

# 6a

## Piṅgiya Māṇava Pucchā

The Questions of Piṅgiya Māṇava | Sn 5.17 (Sn 1120-1123)

Theme: Piṅgiya's devotion to the Buddha

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2015

### 1 Introduction

#### 1.1 PIṄGIYA'S FAITH

**1.1.1 The Piṅgiya Māṇava Sutta** is the 17<sup>th</sup> Sutta in the 5<sup>th</sup> chapter, that is, the second last sutta in the very last chapter of the Sutta Nipāta. It is a moving account of an elderly disciple's devotion to the Buddha [2.2] and also to his own uncle and teacher, Bāvaṛī [2.1]. In other words, Piṅgiya's quality is that of deep faith (*saddhā*), especially in the Buddha. This fact is evident from this Sutta [1.1.2] and Piṅgiya's further verses in **the Pārāyana Sutta** (Sn 5.17) [1.1.4].

**1.1.2 The Piṅgiya Māṇava Pucchā** (Sn 5.17) presents Piṅgiya as being spiritually ready. He asks the Buddha a Dharma question on how to abandon birth and decay [**Sn 1120**]. The Buddha replies that we need to “abandon form to be free of rebirth” [**Sn 1121e**]. From the Buddha's answer we know that Piṅgiya actually has some grounding in the Dharma, that is, the 5 aggregates (form, feeling, perception, formations and consciousness). Piṅgiya probably already knows this teaching theoretically even before he hears the teaching from the Buddha himself. Once he hears it from the Buddha himself, he penetrates its meaning to attain non-returning.

#### 1.1.3 Verse commentary

**1.1.3.1** A couple of points should be noted of **Sn 1122**, which is, in fact, Piṅgiya's joyful acceptance (*sādhu, kāra*) of the truth of the teaching. Here, he also rejoices in the Buddha, praising him, that “there is nothing in the world that you have not seen, or heard or sensed,” that is, the Buddha is omniscient in the sense that he knows “the all” (*sabba*)<sup>1</sup> [Sn 1122]. These are the jubilation of a man of deep joyful faith.

**1.1.3.2** However, in the last two lines of same verse [**Sn 1122ef**], he asks the same question again! How do we abandon “birth and decay” (*jāti, jarā*). This is the point where, having understood the liberating power of that newly found wisdom—he is not a non-returner—he at once thinks of his own teacher, Bāvaṛī, wishing that he had heard the same teaching. This compassionate distraction prevented him from attaining arhathood [2.2].

**1.1.3.3** Note that while the Buddha centres the first of his two teaching verses [Sn 1121] on form (the 5 aggregates), in his second teaching verse [**Sn 1123**] on craving (*taṇhā*). Clearly, the Buddha is addressing Piṅgiya's attachment to his uncle and teacher. This is a minor aberration—but it is like a tiny ink-mark on the Mona Lisa, or a note wrongly played in a beautiful musical masterpiece—which needs to be addressed. Happily, we are told that Piṅgiya does become an arhat when he teaches what he has understood to Bāvaṛī, as recorded in **the Pārāyana Sutta** (Sn 1147 f).<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> On “the all” (*sabba*), see **Sabba S** (S 35.23), SD 7.1.

<sup>2</sup> **Pārāyana S** (S 5.18), SD 49.6b: see Sn 1147 + n.

### 1.1.4 Recollection of the Buddha

**1.1.4.1** Piṅgiya’s two verses in **the Piṅgiya Māṇava Pucchā** (Sn 1120, 1122) attest to his profound faith in the Buddha. This great faith is even more clearly evident in **the Pārāyana Sutta** (Sn 5.18).<sup>3</sup> Of special interest is this verse from the Pārāyana Sutta:

*Passāmi naṃ manasā cakkhunā’va  
rattin, divaṃ brāhmaṇa appamatto.  
Namassamāno vivasemi<sup>4</sup> rattim  
ten’eva maññāmi avippavāsam.*

**Sn 1142**

I see him with the mind, as if with my eye,  
diligent, night and day, brahmin,  
I stay apart, passing the night revering him,  
therefore—I must say—he is surely not apart.<sup>5</sup>

This is clearly an allusion to the recollection of the Buddha (*buddhānussati*), but here, interestingly, it includes a visualization of the Buddha. Here, again, we see Piṅgiya as a disciple of deep faith in the Buddha. In this connection, the Buddha mentions the elder Vakkali—and also Bhadr’āvudha and Āḷavi Gotama—who are all **“faith-freed”** (*mutta, saddha*) (Sn 1146a).<sup>6</sup> [1.1.4.2]

