Dhamma,dinna Sutta
The Discourse to Dhamma,dinna | S 55.53
Theme: Spiritual training for busy lay followers
Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

1 Dhamma,dinna

1.1 Apparently, we hear of this Dhamma,dinna only here in the Dhamma,dinna Sutta (S 55.53). Except for this Sutta and its commentary, he is not mentioned anywhere else.

The other occurrence of the name is in the feminine gender, that is, the nun Dhamma,dinnā, who is the foremost of those nuns who teach the Dharma (A 1:25). The Cūḷa Vedalla Sutta (M 44) is a record of the questions that her erstwhile husband, Visākha, asks her.1

1.2 The Commentary says that Dhamma.dinna is one of 7 lay disciples who each has a following of 500.2 They are, like him, all lay disciples of the Buddha. Other lay disciples with such a following are the lady Visākhā,3 the houselord Ugga,4 the houselord Citta,5 Hatthaka Āḷavaka,6 the houselord Cūḷa Anātha,piṇḍika7 and Mahā Anātha,piṇḍika the houselord.8 (SA 3:291)

Apparently, there are other lay disciples with a following of 500 lay disciples outside of the Saṁyutta Commentary list. The Sutta Nipāta Commentary mentions Dhammika, a Sāvatthī layman whose followers are all non-returners (SnA 1:367).9 The Dhammapada Commentary on Dh 227-230, however, mentions the lay disciple Atula, too, as having a following of 500 lay disciples (DhA 17.7/3:325).

1 M 44 (SD 40a.9).
2 It should be noted that “500” (pañca,sata) here is prob only a figure of speech meaning “many,” ie, a few hundred at least.
3 The lady Visākhā (AA 1:405; DhA 3:59; J 5:11, she and her following are said to be streamwinners). Further see Satta Jājila S (S 3.11/1:3:11n) + SD 14.11 (1).
4 Ugga the houselord (of Vesālī), said to be the foremost of those who give pleasant gifts (A 5.44/1:25). He is said to be a streamwinner (AA 1:394). Further see (Vesālikā) Ugga S (A 8.21), SD 70.3 & The layman and dhyana, SD 8.5 (11).
5 Citta the houselord. At AA 1:388 his 500 followers are said to be “noble disciples” (ariya,sāvaka); also mentioned at DhA 2:79 f. He is said to have “a learner’s analytic insight” (sekha,paṭisambhidā, Vism 14.27/442; VbhA 388), ie, supreme intelligence of a saint, short of an arhat.
6 Hatthaka Āḷavaka (SA 1:337; SnA 1:240). Further see (Hatthaka) Āḷavaka S (A 3.34), SD 4.8.
7 Cūḷa Anātha,piṇḍika, often mentioned alongside (Mahā) Anātha,piṇḍika (DA 3:910; DhA 1:339, 3:145; J 1:148, 2:287). He is mentioned at Vism 12.74/391, whose comy says he is the younger brother of Anātha,piṇḍika (VismṬ 391). He is mentioned alone at AA 1:126; at DhA 3:210, where he is said to be a non-returner and endowed with great psychic power, also at DhA 3:219. Otherwise, he is not mentioned in the suttas.
8 Mahā Anātha,piṇḍika, ie, Sudatta, to distinguish him from (DhA 3:145; J 1:148). He is often mentioned alongside Cūḷa Anātha,piṇḍika (DA 3:910; DhA 1:339, 3:145; J 1:148, 2:287). At J 2:287, he is simply called Anātha,piṇḍika along with Cūḷa Anātha,piṇḍika (see above). Further see Anātha,piṇḍik’ovāda S (M 143) + SD 23.9.
9 Sn 2.14/376-404. Dhammika is also said to have “a learner’s analytic insight” (sekha,paṭisambhidā, Vism 14.27/442; VbhA 388). On the 4 analytic insights, see SD 28.4 (4).
2 Sutta summary and highlights

2.1 SUTTA SUMMARY

2.1.1 When Dhamma,dinna and his following of 500 lay disciples approach the Buddha for a teaching [§§1-2], he advises them to examine and reflect on suttas containing profound teachings, relating to emptiness (suññata), a reference for nirvana [§3]. Dhamma,dinna, however, protests that they are busy laymen who indulge in sensual pleasures, and as such would be neither willing nor able to study or reflect on the profound suttas [§4].

