

# 18

## (Nibbidā) Dhamma,kathika Sutta

The (Revulsion) Discourse on the Dharma Speaker | S 12.16

Theme: The one true purpose of teaching Dharma

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

### 1 Sutta teachings

**1.1 The (Nibbidā) Dhamma,kathika Sutta** (S 12.16) is a record of the Buddha’s reply and instruction to a question by “a certain monk” (*aññatara bhikkhu*) [§2] regarding what is a “Dharma-speaker” (*dhamma,kathika*). The Buddha’s instruction here combines three important teachings into a smooth and interesting flow of Dharma for our reflection and practice.

The 3 teachings of the Sutta are:

- (1) the 3 good truths (*saddhamma*); [1.2]
- (2) the 12 links of dependent arising (*paṭicca,samuppāda*); [1.3] and
- (3) the “revulsion” (*nibbidā*) formula. [1.4]

The set of the 3 good truths and the *nibbidā formula* form the constants running through all the twelve main sections, one each for the 12 links, which are the variables in the form of a conditional chain of causes and effects.

**1.2 THE 3 GOOD TRUTHS.** In the **(Nibbidā) Dhamma,kathika Sutta** (S 12.16), we probably find the roots of the commentarial teaching of the 3 “good truths” (*saddhamma*), namely, the true teaching as theory (*pariyatti saddhamma*), as practice (*paṭipatti saddhamma*) and as realization (*paṭivedha saddhamma*).<sup>1</sup> This triad of theory, practice and realization is a constant structure for each of the 12 sections, each dealing consecutively with the 12 links.

We further see the 3 good truths operating as the “3 phases or cycles” in terms of the 4 noble truths. **The 3 phases** (*ti,parivaṭṭa*) are: (1) the knowledge of each truth (*sacca,ñāṇa*), (2) the knowledge of the task to be done regarding each truth (*kicca,ñāṇa*), and (3) the knowledge of the accomplishment of these tasks (*kata,ñāṇa*). In other words, the noble truths are presented in terms of theory (a theoretical understanding), practice (a direct experience), and realization (a full and liberating understanding). The relationship is tabulated here, as follows:

( <i>sacca,ñāṇa</i> )	the true teaching as <u>theory</u> (textual learning),	<i>pariyatti saddhamma</i>
( <i>kicca,ñāṇa</i> )	the true teaching as <u>practice</u> (moral virtue and mental training/meditation), and	<i>paṭipatti saddhamma</i>
( <i>kata,ñāṇa</i> )	the true teaching as <u>realization</u> (wisdom).	<i>paṭivedha saddhamma</i>
	(VA 225; AA 5.33; cf Nm 143 where the first two are listed)	

In simple terms, the 3 “good truths” refer to the 3 levels of full learning, that is, the stages of theory, practice and realization. First, we generally master a subject or topic *theoretically* by listening to a teacher or informant, by reading or other means. This is at best a second-hand learning, but forms a useful starting-pointing to open up our minds to a bigger picture of things.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> VA 225; AA 5.33; cf Nm 143 where the first two are listed.

<sup>2</sup> See SD 1.1 (5) & SD 40a.4 (6.2).

### 1.3 DEPENDENT ARISING

**1.3.1 The 12 links of dependent arising** is the main thread running through all the 12 main sections, unifying them into a single teaching. This is a reverse dependent arising formula,<sup>3</sup> beginning with “decay-and-death” (*jarā, maraṇa*)—which is a short form (synecdoche) for the fuller traditional link of “decay-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain and despair” (*jarā, maraṇam soka, parideva, dukkham, domanass’upāyasā*), and ending with “ignorance” (*avijjā*). The better known “direct” formula begins with “ignorance” and ends with “this whole mass of suffering.”<sup>4</sup>

**1.3.2** Interestingly, here we are given the impression that arhathood can arise in the practitioner “on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation” towards any of the 12 links [§6, §9, §12 etc]. However, it should be understood that a full understanding on the nature of all the 12 links, how they operate as a whole, and in parts, are the bases for the breakthrough, which may occur, in the arhat’s case, with any of the chain being broken.