1.1.4.2 **The Niddesa** commentary says here that, just like the elders (*thera*) Vakkali, Bhadr’āvudha and Āḷavi Gotama, Piṅgiya, too, “is full of faith, bent on faith (“heavy with faith”), led by faith, seized by faith, by the supremacy of faith, attained arhathood.”<sup>7</sup> In other words, explains both the Niddesa and its Subcommentary, he penetrates into true reality duly and mindfully reflecting that “all conditioned things are impermanent” (*sabbe saṅkhārā aniccā*), that “all conditioned things are unsatisfactory” (*sabbe saṅkhārā dukkhā*) and that “all things are non-self” (*sabbe dhammā anattā*).<sup>8</sup> (Nc:Be 223)

### 1.1.5 The arhathood of the 16 brahmin youths

**1.1.5.1** An interesting and important problem now arises. There is no mention of the attaining of any states by any of the 16 brahmin youths anywhere in the Pārāyana Vagga. We only know from the Commentaries—**the Niddesa** and its Ṭīkā (the Saddhamma Pajjotika 3), and the Sutta Nipāta Commentary (**the Paramattha Jotika 2**)—that 15 of the brahmins youths, their followers, and Piṅgiya’s followers attain arhathood, except for Piṅgiya, who attains non-returning [2.1.2.2].

As for Piṅgiya, on his return to his teacher, Bāvārī, he recites the Pārāyana to him. At the end of the recitation, the Buddha appears to them in a radiant ray of light<sup>9</sup> and teaches them. On account of this intercession, as it were, Piṅgiya finally attains arhathood and Bāvārī non-returning. [2.1.2.2]

**1.1.5.2** The Pārāyana Vagga and its Commentaries seem to show that all the 16 brahmin youths easily awaken to arhathood just by listening to the Buddha teaching the Dharma. There is no mention of the brahmin youths ever meditating. However, we do get a clear hint from the Niddesa that at least Piṅgiya awakens by reflecting on the true nature of the 3 characteristics: impermanence, unsatisfactoriness and

<sup>3</sup> Piṅgiya’s verses in **Pārāyana S** (Sn 5.18) are Sn 1140-1145, 114-1149: see SD 49.6b.

<sup>4</sup> Se *vivasāmi*. Comy glosses *vivasemi* as “to spend, let pass” (*atināmemi*) the night (SnA 2:606).

<sup>5</sup> Or, “There is no absence [no forgetting the Buddha].” There is a wordplay on *vivasemi* and *avippavāsam*, “non-absence,” ie, by his constant Buddhānussati by way of visualizing the Buddha. DhA glosses *avippavāsam* as “diligence, vigilance” (*appamādo*, DhA 1:288,17).

<sup>6</sup> Comy glosses *mutta, saddho* with “penetrated with faith” (*saddhā’ dhimutto*, SnA 606,26). This is clear from the Sutta context and Comy, Nc:Be 25:223 (pace Norman, Sn:N 428 n1146).

<sup>7</sup> *Yathā vakkali-,t,thero ... bhadr’āvudho thero ... āḷavi, gotamo thero saddho saddhāmgaruko saddhā, pubbaṅ, ga-mo sadd’ dhimutto saddhādhipateyyo arahatta-p, patto* (Nc:Be 25:223,1).

<sup>8</sup> Nc:Be 25:223; NcA 94; SnA 606 f (more briefly). On the above 3 statements, esp *sabbe dhammā anattā*, see **Dhamma Niyāma S** (A 3.134), SD 26.8.

<sup>9</sup> There is neither mention of the Buddha himself appearing nor of his holograph. Clearly this ray of light is accompanied only by the Buddha’s voice. On the Buddha radiance, see Endo, *Buddha in Theravāda Buddhism*, 1997:146-163.

non-self [1.1.4.2]. Such an awakening would technically be said, in commentarial terms, to be that of a “dry-insight” practitioner (*sukkha, vipassaka*).<sup>10</sup> [1.1.5.3]

