

1

(Saddha) Subhūti Sutta

The Discourse to Subhūti (and Saddha) | A 11.15 [A:B 11.14]¹

Theme: The 11 qualities and the harvests of faith

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

1 Sutta highlights

1.1 THE MONK SADDHA

1.1.1 The (Saddha) Subhūti Sutta (A 11.15)

1.1.1.1 The Sutta records the visit of elder Subhūti and the monk Saddha to the Buddha. The Sutta opens with the Buddha asking Subhūti who the monk accompanying him is [§1.2]. Firstly, it is significant to note that the Buddha does not use his psychic power to scan or read Saddha’s mind to know his name. Instead, he directly asks Subhūti who the monk accompanying him is.

Indeed, it is interesting that this is an almost contemporary situation, where we see the Buddha asking Subhūti to introduce Saddha to him. Or, this curious moment could reflect the fact that the Buddha addresses Subhūti out of monastic courtesy since he is Saddha’s senior. We can of course accept both explanations are applicable here.

1.1.1.2 From the Sutta and its Commentary, we in due course learn that Saddha is Anātha,piṇḍika’s son and Subhūti’s nephew [1.1.3]. Saddha has renounced the world out of faith in the three jewels and has attained arhathood [§13 (11)]. Clearly, this is a meeting where Subhūti introduces the newly awakened monk to the Buddha. [1.1.2]

1.1.2 The Sutta’s commentary

1.1.2.1 The Commentary says that the Buddha asks Subhūti for Saddha’s name as a way of “breaking the ice” (as we might say today), to start off a conversation with him (*kathā,samuṭṭhāpan’attham pucchati*, AA 5:82). This apparently mundane show of courtesy by the Buddha not only evinces his humanity, but also his accessibility as a teacher.

In asking for Saddha’s name, he at once direct his attention to a monk new to him, putting Saddha at ease as someone who (at least as a monk) is also new to the Buddha. Subhūti informs the Buddha that Saddha “**has gone forth from home to the homeless life out of faith**” [§1.2]. The Sutta closes with Subhūti saying that Saddha has attained arhathood [§13 (11)].

1.1.2.2 Putting all this together, we could surmise that Subhūti is probably Saddha’s preceptor, and also his meditation teacher, besides being his uncle, too. This is likely because both are accomplished dhyana-attainers. Otherwise, this is a surmise from silence.

With Saddha’s awakening, Subhūti presents him to the Buddha. From this fact (if we accept it so), this event must have happened relatively late, clearly in the second half of the Buddha’s ministry—that is, the “second period”²—when he has allowed other monks to ordain candidates on their own.

1.1.3 Who is Saddha?

1.1.3.1 Now that we have some idea of the relationship between Subhūti and Saddha [1.1.2.2], we can probe into further details of **who really is Saddha**. Here, Subhūti tells us that Saddha is the son of **Sudatta**, which is Anātha,piṇḍika’s real name³ [§1.2]. This is the name given in the Burmese reading, while all other other manuscripts give Saddha’s father the same name (*saddhassa upāsakassa putto*). This is unlikely because, as a rule, parents’ names are always differentiated from their children’s name.⁴

¹ See A:B 1861 n2213.

² On the 2 periods in the Buddha’s ministry, see SD 40a.1 (1.3).

³ On Anātha,piṇḍika, see **Anātha,piṇḍik’ovāda S** (M 143) @ SD 23.9(1).

⁴ Some well known examples are: **Rāhula,mātā**, Rāhula’s mother (J 1:145; DhA 2:189); **Sāri,putta**, son of Sāri (AA 1:155; PvA 79); **Māluṅkyā,putta**, son of Māluṅkyā (ThaA 2:170); **Nakula,pitā**, Nakula’s father & **Nakula,mātā**, Nakula’s mother (SA 2:249); **Sigāla,pitā**, Sigāla’s father (Tha 18) & **Sigāla,mātā**, Sigāla’s mother; **Todeyya,putta**, Todeyya’s son (DA 2:384; MA 3:443, 5:8) and **Gagga,mantānī,putta**, “son of Gagga and Mantānī,” Aṅgulimāla (M 86,13), SD 5.11.

1.1.3.2 If we are more technically inclined, we might propose that when a person's name is mentioned, the indeclinable "named" (*nāma*) follows the name.⁵ As such, instead of *sudattassa upāsakassa putto* here, we should have *sudattassa nāma upāsakassa putto* ("the son of the lay disciple named Sudatta"). However, this is not the rule.⁶ However, it is the rule when the noun following the name does not show any family relationship.⁷

There is no good reason to reject the Burmese reading here. Furthermore, as noted, it is unlikely that the son would have the very same name as the father. However, in this case, we can (and should if we prefer this reading) to translate *saddha* as an adjective. Then *saddhassa nāma upāsakassa putto*, "the son of a faithful lay disciple." But, from the context and commentary, this reading is not a convincing one. Anyway, the Commentary clearly says that Saddha is Anātha,piṇḍika's son [1.1.3.3].

1.1.3.3 The Sutta's commentary uses the name *sudatta* and specifically equates this with Anātha,piṇḍika: "This is said in connection with Anātha,piṇḍika" (*anātha,piṇḍikam sandhāy'āha*). And explains, "For, he [Saddha] is Anātha,piṇḍika's son, who has gone forth before his own younger uncle" (*anātha,piṇḍikassa hi putto attano cūla,pitu santike pabbajito*)," and then the elder Subhūti brings him before the Teacher (*atha nam subhūti-t,thero ādāya satthu santikam agamāsi*).⁸ (AA 5:82)

1.1.3.4 **The Giṇjak'āvasatha Sutta** (S 14.13), a discourse on personal inclination, mentions a monk named **Saddha Kaccāyana**.⁹ The Kaccāyana clan is brahmin, while Saddha, son of Anātha,piṇḍika, is from the merchant (*vessa*) class. So, with our currently available information, we can only say that they are very likely different individuals. It is however possible that Saddha Kaccāyana is identical with Sandha of **the Sandha Sutta** (A 11.9) [1.1.3.5].

1.1.3.5 **The Sandha Sutta** (A 11.9) records how a monk named Sandha approaches the Buddha who is residing in the brick house (*giṇjak'āvasatha*) at Nādikā¹⁰ [cf 1.1.3.4]. The Burmese text gives an alternate reading of Saddha to both the Sutta titles and the monk's name. Although the Sutta deals with meditation (in which our Saddha is good in), there is no other clues as to who Sandha really is. It is however possible that Sandha is the same as Saddha Kaccāyana of **the Giṇjak'āvasatha Sutta** (S 14.13).¹¹

1.2 KEY WORDS

1.2.1 *Apadāna*

1.2.1.1 *Apadāna* (Skt *avadāna*) has two main meanings:¹²

- (1) cutting off, break, (interruption), but the idiomatic sense was probable.
- (2) (a) of mowing, reaping, harvesting; → (b) harvest-work, mowed field; → (c) exploit, result, work, (esp meritorious act).

According to CPD, *apadāna* as used here in the (Saddha) Subhūti Sutta [§1], has the sense of 2(c). However, if we consider the context, it is less technical, and is best taken as **2(b)**, that is, the literal sense but is used here in the figurative sense.

⁵ Eg *aññatarissā brāhmaṇiyā brahma,devo nāma putto*, "a certain brahminee's son named Brahma,deva" (S 1:-140).

⁶ Eg *ayaṃ kho viṭatūbho senāpati rañño pasenadissa kosalassa*, "This general Viṭatūbha [Viḍūḍabha] is the son of Pasenadi, king of Kosala" (M 2:130). Or simply, we have *rañño...magha,devassa putto*, "king Makha,deva's son" (M 2:76-78 passim); *meṇḍakassa gahapatissa putto*, "the houselord Meṇḍaka's son."

⁷ Eg *govindassa brāhmaṇassa jotipālo nāma māṇavo putto ahosi*, "There is the son of the brahmin named Govinda, a brahmin youth named Joti,pāla: (D 2:230+231). However, in such a structure *nāma* is not always used, eg *ahaṃ kho so, deva, dīghītissa kosala,rañño putto dīghāvu kumāro*, "Indeed, your majesty, I'm prince Dīgh'āvu, the son of Dīghīti, the king of Kosala" (V 1:347+348).

⁸ *Sudattassa upāsakassa putto'ti anātha,piṇḍikam sandhāy'āha. Anātha,piṇḍikassa hi putto attano cūla,pitu santike pabbajito, atha nam subhūti-t,thero ādāya satthu santikam agamāsi* (AA 5:82).

⁹ S 14.13/2:153 f.

¹⁰ S 11.9/5:323-328.

¹¹ See DPPN sv Sandha.

¹² See *Critical Pali Dictionary* (CPD), sv *apadāna*.

1.2.1.2 Cone's *A Dictionary of Pali* (DP) is helpful here with this definition: "2. a person's "reaping"; (the result of) one's actions." This is attested in the suttas,¹³ that is to say, it is probably the oldest sense of the word.

Hence, in our Sutta context here [§1], we should take *apadāna* in its simple, almost literal sense of "reaping, harvest" used in a figurative sense of harvesting our good actions, or more technically, as the "fruits of recluseship" (*sāmañña,phala*), that is, the 3 trainings¹⁴ of a recluse and their benefits.¹⁵

1.2.1.3 *Apadāna* meaning "the story of the person's actions and their result" (DP) is a late usage, especially in such works as the *Apadāna* (Ap 241,21), which is a hagiography (scared stories of the past lives and action of the prominent Buddhist elders).

1.2.1.4 The commentary explains *saddhā'padāna* (*saddhā* + *apadāna*) as meaning, "in the characteristics or harvests [reaping] for persons with faith" (*saddhā'padānesūti saddhānam puggalānam apadānesu lakkhaṇesu* (AA 5:82). This confirms our surmise that the Buddha is alluding to the recluse's "3 trainings" [1.2.2.1]. We are reminded by the Buddha of the true purpose of renunciation, that is, not the reaping of worldly gains and pleasures, but of the harvesting of a cultivated body, a developed mind and liberating wisdom, as the bases for awakening and ending of suffering in this life itself.

1.2.2 Sandissati as "he fully sees for himself"

1.2.2.1 Another keyword of the (Saddha) Subhūti Sutta is *sandissati* (*saṃ*, "self or fully" + *dissati*, "he sees"), literally meaning "is seen together" or better, as in our Sutta context here, "sees fully for himself," in the sense of realizing the Dharma.¹⁶ Hence, we can comfortably render it into idiomatic English as "He sees the Dharma fully for himself" or even, "The Dharma is fully visible to him."

