

10

The Ceto,khila Suttas

Discourses on Mental Barrenness

Theme: The 5 mental barrennesses, the 5 mental bondages and related teachings

Translated by Piya Tan ©2017

1 Contents

SUTTA VERSIONS. This chapter on **the Ceto,khila Suttas** deals with 5 suttas connected with **the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta** (M 16, SD 32.14) [2.1]. These are shorter or abridged versions of the fuller **M 16**. A study of these shorter discourses on mental barrenness (*ceto,khila*) and mental bondage (*cetaso vinibandha*) gives us an idea of the evolution of the full **(Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta** (M 16).

SD 51.10a	(Pañcaka) Ceto,khila Sutta	A 5.205/3:248	the 5 mental barrennesses
SD 51.10b	(Navaka) Ceto,khila Sutta	A 9.71/4:460	the 5 mental barrennesses + satipatthana ¹
SD 51.10c	(Pañcaka) Vinibandha Sutta	A 5.206/3:249	the 5 mental bondages
SD 51.10d	(Navaka) Vinibandha Sutta	A 9.72/4:461	the 5 mental bondages and satipatthana
SD 51.10e	(Dasaka) Ceto,khila Sutta	A 10.14/5:17	the 5 bondages and their cure

For the sutta notes and commentaries, please refer to them *ad loca* in the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta translation and its notes (SD 32.14).

2 The key teachings of the (Dasaka) Ceto,khila Sutta (A 10.14), SD 51.10e

2.1 THE 5 MENTAL BARRENNESSES (*ceto,khila*)

2.1.1 (1) Doubt in the teacher (*satthā*) [§3]

The teacher is the Buddha, our *one and only historical teacher*, as taught in **the Pavāraṇā Sutta** (S 8.7), SD 49.11. “**Doubt in the teacher**” means not understanding and rejecting the Buddha’s death or parinirvana (final passing away),² and imagining him to be “existing” in some form—this is the basis for such dogmas as doceticism. From such wrong view, we are likely to fall for beliefs in other kinds of Buddhas, of eternal life and omnipotence—which are effectively theistic notions.³

2.1.2 (2) Doubt in the Dharma (*dhamma*) [§4]

2.1.2.1 The Dharma refers to both *the truth and the teaching*. **To doubt the Dharma** is to reject the sutta teachings on true reality and nirvana. Philosophical bantering and poetic imaginations may help us understand how our minds work, but they should not be taken as defining the Dharma, certainly not as “ultimate truths.” The truth (*sacca,dhamma*) is experiential, to be tasted by oneself, that is, its purpose is self-liberation.

¹ This Sutta and **(Navaka) Vinibandha S** (A 9.71+72) from the Navaka Nipāta list the set of 5 as their Pañcaka Nipāta counterparts, but adds that we should practise the 4 satipatthana to eradicate all mental barrenness and mental bondage (thus each sutta has a total of 9 items).

² On the significance of the Buddha’s death, see SD 49.8b (1.0.5.2 (12)) + (12.3.1.1) + (17.2.2.4).

³ On the fact that there is only 1 Buddha in a world-system in each dispensation (*sāsana*), see **Bahu,dhātuka S** (M 115,14), SD 29.1a.

2.1.2.2 When we properly **study** the Dharma, we not only *see* its **truth** (the vision of true reality), we also *feel* its **beauty** (we are at least temporarily free of negative emotions and wrong view). Studying the suttas is both a wholesome Dhamma practice, along with listening to it⁴ and discussing it.⁵ Hence, it is vital that we understand how to study the Dharma, as taught, for example, in a set of teachings called **the Sammatta Niyāma Suttas 1-3** (A 5.151-153), SD 4.2-4.

