

## 21

## Two Discourses on Losses

(1) (Pañcaka) Akkosaka Sutta, The (Fives) Discourse on the Reviler | A 5.211

(2) (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta, The (Tens) Discourse on the Reviler | A 10.88

Theme: The disadvantages of reviling one another in the sangha

Translated &amp; annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

1 The (Pañcaka) Akkosaka Sutta

While the **Saṅgha, bheda Sutta** (It 18) warns of mutual abusing, disdain and rejecting in the sangha can lead to a schism,<sup>1</sup> the **(Pañcaka) Akkosaka Sutta** (A 5.211) speaks of 5 kinds of disadvantages (*ādīnavā*) that befall a monk who reviles or abuses another. While the former addresses a broader danger—that of a schism in the sangha—the latter deals with failure on a more personal level.

## SD 46.21(1)

**(Pañcaka) Akkosaka Sutta**

The (Fives) Discourse on the Reviler | A 5.211/3:252

Theme: The disadvantages of reviling and abusing in the sangha

Traditional: A 5.5.2.1 = Aṅguttara 5, Pañcaka Nipāta 5, Pañcama Paṇṇāsaka 2, Akkosaka Vagga 1

1 Bhikshus, when a monk is one who scolds and abuses his fellow brahmacharis [celibates], faulting the noble ones,

these 5 disadvantages can be expected to fall on him.

What are the five?

2 THE 5 DISADVANTAGES (*pañca ādīnavā*)

(1) He commits a defeat offence or cuts off the outlets.<sup>2</sup>

(2) Or, he commits one or other defiling offence.

(3) Or, he will have a serious disease or ill health.

(4) He dies confused.

(5) With the body's breaking up, after death,<sup>3</sup>

he is reborn in a plane of misery, a bad destination, a lower realm, in hell.

*pārājiko vā hoti chinna,paripantho.*

*aññatarāṃ vā saṅkiliṭṭhāṃ āpattiṃ āpajjati*

*bālham vā rog'ātāṅkam phusati*

*sammūḷho kālam karoti*

*kāyassa bheda param marañā*

*apāyam duggatiṃ vinipātāṃ nirayam*

*papajjati*

3 Bhikshus, when a monk is one who scolds and abuses his fellow brahmacharis [celibates], faulting the noble ones,

these 5 disadvantages can be expected to fall on him.

— evaṃ —

<sup>1</sup> **Saṅgha, bheda S** (It 18), SD 46.19.

<sup>2</sup> Comy explains that he has cut off the outlet (from the world) to the supramundane (*lok'uttara, paripanthassa chinna, paripantho*) (AA 3:327), meaning that, on account of these disadvantages, he is unable to attain any level of sainthood, not even streamwinning. However, we can also take the expression to mean that, having committed the offence of “defeat” (*pārājika*), he is completely cut off from the *bhikkhu* state.

<sup>3</sup> “With the body's breaking up, after death,” *kāyassa bheda param, marañā*. Buddhaghosa explains this phrase as foll: “With the body's breaking up” (*kāyassa bheda*) means on abandoning the aggregates that are clung to; “after death” (*param, marañā*) means that in-between state (*tad-antaram*), in the grasping of the aggregates that have been generated (*abhinibbatta-k, khandha, gahaṇe*). Or, “with the body's breaking up” means the interruption of the life-faculty, and “after death” means after the death-consciousness” (*cuti, cittato uddham*). (Vism 13.91/427; cf NcA 69). See **Deva, dūta S** (M 130,2/3:178), SD 2.23.

## 2 The (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta

### SD 46.21(2)

## (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta

The (Tens) Discourse on the Reviler | A 10.88/5:169  
Theme: The disadvantages of reviling one another in the sangha

**2.1 The (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta** (A 10.88) seems to be an expanded version of the (Pañcaka) Akkosaka Sutta (A 5.211), except for a significant difference in the first factor. Moreover, the latter (A 5.211) uses the term “disadvantage” (*ādīnava*) while the former (A 10.88) speaks of “losses” (*vyasana*), which sounds more grave. The gravity, understandably, is contributed by the presence of the additional 5 kinds of losses in A 10.88.