The passage, then, would be read, "But, Subhūti, this monk, the lay disciple Sudatta's son, who has gone forth from home to the homeless life out of faith—will he fully see for himself the harvests of (his) faith?" [§1.3]

1.2.2.2 An important, and better known, form of *sandissati* is its adjective, *sandiṭṭhika*, which means "visible here and now," or more fully, "self-realized fully here and now." This is one of the virtues or qualities of the Dharma.¹⁷

2 Sutta summary and highlights

2.0 The Sutta structure is simple: the monks Subhūti and Saddha meet the Buddha, who asks about Saddha [§1]. Then Buddha then admonishes him on 11 qualities that a monk should cultivate: this forms the bulk of the Sutta [§§2-12]. Subhūti then reprises the Buddha's teaching by declaring that these very same 11 qualities are all found in Saddha [§13]. A humorous enigmatic remark by the Buddha concludes the dialogue [§14].

2.1 The elder Subhūti brings the monks Saddha to see the Buddha, who asks for his name [§1.2]. Here we see, says the Sutta commentary, Buddha initiating the conversation,¹⁸ putting Saddha at ease.

2.2 Almost immediately, the Buddha then, playing on the monk Saddha's name, asks a sort of pointed question, "**Will he fully see for himself the harvest of (his) faith?**" (*Kacci pana...sandissati saddhā'padānesūti*) [§1.3]. The Buddha puns on the word *apadāna* [§1.2.1]. Subhūti at once sees this as an opportunity to hear the Dharma [§1.4].

2.3 The Buddha's admonition [§§2-12] is a free summary of the traditional three training famously called as "**the fruits of recluseship**" (*sāmañña,phala*) [§1.6 main header note]. The reason for this very simple, almost a casual, presentation will become obvious at the end of the Sutta. In fact, we already have

¹³ M 1:96,6 (MA 2:66,28); A 2:102,3 (AA 2:165,5); Tha 47, ThaA 3:204,31.

¹⁴ The 3 trainings (*ti,sikkhā*) are those of moral discipline (*sīla,sikkha*), of mental cultivation (*samādhi sikkhā*) and of wisdom (*paññā sikkhā*): see *Sīla samādhi paññā*, SD 21.6.

¹⁵ See SD 21.6 (12). For the full passages on *sāmañña,phala*, see (D 2,43-62/2:63-69), SD 8.10.

¹⁶ D 1:102, 2:75, 127; S 5:177; Sn 50.

¹⁷ See *Dhammānussati*, SD 15.9 (2.2).

¹⁸ Comy: "For the sake of initiating a conversation," *kathā,samuṭṭhān'attham* (DA 861,8)

the first hint in the Buddha's use of the word *apadāna*, which is clear from its context is used figuratively, that is, as "harvest."

2.4 This clearly suggests the fruit of a task: we can at once see its connection with the "fruits" (*phala*) of recluseship. There are these 11 "harvests" of an arhat,¹⁹ an abridged version of the "fruits of recluseship".²⁰

(1) A monk should be morally virtuous: this is straightforwardly defined by a stock passage [§2.1 n].

(2) He should have wide learning [§3], also a pericope.

(3) He should be a spiritual friend [§4], very briefly stated: the usual stock is much longer.

(4) He should be amenable [§5], defined by a pericope.

(5) He should be deft and diligent [§6], defined by a pericope.

(6) He should love the Dharma [§7], defined by a pericope.

(7) He should exert effort [§8], defined by a pericope.

(8) He should be a dhyana-attainer [§9], defined by a pericope. In the **Nātha Sutta** (A 10.17), the **Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 33) and the **Das'uttara Sutta** (D 34), however, this quality is replaced by that of "contentment" (*santuṭṭhi*).²¹

(9) He should be able to recollect his own past lives [§10], defined by a pericope. In the **Nātha Sutta** (A 10.17), the **Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 33) and the **Das'uttara Sutta** (D 34), however, this quality is replaced by that of "mindfulness" (*sati*).²²

(10) He should be able to recollect the past lives of others [§11], defined by a pericope. In the **Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 33) and the **Das'uttara Sutta** (D 34), however, this quality is replaced by that of "mindfulness" (*sati*).²³

(11) He should be one with influxes destroyed [§12], defined by a pericope. Subhūti then declares that Saddha has gained the "harvest of faith," confirming that Saddha is an arhat [§13.2]. In the **Nātha Sutta** (A 10.17), the **Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 33) and the **Das'uttara Sutta** (D 34), however, this quality is replaced by that of "wisdom" (*paññā*).²⁴

2.4 Clearly, the 10 "qualities that provides one with protection" (*nātha, karaṇa dhamma*) are not those of an arhat, but for "general practice," that is, for one who is not yet an arhat, but for anyone, even a lay follower who loves the Dharma, but has no attainments at all.

2.5 As soon as the Buddha concludes his admonition, Subhūti declares that Saddha, in fact, has all those qualities [§13]. This is Subhūti's lion-roar (*sīha, nāda*), an exultation of spiritual courage, supremacy and joy.²⁵

2.6 THE BUDDHA'S CLOSING REMARK

2.6.1 The Buddha then closes the whole dialogue with enigmatic statement, one of subtle humour and transcendental play, thus, "...And, Subhūti, when you wish to see the 'thus come' (*yathāgataṃ*), you should approach with this monk Saddha to see the 'thus gone' (*tathāgataṃ*)" [§14]. The Pali for this correlative sentence²⁶ is *Yadā ca tvam subhūti ākaṅkheyyāsi yathāgataṃ²⁷ dassanāya, iminā saddhe-na bhikkhunā saddhim upasaṅkameyyāsi tathāgataṃ dassanāyāti*. Here, although only the Burmese text

¹⁹ The first 7 "harvests" are identical to those of the first 7 virtues "that provides one with protection" (*nātha, karaṇa dhamma*). Only the last 3 differ: see ad loc below here.

²⁰ For the full list of "fruits of recluseship," see **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,43-62/2:63-69), SD 8.10

²¹ **Nātha S** (A 10.17/23-26), **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,3.3(1)/3:267) & **Das'uttara S** (D 34,2.3(1)/3:290).

²² **Nātha S** (A 10.17/23-26), **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,3.3(1)/3:267) & **Das'uttara S** (D 34,2.3(1)/3:290).

²³ **Nātha S** (A 10.17/23-26), **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,3.3(1)/3:267) & **Das'uttara S** (D 34,2.3(1)/3:290).

²⁴ **Nātha S** (A 10.17/23-26), **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,3.3(1)/3:267) & **Das'uttara S** (D 34,2.3(1)/3:290).

²⁵ See SD 36.10 (3).

²⁶ Otherwise called *yam tam* sentence, where the former half has a form of *yam*, while the latter half has a *tam* counterpart. See A K Warder, *Introduction to Pali*, 2nd ed 1974:71 f, 296 f, 301 (or see index); also G A Tubb & R Boose, *Scholastic Sanskrit*, NY, 2007:262 f (2.56.3).

²⁷ Ce Ee Se *tathāgataṃ*; Be *yathāgataṃ*.

has *yathāgata* in the first instance, while the other manuscripts read *tathāgata* (thus reading the same for the object of the two correlative halves of the sentence).

Even then, the Burmese reading is preferable, following the *lectio difficilior potior* (Latin for “the more difficult reading is the stronger”) rule, that is, the more difficult passage is likely to be the right or better one. This is not an ordinary sentence; in fact, it is found only here (so it is a hapax legomenon, a unique reading). It is a wordplay often found in Pali, not only showing a touch of humour, but the fullness and immediacy of the Dharma, and this Dharma is here exemplified in the Buddha himself.

2.6.2 But, let us look at the more popular reading (*tathāgataṃ...tathāgataṃ*), as found in the European, Siamese, and Sinhalese readings. Bodhi follows this reading, and renders it as “[Y]ou may dwell together with this bhikkhu Saddha, and when you want to see the Tathāgata, you may bring him along.”²⁸ Firstly, the verb “dwell” is neither found nor implied in the original Pali. [1.2.3.1]

Secondly, the sentence structure is too complicated for a straightforward sentence such as, “When you want to see the Tathagata, you may bring him along” or something to that effect. The point is simple enough: why would the Buddha make such an apparently frivolous remark? Unfortunately, the Commentary is silent here, too.

2.6.3 The Buddha’s closing sentence “...And, Subhūti, when you wish to see the ‘thus come’ (*yathāgata*), you should approach with this monk Saddha to see the ‘thus gone’ (*tathāgata*)”²⁹ [§14] has a profound sense of transcendental humour. It is also the Buddha’s joyful approval (*attamaṇā...abhinandunī*)³⁰ of the fact that Saddha has attained arhathood.

2.6.4 The term *yathāgata* can also be taken as an idiom for “the path,” as in the **Kimsuka Sutta** (S 35.245),³¹ where we see *yathāgata magga*, “the path thus come,” (that is, the path by which we have arrived at nirvana), and this is, of course, the noble eightfold path (SA 3:63; DhsA 153, 154).

Hence, we can take *yathāgata* as alluding to the eightfold path, or even the Dharma. In other words, the Buddha is telling Subhūti that if he wishes to see the path or the Dharma, visit him (the Buddha), and bring Saddha, too, since he is Subhūti’s pupil.

2.6.5 Here, both *yathāgata* and *tathāgata* are effectively synonyms, since we can take the suffix of both terms as *āgato*, “has come,” or as *gato*, “gone.” So we can translate either correlative pair of terms as “thus come” or as “thus gone.” In that case, we have a tautology. However, the sentence structure is remarkable and presents a play or sport (*kīlā*) of the awakened mind.³²

3 Subhūti

3.1 SUBHŪTI’S LIVES

3.1.1 Padumuttara Buddha’s time

3.1.1.1 Hagiographical accounts of Subhūti are found in the commentaries to the Aṅguttara, to the Udāna and to the Thera, gāthā.³³ According to the commentaries, 100,000 aeons ago, in the time of Padum’uttara Buddha,³⁴ Subhūti was born in Hamsa, vaṭī as the brahmin youth Nanda, the only son of a brahmin “of great halls” (*mahā, sāla*), of immense wealth. In due course, he renounced as an ascetic (*tāpasa*) with a large group of other youths, following the seer (*isī*) tradition.

²⁸ A:B 2012:1573.

²⁹ Cf “Just as he has come, so he is gone” (*yathāgato tathāgato*, Pv 87 = Thī 130 = J 364/165, v728). On the polysemy (multiple meanings) of *tathāgata*. see SD 15.7 (2.4).

³⁰ This is in the past tense, usu in ref the audience “joyfully approving” of the Buddha’s teaching: see eg **Anatta Lakkhaṇa S** (S 22.59,23), SD 1.2. However, clearly here in **Subhūti S** (A 11.15,14), we see the Buddha’s tacit joyful approval of Saddha’s awakening.

