

20

Dhaniya Sutta

The Dhaniya Discourse | Sn 1.2 = Sn 18-34

Theme: Worldly joy versus spiritual joy

Translated by Piya Tan ©1989, 2005, 2017

How to study this Sutta

CONVENTIONS. This **sutta commentary** (“comy”) explains the sutta verses from various angles, especially to present their meaning and application in terms of the Dharma. Most of these grammatical and philological notes are from K R Norman, “The Dhaniya-sutta of the Sutta-nipāta” (1987-88).¹ The abbreviation for this “Sutta Commentary” is “comy” (with initial lower case “c”). Citation is either as “**comy 1-2/1**” or simply as “**1-2/1**” ie, “see §§1-2 (Sn 18-19), section 1.” The initial capitalized “Commentary” or “Comy” refers to the traditional Commentaries.

HOW TO STUDY THIS SUTTA. The most effective way is to start reading through the Introductory notes (1), and as much of the rest of the Introduction as you like. Then, read the Sutta just as it is right through at least once. You may then like to print two copies of the study notes, or separate the Sutta Commentary section so that you can refer to it more easily as you read the Sutta translation. Read through the whole Sutta at least once; then, the second round, look up the difficult words and the cross-references. Make your own notes as needed on the study notes themselves. When you have finished all your study, read the whole Sutta again just as it is to see how you have understood it.

GRAMMATICAL ANALYSES. For an interlinear word-for-word (literal) translation with grammatical details, see R E A Johannson, *Pali Buddhist Texts* [1973], 3rd ed, 1981:152-159 (appendix).

1 Sutta analysis

1.1 SUTTA HIGHLIGHTS

1.1.1 Sutta age

1.1.1.1 The Dhaniya Sutta (Sn 1.2) is a simple and beautiful poem of worldly success and spiritual attainment. There is almost no doctrinal exposition in the Dhaniya Sutta except perhaps for “(mental) barrenness” (*khila*) [Sn 19a] and “acquisitions” (*upadhi*) [Sn 33-34]. If we do not include the latter which belongs to an apparently interpolated passage, then, there is only one Dharma term—not exactly a technical term—in the whole sutta, that is, *khila*.

Note here that we have only the bare word—*khila*—which merely describes a mind that is “barren, sterile, stiff, rigid, hostile or resistant.” This word becomes a technical term in due course as *ceto, khila*, “mental barrenness,” as evident from the sutta title, **Ceto, khila Sutta** (M 16) [3.1.1].

1.1.1.2 The point remains that the Dhaniya Sutta does not have any technical term—which points in favour of the likely fact that it is an ancient text. That it is preserved in the Sutta Nipāta further confirms the likelihood of its age. The Sutta’s original form—that is, omitting the last two verses (Sn 33-34)—is certainly ancient.

¹ K R Norman, “The Dhaniya-sutta of the Sutta-nipāta,” *Journal of the Dept of Pali* (Univ of Calcutta) 4, 1987-88: 10-18, repr in Norman, “Collected Papers” vol 4, Oxford: Pali Text Soc, 1993:146-154 (Article 87).

1.1.2 Pastoral ballad

1.1.2.1 The Dhaniya Sutta is a pastoral ballad,² that is, a simple poem that is also a song. It usually portrays the peacefulness and innocence of country life as being free from the complexity and corruption of a crowded urban or community life.

A similar sentiment is expressed in **the Bhikkhū, paramparā Jātaka** (J 496) by the Bodhisattva (reborn as an ascetic in the Himalayas) regarding a pratyeka-buddha to whom the Bodhisattva offers alms that the Bodhisattva himself has received:

I cook, he cooks not: I have wealth, he nothing: I'm bound tight
To worldly things, but he is free: the food is his by right.³ (J 4:372)

1.1.2.2 The Dhaniya Sutta is an early Buddhist pastoral ballad, the bulk of which—that is, the first twelve verses [**Sn 18-29**—consists of a kind of dialogue between the rich herdsman Dhaniya (or Dhanika) and the Buddha. The verses fall into pairs, with Dhaniya first singing about his pleasures of pastoral life, followed by the Buddha's replies with verses full of puns and word-play pointing to the superior benefits of the spiritual life.

1.1.2.3 The Sutta is a **poetical duet** or even “duel” between the two main interlocutors, one rejoicing in his worldly security and the other in his spiritual liberation. At the end, Māra himself appears and tries to confuse the situation, but the Buddha sets things right again. Verse 13 [**Sn 30**] is spoken by the narrator.

1.1.2.4 Near the Sutta's end are two verses [**Sn 31-32**] in which Dhaniya and his wife (*gopī*, “cowherdess”) accept the Buddha as their refuge. This seems to be the original ending of the Sutta. Apparently, the last two verses have been added later.

The closing pair of verses [**Sn 33-34**] seem to be intrusive to the smooth flow of ideas. They are probably a later addition, since they exist independently in **the Saṃyutta** and also in **the Mahāvastu**, a Sanskrit work.⁴ They were added clearly because their themes coincide, and, except in the first Sutta, are spoken by Māra, too. [16-17/1]

1.1.3 Literary significance

Such pastoral ballads are in verse or in mixed prose and verse.⁵ Their recitation was the source from which epic poetry later gradually developed. The Commentaries, unfortunately, do not comment on the term **akkhāna** (Skt *ākhyāna*), even though it is found in the early texts.⁶

Buddhaghosa, however, gives the Mahābhārata and the Rāmāyaṇa as examples (DA 1:84). Another late development in the *akhyāna* literature was the Itihāsa (Vedic historical traditions) (DA 1247) which comes after the four Vedas (*akkhāna, pañcama*, “with the *akhyāna* as the fifth,” J 5:450).

² N A Jayawickrama, “Sutta Nipāta: The pastoral ballads,” 1950.

³ It should be noted that this giving is done while our Teacher is still a Bodhisattva. As such, this giving is not highly regarded in the Suttas: see eg (**Aṭṭha**) **Dāna Sutta 1** (A 8.31/4:236), SD 6.6.

⁴ **Nandati S** (S 1.2.2/1:6,9-13 = S 22*), spoken by a devata; **Nandana S** (S 4.1.8/1:107,32-108,6 = S 461*), spoken by Māra; Mvst 3.417,15-18, 418,2-5, spoken by Māra. [Sn 33 n]

⁵ See L P N Perera, “An analysis of the Sela Sutta of the Sutta Nipata.” *Ceylon University Review* 8,3 July 1950; repr *Pali Buddhist Review* 4,3 1979:66-70.

⁶ D 1:6, 3:183; M 3:167.

1.2 MISSING PARTS?

The current **Sn 21** seems to include the words of both the speakers. It is probable that the first half of the original verse by Dhaniya and the half by the Buddha have been combined into one verse. In fact, **Sn 21** does not actually respond to **Sn 20**. This probably indicates that two verses were lost, one of them is Dhaniya's musing, and the other is the Buddha's response to Sn 20. [comy 3-4]

1.3 RELATED SUTTAS

One of the most splendid old-style pastoral ballads is **the Raṭṭha, pāla Sutta** (M 82). One of the best known ballads is the story of Aṅgulimāla in **the Aṅgulimāla Sutta** (M 86). **The Āḷāvaka Sutta** (S 10.12)⁷ as a ballad is also of great poetic value. Some of the short ballads of the Saṃyutta about Māra and the nuns—such as those of **the Bhikkhuṇī Saṃyutta** (S 5)⁸—are remarkable, partly because of their archaic language, and they are amongst the most beautiful examples of ancient Indian poetry. One of the most lively examples of the ballad is, of course, **the Dhaniya Sutta** (Sn 1.2).

2 Key names

2.1 DHANIYA

2.1.1 Dhaniya or **Dhanika**⁹ is a herdsman living on the bank of the river Mahī in India [2.2]. He is a seth's son¹⁰ (*setṭhi,putta*) of Dhamma,koṇḍa in Pabbata,raṭṭha, belonging to the kingdom of Videha. He has seven sons, seven daughters, 30,000 oxen and 20,000 cows. During the dry season, he lives on an island (*antara,dīpa*) formed by the Mahī dividing into the Mahā,mahī and the Kāḷa,mahī (SnA 1:26 f).

2.1.2 During the 4 months of rains, he retires to a house on higher ground, where, one day, he sits musing over his comfortable rustic life and sings of his good fortune. Through his divine ear (clairaudience), the Buddha, in the fragrant cell in Sāvathī,¹¹ some 700 yojanas¹² away, hears Dhaniya reciting the first stanza of his song.

On examining the circumstance, the Buddha discovers that both Dhaniya and his wife are endowed by the right karmic conditions (*hetu,sampanna*). He reflects, "If I were to go to teach them Dharma, both of them, having gone forth, will attain arhathood. If I were not to go, tomorrow they will be destroyed by flood-waters." (SnA 1:29). Here is an example of the Buddha intervening, as it were, to convert the spiritually ready in the face of an impending disaster.¹³ [3.3]

2.1.3 The Commentary tells us that the Buddha teleports himself through the air and stands mid-air over Dhaniya's hut. As Dhaniya sings his song, the Buddha replies stanza with stanza (SnA 1:29). The Buddha uses the herdsman's words either to express the exact opposite or puns on them, either way, giving them

⁷ See S 10.12 (Sn 1.10).

⁸ Māra appears to the following nuns: Āḷavikā (S 5.1), Somā (S 5.2), Gotamī (S 5.3), Vijayā (S 5.4), Uppala,vaṇṇā (S 5.5), Cālā (S 5.6), Upacālā (S 5.7), Sisupacālā (S 5.8), Selā (S 5.9) and Vajirā (S 5.10): S 5.1-10/1:128-135.

⁹ On the alternation between -y- and -k-, see Sn:N 156 n22-23 (last para).

¹⁰ A seth (*setṭhī*) is an entrepreneur who finances large business projects, what we today would call a "fund manager" or "merchant banker."

¹¹ That is, in Anātha,piṇḍika's park monastery in Jeta's grove (*jeta,vana*) outside Sāvathī.

¹² Yojana, see **Anatta Lakkhaṇa S** (Sn 1.2) = SD 4.

