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta** (M 38), which corrects the confused monk Sāti, who holds the wrong view that it is the “same” consciousness that is reborn and continues after death, when the Buddha actually teaches that consciousness is not a fixed entity, but a process that arises depending of conditions.⁶⁰

The Alagaddūpama Sutta (M 22), like the Mahā Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta, deals with the errant monk Ariṭṭha’s claims that sensuality (meaning “sex”) is not an obstruction to the holy life, against what the Buddha has frequently stressed, and warns that sense-indulgence is a great hindrance to the holy life.⁶¹

Another famous text on Buddhist apologetics is **the Kesa,puttiya Sutta** (A 3.65), where the Buddha basically speaks on the nature of beliefs and how they arise, how to avoid blind beliefs and false views, and to keep to a safe and sure religious life.⁶² In other words, these are not polemical texts; they generally tend to be *apologetical*, that is, a defence and righting of the Dharma to an open and curious audience.

— — —

⁵⁶ M 103.5-7/2:239-243 = SD 85.14.

⁵⁷ D 12/1:224-234 = SD 34.8.

⁵⁸ See **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2) @ SD 8.10(3).

⁵⁹ D 16/2:72-167 = SD 9.

⁶⁰ M 38/1:256-27 = SD 7.10.

⁶¹ M 22/1:130-142 = SD 3.13.

⁶² A 3.65/1:199-193 = SD 35.4a.

The Discourse on the Delightful

D 29/3:117-141

1.1 Thus have I heard.

At one time the Blessed One was staying amongst the Sakyas, in a terraced building⁶³ in a mango grove of the Sakya named Vedhañña.⁶⁴

Nirgrantha Nātaputta's death

1.2 Now at that time, Nirgrantha Nātaputta⁶⁵ had just died at Pāvā.⁶⁶

On account of his death, the Nirgranthas split into two factions, fallen into strife, disputes and quarrels, and dwelt cutting and piercing one another with the weapons of words, thus:⁶⁷

“You do not know this Dharma,vinaya [the teaching and the discipline]! I know this Dharma,vinaya! What would you understand of this Dharma,vinaya?

You are practising wrong way! I'm practising the right way! Mine is beneficial [connected to the goal]; yours is not!⁶⁸

You have said later what should be said first, and said first what should be said later!

What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your viewpoint has been overthrown. You are defeated. Go and try to salvage your viewpoint; extricate yourself if you can!”⁶⁹

1.3 Indeed, it seems that the followers of Nirgrantha Nāta,putta were out to kill one another!

1.4 Even Nirgrantha Nāta,putta's white-dressed laymen disciple, [118] too, were disgusted with, displeased with, repelled by⁷⁰ these followers of Nirgrantha Nāta,putta,⁷¹

1.5 as to how the Dharma,vinaya was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace,⁷² not taught by one fully self awakened, stupa-breaking [undermining the very foundation], without any refuge.⁷³

⁶³ Comy: It is a long terraced building built for the purpose of learning the arts (*sippam uggaṇh'atthāya kato dīgha,pāsādo atthi*, DA 3:905).

⁶⁴ Comy: Amongst those called Vedhañña are those trained in archery (“the bow”) (*vedhañña nāma sakyāti dhanumhi kata,sikkhā vedhañña,nāmakā eke sakyā*, DA 3:905).

⁶⁵ On Nirgrantha Nāta,putta, see **Upāli S** (M 56), SD 27.1 (2.1).

⁶⁶ According to **Sāma,gāma S** (M 104), which is the Majjhima account of the same event, at this time, the Buddha is staying with the Shakyas at the village of Sāma,gāma (M 104.2/2:243 f), SD 62.4. See below §2. This episode is recounted in **Saṅgīti S** (D 33.1.6/3:209 f).

⁶⁷ *Tassa kālaṃ,kiriyāya bhinnā niḅbañña dve,dhika,jātā bhaṇḍana,jātā kalaha,jātā vivādā,pannā aññaṃ-aññaṃ mukha,sattīhi vitu,dantā viharanti*.

⁶⁸ *Sahitam me, asahitam te*, alt tr: “I'm being consistent; you're being inconsistent!”

⁶⁹ This whole passage [§1.2] is stock: **Pāsādika S** (D 29.1.2/3:177 @ SD 40a.6) = **Saṅgīti S** (D 33.1.6/3:210) = **Sāma,gāma S** (M 104.2/2:243 @ SD 62.4). More briefly at **Mahā Sakul'udāyī S** (M 77.6/2:3+4 @ SD 49.5); **Hālidakāni S 1** (S 22.3.24/3:12 @ SD 10.12) = **Viggāhika Kathā S** (S 56.9.2/5:419 = SD 65.13); Nm 1:173, 194, 200. For the Buddha's warning on this, see **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22.10a/1:133), SD 3.13 (with comy); cf **Kuṇḍaliya S** (S 46.4.3/5:73), SD 35.3.

⁷⁰ “Were disgusted with, displeased with, repelled by” (*nibbinna,rūpā viratta,rūpā paṭivāna,rūpā*), alt tr: “were revulsed at, feel alienated from, repelled by.”

⁷¹ *Ye'pi niḅbañhassa nāta,puttassa sāvakā gihāṇḍa odāta,vasanā, te'pi niḅbañhesu nāta,puttiyesu nibbinna,rūpā viratta,rūpā paṭivāna,rūpā*.

⁷² “Peace” (*upasama*), a broad term meaning self-restraint, inner stillness through meditation and mindfulness, and eradication of defilements, resulting in spiritual calm and clarity.

⁷³ *Yathā taṃ durakkhāte dhamma,vināye duppavedite aniyyānīke anupāsama,sāmvattanīke asammā,sambuddha-p,pavedite bhinna,thūpe appaṭisaraṇe*. *Durakkhāte* = *du* + *r* + *akkhāta* (“shown, pointed out”) with *r* infix (by way of sandhi). **Bhinna,thūpa** (lit, “breaking the stupa”) is figurative, alluding to forgetting the fundamentals, “undermining the very foundations” (*bhinda-p,paṭiṭṭhe*, “breaking the base,” DA 3:905).

Cunda Samaṇ'uddesa meets Ānanda

2.1 Now Cunda Samaṇ'uddesa,⁷⁴ having emerged from his rains-retreat at Pāvā visited the venerable Ānanda at Sāma,gāma. Having approached the venerable Ānanda, he saluted him and sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, Cunda Samaṇ'uddesa said this to the venerable Ānanda:

2.2 “Bhante, Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta has just died in Pāvā.

On account of his death, the Nirgranthas split into two factions, fallen into strife, disputes and quarrels, and dwelt cutting and piercing one another with the weapons of words, thus:

‘You do not know this Dharma,vinaya [the teaching and the discipline]! I know this Dharma,vinaya! What would you understand of this Dharma,vinaya?

You are practising wrong way! I’m practising the right way! Mine is beneficial [connected to the goal]; yours is not!

You have said later what should be said first, and said first what should be said later!

What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your viewpoint has been overthrown. You are defeated. Go and try to salvage your viewpoint; extricate yourself if you can!’

2.3 *Indeed, it seems that the followers of Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta were out to kill one another!*

Even Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta’s white-dressed laymen disciple, too, were disgusted with, displeased with, repelled by these followers of Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta,

as to how the Dharma,vinaya was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened, stupa-breaking [undermining the very foundation], without any refuge.”

2.4 When this was said, the venerable Ānanda said this to Cunda Samaṇ'uddesa:

“This, avuso Cunda, is indeed a matter for clarification for which we should see the Blessed One.⁷⁵

Come, avuso, let us approach the Blessed One. Having approached the Blessed One, we will ask him.”

“So be it, bhante,” replied Cunda Samaṇ'uddesa to the venerable Ānanda in assent.

They meet the Buddha

3.1 Then the venerable Ānanda and Cunda Samaṇ'uddesa approached the Blessed One. Having approached him, they saluted him and sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, the venerable Ānanda said this to the Blessed One:

“Bhante, Cunda Samaṇ'uddesa said this:

3.2 ‘Bhante, Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta has just died in Pāvā.

On account of his death, the Nirgranthas split into two factions, fallen into strife, disputes and quarrels, and dwelt cutting and piercing one another with the weapons of words, thus:

‘You do not know this Dharma,vinaya [the teaching and the discipline]! I know this Dharma,vinaya! What would you understand of this Dharma,vinaya?

You are practising wrong way! I’m practising the right way! Mine is beneficial [connected to the goal]; yours is not!

You have said later what should be said first, and said first what should be said later!

What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your viewpoint has been overthrown. You are defeated. Go and try to salvage your viewpoint; extricate yourself if you can!’

3.3 *Indeed, it seems that the followers of Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta were out to kill one another!*

Even Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta’s white-dressed laymen disciple, too, were disgusted with, displeased with, repelled by these followers of Nirgrantha Nāṭa,putta,

⁷⁴ Sāriputta’s youngest brother, and the foremost of monks who are forest-dwellers (3.1).

⁷⁵ *Atthi kho idaṃ āvuso cunda kathā,pābhataṃ bhagavantam dassanāya.*

as to how the Dharma,vinaya was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened, stupa-breaking [undermining the very foundation], without any refuge.”

THE BUDDHA’S TEACHING

§§3.4-40.3

The Dharma,vinaya rejected by the Buddha

3.4 ⁷⁶“Yes, indeed, Cunda, the Dharma,vinaya was badly taught, [119] poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened. [§1.5]

4.1 Here, Cunda, the teacher was *not* fully self-awakened,

4.2 and the Dharma was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not proclaimed by one fully self awakened,

4.3 and the disciple in that Dharma does not dwell practising that Dharma in accordance with *that* Dharma, nor does he go about with proper practice, nor does he fare [live] in accordance with that Dharma, but he has deviated from that Dharma.⁷⁷

4.4 This should be said to him:⁷⁸

‘This, avuso, is good fortune [a gain] for you; this is very good fortune for you!’⁷⁹

4.5 *Your teacher was not fully self-awakened, and the Dharma was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened.*

And, you, the disciple in that Dharma, do not dwell practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma. You do not go about with proper practice, nor do you fare [live] in accordance with that Dharma, but you deviate from that Dharma.

4.6 Thus, indeed, Cunda, the teacher here is blameworthy and the Dharma here, too, is blameworthy, but **the disciple** here is thus praiseworthy.⁸⁰

4.7 Indeed, Cunda, whoever were to speak thus to such a disciple:⁸¹

‘Come, venerable, practise whatever Dharma that has been taught and declared by your teacher!’⁸²

Whoever instigates, and whatever is instigated, and whomever is the instigated—let that be as it may,⁸³

4.8 *they all generate much demerit.*

4.9 Why is that?

Because, Cunda, that Dharma,vinaya was so badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened.⁸⁴

Turning to the right way

5.1 Now, here, Cunda, *the teacher was not fully self-awakened,*

5.2 *and the Dharma was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self awakened,*

⁷⁶ The closing of this open quote—ie the teaching by the Buddha—is found at §40.3.

⁷⁷ *Sāvako ca tasmim dhamme na dhammānudhamma-p,paṭipanno viharati na sāmīci-p,paṭipanno na anudhamma,cārī, vakkamma ca tamhā dhammā vattati.*

⁷⁸ *So evam assa vacanīyo.*

⁷⁹ *Tassa te, avuso, lābhā, tassa te suladdham, free tr: “You are fortunate, avuso, greatly fortunate.”*

⁸⁰ *Iti kho cunda sathā’pi tattha gārayho, dhammo’pi tattha gārayho, sāvako ca tattha evam pāsāṃso.*

⁸¹ *Yo kho, cunda, eva,rūpaṃ sāvakaṃ evaṃ vadeyya.*

⁸² *Et’āyasmā tathā paṭipajjatu, yathā te sathārā dhammo desito paññatto’ti.*

⁸³ *Yo ca samādapeti, yaṃ ca samādapeti, yo ca samādapito tathattāya paṭipajjati.*

⁸⁴ *Evam h’etaṃ cunda hoti durakkhāte dhamma,vinaye duppavedite aniyyānike anupasama,sāvattanike asam-mā,sambuddha-p,pavedite.*

5.3 and the disciple in that Dharma dwells practising that Dharma in accordance with that Dharma. He goes about with proper practice, fares [lives] in accordance with that Dharma, and does not deviate from that Dharma.