³¹ S 35.245/4:195 @ SD 53.10.

³² For more elaborate examples of such transcendental wordplay, see **Mahā Gosīṅga** (M 32) where the arhats and Ānanda (a streamwinner) propose their vision of an “ideal monk” (M 32), SD 44.12.

³³ AA 1:220-223; UA 348 f; ThaA 19-31. The last source gives the most details.

³⁴ Padum’uttara (“the lotus of the supreme state”) is the 13th buddha since Taṇhānkara, or the 15th before our Gotama. See SD 36.2 (3.4.3).

Practising meditation, became a dhyana-attainer (AA 1:221; ThaA 1:20). He attained the first 5 super-knowledges³⁵ and the 8 attainments,³⁶ but, unlike his friends, failed to attain arhathood. (AA 1:221)

3.1.1.2 In due course, on meeting Padum’uttara Buddha and hearing him teach, he was deeply inspired by him. He gave him excellent fruits, and a cushion of flowers for him to sit in the attainment of cessation (ThaA 1:22). Subsequently, he saw the Buddha declaring a disciple as being the foremost of those who dwell in non-conflict and of those who are worthy of merit-offerings. He too aspired to the same two foremost positions under a future Buddha. (AA 1:222; UA 348; ThaA 1:23) [3.2.1.2]

In the time of Kassapa Buddha (the Buddha just before ours), Subhūti was a forest monk (*āraññaka*), but somehow did not awaken (ThaA 1:23). In his subsequent lives, Subhūti continued to build up his karmic merits, and also enjoyed the fruits of his good karma, such as being born a number of times in Tāvātimsa heaven, and numerous lives in this world as a world monarch. Finally, in his last birth, as a human, he met our Buddha. (ThaA 1:24)

3.1.2 His last life

3.1.2.1 In our Buddha’s time, he was reborn into a wealthy family of Sāvattthī, as the only son of the seth, Sumana, the younger brother of Anātha,piṇḍika (original name, Sudatta), and he was named Subhūti (ThaA 1:24). While the Buddha was residing in Rājagaha, he witnessed how his uncle Anātha,piṇḍika, on his very first seeing the Buddha in the Cool Forest (*sīta,vana*), became a streamwinner, and then donated a park monastery in Jeta’s grove (*jeta,vana*) to him.³⁷ (This was in the first year of the Buddha’s ministry, when he was residing in Rājagaha, the capital of Magadha.) (AA 1:223)

3.1.2.2 On the monastery dedication day (*vihāra,maha.divase*), Subhūti accompanied Anātha,piṇḍika to the event and witnessed it. The Thera,gāthā commentary presents him then as the head of his household (*kuṭumbika*). Hearing the Buddha teaching, his past good karma ripens and he decides to renounce the world. (ThaA 1:24; AA 1:223).

3.2 SUBHŪTI’S PRACTICE AND SIGNIFICANCE

3.2.1 His meditation

3.2.1.1 After joining the order, Subhūti masters the “two matrices” (*dve,mātikā*)³⁸ and takes up meditation. Then he leaves for the forest to practise. Cultivating insight based on “metta dhyana,” he attains arhathood,³⁹ attaining all the 6 superknowledges (*cha-l-abhiññā*),⁴⁰ an arhat in full colours. (UA 348)

³⁵ *Abhiññā*: see (3.2.1.1), see n on “superknowledges.”

³⁶ The 8 attainments (*aṭṭha samāpatti*) comprise the 4 dhyanas and the 4 formless attainments: see (**Anupubba**) **Vihāra S 1** (A 9.32), SD 95.1 & SD 8.4 (12.3). On form dhyanas, see **Dhyana**, SD 8.4. On formless dhyanas, see **Jhāna Pañha S 1** (S 40.1) @ SD 24.11 (5)..

³⁷ Vinaya gives details (V 2:154-159).

³⁸ Basically, the *mātikā* (pl) are systematic lists of Dharma teachings and practices. It occurs in late texts: D 2:125, x2, **Mahā Gopalaka S** (M 33/1:221, 223); **Pāpaṇika S 2** (A 3.20/1:117), **Sugata Vinaya S** (A 4.150/2:147+148, **Mahā’padesa S** (A 4.180/2:169×2), **Saddhamma Sammosa S 3** (A 5.156/3:179+180), (**Dhamma**) **Ānanda S** (A 6.51/3:361+362), **Sen’āsana S** (A 10.11/5:16), **Go,pālaka S** (A 11.18/5:349+352). **Vinaya** mentions *dhamma,dhārā vinaya,dhārā mātikā,dhārā* (Mahā,vagga, V 1:339+340; Cūla,vagga, V 2:98; also Miln 344). Comys often gloss *mātikā,dhārā* as *dve,mātikā,dhārā*, “experts in the 2 matrices,” such as saying that those gone forth, having taken up higher ordination, go on to familiarise themselves with these 2 matrices (*pabbajito upasampanno dve,mātikā paguṇā katvā*): DA 3:749; MA 1:234; SA 2:55; AA 1:85. Or, that it refers to the “Dharma expert” (*dhamma,dhara*) and the “Vinaya expert” (*vinaya,dhara*) (AA 2:289); so does Subcomy (*tesaṃ yeva dhamma,vinayānaṃ mātikāya dhāraṇena mātikā,dhārā*, AAT:Be 3:116). Comy also identifies *dve,mātikā* as the “two Patimokkhas,” ie those of the monks and of the nuns (*mātikā,dhārāti dve,pātimokkha,dhārā*, AA 3:382). The Subcomy agrees, but adds that it includes “the matrices of the Vinaya and the Abhidhamma” (*Dve,mātikā,dhārāti bhikkhu,bhikkhuni,mātikā,vasena dve,mātikā,dhārāti vadanti, vinayābhidhamma,mātikā,dhārāti yuttaṃ*, AAT:Be 2:89). We see an evolution in word usage here. See Vism:Ñ 91 n9; Warder, *Indian Buddhism*, 1980:218-224; Hinuber, *A Handbook of Pāli Literature*, 1996:65; Gethin, *The Buddhist Path to Awakening*, 2001:276-279.

³⁹ ThaA 1:14; *Vipassanaṃ vaḍḍhetvā mettā,jhānaṃ pādakaṃ katvā arahattaṃ pāpuni* (AA 1:223).

⁴⁰ UA 348; cf 161. The 6 superknowledges or direct knowledges (*cha-l-abhiññā*) are (1) psychic powers (*iddhi,vidhā*); (2) the divine ear (*dibba,sota*) or clairaudience; (3) mind-reading (*paracitta,vijānana,ñāṇa*); (4) recollection

This means that, using lovingkindness (*mettā*), he attains dhyana to calm himself (ie, remove the mental hindrances), and in due course, after he has mastered the calmness, after emerging from such clear bliss, he directs his mind to cultivating insight wisdom. This method is described in **the (Yuga,naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta** (A 4.170) as the practice of “insight preceded by calm” (*samatha,pubb’āṅgama vipassanā*).⁴¹

3.2.1.2 The commentaries say that Subhūti is in the habit of attaining “lovingkindness dhyana” (*mettā,jhāna*), emerges from it, and then goes on his almsround, effusing lovingkindness wherever he goes. The people in such areas benefit from the lovingkindness and enjoy non-conflict (*araṇa*), and joyfully offer him alms, thus accumulating great merit that way. (ThaA 1:24).

The Peta,vatthu Commentary actually equates the two, glossing that “dwelling in non-conflict” is “abiding in lovingkindness” (*araṇa,vihārīti mettā,vihārī*, PvA 230,14).

On account of this dual practice (*karana,dvaya*), he is declared to be **the foremost of the monks** who dwelt in non-conflict (*araṇa,vihārīnam*) [3.2.2] and of monks who are worthy of gifts (*dakkhineyyānam*).⁴² Thus, his aspirations in the time of the Buddha Padum’uttara have been fulfilled. [3.1.1.2]

3.2.2 *Araṇa,vihārī*

3.2.2.1 **The Araṇa Vibhaṅga Sutta** (M 139) gives the most prominent mention of Subhūti. Near the very end of the Sutta, when the Buddha has finished explaining the significance of “non-conflict,” he declares,

Therefore, bhikshus, you should train yourself thus: “We will know a state of conflict and we will know a state of non-conflict, and knowing these, we will follow the way of non-conflict.”

Now, bhikshus, the householder’s son, **Subhūti**, is one who has followed the way of non-conflict. (M 139,14/3:236), SD 7.8

The commentary on Sutta says that when Subhūti teaches the Dharma, he is not interested in the differences amongst individuals but simply teaches: “This is a wrong course; this is the right course.” (MA 5:31). In other words, he speaks harmoniously for the benefit of all those he associates with. In this sense, he is one “who dwells in non-conflict” (*araṇa,vihārī*).⁴³

3.2.2.2 Semantically, the word *araṇa* (*a*, negative prefix + *raṇa*, “conflict (external or internal), defilement”) means peace, solitude (both internal and external). Here, *araṇa,vihāra* means a remote dwelling (in an abstract sense): it applies to a person, that is, one free of both external or internal strife or conflict, who is in harmony with others by his personal nature, as well as by the way he communicates with others.

The Vibhaṅga says that the aggregate of feeling (*vedanā-k,khandha*) is twofold: *sa,raṇa* and *araṇa* (Vbh 19 f), that is, “with defilement” and “without defilement,” respectively.⁴⁴ The Sutta commentary says that *araṇa* means “free from passion or defilements (*kilesa*).”⁴⁵

3.2.3 *Dve,matikā*

3.2.3.1 The commentaries on Subhūti mention that he, “having ordained, familiarized himself with the two matrices” (*so upasampajjitvā dve mātīkā paguṇā katvā*).⁴⁶ In later works, it refers to a table of contents that summarizes the text’s key topics. Later still, during the Abhidhamma period, it is used to refer to the summary of Abhidhamma. The *mātīkā* of the Dhamma,saṅgaṇī, for example, serves as a summary of the whole Abhidhamma Piṭaka.

of past lives (*pubbe,nivāsānussati,ñāṇa*), or retrocognition; (5) the divine eye (*dibba,cakkhu*), or knowledge of karma; and (6) the knowledge of the destruction of the mental influxes (*āsava-k,khaya,ñāṇa*): see SD 27.5a esp (5).

⁴¹ A 4.170,3.2 @ SD 41.5.

⁴² A 1:24; MA 5:31 f; AA 1:223.

⁴³ PvA glosses *araṇa,vihārī* as “one dwelling in lovingkindness” (*mettā,vihārī*) (PvA 230,14).

⁴⁴ See BHSD under *araṇa* and *raṇa*.

⁴⁵ MA 5:32; cf AA 1:220, SA 1:101, *nikkilesa*. See **Araṇa Vibhaṅga S** (M 139,2), SD 7.8.