¹³ The most famous case is that of Aṅgulimāla: see **Aṅgulimāla S** (M 86), SD 5.11. On the issue of "grace," see (3.3.1).

a new, spiritual value, so that the stanzas form related pairs. The result is a beautiful set of highly artistic contrapuntal verses.

2.1.4 At the end of the exchange of verses—which may have been heard by the whole family—both Dhaniya and his wife become streamwinners. After the Buddha reveals himself, Dhaniya and his wife join the order and later become arhats. [comy 14-15]

The other herdsmen erect a monastery for their use, and is known as the Go,kulaka Vihāra (SnA 46). This sutta is called **the Dhaniya Gopālaka Sutta** (the Discourse on Dhaniya the Cowherd) in the Milinda,-pañha (Miln 369,4), and is included in the Parittas.¹⁴

2.2 THE RIVER MAHĪ

2.2.1 The **Mahī** is one of the five great rivers of western peninsular India—the Luni, the Sabarmati, the Mahi, the Narmada, and the Tapi (or Tapi)—all of which flow westwards into the Arabian Sea. The Commentaries, however, list the 5 great rivers of ancient India as the Ganges, the Yamunā, the Aciravatī, the Sarabhū and the Mahī—but these rivers do not have the same source, as stated.¹⁵ The kingdom of Aṅg'uttarāpa was to the north of the Mahī (SnA 2:437). It is also called Mahā,mahī, and it divides into the Kāḷa,mahī, both embracing an island where Dhaniya and his family live.¹⁶

The river Mahi is regarded as a sacred river and has many temples and places of worship along its shore. It lends its name to the Mahi Kantha agency of Bombay, and also to the mehwasī, marauding highlanders often mentioned in Arabian chronicles. It is popularly called **Mahisagar** (“the Mahī sea”) due to the vastness of the river. The newly formed Mahisagar district in Gujarat derives its name from this holy river.



Map 2.2.2 The main rivers of west peninsular India¹⁷

¹⁴ *Parittā* here prob means “small,” rather than the later sense of “protection.” They are a collection of “small” or short popular texts. It is possible that, in due course, they were used as chants for the blessings of the laity, then the meaning of *paritta* changed accordingly to reflect their usage.

¹⁵ Vin 2:237; A 4:101, 5:22; S 3:135, 5:38; Miln 20, 104; Vism 10.

¹⁶ For map, see https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mahi_River.

¹⁷ http://geographyzones.blogspot.com/2016_04_01_archive.html.

2.2.2 The Mahī is about 580 km (360 mi) long, and is one of the three interstate west-flowing rivers in India, along with the Tapti river and the Narmada river. Most of the Indian rivers flow in an easterly direction into the Bay of Bengal. It originates at an altitude of 500 m between the villages of Bhopawar and Minda or Mindha, just south of Sardarpur (“tehsil” or sub-district), in the Dhar district of Madhya Pradesh. It runs through the western part of north India, lying between 72°21’ to 75°19’ east longitudes and 21°46’ to 24°30’ north latitudes.

It is bounded by Aravalli hills on the north and the north-west, by Malwa Plateau on the east, by the Vindhya on the south and by the Gulf of Khambhat on the west. It flows northward, turns northwest through the Vagad region of Rajasthan, then enters southwest through Gujarat, through the north outside of Vadodara (Baroda), and down all the way into a wide estuary past Khambhat (sitting in its rich alluvial plain), into the Gulf of Khambhat and the Arabian Sea.

The Som river (arising near the village of Som in Kherwara Tehsil of Udaipur District, flowing south-east) is its principal tributary which joins from the right, and the rivers Anas and the Panam joins from the left. The Mahi basin extends over the states of Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan and Gujarat, totaling 34,842 sq km with a maximum length and width of about 330 km by 250 km. The Mahī river-bed lies considerably lower than the land surface and, hence, is of little use for irrigation. However, some 65% of its basin area is agricultural with over 4% of water-bodies.

3 Teachings

3.1 MENTAL HARDNESS (*khila*)

3.1.1 Sn 19a mentions the first of two terms, that is, ***khila***, (**mental barrenness** (sometimes *khīla*). The Commentary explains *khila* as *citta-t, thaddha-*, “hardness of mind, mental obduracy, mental stubbornness” (SnA 1:30,23).¹⁸ As we have noted [1.1.1], this is not a technical term, but merely a word describing the fact that the Buddha’s mind is free from all defilements, that he is in full charge of it. Only later do we see *khila* becoming a technical term, that is, as *ceto, khila*.

3.1.2 The 5 types of mental barrenness (*ceto, khilā*) are enumerated in detail in the Saṅgīti Sutta (M 33), the (Majjhima) Ceto, khila Sutta (M 16), the (Pañcaka) Ceto, khila Sutta (A 5.205), the (Navaka) Ceto, khila Sutta (A 9.71) and the (Dasaka) Ceto, khila Sutta (A 10.14).¹⁹ **The (Pañcaka) Ceto, khila Sutta** (A 5.205) gives a list of 5 factors that stiffen the mind, hindering it from growing and so preventing spiritual maturity in a follower (especially a monastic), namely:

- (1) doubt about the teacher,
- (2) doubt about the Dharma,
- (3) doubt about the sangha,
- (4) doubt about the training,
- (5) anger against one’s fellow community members. (M 16; A 5.205, 9.71, 10.14; SnA 1:262)

The (Navaka) Ceto, khila Sutta (A 9.71) gives the 4 focuses of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*) as the solution for the 5 kinds of mental barrenness.²⁰

¹⁸ *Khila* as a psychological term is not so common in the suttas: ***S 1:193,13* = Tha 1242; S 3:134,22, 5:57,2; Sn 780, 973.

¹⁹ **D 33,2.1(19)/3:237 f; M 16/1:101-104 (SD 32.14); A 5.205/3:248 f; A 9.71/4:460; A 10.14/5:17-21.**

²⁰ A 9.71/4:460. For detailed references, see SD 32.14 (2.3).

3.1.3 The 3 unwholesome roots (*mūla*)—lust (*rāga*), hate (*dosa*), delusion (*moha*)²¹—are sometimes called *khila*—as in the **(Mūla) Ceto, khila Sutta** (S 45.166).²² It is mentioned with *paligha* in a Saṃyutta verse (S 123).²³ The expression *khilaṃ pabhindati* means “to split asunder the hardness (of one’s mind).”²⁴ When mental hardness is split open and the barrenness gone, we begin to mature as spiritual individuals, that is, to walk the noble path as streamwinners and so on.²⁵

3.1.4 Akhila. Its opposite is *akhila*, “open-minded, open-hearted, not fallow” (D 20; S 35.132).²⁶ It is often found in combination with *an’āsava* (“without influxes”) (Sn 212); with *akaṅkhā* (“doubt-free”) (Sn 477, 1059); with *vivaṭṭa-c-chada* (“drawn back the veil”) (Sn 1147); and *vigata, khila* [Sn 19] here.

The only other occurrence of *khila* is in **Sn 780d**: “Therefore, the sage is not (mentally) barren in any way” (*tasmā muni n’atthi khilo kuhiñci*). Here, *khila* is an adjective—which interestingly is the only case (a hapax legomenon) in the suttas. It is possible to take it as a noun, and read the line figuratively as: “Therefore, the sage is not in any way a barren field.”²⁷

3.1.5 The Ceto, khila Sutta further mentions 5 kinds of mental bondage (*cetaso vinibandha*), which, like the 5 types of mental hardness, hinder the mind from progressing spiritually. These 5 are: (1) lust for sense-objects, (2) lust for the body, (3) lust for visible things, (4) lust for food and sleep, and (5) living the religious life for heavenly rebirth.²⁸

3.2 ACQUISITIONS (*upadhi*)

3.2.1 Sn 33-34, as we have noted, have an independent existence [1.2.1.4]. They were probably added because they have a similar punning exchange, based on the word *upadhi* [16-17 (2)]. This is arguably a technical term (a word with a fixed sense and usage), probably formed from the simpler word, *upadi*. “clinging.”²⁹

Upadhi refers both to the objects, mental and physical, which we amass, and the love and affection we have for such things, leading to our forming an attachment, which leads us to rebirth. Hence, it is often translated as “substrate (of existence and rebirth)” and also “affection.” A man with children or cattle rejoices because he has them, which he loves. But then, he also grieves because of them. All this attaches him to the world and brings him rebirth. This is *upadhi*.

3.2.2 Acquisitions (*upadhi*), derived from *upa + dhā* (to rest upon), literally meaning “that upon which something rests,” that is, the “foundations” or “paraphernalia” of existence, that is to say, the acquisitions that support life, the “props” of life (S:B 348 n21). The term has both objective and subjective connotations: “the act of adding; that which is added” (CPD). Objectively, it refers to the thing acquired, that is, one’s possessions; subjectively, to the act of appropriating rooted in craving. Often the two senses of the word merge, and it is a near-synonym of “clinging” (*upādāna*).

The Sutta Nipāta Commentary (Paramattha, jotikā II) speaks of them as being fourfold:

²¹ D 33,1.10(1)/3:214,19; M 9.5/1:47,10 (SD 11.14)); A 3.68/1:201,18 (SD 16.14); It 3.1.1/45,10; cf Sn 14 (= 369).

²² S 45.166/5:57; cf Nc 9 where they are mentioned with other qualities.

²³ S 1.37/1:27 (S 123).

²⁴ S 8.8/1:193 (S 742), 22.90/3:134; Sn 973.

²⁵ On how we actually start walking the noble path of streamwinning, see **Entering the stream**, SD 3.3.

²⁶ **Mahā, samaya S** (D 20,19/2:261,10), SD 54.4; (**Mahā Kaccāna**) **Lohicca S** (S 35.132/4:118), SD 60.5.

²⁷ See Sn:N 330 n780.

²⁸ M 16/1:101-104 (SD 32.14); D 33,2.1(19)/3:239; A 5.205/3:248 f, 10.14/5:17-21.

²⁹ On *upadi*, see SD 50.13 (2.2). On *upadhi* & *upadi*, see **Brahma, deva S** (S 6.1), SD 12.4 (6).