5.4 This should be said to him:

‘This, avuso, is a misfortune [non-gain] for you; this, avuso, is a bad misfortune for you!’⁸⁵

5.5 *Your teacher was not a fully [120] self-awakened one, and the Dharma was badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self-awakened.*

5.6 But, you, the disciple in that Dharma, dwel now practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma! Go about with proper practice, faring [living] in accordance with the Dharma, keeping to the Dharma!’⁸⁶

5.7 Thus, indeed, Cunda, the teacher here is blameworthy; the Dharma here, too, is blameworthy; but the disciple here is thus *praiseworthy*.⁸⁷

5.8 Whoever, Cunda, were to say this to such a disciple:

‘Surely, venerable, you will accomplish the right way if you were to keep to the right way.’⁸⁸

Whoever praises, and whatever the praise, and whomever the praised—let that be as it may, they all generate much demerit.’

5.9 Why is that?

Because, Cunda, that Dharma, vinaya was so badly taught, poorly proclaimed, not leading to liberation, not conducive to peace, not taught by one fully self-awakened.

The Dharma, vinaya taught by the Buddha

6.1 But here, Cunda, there is **the fully self-awakened Buddha**,

6.2 and **the Dharma** is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self-awakened,

6.3 *but the disciple* in that Dharma does *not* dwell practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma. He does *not* go about with proper practice, *not* faring [living] in accordance with the Dharma, but *deviates* from the Dharma.

6.4 This should be said to him:

‘This, avuso, is a misfortune [non-gain] for you; this, avuso, is a bad misfortune for you!’

6.5 Your teacher is the fully self-awakened Buddha,

6.6 and the Dharma is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self-awakened,

6.7 *but* you in this Dharma do *not* dwell practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma. You do *not* go about with proper practice, do *not* fare [live] in accordance with the Dharma, but *deviate* from the Dharma.’

6.8 Thus, indeed, Cunda, the teacher here is praiseworthy; the Dharma here, too, is praiseworthy; but the disciple here is thus *blameworthy*.

6.9 Whoever, Cunda, were to say this to such a disciple:

‘Come, venerable, practise whatever Dharma that has been taught and declared by your teacher!’⁸⁹

*Whoever instigates, and whatever is instigated, and whomever is the instigated—let that be as it may,*⁹⁰

they all generate much merit.’

⁸⁵ *Tassa te āvuso alābhā, tassa te dulladdham.*

⁸⁶ *Tvañ ca tasmim dhamme dhammānudhamma-p,paṭipanno viharasi sāmīci-p,paṭipanno anudhamma,cārī, sam-ādāya taṃ dhammaṃ vattasīti.*

⁸⁷ *Iti kho cunda satthā’pi tattha gārayho, dhammo’pi tattha gārayho, sāvako ca tattha evaṃ pāsamo.*

⁸⁸ *Addhāyasmā ñāya-p,paṭipanno ñāyam ārādhessatīti.*

⁸⁹ *Et’āyasmā tathā paṭipajjatu, yathā te satthārā dhammo desito paññatto’ti.*

⁹⁰ *Yo ca samādapeti, yañ ca samādapeti, yo ca samādapito tathattāya paṭipajjati: as at §4.7*

6.10 Why is that?

Because, Cunda, that Dharma, vinaya is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self-awakened. [121]

7.1 Now, here, Cunda, there is **the fully self-awakened Buddha**,

7.2 and **the Dharma** is the well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self-awakened,

7.3 and **the disciple** in that Dharma dwells practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma. He goes about with proper practice, faring [living] in accordance with the Dharma, and does not deviate from the Dharma.

7.4 This should be said to him:

‘This, avuso, is good fortune [a gain] for you; this is very good fortune for you!

7.5 Your teacher is the fully self-awakened Buddha,

7.6 and the Dharma is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self-awakened,

7.7 and you, in this Dharma, dwell practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma. You go about with proper practice, faring [living] in accordance with the Dharma, and do not deviate from the Dharma.

7.8 Thus, indeed, Cunda, the teacher here is praiseworthy; the Dharma here, too, is praiseworthy; and the disciple here, too, is thus praiseworthy.

7.9 Indeed, Cunda, this should be said to him:

‘Surely, venerable, you will accomplish the right way in keeping with the right way.

Whoever praises, and whatever the praise, and whomever the praised—let that be as it may.

They all generate much merit.’

7.10 Why is that?

Because, Cunda, Dharma, vinaya was well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self-awakened.

The disciple’s regret in a teacher

8.1 Now, here, Cunda, **a teacher** arises in the world, an arhat, a fully self-awakened Buddha;

8.2 and **the Dharma** is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self-awakened;

8.3 *but* whose **disciples** have *not* been shown the meaning of the true Dharma,⁹¹

and to whom the holy life, complete and perfect, has *not* been presented or made clear,⁹²

with all the steps fully laid out, shown to be well grounded [shown with its wonders],⁹³ [122] well proclaimed amongst devas and humans⁹⁴—before their teacher’s passing away.⁹⁵

⁹¹ *Aviññāpit’atthā c’assa honti sāvaka saddhamme.*

⁹² *Na ca tesam kevalam paripūram brahma, cariyam āvikatam hoti uttāni, katam.*

⁹³ “Shown to be well grounded,” *sa-p, pāṭihīra, katam*, alt tr, “shown with its wonders,” often occurs here and elsewhere: **Pāsādika S** (M 29/3:122×3, 123, 125 etc = SD 40a.6) & **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9.34/1:198×4, 199×2 = SD 7.14). Comy on both gloss it as *niyyānikam*, “leading to liberation” (DA 2:391, 910). The cpd is resolved as *sa*, “with” + *pāṭihīra*, “a wonder, marvel” (both as adj or adj) + *kata* (pp of *karoti*, “to do”), “what is done, performed, accomplished” (CPD sv). Opp: *appāṭihīra, kata*, “made unreliable” (D 1:193 passim = 239, 17 = 244, 4 = M 2:33, 19 = 41, 2-4); meaning unhelpful in bringing about liberation (*aniyyānika*, DA 2:379; MA 3:273; cf DA 2:422, 429, 3:906; MA 3:93, 444 (*micchā, paṭipadā*, “the wrong path”), 4:34, 171; SA 1:23, 105; AA 2:216, 4:41). *Pāṭihīra* is a contracted form of *pāṭihāriya*, “marvel, miracle” (PED sv), esp as *appāṭihīra, kathā*, “foolish talk” (D 1:193, 239 vl; Kvu 361); opp *sa-p, pāṭihīra, kathā* (id). *Sa-p, pāṭihāriya* (with ref to Dhamma) means “wonderful, extraordinary” as opp to *ap-pāṭihāriya*, “plain, ordinary, foolish; not convincing, without arguments” (M 2:9, 27-33; A 1:276, 18-21); PED: *pāṭihāriya*. See also §12.196 n.

8.4 Indeed, Cunda, the death of such a teacher leaves his disciples with regrets [afflictions].⁹⁶

8.5 Why is this? Because it occurs to them:

‘The teacher, an arhat, fully self-awakened Buddha, has arisen in the world;
and the Dharma is well taught, well proclaimed,

8.6 *but* the meaning [purpose] of the true Dharma has not been shown to us,
and the holy life, complete and perfect, has not been presented or made clear to us,
with all the steps fully laid out, well grounded [with its wonders], well proclaimed amongst devas and humans⁹⁷—before our teacher’s passing away.

8.7 The death of such a teacher, Cunda, leaves his disciples with regrets [afflictions].

The disciple’s lack of regret in a teacher

9.1 Now, here, Cunda, **a teacher** arises in the world, an arhat, a fully self-awakened Buddha;

9.2 and **the Dharma** is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, taught by one fully self-awakened;

9.3 *and* whose **disciples** *have* been shown the meaning [purpose] of the true Dharma,
and to whom the holy life, complete and perfect, has been presented or made clear,
with all the steps fully laid out, well grounded [with its wonders], well proclaimed amongst devas and humans⁹⁸—before their teacher’s passing away.⁹⁹

9.4 Indeed, Cunda, the death of such a teacher leaves his disciples with no regrets [no afflictions].

9.5 Why is this? Because it occurs to them:

‘The teacher, an arhat, fully self-awakened Buddha, has arisen in the world;
and the Dharma is well taught, well proclaimed,

9.6 *and* the meaning [purpose] of the true Dharma *has* been shown to us,
and the holy life, complete and perfect, *has* been presented or made clear to us,
with all the steps fully laid out, well grounded, well proclaimed [**123**] amongst devas and humans—
before our teacher’s passing away.¹⁰⁰

9.7 The death of such a teacher, Cunda, leaves his disciples with no regrets [no afflictions].

⁹⁴ “Well-proclaimed amongst and humans,” *yāva deva,manussehi su-p,pakāsitaṃ* (Be Ce Se), found in various contexts: **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16.3.8d/2:106 = 114) = **Cetiya S** (S 51.10/5:262) = **Bhūmi,cāla S** (A 8.70.8/-4:311,21) = **Āyu,saṅkhār’ossajjana S** (U 6.1/64); **Pāsādika S** (D 3:122×2, 123, 124×2, 125×2, 126); **Mahā Supina S** (A 5.8/3:242.6 ~ *su-p,pakāsito*). The phrase *yāva deva,manussehi* (“amongst devas and humans”) appears 8 times here: §§8.3, 8.6, 9.3, 9.6, 12.196, 12.211, 13.14, 14.3. Ee has *yā-vaḍ eva manussehi* (wr) *su-p,pakāsitaṃ* throughout, which has led D:RD to render this phrase as “...well proclaimed among men,” and which is foll by D:W. BPA (1984:411) apparently folls Be and is correct. The correct reading is confirmed by the same passage in **Āyu,-saṅkhār’ossajjana S** (U 6.1/64,16). *Yāva deva,manussehi* (“amongst devas and humans”) appear 8 times here: §§8.3, 8.6, 9.3, 9.6, 12.196, 12.211, 13.14, 14.3. The word *manussehi*, despite being instrumental is expl by Comy as being *locative*, ie, the Dharma has been proclaimed by the Tathagata throughout the region inhabited by gods and human, ie, the whole universe (DA 3:910; UA 400; cf SA 2:223; AA 2:36). Cf loc pl in *-ehi* as an Eastern form (as in *virūpakkhehi*, J 2:145,19* = Skt *virūpākṣeṣu*) (Geiger, *A Pali Grammar*, 2000:§80.3). For details word explanations, see UA 327 :: UA:M 858. See also ItA:M 2:273 n6 & Wijesekera 1993:12 (§9).

⁹⁵ *Sabba,saṅgāha,pada,kataṃ sappāṭihīra,kataṃ yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitaṃ—atha nesaṃ satthuno antara,dhānaṃ hoti*. Cf §14.4 in connection with this statement.

⁹⁶ *Eva,rūpo kho cunda satthā sāvakānaṃ kālaṃ,kato anutappo hoti*.

⁹⁷ On *yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitaṃ*, see §8.3 ad loc n.

⁹⁸ On *yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitaṃ*, see §8.3 ad loc n.

⁹⁹ *Sabba,saṅgāha,pada,kataṃ sappāṭihīra,kataṃ yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitaṃ—atha nesaṃ satthuno antara,dhānaṃ hoti*. Cf §8.3 & nn.

¹⁰⁰ *Sabba,saṅgāha,pada,kataṃ sa-p,pāṭihīra,kataṃ yāva deva,manussehi su-p,pakāsitaṃ*. On *yāva deva,manussehi* here, see §12.196 n.

Non-accomplishing the holy life

10.1 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished by these factors:

but there is *no* teacher who is an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,¹⁰¹

on account of this factor, the holy life is unaccomplished.

10.2 However, Cunda, to the extent that the holy life is accomplished by this factor—

that there *is* a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age—

on account of this factor, the holy life is thus accomplished.¹⁰² [§14.4]

11.1 Also, Cunda, if the holy life is accomplished by these factors:

that there *is* a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

11.2 but there were *no* elder monk disciples, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke¹⁰³—

11.3 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [with its wonders],¹⁰⁴

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [with its wonders]¹⁰⁵—

on account of these factors, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.¹⁰⁶

Accomplishment of the holy life

(1) Elder monk disciples

12.1¹⁰⁷ Now, Cunda, on account of these two factors, the holy life is accomplished:¹⁰⁸

12.2 that there *is* a **teacher**, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.3 and that there *are* **elder monk disciples** (*thera bhikkhu sāvaka*) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.4 capable of speaking the true Dharma, capable of teaching of the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded—

on account of this factor, the holy life is thus accomplished.