⁴⁶ ThaA 1:24; AA 1:223, *so upasampanno dve mātīkā paguṇā katvā*.

Understandably, the term “two matrices” (*dve,mātikā* or *dve,mātikā*) here, applied to Subhūti, is problematic. We will here try to identify its meaning or likely usage here. In its earliest usage, a *mātikā* (singular) is essentially a matrix or systematic list of Dharma teachings and practices. [3.2.3.5]

3.2.3.2 One fully familiar with the matrices is said to be a *mātikā,dhara*, “a matrix expert.” The earliest occurrences of this term are in the following texts (all of which are probably late, or had the term interpolated later), where they all refer to “the Dharma, the Vinaya, the summaries” (*dhamma...vinaya...mātikā*):

Mahā Parinibbāna Sutta	D 16,4.10/2:125 ×2	SD 9
Mahā Gopalaka Sutta	M 33,9/1:221+223	SD 52.6
Pāpaṇika Sutta 2	A 3.20/1:117	SD 37.2b
Sugata Vinaya Sutta	A 4.160/2:147+148	SD 6.7
Mahā’padesa Sutta	A 4.180/2:169×2	SD 3.1(2.2)
Saddhamma Sammosa Sutta 3	A 5.156/3:179+180	SD 6.7
(Dhamma) Ānanda Sutta	A 6.51/3:361+362	SD 92.4
Sen’āsana Sutta	A 10.11/5:16	SD 96.5
Go,pālaka Sutta	A 11.18/5:349+352	SD 41.2

The Vinaya mentions *dhamma,dhārā vinaya,dhārā mātikā,dhārā*, “Dharma experts, Vinaya experts, Summary experts,” in the Mahā,vagga (V 1:339+340) and the Cūla,vagga (V 2:98). This phrase is also found in the **Milinda,pañha** (Miln 344).

3.2.3.3 The Commentaries often gloss *mātikā,dharā* as *dve,mātikā,dharā*, “experts in the 2 matrices,” and remark that “one gone forth, having taken up higher ordination, goes on to familiarize himself with these 2 matrices” (*pabbajito upasampanno dve,mātikā paguṇā katvā*).⁴⁷ Sometimes, only two kinds are mentioned, that is, the “Dharma expert” (*dhamma,dhara*) and the “Vinaya expert” (*vinaya,dhara*) (AA 2:289).⁴⁸

3.2.3.4 The Commentaries sometimes also identify *dve,mātikā* as the “two Patimokkhas,” that is, those of the monks and of the nuns (*mātikā,dharāti dve,pātimokkha,dharā*, AA 3:382). The Subcommentary agrees, but adds that it includes “the matrices of the Vinaya and the Abhidhamma.”⁴⁹ This sense only applies when the order of nuns has been formed. Subhūti joins the order during the first years of the Buddha’s ministry, when the order of nuns has not yet been formed. Hence, this sense of *dve,mātikā* does not apply here.

3.2.3.5 As Subhūti becomes a monk during the first year of the ministry, which is clearly within its “first period,”⁵⁰ In other words, his is a time before the formation of the Abhidhamma [3.2.4.1]; before the institution of the Pātimokkha and order of nuns is founded [3.2.4.2]; and also before the teachings are standardized in any way, as in the suttas as we have them today. This is still a time better reflected by the older sections of, for example, the Sutta Nipāta.⁵¹

In other words, we do not even have systematic doctrines such as those of the “7 sets,”⁵² or those recurrent in the **Niddesa** (an ancient commentary on the Sutta Nipāta),⁵³ or even the famous 10 questions of the Kumāra,pañha (Khp 2), or of the Mahā,pañhā (A 5:48-54, also 54-59).⁵⁴

⁴⁷ DA 3:749; MA 1:234; SA 2:55; AA 1:85.

⁴⁸ The Subcom, however, speaks of the three of them (*tesam yeva dhamma,vinayānaṃ mātikāya dhāraṇena mātikā,dharā*, AAṬ:Be 3:116).

⁴⁹ *Dve,mātikā,dharāti bhikkhu,bhikkhuni,mātikā,vasena dve,mātikā,dharāti vadanti, vinayābhidhamma,mātikā.-dharāti yuttam* (AAṬ:Be 2:89).

⁵⁰ On the 2 periods in the Buddha’s ministry, see (1.1.2.2) n on “second period.”

⁵¹ Such as **Khagga,visāṇa S** (Sn 1.3); **Muni S** (Sn 1.12); **Aṭṭhaka,vagga** (Sn 4.1-16) and **Pārāyana,vagga** (Sn 5.2-18). These texts do not give any well-formed or systematic doctrines, and the teachings tend to be intuitive, even poetic and spontaneous, and the textual language less organized (but no less, indeed even more, beautiful) than in the suttas.

⁵² The 7 sets are (1) the 4 focuses of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*); (2) the 4 right efforts (*samma-p,paḍhāna*); (3) the 4 paths to spiritual power (*iddhi,pāda*); (4) the 5 spiritual faculties (*indriya*); (5) the 5 spiritual powers (*bala*); (6) the

The kind of Dharma that Subhūti learns and benefits from is not even the “Dharma-Vinaya” that is soon to follow, and which is well known in the suttas. In fact, we may say that there is no *dve,mātikā* of any kind in that first year of the Buddha’s ministry. The *dve,mātikā* gloss is a pious commentarial supposition, written centuries later.

Indeed, it may even be said that, useful as the suttas we have them today, their benefit is only realized when we are diligent in understanding their message and put them into committed practice by way of the 3 trainings.⁵⁵ As for what made Subhūti an arhat is not a structured Dharma, but a Dharma that is “deconstructed,” even “pre-constructed.”

3.2.3.6 We clearly see an evolution in meaning and usage of *mātikā* and its related terms. The following references should be consulted for further study of the term *mātikā*:

Ñānamoli (tr), *The Path of Purification* [1956], 4th ed 1979: Vism:Ñ 91 n9.

A K Warder, “*The Mātikā*,” intro essay to *Mohavicchedānī*, London, 1961:xix-xxvii.

—, *Indian Buddhism*, 1980:218-224.

F Watanabe, *Philosophy and Its Development in the Nikāyas and Abhidhamma*, 1983:42-67.

Oskar von Hinüber, *A Handbook of Pāli Literature*, 1996:65

R Gethin, *The Buddhist Path to Awakening*, 2001:276-279.

3.2.4 As a great elder. As one of the first **80 great elders** (*asīti māhā,thera*), he is ranked as no 41, after Rādha but before Aṅgulimāla. If we accept the commentarial listing of these great elders as being chronological, then we may have some idea of the time of Subhūti’s renunciation and attaining arhat-hood.⁵⁶ We can then surmise that he attained arhathood in the 20th year (the date of Aṅgulimāla’s conversion)⁵⁷ or just before that, but perhaps not before Rādha’s renunciation.

3.3 SUBHŪTI IN MAHĀYĀNA. Subhūti is given a very prominent place in Mahāyāna literature, such as the Lotus Sutra, where he is said to become a Buddha after his arhathood! This is clearly an innovation and deviation from early Buddhism, one that reinvents an “inferior-vehicle” (*hīnayāna*) arhat, making him one of the leading spokesmen for the Mahāyāna philosophy, narrative and ideology, especially for debunking the Hīnayāna (“inferior vehicle” that teaches arhathood as the highest spiritual goal.⁵⁸

Clearly, the arhats of the Lotus Sutra and similar Mahāyāna texts are not the historical saints of the Buddha’s teachings. They are the projections of the Mahāyāna mind and serves to legitimize new ideas and agenda.⁵⁹ If this is the case, the magnitude of its unwholesome karma would be unimaginable; for, they would be those

who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—after death, when the body has broken up, have re-appeared in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell.

(D 2,97/1:82 = M 4,29/1:22 f = 36,38/1:248 = 100,37/2:212 = S 28.14,36d/5:280)

7 awakening-factors (*bojjihaṅga*); and (7) the noble eightfold path (*ariy’atth’āṅgika magga*) (D 29,16-18/3:127 f), SD 40a.6. Together they form the famous 37 “limbs of awakening” (*bodhi,pakkhiya dhamma*): for details, see also SD 10.1 (1).

⁵³ **Niddesa** repeatedly admonish us to be skilled (*kusala*) in the aggregates (*khandha*), the sense-bases (*āyatana*), the elements (*dhātu*), dependent arising (*paticca,samuppāda*), the focuses of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*), the right efforts (*samma-p,padhāna*), the path to spiritual power (*iddhi,pāda*), the spiritual faculties (*indriya*), the powers (*bala*), the awakening-factors (*bojjihaṅga*), the path (*magga*), the fruits (*phala*), and nirvana (*nibbāna*) (Nm 69, 71 f, 171): see Gethin 2001:279 n46.

⁵⁴ **Kumāra,pañha** (Khp 2); **Mahā,pañha S 1** (A 10.27/5:48-54), **Mahā,pañhā S 2** (A 10.28/5:54-59). See Gethin 2001:279 n47.

⁵⁵ On the 3 trainings, see **Sīla samādhi paññā**, SD 21.6.

⁵⁶ For the traditional list of the **80 great elders** (ThaA 3:205), see SD 15.10a (7).

⁵⁷ AA 2:125; Jinakālamālī 29-35; cf BA 3. See SD 5.11 (1).

⁵⁸ The idea of new roles given to old heroes is a common theme in literature, even religious hagiography. See **Upāya, skillful means**, SD 30.8 (6.2.1).

⁵⁹ See eg **How Buddhism became Chinese**, SD 40b.

4 Teachings related to Subhūti

4.1 THE (SADDHA) SUBHŪTI SUTTA

4.1.1 Apparently, there are only two suttas (besides the Subhūti Thera, gāthā, Tha 1) [4.1.2], connected with Subhūti (that is, bearing his name). The first is **the (Saddha) Subhūti Sutta** (A 11.15), and the second is **the (Udāna) Subhūti Sutta** [4.2]. Both these Suttas speak on meditation prowess: the former on that of Saddha’s and the latter on Subhūti’s ability.

4.1.2 The (Saddha) Subhūti Sutta (A 11.15) presents Saddha, like Subhūti, as an adept in attaining of the 4 dhyanas. Of Saddha’s meditation skill, the Sutta records Subhūti as saying,

This monk [Saddha], bhante, is a **dhyana-attainer**: attaining at will, without trouble, without difficulty, the 4 dhyanas, the higher minds, and dwelling happily here and now. [§13 (8)]

Saddha is an accomplished dhyana-attainer (*jhāna, lābhī*), meaning that he can easily attain to and remain, with ease, any of the 8 attainments (*aṭṭha samāpatti*), that is, the 4 form dhyanas and the 4 formless attainments.⁶⁰

There is another quality the Sutta mentions which further supports the fact that Saddha is a good meditator and is able to teach others, too. This is the fact he is also a “spiritual friend” (*kalyāṇa, mitta*)⁶¹ [§4], a fact endorsed by Subhūti [§13 (3)].

