

## 8

**(Licchavī) Bhaddiya Sutta**

The Discourse to Bhaddiya (the Licchavī) | A 4.193

Theme: True conversion is personal transformation and spiritual awakening

Translated &amp; annotated by Piya Tan ©2008, 2014

**1 Sutta summary and comments**

**1.1 THE (LICCHAVĪ) BHADDIYA SUTTA** (A 4.193) is a short but significant dialogue between the Buddha and Bhaddiya the Licchavī on the true nature of conversion: true conversion is personal transformation and spiritual awakening.

**1.2 “CONVERSION MAGIC.”** [§1.1-1,2] The Sutta opens with Bhaddiya visiting the Buddha. The Commentary says that just after the Buddha’s breakfast (*bhutta, pātar-āsa*), Bhaddiya, bearing “garlands, fragrances and unguents” (*mālā, gandha, vilepana*), visits the Buddha to pay him homage (AA 3:172). These offerings are respectfully left before the Buddha or nearby (or at a shrine) for its fragrance, as it is against the precepts for monastics to personally use them.<sup>1</sup> Monastics are allowed to use the unguents for medicinal purposes (KhA 37,6).

[§1.3] Bhaddiya relates to the Buddha how other sectarians accuse the Buddha of being an “illusionist” (*māyāvī*) who uses “conversion magic” (*āvattanī māyā*) to convert them (thus, reducing their numbers and patronage). [§1.4] Bhaddiya’s tone is, in fact, one of respect and concern. [3]

**1.3 RIGHT VIEWS AS VIRTUOUS CONDUCT.** Beginning with the “bad conduct cycle” [§2.1], the Buddha declares the wrong kind of life that is to be rejected in the first “virtuous conduct refrain (omission)” [§2.2]. This unwholesome conduct involves a tendency *to destroy life, to steal, to violate the person of others, to lie*, and to encourage others to do likewise on account of the 4 motives: greed (*lobha*) [§3], hate (*dosa*) [§4], delusion (*moha*) [§4.2] and impetuosity (*sārambha*) [§4.3]—all of which “will bring about harm and suffering for a long time.” [§4.1-4.2]

**1.4 SOCIAL REFRAIN: EMPHATIC STATEMENTS** [§§5+10]. This is then followed by the first of two “emphatic statements” (*avadharaṇa*), that is, “social refrain 1” [§5], dealing with the negative aspect of moral conduct on a social or universal scale. The Buddha then declares his reason for mentioning the 10 doubtful points (2<sup>nd</sup> cycle) [§6.1] and the second “virtuous conduct refrain (omission)” [§6.2].

The “good conduct cycle” then begins [§6.3] with the Buddha mentioning the 10 doubtful points for the *third* time. This is followed by the third “virtuous conduct refrain (commission),” that is, what we should do to live a virtuous life. At this point, the teaching on the “4 wholesome motives”—non-greed [§8], non-hate [§9], non-delusion [§9.2] and non-impetuosity [§9.3] are introduced, which then receives an “emphatic affirmation,” that is, “social refrain 2” [§10], by way of universalizing the teaching.

The 10 doubtful points are mentioned for the *fourth* and last time [§11.1], leading into fourth and last “virtuous conduct refrain (omission)” [§11.2], which is an admonition to personal practice. This closes the teaching cycle.

**1.5 CONVERSION.** The conversion cycle opens with the Buddha declaring that there is in this world those “good true individuals” (a reference to the great saints) who admonish their disciples to abstain from any action (body, speech or mind) that is motivated by greed, by hate, by delusion, or by impetuosity [§12].

By this time, Bhaddiya has become a streamwinner—he is effectively converted by his own realization. So, he goes for refuge [§13]. The highlight here is the Buddha’s affirming the fact that Bhaddiya has converted on his own account, through self-knowledge, and not on the Buddha’s invitation to be his pupil [§14], which clearly shows that his critics are wrong [§15]! In other words, there is no magic involved at all in the conversion, only self-realization.

**1.6 STREAMWINNING.** Bhaddiya, now a streamwinner, is elated and roars his lion-roar, declaring that such as conversion is well worth it, and if anyone and everyone were to be converted in this way, it would surely be for their own good [§16]. The Buddha endorses Bhaddiya’s lion-roar [§17], and famously adds

<sup>1</sup> See esp no 8 of the 10 precepts (KhP 1; KhA 37,7).

that even if the great sal trees nearby were conscious beings, they, too, would benefit from such a conversion, what more of human beings!

## 2 “Conversion magic”

**2.0** There are at least three suttas which records accusations by outsiders that the Buddha is an “illusionist” (*māyāvī*) in converting others [1.1], that is, **the Upāli (Gaha,pati) S** (M 56) [2.1.1], **the Pāṭaliya Sutta** (S 42.13) [2.1.2], and **the (Licchavī) Bhaddiya** (A 4.193) [2.1.3].

**2.1 THE UPĀLI (GAHA,PATI) SUTTA** (M 56) is apparently the earliest record we have of such an accusation. The Sutta opens with Upāli warning the Jains about this “conversion magic” of the Buddha.<sup>2</sup> Against his advice, the Jain teacher Nāta,putta sends his ascetic Dīgha,tapassī to visit the Buddha to explain to about the Jain conception of karma.

When Dīgha,tapassī is converted, Nāta,putta sends Upāli the houselord of Nālandā, a leading disciple, to debate with the Buddha. Upāli, too, is converted by the Buddha. Later, Nāta,putta confronts Upāli and is sadly disappointed to know the truth, and dies a tragic death.<sup>3</sup>

**2.2 THE PĀṬALIYA SUTTA** (S 42.13) is a long discourse recording the Buddha’s teachings to the headman Pāṭaliya on the nature of right view.<sup>4</sup> The Sutta has two main parts: the first deals with the accusation that the Buddha is a magician who converts others (I-II); and the second deals with Pāṭaliya’s doubts after listening to diverse religious views (III-V).

In the first part, the Buddha carefully instructs Pāṭaliya, using various parables, to show that right view is not a matter of belief or even which proposition is true. In fact, here the Buddha actually “admits” that he *is* a “magician” who converts others using conversion magic. The “magic” here, declares the Buddha, is that of moral virtue. Being religious is not about beliefs, but about leading a moral life.