¹⁰¹ *No ca kho satthā hoti therō ratt’aññū cira, pabbajito addha, gato vayo, anuppatto.*

¹⁰² *Evam taṃ brahma, cariyāṃ paripūraṃ hoti ten’āṅgena.*

¹⁰³ *No ca khv-assa therā bhikkhū sāvakā honti viyattā vinītā visāradā patta, yoga-k, khemā.* “Who have attained security from the yoke,” *patta, yoga-k, khemā* (pl), those who are safe from the 4 yokes (*yoga*) (= *āsava*, “mental influxes”) [§22.1 n], ie the arhats (DA 3:910).

¹⁰⁴ “Along with its wonders,” *sa-p, pāṭihāriyāṃ*: see §8.3 n.

¹⁰⁵ *Alaṃ samakkhātum saddhammassa, alaṃ uppannaṃ parap-p, pavādaṃ saha, dhammehi suniggahitaṃ nigga-hetvā sappāṭihāriyāṃ dhammaṃ desetuṃ.*

¹⁰⁶ *Evam taṃ brahma, cariyāṃ aparipūraṃ hoti ten’āṅgena.*

¹⁰⁷ For the whole of §12, I follow Ce which gives the full readings instead of the *peyyālā*. The extended passages here follow a concatenating (cumulative) pattern. See Intro (1) on “How to study the Pāsādika Sutta.”

¹⁰⁸ Ce *Yato ca kho cunda etehi dvehi pi āṅgehi samannāgataṃ brahma, cariyāṃ hoti*. Only Ce has *dvehi* through-out.

(2) Middling monk disciples

12.5 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.6 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.7 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.8 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—*

12.9 *but* there were **no middling monk disciples** (*majjhima bhikkhu sāvaka*) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.10 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.11 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.12 *and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.13 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],*

12.14 *and* there are **middling monk disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.15 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(3) Novice monk disciples

12.16 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.17 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.18 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.19 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.20 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.21 *but*, there were **no novice monk disciples** (*nava bhikkhu sāvaka*) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

thus, on account of this factor, the holy life is unaccomplished.

12.22 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished these two factors:¹⁰⁹

12.23 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.24 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.25 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],*

12.26 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.27 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.28 and there are **novice monk disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.29 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—*

on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(4) Elder nun disciples

12.30 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.31 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.32 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.33 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.34 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.35 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.36 but there were no **elder nun disciples** (*therā bhikkhūṇī sāvīkā*) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

¹⁰⁹ Ce Yato ca kho cunda etehi dvehi pi añgehi samannāgataṃ brahma, cariyaṃ hoti.

on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.37 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.38 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.39 *and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.40 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],*

12.41 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.42 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.43 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.44 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.45 and there are **elder nun disciples** (*therā bhikkhunī sāvikā*) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(5) Middling nun disciples

12.46 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.47 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.48 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.49 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.50 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.51 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.52 *and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.53 but there were no **middling nun disciples** (*majhimā bhikkhuṇī sāvikā*) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.54 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.55 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.56 *and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.57 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],*

12.58 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.69 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.60 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.61 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.62 *and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.63 and there are **middling nun disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(6) Novice nun disciples

12.64 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.65 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.66 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.67 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.68 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.69 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.70 and there are elder nun disciples (*therā bhikkhuṇī sāvikā*) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.71 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.72 but there were no **novice nun disciples** (*navā bhikkhuṇī sāvikā*) who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.73 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.74 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.75 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.76 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],

12.77 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.78 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.79 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.80 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.81 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.82 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.83 and there are **novice nun disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
 on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(7) Celibate laymen disciples

12.84 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.85 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.86 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.87 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.88 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.89 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.90 *and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.91 *and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.92 *and there were novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.93 but there were no **white-dressed celibate laymen disciples**¹¹⁰ who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
 on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

¹¹⁰ *Upāsaka sāvaka gihī odāta, vasanā brahma, cāri*, lit “a layman disciple, householder dressed in white, living the holy life (ie observing celibacy).”

12.94 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.95 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.96 *and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.97 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],*

12.98 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.99 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.100 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.101 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.102 *and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.103 *and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.104 *and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.105 and there are **white-dressed celibate laymen disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(8) Celibate laywomen disciples

12.106 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.107 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.108 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.109 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.110 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.111 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.112 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.113 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.114 and there are no novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.115 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.116 but there were no **white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples**¹¹¹ who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—
on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.117 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.118 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.119 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.120 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],

12.121 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

¹¹¹ *Upāsika sāvīkā gihī odāta, vasanā brahma, cārinī*, lit “a laywoman disciple, householder dressed in white, living the holy life (ie observing celibacy).”

12.122 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.123 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.124 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.125 *and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.126 *and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.127 *and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.128 *and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.129 *and there are **white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(9) Householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures

12.130 *If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:*

12.131 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.132 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.133 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.134 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.135 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.136 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.137 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.138 and there are no novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.139 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.140 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,
capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.141 but there were no **white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyer of sense-pleasures,**¹¹² who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.142 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.143 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.144 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.145 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],

12.146 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

¹¹² *Upāsaka sāvaka gihī odāta, vasana kāma, bhogī*, lit “a layman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”

12.147 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.148 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.149 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.150 *and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.151 *and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.152 *and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.153 *and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.154 *and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.155 *but there are **white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyer of sense-pleasures,** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(10) Householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures

12.156 *If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:*

12.157 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.158 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.159 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.160 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.161 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.162 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.163 and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.164 and there are no novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.165 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.166 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.167 and there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,¹¹³ who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma, along with its wonder—

12.168 but there were no **white-dressed householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures**,¹¹⁴ who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

¹¹³ *Upāsaka sāvaka gihī odāta, vasana kāma, bhogī*, lit “a layman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”

¹¹⁴ *Upāsikā sāvikā gihī odāta, vasanā kāma, bhoginī*, lit “a laywoman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”

on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

12.169 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.170 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.171 *and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.172 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],*

12.173 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.174 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.175 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.176 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.177 *and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.178 *and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.179 *and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.180 *and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.181 *and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.182 *and there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.183 but there are **white-dressed householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures**, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

on account of these factors, the holy life is thus accomplished.

(11) Wealth and plenty

12.184 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these two factors:

12.185 *that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,*

12.186 *and that there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

12.187 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

12.188 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.189 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.190 *and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.191 *and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.192 *and there are no novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.193 *and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.194 *and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.195 and there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,¹¹⁵ who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.196 and there are white-dressed householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,¹¹⁶ who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.197 but if there were **no holy life**—merely an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, well proclaimed amongst devas and humans¹¹⁷—

on account of this factor, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

(12) The peaks of gain and fame

12.198 Insofar, Cunda, as the holy life is accomplished in these two factors:

12.199 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

12.200 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.201 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders],

12.202 and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.203 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.204 and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

12.205 capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

¹¹⁵ *Upāsaka sāvaka gihī odāta, vasana kāma, bhogī*, lit “a layman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”

¹¹⁶ *Upāsikā sāvikā gihī odāta, vasana kāma, bhoginī*, lit “a laywoman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”

¹¹⁷ *No ca khv-assa brahma, cariyam hoti iddhañ ce ’va phītañ ca vitthāritam bāhu, jaññam puthu, bhūtam yāva deva, manussehi suppakāsitañ*: **Pāsāsika S** (D 29.12.196 etc @ 3:124-126×4), SD 40a.6; here *no* can be read as “our” (1 gen pl of *aham*, “I”) or as an affirmative indecl (Sn 457, 875, 1077; J 5:343 = *nu*, 435); it can also be taken as a negating word, “no, not” as a wordplay. My tr is contextual. The famous phrase appears in variant forms elsewhere, but similar in sense: *yāva me idam brahma, cariyam na iddham ce ’va bhavissati phītañ ca vitthārikam bāhu, jaññam puthu, bhūtam yāva deva, manussehi suppakāsitañ*: **Mahā, parinibbāna S** (D 16/2:106, 113, 114×2), **Cetiya S** (S 51.10/5:262), **Bhūmi, cāla S** (A 8.70.8/4:311, 18), **Āyu, saṅkhār’ossajjana S** (U 6.1/64); *Tayidañ brahma, cariyam...suppakāsitañ*: **Jana, vasabha S** (D 18.29/2:219, 10); **Nagara S** (S 12.65.33/2:107, 2), **Cetiya S** (S 51.10.14/5:-262, 9). On *yāva deva, manussehi suppakāsitañ*, see §8.3 ad loc n.

12.206 and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.207 and there are [124] middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.208 and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.209 and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.210 and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.211 and there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

12.212 and if the holy life is an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, well proclaimed amongst devas and humans¹¹⁸—

but there is **no attaining of the peak of gain, the peak of fame**,¹¹⁹ on account of these factors, the holy life is thus unaccomplished.

(13) Attaining the peaks of gain and fame

13.1 If, Cunda, the holy life is accomplished with these factors:¹²⁰

13.2 that there is a teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age,

13.3 and there are elder monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,

¹¹⁸ *Brahma, cariyam c'assa hoti iddhañ ce'va phītañ ca vitthāritam bāhu, jaññaṃ puthu, bhūtaṃ yāva deva, manussehi suppakāsitaṃ. On yāva deva, manussehi suppakāsitaṃ, see §89.3 ad loc n.*

¹¹⁹ *No ca kho lābh'agga, yas'agga-p, pattam.* Comy glosses *lābh'agga, yas'agga* in a spiritual sense to refer to the destruction of the mental influxes (*āsava*) [§22.1 n], ie, the attainment of arhathood. More specifically, *lābh'agga* refers to the rules the Buddha introduced concerning food, while *yas'agga* refers to the rule against taking intoxicating drinks (DA 3:156, cf 1:445).

¹²⁰ *Etehi ce pi cunda aṅgehi samannāgataṃ brahma, cariyam hoti.*

13.4 *capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

13.5 *and there are middling monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

13.6 *and there are novice monk disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

13.7 *and there are elder nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

13.8 *and there are middling nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

13.9 *and there are novice nun disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

13.10 *and there are white-dressed celibate laymen disciples [125] who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

13.11 *and there are white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];*

13.12 *and there are white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,¹²¹ who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders];

13.13 *and there were to be no white-dressed householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures,¹²² who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke,*

¹²¹ *Upāsaka sāvaka gihī odāta, vasana kāma, bhogī*, lit “a layman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”

capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders]—

13.14 the holy life is an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, well proclaimed amongst devas and humans¹²³—

and there is the attaining of the peak of gain, the peak of fame, [§12.211]
on account of this factor, the holy life is thus accomplished.

The accomplishment of the Buddha Dharma

14.1 Now, Cunda, **I am the teacher** today, having arisen in the world as the arhat, the fully self-awakened one,¹²⁴ [§6.1]

14.2 and **the Dharma** is well taught, well proclaimed, leading to liberation, conducive to peace, proclaimed by one fully self-awakened,¹²⁵

14.3 *and my disciples* have been shown the meaning [purpose] of the true Dharma,¹²⁶ and to whom the holy life, complete and perfect, *has* been presented or made clear, with all the steps fully laid out, well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders] [presented with wonders],¹²⁷ well proclaimed amongst devas and humans¹²⁸—

14.4 But, Cunda, I am now the teacher, an elder of long standing, long gone forth, far gone down the road of life, well matured in age.¹²⁹ [§10.1]

15.1 (1) There *are*, indeed, today, Cunda, my **elder monk disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.2 (2) There *are*, indeed, today, Cunda, my **middling monk disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.3 (3) There *are*, indeed, today, Cunda, my **novice monk disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.4 (4) There *are*, indeed, today, Cunda, my **elder nun disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

¹²² *Upāsikā sāvīkā gihī odāta,vasanā kāma,bhoginī*, lit “a laywoman disciple, householder enjoying sense-pleasures (ie, keeping to the 5 precepts).”

¹²³ On *yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitaṃ*, see §8.3 ad loc n.

¹²⁴ *Kho pana cunda etarahi satthā loke uppanno araham sammā.sambuddho.*

¹²⁵ *Dhammo ca svākkhāto suppedito niyyāniko upasama,samvattaniko sammā,sambuddha-p.pavedito.*

¹²⁶ This line and the 2 foll: *Viññāpit’atthā ca me sāvakā saddhamme, | kevalāñ ca tesam paripūram brahma,cariyam āvikatam uttānī,katam | sabba,saṅgāha,pada,katam sappāñhira,katam yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitaṃ.*

¹²⁷ “Well grounded,” *sa-p,pāñhira,katam*: see §8.3 n.