2.1.2.3 The teaching (*desanā, dhamma*) is conventional, a skillful adaptation of the truth (*sacca*) for a worldly audience to appreciate and to be inspired to live a moral life as a basis for cultivating the mind for liberating wisdom. Not all of us are naturally skillful in teaching the Dharma. **The (Aṭṭhaka) Alarṇ Sutta** (A 8.62) lists the various qualities we should have or should cultivate that are sufficient (*alarṇ*) for us to teach the Dharma; otherwise, there are other roles we can play in promoting the Dharma.⁶

To be effective Dharma speakers and teachers, there are certain qualities we must have or need to cultivate. These qualities are fully listed in such discourses as **the Kathā, vatthu Sutta** (A 3.67) and **the (Catukka) Dhamma, kathika Sutta** (A 4.139).⁷

2.1.3 (3) Doubt in the sangha (*saṅgha*) [§5]

2.1.3.1 This point deals with doubt both in the noble sangha and in the monastic sangha. **Doubt in the noble sangha** means rejecting the sutta teaching—such as in **the Sambuddha Sutta** (S 22.58), SD 49.10—that the Buddha’s awakening and arhathood are the same (the same liberation). This, then, degrades into rejecting the 4 kinds of saints: the streamwinner, the once-returner, the non-returner and the arhat.

2.1.3.2 Doubt in the monastic sangha means not seeing monastic training as the attaining of path of awakening in this life itself. We have strong doubt in our ability to attain arhathood in this life, and yet we do not even work to attain streamwinning in this life itself, as stated in **the (Anicca) Cakkhu Sutta** (S 25.1), SD 16.7, and the other 9 suttas in the same chapter, **the Okkanta Saṃyutta** (S 25).

2.1.4 (4) Doubt in the training (*sikkhā*)

2.1.4.1 Buddhist training, whether monastic or lay, centres on **the 3 trainings** (*sikkha-t, taya*), that is, the cultivation of moral virtue (*sīla*), of concentration (*samādhi*) and of wisdom (*paññā*). Basically, moral training is the disciplining of our body and speech as a basis for mental cultivation (concentration). Both of them work together as foundations for training in wisdom, that is, insight into true reality so that we live true and happy lives.

2.1.4.2 Doubt in moral virtue means that we, when we are monastics (renunciants), fail to study and understand the Vinaya. If our renunciation is sincere, then we understand and accept the monastic rules as keeping us within the spirit of the monastic community, working together to deepen our renunciation, that is, to give up greed, hate and delusion, so that we approach ever closer to the path of awakening in this life itself.

⁴ *Dhamma-s, savana*. See **Kiṭṭhā, giri S** (M 70,23/1:480), SD 11.1; **Caṅkī S** (M 95,29/2:175), SD 21.15; & see refs in foll n.

⁵ *Dhamma, sākacchā*. See **(Catukka) Kāla S 1** (A 4.146/2:140), SD 41.1, **Catukka) Kāla S 2** (A 4.147/2:140), SD 62.-18; **Maṅgala S** (Khp 5,9/3 = Sn 266); Kvu 615.

⁶ See A 8.62/2:296-299 (SD 46.5).

⁷ Respectively: **A 3.67**/1:197-199 (SD 46.11) & **A 4.139**/2:138 = Pug 4.7/42 (SD 46.10).

As for the laity, the practice of **the 5 precepts** helps us understand that our true values are life, happiness, freedom, truth and wisdom⁸—which the precepts embody. While the monastic life provides a money-free and care-free environment for spiritual development, the lay life celebrates a healthy mind in a healthy body in a wholesome community through **right livelihood**, which is an extension of the precepts and moral virtue into our philosophy of work.

2.1.4.5 To doubt the training is to be swayed by the worldly view that we need to change or “modernize” the monastic rules. **The Anāgata Bhaya Sutta 3** (A 5.79) warns that, on account of such conduct, monastics “will become luxurious, lax, backsliders (*okkamane pubbaṅgamā*, “falling back to prior (lay) states”), not valuing solitude (*paviveke nikkhitta, dhurā*).⁹

Furthermore, for the sake of honours, gains and fame, monastics will become lax and spend their time socializing with the laity and the world. **The Anāgata Bhaya Sutta 4** (A 5.80) grimly warns that such monastics:

Living socializing¹⁰ with nuns, probationers and female novices,¹¹ they will not delight in the holy life, and either will commit some foul deed or return to lay life.

Living and socializing with monastic residents and novices,¹² they will enjoy their various hoarded goods, and mark out their lands and crops.¹³

Bhikshus, be fully awake against these things, and so should you strive to get rid of them.