The second part of the Sutta is essentially similar to the Kesa,puttiya Sutta (A 3.65), which is addressed to a congregation while in the Pāṭaliya Sutta the only interlocutor is Pāṭaliya, who complains that he is confused and doubtful as regards the various conflicting teachings of the rival teachers. The Buddha says that he is rightly doubtful in such a situation, and declares that mental training or meditation is the way out of such doubting.

Moral training and mental training, as we well know, are the bases for wisdom training, which leads to right view. In other words, right view is not is a matter of belief, or even religion, but a clear vision that is beyond doubt, calming the mind and motivating us with wholesome action. Pāṭaliya is convinced and goes for refuge.<sup>5</sup>

**2.3 THE (LICCHAVĪ) BHADDIYA SUTTA** (A 4.193) records Bhaddiya the Licchavī’s remark and the Buddha responds with a teaching on the true nature of conversion [§1.1-1,2]. The Sutta opens with Bhaddiya visiting the Buddha, and relating to him how other sectarians accuse him of being an “illusionist” (*māyāvī*) who uses “conversion magic” (*āvattanī māyā*) to convert them and understandably reducing their numbers and patronage.

## 3 The 10 doubtful points

### **3.1 UNSATISFACTORY KNOWLEDGE.**

#### **3.1.1 Unsatisfactor knowledge**

**3.1.1.1 The (Licchavī) Bhaddiya Sutta** records the Buddha as opening his reply to Bhaddiya the Licchavī by stating the 10 doubtful points [3], and elaborating on them as he does in **the Kesa,puttiya Sutta** (A 3.65).<sup>6</sup> Briefly, they refer to knowledge or information obtained through

- (1) aural tradition (including “revelations”),

<sup>2</sup> M 56,8.1 @ SD 27.1.

<sup>3</sup> M 56/1:371-387 @ SD 27.1.

<sup>4</sup> S 42.13/4:340,23-29 @ SD 65.1.

<sup>5</sup> S 42.13/4:340-358 @ SD 65.1.

<sup>6</sup> A 3.65,3-14/1:189-192 @ SD 35.4a.

- (2) lineage (or received wisdom).
- (3) hearsay,
- (4) scriptural authority (that is, the sacred texts),
- (5) pure reason,
- (6) inference (that is, by logic),
- (7) reasoned thought (or by specious reasoning),
- (8) acceptance of a view (or being convinced) after pondering on it,
- (9) (another's) seeming ability (eg academic qualification, status, wealth, power, charisma, etc),
- (10) thinking, "This monk (or holy man) is our teacher" or "This recluse is respected by us." [§2]

3.1.1.2 These are common ways by which the world and religions communicate, but the reality is that they are usually unreliable as sources of knowledge, as they are not direct experiences of true reality. Here, the Buddha is telling Bhaddiya that those who accuse him of being an "illusionist" who uses "conversion magic" [1.2] to convert others are simply making a pointless statement as they have no direct experience of what is really going on.

3.1.1.3 Today, we might add that they have criticized the Buddha out of professional jealousy, or hoping to tarnish his reputation. Obviously, the Buddha's accusers have not realized the liberating truth for themselves and depend on one or more of these 10 doubtful points for their own wisdom and with which to attract and hold a following.

However, they can only keep their religion or system together, as long as they do not openly question the truth of such claims, whether any of them actually accord with true reality or they have been actually realized through direct experience by those who proclaim them. In other words, their teachings and ideas are all based on one or other of the 10 doubtful points.

### **3.1.2 Unsatisfactory systems**

3.1.2.1 An opinion, idea, system or religion based of any of these 10 doubtful points, especially those transmitted from others (from external sources, and not direct experience), according to **the Sandaka Sutta** (M 76), must have the following possibilities:

it might be well-remembered,	( <i>sussatam pi hoti</i> )
it might be ill-remembered,	( <i>dussatam pi hoti</i> )
it might be true, or	( <i>tathā pi hoti</i> )
it might be false.	( <i>aññathā pi hoti</i> )

3.1.2.2 Furthermore, adds **the Sandaka Sutta** (M 76), these are these 4 types of religions that are not necessarily false but are unsatisfactory (*anassāsika*). Such a teaching or system has 4 possibilities:

well reasoned,	true,	( <i>sutakkitaṃ tathā</i> )	but unsatisfactory,
well reasoned,	false,	( <i>sutakkitaṃ aññathā</i> )	but unsatisfactory,
ill reasoned,	true,	( <i>dutakkitaṃ tathā</i> )	but unsatisfactory, or
ill reasoned,	false.	( <i>dutakkitaṃ aññathā</i> )	but unsatisfactory,

This means that the truth or falsity of an idea or teaching cannot be judged by the consistency of its reasoning alone. For, even a well reasoned idea may be false in the light of related facts, and an ill reasoned idea may be true from personal experience. Just as an idea accepted by the best authority might well be false [Comy 3a(1)], the soundness of reasoning is no guarantee of truth.<sup>7</sup>

3.1.2.3 Seeing, for example, that such a traditional or dogmatic religion based on *anussava* is unsatisfactory (*anassāsika*), an intelligent person, becoming disillusioned with it, would simply leave.<sup>8</sup> Those who do stay on in such religions are either gullible, stupid, deluded, or do so for ulterior motives or for reasons other than for the sake of discovering the true reality.

<sup>7</sup> See **Sandaka S** (M 76), SD 35.7 (3.1.3); also Jayatilleke 1963:271 f.

<sup>8</sup> *So anassāsikam idaṃ brahma, cariyā ti iti viditvā tasmā brahma, cariyā nibbijja pakkamati* (M 76, 28/1:520), SD 35.7. See also Jayatilleke 1963:185-187.

3.1.2.4 Both the **Kesa,puttiya Sutta** (A 3.65)<sup>9</sup> and the **(Licchavī) Bhaddiya Sutta** (A 4.193) centre around doubt arising from religious statements and the Buddha’s instruction on the 10 doubtful points [3]. While the Kesa,puttiya Sutta is addressed to a gathering of the inhabitants of Kesa,putta, the (Licchavī) Bhaddiya Sutta is addressed only to Bhaddiya the Licchavī. In both cases, however, we see the spirit of “come and see” (*ehi,passika*), a continuing challenge that the Buddha throws at us.