However, it is also possible to see that, at the moment of awakening, all the chains simply fall apart, liberating the practitioner by way of attaining arhathood. The 12 links are listed here separately merely as a teaching device for us, the unawakened.<sup>5</sup>

### 1.4 THE NIBBIDĀ FORMULA

**1.4.1** The *nibbidā* formula is another unifying thread that runs through all the 12 cycles of the dependent arising formula, occurring thrice in each cycle, once for each of the three paragraphs of the 3 good truths [1.3]. The *nibbidā* formula [1.4.2], in fact, serves to authenticate or empower the proper practice in every case of the 3 truths to realize their goal leading up to awakening. In other words,

- (1) one who speaks proficiently of the Dharma in terms of the *nibbidā* formula is truly a Dharma-speaker (*dhamma, kathika*);
- (2) one who “practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma” (*dhammānudhamma-p, paṭipanna*), that is, in understanding the *nibbidā* formula [§§5, 8, 11 etc], is truly practising the Dharma as a “learner” (*sekha*), says the Commentary (SA 2:34);<sup>6</sup> and
- (3) one who, on account of fully understanding the *nibbidā* formula, is liberated through non-clinging (*anupādā, vimutto hoti*), is truly one who has attained arhathood (*diṭṭha, dhamma, nibbāna-p, patta*) (SA 2:34).

### 1.4.2 The full and the shorter formulas

**1.4.2.1** The term *nibbidā* forms the first of a well known phrase describing the spiritual turning-point to sainthood: *nibbidā* (revulsion), *virāga* (dispassion), *vimutti* (liberation) and *nibbāna* (nirvana), as in the full *nibbidā* formula goes thus:

<sup>3</sup> For terms relating to dependent conditionality (ie, deoendent arising and dependent ending), see SD 5.16 (0.1).

<sup>4</sup> See (**Paṭicca, samuppāda**) **Desanā S** (S 12.1), SD 83.1, and **Kaccā(ya)na, gotta S** (S 12.15), SD 6.13; also SD 5.16 (4).

<sup>5</sup> For a detailed study, see **Dependent arising**, SD 5.16, esp (18).

<sup>6</sup> Comy explains *dhammānupaṭipnanno* as “one practising the way that is in accordance with the nature of the nirvāna-element” (*lokuttarassa nibbāna, dhammassa anudhamma, bhūtaṃ paṭipadaṃ paṭipanno*, SA 2:34). This means that the practitioner is a “learner” (*sekha*). ie, one who has attained to the supramundane path, short of being an arhat. See a similar sutta in the context (that of *nibbidā*) towards the 5 aggregates: **Anudhamma S 1** (S 22.39/3:41), SD 93.9, & Comy (SA 2:267) [2.2].

it conduces [leads] to **utter revulsion**, to dispassion, to ending (of suffering), to peace [still-ing], to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to nirvana.

*etaṃ ekanta,nibbidāya virāgāya nirodhāya upasamāya abhismāya abhiññāya sambodhāya nibbānāya samvattanti.* (D 1:189; S 5:82, 179, 255, 361; A 3:83, 4:143, 5:216)<sup>7</sup>

**1.4.2.2** A shorter version of this statement is found in **the (Sabb’upādāna) Pariññā Sutta** (S 35.60), which also shows the context of the formula:

Seeing thus, the learned noble disciple is revulsed (*nibbindati*) towards the eye, towards forms, towards eye-consciousness, towards eye-contact, towards feeling...[and towards each of the other 5 sense-bases, sense-objects, sense-consciousnesses, sense-contacts, and respective feelings]...

**Being revulsed (at reality) (*nibbindati*), he becomes dispassionate.**

Through dispassion (*virāga*), (his mind) is liberated.

With liberation (*vimokkha*),<sup>8</sup> he understands, “Clinging has been fully understood by me.”

