

18

Paṅkadhā Sutta

The Paṅkadhā Discourse | A 3.90 [A:B 3.91]

Be: **Saṅkavā Sutta**, The Saṅkavā Discourse

Theme: All monastics should desire the 3 trainings

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

1 Sutta summary and highlights

1.1 The Buddha gives a discourse on spiritual training at Paṅkadhā (or Saṅkāva, according to the Burmese texts), a market-town in Kosala [§§1-4]. Kassapa,gotta, a monk living there reacts with annoyance at the Buddha's teaching [§5].

1.2 However, when the Buddha has left for Rāja,gaha [§§6-7], Kassapa,gotta regrets his thought [§§8-9], and decides to meet the Buddha and confess his transgression.

It's interesting here that merely thinking such a thought [§5] does not constitute any breach of the Vinaya, that is, despite his negative thought, he does not act on it negatively. On the contrary, he realizes his error, and decides to make amends [§§10-18].

1.3 He confesses his fault before the Buddha and seeks his forgiveness [§19-21]. The Buddha accepts his confession since he owns up, as this truthfulness is in itself a mark of progress (*viddhi*) in terms of monastic discipline [§§22-26].

1.4 In the rest of the Sutta, the Buddha speaks on proper attitude of monastics towards the training. He instructs Kassapa,gotta that he does not endorse any monastic who has no desire for the training, or who does not exhort others like him to undertake the training, or to those who desire the training, he does not endorse what Dharma-Vinaya in a timely manner.

1.5 His instructions are given in three cycles. In the first cycle, the Buddha addresses the elder monk (*thera bhikkhu*) [§§27-34; 1.6]; in the second cycle, the middling monks (*majjhima bhikkhu*) [§§35-52; 1.7]; and in the third cycle, the new monks (*nava bhikkhu*) [§§53-59; 1.8].

The Vinaya Commentary explains that an elder (*thera*) is one who is mature in years, that is, one who has been a full 10 rains (in the order), and so on; a new monk, one who has observed less than 5 rains, and a middling monk, one who is more than 5 rains (in the order) (*thero vāti ādīsu vayo,vuḍḍh'ādīsu yo vā so vā hotu, paripuṇṇa,dasa,vassatāya thero vā ūna,pañca,vassatāya nava vā atireka,pañca,vassatāya majjhimo vā'ti attho*, VA 1:239).

1.6 An elder monk (*thera bhikkhu*) is a monastic who has properly observed at least 10 rain-retreats (*vass'āvāsa*). The Buddha declares, in apophatic or negative language, that even such an elder should desire to undergo the training, to inspire others to be positive about it, and to discuss the Dharma-Vinaya at the right time with those who desire the training [§§27-34].

1.7 In the second cycle, the Buddha declares the same [1.6] of **a middling monk** (*majjhima thera*) is a monastic who has properly observed from at least 5 up to 9 rain-retreats. [§§35-52]

1.8 In the third cycle, the Buddha declares the same [1.6] of **a new monk** (*nava bhikkhu*) [§§53-59].

1.9 The reason for including this Sutta in the book of threes (*tika nipāta*) of the Aṅguttara is probably either (1) because it opens with the Buddha teaching on the "training" (*sikkhā*), that is, the 3 trainings,¹ or (2) the second, and longer, section of the Sutta is addressed to the 3 kinds of monks, the elder monks, the middling monks, and the new monks. In terms of emphasis, the theme is certainly that of the 3 kinds of monks, as the training is only briefly mentioned, without any elaboration. Of course, we can surmise that both themes are equally valid reasons for the Sutta's inclusion in the book of threes.

1.10 Clearly, from the Sutta context [1.6-1.8], the Sutta reflects a time when the ministry is at least over 10 years. More specifically, there is mention of monks who have spent at least 10 rain-retreats. It is even likely that this Sutta belongs to the second period of the ministry,² when the monastic order has become more established, populous, widespread and settled. Hence, there is a need for such an exhortation.

¹ On the 3 trainings, see *Sīla samādhī paññā*, SD 21.6.

² On the 2 periods of the ministry, see SD 40a.1 (1.3).