4.2 THE (UDĀNA) SUBHŪTI SUTTA (U 6.7)

4.2.0 The Udāna has a sutta where the Buddha holds up Subhūti as an ideal meditator and an arhat who enjoys the formless attainments. **The (Udāna) Subhūti Sutta** (U 6.7) records Subhūti as attaining his goal of arhathood by “perceiving the formless” (*arūpa, saññī*).⁶² **The Udāna commentary** recounts the prelude to the teaching of this Sutta.

One day, when Subhūti emerged from his day-rest in the evening, he went to the vihara compound and saw the Buddha teaching to the fourfold congregation.⁶³ So he sat under a certain tree not far from the Buddha and, and having determined his meditation duration, went into the “attainment of cessation.”⁶⁴ His intention was that, on emerging from his meditation, to pay his respects to the Buddha at the end of his teaching. The phrase “at that time” below refers to this very occasion. (UA 348)

SD 45.1(4.2)

(Udāna) Subhūti Sutta

The (Udāna) Discourse on Subhūti | U 6.7/57/71

Traditional: U 6.1 = Khuddaka Nikāya, Udāna 6, Jaccandha Vagga 1

Theme: The arhat Subhūti in meditation

1 Thus have I heard.

At one time, the Blessed One was residing at Anātha, piṇḍaka’s park monastery in Jeta’s grove outside Sāvathī.

2 Now, at that time,⁶⁵ the venerable Subhūti was sitting not far away from the Blessed One,⁶⁶ keeping his legs crossed⁶⁷ and his body upright,⁶⁸

⁶⁰ See (3.1.1.1) n on “the 8 attainments.”

⁶¹ A 11.15.4+13/5:338, 341 @ SD 45.1. On spiritual friendship, see **Spiritual friendship: A textual study**, SD 34.1.

⁶² U 6.7/71, SD 44.1b.

⁶³ “The fourfold congregation” or “the 4 assemblies” (*catu, parisa*), ie, the monks (*bhikkhu*), the nuns (*bhikkhunī*), the laymen (*upāsaka*) and the laywomen (*upāsikā*): see **Mahā, parinibbāna S** (D 16,3.7-8), SD 9.

⁶⁴ More fully, “the cessation of perception and feeling,” *saññā, vedayita nirodha*. This anomalous state, fully described in **Visuddhi, magga** (Vism 23.16-52/702-709), is a combination of deep meditative calm and insight where all mental states temporarily shut down (Vism 23.43/707 f): see SD 23.7 (2) & SD 30.2 (3).

⁶⁵ See (4.2.0) here.

2.2 having attained to thoughtfree samadhi.⁶⁹

3 The Blessed One saw the venerable Subhūti *sitting not far away from him, keeping his legs crossed and his body upright, having attained to thoughtfree samadhi.*

4 Then, the Blessed One, knowing the significance, on the occasion, uttered this udana [inspired utterance]:⁷⁰

*Yassa vitakkā vidhūpitā⁷¹
ajjhataṃ suvikappitā asesā
taṃ saṅgam aticca arūpa,saññī
catu,yogātigato na jātum etīti⁷⁵*

Whose thoughts have burnt out,⁷²
internally well shorn (of thoughts)⁷³ without remains,
going beyond bondage,⁷⁴ perceiving the formless, he
has gone beyond the four yokes,⁷⁶ comes not to birth.

— evaṃ —

4.2.1 “Having attained to thoughtfree samadhi” (*avitakkaṃ samādhim samāpajjitvā*) [§2.2 here] specifically applies to the fact that the arhat Subhūti is an adept dhyana-attainer. His pupil Saddha, too, is an accomplished dhyana-attainer [§9 below]. Here, in **the (Udāna) Subhūti Sutta**, however, the Buddha

⁶⁶ The usual satipatthana pericope here is: ...*nisīdati, pallaṅkaṃ ābhujitvā, ujum kāyaṃ paṇidhāya, parimukhaṃ satim upaṭṭhapetvā*. At §2.2, instead of *parimukhaṃ satim upaṭṭhapetvā*, “having established mindfulness before him,” we have **avitakkaṃ samādhim samāpannaṃ**, “having attained thoughtfree samadhi.” Although technically here “thoughtfree samadhi” (*avitakka samādhi*), as a rule, refers to the first dhyana, from the Sutta context, it refers to Subhūti’s meditation as a whole, ie, he has attained to the formless attainments, too. As a set, the 4 dhyanas and the 4 formless attainments are called the “8 attainments” (*aṭṭha samāpatti*): see SD 8.4 (12.3). On form dhyanas, see **Dhyana**, SD 8.4. On formless dhyanas, see **Jhāna Pañha S 1** (S 40.1) @ SD 24.11 (5). Cf the 8 liberations (*aṭṭha vimokkha*): **Mahānidāna S** (D 15,35/2:70 f), SD 5.17.

⁶⁷ “Sitting cross-legged” (*pallaṅkaṃ ābhujitvā*) here helps one to spread one’s body weight over the greatest area, thereby reducing tiredness so that one can focus better on the meditation. This is the prescribed posture for breath meditation which is best done in the sitting posture.

⁶⁸ “Keeping his body upright” (*ujum kāyaṃ paṇidhāya*). This is mainly for the sake of warding off discomfort and pain after a long sitting. Imagine a pendulum or plumb line hanging from just below one’s skull with the pendulum ball hanging inside the belly. When one bends too far forward, or one sits leaning too far back, the pendulum hangs outside the body—the centre of gravity is outside the body. When one’s centre of gravity is outside the body, it tires more quickly.

⁶⁹ *Avitakkaṃ samādhim samāpajjitvā*. This line is not found in the usu dhyana pericope, which apparently applies ordinary dhyana [4.2.1]. The term “**thoughtfree samadhi**” (*avitakka samādhi*), says Comy, is a characteristic of all dhyanas from the 2nd upwards and including the 4 formless attainments. However, here it specifically refers to the 4th-dhyana-based (*catuttha-jjhāna,pādaka*; UA 188) samadhi of the fruition of arhathood (*arahatta,phala,samādhi*) (UA 348).

⁷⁰ *Atha kho bhagavā etam atthaṃ viditvā tāyaṃ velāyaṃ imaṃ udānaṃ udānesi*.

⁷¹ Lines ab as at **Uraga S** (Sn 7ab), where see Comy; also Sn:N 190 n7.

⁷² *Vidhūpitā*, “burnt out,” *vi + dhū + pita* (pp of *vidhūpeti*, “to fumigate, diffuse, scatter, destroy”), lit “smoked out” (UA 348), got rid of by fumigation, often said of thoughts (*vitakka*). Cf *dhūpa*, “incense.” Comy: (*vidhūpitā ’ti daḍḍha*, SnA 409,29 as Sn 472b); cf Tha:N 196 n488. See U 6.7,4 @ SD 45.1(4.2).

⁷³ “Well shorn (of thoughts),” *su-vi-kappita* from √KLP, to trim, cut (SED, sv; where we have *kalpanī*, “scissors, shears”). Comy eg “For, *kappita* is said to be that which “has been cut” (*chinnam hi happitan ti vuccati*) (SnA 21,8).

⁷⁴ “Bondage,” *saṅga*. Comys gloss as “the 5 bonds,” viz, those of lust, hate, delusion, conceit and views (*Tattha saṅgāti rāga,saṅgo dosa,moha,māna,diṭṭhi,saṅgo ’ti pañca,vidhā ’pi saṅgā*) (UA 73) [4.2.4].

⁷⁵ Ee Se UA *na jātimetīti*. Comy notes the possible alternatives readings of *na...jātum eti* (“comes not to be born”) and *na...jātim eti* (“comes not for birth”) (UA 349).

⁷⁶ “The 4 yokes,” *catu,yoga*, ie **the 4 influxes** (*āsava*), viz: those of (1) sense-desire (*kām ’āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav ’āsava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭh ’āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjāsava*): §12.1 n.

declares that Subhūti is a “perceiver of the formless” (*arūpa,saññī*), that is, “perceiving the formless” (that is, the formless attainments), he has won arhathood.

As such, he is a full-fledged arhat (like Sāriputta and Moggallāna). Technically, he is an arhat who is “liberated both ways” (*ubhato,bhāga,vimutta*),⁷⁷ that is, liberated from the physical body (that is, the 5 physical senses) by means of the formless dhyanas, and from all defilements (that is, attaining mental purity) by the path of arhathood.⁷⁸

4.2.2 The line, “**Whose thoughts have burnt out**” [§4a], refers to the temporary cessation the thinking process during the second dhyana onwards. As the commentary notes, the second dhyana onwards are all states that are thought-free (UA 348). This is obvious because all the five physical senses have shut down within such a state. The experience is purely mental but thought-free.

4.2.3 The line, “**internally well shorn (of thoughts) without remains**” [§4b], means that he has progressed even further so that his mind is permanently free from thoughts as we understand them, so that his mind is truly pure and spontaneous. Technically, this means that he has uprooting craving and clinging, so that he is nothing more than the 5 aggregates—form, feeling, perception, formation (singular) and consciousness⁷⁹—without any more “fuel” (*upādāna*) for rebirth.⁸⁰

4.2.4 The line, “**going beyond bondage, perceiving the formless**” [§4c] refers to his abandoning of all forms of craving—the 5 kinds of “bondage” (*saṅga*), that bind is to rebirth—that is, those of lust (*rāga*), hate (*dosa*), delusion (*moha*), conceit (*māna*) and views (*diṭṭhi*) (UA 73). This is an abbreviated form of the 10 fetters (*dasa saṃyojana*),⁸¹ where the last two bonds or fetters are only broken by the arhat. In short, the arhat has broken all the 10 fetters, and so that he is fully awakened and liberated.

4.2.5 The line, “**(he) has gone beyond the four yokes, comes not to birth**” [§4d]. Here, “the four yokes” (*catu,yoga*)—*yoga* and *saṅga* are actually synonyms—are the the 4 influxes (*āsava*), namely, those of (1) sense-desire (*kāma’sava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhava’sava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭha’sava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjāsava*) [§12.1 n]. The older version of this set lists only 3 influxes, omitting “views” (*diṭṭhi*), which is included in “ignorance” (*avijjā*).