(A 5.80/3:108-110), SD 1.10 (3.4) = SD 77.18; cf S 16.1/2:194 f; Miln 401)

2.1.4.6 In simple terms, **the monastic life** of a renunciant is about “more and more of less and less.” Properly speaking, the true life of a monastic is a “**Dharma-engaged**” one of living and practising “the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma” (*dhammānudhamma paṭipatti*).¹⁴

Monastics are socially “disengaged” in the sense of having given up “the world” (money, socializing, consumerism, etc) to work for awakening in this life itself, and to be spiritual exemplars to the laity. The Buddha has very good reasons to forbid monks from having anything to do with money and property, whether directly or indirectly—this is what renunciation is about. Once a monastic lets money or wealth into his life, he is likely to break more rules and live a more worldly life, and become a contradiction in term.¹⁵

The lay Buddhist life, on the other hand, is one that is “**socially engaged**” in the spirit of the 5 precept and right livelihood. We (the laity) should be engaged in social work and educational enterprises. In

⁸ On the 5 precepts, see **Dīgha, jānu S** (A 8.54,13), SD 5.10; **Veḷu, dvāreyya S** (S 55.7), SD 1.5 (2); **Sīlānusati**, SD 15.11 (2.2); SD 21.6 (1.2); SD 37.8 (2.2). On the 5 values, see SD 1.5 (2) Table; SD 51.11 (2.2.3.4).

⁹ See SD 1.10 (3.2); A 5.78/3:105 (SD 77.16).

¹⁰ *Saṃsaṭṭhā viharissanti*, “they will live socializing ...,” connoting sexual liaisons, too: see **Ratha, vinīta S** (M 24,2.2/1:146), SD 28.3 n.

¹¹ *Bhikkhunī, sikkhamānā, samaṇ’uddesehi*.

¹² *Ārāmika, samaṇ’uddesehi*.

¹³ “Will enjoy ... their lands and crops,” *oḷārikam pi nimittam karissanti paṭhaviyā pi haritagge pi*. Buddhaghosa describes “property-owning recluse” (*samaṇa, kuṭumbika* or *~kuṭimbika*), a “monk” who earned a living as a farmer (SA 3:32 f). Of Sri Lanka, **Mahāvamsa** records: “In the villages owned by the Sangha the morality of the monks consisted only in supporting their wives and children” (Mahv 77.3 f, cited by Carrithers 1979:298). See Hinüber 2002:82 & Boucher 2008:65.

¹⁴ See **(Sotāpatti-y) Aṅga S** (S 55.50), SD 70.1(1); **(Sotāpatti) Phala S** (S 55.55,2 (4)) + SD 3.3(4.1) (2(4)); **(Aṭṭhaka) Alaṃ S** (A 8.62,2) (4), SD 46.5; **Dharmānudhamma Paṭipanna S** (It 3.4.7/81 f), SD 73.13.

¹⁵ See **Money and monastics**, SD 4.19-23.

other words, the lay life centres on the proper and beneficial management of wealth to support the monastic sangha and for the benefit of the many.

2.1.5 (5) Lacking in fellowship [§6]

2.1.5.1 The Sutta speaks of the 5th “mental barrenness” as follows: “**Being angry and displeased with fellow brahmacharis, his heart troubled, unfeeling**” (*Sa, brahma, cārisu kupito anattamano āhata, citto khila, jāto*). Such a lapse in spiritual fellowship may arise from something as mundane as discontent or jealousy over the distribution of offerings (almsfood, robes, lodging or medicine and medical care), or disagreement over interpretation of monastic rules or divergence in the interpretation of texts or teachings.

2.1.5.2 Traditionally, monastics will respect the teachings and views of their teachers and elders, or even of other monastics, when they differ in opinion regarding these. When the abbot or leader has his own way with the interpretation of the Dhamma-Vinaya, the senior monastics (those immediately below him in seniority) would, as a rule, respect him by keeping silence. The younger monastics, too, are likely to do the same. However, those who strongly disagree with such a state of affairs have the option of moving on to another monastery or centre. When the abbot passes on, the new abbot would, as a rule, set things right again where necessary.