¹²⁸ On *yāva deva,manussehi suppakāsitaṃ*, see §8.3 ad loc n.

¹²⁹ *Aham kho pana, cunda, etarahi satthā therō rattaññū cira,pabbajito addha,gato vayo,anuppatto.*

15.5 (5) There *are*, indeed, today, Cunda, my **middling nun disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.6 (6) There *are*, indeed, today, Cunda, my **novice nun disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.7 (7) There *are*, indeed, today, Cunda, my **white-dressed celibate laymen disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.8 (8) There *are*, indeed, today, Cunda, my **white-dressed celibate laywomen disciples** who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.9 (9) There *are*, indeed, today, Cunda, my **white-dressed householder laymen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures**, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.10 (10) There *are*, indeed, [126] today, Cunda, my **white-dressed householder laywomen disciples, enjoyers of sense-pleasures**, who are experienced, of good judgement, self-possessed [fearless], who have attained to the security from the yoke, capable of speaking the true Dharma—capable of reasonably addressing disputes with others that have arisen so that they are well addressed—for the sake of teaching the Dharma that is well grounded [the Dharma with its wonders].

15.11 (11) Indeed, Cunda, today [now] this holy life of mine is truly an extensive success, wealthy, popular, widespread, only so far as it is well proclaimed amongst humans.¹³⁰

Nothing to minus, nothing to add

16.1 Cunda, as regards teachers that have arisen in the world today, Cunda, I do not see a single teacher who has attained to the peak of gain, the peak of fame, as I have.¹³¹

16.2 Also, Cunda, as regards any sangha or group that has arisen in the world, I do not see a single sangha that has attained to the peak of gain, the peak of fame, Cunda, compared to this bhikkhu-sangha [the community of monks].¹³²

¹³⁰ *Etarahi kho pana me cunda brahma,cariyam iddham c'eva phītañ ca vitthāritam bāhu,jaññam puthu,bhūtam yāvad-eva manussehi suppakāsitam. See Intro (1.1.2).*

¹³¹ *Yāvatā kho cunda etarahi satthāro loke uppannā, nāham cunda aññam eka,satthāram pi samanussami evam lābh'agga,yas'agga-p,pattam yatha-r-ivāham.*

¹³² *Yāvatā kho pana cunda etarahi saṅgho vā gaṇo vā loke uppanno, nāham cunda aññam eka,saṅgham pī samanupassāmi evam lābh'agga,yas'agga-p,pattam yatha-r-ivāyam cunda bhikhu,saṅgho.*

16.3 Anyone speaking rightly of this, Cunda, would say that the holy life—the well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed—is accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more.¹³³

16.4 That one speaking rightly would be speaking of *this* very holy life—the well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed—is accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more.

Uddaka Rāma,putta's riddle

16.5 Uddaka Rāma,putta,¹³⁴ Cunda, made this remark: 'Looking, one sees not' (*passaṃ na passatīti*). Seeing what, does one not see?

16.6 Of a well sharpened razor, one sees its blade [its surface], but not its edge.¹³⁵

16.7 This is said: 'Looking, one sees not,'

16.8 But, Cunda, this saying that was spoken by Uddaka Rāma,putta is low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal¹³⁶—merely in connection with a razor.¹³⁷

Nothing to minus, nothing to add

16.9 So Cunda, if one, speaking rightly, were to speak about this, that is to say, 'Looking, one sees not,'

how, Cunda, how would one, speaking rightly, speak of [127] 'Looking, one sees not.'¹³⁸

16.10 This is just how that one speaking rightly, should speak of 'Looking, one sees not':¹³⁹

16.11 Now, seeing what, one sees not?¹⁴⁰

16.12 It is this very holy life—the well spoken, fully accomplished, that has been well proclaimed, accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more—this is what one sees.

16.13 There is nothing here that needs to be removed, so that it would be more pure: this is what one sees not.¹⁴¹

16.14 There is nothing here that needs to be added, so that it would be more pure: this is what one sees not.¹⁴²

This is said to be 'Looking, one sees not.'

16.15 If anyone, Cunda, speaking rightly, were to speak of *a well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed, accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more,* speaking rightly, he would speak of *this very well spoken, fully accomplished holy life that has been well proclaimed, accomplished in every way, with nothing less, with nothing more.*

¹³³ *Yaṃ kho taṃ cunda sammā vadamāno vadeyya sabb 'ākāra,paripūraṃ anūnaṃ anadhikaṃ svākkhātaṃ kevala,paripūraṃ brahma,cariyaṃ suppakāsitaṃ.* "With nothing less, nothing more," *anūnaṃ anadhikaṃ*, meaning with nothing missing nor anything superfluous.

¹³⁴ On Uddaka Rāma,putta, see **Uddaka S** (S 35.103/4:83 f), SD 94.2. He was the last of the 2 teachers that the Bodhisattva has before he turns to self-mortification: see **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26.15/1:165) & SD 1.11 (4.2).

¹³⁵ *Khurassa sādhu nisitassa talam-assa passati, dhāraṇ ca khv-assa na passati.*

¹³⁶ "Low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal" (*hīna gamma pothujjanika anariya anatta,saṃhita*). Cf fuller formula at §23.3 etc below. For details, see **The body in Buddhism** = SD 29.6a (1.2.2 + 4.1.1).

¹³⁷ *Yaṃ kho paṇ'etaṃ cunda udakena rāma,puttena bhāsitaṃ hīnaṃ gammaṃ pothujjanikaṃ anariyaṃ anatta,-saṃhitaṃ khuram eva sandhāya.* The underscored phrase is stock, signifying an extreme to be avoided: see **Dhamma,cakka Pavattana S** (S 56.11.3/5:420), SD 1.1.

¹³⁸ *Ce Yaṃ ce taṃ cunda sammā vadamāno vadeyya passaṃ na passatīti,*

¹³⁹ *Ce Idam ev'etaṃ sammā vadamāno vadeyya 'passaṃ na passatīti.*

¹⁴⁰ *Kiṃ ca passaṃ na passatīti?*

¹⁴¹ *Idam ettha apakaḍḍheyya, evaṃ taṃ parisuddha,taraṃ assāti, iti h'etaṃ na passati,* lit "If here.this were to be removed, so that it would be more pure, this indeed one does not see."

¹⁴² *Idam ettha upakaḍḍheyya, evaṃ taṃ parisuddha,taraṃ assāti, iti h'etaṃ na passati,* lit "If here.this were to be added, so that it would be more pure, this indeed one does not see."

Teachings to be recited (memorized)

17.1 Therefore, Cunda, I have here shown you these teachings that I have directly understood.¹⁴³

17.2 So here, all having gathered and assembled, you should not quarrel, but rehearse [recite] meaning for meaning, word for word,¹⁴⁴

17.3 so that this holy life would endure, stand long,¹⁴⁵
and this is for the good of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of compassion for the world, for the benefit and happiness of devas and humans.

17.4 And what, Cunda, are these teachings, directly understood by me, that I have shown you,

17.5 that, all having gathered and assembled, should not quarrel, but rehearse [recite] meaning for meaning, word for word,¹⁴⁶

17.6 so that this holy life would endure, stand long,

17.7 and this is for the good of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of compassion for the world, for the benefit and happiness of devas and humans?

17.8 THE 7 SETS.¹⁴⁷ They are as follows:

the four focusses of mindfulness,	<i>cattāro satipaṭṭhānā,</i>
the four right efforts,	<i>cattāro samma-p, padhānā,</i>
the four paths of spiritual power,	<i>cattāro iddhi, pādā,</i>
the five spiritual faculties,	<i>pañc 'indriyāni,</i>
the five spiritual powers,	<i>pañca balāni,</i>
the seven [128] awakening-factors,	<i>satta bojjaṅgā,</i>
the noble eightfold path.	<i>ariyo aṭṭh 'aṅgiko maggo.</i>

17.9 *These, Cunda, are the teachings directly understood by me that I have shown you, wherein all having gathered and assembled, should not quarrel, but rehearse [recite] meaning for meaning, word for word, so that this holy life would endure, stand long, and this is for the good of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of compassion for the world, for the benefit and happiness of devas and humans.*

Resolving differences of opinions

18.1(1) DISAGREEING ON BOTH MEANING AND WORDING. And, Cunda, when you are gathered, when you are assembled, free from quarrelling [free from disputing], you should train yourselves thus when a certain fellow brahmachari [fellow in the holy life] speaks the Dharma before the sangha.¹⁴⁸

18.2 Now, if he were to speak, thus:

'You, venerable, have grasped this meaning wrongly and proposed the wording'¹⁴⁹ wrongly, too!¹⁵⁰

¹⁴³ *Tasmā, t-īha cunda ye vo mayā dhammā abhiññā desitā.* Here *abhiññā* is a pp (*abhiññā*, DA 33.22) of *abhiññāti*, "to fully know (through experience)," acting as an adj, qualifying *dhammā*, and means "having known (as a direct experience of true reality)."

¹⁴⁴ *Tattha sabbe h 'eva saṅgama samāgama atthena attham vyañjanena vyañjanam saṅgāyitabbam na vivadi-tabbam.*

¹⁴⁵ *Yatha-y-idaṃ brahma, cariyam addhaniyam assa cira-t, ṭhitikam.*

¹⁴⁶ *Yattha sabbe h 'eva saṅgama samāgama atthena attham vyañjanena vyañjanam saṅgāyitabbam na vivadi-tabbam.*

¹⁴⁷ The 7 sets—4 focusses of mindfulness, 4 right efforts, 4 paths to spiritual power, 5 spiritual faculties, 5 spiritual powers, 7 awakening-factors, the noble eightfold path—consisting of the 37 limbs of awakening (*bodhi, pakkhiya dhamma*): see Intro (3).

¹⁴⁸ *Tesaṃ ca vo cunda samaggānam sammodamānānam avivadamānānam sikkhitabbam [Ce Ee Se; Be sikkhatam] aññataro sa, brahma, cārī saṅhe dhammam bhāseyya.*

¹⁴⁹ "Proposed the wording," *vyañjanāni... ropeti*, lit "propagated the phrase."

¹⁵⁰ *Ayam kho āyasmā atthañ c 'eva micchā gaṇhāti, vyañjanāni ca micchā ropetīti.*

18.3 then, you should neither approve nor disapprove of him [of his words].

Neither approving nor disapproving, his word and expression, you should say this to him:¹⁵¹

18.4 ‘Now, avuso, of this meaning, which of these wordings or those are the more suitable;¹⁵² of these wordings, which meaning, this or that one, is the more suitable?’¹⁵³

18.5 If he were to say:

‘Avuso, for this meaning, only these wordings are truly more suitable, and only these; for these wordings, only this meaning is truly more suitable, and only this,’

18.6 then, neither dismissing nor disparaging him at all, without dismissing him, without disparaging him, you should, with careful attention, make him comprehend *only those meanings and those wordings*.¹⁵⁴

19.1 (2) DISAGREEING ON THE MEANING. Again, Cunda, when you are gathered, when you are assembled, free from quarrelling [free from disputing], you should train thus if [when] a certain fellow brahmachari [fellow in the holy life] were to speak Dharma before the sangha.

19.2 Now, suppose he were to speak, thus:

‘You, venerable, have grasped this meaning *wrongly* but proposed the wording *rightly*!’ [129]

19.3 Then, you should neither approve nor disapprove of him [his word].

Neither approving nor disapproving, you should say this to him:

19.4 ‘Now, avuso, of these wordings, which meaning, this or that, is the more suitable?’

19.5 If he were to say:

‘Avuso, for these wordings, only this meaning is truly more suitable, and only this,’

19.6 then, neither dismissing nor disparaging him, without dismissing him, without disparaging him, you should, with careful attention, make him comprehend *only those meanings*.

20.1 (3) DISAGREEING ON THE WORDING. Again, Cunda, when you are gathered, when you are assembled, free from quarrelling [free from disputing], you should train thus if [when] a certain fellow brahmachari [fellow in the holy life] were to speak Dharma before the sangha.

20.2 Now, if he were to speak, thus:

‘You, venerable, have grasped this meaning *rightly* but proposed the wording *wrongly*!’