The 4 influxes need to be understood and uprooted, as they are the “fuel” (*upādāna*) or “food” (*āhāra*)⁸² for sustaining karma and rebirth, so that we are caught up in the rut of endless cycles of suffering. The arhat is said to have destroyed all these influxes; hence, he is famously called “influx-destroyed” (*khīṇ’āsava*).⁸³ The arhat has transcended both karma and rebirth by attaining nirvana.⁸⁴

4.3 SUBHŪTI THERA,GĀTHĀ (Tha 1)

4.3.1 Interestingly, Subhūti is the first elder listed in the Thera,gāthā. He has only one elder’s verse (Tha 1), one of the simplest verses in the whole of the Thera,gāthā, but expressing a profound and care-free joy of the awakened mind which runs thus:

⁷⁷ *The Princeton Dictionary of Buddhism* entry on “Subhūti” prob reads this term as *ubhato,vibhaṅga*, “the two collections comprising the Vinayaṭṭaka,” of which he is said to have “mastered,” after which “he retired to the forest to practise meditation” (2014:862). The term does not occur in the suttas, but occurs only in commentarial literature (but see V 2:287). This point is not attested by the suttas. Subhūti is declared by the Buddha to be the foremost amongst the monks who are recipients of gifts (A 1:24). [3.2.4]

⁷⁸ All arhats are perfectly liberated in the same way from ignorance and suffering, but are distinguished into 2 types on the basis of their proficiency in concentration. Those who can attain the 8 liberations (*aṭṭha,vimokkha*), which incl the 4 formless attainments and the attainment of cessation, are called “liberated both ways” (*ubhato,bhāga,vimutta*), ie, liberated from the physical body by means of the formless dhyanas, and from all defilements by the path of arhathood. On “**liberation of mind and liberation through wisdom**,” see §12 n below.

⁷⁹ See *Cūḷa Vedalla S* (M 44), SD 40a.9.

⁸⁰ On *upādāna* as “fuel,” See (*Upādāna*) *Parivaṭṭa S* (S 22.56), SD 3.7 & *Bhāra S* (S 22.22), SD 17.14 (1).

⁸¹ On the 10 fetters (*dasa saṃyojana*), see *Kiṭṭa,giri S* (M 70) @ SD 11.1 (5.1); (*Sekha*) *Uddesa S* (A 4.85), SD 3.3(2); also S 5:61, A 5:13, Vbh 377. On the fetters and the influxes, see SD 28.6 (1.2.10).

⁸² On “**food**” (*āhāra*) in a psychological sense, see *Āhāra S* (S 12.11), SD 76.1 & (*Nivaraṇa Bojjhaṅga*) *Āhāra S* (S 46.51), SD 7.15.

⁸³ On how they are removed, see SD 28.6 esp (1.2.9).

⁸⁴ On the mental influxes (*āsava*), see SD 33.8 (1).

SD 45.1(4.3)**Subhūti Thera,gāthā**The Verse of the Elder Subhūti | **Tha 1**

Traditional: Tha 1.1 = Khuddaka Nikāya, Theragāthā 1, Ekanipāta 1

Theme: When an arhat brings on the rain

*Channā me kuṭikā sukhā nivātā
vassa deva yathā,sukhaṃ
cittaṃ me susamāhitam vimuttam
ātāpī viharāmi vassa devā'ti.*

My hut⁸⁵ is thatched, pleasant, draught-free:
so rain as you wish, O rain!
My mind is well stilled, liberated,
ardent I dwell: so let it rain! (Tha 1)

— evaṃ —

4.3.2 The Thera.gāthā Commentary gives us the origin story behind Subhūti's Thera.gāthā. Subhūti, after awakening, it is said wandered on Dharma-tour for the good of the many, and in due course arrived in Rāja,gaha, the capital of Magadha, Bimbisāra's kingdom. When the king hears of his coming, he visits him to pay his respects, and invites him to stay there (probably for the rains-retreat), promising to build a leaf-hut (*kuṭika*) in the forest for him.

The king, however, forgets to have the hut built. So the elder dwells in the open, meditating there, too. On account of Subhūti's great virtue (*anubhāva*), the rains do not fall. The rain-gods, it is said, dare not shower the rains upon the land for fear of inconveniencing the unsheltered arhat.⁸⁶ As the drought continues, the people are troubled and approached the palace to demand the reason for this.⁸⁷

The king then recalls his forgotten promise, and at once has the leaf-hut built for Subhūti. Subhūti enters his hut and sits in meditation on a pile of grass (*tiṇa,santhāraka*). Then the rain falls, but in light drops, not in torrents. The elder, out of compassion for the people decides to allay the people's fear of the drought, and declaring that he is free of any danger from without or from within, utters this verse (Tha 1). (ThaA 1:25)

— — —

The Discourse to Subhūti (and Saddha)

A 11.15

Subhūti and Saddha

1 Then the venerable Subhūti, along with the monk Saddha,⁸⁸ approached the Blessed One. Having approached the Blessed One, he sat saluted him and sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, the Blessed One said this to the venerable Subhūti:

1.2 “Subhūti, what is the name of this monk?”⁸⁹

⁸⁵ Note a metaphorical tone here, where “hut” refers to the arhat's “body” or “personality” (*atta,bhāva*), “composed of the earth and the other elements, and dependent on sense-contacts” (ThaA 1:26, 28).

⁸⁶ The ancient Indians attributed rain to the gods, *deva*, which also figuratively means “rain”: see Tha 1, 51-54, 189, 325-329, 524, 531, 1137. In all these verses, *deva* is glossed as “clouds” (*megha*), except for Tha 531, where the deva-king Pajjuna is mentioned as the rain-god (cf J 5:193, where Sakka is mentioned in a similar connection). For philological details, see Tha:N 117 n1.

⁸⁷ It is common belief then that the kingdom's good weather depends on the king's moral virtue.

⁸⁸ *Āyasmā subhūti saddhena bhikkhunā saddhim*. See Intro (1.1).

⁸⁹ *Ko nāmāyaṃ* [Ee so. Ce Ke Ko nāmo ayaṃ; Be:Ka Se Ko nāma ayaṃ] *subhūti bhikkhūti*. See Intro (2) ad loc.

“Bhante, this monk is named Saddha, the son of the lay disciple Sudatta,⁹⁰ and who has gone forth from home to the homeless life out of faith.⁹¹

1.3 “But, Subhūti, this monk, the lay disciple Sudatta’s son, who has gone forth from home to the homeless life out of faith—**will he fully see for himself the harvest of (his) faith?**”⁹²

1.4 “This is the time, bhante! This is the time, well-gone one! May the Blessed One speak on the harvests of faith, so that I will now know whether or not this monk sees for himself to the harvests of faith.”⁹³

1.5 “In that case, Subhūti, listen well, pay close attention. I will speak.

“Yes, bhante,” the venerable Subhūti replied in assent to the Blessed One.

THE HARVESTS OF THE HOLY LIFE⁹⁴

1.6 The Blessed One said this: [338]

(1) Moral virtue

2 “Here, Subhūti, a monk is **morally virtuous** (*sīlava*):
he dwells restrained in keeping with the restraint of the monastic code (Pāṭimokkha),
seeing danger in the smallest fault, and
having taking up the training-rules, he trains himself in them.⁹⁵

2.2 Insofar, too, Subhūti, as a monk is morally virtuous—
he dwells restrained in keeping with the restraint of the monastic code (Pāṭimokkha), seeing danger in the smallest fault, and having taking up the training-rules, he trains himself in them—
this, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha [for the faithful].⁹⁶

(2) Wide learning

3 Furthermore, Subhūti, a monk is **widely learned** (*bahu-s,suta*).⁹⁷
he remembers what he hears, a store of learning.

Whatever teachings

that are beautiful in the beginning, beautiful in the middle, beautiful in the end,
endowed both in the spirit and in the letter,
that proclaims the holy life, utterly complete and pure—

⁹⁰ Only Be reads *sudattassa* (which I follow); Ce Ee Ke Se *saddhassa* (which then suggests both son and father have the very same name). See Intro (1.1.3.2).

⁹¹ *Saddho nāmāyaṃ bhante bhikkhu sudattassa upāsakassa putto saddhā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajito ’ti*. If we read *sudattassa* (Be) as *saddhassa* (Ce Ee Ke Se), then we should tr the line as “Bhante, this monk is named Saddha, the son of a faithful lay disciple” See prec n.

⁹² *Kacci paṇāyaṃ subhūti saddho bhikkhu sudattassa upāsakassa putto saddhā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajito sandissati saddhā ’padānesūti*. See Intro (1.2.2).

⁹³ *Etassa bhagavā kālo etassa sugata kālo, yaṃ bhagavā saddhassa saddhā ’padānāni bhāseyya, idānāham jānis-sāmi yadi vā ayaṃ bhikkhu sandissati saddhā ’padānesu, yadi vā no ’ti*.

⁹⁴ This section [§§1.6-12], which is almost the whole Sutta, is a summary of the “fruits of recluseship” (*sāmañña-phala*), famously laid out in full in such texts as **Sāmañña-phala S** (D 2,40-62/2:63-69), SD 8.10 & **Sekha S** (M 53,7/1:355), SD 21.14: see **Sīla samādhi pañña**, SD 21.6 (2); also **Right livelihood**, SD 37.8 (4.1). As it is brief but comprehensive, it is likely to be older than the *sāmañña-phala* pericope and **Sāmañña-phala S**, on which, in fact, they could have been based and elaborated.

⁹⁵ As at **Cakka,vatti Siha,nāda S** (D 26,28(2)/3:77 f), SD 36.10. For a full listing of these qualities, see **Sāmañña-phala S** (D 2,43-62/1:68), SD 8.10.

⁹⁶ *Idam pi subhūti saddhassa saddhā,padānam hoti*. Here there is a wordplay on *saddha*: it both refers to the monk Saddha, and generically to anyone who has faith (*saddha*). This whole section, almost identical as D 2,42/-1:63, SD 8.10, except for the refrain.

⁹⁷ This section is as at **Mahā Go,siṅga S** (M 32,4.5/1:213), SD 44.12.

in such a Dharma, he is deeply learned, remembers it, master it verbally, investigates it mentally, well penetrates it by seeing [by right view].⁹⁸

3.2 Insofar, too, Subhūti, as a monk is widely learned—
he remembers what he hears, a store of learning.

Whatever teachings

that are beautiful in the beginning, beautiful in the middle, beautiful in the end,
endowed both in the spirit and in the letter,

that proclaims the holy life, utterly complete and pure—

in such a Dharma, he is deeply learned, remembers it, master it verbally, investigates it mentally, well penetrates it by seeing [by right view]—

this, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha.

(3) Spiritual friendship

4 Furthermore, Subhūti, a monk is a **spiritual friend** (*kalyāṇa,mitta*):⁹⁹
a good companion, good comrade.

4.2 Insofar, too, Subhūti, as a monk is a spiritual friend—
a good companion, good comrade—

this is, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha.