**1.1.5.3** The term “dry-insight” practitioner (*sukkha, vipassaka*) is found only in the Commentaries,<sup>11</sup> not in any sutta or the Tipiṭaka. Although we may apply this term to those who listen to the Buddha’s teaching with deep faith and clear mind—such as in the case of Aṅgulimāla<sup>12</sup>—these only lead to the arising of the “Dharma-eye” (*dhamma, cakku*), which technically refers to any stage of the path *except* arhathood. More often, the Dharma-eye refers to streamwinning. Aṅgulimāla, for example, attains arhathood only after he has become a monk.<sup>13</sup> [1.1.5.5]

**1.1.5.4** However, in the case of Bāhiya Dāru, cīriya, as recorded in **the (Arahatta) Bāhiya Sutta** (U 1.10), he clearly attains arhathood by *merely* listening to the Buddha teaching: “Then, Bāhiya Dāru, cīriya, on account of this brief advice given by the Blessed One, was at once freed from the influxes.”<sup>14</sup> Such a case of awakening to arhathood from merely listening to a “brief advice” does not seem to be found anywhere else in the Tipiṭaka. Even in the case of the first 5 monks, only Koṇḍañña attains streamwinning at the end of the Buddha’s teaching. All the 5 monks attain arhathood only at the end of the teaching of **the Anatta Lakkhaṇa Sutta** (S 22.59).<sup>15</sup>

**1.1.5.5** All these cases of awakenings into arhathood, it should be noted, involve renunciants who are well seasoned spiritual practitioners in their last lives or who have had deep spiritual training in previous lives. It should therefore be clear that not everyone who hears the Dharma, even when spoken by the Buddha, would attain any level of awakening, least of all, arhathood. In other words, they are all well tractable individuals (*veneyya, puggala*)<sup>16</sup> whose mental faculties are ripe (*indriya, paripāka*)<sup>17</sup> for the Buddha’s deepest teachings: they only need to hear the Dharma and be liberated.

In other words, not everyone who listens to the Dharma—or reads the suttas, even in their original Pali—would at once awaken to even streamwinning, what more to speak of arhathood. It is not merely a matter of listening, but also a matter of being able to mentally comprehend the teaching and penetrate the truth. Ideally, the mind should be able to refine itself with dhyanic calm and clarity, in order to attain non-returning or arhathood.

**1.1.5.6** If the dhyanic calm and clarity cannot be sustained, but we still have such a momentary experience—just as when we have taken a quick glance into a well and see the water<sup>18</sup>—then we will attain streamwinning or once-return. This is the meaning of “one who gains the higher wisdom that is insight into things, but does not gain inner mental calm,” as mentioned, for example, in **the (Samatha Vipassanā) Samādhi Sutta 1** (A 4.92).<sup>19</sup> This is also the way that the commentarial term, “dry-insight” practitioner (*sukkha, vipassaka*) should be understood. [1.1.5.2]

From the narrative accounts of the suttas, we will notice that whenever the Dharma-eye arises in a listener, the teacher is, as a rule, the Buddha himself. This is understandable because the Buddha is a supremely skilled mind-reader—the “peerless guide of those to be tamed” (*anuttari purisa, damma, sara-*

<sup>10</sup> See SD 41.1 (2.1.1).

<sup>11</sup> Eg DA 3:754; MA 1:239; AA 3:142; KhpA 182; SnA 1:277, 2:547; NmA 2:313; NcA 102; PmA 3:696; VbhA 215.

<sup>12</sup> **Aṅgulimāla S** (M 86,6), SD 5.11.

<sup>13</sup> M 86,16 (SD 5.11).

<sup>14</sup> U 1.10 (SD 33.7).

<sup>15</sup> S 22.59,24 (SD 1.2).

<sup>16</sup> DA 2:470; MA 2:178; SA 1:200; ItA 1:151.

<sup>17</sup> SnA 602,1 ad Sn 1116; cf Nc 42,24.

<sup>18</sup> See **(Musīla Narada) Kosambī S** (S 12.68/2:118), SD 70.14.

<sup>19</sup> *Lābhī hoti adhipaññā, dhamma, vipassanāya, na lābhī ajjhataṃ ceto, samathassa* (A 4.92/2:92), SD 96.7: for details, see A 4.93 (SD 95.8) & A 4.94 (SD 41.3). Cf SD 33.8 (3) Calm as basis for insight.

*thī*)<sup>20</sup>—and is able to give just the right teachings that would spiritually uplift the listener. Many become streamwinners in this way;<sup>21</sup> some become non-returners;<sup>22</sup> and more rarely, a few become arhats [1.1.5.5].