2.1.2 The Buddha then advised Dhamma,dinna and his following to cultivate wise faith in the 3 jewels and be truly morally upright [§5]. Dhamma,dinna says that he and his followers are accomplished in these qualities [§6]. The Buddha then congratulates them, declaring that they have declared themselves to have attained streamwinning [§7].

2.2 LATITUDE FOR THE LAITY. The Veḷu,dvāreyya Sutta (S 55.7) is an example of the Buddha giving Dharma teaching that suits the laity who lead busy family lives, enjoying sensual pleasures, making use of money and owning things, whose afterlife wish is merely to be reborn in a happy rebirth or a heavenly world. The Buddha calls his teaching for the people of Veḷu,dvāra, ”a personal Dharma teaching for self-application” (attūpanāyika dhamma,pariyāya), a teaching dedicated to personal development by self-effort without any appeal to external agency.

This “Dharma teaching for self-application” is a teaching that one, having applied to oneself, should apply to others (S Porāṇa Tiṅkā). It comprises the first 7 of the 10 courses of wholesome action, each practised in 3 ways: by observing them oneself, by exhorting others to observe them, and by praising such actions (S:B 2000:1955 n328).

This “personal teaching” evidently refers to a spiritual lifestyle conducive to the attainment of streamwinning. We again see this same theme of streamwinning for the laity in the Dhamma,dinna Sutta, where Dhamma,dinna and his following are all streamwinners, albeit they prefer not to go into the more profound teachings at this point [3.1.2].

3 Related suttas and translating difficulties

3.1 THE ANĀTHA,PIṆḌIҚ’OVĀDA SUTTA

3.1.1 The Anātha,piṇḍik’ovāda Sutta (M 143) is a record of a profound teaching that Anātha,piṇḍika receives on his deathbed. Sāriputta, the visiting monk, instructs Anātha,piṇḍika on not clinging to the sense-faculties, and their respective sense-objects, sense-consciousnesses, contacts, feelings, and the elements, and to the formless bases, to the world, and to sense-pleasures. Anātha,piṇḍika is deeply impressed and requests that such teachings should be given to the laity, too [3.1].

From this, we must surmise that profound teachings (like those given to Anātha,piṇḍika here) are, till then, only given to monastics. The laity are presumably only taught the gradual teaching (ānupubbī-kathā), and when they are ready, the 4 noble truths. This interesting episode should throw some light on the Dhamma,dinna Sutta, especially where it reports Dhamma,dinna’s protests when the Buddha

10 Comy alludes to Khajjaniya S (S 22.79,31-37/3:90 f) (SA 3:291). See §3.2 + nn.
11 S 55.7,4/5:353 @ SD 1.5.
12 Anātha,piṇḍik’ovāda S (M 143) + SD 23.9 (3.2): Profound teachings given to the laity.
13 SD 21.6 esp (1)’ SD 46.1 (4.1); SD 30.8 (3.4.2): Skillful means of speech.

http://dharmafarer.org
proposes that they “take up and dwell in suttas [discourses] spoken by the Tathagata that are profound, deep in meaning, supramundane [beyond the world], relating to emptiness.” [§3.2].

3.1.2 The Buddha’s confidence in our spiritual potential. Hence, it is wrong to say here [§§1-3] that the Buddha has deviated from his usual “gradual teaching” to the laity, and that he imposes upon them to study or practise profound teachings found in the suttas. Indeed, here, we see the Buddha as having great confidence in the spiritual potential of Dhamma,dinna and his followers (and in the laity in general), that they are capable of delving into profound teachings if they choose to.

In this case, however, Dhamma,dinna (on behalf of his followers) is not inclined to do so. The laity, in other words, have a choice of what kind of Dharma teachings they would like to study or practise—as long as they do practise. In fact, the Sutta concludes with the Buddha declaring that Dhamma,dinna and his following are indeed practitioners—they have all attained streamwinning [§§5.2-5].