- (1) the acquisition of sense-pleasures (*kām'upadhi*), that is, the 5 cords of sense-pleasures (*pañca kāma,guṇa*), including material possessions;
- (2) the acquisition of the aggregates (*khandh'upadhi*), that is, the 5 aggregates (*pañca-k,khandha*) and the suffering arising from the unwholesome roots (*khandha,mūla,dukkhassa adhiṭṭhāna,bhāvato*);
- (3) the acquisition of defilements (*kiles'upadhi*), that is, defilements that are the bases for suffering in the suffering states (*apāya,dukkhassa adhiṭṭhāna,bhāvato*); and
- (4) the acquisition of volitional activities (*abhisankhārūpadhi*), that is, volitional activities, the accumulation of karma, that are the bases for all suffering in samsara.

(SnA 1:44 f, SA 1:31 f; cf MA 5:60; SnA 2:436; ItA 2:64)

For a fuller sutta teaching on *upadhi*, see **the Sammasa Sutta** (S 12.66).³⁰

3.3 GRACE IN EARLY BUDDHISM?

3.3.1 Why the Buddha visits Dhaniya

3.3.1.1 We have noted why the Buddha appears to Dhaniya and his family and teaches them. The Buddha sees that they are ready for spiritual maturation and, that if he does not intercede at that very moment, Dhaniya and his family would be destroyed in a great flood on the following day [2.1.2]. The question here is whether this amounts to “grace” on the Buddha’s part?

3.3.1.2 As a religious term, **grace** (from the Greek *gratia*, and the Latin *charis*) evokes liberality and graciousness. Although it may be seen as a kind of “favour” extended by a being of special knowledge and power, and the ability to “save” others, this is a notion that is foreign to early Buddhism. However, this theistic notion of grace became more acceptable and centralized in many post-Buddha forms of Buddhism, especially the Mahāyāna.

3.3.1.3 In early Buddhism, “grace” is at once understood as the active and wise compassion of the Buddha in reaching out to beings, especially when they are ready for spiritual liberation, as in the case of Dhaniya and his family. However, such an act, common enough in the early canon, seems to contradict the Buddha’s teaching on karma—especially the idea of personal accountability—and his constant injunction that we should work out our own salvation—that is, the primacy of self-effort in spiritual liberation.

3.3.2 The Buddha’s wisdom

3.3.2.1 The Dīgha Commentary tells us that the Buddha, during the third watch of the night, that is, just before dawn, would through his mental powers and wisdom, reflect on those who, on account of past good karma, are capable of benefitting from his teaching and appear in his vision. Only those who are tractable (*veneyya*), that is, have the capacity for benefitting by his instruction, and who possess karmic affinity (*upanissaya*), appear before the Buddha’s divine eye. (DA 2:470)³¹

3.3.2.2 The point is that the Buddha helps those who are within his power to be helped. His wisdom allows him to be aware of those who need his help just at the right time. In the case of Aṅguli,māla, for

³⁰ S 12.66/2:107-112 (SD 107.9).

³¹ For the Buddha’s daily routine, see SD 36.2 (5.6.1).

example, the Buddha intercedes just before Aṅgulimāla is ready to kill his own mother to get his 1000th and last finger for his garland of human fingers as the honorarium (*dakkhiṇa*) for his foolish teacher. If he had killed his mother, he would have created such karma that will cut off his ability to attain spiritual breakthrough in this life.

3.3.2.3 Similarly, in the case of Dhaniya and his family, the Buddha intercedes at just the right time to literally save their lives. By renouncing before the Buddha and leaving their ranch for Jetavana that very day (probably at dawn), they are spared from being washed away by the flood-waters of the Mahī river on the next day. We are not told of the spiritual destiny of the rest of Dhaniya's family (those who have not gone forth under the Buddha), but there is also no mention that they perish in the impending floods. [2.2]

3.3.3 The Buddha's compassion

3.3.3.1 It should be understood that such accounts of the conversions and attainments of Aṅgulimāla and of Dhaniya are exceptional events with all the right conditions. Such individuals—like the early disciples—have all performed great good karma in past lives, and in their last lives, meeting the Buddha expedited the fruiting of such karma so that they all attain arhathood or attain the path. These are cases of ready students meeting their capable and receptive teacher.

3.3.3.2 In stark contrast to the Buddha's intercessory dispensations—his acts of compassionate interventions in human situations—preventing impending doom and nurturing the awakening of the spiritually ready, we also see the Buddha engaging himself with those who are unready, who do not appear to benefit from his teaching. There are at least 8 occasions when the Buddha teaches those before him, but they remain unmoved by his compassion and wisdom.

These are the cases of the status-conscious brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa (D 4), the foolish wanderer Nigrodha and his followers (D 25), some arrogant brahmin monks (M 1), the lustful monk Moḷiya Phagguna (M 21, S 12.32), the lustful monk Ariṭṭha (M 22), the deluded monk Sāti (M 38), and the false renunciant Potaliya (M 54). We have no mention of any of them benefitting from the Buddha's teaching in any way.³²

Of course, we may rest assured that to be born in the Buddha's time and in his presence is the benefit of the fruiting of our good karma. To be instructed by him is even a greater blessing. How we respond to such an opportunity for spiritual liberation depends on both our past karma and present conditions. Our past good karma may have propelled us into the Buddha's presence, but our present wholesome readiness and response are necessary for this precious gift to be enjoyed. This does not mean that the gift is lost if we do not benefit under such conditions. Still, they build up our store of good karma, and in time, when the conditions are right, we will surely enjoy spiritual liberation.

3.3.3.3 To understand the tension between the Buddha's intercessory activities and his routine teaching sessions, we must visualize and appreciate the big picture of the Buddha's teaching. The Buddha, first and foremost is the most highly evolved being amongst us in any epoch. He is able to see the whole of existence just as it is, and understand fully and exactly how life goes—this is the Dharma, the true nature of things. He instructs us how to see this true reality, and when we are able to do so ourselves, we are wise, compassionate and liberated just like him—we are the noble sangha.

Such a situation entails an awareness of our own true nature, that of others, and of the environment. With this understanding, we are able to move others with the same vision—they only need to

³² For details, see SD 1.4 (2.3.1).

open their own eyes and awake. Ours is merely a task of rousing and reminding ourselves that things are not right in the world, that we can rise above it.

In between the vision of reality and the vision of salvation, there is *the path* and *the journey*, the process of transformation that plucks us out of suffering into liberation. The Buddha, then, is a shower of the path (*akkhātāra*), a teacher (*satthā*) (Dh 276). This is a learning situation where life is not a problem to be solved, but rather a lesson to learn. It is the learning and knowledge that set us free.³³

— — —

The Dhaniya Discourse

Sn 1.2 = Sn 18-34

- | | | |
|---|--------------|---|
| <p>1 <i>Pakk'odano duddha, khīro'ham asmi</i>
(<i>iti dhaniyo gopo</i>)³⁶
<i>anutīre mahiyā samāna, vāso.</i>
<i>Channā kuṭi āhito gini</i>
<i>atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva.</i></p> | <p>Sn 18</p> | <p>I've boiled the rice,³⁴ I've milked the cows,³⁵
(<i>thus said Dhaniya³⁷ the herdsman,³⁸</i>)
with my family I dwell³⁹ on Mahī's⁴⁰ bank.
The hut is thatched,⁴¹ the fire is fed—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!⁴²</p> |
| <p>2 <i>Akkodhano vigata, khilo'ham asmi</i>⁴³
(<i>iti bhagavā</i>)⁴⁵
<i>anutīre mahiy'eka, ratti, vāso.</i>
<i>Vivaṭā kuṭi nibbuto gini</i>
<i>atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva.</i></p> | <p>Sn 19</p> | <p>Without anger am I, barrenness⁴⁴ gone,
(<i>thus said the Blessed One,</i>)
for (only) a night I dwell⁴⁶ on Mahī's bank.
Uncovered is the hut,⁴⁷ the fire's quenched⁴⁸—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!</p> |
| <p>3 <i>Andhaka, makasā na vijjare</i>
(<i>iti dhaniyo gopo</i>)</p> | | <p>Nor gadflies nor mosquitoes are found here.
(<i>Thus said Dhaniya the herdsman.</i>)</p> |

³³ On the problem of grace in early Buddhism, see Peter Masefield, *Divine Revelation in Pali Buddhism*, 1986:136 f + passim.

³⁴ "The rice is boiled": see comy 1-2/1 (below).

³⁵ "The cows are milked": see comy 1-2/2.

³⁶ This line is hypermetrical (it does not fit into the poem's metre), added by the council elders: see comy 1-2 (8). See also n on the narrators: comy 1-2/8.

³⁷ On Dhaniya, see (2.1).

³⁸ On *gopa*, see comy 1-2/9.

³⁹ *Samāna, vāso*, lit, "with equals," "With my family I dwell": cf "live with me" (*samāniyā*) (Sn 24b); see comy 1-2/3.

⁴⁰ On the Mahī river, see (2.2).

⁴¹ "The hut is thatched": see comy 1-2/4.

⁴² On the refrain, see comy 1-2/7.

⁴³ So Be Se; Ce Ee *vigata, khīlo'ham asmi*.

⁴⁴ On (mental) barrenness (*khīla*), see (1.1.1; 3.1).

⁴⁵ This line is hypermetrical (it does not fit into the poem's metre), added by the council elders: see comy 1-2/8. See also n on the narrators: comy 1-2/8.

⁴⁶ "For a night I dwell": see comy 1-2/3.

⁴⁷ "Uncovered is the hut": see comy 1-2/4.

⁴⁸ "The fire's quenched": see comy 1-2/6.