The Buddha’s standing challenge, given in the **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda Sutta** (D 25)—which applies to early Buddhism as it does even to this day—is this:

Let an intelligent person, honest, trustworthy, upright, come to me, and I will instruct him,  
I will teach him the Dharma.<sup>10</sup>

If he then practises what he is taught to attain for himself here and now  
that supreme goal of the holy life, for the sake of which sons of family go forth  
from the household life into the homeless state,  
will take him 7 years...only 7 days.<sup>11</sup> (D 25,22.2/3:55 paraphrased), SD 1.4<sup>12</sup>

3.1.2.5 This is clearly not a challenge of religious “conversion,” as we commonly know it today. Following the above statement [3.1.2.4] in the Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda Sutta, the Buddha continues by stating the true purpose of his teaching:

**23** “Nigrodha, you may think,  
‘The recluse Gotama says this out of desire to win disciples.’

But you should not think so.

Let whoever is your teacher remain as your teacher. ...

Let your rules remain as your rules. ...

Let your livelihood remain as your livelihood. ...

Let what you consider unwholesome continue to be so considered. ...

Let what you consider wholesome continue to be so considered. ...

—I do not speak for any of these reasons.

There are, Nigrodha, *unwholesome things* that have not been abandoned, defiled, conducive to rebirth, fearful, productive of painful results in the future, associated with birth, decay and death. It is for the abandonment of these things that I teach Dharma.

23.2 If you practise accordingly, these defiled states will be abandoned, the states that purify will increase, and by your *direct knowledge*, you will realize, here and now, the bountiful perfection of wisdom.<sup>13</sup> (D 25,232/3:55 abridged), SD 1.4

Here again we see the Buddha affirming that the purpose of religion, or at least early Buddhism, is not the acceptance of any dogma or teaching, or even changing one’s religion, but that of living a virtuous life that is the basis for personal growth and spiritual awakening. [4.3.2.3]

## 4 The 4 motives

### 4.1 THE 3 ROOTS

**4.1.1 Roots, unwholesome and wholesome.** The passage on the 4 motives (greed, hate, delusion, and impetuosity) appears twice in the (Licchavī) Bhaddiya Sutta: the first set appears as the 4 unwholesome motives [§§3-4.3], and the second as the 4 wholesome motives [§§8-9.3]. These same passages

<sup>9</sup> A 3.65/1:188-193 @ SD 35.4a.

<sup>10</sup> These 2 lines: *Etu viññū puriso asaṭṭho amāyāvī uju,jātiko aham anusāsāmi, aham dhammaṃ desemi*. This second line and the foll line [§16.4: see foll n], also spoken by the Buddha to the 5 monks at **V 1:9,15-17**, where instead of “recluseship” (*sāmañña*), the ref is to the true purpose of renunciation (as in the stock passage).

<sup>11</sup> These last 4 lines on the Buddha’s “prediction” of realization are also found in **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22,22) and **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10,46), SD 13, & also Analayo, *Satipaṭṭhāna: The direct path to realization*, 2003:250-257.

<sup>12</sup> See also SD 40a.15 (16.3-5).

<sup>13</sup> On the significance of this whole passage, see SD 19.1 (7.3).

recur in the Kesa,puttiya Sutta (A 3.65), but without the fourth motive (that is, *sārambha* and *asārambha*, respectively).<sup>14</sup> [4.2]

The 3 unwholesome roots (*akusala mūla*)—greed, hate and delusion—are those of unwholesome actions, while the 3 wholesome roots (*kusala mūla*)—non-greed (charity), non-hate (lovingkindness) and non-delusion (wisdom)—are those of wholesome actions. These are common teachings found throughout the suttas.<sup>15</sup>

**4.1.2 The 4 biases.** While the 3 unwholesome roots [4.1.1] are one of the most common sets of negative motivators of unwholesome action,<sup>16</sup> an expanded set of this is that of the 4 biases (*agati*), that is, greed, hate, delusion, and fear.<sup>17</sup> In other words, we are driven to commit any kind of unwholesome act or omit any kind of wholesome act on account of greed, hate, delusion or fear.

While greed and hate, and to some extent delusion, arise from a lack of moral restraint (that is, restraint of the 6 senses), **fear** tends to arise in the unmindful. Fear tends to arise from any kind of lust or attachment.<sup>18</sup> The best antidote for overcoming fear is of course to uproot any kind of craving. The next best way of overcoming fear is by way of cultivating mindfulness or dhyana.<sup>19</sup>

## 4.2 SĀRAMBHA

**4.2.1 Meaning.** In the (Licchavī) Bhaddiya, we see the Buddha adding *sārambha* to the 3 unwholesome roots. We also have the reading *sāraddha*, “violent, angry,” in the PTS edition. The Pali dictionaries give *sārambha* (ts; cf Skt *saṁrambha*) the following range of meanings:

- (1) impetuosity, animosity, aggressiveness, hot-headedness, anger (A 1:100, 299, 2:193; M 1:16; S 1:279; Dh 133; J 4:26; Miln 289,11; ItA 1:95).
- (2) quarrel (Sn 483; J 2:223, 5:141).
- (3) pride (Tha 759; VvA 139).

As *~kathā*, “angry or haughty talk, imperiousness.”<sup>20</sup> It is likely the Buddha has all these qualities in mind. Comys gloss it as the characteristic of impetuous angry protest” (*karaṇ’uttariya, lakkaṇam*, SA 2:264); “on account of impetuosity, expressing vehement anger” (*sārambha, vasena karaṇ’uttarikam karoti*, J 3:260): cf “impetuously angry protest” (*karaṇ’uttariya*, DhA 1:44); “characteristic of acting with vehement anger” (*karaṇ’uttariya, karaṇa, lakkaṇa*, ThaA 3:28 = CA 139); that it arises on account of discontent (*arati, vasena*, ThaA 1:108).

**4.2.2 Application.** Why does the Buddha add *sārambha* to the list of 3 unwholesome roots in the (Licchavī) Bhaddiya Sutta [eg §4.3]? Like fear (*bhaya*), **impetuosity** (*sārambha*), too, arises when we are both morally unrestrained and unmindful. In other words, impetuosity is motivated by either greed or

<sup>14</sup> The sections on the 3 unwholesome roots [§§3-4.2] (omitting the *sārambha* section), as in **Kesa,puttiya S** (A 3.65,4-6/1:189 f), SD 35.4a. The sections on the 3 wholesome roots [§§8-9.3] (omitting the *asārambha* section), as in **Kesa,puttiya S** (A 3.65,10-12/1:193), SD 35.4a.