20.3 Then, you should neither approve nor disapprove of him [his word].

Neither approving nor disapproving, you should say this to him:

20.4 ‘Now, avuso, as for this meaning, which of these wordings is the more suitable?’¹⁵⁵

20.5 If he were to say:

‘Avuso, for this meaning, only these wordings are truly more suitable, and only these,’

20.6 then, neither dismissing nor disparaging him, without dismissing him, without disparaging him, you should, with careful attention, make him comprehend *only those wordings*.

21.1 (4) FULL AGREEMENT. Again, Cunda, when you are gathered, when you are assembled, free from quarrelling [free from disputing], you should train thus if [when] a certain fellow brahmachari [fellow in the holy life] were to speak Dharma before the sangha.

21.2 Now, if he were to speak, thus:

¹⁵¹ *Tassa n’eva abhinanditabbam na paṭikkositabbam, anabhinanditvā appaṭikkositvā so evam assa vacanīyo*: also at §§19.3+20.2+21.2. For similar instructions, see **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16.4.7-11/2:124+125, on the 4 great references, *catu mahā’padesa*) & SD 9 (11); **Cha-b,bisodhana S** (M 112/3:29), SD 59.7; **Mahā’padesa S** (A 4.180/-2:168×4, 169×3, 170×2), SD 3.1 (2.2) (= D 16.4.7/2:123-126).

¹⁵² *Imassa nu kho āvuso atthassa imāni vā vyañjanāni etāni vā vyañjanāni katamāni opāyika,tarāni*.

¹⁵³ *Imesam vā vyañjanānam ayam vā attho eso vā attho, katamo opāyika,taro*.

¹⁵⁴ *So n’eva ussādetabbo na apasādetabbo anussādetvā anapasādetvā sv-eva sādhuḥkam saññāpetabbo tassa ca atthassa tesañ ca vyañjanānam nisantiyā*.

¹⁵⁵ *Imassa nu kho āvuso atthassa imāni vā vyañjanāni etāni vā vyañjanāni katamāni opāyikatarānīti?*

‘You, venerable, have grasped this meaning *rightly* and proposed the wording *rightly*, too!’

21.3 then, you should approve of him, rejoice in him, saying to him, ‘Sadhu!’ [Good!].¹⁵⁶

21.4 Having approved of him, rejoicing in him, saying sadhu, you should say these words to him:

21.5 ‘This is a gain for us, avuso, a good gain for us, avuso—that we see that the venerable to be *such* a brahmachari who is so accomplished in its meaning, accomplished in its wording!’¹⁵⁷

Proper use of permitted life-supports

22.1 Cunda, I teach the Dharma not merely for the restraint of mental influxes¹⁵⁸ here and now,¹⁵⁹ [130]

but I also teach the Dharma for the warding off of mental influxes in the next life.¹⁶⁰

22.2 (1) REFLECTION ON ROBES. As such, Cunda, whatever robes that have been allowed by me, let it be enough for you, thus:

only for warding off heat,	for the sake of warding off cold,
for the sake of warding off	the touch of mosquitoes, flies, the wind, the sun,
and creeping creatures;	for the purpose of covering up the privies, out of moral shame.

(2) REFLECTION ON FOOD.¹⁶¹ Whatever almsfood that have been allowed by me, let it be enough for you, thus:

only for keeping this body going and enduring,	for ending hunger pangs, ¹⁶²
for the sake of supporting the holy life, ¹⁶³	considering,
‘Thus I shall get rid of an old feeling,	and not let a new feeling arise,
and so that I will be healthy and blameless,	and live at ease.’

(3) REFLECTION ON LODGING. Whatever lodging that have been allowed by me, let it be enough for you, thus:

only for warding off cold,	for warding off heat,
for warding off the touch of mosquitoes, flies,	the wind, the sun, and creeping creatures,
only for avoiding weather hazards,	for the purpose of enjoying solitude.

¹⁵⁶ *Tassa sādhitī bhāsitaṃ abhinanditvā anumoditvā.*

¹⁵⁷ *Lābhā no āvuso suladdhaṃ no āvuso, ye mayaṃ āyasmantaṃ tādisaṃ brahma, cāriṃ passāma evaṃ atth’upe-taṃ vyañjanūpetam.*

¹⁵⁸ **‘Mental influxes,’** *āsava*. The term *āsava* (lit “in-flow, out-flow”) comes from *ā-savati* “flows towards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously translated as influxes, taints (“deadly taints,” RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists 4 kinds of *āsava*: the influx of (1) sense-desire (*kāma-āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhava-āsava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭhā-āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjā-āsava*) (D 16,2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These four are also known as “floods” (*oghā*) and “yokes” (*yogā*). The list of three influxes (omitting the influx of views) [43] is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these *āsavas* is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict: *āsava*.

¹⁵⁹ *Na vo [Be Ce Se; only Ee Navam] ahaṃ cunda diṭṭha, dhammikānaṃ yeva āsavānaṃ saṃvarāya dhammaṃ desemi.* Instead of “I teach the Dharma not merely for...” Ee reading translates as “I teach a *new* Dharma...”

¹⁶⁰ These foll 4 reflections on the use of life-supports [§22.2], here abridged, appear in full in **Sabb’āsava S** (M 2) under the heading “influxes to be abandoned by reflective use” (*paṭisevana pahatabb’āsava*): M 2,13-17/1:10 & SD 30.3 (2.3)); also at **Āsava S** (A 6.58,4/3:388 f), SD 62.1; **Nm** 2:496. For details, see Vism 1.85-97/30-35.

¹⁶¹ This reflection is found by itself at **Mahā Assa, pura S** (M 39,9/1:273), SD 10.13; **Sekha S** (M 53,9/1:355), SD 21.14; **Gaṇaka Moggallāna S** (M 107,5/3:2), SD 56.3; **Sāriputta Saddhi, vihārika S** (S 35,129/4:104); **Rathō-pama S** (S 35.239/4:176, 177), SD 55.14; **Apaṇṇaka Paṭipada S** (A 3.16/1:114), SD 74.11; **Aparihāna S** (A 4.37,4/2:40); **(Taṇhā) Bhikkhuṇī S** (A 4.159,4/2:145), SD 10.14; **Nanda S** (A 8.9,3/4:167); **Nm** 1:240, 241, 368×2, 484; **Nc:Be** 292; **Dhs** 231; **Vbh** 249; **Pug** 25.

¹⁶² Vism 1.92/32.

¹⁶³ Buddhaghosa distinguishes 2 kinds of holy life (*brahma, cariya*): the teaching (*sāsana*) as a whole, and the holy life of the path (*maggā brahma, cariya*), ie sainthood (Vism 1.92/32).

(4) REFLECTION ON MEDICINE. Whatever medicine that have been allowed by me, let it be enough for you, thus:

only for warding off feelings of illness that have arisen,
only for the sake of non-affliction.

Devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure

23.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside sectarians might speak thus:

‘The recluses, sons of the Sakya, dwell devoted to the enjoyment of pleasure!’¹⁶⁴

23.2 These wanderers who are outside sectarians who speak thus should be asked:

‘**What, avuso, is this devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure?** For, there are many different ways of falling into devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure, which are of various forms.’¹⁶⁵

23.3 Cunda, there are these four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure that are low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal,¹⁶⁶

not conducive to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana. [§24.3]

23.4 What are the four?

(1) Here, Cunda, one who is foolish is pleased and gratified with himself in habitually killing and harming life.¹⁶⁷

This is the first kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

(2) Furthermore, Cunda, here [131] a certain person is pleased and gratified with himself in habitually stealing and taking the not-given.¹⁶⁸

This is the second kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

(3) Furthermore, Cunda, here a certain person is pleased and gratified with himself in habitually speaking falsehood.¹⁶⁹

This is the third kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

(4) Furthermore, Cunda, here a certain person gives oneself over the 5 cords of sense-pleasures, fallen into them, overwhelmed by them.¹⁷⁰

This is the fourth kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

23.5 These, Cunda, are the four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure that are *low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal,*

not conducive to revulsion, nor to dispassion, nor to cessation, nor to stilling, nor to knowledge, nor to self-awakening, nor to nirvana.

Dhyanic pleasures

24.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside sectarians might speak thus:

¹⁶⁴ *Sukh’allikānuyogam-anuyuttā samaṇā sakya,puttiyā viharantīti.* The term *sukh’allikānuyoga* is resolved as *su-kha*, “pleasure, happiness,” + *allika* (from *alla* = *allika*, “being soiled (by defilement), or *allīyati* = *alliyaka*,” clinging to, sticking to”) + *anuyoga* (*anu*, “after” + *yoga*, “yoke”), “being yoked to, devotion”: V 1:10; D 3:113, 130; S 4:330, 5:421. The better known (negative) term is *kāma-*, “devotion of sensual pleasures”: see **Dhamma,cakka Pavattana S** (S 56.11,3/5:420) & SD 1.1 (3.1). On how the Buddha progresses from self-mortifying (painful) meditations to the realization that there is a pleasure that *is* conducive to meditation and spiritual cultivation, see **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36,21-32/1:236 f), SD 1.12 = SD 49.4 (full tr).

¹⁶⁵ *Sukh’allikānuyogā hi bahū aneka,vihitā nāna-p,pakārakāti.*

¹⁶⁶ “Low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal” (*hīna gamma pothujjanika anariya anatta,saṁhita*), also at §16.8 above: for explanation, see **The body in Buddhism**, SD 29.6a (1.2.2 + 4.1.1).

¹⁶⁷ *Idha cunda ekacco bālo pāṇe vadhitvā vadhitvā attānaṁ sukheti pīṇeti.* “Habitually” here is connoted by the reiterative *vadhitvā vadhitvā*, “having killed, having harmed.”

¹⁶⁸ *Puna ca param cunda idh’ekacco adinnaṁ ādiyitvā ādiyitvā attānaṁ sukheti pīṇeti.*

¹⁶⁹ *Puna ca param cunda idh’ekacco musā bhaṇitvā bhaṇitvā attānaṁ sukheti pīṇeti.*

¹⁷⁰ *Puna ca param cunda idh’ekacco pañcahi kāma,guṇehi samappito samaṅgī,bhūto paricāreti.*

‘The recluses, sons of the Sakya, dwell devoted to these four devotions to the enjoyment of pleasure!’

24.2 They should be told: ‘It is not so!’

For, if they were to speak thus they are not speaking rightly, they have misrepresented us with what is false, what is untrue.¹⁷¹

24.3 There are, Cunda, these four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure that conduce [lead] to utter revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana.¹⁷²

24.4 What are the four?¹⁷³

(1) THE FIRST DHYANA. Here, Cunda, a monk quite detached from sensual pleasures, detached from unwholesome mental states, he enters and dwells in the **first dhyana**, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and joy, born of seclusion.¹⁷⁴

This is the first kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

(2) THE SECOND DHYANA. Furthermore, Cunda, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he enters and dwells in **the second dhyana**, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and joy born of concentration.¹⁷⁵

This is the second kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

(3) THE THIRD DHYANA. Furthermore, Cunda, with the fading away of zest, he dwells equanimous, mindful and fully aware, and experiences joy with the body. He enters and dwells in **the third dhyana**, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’

This is the third kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.¹⁷⁶

(4) THE FOURTH DHYANA. Furthermore, Cunda, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain, and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure [132] and displeasure. He attains and dwells in **the fourth dhyana** that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.¹⁷⁷

This is the fourth kind of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure.

24.5 These, Cunda, are the four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure that conduces [leads] to utter revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana.

24.6 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside sectarians might speak thus:

‘The recluses, sons of the Sakya, dwell devoted to *these* four devotions to the enjoyment of pleasure!’

24.7 They should be told: ‘It *is* so!’ (*evam*)

For, if they were to speak thus they *are* speaking rightly, they have not misrepresented us with what is false, what is untrue.

¹⁷¹ *Na te vo sammā vadamānā vadeyyuṃ, abbhācikkheyyuṃ asatā abhūtena.*

¹⁷² *Cattārōme cunda sukh’allikānuyogā ekanta, nibbidāya virāgāya nirodhāya upasamāya abhiññāya sambodhāya nibbānāya samvattant:* D 1:189; S 5:82, 179, 255, 361; A 3:83, 4:143, 5:216. These are the 7 criteria for the true Dharma-Vinaya (**dhamma, vinaya, jānana, lakkhana*). See *Nibbidā*, SD 20.1.