(S 35.60/4:33), SD 6.17

The Pali of the highlighted (bold) line simply reads *nibbindati virajjati*. The word ***nibbindati***, “revulsed (at)” is the present participle of ***nibbindati***, “he is revulsed at, is wearied with, is disgusted with, disenchanted with, disillusioned, indifferent towards, averse to,” and is usually applied to the awakening to true reality.<sup>9</sup> Other suttas with this stock passage include **the Sabb’upādāna Pariññā Sutta** (S 35.60)<sup>10</sup> and **the Sabb’upādāna Pariyādāna Sutta 1** (S 35.61).<sup>11</sup>

**1.4.2.3** The Sutta Commentary explains the key sentences (actually only a single word each) as follows:

**“He is revulsed” (*nibbindati*):** He is discontented (*ukkaṇṭhati*) (with worldly reality). This revulsion marks the culmination of insight, *just before* the attainment of the supramundane path.

**“His is dispassionate” (*virajjati*)** marks the attainment of the supramundane path (*magga*), when the mental fetters<sup>12</sup> are finally eliminated.

**“It [the mind] is liberated” (*vimuttati*)** refers to the attainment of the supramundane fruit-ion (*phala*). (MA 2:114; Vism 21.43-44/650 f)

<sup>7</sup> These are the 7 criteria for the true Dharma-Vinaya (\**dhamma,vinaya.jānana,lakkhaṇa*). For other connections, see PED: *nibbidā*.

<sup>8</sup> “Liberation,” *vimokkha*. On the usual application of this term here, in **(Sabb’upādāna) Pariññā S** (S 35-60), see SD 7.4 n.

<sup>9</sup> Skt & BHS *nirvid* or *nirveda*. On the tr “revulsed at, revulsion, etc.” see SD 20.1 (6.2).

<sup>10</sup> S 35.60/4:33 f.

<sup>11</sup> S 35.61/4:34. See also SD 20.1 (6.1).

<sup>12</sup> **Mental fetters** (*samyojanā*). There are 10 of them: (1) self-identity view (*sakkāya,diṭṭhi*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rules and rituals (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*), (4) sensual lust (*kāma,rāga*), (5) repulsion (*paṭigha*), (6) greed for form existence (*rūpa,rāga*), (7) greed for formless existence (*arūpa,rāga*), (8) conceit (*māna*), (9) restlessness (*uddhacca*), (10) ignorance (*avijjā*) (S 5:61, A 5:13, Vbh 377). In some places, no. 5 (*paṭigha*) is replaced by ill will (*vyāpāda*). The first 5 are the lower fetters (*oram,bhāgiya*) that bind one to the “lower” realm, ie the sense world, and the rest, the higher fetters (*uddham,bhāgiya*) that bind one to the “higher” realms, ie the form and formless worlds.

The arhat's subsequent review knowledge (*paccavekkhaṇa, ñāṇa*) is shown by the phrase “there comes the knowledge” and “he understands: ‘Birth is destroyed ... ’,” in the following paragraph.<sup>13</sup>

## 2 Sutta highlights

### 2.1 MEANING OF *BHIKKHU* IN THE (NIBBIDĀ) DHAMMA, KATHIKA SUTTA

**2.1.1** In the Sutta, there are only the Buddha and his interlocutor, “a certain monk” (*aññatara bhikkhu*). As a rule, the Buddha would always address the assembly (“Bhikshus!” *bhikkhave*)<sup>14</sup> or individual monk (“Bhikshu!” *bhikkhu*).<sup>15</sup> However, in all the Sutta phrases or sentences where *bhikkhu* appears, it does so only once where, as a rule, its vocative form is also present [eg §§3, 4, 5, etc]. In other words, the word *bhikkhu* or *bhikkhave* (pl) appears with their respective vocative forms.

**2.1.2** In such sentences—where *bhikkhu* appears only once—we can either translate *bhikkhu* as “the monk,” referring to the interlocutor, or as the vocative, “Bhikshu!” If we choose to render *bhikkhu* as “a/the monk,” then we have this sentence: “If a monk teaches the Dharma for the sake of revulsion ... , then he is fit to be called ‘a monk who is a Dharma speaker’” [cf §4, 7, 10 etc]. Note that there is no vocative here, and it does not sound right. Perhaps this might be an exception to the rule, but, in the early suttas, it is highly uncharacteristic of the Buddha and the early saints not to address their audience directly.