2 Key and related terms

2.1 ABHISALLIKHATA

2.1.1 Meanings and usages

2.1.1.1 COMMENTARY. **The Paṅkadhā Sutta** (A 3.90) opens with the monk Kassapa,gotta being annoyed at the Buddha teaching about the training, that he is being “scrupulous [too stern]” (*abhisallikhi-ta*) [§5]. The Sutta Commentary explains *abhisallikhata* as follows: “(He) cuts it up into tiny bits. He speaks in such great detail, as if cutting it all up into extremely tiny bits,” (*ativīya sallikhati, ativīya sallikhitam katvā saṅham saṅham katheti*, AA 2:352,5).

2.1.1.2 ETYMOLOGY. *Abhisallikhata* or -ti resolves as *abhi-* (a prefix suggesting here something extreme or excessive) + *saṁ-* (a prefix suggesting something intense) + \sqrt{LIKH} , “to scratch,” in the “scratch-ing off” or “erasing” something. In our Sutta context, this means that Kassapa,gotta perceives the Buddha’s teaching on the training [§5] as being “too scrupulous,” threatening (seen as criticising) his views or personal habits, or the teaching takes a long time, that is, the Buddha is being “prolix.” Perhaps, both these senses apply to how or why Kassapa,gotta is annoyed by the Buddha teaching. After all, Kassapa,-gotta does not see the Buddha everyday or often, but lives in the market-town of Paṅkadhā, away from the regular monastic community close to the Buddha.

2.1.1.3 UDĀYĪ. Kassapa,gotta’s negative sentiment is also shown by Udāyī in **the Laṭukikōpama Sutta** (M 66),³ where the Commentary explains the phrase as meaning, “This recluse is being extremely scrupulous [prolix], as if grinding (*pisanto*) fresh butter, like cutting a thread from a lotus-stalk with a saw” (*Adhisallikhatevāyan’ti ayam samaṇo nava,nītam pisanto vīya paduma,nāḷa,suttam kakacena okantanto* [from *okantati*, cuts, cuts off] *vīya atisallekhati, ativāyāmam karoti*, MA 3:165). Def as “to put stress upon” (CPD).

2.1.3 Sallekha. Without the prefix *adhi-* in *adhisallikhata*, we have the stem *sallikha*, as in the rare phrase, *sallikhitācāra*, “scrupulous” (Miln 230, 244, 348).⁴ It is more commonly spelt as *sallekha*, which also has the sense, “effacing,” as in **Sallekha Sutta** (M 8 @ SD 51.2).⁵ It is clearly related to the more common form, *abhisallekhika* (note the *abhi-* prefix), “effacing” (CPD sv) or better *ābhisallekhika*, “austere, stern, putting stress upon (abstinence).”⁶ The plural form, *abhisallekhikā* (n & adj),⁷ “austere” (A 9.1/4:352,8), is glossed as *abhisallikhanti*, “to put stress upon” (AA:Se 3:323,7).

2.2 CONSCIENCE

2.2.1 A key theme of the Sutta is Kassapa,gotta’s confession that he realizes that he harbours a negative thought when the Buddha gives teachings on the training. This realization moves him to confess his wrong view to the Buddha himself. This shows that he is a monk of some level of conscience, that is, he has moral shame (*hiri*) and moral fear (*ottappa*).⁸ [2.3]

2.2.2 The theme of spiritual confession (*paṭidesanā*) has been dealt with in some detail in **the Sāmañña,phala Sutta** (D 2).⁹ This Sutta also gives a detailed account of the 3 trainings in terms of the well known “fruits of recluseship” (*sāmañña,phala*) sequence.¹⁰

2.3 MORAL SHAME AND MORAL FEAR

2.3.1 Moral shame (*hiri*; Skt *hrī*), is a sense of disgust with bad. The Abhidhamma defines it as a state of “being ashamed of what one ought to be ashamed of, to be ashamed of performing bad and un-

³ M 66,7/1:449,12-13), SD 28.11.

⁴ Miln:H tr it as “submissive,” which does not seem to fit the context.

⁵ On *sallekha*, further see M 8 @ SD 51.2.

⁶ M 3:113,35,25 (qu at MA 1:97,22) = 115,21 = A 3:121,1 = 4:352,8 = 357,13 = 5:67,18 ≈ U 36,12 (see UA:M 581,7+n).

⁷ Qualifying *kathā* (“talk”): A 3:117 f, 4:352, 357, 5:67. CPD however notes that this might be a wr for *abhisallekhitā* or *~atā* (UA 221,20).