- kacche rūḷha,tiṇe caranti gāvo.*
Vuṭṭhim pi saheyyum āgataṃ
atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva. Sn 20 In the marshes,⁴⁹ lush with grass,⁵⁰ the cattle roam.
They will bear it even if it rains—
rain,⁵¹ therefore, rain if you wish!
- 4** *Baddhā'si⁵² bhisī susaṅkhatā*
(iti bhagavā)
tiṇṇo pāragato vineyya oghaṃ.
Attho bhisiyā na vijjati
atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva. Sn 21⁵⁵ Lashed together is a well-made raft [float],⁵³
(*thus said the Blessed One,*)
crossed over, reached beyond, away from⁵⁴ the
flood.
There's no need for any raft—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!
- 5** *Gopī mama assavā alolā*
(iti dhaniyo gopo)
dīgha,rattam⁵⁷ samvāsīyā⁵⁸ manāpā.
Tassā na suṇāmi kiṃci pāpaṃ
atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva. Sn 22 Obedient is my wife [*Gopī*],⁵⁶ not wanton,
(*thus said Dhaniya the herdsman,*)
charming, long have we dwelled together.
No bad do I ever hear of her—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!
- 6** *Cittam mama assavaṃ vimuttam*
(iti bhagavā)
dīgha,rattam paribhāvitaṃ⁵⁹ sudantaṃ.
Pāpaṃ pana me na vijjati
atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva. Sn 23 Obedient is my mind, liberated,
(*thus said the Blessed One,*)
for a long time fully cultured,⁶⁰ well tamed.
So, too,⁶¹ no bad is ever found in me—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!
- 7** *Atta,vetanā,bhato⁶² 'ham asmi*
(iti dhaniyo gopo)
puttā ca me samāniyā arogā.
Tesaṃ na suṇāmi kiṃci pāpaṃ
atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva. Sn 24 My own wage-earner⁶³ am I, self-supported,
(*thus said Dhaniya the herdsman,*)
and my children, healthy, live with me.⁶⁴
No bad whatsoever do I hear of them—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!
- 8** *Nāham bhatako'smi kassaci*
(iti bhagavā) Sn 25 No one's hireling⁶⁵ am I,
(*thus said the Blessed One,*)

⁴⁹ On *kaccha*, see comy 3-4/2.

⁵⁰ On the wordplay on *grass* (*tiṇa*), see comy 3-4/1.

⁵¹ On the imagery of *rain*, see comy 1-2/7.

⁵² Be *baddhā'si*; Ce Ee Se *baddhā hi*.

⁵³ "Raft [float]": see comy 3-4/3+4.

⁵⁴ On "away from" (*vineyya*), see comy 3-4/4.

⁵⁵ On a missing section in this verse, see (1.3). See comy 3-4.

⁵⁶ On *gopī*, see comy 1-2/9, 5-6/1.

⁵⁷ All MSS so; Be:Ka *dīgha,ratta*.

⁵⁸ On *samvāsīya* see comy 5-6/1.

⁵⁹ On how *paribhāvita* has prob changed in meaning over time, see comy 5-6.

⁶⁰ "Fully cultured": see comy 5-6/1.

⁶¹ *Pana* here clearly has the sense of *puna*, "moreover": cf Sn 690a.

⁶² The lengthened *-ā-* after *-vetanā-* is metri causa (mc): see Sn:N 157 n24a.

⁶³ On "wage-earner" (Sn 24a) and "hireling" (Sn 25a), see comy 7-8/3.

⁶⁴ "Live with me": see comy 7-8/2.

⁶⁵ On the "teacher's wealth" (*ācariya,dhana*), see SD 50.35 (1.1.3.2).

- nibbiṭṭhena carāmi sabba,loke.*
Attho bhatiyā na vijjati
atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva. Sn 25⁶⁷ I roam all the world enjoying my reward.⁶⁶
There's no use for wages—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!
- 9** *Atthi vasā atthi dhenupā*
(iti dhaniyo gopo)
go,dharaṇiyo paveniyo'pi atthi.
Usabho'pi gavam,patīdha⁷⁰ atthi
atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva. Sn 26 Heifers⁶⁸ have I, suckling calves [milch cows]⁶⁹
have I,
(thus said Dhaniya the herdsman,)
calving cows and mature oxen, too, have I.
A noble bull, lord of herd, too, here,⁷¹ have I—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!
- 10** *N'atthi vasā n'atthi dhenu,pā*
(iti bhagavā)
Go,dharaṇiyo paveniyo'pi n'atthi.
Usabho'pi gavam,patīdha⁷³ n'atthi
atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva. Sn 27 Nor heifers,⁷² nor suckling calves [nor milch
cows] have I,
(thus said the Blessed One,)
nor pedigree breeders, great with calf;
nor a noble bull here, lord of the herd—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!
- 11** *Khilā nikhātā asampavedhī*
(iti dhaniyo gopo)
dāmā muñja,mayā navā susaṅṭhānā.
Na hi sakkhinti dhenupā'pi chetum⁷⁴
atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva. Sn 28 The tethering posts are sunk, unshakable,
(thus said Dhaniya the herdsman,)
well-woven are the tethers of muñja-reed.
The suckling calves are unable to break out—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!
- 12** *Usabho-r-iva⁷⁵ chetva⁷⁶ bandhanāni*
(iti bhagavā)
nāgo pūtilataṃ'va dālayitvā⁷⁷.
Nāhaṃ pun'upessaṃ⁷⁸ gabbha,seyyaṃ
atha ce patthayasī pavassa deva. Sn 29 Like a bull, having burst his bonds,
(said the Blessed One,)
like an elephant breaking through stink-creepers,
never again will I come to lie in a womb—
rain, therefore, rain if you wish!

⁶⁶ On “enjoying my reward” (*nibbiṭṭhena*), see comy 7-8/4.

⁶⁷ Sn 24-25: on a missing verse and merging of two verses, see comy 7-8/1.

⁶⁸ “Heifers,” etc. A *heifer* is a young cow, esp one that has not yet calved. Dhaniya mentions altogether 5 kind of cattle: see comy 9-10/2-4.

⁶⁹ *Dhenu,pā* = *dhenu*, “milk” + *pā*, “drinker.” Comy however seems uncertain: see comy 9-10/2.

⁷⁰ Be Ce so; Ee Se *gavampatī ca*. See comy 9-10/1.

⁷¹ On the two occurrences of “here” (*idha*) (Sn 26c + 27c), see comy 9-10/7.

⁷² On the meaning of the cattle imagery here, see comy 9-10/5.

⁷³ = Sn 26 ad loc.

⁷⁴ Be:Ka *chetum*.

⁷⁵ The *-r-* sandhi (the particle *-r-* combines words together, *ra-kāro pada,sandhi,karo*, SnA 1:40,24) is common enough, eg, *vutti-r-esa* (Sn 81, 480), *puna-r-eti* (Sn 152), *thambho-r-iva* (Sn 214), *puna-r-āgamī* (Sn 339), *dhi-r-atthu* (Sn 440), *aragge-r-iva* (Sn 625), *sāsapo-r-iva* (Sn 631), *ati-r-iva* (Sn 679, 680, 683), *sarada-r-iva* (Sn 687), *haṃsa-r-iva* (Sn 1134); also *sikhi-r-iva* (J 5:445,25), *nadi-r-iva* (J 5:445,26).

⁷⁶ Be:Ka Se *chetvā*; Ee Ce *chetva*.

⁷⁷ Be:Ka Se *pūtilataṃ padālayitvā*; Ce *pūtilataṃ va dālayitvā*; Ee Se *pūtilataṃ va dālayitvā*.

⁷⁸ Be so; Ce Ee Se Ke *puna upessaṃ*; Be:Ka *punupeyya*.

- [Narrator:]⁷⁹
- 13** *Ninnarñ ca thalañ ca pūrayanto
mahā,megho pavassi tāvad eva.
sutvā devassa vassato
imam atthañ dhaniyo abhāsatha.* Sn 30⁸⁰ Suddenly, a great cloud burst into rain, b
Flooding the lowlands full. a
Hearing the falling of rain,
Dhaniya uttered this wish:
- 14** *Lābhā vata no anappakā
ye mayarñ bhagavantarñ addasāma.
Saraṇarñ tam upema cakkhuma
satthā no hoti tuvarñ mahā,muni.* Sn 31⁸¹ No small gain indeed is this for us,
we who have seen the Blessed One!
To you as refuge we go, O seeing one,
be our teacher, great sage!
- 15** *Gopī ca aharñ ca assavā
brahma,cariyarñ⁸² sugate carāmase.

Jāti,marañassa pārāgū⁸⁴
dukkhass’antakarā bhavāmase.* Sn 32⁸⁵ My wife [Gopī] and I are ready to listen:
Let us live the holy life under the Sugata [well-
gone]⁸³
for crossing over birth and death!
Let us be the end-makers of suffering!⁸⁶
- 16** *Nandati puttehi puttīmā
(iti māro pāpimā)⁸⁷
gomā⁸⁸ gohi tath’eva nandati.
Upadhī hi narassa nandanā
na hi so nandati yo nirūpadhi.* Sn 33⁹⁰ One with sons delight in sons,
(thus said Māra the bad one,)
the cow-owner, too, delights in cows.
For, acquisitions⁸⁹ are man’s delight;
one without acquisition delights not.
- 17** *Socati puttehi puttīmā
(iti bhagavā)
gomā⁹¹ gohi tath’eva socati.
Upadhī hi narassa socanā
na hi so socati yo nirūpadhīti.* Sn 34 One with sons grieves over sons,
(thus said the Blessed One,)
the cow-owner, too, grieves over cows.
For, acquisitions are man’s grief—
but one without acquisitions grieves not.

⁷⁹ See (1.2.1.3). See also n on the narrators: comy 1-2/7.

⁸⁰ On Sn 30, see comy 13.

⁸¹ On Sn 31-32, see comy 14-15.

⁸² All MSS so; Be:Ka *brahma,cariya*.

⁸³ On the couple’s renunciation, see comy 14-15/2.

⁸⁴ Be so; Ce Ee Ke Se *pārāgā*.

⁸⁵ **Sn 31-32**, relating the conversion of Dhaniya and his wife, and their aspiration to live the holy life under the Buddha, are presumably the original ending of the Sutta.

⁸⁶ Such a show of faith and sincere request clearly attest to the fact that the pair have attained at least stream-winning.

⁸⁷ This line is hypermetrical (it does not fit into the poem’s metre). It was added by the council elders: see comy 1-2/8. See also n on the narrators: comy 1-2/8.

⁸⁸ Be so; Be:Ka *gopiyo*; Ce Ee *gomiko*; Ke Se *gopiko*: comy 1-2/9. All the readings here go against the metre: **gomā** (f) is better metrically, and forms a better parallel with *puttīmā*, “those who have sons”: *go-mā* / *putt-i-mā*. **Mahāvastu**, however, has the reading *gomiko*, with vl *gopiko* (Mvst 3:417,16 + 417,3)—it is clear, then, that this must have been the reading at a very early date, but more likely, the Skt version preserved this reading from a late source. See comy 16-17/1.