2.1.5.3 As a rule, monastics of 5 rains or less have to observe “**tutelage**” or “**dependence**” (*nissaya*)¹⁶ on a suitable teacher. This is a vital nurturing period so that the monastic is able to full leave behind all his lay habits and fit rightly into the monastic life-style. Those monastics who renege this vital formative period will somehow show their weaknesses and failures in due course. **The Sugata Vinaya Sutta** (A 4.160) records the Buddha as warning us (the 2nd of 4 factors), thus:

Furthermore, bhikshus, the monks are difficult to speak to; possessed of qualities that make them difficult to speak to;¹⁷ impatient; when taught, they learn without respect [for the teaching and the teacher].¹⁸

Bhikshus, this is the 2nd thing that conduces to confusion regarding the true teaching, to its destruction. (A 4.160/2:147-149), SD 1.10 (3.5)¹⁹

¹⁶ SD 40a.8 (4.2.2.3).

¹⁷ “Possessed of qualities that make them difficult to speak to.” **Anumāna S** (M 15) gives a list of such qualities: (1) one has evil desires and is overcome by them; (2) one lauds oneself and disparages others; (3) one is angry and overcome by it; (4) one is angry, and resentful as a result; (5) one is angry, and stubborn as a result; (6) one is angry and utters words bordering on anger; (7) one is reproved, but resists the reprover; (8) one is reproved, but denigrates the reprover; (9) one is reproved, but counter-reproves the reprover; (10) one is reproved, but beats about the bush; (11) one is reproved, but fails to account for one’s conduct; (12) one is contemptuous and insolent; (13) one is envious and avaricious; (14) one is fraudulent and deceitful; (15) one is obstinate and arrogant; (16) one sticks stubbornly to one’s views (M 15/1:95).

¹⁸ As at **Ovāda S 1** (S 16.6/2:204) where the same complaint is made by Mahā Kassapa to the Buddha.

¹⁹ On the nature of monastic fellowship, see **Dhamma, cetiya S** (M 89,11), SD 64.10; **(Anuruddha) Upakkilesa S** (M 128,11), SD 5.18.

2.2 THE 5 MENTAL BONDAGES (*cetaso vinibandha*)²⁰

2.2.1 (1) “A monk is *not* rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for sensuality” (*bhikkhu kāme avīta, rāgo hoti avigata-c, chando avigata, pemo avigata, pipāso avigata, pariḷāho avigata, taṇho*) [§8]

The fact is that the monastic fails in his training when he does not work to overcome **sensuality** (*kāme*, plural). The term, sensuality (*kāma*), refers to both the *subjective* aspect as “sensual desire,”²¹ that is, as a mental experience, and the *objective* aspect as “object-based sensuality,” a sensual reaction to the physical sense-objects.²²

In other words, the person here not only reacts with lust towards sense-objects perceived as pleasurable, but also conjures them up **subjectively** in his mind after the fact or conceives such notions and seeks such to satiate such pleasures through his physical senses. In short, a renunciant should not only over sensual reactions to perceivably pleasurable objects, but he should clear his mind of any such notions.

2.2.2 (2) “A monk is *not* rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for his body” (*bhikkhu kāye avīta, rāgo hoti avigata-c, chando avigata, pemo avigata, pipāso avigata, pariḷāho avigata, taṇho*) [§9]

While the 1st mental bondage refers to sensuality (*kāme*) out there or as mental objects, this mental bondage arises from **attachment to his own body** (*attano kāye*, MA 2:69,6). Technically (that is, in terms of textual references), such an attachment is rooted in and driven by the 3 intoxications (*mada*), that is, the intoxication with youth, with health and with life. Such a person will be obsessed with personal looks, way of dressing, avoidance of pain and discomfort, and seeking pleasure related to the body.²³

2.2.3 (3) “A monk is *not* rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for form” (*bhikkhu rūpe avīta, rāgo hoti avigata-c, chando avigata, pemo avigata, pipāso avigata, pariḷāho avigata, taṇho*) [§10]

The Commentary explains “**form**” (*rūpa*) here as referring to external forms (*bahiddhā rūpe*), that is, visual objects, especially *the bodies of others* that we lust for or are attached to (MA 2:69). But this is already included in “sensuality” [2.2.1]. Moreover, such an interpretation seems narrow. We should include here attachment to the blissfulness of the form dhyanas. Such bliss, however, is not “external” but personal mental experiences of our meditation.²⁴

2.2.4 (4) “A monk eats and overfills his belly and dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping” (*bhikkhu yāva-d-atthaṃ udarāvadehakaṃ bhuñjitvā seyya, sukhaṃ passa, sukhaṃ middha, sukhaṃ anuyutto viharati*) [§11]

Monastics are often reminded that they take food merely to “keep going” so that they are healthy and energetic enough to practise to attain awakening in this life itself.²⁵ **The Ūmi Bhaya Sutta** (A 4.122), the Buddha warns monastics against the first 4 mental bondages. Using 4 “river” or “water” parables, he

²⁰ Like **Ceto, khila S** (M 16,8-12), **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,2.1(20)/3:238) lists these 5 mental bondages as an alternative set of mental hindrances.