(4) Amenability

5 Furthermore, Subhūti, a monk is **amenable** (*suvaca*):¹⁰⁰
he possesses qualities that make him amenable, patient, adroit [quick to grasp instructions].¹⁰¹

5.2 Insofar, too, Subhūti, as a monk is amenable—
he possesses qualities that make him amenable, patient, adroit [quick to grasp instructions]—

this, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha.

(5) Deftness and diligence

6 Furthermore, Subhūti, a monk is **deft** (*dakkha*) and **diligent** (*analasa*)—

in whatever work—great or small—that needs to be done by his fellow brahmacharis, he is deft and diligent in them.¹⁰²

⁹⁸ *Tathā,rūpāssa dhammā bahu-s,sutā honti dhātā* [Ce Ee Ke Se *dhatā*] *vacasā paricitā manasānupekkhitā diṭṭhiyā suppaṭividdhā*. Cf **Gopaka Moggallāna S** (M 108,15/3:11), SD 33.5; (**Ahitāya**) **Thera S** (A 5.88/3:114-116), SD 40.16. “Well penetrates it by seeing it” (*diṭṭhiyā suppaṭividdhā*), ie, by his wisdom: here *diṭṭhi* has a positive sense of “right view, insight” (V 4:51,28 = D 3:267,9; A 3:349,13, 4:98,4*; AA 49,19; Sn 471; SnA 409,26; Vbh 328,26

⁹⁹ Variations of *kalyāṇa,mitta...kalyāṇa,sahāya...kalyāṇa,sampavaṅka...* appear at **D 33.3.3(1c)/3:267**, **34.2.3(1c)/3:290**; **S 3.14/1:83**, **3.18/1:87 f = 45.2/5:2 f**, **45.3/5:3**; **A 3.27/1:127**, **6.67/3:422**, **8.54.9/4:284**, **8.55.9/4:288**, **8.57.2/4:290**, **9.1.8/4:352**, **9.3.13/4:357 f (= U 4.1/27 f)**, **10.17.4/5:24**, **10.18.5/5:26**, **10.50.5/5:90**, **10.97.4/5:199**, **11.15.4+ 13/5:338**, 341; **Pug 3.14/37**. On the 3 terms, see **Spiritual friendship: A textual study**, SD 34.1 (4). A longer version of this def appears in **Kalyāṇa,mitta Appamāda S** (S 3.18,2/1:87), SD 34.3.

¹⁰⁰ *Puna ca param subhūti bhikkhu suvaco hoti sovacassa,karaṇehi dhammehi samannāgato khamo pada-k,khiṇa-g,gāhī anusāsanīm*. Recurs at **Anumāna S** (M 15,5/1:96); **Nātha S 1** (A 10.17/5:23 f), **Nātha S 2** (A 10.18/5:26), **Bhaṇḍana S** (A 10.50/5:90), **Subhūti S** (A 11.15,5/5:338), SD 45.1. Cf **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,3.3(1)/3:267) & **Das’uttara S** (D 34,2.3(1)/3:290), where both give the 10 “virtues that provides one with protection (by making us our own lord, *nātha*)” (*nātha,karaṇa dhamma*): the last 3 virtues, however, are different [2.4].

¹⁰¹ “Adroit,” *pada-k,khiṇa-g,gahī anusāsanīm*, lit, “grasping instructions with the right hand”; esp “adroit,” from French, *à-droit*, “with the right,” proper: A 3:79, 180, 5:24 f, 90, 338; DhA 2:105. Opp *apadakkhiṇa-g,gahī* (“left-handed,” cf German “linkisch”), unskilled, untrained: S 2:204 fJ 3:483. ~*g,gahitā* (n), quick grasp, skillfulness, cleverness: KhpA 148.

6.2 Insofar, too, Subhūti, a monk is deft and diligent—
in whatever work—great or small—that needs to be done by his fellow brahmacharis, he is deft and diligent in them—
 this, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha. [339]

(6) Love for the Dharma

7 Furthermore, Subhūti, a monk is one **who loves the Dharma** (*dhamma, kāmo hoti*)—
 he is pleasant when conversing about the Dharma, and rejoices abundantly in regards to the Dharma and to the Vinaya.¹⁰³

7.2 Insofar, too, Subhūti, as a monk is one who loves the Dharma—
he is pleasant when conversing about the Dharma, and rejoices abundantly in regards to the Dharma and to the Vinaya—
 this, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha.

(7) Effort

8 Furthermore, Subhūti, a monk is **one who dwells exerting [initiating] effort** (*āradḍha, viriya*),
 abandoning unwholesome states and promoting wholesome states. He is vigorous, steadfast in striving,
 unrelentingly working on [not laying down the burden regarding] the wholesome states.¹⁰⁴

8.2 Insofar, too, Subhūti, as a monk is one who dwells exerting effort,
*abandoning unwholesome states and promoting wholesome states. He is vigorous, steadfast in striving,
 unrelentingly working on [not laying down the burden regarding] the wholesome states*—
 this, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha.

(8) Dhyana

9 Furthermore, Subhūti, a monk is **a dhyana-attainer** (*lābhī*):
 attaining at will, without trouble, without difficulty, the 4 dhyanas, the higher minds, and dwelling
 happily here and now.¹⁰⁵

9.2 Insofar, too, Subhūti, as a monk is a dhyana-attainer,

¹⁰² *Puna ca param subhūti bhikkhu yāni tāni sabrahma, cārīnaṃ uccā'vacāni kim, karaṇīyāni, tatra dakkho hoti analaso.* This is as at **Kosambiya S** (M 48,12/1:324); **Paṭisambhidā, patta S** (A 5.86/3:113), **Nātha S 1** (A 10.17/5:23), **Nātha S 2** (A 10.18/5:27), **Bhaṇḍana S** (A 10.50/5:90), **Subhūti S** (A 11.15,6/5:338), SD 45.1.

¹⁰³ *Puna ca param subhūti bhikkhu dhamma, kāmo hoti piya, samudāhāro abhidhamme abhivinaye ulāra, pāmojjo.* This is as at **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,3.3(1f)/3:267), **Das'uttara S** (D 34,2.3(1f)/3:290); **Nātha S 1** (A 10.17/5:24), **Nātha S 2** (A 10.18/5:27), **Kathā, vatthu S** (A 10.50/5:90), **Thera S** (A 10.98/5:201), **Subhūti S** (A 11.15,7/5:338), SD 45.1. Note here the sutta usage of the adverbial *abhidhamme*, “with regard to the Dharma,” without any technical or scholastic sense.

¹⁰⁴ *Puna ca param subhūti bhikkhu āradḍha, viriyo viharati akusalānaṃ dhammānaṃ pahānāya kusalānaṃ dhammānaṃ upasampadāya, thāmaṃvā daḷha, parakkamo anikkhitta, dhuro kusalesu dhammesu.* This is stock: D 3:237; **M 53.15/1:356**, **85.57/2:95**, **90.10/2:128**; **S 48.9/5:197**, **48.10/5:198**, **48.50/5:225+226**; **A 3.20.11/1:117**, **3.94.4/1:244** (the one who puts in effort is said to be “possessed of power,” *bala, sampanna*), **3.95.4/1:245** (do), **3.96.4/1:246** (do), **4.256.2/2:250** (do), **4.257.2/2:251** (do), **5.2.5/3:2** (called “power of effort,” *viriya, bala*), **5.12.4/3:10** (do), **5.14.4/3:11** (do), **5.53.2/3:65**, **5.110.2/3:135**, **5.134.3/3:152**, **5.135.3/3:153+154+15+155**, **5.136.3/3:155**, **7.4.3/4:3**, **7.63.-17/4:110**, **8.2.7/4:153 + 15/4:154**, **8.30.23/4:234**, **8.55.2/4:291**, **9.1.6/4:352+ 8/4:353**, **9.3.11/4:357**, **10.11.2/5:15**, **10.17.3/5:23 + 8/5:24**, **10.18.8/5:27 + 11/5:28**, **10.50.4+9/5:90 f**, **11.15.3/3:338 + 8/5:339 + 13/5:341**; **U 4.1.11/36 + 13c/37**.

¹⁰⁵ *Puna ca param subhūti bhikkhu catunnaṃ jhānaṃ ābhicetasikānaṃ diṭṭha, dhamm, asukha, viharānaṃ nikāma, lābhī hoti akiccha, lābhī akasira, lābhī.* This is stock: **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22,22/2:314,12); **Sati'paṭṭhāna S** (M 10,46/1:62); **Kiṭa, giri S** (M 70,27/1:481); **Aññatara S** (S 46.57/5:129); **Nirodha S** (S 46.76/5:133); **Dve Phalā S** (S 48.65/5:236); **Phalā S 1+2** (S 54.4+5/5:313 f); **Iddhi, pāda S** (A 5.67/3:82); **Sati Supaṭṭhita S** (A 5.122/3:143); **Pabbajjā S** (A 10.59/5:108); **Paṭisallāna S** (It 2.2.8/39,15); **Sikkhānisamsa S** (It 2.2.9/40,12); **Jāgariyo S** (It 2.2.10/41,11); **Dvayatānupassanā S** (Sn pp140,13, 148,13).

attaining at will, without trouble, without difficulty, the 4 dhyanas, the higher minds, and dwelling happily here and now—

this, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha.

(9) Recollection of past lives

10 Furthermore, Subhūti, a monk **recalls divers former existence** (*aneka, vihitam pubbe, nivāsam anussarati*),¹⁰⁶

that is to say,

one birth, two births, three births, four births,	five births,
ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births,	fifty births,
one hundred births, one thousand births,	one hundred thousand births,
many aeons of cosmic contraction,	many aeons of cosmic expansion,
many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:	

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such was my experience of joy and pain, such was the end of my life.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose there.

There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such was my experience of joy and pain, such was my life-span.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’¹⁰⁷

10.2 Insofar, too, Subhūti, [340] as a monk recalls diverse former existence,

that is to say,

<i>one birth, two births, three births, four births,</i>	<i>five births,</i>
<i>ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births,</i>	<i>fifty births,</i>
<i>one hundred births, one thousand births,</i>	<i>one hundred thousand births,</i>
<i>many aeons of cosmic contraction,</i>	<i>many aeons of cosmic expansion,</i>
<i>many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:</i>	

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such the end of my life.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose there.

There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such my life-span.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose here’—

this, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha.