⁸⁹ On *upadhi*, see (1.1.1; 3.2).

⁹⁰ **Sn 33-34** recur in **Nandati S** (S 1.2.2 = S 22*-23*), the 1st verse spoken by a devata, and then the Buddha’s response; **Nandana S** (S 4.1.8 = S 461*-462*), the 1st verse spoken by Māra, followed by the Buddha’s response; Mvst 3.417 + 418, the same. On Sn 33-34, see comy 16-17, also (1.2.1.4).

⁹¹ = Sn 33 ad loc.

— evaṃ —

Sutta Commentary

§§1-2 (Sn 18-19)

1-2/1 There is a pun on *pakk'odano*, “my rice is boiled” = “having boiled rice” [Sn 18a] and *akko-dhano*, “having no anger” = “free from anger” [Sn 19a]. This pun ignores the difference between the unaspirated *-d-* and the aspirated *-dh-*.⁹² The word *akkodhano* in the verse is discussed in **the Milinda, -pañha** (Miln 186 f).⁹³

1-2/2 There is also a pun on *duddha, khīro*, literally, “having milked milk” = “(my cows) are milked” [Sn 18a] and *vigata, khilo*, “mental hardness gone” = “(mental) stubbornness gone away” [Sn 19a]. This pun ignores the difference between the long *-ī-* and the short *-i-*.

1-2/3 The phrase *eka, ratti, vāso*, “for a night I dwell” [Sn 19b] only makes sense in connection with *samāna, vāso*, “with my family I dwell” [Sn 18b]. The Commentary explains *samāna, vāso* as follows: “Those who are *samāna, vāso* dwell with their family agreeably, together with attendants” (*samānena anukūla, vuttinā parijanena saddhiṃ vāso yassa samāna, vāso*, SnA 1:28,22).

This would make even better sense if **18b** makes a reference to time, that is, duration. The British philologist, K R Norman, suggests that in place of *samāna, vāso*, there was an earlier form, *samāsa, vāso*, which fits better here. Both words would have the same meaning (“dwelling together”), but *samāsa* can also be understood as meaning “6 months” (*cha māsa*),⁹⁴ to which the Buddha’s “one night” would make an appropriate response.

It is possible, suggests Norman, that *samāsa-* was replaced by *samāna-* because of the presence of the word *samāniyā* in **24b**.⁹⁵ Perhaps, the phrase here is influenced by the compound, *samāna, samvāso* at **Dh 302**, where it is said, “Living together as a family is suffering” (*dukkho samāna, samvāso*). [Sn 24b; comy 7-8/2]

1-2/4 Hut. There are two metaphors here—those of the **hut** (*kuṭi*) and the **fire** (*gini*). Dhaniya uses the words *kuṭi*, “hut,” and *gini*, “fire” [Sn 18c], in the ordinary sense of the words. The Commentary, however, explains *kuṭi*, “hut” [Sn 19c], in a figurative sense—as the “body,” the way the Buddha uses them: “By ‘**thatched is the hut**’ (*channā kuṭi*) is meant suffering that may come to the body has been warded off” (*Channā kuṭiṭi kaya, dukkh'āgama, paṭighātam*, SnA 1:29,8).

⁹² See Norman 1987-88:11 = 1993:148: this ref applies to this whole subsection.

⁹³ King Milinda presents a “dilemma” to Nāgasena: **Cātuma S** (M 67,4-5 + SD 34.7 (3.1.2)) records the Buddha as dismissing the elders Sāriputta and Moggallāna and their following of noisy young monks—the question is whether here the Buddha is angry or pleased. If he is pleased, then, he acted groundlessly or ignorantly. If he were angry, then, it contradicts what is said here in **Dhaniya S** [Sn 19a]. Nāgasena replies that, like the great ocean, the Buddha is beyond approval and repugnance, casting ashore a carcass (A 8.19,14 @ SD 45/18; V 2:237 @ SD 59.2c; A 8.20 @ SD 59.2a; U 5.5 @ SD 59.2b; cf Miln 380), here alluding to the noisy monks.

⁹⁴ The usual Pali word for “6” is *cha*, but we often see it in the form *sa-*, as in *sāham*, “6 days” (J 6:80,7*) = *cha, -divasa, matta*, J 6:80,22) and in *sa-*, as in *sa-āyatana*, “the 6 sense-bases.” Cf Asokan *āsammāsika*, “up to 6 months old,” *saḍḍuṅṅasati*, “26” and *sapaṇṇā*, “56.” (Norman 1987-88:148 n4).

⁹⁵ Norman 1987-88:11 = 1993:148.

In the Buddha's reply, the "hut" refers to the body, while "fire" is clearly an allusion to the householder's 3 fires [1-2/6]. These are, of course, wordplays: Dhaniya uses these words in the normal worldly sense, while the Buddha uses them in a Dharma sense. The Commentary explains **the hut metaphor** as follows:

The "hut" (*kuṭi*) [Sn 18c] is selfhood [the person]. For various reasons, selfhood is dependent on the body, which is said to be a cave,⁹⁶ or a heap, or an accumulation,⁹⁷ or a boat,⁹⁸ or a chariot,⁹⁹ or flag, or an anthill,¹⁰⁰ or a hut, or a little shed.¹⁰¹ Here, too, the body—like a hut that is dependent on wood, and so on—the body is called a "hut" because, like the hut (that is dependent on stick, etc), it is regarded as being dependent on bones, and so on.¹⁰²

(SnA 1:31,4-9)

In the case of ordinary worldlings, their dwellings are covered—as humourously observed in **the Aggañña Sutta** (D 27) in its account of the evolution of sexual behaviour: "Since those beings fell into excessive [uncontrollable] intoxication with this immorality [sexual intercourse], they resorted to **building houses**¹⁰³ just to hide this immorality."¹⁰⁴

The Dhaniya Sutta Commentary explains that such houses refers to beings who are "covered by craving, conceit and views" (*taṇhā, māna, diṭṭhi-c, chadena*) (SnA 1:31,19). The Commentary then quotes this well known verse [1-2/5.1].

Hence, the phrase, "**uncovered is the hut**" (*vivatā kuṭi*, Sn 19c) should be understood as having a roof (against the rain) but without walls or covering to hide its inhabitants. The walls represent the various defilements mentioned and any other kind of immoral activity.

1-2/5.1 Related teachings on the "uncovered houses." The Dhaniya Sutta Commentary quotes the following verse from **the Siri,maṇḍa Thera,gāthā** (Tha 447) after its explanation of *channā kuṭi* (Sn 18c) and *vivaṭā kuṭi* (Sn 19c):

*Channam̐ ativassati
vivaṭam̐ nātivassati
tasmā channam̐ vivaretha
evan tam̐ nātivassati.*

It rains hard on the covered;
it rains not hard on the uncovered.
Therefore, remove the covering—
then, it will not rain hard on it.

⁹⁶ The body is like a cave (*guhā*): Sn 772.

⁹⁷ The body is like an accumulation (*sandeha*): Tha 20; Dh 146.

⁹⁸ The body is like a boat (*nāvā*): Dh 369.

⁹⁹ The body is like a chariot (*ratha*): S 4:292,7.

¹⁰⁰ The body is like an anthill (*vammika*): M 1:144,1.

¹⁰¹ The body is like a little shed (*kuṭikā*): Tha 1, etc.

¹⁰² *Kuṭīti atta, bhāvo, atta, bhāvo'ti tam̐ tam̐ atthavasam̐ paṭicca kāyo'ti pi guhāti pi deho'ti pi sandeho'ti pi nāvā'ti pi ratho'ti pi dhajo'ti pi vammiko'ti pi kuṭīti pi kuṭikāti pi vuccati, idha pana kaṭṭh'ādīni paṭicca geha, nāmikā kuṭi viya aṭṭhi-ādīnā paṭicca saṅkham̐ gatattā kuṭīti vutto* (SnA 1:31,4-9).

¹⁰³ "Building houses" contradicts the essence of monastic life, ie, of "going from the household into homelessness" (*agārasmā anagāriyam̐ pabbajjā*, **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 1,5/1:88), SD 21.3; **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,27/1:172), SD 1.11; **Laṭukikōpama S** (M 66,12.3/1:452), SD 28.11; **Raṭṭha, pāla S** (M 82,4/2:55), SD 92.5; Tha 46; Sn 274; cf **Cūḷa Dukkha-k, khandha S** (M 14,4/1:91), SD 4.7. See foll n.

¹⁰⁴ D 27,17.3 (SD 2.19). This interesting statement echoes the common phrase in the suttas, "The household life is stifling, a dusty path. The life of renunciation is like the open air. It is not easy living in a house to practise the holy life completely, in all its purity, like a polished conch-shell. What if I were to shave off my hair and beard, put on the saffron robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?" (eg, D 2,41/1:63; Sn 406).

This well known verse is also found in **the Pātimokkha Ṭhapana Khandhaka** (the section on the cancellation of the Pātimokkha recital, V 2:240)¹⁰⁵—also recorded in **the (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta 1** (A 8.20)¹⁰⁶ and **the (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta 2** (U 5.5)¹⁰⁷—where “the covered” (*chādana*) means “having fallen into an offence and hiding it, one falls into another new offence; but disclosing it, one does not fall into another offence” (VA 1287; UA 306). The right thing to do here, then, is to own up an offence to set things right, and so minimize the harm, or even avoid it altogether.¹⁰⁸

1-2/5.2 Related teachings on the “covered houses.” While the “open hut” imagery relates more to the Vinaya and moral virtue (restraint of body and speech), the “well-thatched hut” imagery relates to *the mind*, as in this pair of “twin verses” from the Yamaka Vagga of **the Dhammapada**, which are also the verses of the elder Rādha, **the Rādha Thera, gāthā**:

<i>Yathâgāraṃ ducchannaṃ</i>		Just as rain pierces through	<i>b</i>
<i>vuṭṭhī samativijjhati</i>		the badly thatched roof of a house,	<i>a</i>
<i>evaṃ abhāvitaṃ cittaṃ</i>		even so, an uncultivated mind	
<i>rāgo samativijjhati</i>	Dh 13 = Tha 133	is penetrated by lust.	
<i>Yathâgāraṃ succhannaṃ</i>		Just as rain does not pierce through	<i>b</i>
<i>vuṭṭhi na samativijjhati</i>		the well-thatched roof of a house,	<i>a</i>
<i>evaṃ subhāvitaṃ cittaṃ</i>		even so, a well cultivated mind	
<i>rāgo na samativijjhati</i>	Dh 14 = Tha 134	is not penetrated by lust.	