¹⁷³ The defs of these 4 dhyanas are stock: see eg **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2.77-84/1:73-76 = SD 8.10). For a fuller list of refs, see **Dhyana** @ SD 8.4 (1.2) n or SID: jhāna 4.

¹⁷⁴ *Idha cunda bhikkhu vivicc’eva kāmehi vivicca akusalehi dhammehi sa, vitakkaṃ sa, vicāraṃ viveka, jaṃ pīti, sukhaṃ, paṭhamāṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharati.* On the 1st dhyana, see **Dhyana** @ SD 8.4 (5.1) or SID: jhāna 4.

¹⁷⁵ *Puna ca param cunda bhikkhu vitakka, vicāraṇaṃ vūpasamā ajjhataṃ sampasādanaṃ cetaso ekodi, bhāvaṃ avitakkaṃ avicāraṃ samādhi, jaṃ pīti, sukhaṃ dutiyaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharati.* On the 2nd dhyana, see **Dhyana** @ SD 8.4 (5.2) or SID: jhāna 4.

¹⁷⁶ *Puna ca param cunda bhikkhu pītiyā ca virāgā upekkhako ca viharati sato ca sampajāno sukhaṃ ca kāyena paṭisaṃvedeti, yaṃ taṃ ariyā ācikkhanti “upekkhako satimā sukha, viharī” ti taṃ tatiyaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharati.* On the 3rd dhyana, see **Dhyana** @ SD 8.4 (5.3) or SID: jhāna 4.

¹⁷⁷ *Puna ca param cunda bhikkhu sukhasa ca pahānā dukkhasa ca pahānā pubb’eva somanassa, domanassānaṃ atthaṇ, gamā adukkhaṃ asukhaṃ upekkhā, sati, pārisuddhiṃ catutthaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharati.* On the 4th dhyana, see **Dhyana** @ SD 8.4 (5.4) or SID: jhāna 4.

The benefits of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure

25.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside sectarians might speak thus:

‘But, avuso, having lived these four devotions to the enjoyment of pleasure, how many fruits, how many benefits are to be expected?’

Cunda, when the wanderers who are outside sectarians say thus, they should be spoken to thus:

‘Having lived these four devotions to the enjoyment of pleasure, avuso, four fruits, four benefits are to be expected.

What are the four?¹⁷⁸

(1) STREAMWINNING. Here, avuso, a monk, whose three fetters¹⁷⁹ are totally destroyed, is a **stream-winner**, not bound for the lower world,¹⁸⁰ sure of liberation, destined for awakening.¹⁸¹

This is the first fruit, first benefit.

(2) ONCE-RETURN. Furthermore, avuso, a monk, whose three fetters¹⁸² are destroyed, and with the diminishing of lust, hate and delusion, is a **once-returner**, returning only once to this world to make an end of suffering.¹⁸³

This is the second fruit, second benefit.

(3) NON-RETURN. Furthermore, avuso, a monk, with the destruction of the five lower fetters¹⁸⁴, is **spontaneously reborn¹⁸⁵** and there attain final nirvana, without ever returning from that world.¹⁸⁶

This is the third fruit, third benefit.

(4) ARHATHOOD. Furthermore, avuso, a monk, with mental influxes¹⁸⁷ destroyed, having lived the holy life, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, reached his own goal,¹⁸⁸ destroyed the fetters of being, is completely liberated through direct knowledge.¹⁸⁹

¹⁷⁸ These 4 defs of sainthood are stock: see **Ānāpāna,sati S** (M 118.9-12/3:80), SD 7.13; also **Kiṭṭā,giri S** (M 70) @ SD 11.1 (5.1).

¹⁷⁹ They are: (1) Personality view (*sakkāya,dīṭṭhi*), (2) persistent doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rules and rites (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*). They are part of the 10 mental fetters: see (3) n below.

¹⁸⁰ **Avinipāta**, alt tr “not fated for birth in a suffering state”; opp of *vinipāta*, “the world of suffering,” another name for the 4 woeful courses (*duggati*) or the 4 lower worlds (*apāya*) (Vism 13.92 f). Sometimes 5 woeful courses (*pañca,gati*) (D 33.21/3:234, A 11.68) are mentioned: the hells (*niraya*), the animal kingdom (*tirachāna,yoni*), the ghost realm (*pitti,visaya*), the human world (*manussa*) and the heavenly world (*deva*). Of these, the first three are woeful, with the asura-demons (*asura,kāya*) as the fourth woeful course. The remaining two are “happy courses” (*sugati*). For a discussion, see Nyanaponika & Bodhi (tr), *Numerical Discourses of the Buddha*, 1999:14-19.

¹⁸¹ *Idh’āvuso bhikkhu tiṇṇaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ parikkhayā sot’āpanno hoti avinipāta,dhammo niyato sambodhi,-parāyaṇo.*

¹⁸² See (1) n above here.

¹⁸³ *Puna ca paraṃ āvuso bhikkhu tiṇṇaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ parikkhayā rāga,dosa,mohānaṃ tanuttā sakadāgāmī hoti, sakid-eva imaṃ lokaṃ āgantvā dukkhass’antaṃ karoti.*

¹⁸⁴ They fetter us to the lower realms of existence (the sense worlds). **The 10 fetters** (*dasa,samyojanā*) are: (1) Personality view (*sakkāya,dīṭṭhi*), (2) persistent doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rules and rites (*sīla-b,bata,-parāmāsa*), (4) sensual lust (*kāma,rāga*), (5) repulsion (*paṭigha*), (6) greed for form existence (*rūpa,rāga*), (7) greed for formless existence (*arūpa,rāga*), (8) conceit (*māna*), (9) restlessness (*uddhacca*), (10) ignorance (*avijjā*) (S 5:61, A 5:13, Vbh 377). In some places, no. 5 (*paṭigha*) is replaced by ill will (*vyāpāda*). The first 5 are the lower fetters (*orambhāgiya*), and the rest, the higher fetters (*uddhambhāgiya*).

¹⁸⁵ As a non-returner, reborn in the Pure Abodes (*suddh’āvāsa*), the 5 highest heavens of the form world (*rūpa,-loka*) inhabited only by non-returners who assume their last birth to become arhats and attain nirvana. These worlds are Āviha (“Non-declining”), Ātappa (“Unworried”), Sudassā (“Clearly Visible”), Sudassī (“Clear-visioned”) and Akaṇiṭṭhā (“Highest”) (D 3:237, M 3:103, Vbh 425, Pug 42-46). It should be noted that one could become a non-returner in this world itself, but upon dying, one is reborn in the Pure Abodes.

¹⁸⁶ *Puna ca paraṃ āvuso bhikkhu pañcannaṃ orambhāgiyānaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ parikkhayā opapātiko hoti tattha parinibbāyī anāvatti,dhammo tasmā lokā.*

¹⁸⁷ “Mental influxes,” *āsava*: see §22.1 n.

¹⁸⁸ *Sadatthā*, may be resolved as: (1) *sa-d-atthā*, “one own goal,” (2) *sant + atthā*, “the sublime goal,” “the ideal.”

This is the fourth fruit, fourth benefit.

25.2 Having dwelled with these four kinds of devotion to the enjoyment of pleasure, avuso, these four fruits, these *four* benefits, are to be expected.

The consistency of the Buddha Dharma

26.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside [133] sectarians might speak thus: ‘The recluses, sons of the Sakya, dwell without a consistent teaching.’¹⁹⁰

26.2 Cunda, when the wanderers who are outside sectarians say thus, they should be spoken to thus:

26.3 ‘There is **the Dharma**, avuso, taught, laid out, by the Tathagata, who knows, who sees, worthy, fully self-awakened for the disciples, and which is not to be transgressed as long as life lasts.

26.4 Avuso, just as Indra’s pillar¹⁹¹ or an iron pillar, deeply buried, well sunk, unshakeable, immovable¹⁹² —

even so, avuso, the Dharma, is *taught, laid out, by the Tathagata, who knows, who sees, worthy, fully self-awakened for the disciples, and which is not to be transgressed as long as life lasts.*

26.5 Such, avuso, is that monk who is **an arhat**, whose mental influxes are destroyed, having lived the holy life, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, reached his own goal, destroyed the fetters of being, is completely liberated through direct knowledge. [§25.1(4)]

26.6 He is incapable of committing nine things:¹⁹³ Avuso,

(1) a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of deliberately depriving beings of their life;

(2) a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of taking the not-given by way of theft;

(3) a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of indulging in sexual intercourse;

(4) a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of consciously speaking falsehood.

(5) a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of enjoying sensual pleasure from what he has stored up, just as he has done before as a householder;¹⁹⁴

(6) a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of acting with the bias of greed;

(7) a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of acting with the bias of hate;

(8) a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of acting with the bias of delusion;

(9) a monk with mental influxes destroyed is incapable of acting with the bias of fear.

26.7 Such, avuso, is that monk who is an arhat, *whose mental influxes are destroyed, having lived the holy life, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, reached his own goal, destroyed the fetters of being, is completely liberated through direct knowledge.*

He is incapable of committing these nine things. [134]

¹⁸⁹ *Puna ca param āvuso bhikkhu āsavānaṃ khayā anāsavaṃ ceto, vimuttiṃ paññā, vimuttiṃ diṭṭh’eva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharati.*

¹⁹⁰ *Aṭṭhita, dhammā samaṇā sakya, puttīyā viharantīti. Aṭṭhita, dhammā*, “with unfixed [uncertain] teachings,” ie, saying what they like (DA 3:913).

¹⁹¹ “Indra’s pillar,” *inda, khīla* (Skt *indra, kīla*), “Indra’s bolt or wedge,” a wooden post securing a city gate (exact shape and function uncertain). CPD: Most prob, orig, a pointed wooden post (syn *esikā, thambha*) rammed deep into the ground and projecting about one cubit above it (Skt *aratnir indra, kīlah*), against which the wings of the city gate are closed (KhpA 1:185,21 ad Khp 6.8 = Sn 229; Tha 663). See D 20/2:254,17* = S 1.37/1:27,4*; **Pāsādika S**, D 29/3:133,6 ≈ **Inda, khīla S**, S 56.39/5:444,17. In similes (as here), it ref to a symbol of firmness, unshakability, immobility; but also of an obstacle, a hindrance. See PED; CPD; BHS: *indrakīla*; J J Meyer, *Arthaśāstra des Kauṭilya*, Leipzig, 1926:689 f; D Schlingloff, *Weiner Zeitschrift für die Kunde süd- und ostasiens* (WZKSOA) 11, 1962:71; A Ray, *Villages, Towns and Secular Buildings in Ancient India*, Calcutta, 1964:87 f.

¹⁹² *Seyyathā’pi āvuso inda, khīlo vā ayo, khīlo vā gambhīra, nemo sunikkhitto* [Be Ee *sunikhāto*] *acalo asampavedhī*.

¹⁹³ *Abhabbo so nava ṭhānāni ajjhācaritum*. In other words, the arhat is pure in both body and mind. See **Samāṇa, maṇḍika S** (M 78/2:22-20), SD 18.9; also **Beyond good and evil**, SD 18.7.

¹⁹⁴ *Abhabbo khīnāsavo bhikkhu sannidhi, kārakam kāme paribhuñjitum, seyathā’pi pubbe āgārika, bhūto*.

Ways of answering questions

27.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers who are outside sectarians might speak thus:

‘Now the recluse Gotama manifests unlimited knowledge and vision concerning the past, way back a long time,¹⁹⁵

but he does not manifest knowledge and vision of the future, the way ahead.¹⁹⁶

How is this so? What is the reason for this?’¹⁹⁷

27.2 But these wanderers, outside sectarians, like the foolish and ignorant, think that knowledge and vision concerning *certain* things should manifest itself in the same way as that concerning *other* things, too.¹⁹⁸

27.3 As regards the past, Cunda, the Tathagata’s knowledge of the recollection and memory goes back a long way:¹⁹⁹

he is able to recall as far back as he wishes.²⁰⁰

27.4 But as regards the future, the time way ahead, there arises in his knowledge born of awakening that²⁰¹

‘This is the last birth! There is no more rebirth now (for me)!’²⁰²

Knowledge of the three times

28.1 If, Cunda, **the past** were untrue, unreal, not connected with the goal, then the Tathagata will not reveal it.²⁰³

28.2 If, Cunda, the past was true, real, but *unconnected* with the goal, then the Tathagata will not reveal it.²⁰⁴

28.3 If, Cunda, the past was *true, real, connected with the goal*, then the Tathagata would reveal it at the right time when questioned.²⁰⁵

28.4 If, Cunda, **the future** were untrue, unreal, unconnected with the goal, then the Tathagata will not reveal it.²⁰⁶

28.5 If, Cunda, the future will be true, real, but *unconnected* with the goal, then the Tathagata will not reveal it.

28.6 If, Cunda, the future will be *true, real, connected with the goal*, then the Tathagata would reveal it at the right time when questioned.