(10) The divine eye

11 Furthermore, Subhūti, a monk is one **with the divine eye** (*dibba, cakkhu*):¹⁰⁸ he sees—by means of the divine eye [clairvoyance], purified, surpassing the human—beings passing away and re-arising, and

¹⁰⁶ More fully, this is called *pubbe, nivāsanānussati, ñāṇa*, lit “the knowledge of the recollection of past abidings [existences],” or more simply, “the knowledge of (one’s) past lives.” The passage here is slightly shorter than the well known stock—which adds here: “with the divine eye, purified, surpassing the human” (*so dibbena cakkhunā visuddhena atikkanta, manussakena*)—found in **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,95/1:81), SD 8.10. This missing phrase is, however, found in the next “harvest” or knowledge [§11].

¹⁰⁷ This knowledge is detailed at Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

¹⁰⁸ *Dibba, cakkhu*, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (*dhamma, cakkhu*) (see n in §104). On the relationship of this knowledge to the 62 grounds for wrong views, see **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1), SD 25.3(76.3). See prec n.

he knows how they are inferior and superior,
 beautiful and ugly,
 fortunate and unfortunate,
 in the heavens, in the suffering states,
 faring in accordance with their karma:
 ‘These beings—who were endowed with bad conduct of body, speech, and mind,
 who reviled the noble ones,
 held wrong views and
 undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—
 after death, with the body’s breaking up,
 have re-arisen in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell.

11.2 But these beings—
 who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind,
 who did not revile the noble ones,
 who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—
 after death, with the body’s breaking up, have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.’

Thus, Subhūti, by means of the divine eye, he sees beings passing away and re-arising, and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma.

11.3 Insofar, too, Subhūti, as a monk *with the divine eye*,
he sees—by means of the divine eye [clairvoyance], purified, surpassing the human—
beings passing away and re-arising, and
he knows how they are

inferior and superior,
beautiful and ugly,
fortunate and unfortunate,
in the heavens, in the suffering states,
faring in accordance with their karma:

‘These beings—who were endowed with bad conduct of body, speech, and mind,
who reviled the noble ones,
held wrong views and
undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—
after death, with the body’s breaking up,
have re-arisen in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell.

11.4 *But these beings—*
who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind,
who did not revile the noble ones,
who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—
after death, with the body’s breaking up, have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.’

Thus, Subhūti, by means of the divine eye, he sees beings passing away and re-arising, and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states, faring in accordance with their karma.

This, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha.

(11) Destruction of the influxes

12 Furthermore, Subhūti, a monk has **destroyed the mental influxes** (*āsavānam khayā*)—

he dwells, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, upon attaining, right here and now, the liberation of mind and the liberation by wisdom¹⁰⁹ that are influx-free with the destruction of the mental influxes.¹¹⁰

12.2 Insofar, too, Subhūti, as a monk who has destroyed the mental influxes—

he dwells, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, upon attaining, right here and now, the liberation of mind and the liberation by wisdom that are influx-free with the destruction of the mental influxes.

This, too, Subhūti, is a harvest of faith for Saddha.”

Subhūti’s lion-roar

13 When this was said, the venerable Subhūti said this to the Blessed One:

“Bhante, as regards that which has been spoken of by the Blessed One as the harvests of faith, they are found in this monk, and this monk has fully seen them for himself.¹¹¹

(1) This monk, bhante, is **morally virtuous**:

he dwells restrained in keeping with the restraint of the monastic code (Pāṭimokkha), seeing danger in the smallest fault, and

having taking up the training-rules, [341] he trains himself in them.

(2) This monk, bhante, is **widely learned** (*bahu-s,suta*):

he remembers what he hears, a store of learning.

Whatever teachings

that are beautiful in the beginning, beautiful in the middle, beautiful in the end,

endowed both in the spirit and in the letter,

that proclaims the holy life, utterly complete and pure—

in such a Dharma, he is deeply learned, remembers it, master it verbally, investigates it mentally, well penetrates it by seeing [by right view].

(3) This monk, bhante, is **a spiritual friend**: a good companion, good comrade.¹¹²

(4) This monk, bhante, is **amenable**:

¹⁰⁹ “**Liberation of mind and liberation through wisdom**,” respectively, *ceto,vimutti* (or, liberation by concentration, ie through destruction of the mental hindrances) and *paññā,vimutti* (liberation through insight) (A 1:60). One who is *liberated by wisdom* “may not have reached the 8 deliverances (*vimokkha* = *jhāna*) in his own body, but through seeing with wisdom, his mental influxes are destroyed” (M 70.16/1:478). All arhats are perfectly liberated in the same way from ignorance and suffering, but are distinguished into two types on the basis of their proficiency in concentration. Those who can attain **the 8 deliverances** (*aṭṭha,vimokkha*), which include the four formless attainments and the attainment of cessation, are called *liberated both ways*, that is, liberated from the physical body by means of the formless dhyanas, and from all defilements by the path of arhathood. Saḷha, like the arhats Sāriputta and Moggallāna, is “liberated both ways” (*ubhato,bhāga,vimutta*). The differences between the two types of liberation are given in **Mahā,nidāna S** (D 2:70 f) and **Kiṭṭagiri S** (M 1:477 f). For full list of the 8 deliverances, see **Mahā Nidāna S** (D 15.35/2:70 f). For full list of the 8 deliverances, see **Mahā Nidāna S** (D 15.35/2:70 f), SD 5.17.35. See also D 3:262, 228; **Vimokkha S**, A 8.66/4:306; also M 120.37/3:103 @ SD 3.4.37.

¹¹⁰ *Puna ca param subhūti bhikkhu āsavānaṃ khayā anāsavaṃ ceto,vimuttiṃ paññā,vimuttiṃ diṭṭh’eva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharatī*: as at **Mahā,nidāna S** (D 15,36.2/2:71), SD 5.17. More fully, this is called **asava-k,khaya,ñāṇa**, “the knowledge of the destruction of the mental influxes.” The Abhidhamma lists 4 *āsava*: the influx of (1) sense-desire (*kāma’āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav’āsava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭh’āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjāsava*) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These 4 are also known as “floods” (*oghā*) and “yokes” (*yogā*). The list of 3 *influxes* (omitting the influx of views) is prob older and is found more frequently: D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63. The destruction of these āsavas is equivalent to arhathood. For details, see **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,99.2) n, SD 8.10.

¹¹¹ *Yān’imāni bhante bhagavatā saddhassa saddhā’padānāni bhāsītāni, samvijjanti tāni imassa bhikkhuno, ayañ ca bhikkhu etesu sandissati.*

¹¹² This means that Saddha is capable of being a meditation teacher, having his own pupils, or anyone can beneficially consult him on their meditation [§13 (8)].

he possesses qualities that make him amenable, patient, adroit [quick to grasp instructions]

(5) This monk, bhante, is **deft and diligent**—

in whatever work—great or small—that needs to be done by his fellow brahmacharis, he is deft and diligent in them.

(6) This monk, bhante, is one **who loves the Dharma**—

he is pleasant when conversing about the Dharma, and rejoices abundantly in regards to the Dharma and to the Vinaya.

(7) This monk, bhante, is **one who dwells exerting [initiating] effort**,

abandoning unwholesome states and promoting wholesome states. He is vigorous, steadfast in striving, unrelentingly working on [not laying down the burden regarding] the wholesome states.

(8) This monk, bhante, is **a dhyana-attainer**:

attaining at will, without trouble, without difficulty, the 4 dhyanas, the higher minds, and dwelling happily here and now.

(9) This monk, bhante, is one who **recalls diverse former existence**,

that is to say,

one birth, two births, three births, four births,	five births,
ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births,	fifty births,
one hundred births, one thousand births,	one hundred thousand births,
many aeons of cosmic contraction,	many aeons of cosmic expansion,
many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:	

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such was my experience of joy and pain, such was the end of my life.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose there.

There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance.

Such was my food, such was my experience of joy and pain, such was my life-span.

Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’

(10) This monk, bhante, is one **with the divine eye**:

he sees—by means of the divine eye [clairvoyance], purified, surpassing the human—

beings passing away and re-arising, and

he knows how they are

inferior and superior,

beautiful and ugly,

fortunate and unfortunate,

in the heavens, in the suffering states,

faring in accordance with their karma:

‘These beings—who were endowed with bad conduct of body, speech, and mind,

who reviled the noble ones,

held wrong views and

undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—

after death, with the body’s breaking up,

have re-arisen in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell.

(11) This monk, bhante, has **destroyed the mental influxes**—

he dwells, having realized for himself through direct knowledge, upon attaining, right here and now, the liberation of mind and the liberation by wisdom¹¹³ that are influx-free with the destruction of the mental influxes.

¹¹³ “**Liberation of mind and liberation through wisdom**,” respectively, *ceto, vimutti* (or, liberation by concentration, ie through destruction of the mental hindrances) and *paññā, vimutti* (liberation through insight) (A 1:60). One who is *liberated by wisdom* “may not have reached the 8 deliverances (*vimokkha = jhāna*) in his own body, but through seeing with wisdom, his mental influxes are destroyed” (M 70.16/1:478). All arhats are perfectly liberated in the same way from ignorance and suffering, but are distinguished into two types on the basis of their proficiency in concentration. Those who can attain **the 8 deliverances** (*aṭṭha, vimokkha*), which include the four formless attain-

13.2 Bhante, as regards that which has been spoken of by the Blessed One as *the harvests of faith*, they are found in this monk, and this monk has fully seen them for himself.”

The Buddha’s endorsement

14 “Sadhu, sadhu, Subhūti! And, Subhūti, when you wish to see the “thus come” (*yathāgata*),¹¹⁴ you should approach with this monk Saddha to see the “thus gone” (*tathāgata*).”¹¹⁵ **[342]**

— evaṃ —

140209; 140215; 140419r

ments and the attainment of cessation, are called *liberated both ways*, that is, liberated from the physical body by means of the formless dhyanas, and from all defilements by the path of arhathood. Saḷha, like the arhats Sāriputta and Moggallāna, is “liberated both ways” (*ubhato, bhāga, vimutta*). The differences between the two types of liberation are given in **Mahā, nidāna S** (D 2:70 f) and **Kīṭāgiri S** (M 1:477 f). For full list of the 8 deliverances, see **Mahā Nidāna S** (D 15.35/2:70 f). For full list of the 8 deliverances, see **Mahā Nidāna S** (D 15.35/2:70 f), SD 5.17.35. See also D 3:262, 228; **Vimokkha S**, A 8.66/4:306; also M 120.37/3:103 @ SD 3.4.37.

¹¹⁴ On a possible wordplay here, see Intro (1.2.4)..

¹¹⁵ *Yadā ca tvam subhūti ākaṅkheyyāsi tathāgatam* [only Be *yathāgatam*] *dassanāya, iminā saddhena bhikkhunā saddhim upasaṅkameyyāsi tathāgatam dassanāyāti*. Here we see a wordplay in this correlative sentence, the former half’s object is *yathāgata*, while the latter half is *tathāgata*.