1-2/6 Fire. Dhaniya uses the words *gini*, “fire” [Sn 18c], in the ordinary sense of the words. The Commentary, however, explains it in a metaphorical sense, as used by the Buddha. “‘**The fire is fed**’ (*āhi-to gini*) means that cowherds make the 3 fires, making the smoke of the wood-fire in the enclosure fill up the whole house.”¹⁰⁹ **The “3 fires”** are clearly an allusion to the householder’s 3 fires (*tayo aggī*): (1) the fire fit for oblation (*āhuneyy’aggi*); (2) the houselord’s fire (*gahapat’aggi*); and (3) the fire of offering (*dakkhineyy’aggi*).¹¹⁰

The word *gini*, “fire” [Sn 19c] is an alternate form of the more familiar *aggi* (Sn 2:28,24), also in **the Culla Bodhi Jātaka** (J 443/4:26,17*), or *aggini* (Sn 668d). *Gini*, too, is a pun—for the 3 fires of lust (*lobha*), hate (*dosa*) and delusion (*moha*), and *nibbuta*, “quenched, cooled,” is also used figuratively in the same connection. The Commentary explains:

“**Quenched**” (*nibbuta*) means “at peace.” *Gini* means “fire,” that is, all the 11 kinds of flames.¹¹¹ It is said of “burning” (*āditta*), in detail, thus: “Burning with the fire of lust, and so on

¹⁰⁵ V 2:240 (SD 59,2c).

¹⁰⁶ A 8.20/4:198-204 + 206-208 (SD 59.2a). This Sutta, however, omits the verse.

¹⁰⁷ U 5.5/53-56 (SD 59.2b), where UA 306 gives the same comy “the covered” (*channa* or *chādana*) as VA 1287.

¹⁰⁸ This verse recurs at Nett 153, where “the covered” is said to be defilements, while “the open” is moral virtue; also at Peṭk 25, 202.

¹⁰⁹ **Āhito ginīti yasmā go, pālakā parikkhepa, dhūma, dāru, aggi, vasena tayo aggī karonti, te ca tassa gehe sabbe katā** (SnA 1:29,9-11).

¹¹⁰ **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,1.10(33)/3:217,20); **(Uggata, sarīra) Aggī S** (A 7.44,12-16/4:33,3); V 1:31,6.

¹¹¹ **The 11 kinds of flames** are those of: (1) lust (*rāga*), (2) hate (*dosa*), (3) delusion (*moha*), (4) birth (*jāti*), (5) decay (*jarā*), (6) death (*maraṇa*), (7) sorrow (*soka*), (8) lamentation (*parideva*), (9) suffering (*dukkha*), (10) sorrow (*do-manassa*) and (11) despair (*upāyāsa*) (J 3:411,24; DA 441,17; VAṬ:Be 2:89,1); 10 are listed at Pm 1:129, but makes 11 if *jarā* and *maraṇā* are taken separately. Also mentioned at MA 4:188; SA 1:82, 2:279; DhA 3:103; UA 356; BA 81; ThaA 1:98, 2:178, 3:15, 41, 139, 152; ThīA 288, 292; J 3:411, 471, 472, 5:251; SnA 1:32, 114; PmA 1:22; ApA 190; VA 1:262; Vism 666,7+8. Cf the 8 kinds of sufferings given at **Dhamma, cakka Pavattana S** (S 56.11,5), SD 1.1.

...¹¹² **Gini** is thus said of the fire that the Blessed One has quenched at the foot of the Bodhi tree by sprinkling it with the water that is the noble path: therefore, it is said that **the fire (gini) is quenched.**¹¹³ (SnA 1:32,7-11)

1-2/7 Rain. In the refrain—*atha ce patthayasi pavassa deva*¹¹⁴ [Sn 18d etc], there is a pun on the word “rain.” Dhaniya refers to the physical “rain” [Sn 18d]. The Buddha, on the other hand, uses the same phrase [Sn 19d] to speak metaphorically. He is referring to the “rain of defilements, such as lust and so on” (*rāg’ādi,kilesa,vassam*, SnA 1:31,20).

1-2/8 The narrators. When studying a sutta, we should be mindful of who *the narrator* is. The Dhaniya Sutta is a poetic dialogue. Most of the time, we directly hear, as it were, the two interlocutors—**Dhaniya** [Sn 18, 20, 22, 24, 26, 28, 31, 32] and **the Buddha** [Sn 19, 21, 23, 25, 27, 29, 34]. Almost all these verses are marked with the speaker’s tags—stating who the speaker is—which is hypermetrical (they do not fit into the poem’s metre).

For Dhaniya’s verses, there is the tag “(*iti dhaniyo gopo*)” in Sn 18, etc; for the Buddha’s verses, there is “(*iti bhagavā*).” Sn 30, says the tag, is spoken by the council elders [comy 13/1]. Line d of Sn 30 is a tag, telling us that Dhaniya speaks the next two verses (Sn 31-32).

The Commentary says nothing about these tags¹¹⁵ until almost the end of the Sutta. There, the tag says—(*iti māro pāpimā*)—“thus said Māra the bad one” [Sn 33]. The Commentary says of this line, “These and such like are the council elders’ words” (*saṅgīti,kārānaṃ etaṃ vacanaṃ, sabba,gāthāsu ca īdisāni*, SnA 1:44,19). This covers all the contexts.¹¹⁶

1-2/9 Gopa and gopī. In Sn 24, Dhaniya states that he looks after his own cows—he is a **herdsman** (*gopa*). The Commentary explains the distinction between **gopa** (“herdsman”) and *gopālaka* (“cowherd”), as follows: “One who guards his own cows is called a ‘herdsman’. One who earns wages by looking after the cows of others is called a ‘cowherd’ (*go,pālaka*).” (*Yo hi attano gāvo pāleti so gopo’ti vuccati. Yo parea-saṃ vetanena bhato hutvā, so gopālako. Ayaṃ pana attano yeva, tena gopo’ti vutto*, SnA 1:28,18-20).

Gopī [Sn 22a], although a popular Indian name, is here probably simply the feminine counterpart of *gopa*, “herdsman.” *Gopī* means “herdswoman, cowherdess; milkmaid.” In post-Buddha mythology, *Gopī* was a companion of Kṛṣṇa (Krishna). It is also an Indian name for *Ichnocarpus frutescens*, the “black creeper.”

§§3-4 (Sn 20-21)

3-4/1 Clearly, Sn 21 is a response to Sn 20. However, apparently, the true opposite to Sn 20 has probably been lost. According to Norman, the lost verse presumably gave some punning references by the Buddha to insects and cattle in lush pastures.¹¹⁷

¹¹² Well known examples of “fire” as defilements, esp the 3 unwholesome roots (*akusala.mūla*) of lust, hate and delusion are found in **Āditta (Pariyāya) S** (S 35.28 = Mv 1.21), SD 1.3; (**Mūla**) **Aggi S** (It 3.5.4/92 f), SD 62.14.

¹¹³ *Nibbuto’ti upasanto; ginīti aggi, yena hi ekādasa,vidhena agginā sabbaṃ idaṃ ādittam yath’āha: “ādittam rāg’agginā”ti vitthāro, so aggi bhagavato bodhi,mūle yeva ariya,magga,salila,sekana nibbuto, tasmā nibbuto ginīti āha* (SnA 1:32,7-11).

¹¹⁴ See Tha:N 135 n51-54.

¹¹⁵ See Tha:N 242 n824.

¹¹⁶ For other occurrences of council elders’ remarks in Sn, see Sn:N 154 n18-29.

¹¹⁷ Norman 1987-88:12.

There is a play between **-tiṇa** in *rūlha,tine*, “lush with grass” [Sn 20b] and **-tiṇṇa** in the phrase *tiṇṇo pārāgato*, “crosses over, reached beyond.” While the former refers to a worldly context of natural beauty and food for Dhaniya’s cattle, the latter alludes to the Buddha’s attainment of awakening and liberation.

3-4/2 The word **kacche** [Sn 20b] refers to *nadi,kaccha*, the inner side of a river-bend—a kind of spit—where there is sedimentation, forming marshy land where reed grows luxuriantly.¹¹⁸ The Commentary tells us that Dhaniya lives at the confluence of the Mahā,mahī and its tributary, the Kāḷa,mahī (SnA 17,2). This location, however, cannot be determined from the information we currently have.

This, however, gives us a good clue regarding the physical location of Dhaniya’s ranch, that is, very close to the river. This is significant because such a place is also liable to floods when the river-waters build up. In fact, the Commentary tells us that the day after the Buddha’s visit, there will be a devastating flood that will destroy the area (SnA 1:29) [2.2].

3-4/3 Apparently, **Sn 21**, as it is, contains parts of both Dhaniya’s statement and the Buddha’s reply, since line c (“There’s no more need for a raft”) seems to contradict line a (“Lashed together is a well-made raft”). It is possible that line a is part of Dhaniya’s statement: He worries not if the rains flood the fields because he has prepared a **bhisi** (either a “raft” or a “float”), probably large enough to safely hold his whole family.

3-4/4 Sn 21b is probably spoken by Dhaniya, too, referring to the crossing of the river with **vineyya** as an absolutive (“gone across, having crossed the flood,” *oghaṃ taritvā atikkamma*, SnA 1:35,13-14), doubtless going with a finite verb, now lost, in line c.¹¹⁹

It probably said something about hearing the Dharma, and the rest of the verse tells how a person who has the Dharma as his **bhisi** would cross safely to the far shore, and overcome the flood of samsara, “that is, the fourfold floods of sensual lust and so on” (*kām’ādi,catu-b,bidhaṃ oghaṃ*, SnA 1:35,13).