## 2 Bāvarī and his 16 pupils

### 2.1 PIŅGIYA MĀNAVA

**2.1.1** The protagonist of the Piᅅgiya Māᅇava Sutta is an old brahmin named Piᅅgiya Māᅇava—literally, the “brahmin youth” Piᅅgiya—with failing eyesight and hearing (Sn 1120), and very feeble (SnA 2:413). Here, *māᅇava* simply means a “brahmin student,” that is, he is learned in brahminical teachings and practices. The Commentaries say that he is 120 years old,<sup>23</sup> but is still known as “brahmin youth” (*māᅇava*).<sup>24</sup> He is a nephew and pupil of Bāvarī, who is of the same age.<sup>25</sup>

### 2.1.2 Piᅅgiya’s discipleship

**2.1.2.1** At the time when Piᅅgiya visits the Buddha with the other 15 disciples of Bāvarī, Piᅅgiya was 120 years old and very feeble [2.1.1]. At the end of his discussion with the Buddha, as recorded in the Piᅅgiya Sutta (Sn 1120-1123), because of **Piᅅgiya’s infirmity**, he fails to fully grasp the meaning of the first of two verses spoken to him by the Buddha. Mostly, however, he is distracted by the thought of his teacher, Bāvarī, whom he wishes were there.

**2.1.2.2** Evidently, Piᅅgiya does not hear the Buddha’s first verse [Sn 1121], because he effectively repeats his question, which has been answered [Sn 1122], where he also praises the Buddha. The Buddha patiently answers again [Sn 1123], and Piᅅgiya becomes a non-returner, although the teaching could have brought him arhathood. Piᅅgiya fails to attain arhathood because he is distracted by the notion that his uncle, Bāvarī, should be hearing the teaching, too.<sup>26</sup> Piᅅgiya’s 1000 pupils, properly attentive, however, all attain arhathood.

**2.1.2.3 The Cūᅇa,niddesa**, a canonical commentary on the Sutta Nipāta, however, says that Piᅅgiya attains the “Dharma-eye” (*dhama,cakkhu*).<sup>27</sup> Clearly, this is an ancient term which refers to the non-

<sup>20</sup> On *anuttaro purisa,damma,sarathī*, see SD 15.7 (3.6).

<sup>21</sup> Those who become streamwinners by listening to the Buddha incl Añña Koᅇᅇañña (**Dhamma,cakka Pavattana S**, S 56.11,16), SD 1.1; and Yasa (V 1:16). In both cases, they go on to become arhats by further listening to the Buddha teaching: for Añña Koᅇᅇañña, see **Anatta Lakkhaᅇa S** (S 22.59,24), SD 1.2; for Yasa, see V 1:17. Streamwinners may, through their own diligence, go on to become once-returners, either listening to the Dharma, reflecting on it, or practising mindfulness and meditation. On the 4 kinds of saints, see **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22,42-47), SD 3.13; **Āᅇāpāna,sati S** (M 118,9-12), SD 7.13; **Samaᅇa-m-acala S 1** (A 4.87), SD 20.13 + **S 2** (A 4.88), SD 20.14. For a comprehensive list of those awakened by listening to the Buddha, see Masefield, *Divine Revelation in Pali Buddhism*, 1986: Tables 4+5 (Appendices).

<sup>22</sup> Those who become non-returners by listening to the Buddha incl Piᅅgiya (**Piᅅgiya Māᅇava S**, Sn 5.17), SD 49.6a.

<sup>23</sup> Curiously, this means that Piᅅgiya is of the same age as his uncle and teacher, Bāvarī (Sn 1019). However, while the Sutta itself mentions Bāvarī’s age, we only know of Piᅅgiya’s age from Comys [foll n].

<sup>24</sup> Sn 1120; Nc:Be 189,2; NcA 82,3;SnA SnA 2:602,26.

<sup>25</sup> It is possible for an uncle and his nephew to be of the same age or about the same age when the nephew’s parents married very young, ie, before or just after the uncle’s birth. On Bāvarī, see SD 49.6b (2).

<sup>26</sup> SnA 2:603; NcA 84.