It’s just that at this point, they feel that they are not yet ready for the profound teachings. This is a wonderfully warm insight into the nature of true saints who do not walk the path in a predictable or automated fashion, but still are able to make choices for themselves without compromising their spirituality.

3.2 The Āni Sutta

3.2.1 The Dhamma,dinna Sutta should be carefully studied alongside the Āni Sutta (S 20.7), the crux of which is that monastics should not neglect to at least study, if not master, the “profound” suttas taught by the Buddha and the early saints. It is also a warning against being distracted by worldly works, so that wrong views arise and our spiritual practice is badly affected. The teaching of the Āni Sutta is highlighted in these key passages:

5 When the discourses spoken by the Tathagata, profound, deep in meaning, supramundane, connected with emptiness, are being spoken, they have no desire to listen to them, they do not lend their ears to them, they do not apply their minds to understand them, and they will not think that these teachings should be studied and mastered.

6 But when those discourses that are poetry [worldly writings] composed by poets (and thinkers),

beautiful in word and phrase, composed by outsiders, spoken by their disciples,

---

14 Pace Bodhi’s mildly curious remark that “it is unusual for the Buddha to give such an injunction to householders” (S:8 1959 n366), where see also his n on the “bizarre explanation” given by Comy on Dhamma,dinna S.

15 S 20.7/2:266 f @ SD 11.13.

16 “Profound,” gambhira, ie by way of its texts (pāli, vāsena) like Salla S (Sn 3.8) or Sallekha S (M 8) (SA 2:229).


18 “Supramundane,” lok’uttara, ie pointing to the supramundane goal (SA 2:229).

19 “Connected with emptiness,” suññatā, paññasiyuttā, ie explaining only the nature of beings as empty, as in the Saṅkhita Sānyuttaya [untraced, prob Asaṅkhata Sānyuttaya] (SA 2:229). See §7n.

20 “Thinkers [poets and scholars],” kavi, usu tr as “poets,” but here has a general connotation or synecdoche for worldly thinkers and writers, incl academic scholars. Kavi S (A 4.230) speaks of 4 kinds of kavi: one who writes or composes a work after listening (cintū, kavi), one who composes a work after thinking (pāthā, kavi), one who writes relying on the meanings of things (attha, kavi), and one who uses his own creative ideas, like the elder Vangīsa (pāthabhimā, kavi) (A 4.230/2:230; AA 3:211; DA 1:95). See Intro.

21 “Outsiders,” baḥirakū, ie those outside the Dharma-Vinaya (SA 2:229).
are being spoken, they will desire to listen to them, they will lend their ears to them,
they will apply their minds to understand them, and
they will think that these teachings should be studied and mastered.

6.2 Thus, bhikshus, the discourses spoken by the Tathagata, profound, deep in meaning,
supramundane, connected with emptiness, would disappear. (§ 20.7,5-6), SD 11.13

3.2.2 As such, says the Sutta, monastics should carefully study the profound teachings, so that they
would not be led astray and that the Dharma would not disappear. In our own times, professional
scholars (some of whom are not Buddhists) are carefully studying the Buddha’s suttas and teachings,
using their own secular methods and academic standards. Such works may, of course, be helpful if they
are unbiased and sensitive to the Buddhist teachings and spirit, and not merely done for the sake of
scholarship and financial success.

Where the scholars or writers are not Buddhist, or are not well rooted in the Dharma, their work
would not be helpful for a better understanding of the Buddha’s teaching, much less for personal and
spiritual development. This would be like merely reading a book on music or on cooking, without
actually playing music or loving music, or without actually cooking or tasting the food. Such works would
even be detrimental to our openness to Buddhism and understanding of the Dharma, especially where
such works are composed by those who have no love for the Dharma.

3.3 Translating difficulties. Translations, especially of Buddhist texts, are of two kinds, the worldly and
the spiritual. More often, we see the first kind, which may be scholarly or popular in style. Even in
scholarly translations, the tendency is to present them in a way that would attract readers and a market:
they tend to be commercial enterprises (such as translations of the Dhammapada).