#### 2.1.3 *Bhikkhu* as a vocative

**2.1.3.1** Alternatively, we can (and should) render *bhikkhu* in such a sentence [2.1.1] as the vocative, “Bhikshu!” Characteristically, the Buddha or a teacher will address his audience by name,<sup>16</sup> or *bhikkhu* (sg) or *bhikkhave* (pl), and so on,<sup>17</sup> as means of drawing the audience’s attention, or highlighting an important point, or mark a new development or idea, and so forth. Indeed, we can say that such a vocative is also a gesture of respect for the Dharma (*dhamma, gāravatā*),<sup>18</sup> that is, when the Dharma is spoken, we should give all our attention to it.

**2.1.3.2** If we choose to render *bhikkhu* as a vocative in such a sentence [2.1.1], then we must add an impersonal third person, “one” or the like, which is, in fact, inherent in such a syntax. Then, we have the sentence as follows: “**If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma for the sake of revulsion ... , then he is fit to be called ‘a monk who is a Dharma speaker’**” [§4, 7, 10 etc], as done here.

A significant fact, then, presents itself before us. Although the Buddha addresses a particular monk (*bhikkhu*), or monks (*bhikkhave*) in other contexts, we should understand that this is a *historical* circum-

<sup>13</sup> See SD 20.1 Appendix for a list of such suttas. For a detailed study, see *Nibbidā*, SD 20.1.

<sup>14</sup> Some refs to *bhikkhu* (2 voc): M 1:110-116, 449, 3:15-18; S 1:8-11, 2:50, 60-62; Sn p126.

<sup>15</sup> Some refs to *bhikkhave* (2 voc pl): D 1:45; M 2:223-225, 3:83-87). With *bhikkhu*, 3 nom sg): D 2:294-299, 3:58, 77 f; M 1:4-6, 3:89-103; S 1:188, 2:44; A 1:8, 53-55; It 9.

<sup>16</sup> Audience addressed by name, eg, Cunda (D 3:131); Sāriputta (M 1:71), Moggallāna (M 1:218 f, *avuso* ~), Ānanda (M 1:398-400; S 1:88, 112).

<sup>17</sup> Also with vocatives such as *āvuso*, “friend, avuso” (D 3:132; M 1:28, 468-472) and *bhante*, “(venerable) sir, bhante”) (M 1:131-144; S 1:150-152), by those with respect or faith; or *bho*, “sir,” mostly by brahmins (M 1:486, *bho gotama*). Also *brahmaṇa*, “brahmin!” (M 1:204, 3:2 f); *gaha, pati*, “household!” (M 1:349-352), *mahārāja*, “maharajah; great king!” (S 1:69).

<sup>18</sup> On respect for the Dharma, see (Upagantabba) Kula S (A 9.17/4:387 f) + SD 37.11 (3).

stance: the teachings are addressed to the monk or monks, but this is only a synecdoche (short form) for all the members of the fourfold assembly, that is, the monks, nuns, laymen and laywomen, especially *the unawakened*, that is, including those of us today who are desirous of understanding and living the Dharma as a method of personal development and spiritual awakening.

Here, we have Buddhaghosa's endorsement, when he comments on the usage of "Bhikshus!" (*bhikkhave*) in the **Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta** (M 10), where "a monk" (*bhikkhu*) may refer to either an ordained monastic (that is, a renunciant) or anyone who is meditating in accordance to the Dharma.<sup>19</sup> After all, the higher purpose of being a Buddhist is to practise the Dharma "in accordance with the Dharma" (*dhammā-nupatti*) [§5, 8 etc], and not merely becoming a monk or a nun.

**2.1.3.3** Furthermore, it might be helpfully said that the purpose of practising the Dharma is that of renunciation (*nekkhamma*), that is, the letting go of attachment to the world and giving up of negative emotions. The most effective way to do this is to renounce as a monastic (*pabbajita*) or recluse (*samaṇa*), that is, as a monk (*bhikkhu*) or a nun (*bhikkhuni*), those who keep to the monastic code and right livelihood, and have no intimacy with the world and have no economic security (including no dealings with money, property and material gains). A monastic's avowed purpose is to work singlemindedly for awakening in this life itself.