<sup>15</sup> See (**Akusala Mūla**) **Añña Titthiya** (A 3.68/1:199-201), SD 16.4); **Abhabba Tayo,dhamma S** (A 10.76/5:-144-149), SD 2.4: on the unwholesome roots, see §§3-4; on how they are overcome, see §§23-24. On the unwholesome roots as motivators of action, see SD 5.7 (2.2.2(5)). On the wholesome roots, see **Sammā Ditthi S** (M 9,7), SD 11.14); **Mahā Vaccha,gotta S** (M 73,4), SD 27.4; **Mūla S** (A 3.69,6-10), SD 18.2.

<sup>16</sup> The 10 unwholesome courses of karma (*akusala kamma,patha*) are: (1) killing, (2) stealing, (3) sexual misconduct; (4) lying, (5) divisive speech, (6) harsh speech, (7) frivolous chatter; (8) covetousness, (9) ill will, (10) wrogn views: (1-3) are bodily karma, (4-7) are verbal karma, (8-10) are mental karma. See **Sāleyyaka S** (M 41,7-10/1:286 f), SD 5.7; **Saṅcetanika S** (A 10.206,1-7), SD 3.9. Opp: the 10 wholesome karmic courses (*kusala kamma,patha*), see **Saṅcetanika S** (A 10.206,7.2-12), SD 3.9.

<sup>17</sup> *le chandāgati, lobhāgati, mohāgati* and *bhayāgati*, respectively also called “motives”: (*thāna*): see **Agati Ss 1-3** (A 4.17-19), SD 89.7-9; **Bhatt’uddesaka S** (A 4.20), SD 89.10.

<sup>18</sup> Fear is said to arise from endearment (*piyato jāyati bhayam*, Dh 212b), from love (*pemato jāyato bhayam*, Dh 213b), and from lust (*ratiyā jāyati bhayam*, Dh 214b).

<sup>19</sup> “On account of having the resolve to attain mental stillness, the bias of fear does not arise because of one’s innocence,” *upasaṁhādhīthāna,samudāgamena bhayāgatiṁ na gacchati anaparādhato*, CA 325).

<sup>20</sup> M 1:16; Dh 133; DhA 3:57.

hate, and always with some level of delusion, and it is outwardly expressed through bodily action or speech. [4.1.2]

Impetuosity is specially added to the list of 3 unwholesome roots in the (Licchavī) Bhaddiya Sutta [§4.3] because of the nature of problem that has been raised by Bhaddiya to the Buddha. Outside sectarians and rival teachers, attached to their teachings and groups, are understandably alarmed at the growing popularity of the Buddha who draws vast audiences and converting even the most devoted followers of the various sects [2.1]. On account of their attachment and craving, and lack of spiritual development, the various outside sectarians cast aspersions on the Buddha, claiming that he is a “magician” who uses “conversion magic” to attract followers.

The Buddha, on the other hand, explains that true religion is not about belief and affiliation to a group, but about wisdom and personal transformation. Notice that throughout the Buddha’s instruction in the (Licchavī) Bhaddiya Sutta, there is no mention of belief or belonging to a group or guru. His emphasis is on right practice and moral virtue.

Towards the close of the Sutta, when Bhaddiya has gone for refuge, the Buddha asks him if this was because on his evangelizing or seeking followers, saying, “Come, Bhaddiya, be my disciple! I will be your teacher!” [§14]. Bhaddiya at once denies this, and then affirming that despite the accusations, he actually feels that the Buddha’s “conversion magic” (that is, the Dharma) is really a good thing, after all, since it actually benefits everyone! [§16]

### 4.3 RIGHT VIEWS AS VIRTUOUS CONDUCT

**4.3.1 Personal accountability.** The main drift of the teaching of the (Licchavī) Bhaddiya Sutta is that we should act in a wholesome way [§2.2]. The Buddha then elaborates that we tend to destroy life, steal, violate the person of others, lie, and encourage others to do likewise on account of the 4 motives: greed (*lobha*) [§4.1], hate (*dosa*) [§4.2], delusion (*moha*) [§4.2] and impetuosity (*sārambha*) [§4.3]—all of which “will bring about harm and suffering for a long time.”

This is a teaching on personal accountability, that is, we are responsible for our own actions, and as such should be mindful of them, that they do not harm oneself, others or the world. If the Buddha’s teaching is based on personal accountability and self-transformation, it is not true or helpful to speak of the Buddha “converting” others. The Dhammapada records the Buddha as famously declaring:

<i>Tumhehi kiccaṃ ātappam</i>	You must make the effort.	
<i>akkhātāro tathāgatā</i>	The tathagatas only show the way.	
<i>paṭipannā pamokkhanti</i>	Liberated are those who have gained the path,	
<i>jhāyino māra,bandhanā</i>	who meditate, freed from Mara’s bonds.	(Dh 276)

### 4.3.2 Greatest good

4.3.2.1 Like the Kesa,puttiya Sutta (A 3.65), the (Licchavī) Bhaddiya Sutta (A 4.193), too, has two emphatic statements (*avadharāṇa*), that is, “Social refrain 1” [§5] and “Social refrain 2” [§10]. Social refrain 1 has been discussed under Kesa,puttiya Sutta.<sup>21</sup> So here, we will focus on discussing “Social refrain 2,” which goes like this:

“What do you think, Bhaddiya, are these things wholesome or unwholesome?”

“Wholesome, bhante.”

“Blamable or not blamable?”

“Not blamable, bhante.”

“Censured or praised by the wise?”

“Praised by the wise, bhante.”

“Fully undertaken for oneself do they bring about good and happiness or not; or how is it here?”

“Fully undertaken for oneself, bhante, they bring about good and happiness.”

“So indeed it is to us in this matter.” (*Evaṃ no ettha hotīti*) [§10]

<sup>21</sup> See A 3.65,7 @ SD 35.4a (Comy).

4.3.2.2 **The Udāna Commentary**, in its explanation of the term *evam*, gives this passage as an example of an emphasis or emphatic statement (*avadhāraṇa*) (UA 7). This is a vital stage in the “word” (*pada*) learning process, so that the text (*vyañjana*) is understood in context (*attha*). The exercise begins with partial rejection of the following:

- §4 on the unwholesomeness of greed,
- §5 on the unwholesomeness of hate, and
- §6 on the unwholesomeness of delusion,

and climaxes with the full affirmation of §7.