The more popular translations, however, often lack a helpful critical apparatus (such as explanatory
notes and references). Often such works tend to be easy glossed writings mostly to promote the vision
or ideas of the “translator” or writer. The bottom line is that such works are realities unto themselves,
and do not really help us to better understand, much less practise the Buddha’s teachings (if that is their
purpose at all). Indeed, some such works even contain wrong views or idiosyncratic ideas that are alien
to early Buddhism.

A “spiritual translation” is more difficult to do, although it can really be a great joy if we have a true
love for the Dharma. Still, translators of Buddhist suttas and texts face a formidable task of not only
correctly restating in English the Pali records we have of the early teachings, but also to present a
translation that retains the efficacy and beauty of the teachings themselves. The translator should not
only understand the word of the teaching, but also its spirit.22

When we translate the word (vyañjana) of a sutta, it helps to think like a scholar, one who is aware
of the nature of Pali and of the translation language and its idiom. Then, we must understand and
express the spirit (attha) of the sutta teaching, so that its meaning and message are clearly brought out.
Where this is impossible—such as in the case of Pali polysemy and the narrowness of the English syntax
or idiom—then we need to apply various skillful means such as the use of amplified translations,23
alternate translations24 and footnotes.

22 See eg Neyv’attha Nit’attha S (A 2.3.5+6/1:60), SD 2.5b.
23 In our SD translations, an “amplified translation” is designated by the use of (round brackets) within the trans-
lation itself, which should be read along with the rest of the text. An example is: “In that case, Dhamma,dinna, you
(all) should train yourself in this way...” [§5].
24 In our SD translations, an “alternate translation” is designated by the words within [parentheses] within the
translation itself. The reader has a free choice of which reading he prefers. If both the main translation and the
alternate translations are read, then, an intervening “or” or some tag will mark the alternative readings.
To be a good translator of the early Buddhist texts, we should not only be good in English, but must also master Pali and have at least some working knowledge of Sanskrit related to Buddhism. Even more vital than this philological dexterity, we need to love the Dharma and practise it, attaining some level of calm and clarity through the meditation as taught in the suttas. Only then perhaps we would be able to unveil the beauty of the letter and reveal the truth of the spirit so that the Dharma can touch and change our lives.

The key to the suttas and the essence of the Dharma is found in the meditation tradition handed down through the centuries, going back to the Buddha’s own times. The rich and liberating perspectives of the Buddha’s teachings can never be fully tasted through the scholarly enterprise that lacks Dharma practice and spirituality. To write a critical study on music and musical works of the masters we must not only know music and the lives of the masters themselves—we must, above all, love music!

---

**Dhamma,dinna Sutta**

The Discourse to Dhamma,dinna

S 55.53

Dhamma,dinna’s request

1. At one time, the Blessed One was staying at the deer park in Isi,patana, outside Benares. [407]
2. Then, the lay disciple Dhamma,dinna, alongside with 500 lay disciples, approached the Blessed One, saluted him, and sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, the lay disciple Dhamma,dinna said this to the Blessed One.

3. “Bhante, may the Blessed One advise us! Bhante, may the Blessed One instruct us, in what is for our good and joy for a long time!”

3.2 “In that case, Dhamma,dinna, you should (all) train yourselves, thus,

‘From time to time, we will take up and dwell in suttas [discourses] spoken by the Tathagata that are profound, deep in meaning, supramundane [beyond the world], relating to emptiness.’

Thus, Dhamma,dinna, you should train yourselves.”

Dhamma,dinna’s protest

4. “But, bhante, we dwell in a home crowded with children; we enjoy Kāśī sandalwood; wear garlands, scents and make-up; we enjoy gold and silver [use jewelry and money].”

---

25 See (1.1).

26 See (1.2).

27 Comy gives these meanings of “profound” and examples: “profound,” like Salla S (Sn 3.8); “deep in meaning,” like Cetanā S (prob S 12.38-40/2:65-67); “supramundane,” like Aṣaṅkhata Saṁyutta S 43); “connected with emptiness,” like Khajjaniya S (S 22.79/3:86-91, SD 17.9 (SA 3:291).


29 “Supramundane,” lok’uttara, ie pointing to the supramundane goal, ie, the path of noble sainthood (SA 2:229).