A lay person who meditates, especially cultivating mindfulness based on inner calm and clarity, is to that extent, for that duration, a renunciant. However, when a lay person attains any of the stages of sainthood, that is, streamwinning and so on, he is, in fact, a member of the noble community (*ariya, saṅgha*), which includes monastics who have attained the path to awakening, too.

**2.2 RELATED SUTTAS.** The (**Nibbidā**) **Dhamma,kathika Sutta** should be studied with a set of 4 short but connected suttas, all related to the *nibbidā* formula in the context of the 5 aggregates (*pañca-k,khandha*), namely:

		<u>revulsion (<i>nibiddā</i>) shown towards</u>	
<b>Anudhamma Sutta 1</b>	S 22.39/3:41	the 5 aggregates <sup>20</sup>	SD 93.9
<b>Anudhamma Sutta 2</b>	S 22.40/3:41	the impermanence of the 5 aggregates	SD 93.10
<b>Anudhamma Sutta 3</b>	S 22.41/3:41	the unsatisfactoriness of the 5 aggregates	SD 93.11
<b>Anudhamma Sutta 4</b>	S 22.42/3:41	the non-self of the 5 aggregates	SD 93.12

— — —

## (Nibbidā) Dhamma,kathika Sutta

### The (Revulsion) Discourse on the Dharma-speaker

S 12.16

[After §7, the numbering does not follow that of the PTS]

- 1 At Sāvattḥī.
- 2 Then a certain monk approached the Blessed One, saluted him and then sat down at one side.

<sup>19</sup> DA 3:756; MA 1:241; VbhA 216 f; cf SnA 251; see **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M10), SD 13.1 (3.1.1). On meditation as renunciation, see **Hāliddakāni S 1** (S 22.3/3:9-12), SD 10.12; **Bhāvanā**, SD 15.1 (14.7); **Sexuality**, SD 31.7 (1.6.2).

<sup>20</sup> Its Comy (SA 2:267) explains the key terms in a similar way; similarly at DA 2:578; AA 2:203, 3:289. [1.4.1].

3 Sitting thus at one side, the monk said this to the Blessed One:

“‘Dharma-speaker, Dharma-speaker,’ bhante, it is said. How, indeed, bhante, is one a **Dharma-speaker?**”

### (1) Decay-and-death (*jarā, maraṇa*)

- 4 “If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma<sup>21</sup>  
for the sake of revulsion,<sup>22</sup> of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **decay-and-death,**  
one is fit<sup>23</sup> to be called ‘a monk who is a *Dharma-speaker*.’<sup>24</sup>
- 5 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma<sup>25</sup>  
for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **decay-and-death,**  
one is fit to be called  
‘a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma*.’<sup>26</sup>
- 6 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging<sup>27</sup>  
on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **decay-and-death,**  
one is fit to be called  
‘a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana*.’<sup>28</sup>

### (2) Birth (*jāti*)

- 7 If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma  
for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **birth,**  
one is fit to be called ‘a monk who is a *Dharma-speaker*.’
- 8 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma  
for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **birth,**  
one is fit to be called  
‘a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma*.’
- 9 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging  
on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **birth,**  
one is fit to be called  
‘a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana*.’

<sup>21</sup> *Jarā, maraṇassa ce bhikkhu ... dhammaṃ deseti.*

<sup>22</sup> *Nibbidāya virāgāya nirodhāya:* see Intro (1.4).

<sup>23</sup> “Fit,” *alaṃ*. As in (**Aṭṭhaka**) **Alaṃ S** (A 8.62), *alaṃ* is used in the sense of being “enough, sufficient, capable, fit(ting),” all by itself; more fully, it means “sufficiently capable”: see A 8.62 + SD 46.5 (4.0.2).

<sup>24</sup> The whole para: *Jarā, maraṇassa ce bhikkhu nibbidāya virāgāya nirodhāya dhammaṃ deseti, “dhamma, kathiko bhikkhūti alaṃ vacanāya.* On “how to teach the Dharma,” see (**Dhamma, desaka**) **Udāyī S** (A 5.159), SD 46.1.