⁸ See **Moral shame and moral fear**, SD 2.5. See also **Veḷu,dvāreyya S** (S 55.7), SD 1.5 (4); (**Abhabba**) **Tayo,-dhamma S** (A 10.76,20), SD 2.4; **Hiri Ottappa S** or **Cariya S** (A 2.1.9), SD 2.5(2c).

⁹ D 2,101.4-102 + SD 8.10 (6).

¹⁰ D 2,33-100 + SD 8.10 (2). For detailed study on the 3 trainings, see *Sīla samādhi paññā*, SD 21.6.

wholesome deeds” (Pug 24).¹¹ It is one of the 7 noble treasures (*ariya,dhana*),¹² that is, the treasures of generosity (*cāga,dhana*): faith, moral conduct, moral shame, moral fear, learning, generosity, wisdom.¹³

2.3.2 Moral fear (*ottappa*) is often paired with moral fear, when they are said to be the “the world protectors” (*loka,pāla*), that is, to say, they are the preconditions for a functional or good society.¹⁴ Moral shame is sometimes known as self-regarding moral conduct (motivated by the *shame* a deed entails), while moral fear is other-regarding moral conduct (motivated by a healthy *fear* of karmic repercussion or personal accountability).¹⁵

As such, these two actions are known as **the two bright states that protect the world**, without which “one would neither respect one’s mother, nor one’s mother’s sister, nor one’s brother’s wife, nor one’s teacher’s wife ...” so that we do not behave like animals (A 1:50).¹⁶

2.4 VIEWS

2.4.1 Overcoming a wrong view. Kassapa,gotta was at first impatient and annoyed, thinking that the Buddha is being “too scrupulous [too stern]” [§5]. When the Buddha has left, he realizes, “**What a loss! Not a gain at all! Difficult it is for me to gain, not easy is it for me to gain**” [§9]. He decides to see the Buddha to confess his transgression [§§10+31].

The Buddha responds by confirming that it is unhelpful to have such a negative thought [§§22-23], and acknowledges Kassapa,gotta’s contrition [§24], thus accepting his confession [§25]. It is important to note the reason given by the Buddha for this: “For, Kassapa, **this is progress in the discipline [Vinaya] of noble ones**, when one, having seen a transgression as a transgression, makes amends in accordance with the Dharma, and shows restraint henceforth.” [§26]

Basically, this “progress” (*vuddhi*) consists in the transgressor making “amends in accordance with the Dharma” (*yathā,dhammā paṭikaroti*). The verb *paṭikaroti* means “to act against, redress, repair.” In other words, when we have a negative thoughts towards a Dharma teacher (or anyone, for tha matter), or towards the Dharma itself, it is rooted in one of the 3 unwholesome roots of greed, hate, or delusion.

We are then cut off from the Dharma, and open the door for more negative thoughts and actions. However, the sooner we see the negative situation for what it is, the better for us. This is like noticing that the vehicle we are in or the path we are on is going in the wrong way, heading towards certain danger. We need to take a step back, as it were, and set our mind right again. This positive step back is the self-realization that we have thought or done something wrong, and see its danger (*ādīnava*).

2.4.2 Cultivating right view. In terms of discipleship, this wholesome process is the first part of the 12-step discipleship, as laid out in **the Kīṭāgiri Sutta** (M 70) and **the Caṅkī Sutta** (M 95). More specifically, these first 4 stages are relevant here:

- (1) Faith (*saddhā*) conduces one to visit (that is, to see) a Dharma teacher.
- (2) Approaching (*upasāṅkamana*) the teacher conduces one to respectfully attending to the teacher.
- (3) Sitting near (with respect) (*payirupāsana*) the teacher conduces to lending the ear.¹⁷

¹¹ Cf Dh:R 18 f.

¹² DA 2:34; ThaA 240; VvA 113.

¹³ D 3:163, 251; A 4:5; VvA 113; cf A 3:53; Sn 77, 462 (= D 1:168), 719.

¹⁴ On the 2 world-protectors, see SD 2.5 (1).

¹⁵ See **Ādhipateyya S** (A 3.40), SD 27.3.