4.3.2.3 In repeating these key points, the Kālāmas not only show their *understanding* of the points, but also their *acceptance* of them on a broader social level. This is highly significant if we note that the preceding section [§§3.2-6] addresses personal accountability and how our action affect others.

In this section, *how our actions affect others* is stressed. In other words, **right view** is not about endorsing opinions and enforcing dogmas, but living a virtuous life, being a truly good person. This is something clearly universal that any person with some level of wisdom would notice this and agree with it. Having established this consensus, the Buddha goes on to the next stage of his admonition.

— — —

## The Discourse to Bhaddiya (the Licchavī)

A 4.193

1 At one time the Blessed One was residing in the hall of the gabled house<sup>22</sup> in the Great Wood outside Vesālī.

### The Buddha and “conversion magic”

1.2 Then Bhaddiya the Licchavī, saluted him and sat down at one side.<sup>23</sup> Sitting thus at one side, he said this to the Blessed One:

1.3 “Bhante I heard this, ‘The recluse Gotama is an illusionist [magician]. He knows the conversion magic with which he converts the disciple of other sectarians!’<sup>24</sup>

1.4 Bhante, those who speak thus, ‘*The recluse Gotama is an illusionist. He knows the conversion magic with which he converts the disciple of other sectarians!*’—

do they, bhante, speak what has been spoken by the Blessed One, and not misrepresent him with what is untrue? And would they explain the matter in accordance with the Dharma so that there arises no reasonable ground for disputation or censure?’<sup>25</sup> [191]

<sup>22</sup> “The hall of the gabled house,” or simply “the gabled house” (*kūṭ’āgāra,sālā*) located . See Intro (2).

<sup>23</sup> Comy says that just after the Buddha’s breakfast, Bhaddiya, bearing “garlands, fragrances and unguents,” visits the Buddha to pay him homage (AA 3:172). See Intro [1.1].

<sup>24</sup> “*Sutaṃ m’etaṃ bhante māyāvī samaṇo gotamo āvaṭṭaniṃ māyaṃ\* jānāti, yāya añña,titthiyānaṃ sāvake āvaṭṭeti.* \*Be Ee so; Ce *āvaṭṭanī,māyaṃ*; Be:Ka Ke Se *āvaṭṭani,māyaṃ*. On suttas dealing with this accusation, see Intro [2].

<sup>25</sup> *Kacci te bhante bhagavato vutta,vādino, na ca bhagavantam abhūtena abbhācikkhanti, dhammassa cānudhammam vyākaronti, na ca koci saha,dhammiko vādānuvādo gārayham ṭhānam āgacchatīti.* This is stock: see (**Majjhima**) **Jīvaka S** (M 55,3.2) n, SD 43.4.

## THE BAD CONDUCT CYCLE

### The 10 doubtful points: Opening cycle<sup>26</sup>

- |   |   |  |
|---|---|--|
| 2 | “Come, Bhaddiya, <sup>27</sup>  |  |
|   | (1) Do not go <sup>28</sup> by aural tradition (including “revelations”). <sup>29</sup>                         | <i>mā anussavena</i>                   |
|   | (2) Do not go by lineage [received wisdom].   | <i>mā paramparāya</i>                  |
|   | (3) Do not go by hearsay.   | <i>mā iti, kirāya</i>                  |
|   | (4) Do not go by scriptural authority.  | <i>mā piṭaka, sampadānena</i>          |
|   | (5) Do not go by pure reason.   | <i>mā takka, hetu[, gāhena]</i>        |
|   | (6) Do not go by inference [by logic].  | <i>mā naya, hetu[, gāhena]</i>         |
|   | (7) Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious reasoning].  | <i>mā ākāra, parivitakkena</i>         |
|   | (8) Do not go by acceptance of [being convinced of]<br>a view after pondering on it.                            | <i>mā diṭṭhi, nijjhāna-k, khantiyā</i> |
|   | (9) Do not go by (another’s) seeming ability.   | <i>mā bhavya, rūpatāya</i>             |
|   | (10) Do not go by the thought, “This monk <sup>30</sup> is our teacher”<br>[“This recluse is respected by us”]. | <i>mā samaṇo no garu</i>               |

### Virtuous conduct refrain 1 (Omission)

2.2 When you know for yourself, Bhaddiya,  
‘These things are unwholesome.

These things are blamable. These things are censured by the wise.

These things, fully undertaken for oneself,<sup>31</sup> bring about harm and suffering.<sup>32</sup>

—Then, Bhaddiya, you should abandon them.<sup>33</sup>

### The 4 unwholesome motives<sup>34</sup>

3 GREED. What do you think, Bhaddiya, when **greed** arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?<sup>35</sup>

“For his harm, bhante.”

“This person, Bhaddiya, who is greedy, overcome by greed, his mind controlled by it,

<sup>26</sup> These well known points occur in **Kesa,puttiya S** (A 3.65,3 etc), SD 35.4a, where they are discussed in some detail. See Intro [3].

<sup>27</sup> *Etha tumhe bhaddiya*, lit, “Come you Bhaddiya!”

<sup>28</sup> Comy interprets as *mā gaṇhiṭṭha* or *mā gaṇhittha*, “do not accept (lit, ‘take hold of’) (a notion)” throughout (AA 2:305).

<sup>29</sup> Broadly speaking, this also includes what we have heard and read.

<sup>30</sup> *Samaṇa* is usually tr as “recluse,” even “holy man,” but here also refers to “nun,” or a religious teacher.

<sup>31</sup> “Fully undertaken for oneself,” *samattā samādinnā*. **Samadinnā** here is pp of *samādiyati*, “he undertakes” (as in “I undertake,” *samādiyāmi*, the training precepts). **Samattā** has these senses: (1) cf Skt *samasta*, Jtkm 31.90; A 2:-193, ie here; Sn 781 = *paripuṇṇa*; Nm 65; (2) cf Skt *samāpta*; complete, entire, perfect (Sn 402, 881, 1000; Nm 289, 298; SnA 778; Miln 349); (3) adv, *samattam*, “completely (S 5:175), “accomplished, in full” (Sn 889). The meaning here is that if any of the 10 doubtful points were accepted or practised “in full,” it would not be beneficial, and even be detrimental to one. See Sn:N 344 n 402.

<sup>32</sup> *Yadā tumhe bhaddiya attanā va jāneyyayātha, ime dhammā akusalā ime dhammā sāvajja ime dhammā viññu, - garahitā ime dhammā sammattā samādinnā ahitāya dukkhāya samvattanti*. Also at §6.2. Cf §§7.2+11.2.