28.7 If, Cunda, **the present** were untrue, unreal, unconnected with the goal, then the Tathagata will not reveal it.

28.8 If, Cunda, the present is true, [135] real, but *unconnected* with the goal, then the Tathagata will not reveal it.

¹⁹⁵ *Atītaṃ kho addhānaṃ ārabba samaṇo gotamo atīrakaṃ nāṇa, dassanaṃ paññapeti.*

¹⁹⁶ *No ca kho anāgataṃ addhānaṃ ārabba atīrakaṃ nāṇa, dassanaṃ paññapeti.*

¹⁹⁷ *Tay-idaṃ kiṃsu tay-idaṃ kathaṃsūti?*

¹⁹⁸ *Te ca añña, tiṭṭhiyā paribbājaka añña, vihitakena nāṇa, dassanena añña, vihitakaṃ nāṇa, dassanaṃ paññapetabbaṃ maññanti yatha-r-iva bālā avyattā.* Here *añña, vihita* means “thinking about, or occupied with, other things, otherwise disposed” (CPD). The point here is that the wanderers think that all knowledge (of the past and of the future) is the same thing.

¹⁹⁹ *Atītaṃ kho, cunda, addhānaṃ ārabba tathāgatassa satānusāri, nāṇaṃ hoti.*

²⁰⁰ *So yāvatakaṃ ākaṅkhati tāvatakaṃ anussarati.*

²⁰¹ *Anāgatañ ca kho addhānaṃ ārabba tathāgatassa bodhi, jaṃ nāṇaṃ uppajjati.*

²⁰² *Ayam-antimā jāti, n’atthi dāni puna-b, bhavo’ti.* In **Mahā’padāna S** (D 14), the Bodhisattva is presented as knowing his impending destiny as the fully self-awakened Buddha (D 14.1.29/2:15).

²⁰³ *Atītañ ce’pi cunda hoti abhūtaṃ atacchaṃ anatta, saṃhitā, na taṃ tathāgato vyākaroti.*

²⁰⁴ *Atītañ ce’pi, cunda, hoti bhūtaṃ tacchaṃ anatta, saṃhitā, tampi tathāgato na vyākaroti.*

²⁰⁵ *Atītañ ce’pi cunda hoti bhūtaṃ tacchaṃ attha, saṃhitā, tatra kālaññū tathāgato hoti tassa pañhassa veyyākaraṇāya.*

²⁰⁶ On the Buddha’s prophecies on the future of Buddhism, see **The Dharma-ending age**, SD 1.10 (3).

28.9 If, Cunda, the present is *true, real, connected with the goal*, then the Tathagata will reveal it at the right time when questioned.

28.10 Thus, Cunda, concerning the past, the future and the present, the Tathagata is one who speaks at the right time, *kāla, vādī*
 speaks the truth, *bhūta, vādī*
 speaks on the goal [the meaning], *attha, vādī*
 speaks the Dharma, *dhamma, vādī*
 speaks the Vinaya— *vinaya, vādī*
 therefore he is called Tathāgata [thus come].²⁰⁷ *tasmā tathāgato 'ti vuccati*

Why the Buddha is Tathagata²⁰⁸

29.1 ²⁰⁹And, Cunda, whatever that is what is seen, heard, sensed, cognized,²¹⁰ attained [encountered], sought after, examined by the mind²¹¹

of those in this world with its devas [gods], with its Mara, with its Brahma, with its recluses and brahmins, this generation along with their rulers and humans—

all that is comprehended by the Tathagata—therefore, he is called Tathāgata.

29.2 And, Cunda, the night that the Tathagata awakened to the supreme full self-awakening, and the night that he passed away into final nirvana without any remains—

whatever in between them that he has spoken, conversed, expressed²¹²—

all that is just as it is, not otherwise—therefore, he is called Tathāgata.²¹³

29.3 As he speaks, Cunda, that the Tathagata does; as he does, so he speaks.

As he speaks, so he does; as he does, so he speaks²¹⁴—therefore, he is called Tathāgata.

29.4 As to the world, Cunda, with its devas [gods], with its Mara, with its Brahma, with its recluses and brahmins, this generation along with their rulers and humans,
 the Tathagata is the vanquisher, unvanquished, who sees all,²¹⁵ overlord—therefore he is called Tathāgata.²¹⁶

²⁰⁷ *Iti kho cunda atī 'ānāgata, paccuppannesu dhammesu tathāgato kāla, vādī bhūta, vādī attha, vādī dhamma, vādī vinaya, vādī, tasmā tathāgato 'ti vuccati.*

²⁰⁸ For a fuller comy set of defs, see **Buddhānussati**, SD 15.7 (2).

²⁰⁹ This whole section as at (**Tathāgata**) **Loka S** (A 4.23.2-3/2:23 f) = **Loka S** (It 4.1.13/121 f), SD 15.7(2.1.2).

²¹⁰ *Diṭṭham sutam mutam viññātam.* “Sensed” (*muta*) here includes the senses of smell, taste and touch. On *diṭṭha suta muta viññāta*, see SD 53.5.

²¹¹ *Diṭṭham sutam mutam viññātam pattam pariyesitam anuvaritāmanasā.* This refers to all that can be experienced bodily and mentally, and alludes to the Buddha’s quality of “knowing the world” (*loka, vidū*): see eg **Buddhānussati**, SD 15.7 (3.5).

²¹² *Yam etasmim antare bhāsati lapati niddisati.*

²¹³ *Sabbam tam tath'eva hoti no aññāthā, tasmā 'tathāgato 'ti vuccati.* This is an allusion to the Buddha’s quality of knowing the “all” (*sabba*): see **Sabba S** (S 35.23/4:15), SD 7.1.

²¹⁴ *Iti yathā, vādī tathā, kārī, yathā, kārī tathā, vādī, tasmā 'tathāgato 'ti vuccati.* His words and actions are true and consistent.

²¹⁵ *Añña-d-atthu, dasa*, a difficult cpd. Probably *añña* (Skt *anya*, other, another, something, anything) + *atthu* (imp of *atthi*, “let the rest be (as it will)”) + *dasa* (Skt *dr̥ṣa*, seeing, to be seen, to be perceived or understood, PED). Comys expl as “one who sees everything” (DA 1:67; SA 1:209; UA 132; NmA 1:183). CPD prefers “who only sees, the absolute seer, cf *draṣṭa dr̥ṣimātraḥ*, Yoga, sūtra 2:20. See also DP sv. The meaning here I think is that the Tathagata is one who see all, and sees them only as they really are.

²¹⁶ *Tathāgato abhibhū anabhibhūto añña-d-atthu, daso vasa, vattī, tasmā 'tathāgato 'ti vuccatiz.* This is stock: **Pāsādika S** (D 29.29.4/3:135,20 = Nc 276, attr to Buddha); (**Tathāgata**) **Loka S** (A 4.23.3/2:24,13 = It 4.1.13/122,7, attr to Buddha), SD 15.7(2.1.2). These are usu Mahā Brahmā’s epithets: **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1.5/1:18,7), SD 25.2; **Bhaddaji S** (A 5.170/3:202,9); (**Puñña**) **Mettā S** (A 7.58a.3/4:89,9), SD 2.11a; (**Satta**) **Suriya S** (A 7.62.47/4:105,-3), SD 67.3; Comy: DA 1:111.

The undetermined points

30.1 (1) Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:
‘What now, avuso—**the tathagata exists after death**—is only this true, all else false?’

30.2 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
Avuso, this is *undetermined* [136] by the Blessed One, that is:

‘*The tathagata exist after death*—only this is true, all else false.’

30.3 (2) Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:

‘What now, avuso—**the tathagata does not exist after death**—is only this true, all else false?’

30.4 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
Avuso, this is *undetermined* by the Blessed One, that is:

‘*The tathagata does not exist after death*—only this is true, all else false.’

30.5 (3) Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:

‘What now, avuso—**the tathagata both exists and not exist after death**—is only this true, all else false?’

30.6 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
Avuso, this is *undetermined* by the Blessed One, that is:

‘*The tathagata both exists and not exist after death*—only this is true, all else false.’

30.7 (4) Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:

‘What now, avuso—**the tathagata neither exists nor not exist after death**—is only this true, all else false.’

30.8 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:
Avuso, this is *undetermined* by the Blessed One, that is:

‘*The tathagata neither exists nor not exist after death*—only this is true, all else false.’

31.1 REASON FOR NOT TEACHING THEM. Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:

‘But why, Cunda, have they been undetermined [unanswered] by the Blessed One?’

31.2 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:

‘Because, avuso, they are not connected with the goal, not related to the fundamentals of the holy life, not conduce to revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana. [§23.3]

Therefore, they are undetermined by the Blessed.’

The determined

32.1 Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:

‘What now, avuso, is determined by the Blessed One?’

32.2 THE 4 NOBLE TRUTHS. Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:

‘This is suffering’	has been determined, avuso, by the Blessed One.
‘This is the arising of suffering’	has been determined, avuso, by the Blessed One.
‘This is the ending of suffering’	has been determined, avuso, by the Blessed One.
‘This is the path leading to the ending of suffering’	has been determined, avuso, by the Blessed One. [137]

33.1 REASON FOR TEACHING THEM. Now, Cunda, it is possible that wanderers, outside sectarians, might speak thus:

‘But why, avuso, have these been determined [answered] by the recluse Gotama?’

33.2 Cunda, when the wanderers, outside sectarians, speak thus, they should be told thus:

‘Because, avuso, they are connected to the goal, it is connected to the Dharma, it is connected with the fundamentals of the holy life,

conducting [leading] to utter revulsion, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [stilling], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana. [§24.3]

Therefore, they have been determined by the Blessed One.’

Views connected with “finite past” beliefs

34.1 Whatever, Cunda, that are **dependent on views connected with the finite past**,²¹⁷ they have been determined [declared] by me insofar as they are determinable.

34.2 And as for what *you* should not determine, what is there as such for *me* to determine for you?²¹⁸

34.3 Whatever, Cunda, that are dependent on views connected with the future, they have been revealed by me insofar as they are determinable.

34.4 And as for what *you* should not determine, what is there as such for *me* to determine for you?

34.5 And what are they, Cunda, that are dependent on views connected with the finite past that have been determined by me insofar as they are determinable,

34.6 and as for what *you* should not determine, what is there as such for *me* to determine for you?

THE 16 WRONG VIEWS REGARDING THE FINITE PAST²¹⁹

34.7 (1) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are *eternal*: only this is true, all else false.’

34.8 (2) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are *not eternal*: only this is true, all else false.’

34.9 (3) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are *both eternal and not eternal*: only this is true, all else false.’

34.10 (4) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are *neither eternal nor not eternal*: only this is true, all else false.’

34.11 (5) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are *self-made*: only this is true, all else false.’

34.12 (6) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are *other-made*: only this is true, all else false.’

34.13 (7) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are *both self-made and other-made*: only this is true, all else false.’ [138]

34.14 (8) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘the self and the world are *neither self-made nor other-made, but arise fortuitously*: only this is true, all else false.’²²⁰

34.15 (9) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are *eternal*: only this is true, all else false.’

34.16 (10) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are *not eternal*: only this is true, all else false.’

34.17 (11) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are *both eternal and not eternal*: only this is true, all else false.’

34.18 (12) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are *neither eternal nor not eternal*: only this is true, all else false.’

34.19 (13) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view,

²¹⁷ *Ye’pi te cunda pubb’anta,saha,gatā diṭṭhi,nissayā.*

²¹⁸ *Yathā ca te na vyākātabbā, kiṃ vo ahaṃ te tathā vyākarissāmi?*

²¹⁹ These 16 views are also listed in **Nānā Tittthiyā S 2+3** (U 6.5+6/69 f), SD 97.2+3.

²²⁰ *Asayaṅ,kāro aparāṅ,kāro adhicca,samuppanno attā ca loko ca, idam eva saccaṃ mogham aññan’ti.*

that ‘happiness and sorrow are self-made: only this is true, all else false.’