30 Ye te suttantā tathāgata, bhāsitā gambhirā gambhir’atthā lok’uttarā suññata’paṭisaṁyuttā, te kālena kālaṁ upasampaja viharissāmāti. This para [§3.2] recurs (with contextual variations) in Aṇi S (S 20.7), SD 11.13, closely related to this Sutta [3.1].
It is not easy for us to take up and dwell in these suttas spoken by the Tathagata that are profound, deep in meaning, supramundane [beyond the world], relating to emptiness.

4.2 Teach us, bhante, higher dharma, for we have been established in the 5 training-rules.”

The 4 limbs of a streamwinner

5 “In that case, Dhamma,dinna, you should (all) train yourself in this way:

(1) ‘We shall be accomplished in wise faith in the Buddha, thus:
   “So, too, is he the Blessed One [the Lord]:
   fully self-awakened,
   accomplished in wisdom and conduct,
   well-farer,
   knower of worlds,
   peerless guide of tamable persons,
   teacher of gods and humans,
   awakened,
   blessed.”

(2) We shall be accomplished in wise faith in the Dharma, thus:
   “Well-taught is the true teaching of the Blessed One, to be self-realized,
   timeless,
   for one to ‘come and see,’
   accessible [leading onward],
   to be personally known by the wise.”

31 [Na kho n'etaṁ bhante sukaraṁ] amhehi putta,sambādha,sayanaṁ aijhōvasantehi kāsika,candanaṁ pacca-nubhontehi mālā,gandha,stilepanaṁ dhārayantehi jāta,rūpa,rajataṁ sādiyantehi, This passage beginning with putta,sambādha,sayanaṁ is stock (with variations of syntax): Sandaka S (M 76,8.6+11.5+14.5+17.6/1:515, 516, 517, 518), SD 35.7; Piya,jāti ka S (M 87,28/2:111), SD 84.11 (on “Kāsi sandalwood...unguents”; (Satta) Jaṭila S (S 3.11,7/1:78, 79) = Ossajana S (U 6.2/65, 66), SD 14.11; Veḷu,dvāreyya S (S 55.7,4/5:353), SD 1.5 (in separate sentences); Dhamma,dinna S (S 55.53,4/5:407), SD 46.4; Dāru,kammika S (A 6.59,3/3:391), SD 80.4; Dīgha,jānu S (A 8.54,1/4:281), SD 5.10; Kvu 167, 168×4, 268; Miln 243,348.

32 Tesaṁ no bhante bhagavā amhākaṁ pañcasu sikkhā,padesu ṭhitānaṁ uttari,dhammaṁ desetûti.

33 Sotāpannassa agīni (D 33,1.11(14)/3:227), ie the qualities of one who has attained streamwinning. For a shorter statement on the limbs of a streamwinner, see Ogadha S (S 55.2/5:343 f). For the streamwinner’s practice, see (Agata,phala) Mahānāma S (A 6.40/3:284-288), SD 15.3. On the faith of the streamwinner, see Gethin 2001: 116. Cf the limbs for streamwinning (sotāpatti-y-āṅgī): (Sotāpatti) Phala S (S 55.55/5:410 f; A 5.246/2:245), SD 2.2(4.1). See Pañca Vera Bhaya S 1 (S 12.41,4-14), SD 3.3(4.2) + nn.

34 Alt tr: “For the following reasons, too, he is the Blessed One [the Lord]...” On the meaning of iti pi so, see CPD: iti: ...kitti-saddo abbhuggato: “pi so bhagavā: arahāṁ sammā-sambuddho...” (“for the following reasons, too, he is a bhagavā: because he is arahāṁ...”), V 3:11,13 = D 1:49,27 = M 2:133,22 = S 1:219,31 = A 3:312,8, qu Vism 198,4 and MahvṬ 26,11 (VA 112,4 = DA 146,5 = Vism 198,8: so bhagavā “pi arahāṁ " pi sammāsambuddho ...imānā ca imānā ca kāraṇen ti vuttaṁ hoti). Translating iti pi so this way explains the double occurrence of Bhagavā. See L S Cousins, “Review of Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha,” in Journal of Buddhist Ethics 4, 1997: 165. The Skt parallel to this opening reads: iti hi sa bhagavāṁ tathāgato, but tathāgato here is missing from the Pali version. See Dhaj‘agga S (S 11.3), SD 15.5 (2).
(3) We shall be accomplished in wise faith in the Sangha, thus:

“Of good conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
of upright conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
of right conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
of proper conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples.