<sup>25</sup> *Jarā, maraṇassa ce bhikkhu ... dhammānudhamma-p, paṭipanno.* Here *dhammānudhamma* is tr as “with the Dharma” rather than “to the Dharma,” to highlight that we *become* Dharma when we practise it in this way; we are not separate from the Dharma, as suggested by “to the Dharma.”

<sup>26</sup> The whole para: *Jarā, maraṇassa ce bhikkhu nibbidāya virāgāya nirodhāya paṭipanno hoti, “dhammānudhamma-p, paṭipanno bhikkhūti alaṃ vacanāya.*

<sup>27</sup> *Anupādā, vimutto hoti:* see Intro (1.4.1).

<sup>28</sup> *Jarā, maraṇassa ce bhikkhu nibbidāya virāgāya nirodhāya anupādā, vimutto hoti, “diṭṭha, dhamma, nibbāna-p, patto bhikkhūti alaṃ vacanāya.*

(3) Existence (*bhava*)

- 10 If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding one is fit to be called 'a monk who is a *Dharma-speaker*.' **existence,**
- 11 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding one is fit to be called 'a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma*.' *existence,*
- 12 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding one is fit to be called 'a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana*.' *existence,*

(4) Clinging (*upādāna*)

- 13 If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding one is fit to be called 'a monk who is a *Dharma-speaker*.' **clinging,**
- 14 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding one is fit to be called 'a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma*.' *clinging,*
- 15 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding one is fit to be called 'a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana*.' *clinging,*

(5) Craving (*tanhā*)

- 16 If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding one is fit to be called 'a monk who is a *Dharma-speaker*.' **craving,**
- 17 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding one is fit to be called 'a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma*.' *craving,*
- 18 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding one is fit to be called 'a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana*.' *craving,*

(6) Feeling (*vedanā*)

- 19 If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding one is fit to be called 'a monk who is a *Dharma-speaker*.' **feeling,**



- 20 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *feeling,*  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.*'
- 21 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *feeling,*  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana.*'

### (7) Contact (*phassa*)

- 22 If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **contact,**  
one is fit to be called 'a monk who is *a Dharma-speaker.*'
- 23 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *contact,*  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.*'
- 24 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *contact,*  
one is fit to be called 'a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana.*'

### (8) The 6 sense-bases (*saḷāyatana*)

- 25 If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **the 6 sense-bases,**  
one is fit to be called 'a monk who is *a Dharma-speaker.*'
- 26 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *the 6 sense-bases,*  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.*'
- 27 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *the 6 sense-bases,*  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana.*'

### (9) Name-and-form (*nāma,rūpa*)

- 28 If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **name-and-form**  
one is fit to be called 'a monk who is *a Dharma-speaker.*'
- 29 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *name-and-form,*  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.*'



- 30 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging  
on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *name-and-form*,  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana*.'

### (10) Consciousness (*viññāna*)

- 31 "If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma  
for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **consciousness**,  
one is fit to be called 'a monk who is *a Dharma-speaker*.'
- 32 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma  
for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *consciousness*,  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma*.'
- 33 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging  
on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *consciousness*,  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana*.'

### (11) Decay (*saṅkhārā*)

- 34 If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma  
for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **formations**,  
one is fit to be called 'a monk who is *a Dharma-speaker*.'
- 35 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma  
for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *formations*,  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma*.'
- 36 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging  
on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *formations*,  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana*.'

### (12) Ignorance (*avijjā*)

- 37 If, bhikshu, one teaches the Dharma  
for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding **ignorance**,  
one is fit to be called 'a monk who is *a Dharma-speaker*.'
- 38 If, bhikshu, one practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma  
for the sake of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *ignorance*,  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *practises the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma*.'
- 39 If, bhikshu, one is liberated through non-clinging  
on account of revulsion, of dispassion, of cessation, regarding *ignorance*,  
one is fit to be called  
'a monk who *has here and now attained nirvana*.'