<sup>33</sup> *Atha tumhe bhaddiya pajaheyyātha*. Also at §11.2 ad loc. Cf §§2.2+6.2 ad loc.

<sup>34</sup> The sections on the 3 unwholesome roots [§§3-4.2] here (omitting the *sārambha* section), as in **Kesa,puttiya S** (A 3.65,4-6/1:189 f), SD 35.4a.

<sup>35</sup> *Tam kim maññatha bhaddiya lobho purisassa ajjhataṃ uppajjamāno uppajjati hitāya vā ahitāya vāti*, lit “What do you think, Bhaddiya, when greed arises within, does it arise for the person’s good or non-good?” The sentence structure is the same for the cognate sentences in §4 (on hate), §4.2 (on delusion), and §4.3 (on impetuosity).



will destroy life,  
 will take what is not-given,  
 will violate the women of others,<sup>36</sup> and  
 will tell lies,  
 and he will also make others do likewise—  
 which will bring about harm and suffering for a long time.”  
 “Yes, bhante.”

**4 HATE.** “What do you think, Bhaddiya, when **hate** arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?”

“For his harm, bhante.”  
 “This person, Bhaddiya, who is hateful, overcome by hatred, his mind controlled by it,  
 will destroy life,  
 will take what is not-given,  
 will violate the women of others, and  
 will tell lies,  
 and he will also make others do likewise—  
 which will bring about harm and suffering for a long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

**4.2 DELUSION.** “What do you think, Bhaddiya, when **delusion** arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?”

“For his harm, bhante.”  
 “This person, Bhaddiya, who is deluded, overcome by delusion, his mind controlled by it,  
 will destroy life,  
 will take what is not-given,  
 will violate the women of others, and  
 will tell lies,  
 and he will also make others do likewise—  
 which will bring about harm and suffering for a long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

**4.3 IMPETUOSITY.** “What do you think, Bhaddiya, when **impetuosity**<sup>37</sup> arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?”

“For his harm, bhante.”  
 “This person, Bhaddiya, who is impetuous, overcome by impetuosity, his mind controlled by it,  
 will destroy life,  
 will take what is not-given,  
 will violate the women of others, and  
 will tell lies,  
 and he will also make others do likewise—  
 which will bring about harm and suffering for a long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

### Social refrain 1: Emphatic rejection

**5** “What do you think, Bhaddiya, are these things wholesome or unwholesome?”

“Unwholesome, bhante.”

“Blamable or not blamable?”

<sup>36</sup> *Para,dāram pi gacchati*, lit “go to the women of others, too.” It is likely that most, if not all, of the Buddha’s audience at Vesālī are men, since elsewhere, we often see the third precept reads *kāmesu micchācārā*, “misconduct through sense-pleasures” (eg M 1:312), esp in the 5 precepts (*pañca,sīla*, D 1:146), which applies to all, regardless of gender.

<sup>37</sup> *Sārambha* (Ee *sāradhha*, “violent, angry”): see Intro [3.2.2].

“Blamable, bhante.”

“Censured or praised by the wise?”

“Censured by the wise, bhante.”

“These things, fully undertaken for oneself, do they bring about harm and suffering?”

“These things, bhante, fully undertaken for oneself, bring about harm and suffering for a long time.”

“So indeed it is to us in this matter.”<sup>38</sup>

### The 10 doubtful points: 2<sup>nd</sup> cycle

6 “Thus have I spoken, Bhaddiya; it is for this reason that I have spoken thus:

‘Come, Bhaddiya,

(1) Do not go by aural tradition (including “revelations”).

(2) Do not go by lineage [received wisdom].

(3) Do not go by hearsay. [192]

(4) Do not go by scriptural authority.

(5) Do not go by pure reason.

(6) Do not go by inference [by logic].

(7) Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious reasoning].

(8) Do not go by acceptance of [being convinced of] a view after pondering on it.

(9) Do not go by (another’s) seeming ability.

(10) Do not go by the thought, “This monk is our teacher” [“This recluse is respected by us”].

### Virtuous conduct refrain 2 (Omission)

6.2 When you know for yourself, Bhaddiya,

“These things are unwholesome.

These things are blamable. These things are censured by the wise.

These things, fully undertaken for oneself, bring about harm and suffering.”<sup>39</sup>

—Then, Bhaddiya, you should abandon them.”<sup>40</sup>

## THE GOOD CONDUCT CYCLE

### The 10 doubtful points: 3<sup>rd</sup> cycle

6.3 Thus have I spoken, Bhaddiya; it is for this reason that I have spoken:

7 ‘Come, Bhaddiya,

(1) Do not go by aural tradition (including “revelations”).

(2) Do not go by lineage [received wisdom].

(3) Do not go by hearsay.

(4) Do not go by scriptural authority.

(5) Do not go by pure reason.

(6) Do not go by inference [by logic].

(7) Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious reasoning].

(8) Do not go by acceptance of [being convinced of] a view after pondering on it.

(9) Do not go by (another’s) seeming ability.

(10) Do not go by the thought, “This monk is our teacher” [“This recluse is respected by us”].’

<sup>38</sup> *Evam* no ettha hotīti. Udāna Comy, in its explanation of the term *evam*, gives this passage as an example of an emphasis or emphatic statement (*avadhāraṇa*) (UA 7). This is a vital stage in the “word” (*pada*) learning process, so that the text (*vyañjana*) is understood in context (*attha*). See Intro [1.5].

<sup>39</sup> *Yadā tumhe bhaddiya attanā va jāneyyātha, ime dhammā akusalā ime dhammā sāvajja ime dhammā viññu, - garahitā ime dhammā sammattā samādinā ahitāya dukkhāya samvattanti.* Also at §2.2. Cf §§7.2+11.2.

<sup>40</sup> *Atha tumhe bhaddiya attanā pajaheyyātha.* As at §2.2 ad loc. Cf §§7.2+11.2 ad loc.

### Virtuous conduct refrain 3 (Commission)

7.2 When you know for yourself, Bhaddiya,  
‘These things are wholesome.

These things are not blamable. These things are praised by the wise.

These things, fully undertaken for oneself, bring good and happiness,<sup>41</sup>  
—then, Bhaddiya, you should live attaining them.<sup>42</sup>

### The 4 wholesome motives<sup>43</sup>

**8 NON-GREED.** What do you think, Bhaddiya, when **non-greed** [charity] arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?”