These 4 pairs of persons, the 8 individuals, are the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples: worthy of offerings, worthy of hospitality, worthy of gifts, worthy of salutation with the lotus-palms, an incomparable field of merit for the world.”

(4) We shall be accomplished in moral virtue dear to the noble ones, unbroken, untorn, unmixed, spotless, liberating, praised by the wise, un tarnished, giving rise to concentration.

5.2 Thus, Dhamma,dinna, you should train yourselves.”

Streamwinners

5.2 “Bhante, as regards these 4 limbs of streamwinning taught by the Blessed One—these states are found in us; we live committed to these states.”

6 (1) We, bhante, are accomplished in wise faith in the Buddha, thus:

‘So, too, is he the Blessed One: for, he is an arhat, fully self-awakened, accomplished in wisdom and conduct, well-farer, knower of worlds, peerless guide of tamable persons, teacher of gods and humans, [408] awakened, blessed.’

35 “Moral virtue dear to the noble ones,” ariya,kantāni silāni. The noble one’s moral virtue is explained at Vism 7.101-106/221 f. Comy says that the noble ones do not violate the 5 precepts; hence, this virtue is dear to them (SA 2:74).

36 Akhaṇḍehi acchiddehi asabalehi akammāsehi bhujissehi viññūpasāṭhehi aparāmaṭṭhehi samādhi, saṅvattanakehi. Found in 7 of the 10 suttas in Veḷu,dvāra Vagga (S 55.1-5, 7-8, ie except nos 6, 9 ad 10); Cundi Rāja,kumāri S (A 5.32/3:36), SD 66.4; [Agata,phala] Mahānāma S (A 6.10/3:286), SD 15.3. Details at Vism 1.143-161/51-58, 7.101-106/221 f. The noble ones do not break any of the 5 precepts even when they are reborn into a new existence; hence, these virtues are dear to them. See also Virtue ethics, SD 18.11 (2.2).

37 These 2 lines: Yān’imāni bhante bhagavatā cattāri sot’āpatti-y-aṅgāni desitāni, saṅvijjant’ete dhammā amhe-su, maṇḍa ca tesu dhammesu sandissāma. Here, the 4 “limbs of streamwinning” (qualities of those who have attained streamwinning) are called sot’āpatti-y-aṅgā, but at [Sotāpatti-y-Aṅga Sutta (S 55.50/5:401), they refer to the 4 “factors (or limbs) for streamwinning,” qualities conducive to the attaining of streamwinning: see SD 3.3(4.1). Here, we see a case for the non-technicality of the early suttas.
(2) We, bhante, are accomplished in wise faith in the Dharma, thus:
‘Well-taught is the true teaching of the Blessed One,
to be self-realized,
timeless,
for one to “come and see,”
accessible [leading onward],
to be personally known by the wise.’

(3) We, bhante, are accomplished in wise faith in the Sangha, thus:
‘Of good conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
of upright conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
of right conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
of proper conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples.
These 4 pairs of persons, the 8 individuals, are the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples:
worthy of offerings,
worthy of hospitality,
worthy of gifts,
worthy of salutation with the lotus-palms,
an incomparable field of merit for the world.’

(4) We, bhante, are accomplished in moral virtue dear to the noble ones,
unbroken, untorn, unmixed, spotless, liberating, praised by the wise, untarnished,
giving rise to concentration.”

7 “This is a gain for you, Dhamma,dinna! This is a great gain for you, Dhamma,dinna!
You have declared the fruits of streamwinning!\(^{38}\)

— evaṁ —

140526 140527 140610r 150702 180524

\(^{38}\) Lābhā vo dhammadinna, suladdham vo dhammadinna, sotāpattiphalam tumhehi vyākatanti.