**2.2** The teachings of **the (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta** (A 10.88) are expanded as **the (Ekādasaka) Vyasana Sutta** (A 11.6), which has an additional “loss,” that is, no. 7, “forsaking the training, he turns to the low life” (*sikkham vā paccakkhāya hīnāy’āvattati*).<sup>4</sup> In other words, the former (A 10.88) can be seen as a shorter version of the latter (A 11.6). Although the difference—the additional factor—is a new one, it similarly reflects the “loss” (*vyasana*) that the other ten factors entail. [3]

**2.3** The (Dasaka) Akkosaka Sutta is, in turn, expanded into **the (Ekā,dasaka) Vyasana Sutta** (A 11.6), with an additional “loss” (*vyasana*), that is, giving up the training and returning to the lay life.<sup>5</sup>

## The (Tens) Discourse on the Reviler

A 10.88

**1** [169] Bhikshus, when a monk is one who scolds and abuses his fellow brahmacharis [celibates], faulting the noble ones,<sup>6</sup>

it is impossible, there is no chance,<sup>7</sup> that he would not<sup>8</sup> incur one or other of these 10 kinds of losses [disasters].<sup>9</sup>

What are these ten?

**2** THE 10 LOSSES (*dasa vyasana*)

(1) He does not attain the unattained.

(2) He loses what he has attained.

(3) The good qualities are not purified in him.

(4) Or, he thinks too highly of himself in terms of good qualities.

(5) Or, he does not delight in living the holy life.<sup>11</sup>

(6) Or, he commits one or other defiling offence.

*anadhigatam nādhigacchati*

*adhigatā parihāyati*

*saddhammassa na vodāyanti*<sup>10</sup>

*saddhammesu vā adhimāniko hoti*

*anabhirato vā brahmacariyaṃ carati*

*aññataram vā saṅkiliṭṭham āpattim āpajjati*

<sup>4</sup> A 11.6 (SD 46.22).

<sup>5</sup> See A 11.6/5:317 (SD 46.22).

<sup>6</sup> *Yo so bhikkhave bhikkhu akkosaka, paribhāsako ariyūpavādī sabrahmacārīnaṃ.*

<sup>7</sup> *Aṭṭhānam etaṃ anavakāso*: Ce Ee Se so; Be *ṭhānam etaṃ avakāso*. The phrase *aṭṭhānam etaṃ anavakāso* is stock: V 2:199; A 1:26, 5:169; Pug 11, 12; PvA 28.

<sup>8</sup> *Na*: Ce Ee Se so; Be omits.

<sup>9</sup> *Yaṃ so dasannaṃ vyaśanānaṃ aññataram vyaśanaṃ na nigaccheyya.*

<sup>10</sup> Be Ce Se Comy so; Ee *vodayati* (sg). Hence, *saddhammassa* should be resolved as *saddhammā assa*, “the good qualities...for him,” foll Comy which says, “The good qualities of the teaching, comprising the 3 trainings, are not purified [polished] for him” (*sikkhā-t.taya, saṅkhātā sāsana, saddhammā assa vodānaṃ na gacchanti*, AA 3:326).

<sup>11</sup> Lit, “He does not live the holy life [celibate monastic life] with joy.”

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| (7) Or, he will have a painful disease or bad health.  | <i>gāḷham vā rog'ātāṅkam phusati</i>   |
| (8) Or, he goes out of mind or becomes deranged.   | <i>ummādam vā pāpuṇāti citta-k,khepaṃ</i>  |
| (9) He dies confused.  | <i>sammūḷho kālam karoti</i>   |
| (10) With the body's breaking up, after death, <sup>12</sup><br>he is reborn in a plane of misery, a bad<br>destination, a lower realm, in hell. | <i>kāyassa bheda param marañā<br/>apāyam duggatiṃ vinipātam nirayam<br/>upapajjati</i> |
- 3** Bhikshus, when a monk is one who scolds and abuses his fellow brahmacharis [celibates], faulting the noble ones,  
it is impossible, there is no chance, that he would not incur one or other of these 10 kinds of losses.

— evaṃ —

140903 140904 141215 150706 160429

---

<sup>12</sup> “With the body’s breaking up, after death,” *kāyassa bheda param,marañā*. Buddhaghosa explains this phrase as foll: “With the body’s breaking up” (*kāyassa bheda*) means on abandoning the aggregates that are clung to; “after death” (*param,marañā*) means that in-between state (*tad-antaram*), in the grasping of the aggregates that have been generated (*abhinibbatta-k,khandha,gahaṇe*). Or, “with the body’s breaking up” means the interruption of the life-faculty, and “after death” means after the death-consciousness” (*cuti,cittato uddham*). (Vism 13.91/427; cf NcA 69). See **Deva,dūta S** (M 130,2/3:178), SD 2.23.