The missing second line of the Buddha’s reply is presumably the same as Dhaniya’s, “which would explain why the two verses became merged together.”¹²⁰ In the Buddha’s reply, however, **vineyya** [Sn 21b] would be an optative (expressing wish or desire, “may we ... ” or “let us ... ”): “We should cross over the flood ... ”

Since we will cross the samsaric “flood” by means of the Dharma, we do not need a **bhisi**. The metaphorical use of **bhisi** is well known, found in a number of Commentaries, besides that of the Sutta Nipāta:

*Maggo pajjo patho pantho añjasam vaṭum’āyanam
nāvā uttara,setu ca kullo¹²¹ ca bhisi saṅkamo
addhānam pabhavo c’eva tattha tattha pakāsita*

Path, trail, course, way, the straight road for going,
boat, causeway, raft, float, and bridge—
these are the various means for making a journey.
(SnA 1:34,26-28)¹²²

§§5-6 (Sn 22-23)

5-6/1 It is probable that the word **gopī** [Sn 22a + n, 32a] is simply the feminine counterpart of **gopa** [Sn 18a]. Clearly, in the Buddha’s verse, **gopī** refers to the mind (*cittam*) [Sn 23a]. The fact that **23b** has a

¹¹⁸ Comy says that there are 2 kinds of *kaccha* (lit, “armpit”), ie, in a river or a hill: a river-bend (*nadi,kaccha*) and a canyon (*pabbata,kaccha*). A river-bend is meant here. (SnA 1:33,29)

¹¹⁹ See Norman id.

¹²⁰ Norman id.

¹²¹ For the famous parable of the raft (*kull’upama*), see **Alagaddûpama S** (M 22,14/1:134 f), SD 3.13.

¹²² The first 2 lines recur at Nc:Be 201; DA 3:743; MA 1:229; SA 3:177; ApA 454 (line a); BA 72; NmA 2:442; PmA 2:485; NettA:Be 268.

past participle *paribhāvitam* suggests that **22b** should also have a past participle. In that case, *samvāsiyā* [Sn 22b] must stand for *samvāsītā*. This may be a remnant from an older version of the Sutta.¹²³

Of Dhaniya's wife, the Commentary says: "For a long time, since boyhood, they had lived together, growing up (*vaḍḍhitā*) with one another so that she knew no other persons."¹²⁴ The presence of *vaḍḍhitā* suggests that the Commentary followed a tradition that took *samvāsiyā* as a past participle ("had lived together").

5-6/2 *Paribhāvitam* [Sn 23b] has its problems. As we understand it today, the word is derived from *pari-* ("all around") + *√BHŪ*, "to cultivate" = *paribhāveti*,¹²⁵ "to cause to be pervaded or penetrated."¹²⁶ Hence, *paribhāvita* means "penetrated, trained," or literally "cultivated all around," that is, "fully cultivated," here meaning, "well liberated." However, if we use this translation for the Buddha's phrase, as "my mind ... fully cultured" [Sn 22ab], it does not seem to parallel Dhaniya's words, "we have dwelled together."

Interestingly, the word *paribhāvita* occurs in Sanskrit, meaning "enclosed, contained."¹²⁷ Now, if we retranslate this as "my mind ... fully enclosed (or restrained) within," then, this very well parallels Dhaniya's words regarding his wife, that "we have dwelled together." It is likely that the Sanskrit word here retained an old sense which was forgotten in the Pali. However, we should not assume that this is always the case [7-8/1].

Technically, we do not have to change our translation here. However, we must cultivate the habit of "rightly reading" the Pali and its translation. When we read the Buddha saying, "my mind ... fully cultivated," we should remember that it can also mean: "my mind ... fully enclosed (or restrained) within."

§§7-8 (Sn 24-25)

7-8/1 Here, we again seem to have a problem of lost lines or verses. **Sn 25** records the Buddha's reply to only **Sn 24a**. In other words, **24bc**—where Dhaniya comments about his children—has no parallel in **25**, where we would expect some comment on them by the Buddha. This suggests that we have a missing verse, and two verses dealing with sons and wages have been merged together.

7-8/2 The Commentary explains *samāniya* [Sn 18b, 24b] as meaning "put or placed down, not going anywhere else" (*samāniyā'ti sannihitā avippavutthā*, SnA 1:38,14-15). This seems to take *samāniyā* as a past participle, but there is no reason not to follow PED in taking it as the equivalent of the Sanskrit *samānyā*, "equally, jointly, together"¹²⁸—that is, as an adverb. In fact, this second sense fits the context here better.

¹²³ For the philological details, see Norman 1987-88:12 n2.

¹²⁴ *Cira, kālaṃ saddhiṃ vasamanā komāra, bhāvato pabhuṭi ekato vaḍḍhitā, tena para, purise ns jānā'ti dasseti* (SnA 1:36,7-8).

¹²⁵ *Paribhāveti* is the causative of *paribhavati* or *paribhoti*, "to treat with contempt, neglect, despise" (S 1:69; A 3:174 f). Notice that these senses diverge significantly from its other forms. Such changes developed over time, probably after the Buddha's time.

¹²⁶ This word and its other forms have several meanings, but here we restrict ourselves to the sense reflected in *paribhāvita* in our Sutta. For details, see PED: svv *paribhavati*, *paribhāveti*, *paribhāvita*.

¹²⁷ See SED: *paribhāvita*.

¹²⁸ SED: *samānyā*.

7-8/3 The Buddha’s reply in **25a** is clearly in response to Dhaniya’s statement in **24a**. We should therefore have expected two more lines in **24**, devoted to a statement about being a *bhata(ka)* (“wage-earner”) and *bhiti* (“wages”) as the Buddha’s reply.¹²⁹

7-8/4 In **Sn 25b**, the phrase, “enjoying my reward” (*nibbiṭṭhena*) refers to the Buddha’s awakening. The Commentary quotes our Buddha Gotama as saying, “From the time of Dīpaṅkara Buddha (when Gotama first aspired to attain Buddhahood) up to the awakening (under the Bodhi tree), I was a wage-earner (*bhataka*) for the sake of omniscience (that is, awakening). But with the attainment of omniscience (when he awakens as a fully self-awakened buddha), I was fully paid my wages (*nibbiṭṭha, nibbisa*), like one discharged from the king’s service, that is to say, thus, debt-free, I live in the joy of the supramundane samadhi of the state of omniscience.”¹³⁰

7-8/5 The presence of *nibbiṭṭhena* in **25b** suggests that this word, or some part of the verb *nibbisati*, was in **24b**, and a pun is intended on the two meanings of the verb. The Commentary explains the figurative usage of *nibbiṭṭhena* as follows: the Buddha’s gaining of omniscience (awakening) “is like one in royal service who has been discharged from service” (*nibbiṭṭha, nibbiso raja, bhato viya*, SnA 1:38,27-30).

Norman suggests that *nibbiṭṭha* has two meanings: (1) “earnings” and (2) “expiation (of a wrong done).”¹³¹ However, the second sense does not fit any context here, and is not attested in Cone’s *Dictionary of Pali* (DP), which gives only these two senses of *nibbiṭṭha* (1) “(what is) paid; paid off; earned” (Sn 25); (2) “married” (Sadd 364,21). These two senses may well provide the bases for a pun in the Buddha’s reply in the lost verse.¹³²

§§9-10 (Sn 26-27)

9-10/1 *idha*. Sn 26-27 are quite straightforward—they are opposites of one another. The Commentary explains *idha* in **26c**: “‘Here,’ that is, in our cattle compound” (*idha mayam go, maṇḍale*, SnA 1:39,16-17), and in **27c**: “‘Here,’ that is, in our teaching” (*idha amhākaṃ sāsane*, SnA 1:39,20). This shows that the word *idha* should be in both verses. The PTS and Siamese manuscripts, however, read *ca* instead of *idha*—which suggests a scribal confusion between letters or syllables (*akkhara*) *ca* and *dha*, as happened often enough in the scribal tradition.¹³³

9-10/2 The 5 kinds of cattle. In **Sn 26**, Dhaniya lists **the 5 categories of cattle**—heifers (young cows) (*vasā*), suckling calves or milch cows (*dhenupā*),¹³⁴ cows in calf (*go, dharaṇī*), breeding cows (*paveṇī*) and the head bull (*usabha*)—which the Commentary explains as follows:

Therein, *vasā* are the older, untamed calves. *Dhenupā* are young calves still drinking milk or cows that give milk. *Go, dharaṇiyo paveṇiyo* are calving cows along with the mature oxen. *Usabho*

¹²⁹ On monastics not being hirelings, see **Kasi Bhāra, dvāja S** (Sn 1.4 = S 480), SD 37.8 (1.4.3); **Right livelihood**, SD 37.8 (1.4.3).

¹³⁰ *Ahaṃ hi dīpaṅkarato yāva bodhi tāva sabbaññuta, ñāṇassa bhatako ahoṣim, sabbaññuta-p, patto pana nibbiṭṭha, nibbiso raja, bhato viya ten’eva nibbiṭṭhena sabbaññu, bhāvena lok’uttara, samādhi, sukkena ca jīvāmi* (SnA 1:38,25-30). The parentheses are nn I have supplied.

¹³¹ Norman 1987-88:14 & Tha:N 141 f n78.

¹³² Norman suggests that *nibbiṭṭha* has two meanings: (1) “earnings” and (2) “expiation (of a wrong done)” (1987-88:14 & Tha:N 141 f n78). However, the second sense does not fit any context here, and is not attested in DP.

¹³³ On the alternation between *ca* and *dha*, see Tha:N 169 f n237; Thī:N 57 n7.