<sup>27</sup> “Dharma-eye,” *dhama,cakkhu*. The opening of the Dharma-eye refers to the vision of the law of change, usu denoting the attainment of streamwinning, but, more rarely, it may also refer to once-return or non-return—which puts us irrevocably on the path. Further see **Dhamma,cakka Pavattana S** (S 56.11,16 n), SD 1.1.

arhat sainthood, ie, as a streamwinner, a once-returner or a non-returner (Nc:Be 194,26). Such a term may reflect a time early in the first period of the ministry.<sup>28</sup>

The Cūḷa Niddesa adds that countless thousands of “living beings” (*aneka, pāṇa, saḥassānam*), too, attain the Dharma eye, that is, gain streamwinning, once-returning or non-returning. On account of Piṅgiya’s own merit (past good karma), his clothing is transformed into monastic robes, and his hair and beard appear to have been shaven. Venerating the Buddha by prostrating down deeply, he declares, “The Blessed One, bhante, is my teacher. I am his disciple!” (*satthā me bhante bhagavā, sāvako ’ham asmi*, Nc:Be 194 f).

**2.1.2.4** Piṅgiya and his followers—along with the other 15 brahmin youths and their followers—then express their desire to renounce the world, and are accepted by the Buddha with the “come, bhikshu” going-forth.<sup>29</sup> [2.0.4].

**2.1.3** Later, taking leave of the Buddha, he goes back to see Bāvarī and tells him the good news, describing the Buddha’s glory [Sn 1131-1145].<sup>30</sup> At the end of his report, the Buddha, seeing that the minds of both are spiritually ready, appears before them as a radiant light [1.1.5.1]], and teaches them the Dharma. Thereupon, Bāvarī becomes a non-returner and Piṅgiya an arhat (SnA 2:603-607).

**2.1.4** It is possible that the name Piṅgiya is a variant of Piṅgiyānī. In other words, Piṅgiya and Piṅgiyānī are the same person.<sup>31</sup> Piṅgiyānī is mentioned in **the Karāṇa, pālī Sutta** (A 5.194). The possible identity of the two names has been discussed in the introduction to this Sutta.<sup>32</sup>

## **2.2 Piṅgiya’s mental restlessness**

**2.2.1** Piṅgiya is famously distracted while the Buddha teaches him Dharma that could have made him an arhat. Piṅgiya is so excited by the teaching that he wishes his uncle were there, too, to listen to it. As a result, he only attains non-returning.<sup>33</sup> However, upon returning to Bāvarī, Piṅgiya happily recounts the Buddha’s teachings he has learned—which he calls the Pārāyana—and at the end of it, the Buddha appears before them in a radiant ray of light and teaches them. Listening to the Buddha, Piṅgiya becomes an arhat, while Bāvarī becomes a non-returner.<sup>34</sup>

**2.2.2 Piṅgiya’s arhathood** is a case of someone who attains final liberation after initially going through some mental restlessness (*uddhacca*), as mentioned in **the (Yuganaddha) Paṭipadā Sutta** (A 4.170).<sup>35</sup> According to this discourse, we cannot reach the path to final liberation when the mind is under the influence of *dhamm’uddhacca*, that is, restlessness related to the Dharma (but also translatable as “restlessness of mental states”).

**2.2.3** This “restlessness” or angst is a sort of existential “cry” out of a powerful desire to break free from suffering or out of compassion for the suffering world, or both. Once the mind settles down and becomes focused, the path is attained. Initially, Piṅgiya is all excited upon hearing the very teaching that he has

<sup>28</sup> On the 2 periods of the Buddha’s ministry, see SD 40a.1 (1.3).

<sup>29</sup> See SD 49.6b (2.3.4).

<sup>30</sup> In fact, Sn 1131-1149, are all connected with Piṅgiya. These verses form the concluding part of **Pārāyana S** (Sn 5.18), which itself concludes the Sutta Nipāta.

<sup>31</sup> DPPN calls him Piṅgiya (2) (qv).

<sup>32</sup> A 5.194 (SD 45.11 (2.2)).

<sup>33</sup> The wanderer Bāhiya Dāri, cīriya, too, is excited when he first meets the Buddha, and so was unable to fully attend to the Buddha’s teaching. After calming him down, the Buddha teaches him, and he becomes an arhat (U 1.10 @ SD 33.7): see SD 32.7 (2.1.4).

<sup>34</sup> On Bāvarī, see SD 49.6b (2.3), esp (2.3.3).