“For his good, bhante.”

“This person, Bhaddiya, who is not greedy, not overcome by greed, his thoughts not controlled by it, will not destroy life,

will not take what is not-given,

will not violate the women of others, and

will not tell lies,

and he will also not make others do likewise—

which will bring about good and happiness for a long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

**9 NON-HATE.** “What do you think, Bhaddiya, this person, in whom **non-hate** [lovingkindness] arises, does it arise for his good or for his harm?”

“For his good, bhante.”

“This person, Bhaddiya, who is not hateful, not overcome by hatred, his mind not controlled by it, will not destroy life,

will not take what is not-given,

will not violate the women of others, and

will not tell lies,

and he will also not make others do likewise—

which will bring about good and happiness for a long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

**9.2 NON-DELUSION.** “What do you think, Bhaddiya, this person, in whom **non-delusion** [wisdom] arises, does it arise for his good or for his harm?”

“For his good, bhante.”

“This person, Bhaddiya, who is not deluded, not overcome by delusion, his mind not controlled by it, will not destroy life,

will not take what is not-given,

will not violate the women of others, and

will not tell lies,

and he will also not make others do likewise—

which will bring about good and happiness for a long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

<sup>41</sup> *Yadā tumhe bhaddiya attanā va jāneyyātha, ime dhammā kusalā ime dhammā anavajja ime dhammā viññu-p, pasathā ime dhammā sammattā samādinna hitāya sukhāya saṁvattanti.* Also at §11.2. Cf §§2.2+6.2.

<sup>42</sup> *Atha tumhe bhaddiya upasampajja vihareyyātha.* Here, **upasanpajja** is an indecl, an absolutive of *upasampajja-ti*, meaning “after reaching, attaining, in the attaining of” (V 3:4,8; V 5:135,17 = D 1:156,26 = A 4:13,6 = 5:69,18; M 1:89,35 = Pug 59.29 = Vbh 245,7; S 1:140,27; A 1:50,23; Sn 16,9; U 24,1 = Pm 2:176,6; 4 2:100,18; M 3:109,5; S 3:8,22, 5:407,11; Thī 362). Also at §§11.2 ad loc. Cf §§2.2+6.2 ad loc.

<sup>43</sup> The sections on the 3 wholesome roots [§§8-9.3] here (omitting the *asārambha* section), as in **Kesa,puttiya S** (A 3.65,10-12/1:193), SD 35.4a.

9.3 NON-IMPETUOSITY. “What do you think, Bhaddiya, this person, in whom **non-impetuosity**<sup>44</sup> arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?”

“For his good, bhante.”

“This person, Bhaddiya, who is not impetuous, not overcome by impetuosity, his mind not controlled by it,

*will not destroy life,*

*will not take what is not-given,*

*will not violate the women of others, and*

*will not tell lies,*

*and he will also not make others do likewise—*

*which will bring about good and happiness for a long time.”*

“Yes, bhante.”

### Social refrain 2: Emphatic affirmation

**10** “What do you think, Bhaddiya, are these things wholesome or unwholesome?”

“Wholesome, bhante.”

“Blamable or not blamable?”

“Not blamable, bhante.”

“Censured or praised by the wise?”

“Praised by the wise, bhante.” [193]

“Fully undertaken for oneself do they bring about good and happiness or not; or how is it here?”

“Fully undertaken for oneself, bhante, they bring about good and happiness.”

“So indeed it is to us in this matter.

### The 10 doubtful points: 4<sup>th</sup> cycle

**11** Thus have I spoken, Bhaddiya; it is for this reason that I have spoken thus:

‘Come, Bhaddiya,

(1) Do not go by aural tradition (including “revelations”).

(2) Do not go by lineage [received wisdom].

(3) Do not go by hearsay.

(4) Do not go by scriptural authority.

(5) Do not go by pure reason.

(6) Do not go by inference [by logic].

(7) Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious reasoning].

(8) Do not go by acceptance of [being convinced of] a view after pondering on it.

(9) Do not go by (another’s) seeming ability.

(10) Do not go by the thought, “This monk is our teacher” [“This recluse is respected by us”].’

### Virtuous conduct refrain 4 (Commission)

11.2 When you know for yourself, Bhaddiya,

‘These things are wholesome.

These things are not blamable. These things are praised by the wise.

These things, fully undertaken for oneself, bring good and happiness.’<sup>45</sup>

—Then, Bhaddiya, you should live attaining them.<sup>46</sup>

Thus have I spoken, Bhaddiya; it is for this reason that I have spoken thus.

<sup>44</sup> *Asārambha*: see *sārambha* at §4.3.

<sup>45</sup> *Yadā tumhe bhaddiya attanā va jāneyyayātha, ime dhammā kusalā ime dhammā anavajja ime dhammā viññu-p.pasatthā ime dhammā sammattā samādinna hitāya sukhāya samvattanti*. Also at §7.2. Cf §§2.2+6.2.

<sup>46</sup> See §7.2 ad loc n. Cf §§2.2+6.2.

## THE CONVERSION CYCLE

### Pushing away the 4 unwholesome motives

**12** Now, Bhaddiya, those good true individuals in the world encourage their disciples, thus:<sup>47</sup>

12.2 ‘My good man, come now, dwell again and again pushing away greed.

When you dwell again and again pushing away *greed*, you will not do any action born of *greed* by way of body, speech or mind.<sup>48</sup>

12.3 Come now, dwell again and again pushing away hate.

When you dwell again and again pushing away *hate*, you will not do any action born of *hate* by way of body, speech or mind.

12.4 Come now, dwell again and again pushing away delusion.

When you dwell again and again pushing away *delusion*, you will not do any action born of *delusion* by way of body, speech or mind.

12.5 Come now, dwell again and again pushing away impetuosity.

When you dwell again and again pushing away *impetuosity*, you will not do any action born of *impetuosity* by way of body, speech or mind.”

### Bhaddiya goes for refuge

**13** When this was spoken, Bhaddiya the Licchavi said this to the Blessed One:

“Excellent, bhante! Excellent, bhante!

Just as if one were to place upright what had been overturned,

or were to reveal what was hidden,

or were to show the way to one who was lost,

or were to hold up a lamp in the dark so that those with eyes could see forms,

in the same way, in numerous ways, the Dharma has been made clear by the Blessed One.