¹³⁴ Comy mentions both as alternatives (see below, SnA 1:39 @ 9-10/3).

gavampati: Early in the morning it is fed and bathed with the five-fingered hand, garlanded, and dispatched, “Go, dear, bring the cows down the cow-track, guarding and leading them to pasture!” Thus dispatched, it leads the cows, bringing those off the track back on track, keeping them on track, guarding against lions or tigers—truly, a lordly bull, lord of the herd.¹³⁵ (SnA 1:39)

9-10/3 Solution. The Commentary then explains the Buddha’s use of the same **5 categories** in a metaphorical sense in his reply:

In this teaching, cattle are counted as **untamed and old** (*vasā*), like obsessive actions (*pariyuṭṭhāna*).¹³⁶

Suckling calves (*dhenupā*) are counted together with young calves or milch cows still trickling (with milk), like the latent tendencies (*anusaya*).¹³⁷

Calving cows (*go, dharaṇī*) are counted as relinking in the womb, like meritorious, demeritorious and unperturbable intention (*puññāpuññāneñjābhisaṅkhāra, cetanā*).¹³⁸

The mature oxen (*paveṇī*) are counted as bonded with wanting, wanting and craving (*taṇhā*).

The bull (*usabha*), the head of the herd, is counted as lordly, going first, the chief, like formation-consciousness (*abhisaṅkhāra, viññāṇa*).¹³⁹ (SnA 1:39,20-28)¹⁴⁰

9-10/4 The Kassaka Sutta. The solution to the problem, however, is probably simpler than it seems. In **the Kassaka Sutta** (S 4.19), Māra appears as a ploughman while the Buddha is giving a teaching. To distract the Buddha’s audience, he feigns to ask the Buddha if he has seen his lost oxen. The Buddha replies that he has nothing to do with oxen. Māra then declares that the sense-faculties and their objects belong to him. The Buddha retorts that where there are neither senses nor sense-objects, there is *no place for Māra*.¹⁴¹

Here, clearly, cattle are an imagery for the 6 senses and their objects—that is, the “**all**” (*sabba*) of our existence: see **the Sabba Sutta** (S 35.23), SD 7.1. This “all” refers to the “world of formations” (*saṅkhāra, loka*),¹⁴² the world which we create for ourselves at the instigation of Māra, who wants us to remain and prosper in it for his benefit at our expense.¹⁴³

¹³⁵ *Tattha vasā’ti adamita, vuddha, vacchakā. Dhenupā’ti dhenum pivantā taruṇa, vacchakā khirā, dāyikā vā gāvo. Go, dharaṇiyo paveṇiyo’ti vapa-p, pattā balivaddehi saddhim methuna, patthana, gāvo [Be methuna, saṅṭhāna, gāvo]. Usabho pi gavampatīti yo pi so gopālakehi pāto eva nahāpetvā bhojetvā pañc’āṅgulaṃ datvā mālaṃ bandhitvā, “ehi tāta gāvo gocaraṃ pāpetvā rakkhitvā ānehīti pesiyati, evaṃ pesito ca gāvo agocaraṃ pariharitvā gocare cāretvā siha, vyaggh’ādi, bhayā parittāyitvā āneti, tathā, rūpo usabho pi gavampati. (SnA 1:39,8-16)*

¹³⁶ On *pariyuṭṭhāna*, see SD 10.16 (1.6.5.5).

¹³⁷ On the latent tendencies, see **Anusaya**, SD 31.3.

¹³⁸ On the 3 kinds of abhisaṅkhāra, see **Parivimamsana S** (S 12.51) SD 11.5.

¹³⁹ This commentarial term—“formation-consciousness” (*abhisaṅkhāra, viññāṇa*) or “accumulation-consciousness” (PED: *abhisaṅkhāra*)—is often used in comys to gloss *bīja*, “(karmic) seed” (eg AA 2:334; SnA 1:257). It is very close to the Yogācāra idea of the *ālaya, vijñāna*, “store-consciousness” or the “8th consciousness” see Waldron, 2003:220 f n27, where he qu Collins, 1982:205-207.

¹⁴⁰ *Idha amhākaṃ sāsane adami’taṭṭhena vuḍḍha’taṭṭhena ca vasā, saṅkhātā pariyuṭṭhānā vā, taruṇa, vacchake sandhāya vasānaṃ mūl’atṭhena khiradāyiniyo sandhāya paggharaṇ’atṭhena vā dhenupā, saṅkhātā anusayā vā, paṭi-sandhi, gabbha, dharaṇ’atṭhena go, dharaṇi, saṅkhātā puññāpuññāneñjābhisaṅkhāra, cetanā vā, saṃyoga, patthan’atṭhena paveṇi, saṅkhātā patthana, taṇhā vā, ādhipacc’atṭhena pubbaṇ, gam’atṭhena seṭṭh’atṭhena ca gavam, pati, usabha, saṅkhātāṃ abhisaṅkhāra, viññāṇaṃ vā (SnA 1:39,20-28). My thanks for Bh Ariyajoti for his assistance in this translation (email 19 March 2017). On the key terms relating to cows (SnA 1:39,8-17), see above here [9-10/2].*

¹⁴¹ S 4.19/1:114,26-116,13 (SD 43.9).

¹⁴² On the 3 kinds of world (*loka*), see SD **Viññāṇa-ṭ, ṭhiti**, SD 23.14; SD 29.6a (5.2); SD 29.6b (7.2).

¹⁴³ On Māra as lording over the worlds, see **Māra, dheyya S** (It 3.1.10), SD 50.8.

9-10/5 The exchange between **Sn 26 and 27** makes it clear that there “cows” (*gavo*) means “senses.” This is noted by the Pali grammarians, and Aggavaṃsa states: “Or, ‘cows’ are the faculties that is the eye and so on” (*gāvo vā cakkh’ādin’indriyāni*, Sadd 241,20-21) and “Here, ‘pasture’ means where the faculties that is the eye, etc, move around” (*gāvo cakkh’ādin’indriyāni caranti etthāti go,caro*, Sadd 241,18). Based on this, we can safely conclude that the Buddha has appropriately taken the 5 categories of cattle as referring to the 5 senses.¹⁴⁴

§§11-12 (Sn 28-29)

11-12 The contrast between the herdsman sinking a **tethering post** to bind his cows, and the Buddha *breaking* the bonds which bind him to rebirth is clear, and needs little comment. The Commentary says: “**Are sunk**’ (*nikhātā*) alludes to that fact that the smaller ones, trampling the ground, pushes it inwards; the bigger ones, after digging into it, just stand there” (*nikhātā’ti ākoṭetvā bhūmiṃ pavesitā khuddakā, mahantā khaṇitvā ṭhapitā*, SnA 1:40,6-7).

§§13 (Sn 30)

The Commentary states that **Sn 30** “was spoken by the Council elders” (*ten’āhu saṅgīti,kārā*, SnA 1:42,3-4) [comy 1-2/8]. This implies that the sutta reciters (*bhāṇaka*) did not believe that it was an original part of the sutta. However, it forms a logical conclusion to the “rain” refrain following each verse, inviting the rain to fall.

§§14-15 (Sn 31-32)

14-15/1 These two verses relate how Dhaniya and his wife go to the Buddha as refuge. They express their desire to practise the holy life (*brahma,cariya*) under the Buddha (*brahma,cariyaṃ sugate carāma-se*)¹⁴⁵ [Sn 32b]. This climax presumably marks the end of the original Sutta. [comy 16-17].

This implies that **the rain**—the metaphorical rain which the Buddha repeatedly states—has finally come. Apparently, the council elders thought that it was necessary to insert this verse to highlight the change that has come about, and to dramatize the Sutta’s climax: the conversion of Dhaniya and his wife (SnA 1:46,7-8).

14-15/2 The Commentary explains that *sugate*, “under the Sugata,” means “in the Sugata’s presence ... meaning nearby ...” (*sugate’ti sugatassa santike ... samīpa,aṭṭhe*. SnA 1:43,17-21). The Commentary adds that at the end of the teaching, they both renounce the world and live in Jetavana, and become arhats (SnA 1:46,7-9). In doing so, they happily escape the certain death in the flood-waters that appear in their area the day after their meeting with the Buddha [2.1.2]. More important than even that, they now follow the Buddha’s teaching and attain the highest, arhathood.

¹⁴⁴ This metaphor of the 5 senses is also found outside of Buddhism. The Sadda,nīti, eg, quotes from a late Skt source. SED, sv *go*, gives the meaning, “an organ of sense,” as a quote from Bhagavata Purāṇa (8th-10th cent). A mediaeval Jain text refers to the 5 *balidda* (Skt *balivarda*) of the senses: Hiralal Jain, *Pāhudadoh, Amraoti*, 1933, verse 44, and the French tr C Caillat, *Journal Asiatique* 1976:63-95.

¹⁴⁵ The ending *-āmase* seems to represent a blend of the Vedic active ending *-āmasi* with the middle form *-āmahe*. See Norman 1987-88:15 n2.

§§16-17 (Sn 33-34)

16-17/1 Sn 33 is spoken by **Māra**, while **Sn 34** is the Buddha's response and the final word to the whole Sutta. The two verses exist independently elsewhere, in **the Nandati Sutta** (S 1.2.2), **the Nandana Sutta** (S 4.1.8) and **the Mahāvastu** (Mvst 3.417 + 418) [Sn 33 n]. They were probably added because they, too, have a punning exchange of words, based on the two meanings of *upadhi*: as acquisitions (things which we amass) and as the love and affection for such thing—either way, they are the basis for suffering and rebirth [3.2.2].

16-17/2 N A Jayawickrama thinks that these two verses are later interpolations, partly because they occur elsewhere, and partly because the Sutta seems complete with **Sn 32** (1950 2:88).

16-17/3 The last two verses (**Sn 33-34**) were added, clearly as an afterthought, in a post-Buddha ambience where materialism was rife, and continues to be so. **The Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16), for example, records the old Subhadda actually expressing relief at the Buddha's death, complaining that the Buddha was fussy with monastic rules, and that "now we can do what we like, and not do what we do not like!"¹⁴⁶

This is the kind of predilection that Māra encourages so that we monastics live just like worldlings, and worldlings continue just the way they are—embroiled in the world. This way, they are all under Māra's power and bidding. **Sn 33** is Māra's terse reminder to what lies salient in the worldling's mind—the need for acquisition, for amassing things. The Buddha's closing words (**Sn 34**) set things right again, so that even today, as long as we keep to the Buddha word, we are able to rise to the high ground where the noble path lies before the flood-waters bring devastation.

170316 170321 170613

¹⁴⁶ D 16,6.20/2:162 (SD 9).