¹⁶ See **Veḷu,dvāreyya S** (S 55.7/5:352-356) + SD 1.5 (4); (**Abhabba**) **Tayo,dhamma S** (A 10.76/5:144-149) = SD 2.4; **Hiri Ottappa S or Cariya S** (A 2.9/1:51) = SD 2.5c. In his tr, Ñāṇamoli renders *hiri* as “conscience,” but apparently mistranslates *ottappati* as “is ashamed” and *ottappa* as “shame,” Vism:Ñ 524 f.

¹⁷ *Payirupāsana* (M 2:176; S 5:67 = It 107; DA 1:142; PvA 138), vb *payirupāsati* from *pari* (all around, completely) + *upa* (near, close) + √ās, “to sit” + a (infix meaning “variety”): D 1:47, 2:257; M 2:117; S 1:146; A 1:124, 126, 142, 4:337; Dh 64, 65; Tha 1236; J 6:222 (imp *payirupāsaya*; Pv 2.9,61; Pug 26, 33; SnA 401; VbhA 457 *pu-nappunam upasāṅkamati*, “regularly approach.” In *payirupāsana*: the -i- is an anaptyxis (a vowel epenthesis or svarabhakti), an added vowel, but is here usu almost silent, as in Dh 64b 65b metrical = *payrupāsati*. See Tha:N 293 n1236. Here “sit near” refers to a spiritual closeness, not a physical or social closeness (cf Dh 64-65). Indeed, it is a task of the lay follower to keep a social distance from the renunciant so that his/her rule of celibacy and mindfulness

- (4) Lending the ear [listening attentively] (*sotāvadhāna*) conduces to listening to the Dharma.¹⁸
(M 70,23-24/1:480), SD 11.1, = (M 95,20/2:173), SD 21.15

Through wrong view, Kassapa.gotta feels annoyed with the Buddha, but his faith works to put him on the right course of discipleship again. His wrong view is shaken when the Buddha has left—he suddenly feels distanced and alienated from the teacher—as if he has lost his teacher [§9]. Hence, he feels an urgent need to approach the teacher again. To do this he has to say something true, that is, his admission of a transgression. This honest self-acceptance brings him close to the teacher again, sitting near him. And when the teacher speaks, he respectfully lends his ear. The healing process has begun, and he is back on the track of Dharma progress.

3 Kassapa.gotta

3.1 A GENERIC NAME. **Kassapa,gotta** is apparently a generic name given to those belonging to the Kassapa clan or family. Thus, the naked ascetic (*ājīvaka*) Guṇa is addressed as Kassapa,gotta (J 6:222) and again as Kassapa (J 6:224, 229, 235).

The name **Kassapa**, too, is a well known clan (*gotta*; Skt *gotra*) name,¹⁹ and members of this clan are often addressed simply as Kassapa, such as Mahā Kassapa,²⁰ Uruvelā Kassapa²¹ and the elder Nāgita (D 1:151). The following individuals called Kassapa are mentioned in the suttas as his contemporaries:

Uruvelā Kassapa ²²	ex-fire worshipper	} Anatta Lakkhaṇa Sutta ²³	S 35.28	SD 1.3
Gayā Kassapa	ex-fire worshipper			
Nadī Kassapa	ex-fire worshipper			
Mahā Kassapa ²⁴	a great elder	Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta	D 16.6.19	SD 9
Kumāra Kassapa ²⁵	a great elder	Vammika Sutta	M 23	SD 28.13
Pūrana Kassapa	one of the 6 teachers	Sāmañña,phala Sutta	D 2	SD 8.10
Acela(ka) Kassapa 1	a naked ascetic	Kassapa Siha,nāda Sutta	D 8	SD 73.12
Acela(ka) Kassapa 2	a naked ascetic	Bakkula Sutta	M 124	SD 3.15
Acela(ka) Kassapa 3	a naked ascetic	(Pabbajjā) Acelaka Kassapa Sutta	S 12.17	SD 18.5
Acela(ka) Kassapa 4	a naked ascetic	(Arahatta) Avelaka Kassapa Sutta	S 41.9	SD 45.14

3.2 Kassapa,gotta 1. A monk living outside Pankadhā in Kosala country. Once, he hears the Buddha teaching on the training and feels annoyed, thinking that the Buddha is too scrupulous. Later, filled with remorse, he goes before the Buddha in Rāja,gaha and confesses his transgression. The Buddha praises him for his honesty, and reminds him to be diligent (A 3.90 @ SD 47.18). He is probably identical with Kassapa,gotta 2 [3.3].