I go to the Blessed One for refuge, to the Dharma, and to the community of monks.

May the Blessed One remember me as a layman who has gone to him for refuge from this day forth for life.”

### The clincher

**14** “Now, Bhaddiya, did I say to you, thus:

‘Come, Bhaddiya, be my disciple! I will be your teacher!’<sup>49</sup>”

“Not at all, bhante!”

**15** “Yet, Bhaddiya, though I spoke thus, point out thus, some recluses and brahmins emptily, wrongly, untruthfully, falsely, baselessly, misrepresent me, thus:<sup>50</sup>

‘*The recluse Gotama is an illusionist. He knows the conversion magic with which he converts the disciple of other sectarians!*’ [194]

<sup>47</sup> *Ye kho te bhaddiya loke santo sappurisā, te sāvakaṃ evaṃ samādapenti.*

<sup>48</sup> *Ehi tvam ambho purisa lobhaṃ vineyya vineyya* [So Ce Ke Se; Be *vineyya*] *viharāhi, lobhaṃ vineyya* [id] *viharanto na lobhajaṃ kammaṃ karissasi kāyena vācāya manasā.*

<sup>49</sup> *Ehi me tvam bhaddiya sāvako hoti, ahaṃ satthā bhavissāmīti.*

<sup>50</sup> *Eke samaṇa brāhmaṇā asatā tucchā musā abhūtena abbhācikkhanti.* Cf **Pāṭaliya S** (S 42.13) where the Buddha actually admits that he *is* a “magician” (*māyāvī*) and then goes on to explain the “magic” of the Dharma [2.2].

## THE STREAMWINNING CYCLE

### Bhaddiya's lion-roar<sup>51</sup>

**16** “Auspicious (*bhaddika*), bhante, is the conversion magic!<sup>52</sup> Beautiful (*kalyāṇi*), bhante, is the conversion magic!<sup>53</sup>

(1) Bhante, beloved (*piya*) would be my blood relatives and relations were they to be converted by this conversion! It would be for my beloved relatives' good and happiness for a long time!<sup>54</sup>

(2) Bhante, if all the kshatriyas [the noble class] were to be converted by this conversion, it would be for their good and happiness for a long time!

(3) Bhante, if all the brahmins [the priestly class] were to be converted by this conversion, it would be for their good and happiness for a long time!

(4) Bhante, if all the vaishyas [the business class] were to be converted by this conversion, it would be for their good and happiness for a long time!

(5) Bhante, if all the shudras [the working class] were to be converted by this conversion, it would be for their good and happiness for a long time!”

### The Buddha's response

**17** “So it is, Bhaddiya! So it is, Bhaddiya!

(1) Bhaddiya, if all the kshatriyas [the noble class] were to be converted by this conversion— for the abandoning of unwholesome states, for the promoting of wholesome states<sup>55</sup>— it would be for the good and happiness *of all the kshatriyas* for a long time!<sup>56</sup>

(3) Bhaddiya, if all the brahmins [the priestly class] were to be converted by this conversion— for the abandoning of unwholesome states, for the promoting of wholesome states— it would be for their good and happiness *of all the brahmins* for a long time!

(4) Bhaddiya, if all the vaishyas [the business class] were to be converted by this conversion— for the abandoning of unwholesome states, for the promoting of wholesome states— it would be for their good and happiness *of all the vaishyas* for a long time!

(5) Bhante, if all the shudras [the working class] were to be converted by this conversion— for the abandoning of unwholesome states, for the promoting of wholesome states— it would be for their good and happiness *of all the shudras* a long time!”

(6) Bhaddiya, if this world, along with its gods, its bad ones [Māra], its high gods, its recluses and brahmins, this generation, with its rulers and people, were to be converted by this conversion— for the abandoning of unwholesome states, for the promoting of wholesome states— it would be for the good and happiness *of the world along with its gods, its bad ones [Māra], its high gods, its recluses and brahmins, this generation, with its rulers and people*, for a long time!

**18** Bhaddiya, even if these great sal trees<sup>57</sup> were to be converted by this conversion—

<sup>51</sup> Comy says that while the Buddha is “turning over” (*vinivaṭṭente*) the teaching, ie, in the midst of it, Bhaddiya becomes a streamwinner (AA 3:172). That awakening moment is likely to be just before this *udāna*.

<sup>52</sup> *Bhaddikā bhante āvaṭṭanī māyā*. In **Upāli (Gaha,pati) S** (M 56), Upāli is saying this in reference to the path of streamwinning that he has won earlier (MA 3:94).

<sup>53</sup> *Kalyāṇī bhante āvaṭṭanī māyā*. From this line until §26.6 parallels in some way to §26 of **Upāli (Gaha,pati) S** (M 56/2:383,32-384,7), SD 27.1, which however is slightly briefer.

<sup>54</sup> *Piyā me bhante ñāti, sālohitā imāya āvaṭṭaniyā āvaṭṭeyyūṃ, piyānam pi me assa ñāti, sālohitānam dīgha, rattam hitāya sukhāya*.

<sup>55</sup> The Buddha adds this highly significant phrase, which highlights the fact that Dharma-moved conversion is about self-transformation and self-liberation, and not about becoming a member of a religious group or professing a religion.

<sup>56</sup> *Sabbe ce'pi bhaddiya khattiyā imāya āvaṭṭaniyā āvaṭṭeyyūṃ akusala, dhamma-p, pahānāya kusala, dhammūpa-sampadāya, sabbesam pi'ssa khattiyānam dīgha, rattam hitāya sukhāya*.

<sup>57</sup> Comy says that there were two great sal trees standing before (*purato thite*) the Buddha at that time (AA 3:173).

for the abandoning of unwholesome states, for the promoting of wholesome states—  
 it would be for the good and happiness *of these great sal trees* for a long time<sup>58</sup>—  
 that is, if they could think.<sup>59</sup>  
 what more to say of human beings!”

— evaṃ —

072324 140322 140328 140423r

---

<sup>58</sup> For similar remarks on sal trees, see **Sarakāni S 1** (S 55.24/5:377, if they could discern between good speech and wrong speech, they could attain streamwinning) SD 3.6; **Vāseṭṭha S** (A 8.44/4:259, regarding the benefit of keeping the uposatha), SD 89.6.

<sup>59</sup> Ee Ce Se *sace ceteyyumi*; but not Be.