34.20 (14) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

34.21 (15) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are both self-made and other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

34.22 (16) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘happiness and sorrow are neither self-made nor other-made, but arise fortuitously: only this is true, all else false.’

Rejecting the views connected with “finite past” beliefs

35.1 Here, Cunda, there are those recluses and brahmins who hold these doctrines, these views:

(1) ‘The self and the world are eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

35.2 Having approached them, I said this:

‘Now, avuso, is this what you said: “The self and the world are *eternal*.”’

35.3 And they replied thus: “Only this is true, all else false!”

I do not grant them this. Why is the reason for this?

35.4 For here, Cunda, there are beings with different perceptions.²²¹

35.5 Indeed, Cunda, in these declarations I see no one at all who is my equal, what more to say better.²²²

Moreover, here I am indeed the better at whatever concerning declarations [expositions].²²³

36.1 Here, Cunda, as regards those recluses and brahmins who hold these doctrines, these views,²²⁴

(2) that ‘the self and the world are not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(3) that ‘the self and the world are both eternal and not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(4) that ‘the self and the world are neither eternal nor not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(5) that ‘the self and the world are self-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(6) that ‘the self and the world are other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(7) that ‘the self and the world are both self-made and other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(8) that ‘the self and the world are neither self-made nor other-made, but arise fortuitously: only this is true, all else false.’

(9) that ‘happiness and sorrow are eternal: only this is true, all else false.’ [139]

(10) that ‘happiness and sorrow are not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(11) that ‘happiness and sorrow are both eternal and not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(12) that ‘happiness and sorrow are neither eternal nor not eternal: only this is true, all else false.’

(13) that ‘happiness and sorrow are self-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(14) that ‘happiness and sorrow are other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(15) that ‘happiness and sorrow are both self-made and other-made: only this is true, all else false.’

(16) that ‘happiness and sorrow are neither self-made nor other-made, but arise fortuitously: only this is true, all else false.’

²²¹ *Aññathā,saññino’pi h’ettha cunda sant’eke sattā.*

²²² *Imāya’pi kho aham cunda paññattiyā n’eva attanā sama,samam samanupassāmi kuto bhīyyo.* The comparison here, says Comy, is on the level of knowledge (*ñāṇena*) (DA 3:916). See foll n.

²²³ *Atha kho aham eva tattha bhīyyo yad idam adhipaññatti.* Here I take *adhipaññatti* as *adhi*, “concerning” + *paññatti*, “declaration, conception,” which Comy glosses as “view” (*diṭṭhi*, DA 3:916). Here again, we see the saṅgha fathers or sutta compilers presenting the Buddha as reassuring us of his full mastery of the doctrines (see DA 3:916). One way of interpreting this as a narrative skillful means of showing how comprehensive and authentic Buddhist philosophical analysis is. After all, this is a Dīgha sutta, often used as a Buddhist prospectus or advertisement for the unconverted: see Joy Manné, 1990, 1992.

²²⁴ Only Ce includes view no 1 (*The self and the world are eternal*), which is already addressed at §35 above; hence, should not be mentioned again.

36.2 Having approached them, I said this:
‘Now, avuso, there is this that you said: “Happiness and sorrow are neither self-made nor other-made, but arise fortuitously”—

36.3 And they replied thus: “*Only this is true, all else false!*”

I do not grant them this. Why is the reason for this?

36.4 *For here, Cunda, there are beings with different perceptions.*

36.5 *Indeed, Cunda, in these declarations I see no one at all who is my equal, what more to say better. Moreover, here I am indeed the better at whatever concerning declarations [expositions]. [§35.5]*

36.6 These, Cunda, are what are dependent on views connected with the finite past, that have been determined [declared] by me insofar as they are determinable. [§34.1]

36.7 And as for what you should not determine, what is there as such for me to determine for you? [§34.2]

Views connected with “future” beliefs

37.1 Whatever, Cunda, that are **dependent on views connected with the future**,²²⁵ they have been determined [declared] by me insofar as they are determinable.

37.2 And as for what you should not determine, what is there as such for me to determine for you?

37.3 Whatever, Cunda, that are dependent on views connected with the future, they have been revealed by me insofar as they are determinable.

37.4 And as for what you should not determine, what is there as such for me to determine for you?

THE 8 WRONG VIEWS DEPENDENT ON VIEWS OF THE FUTURE

37.5 (1) There are, Cunda, some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self has form and, after death, is unimpaired [intact]’.²²⁶ only this is true, all else false.’

(2) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

(3) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self both has form and is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

(4) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self neither has form nor is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’ [140]

(5) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self is conscious’²²⁷ and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

(6) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self is unconscious’²²⁸ and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

(7) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self is neither conscious nor unconscious and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’

(8) But, Cunda, there are some recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view, that ‘The self perishes, is destroyed, does not exist after death: only this is true, all else false.’

Rejecting views connected with “future” beliefs

38.1 Here, Cunda, as regards those recluses and brahmins who hold this doctrine, this view,

²²⁵ *Ye’pi te cunda apar’anta,saha,gatā diṭṭhi,nissayā.*

²²⁶ *Rūpī attā hoti arogo param marañā,* as at **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1.76/1:31,6-9), SD 25.2, where Comy glosses *aroga* as *nicca*, “permanent” (DA 1:1119). Also at **Pañca-t,taya S** (M 102.13/2:233), SD 40a.12.

²²⁷ *Saññī,* alt tr “percipient.”

²²⁸ *Asaññī,* alt tr “non-percipient.”

(1) *‘The self has form and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’*

38.2 Having approached them, I said this:

‘Now, avuso, there is this that you said: *“The self has form and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.”*’

38.3 And they replied thus: *“Only this is true, all else false!”*

I do not grant them this. Why is the reason for this?

38.4 *For here, Cunda, there are beings with different perceptions.*

38.5 *Indeed, Cunda, in these declarations I see no one at all who is my equal, what more to say better. Moreover, here I am indeed the better at whatever concerning declarations [expositions].* [§35.5]

39.1 Here, Cunda, as regards those recluses and brahmins who hold these doctrines, these views,

(2) *that ‘The self is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’*

(3) *that ‘The self both has form and is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’*

(4) *that ‘The self neither has form nor is formless and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’*

(5) *that ‘The self is conscious and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’*

(6) *that ‘The self is unconscious and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’*

(7) *that ‘The self is neither conscious nor unconscious and, after death, is unimpaired: only this is true, all else false.’*

(8) *that ‘The self perishes, is destroyed, does not exist after death: only this is true, all else false.’*

THE BUDDHA REJECTS THESE VIEWS CONNECTED WITH FUTURE BELIEFS:

39.2 Having approached them, I said this:

‘Now, avuso, there is this that you said: *“The self perishes, is destroyed, does not exist after death.”*’

39.3 And they replied thus: *“Only this is true, all else false!”*

I do not grant them this. Why is the reason for this?

39.4 *For here, Cunda, there are beings with different perceptions.*

39.5 *Indeed, Cunda, in these declarations I see no one at all who is my equal, what more to say better. Moreover, here I am indeed the better at whatever concerning declarations [expositions].* [§35.5]

39.6 These, Cunda, are what are dependent on views connected with the future, that have been determined [declared] by me [141] insofar as they are determinable.

39.7 And as for what *you* should not determine, what is there as such for *me* to determine for you?

Way out of the wrong view

40.1 Now, Cunda, for the abandoning, the crossing beyond, these dependence on views connected with the finite past, and this dependence on views connected with the future, I have thus taught and declared the four focusses [foundations] of mindfulness.

What are the four?²²⁹

40.2 Here, Cunda, a monk²³⁰

(1) dwells²³¹ exertive, clearly aware, mindful, **observing [watching] the body in the body**,²³² remov-

²²⁹ This passage [§40.2] is the stock def or “basic formula” for satipatthana practice: see esp **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.3/1:55), SD 13.3 & 13.1 esp (5).

²³⁰ Here “a monk” (*bhikkhu*) may refer to either an ordained monastic or anyone who is meditating (here, doing satipatthana) (DA 3:756; MA 1:241; VbhA 216 f; cf SnA 251). See SD 13.1 (3.1a).

²³¹ *Ātāpī sampajāno satimā, vineyya loke abhijjhā, domanassāṃ*. Here we find 4 of the 5 spiritual faculties (*pañc’-indriya*) in action: see SD 13.1 (4.2) above.

²³² “Observing the body in the body” (*kāye kāyānupassī*). See SD 13.1 (3.4).

- ing²³³ covetousness and displeasure²³⁴ in regard to the world;²³⁵
- (2) dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, **observing feelings in the feelings**, removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world;
- (3) dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, **observing the mind in the mind**, removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world;
- (4) dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful, **observing dharmas in the dharmas**, removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world.

40.3 And these, Cunda, are for the abandoning, the crossing beyond, these dependence on views connected with the finite past, and this dependence on views connected with the future. As such, I have taught and declared the four foundations of mindfulness.”

Conclusion

41.1 Now at that time, the venerable Upavāṇa²³⁶ was standing behind the Blessed One, fanning him. Then the venerable Upavāṇa said this to the Blessed One:

“It is wonderful, bhante! It is marvellous, bhante!

41.2 How delightful, bhante, is this Dharma exposition! How greatly delightful, bhante is this Dharma exposition! What is the name of this Dharma exposition, bhante?”²³⁷

41.3 “In that case here, Upavāṇa, you indeed may remember this Dharma exposition as just that, that is, as ‘the delightful’ (*pāsādika*)”²³⁸

41.4 The Blessed One said this.

The venerable Upavāṇa joyfully approved of the Blessed One’s word.

— evaṃ —

Bibliography

Burma Piṭaka Association = BPA

1984 *Ten Suttas From Dīgha Nikāya, Long Discourses of the Buddha*. Rangoon: Burma Piṭaka Association, 1984.

Gethin, Rupert M

2001 *The Buddhist Path to Awakening: A study of the Bodhi-pakkhiyā Dhammā*. [Leiden: E J Brill, 1992.] 2nd ed sb Oxford: Oneworld, 2001.

²³³ *Vineyya* can mean “should remove” (as pot, like *vineyya*, Sn 590) or as “having removed” (as ger, like *vinaitvā*, Pm 1:244), and both senses apply in Satipaṭṭhāna S. U Silananda similarly ends the sentence with “removing covetousness and grief in the world” (1990:177); also 1990:22-25. See SD 13.1 (4.2c) above.

²³⁴ “Covetousness and displeasure,” *abhijjhā,domanassaṃ*, alt trs: “desire and discontent,” “desiring and disliking,” or “longing and loathing.” Walshe (1995:335 & n632) renders it as “hankering and fretting [for the world].” See SD 13.1 (4.2).

²³⁵ “World” (*loka*). See SD 13.1 (4.2d).

²³⁶ An elder of Sāvattihī and one of the Buddha’s attendants. See Tha 185 f for his verses (also S 7.13; cf Miln 134, Miln:H 1:187 n8) & Tha:RD 350 for an allusion to this incident (ThaA 2:56 f). On his orig: Ap 22/70,22-74,7 (ApA 343,27 f). **Devahita S** (S 7.13) records how Upavāṇa, as the Buddha’s attendant, attends to him when he was suffering from wind illness (S 7.13/1:174 f ≈ DhA 4:232,18). In **Upavāṇa S** (S 35.70), he asks the Buddha on the meaning of *sandiṭṭhika* (directly visible; seen for oneself) which the Buddha explains it as that of direct awareness of lust as it arises through sense-experience (S 35.70/4:41-44). In **Pāsādika S** (D 29), he fans the Buddha as he teaches, and the Sutta title is to his credit (D 29.41/3:141), SD 40a.6. See CPD sv.

²³⁷ *Pāsādiko vatāyaṃ, bhante, dhamma,pariyāyo; supāsādiko vatāyaṃ, bhante, dhamma,pariyāyo, ko nāmāyaṃ, bhante, dhamma,pariyāyo ’ti?*

²³⁸ *Tasmā-t-īha tvaṃ upavāna imaṃ dhamma,pariyāyaṃ pāsādiko tv-eva naṃ dhārehīti.*

Manné, Joy

1990

“Categories of Sutta in the Pāli Nikāyas and their Implications for our Appreciation of the Buddhist Teaching and Literature,” in *Journal of the Pali Text Society* XV, 1990: 29-87.

1992

“The Dīgha Nikāya Debates: Debating Practices at the Time of the Buddha,” in *Buddhist Studies Review* 9,2, 1992:117-136.

120918; 121002; 120221; 130226