3.3 Kassapa,gotta 2. According to **(Cheta) Kassapa,gotta Sutta** (S 9.3 @ SD 47.22), once when he was staying in a forest in Kosala, he meets a trapper (*cheta*). He exhorts him against living by such cruelty. The trapper, however, is too preoccupied with his hunt to pay any attention to what he says. A forest deva appears to Kassapa,gotta and advises him not to waste his time in teaching someone “who listens but does not understand,...looks but does not see.” Kassapa is agitated and, according to the Commentary, de-

are well kept. On indirect ways by which the monastic’s spiritual training can be endangered, see **Methuna S** (A 7.-47/4:54-56), SD 21.9.

¹⁸ This incl esp switching off our handphones and similar devices totally, and definitely not using them during such teaching or meditation sessions. We should also prepare ourselves by not conversing about unrelated topics, so that the mind is calm and clear to receive the Dharma. See §20(7) n.

¹⁹ Eg DA 2:592; MA 3:223; AA 1:296; SnA 2:422.

²⁰ BA 49 (on why he is called *mahā*).

²¹ AA 1:296-300.

²² The foll 3 are matted-hair ascetics (*jaṭila*) who were brothers: AA 1:296-300.

²³ On these 3 Kassapa brothers, see Mv 1.21 @ V 1:34 f; J 1:82, 4:180.

²⁴ AA 1:161-183.

²⁵ AA 1:283-285.

cides to fully keep to his own practice. In due course, he becomes an arhat.²⁶ He is perhaps the same as Kassapa,gotta 1 [3.2].

3.4 KASSAPA,GOTTA 3. According to **the Vinaya**, he is a monk of Vāsabha,gāma²⁷ in the kingdom of Kāsi, who habitually shows warm hospitality to the monks who visit his village. Once, some visiting monks, enjoying his hospitality, decide to stay on. In due course, feeling that they have overstayed their welcome, Kassapa,gotta tires of looking after them, and is threatened with disciplinary action for his neglect. He goes to Campā (the capital of Aṅga), where the Buddha is then, and presents the matter to him. The Buddha declares that he has committed no offence. The accusing monks then confess their misjudgement. (Mv 9.1 @ V 1:312-315)

— — —

The Paṅkadhā Discourse

A 3.90

The Buddha teaches on the training

- 1 At one time, the Blessed One was wandering [peregrinating] in Kosala with a great community of monks. They arrived at a Kosala market-town called Paṅkadhā [Be Saṅkavā].
- 2 The Blessed One dwelled right there.
- 3 At that time, a monk named Kassapa,gotta dwelled at Paṅkadhā.
- 4 There the Blessed One instructed, inspired, roused and gladdened the monks with a Dharma talk related to the training.²⁸

Kassapa,gotta is annoyed

- 5 Now, as the Blessed One was instructing, inspiring, rousing and gladdening the monks with a Dharma talk related to the training, the monk Kassapa,gotta became impatient and annoyed, thinking, “This recluse is too scrupulous [too stern]!”²⁹
- 6 Then, when the Blessed One has resided at Paṅkadhā as long as he pleased, left for Rāja,gaha. Wandering in stages, and in due course arrived at Rāja,gaha. [237]
- 7 There, at Rāja,gaha, the Blessed One dwelled on Mount Vulture Peak.³⁰

Kassapa,gotta is remorseful

- 8 Then, not long after the Blessed One had departed, restlessness and regret arose in the monk Kassapa,gotta,³¹ thus:
 - 9 “What a loss! Not a gain at all! Difficult it is for me to gain, not easy is it for me to gain,³² that when the Blessed One was instructing, inspiring, rousing and gladdening the monks with a Dharma talk related to the training,

²⁶ S 9.3/1:198f; SA 1:289.

²⁷ Also mentioned at **Abhijjamāna Pv** (Pv 3.1.2/387).

²⁸ *Tatra sudam bhagavā sikkhāpada,paṭisaṃyuttāya dhammiyā kathāya bhikkhū sandasseti samādapeti samuttejeti sampahamseti.*

²⁹ *Ahud eva akkhanti ahu appaccayo adhisallikhat’evāyam* [Ce Ee Ke so; Be Se *adhisallekhat’evāyam*] *samaṇo’ti*: see (2.1).