<sup>35</sup> A 4.170.5/2:157 @ SD 41.5.

been looking for. It is as if his mind, for a moment, remembers how he has struggled and wished to know such a teaching, and how his uncle and teacher, too, would have benefitted from such a teaching. Later, when he is calmer, as a non-returner, listening to the Dharma from the Buddha again, he attains final liberation, on account of his full and ready mind.<sup>36</sup>

— — —

## The Questions of Piṅgiya Māṇava

Sn 1120-1123

- 1 *Jiṅṅo 'ham asmi abalo vīta,vaṅṅo*  
(*icc'āyasmā piṅgiyo*)  
*nettā na suddhā savanam na phāsu*  
*mā'ham nassam momuho antarāya*<sup>37</sup>  
*ācikkha dhammam yam aham vijaññam*<sup>38</sup>  
*jāti,jarāya idha vippahānam* **Sn 1120** Aged am I, frail, complexion gone,  
(so speaks the venerable Piṅgiya)  
my eyes unclear, my hearing bad.  
May I not perish while still deluded.  
Show me the Dharma that I may understand  
the abandoning of birth and decay here.
- 2 *Disvāna rūpesu vihaññamāne*  
(*piṅgiyāti bhagavā*)  
*ruppanti rūpesu janā pamattā*  
*tasmā tuvaṃ piṅgiya appamatto*  
*jahassu rūpaṃ apunabbhavāya* **Sn 1121** Seeing people afflicted in **material forms**,  
(Piṅgiya, said the Blessed One,)  
the heedless are oppressed in material forms.  
Therefore, be you heedful, Piṅgiya—  
abandon form for the sake of non-rebirth.
- (Piṅgiya:)<sup>39</sup>
- 3 *Disā catasso vidisā catasso*  
*uddham adho dasa disā*<sup>40</sup> *imāyo*  
*na tuyham adiṭṭham asutaṃ amutaṃ*<sup>41</sup> *va*  
*atho aviññātam*<sup>42</sup> *kiñcinam atthi*<sup>43</sup> *loke*  
*ācikkha dhammam yam aham vijaññam*<sup>44</sup>  
*jāti,jarāya idha vippahānam* **Sn 1122** The 4 quarters, the 4 points in between,  
above and below—these are the 10 directions.  
There is nothing whatsoever in the world *d*  
that you have not seen not heard not sensed. *c*  
Show me the Dharma that I may understand  
the abandoning of birth and decay here.
- 4 *Taṅhâdhipanne manuje pekkhamāno*  
(*piṅgiyāti bhagavā*)  
*santâpajâte jarasâ parete* **Sn 1123** Seeing humans afflicted by **craving**,  
(Piṅgiya, said the Blessed One,)  
tormented, overcome by decay,

<sup>36</sup> On *dhamm'uddhacca*, see 32.7 (2.1).

<sup>37</sup> Be *antarāya*; Ee Nc SnA *antarāya*.

<sup>38</sup> **Ācikkha** is 2 sg imperative of *ācikkhati* [redupl pres of ā √KHYĀ, to see], “tells, inform (about), declares; makes known; describes; shows, points out; assigns”, esp ~ *dhammam*, “show the Dharma,” Sn 1097d = 1120d = 1122e. See CPD 1:138a sv *ācikkhati*, Cf ~ *dhammam yam aham vijaññam* (Sn 1097d) and ~ *me tam* [Ee wr *ācikkham etaṃ*] *yam aham vijaññam* (S 1:143,19\*). **Vijaññam** (Sn 1090c, 1097d, 1120e, 1122e) is 1 sg opt of *vijānāti*, “to understand”: see Sn:N n1065. For **yam** meaning “therefore, so that, for the reason that,” see Abh 1145 & SED yad (844).

<sup>39</sup> Although unattested by the verses, clearly this verse is spoken by Piṅgiya.

<sup>40</sup> Be so; Ee *disatā*.

<sup>41</sup> Be Ce so; Ee *asutaṃ'mutaṃ vā*; Se *asutāmutaṃ vā*.

<sup>42</sup> Ce *viññātam*.

<sup>43</sup> Be *kiñcinam atthi*; Se *kiñcim atthi*; Ee *kiñci natthi*.

<sup>44</sup> See (1): Sn 1120e nn.

*tasmā tuvaṃ piṅgiya appamatto  
jahassu taṇhaṃ apunabbhavāyāti*

**Sn 1123** therefore, you, Piṅgiya, be heedful—  
abandon craving for the sake of non-rebirth.

— evaṃ —

[For **Bibliography**, see the end of SD 49]

151018 151101 160826 170531