³⁰ *Tatra sudam bhagavā rājagahe viharati gijjha,kūte pabbate* [Be omits *gijjha,kūte pabbate*].

³¹ *Atha kho kassapa,gottassa bhikkhuno acira,pakkantassa bhagavato ahud eva kukkucam ahu vipṭasāro.*

³² *Alābhā vata me, na vata me lābhā; dulladdham vata me, na vata me suladdham.*

I became impatient and annoyed, thinking, 'This recluse is too scrupulous!'

10 What now if I were to approach the Blessed One, and having gone up to him, were to confess this transgression as such before him?"³³

Kassapa,gotta approaches the Buddha

11 Then the monk Kassapa,gotta tidied up his lodging, and taking his bowl and robe, left for Rāja,gaha. In due course, he arrived at Mount Vulture Peak, outside Rāja,gaha.

He approached the Blessed One, and having gone up to him, saluted him, and sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, the monk Kassapa,gotta said this to the Blessed One:

12 "There is this one occasion, bhante, when the Blessed One was dwelling at a Kosala market-town named Paṅkadhā.

13 *There the Blessed One instructed, inspired, roused and gladdened the monks with a Dharma talk related to the training.*

14 *While the Blessed One was instructing, inspiring, rousing and gladdening the monks with a Dharma talk related to the training,*

I became impatient and annoyed, thinking, 'This recluse is too scrupulous!'

15 *Then, when the Blessed One has resided at Paṅkadhā as long as he pleased, left for Rāja,gaha. Wandering in stages, and in due course arrived at Rāja,gaha.*

16 *Then, not long after the Blessed One had departed, restlessness and regret arose in me regarding this:*

17 *'What a loss! Not a gain at all! Difficult it is for me to gain, not easy is it for me to gain, that when the Blessed One was instructing, inspiring, rousing and gladdening the monks with a Dharma talk related to the training,*

I became impatient and annoyed, thinking, "This recluse is too scrupulous!"

18 What now if I were to approach the Blessed One, and having gone up to him, were to confess this transgression as such before him?"

Kassapa,gotta's confession

19 I have transgressed, bhante, [238] on account of folly, on account of delusion, on account of such unskill,³⁴

20 *that when the Blessed One was instructing, inspiring, rousing and gladdening the monks with a Dharma talk related to the training,*

I became impatient and annoyed, thinking, "This recluse is too scrupulous!"

21 May the Blessed One accept this transgression for what it is, so that I may henceforth restrain myself."³⁵

The Buddha accepts Kassapa,gotta's confession

22 "Indeed, Kassapa, you have transgressed, on account of folly, on account of delusion, on account of such unskill,³⁶

23 *that when I was instructing, inspiring, rousing and gladdening the monks with a Dharma talk related to the training,*

you became impatient and annoyed, thinking, 'This recluse is too scrupulous!'

³³ *Yaṃ nūnāhaṃ yena bhagavā ten'upasaṅkameyyaṃ, upasaṅkamitvā bhagavato santike accayaṃ accayato deseyyaṃ'ti. Accayaṃ accayato deseyyaṃ. Deseyyaṃ = desessaṃ, fut I sg of deseti, "tells, confesses, acknowledges" (DP deseti 2) [Skt deśayati, caus of disati, PED sv] to point out, indicate, show; set forth, preach, teach; confess. Very freq in phrase dhammaṃ ~, to give a discourse, to teach the Dhamma: V 1:15, 2:87, 188, 5:125, 136; D 1:241; A 2:185, 5:194; It 111; J 1:168, 3:394; Pug 57; PvA 6.*

³⁴ *Accayo maṃ bhante accagamā yathā, bālaṃ yathā, mūḷhaṃ yathā, akusalaṃ.*

³⁵ *Tassa me bhante bhagavā accayaṃ accayato paṭiggaṇhātu āyatim saṃvarāyāti.*

³⁶ *Taggha tvam [Ce Ee so; Be Se taṃ] kassapa accayo accagamā yathā, bālaṃ yathā, mūḷhaṃ yathā, akusalaṃ.*

24 However, Kassapa, having seen your transgression for what it is, you have made amends in accordance with the Dharma.³⁷

25 As such, we accept this of you.³⁸

26 For, Kassapa, this is progress in the discipline [Vinaya] of noble ones when one, having seen a transgression as a transgression, makes amends in accordance with the Dharma, and shows restraint henceforth.³⁹

When the Buddha does not praise an elder monk

27 If, Kassapa, there were an elder monk⁴⁰ who desires not the training, who speaks not in praise of undertaking the training,⁴¹

28 and there are also other monks who desire not the training, but he moves them not to undertake the training,⁴²

29 and there are other monks who desire the training, and he does not speak in praise of what is true, real and timely⁴³—

30 Kassapa, I, too,⁴⁴ do not speak in praise of that elder monk.

31 What is the reason for this?

Because other monks would associate with him, thinking, ‘The teacher speaks in praise of him.’⁴⁵

32 When they associate with him, they would fall into following his views, too.⁴⁶

33 When they fall into following his views, it would be for their loss, their suffering, for a long time.⁴⁷

34 Therefore, Kassapa, I do not speak in praise of such an elder monk.

When the Buddha does not praise a middling monk

35 If, Kassapa, there were a middling monk⁴⁸ who desires not the training, who speaks not in praise of undertaking the training,

36 and there are also other monks who desire not the training, but he moves them not to undertake the training,

37 and there are other monks who desire the training, and he does not speak in praise of what is true, real and timely—

38 Kassapa, I, too, do not speak in praise of that middling monk.

39 What is the reason for this?

Because other monks would associate with him, thinking, ‘The teacher speaks in praise of him.’

40 When they associate with him, they would fall into following his views, too.

42 When they fall into following his views, it would be for their loss, their suffering, for a long time.

42 Therefore, Kassapa, I do not speak in praise of such a middling monk.

³⁷ *Yato ca kho tvam kassapa accayam accayato disvā yathā, dhammam paṭikarosi.*

³⁸ *Tam te mayam paṭiggaṇhāma.*

³⁹ *Vuddhi ’h ’esā kassapa ariyassa vinaye, yo accayam accayato disvā yathā, dhammam paṭikaroti, āyatiṃ samvar-am āpajjati.* The same recurs in connection with Ajāta, sattu in **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2, 101.4-102) + SD 8.10 (5.2).

⁴⁰ See (1.5).

⁴¹ *Thero ce ’pi kassapa bhikkhu hoti na sikkhā, kāmo na sikkhā, samādānassa vaṇṇa, vādī.*

⁴² *Ye c ’aññe bhikkhū na sikkhā ’kāmā, te ca na sikkhāya samādapeti.*

⁴³ *Ye c ’aññe bhikkhū sikkhā, kāmā, tesañ ca na vaṇṇam bhaṇati bhūtam taccham kālena.*

⁴⁴ *Eva.*

⁴⁵ *Sathā hi ’ssa vaṇṇam bhaṇātīti aññe nam bhikkhū bhajeyyūṃ.*

⁴⁶ *Ye nam bhajeyyūṃ, tyāssa diṭṭhānugatim āpajjeyyūṃ.*

⁴⁷ *Yvāssa diṭṭhānugatim āpajjeyyūṃ, tesam tam assa dīgha, rattam ahitāya dukkhāyāti.*

⁴⁸ “Middling monk,” *majjhima, bhikkhu*, ie a duly ordained monk of at least 5 rains but not more than 9 rains. (1.5)

When the Buddha does not praise a new monk

43 If, Kassapa, there were a new monk⁴⁹ who desires not the training, who speaks not in praise of undertaking the training,

44 *and there are also other monks who desire not the training, but he moves them not to undertake the training,*

45 *and there are other monks who desire the training, and he does not speak in praise of what is true, real and timely—*

46 Kassapa, I, too, do not speak in praise of that new monk.

47 *What is the reason for this?*

Because other monks would associate with him, thinking, ‘The teacher speaks in praise of him.’

48 *When they associate with him, [239] they would fall into following his views, too.*

49 *When they fall into following his views, it would be for their loss, their suffering, for a long time.*

50 Therefore, Kassapa, I do not speak in praise of such a middling monk.

—evam—

141121 141127 141220r

⁴⁹ “New monk,” *navaka, bhikkhu*, ie a duly ordained monk of 5 rains or less. (1.5)