²¹ See SD 32.2 (1.2.2).

²² On letting go of such object-based sensuality, see (**Mahānāma**) **Gilāyana S** (S 55.54,6-9) SD 4.10. On the lack of sensuality in such object in themselves, see **Nibbedhika (Pariyāya) S** (A 6.63,3.4), SD 6.11.

²³ See **Mada S** (A 3.39), SD 42.13; **Sukhumāla S** (A 3.38), SD 1.11 (3.2).

²⁴ On bliss in the form dhyanas, see SD 8.4 (5.1.1.2(6)).

²⁵

warns renunciants of the dangers of “waves” (anger and despair), of “crocodiles” (gluttony), of “whirlpools” (sensual pleasures), and of “river dolphins” (sexual lust). Briefly:

(1) A renunciant should not feel upset when he is taught the decorum of a monastic renunciant, even when his teacher or instructor is younger than him.

(2) A renunciant should learn to cultivate moderation in food—taking less food, avoiding certain kinds of food, and eating only at the right time—unlike before when he was still a lay person.

(3) When a renunciant goes amongst houses on almsround, he should be mindful to avoid seeing lay people frolicking in sensual pleasures and worldly ways, and being enticed by them.

(4) Again, when a renunciant goes amongst houses on almsround, he should be mindful to avoid looking at scantily dressed women, which might arouse lust in him.²⁶

2.2.5 (5) “A monk lives the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas, thus: ‘By this moral virtue [ritual]²⁷ or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!’” (*bhikkhu aññataraṃ deva, nikāyaṃ pañidhāya brahma, cariyāṃ carati, “iminā’haṃ sīlena vā vatena vā tapena vā brahma, cariyena vā devo vā bhavissāmi dev’aññatara vāti*) [§12]

The singular purpose of being a Buddhist, especially a renunciant, is to attain awakening in this life itself. Being reborn in a heavenly state or happy human state is merely a momentary respite of good karma that, when exhausted, only brings one down into the suffering states²⁸—like in a cosmic snakes-and-ladders game.²⁹

When a monastic is not well trained in the Dhamma and lacking proper practice, he is likely to hold on to some old beliefs he had before turning to Buddhism. Not understanding the nature of nirvana, he may still be attached to the misconstrued nature of the bliss of dhyanic existence, and so desire to be reborn in one of those heavenly states.

Similarly, the laity who have been in some way influenced by a dominant theistic religion may continue to cherish theistic notions, and even aspire to be reborn in the heavens, or imagine that some heavenly beings are favouring them, and so on. This is the result of a poor grounding in the Dharma so that he is still shadowed by theistic wrong views.³⁰

2 Related suttas

2.1 THE (MAJJHIMA) CETO,KHILA SUTTA (M 16)

The Ceto,khila Sutta, the “discourse on mental barrenness,” discusses **10 impediments** to spiritual growth and awakening. These 10 impediments are the 5 mental barrennesses (*ceto,khila*) and the 5 mental bondages (*cetaso vinibandha*) [2.2]. It has been translated with notes in **SD 32.14**. Here, we shall examine suttas related to the Ceto,khila Sutta.

2.2 SUTTAS RELATED TO MENTAL BARRENNESS (CETO,KHILA)

In this chapter (SD 51.10), we will examine suttas which are related to the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta specifically and to the topic of “mental barrenness” (*ceto,khila*) and its related doctrine, that of “mental bondage” (*cetaso vinibandha*). In addition to being found in the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta (M 16) and

²⁶ A 4.122 (SD 47.9).

²⁷ On this alt tr, see §12.1 n.

²⁸

²⁹ SD 48.1 (6.3.1.5); SD 50.13 (2.4.3.2).

³⁰ See SD 40b.3 (3.2).

its parallels, the 5 mental barrennesses occur twice as independent discourses in different parts of the Aṅguttara Nikāya, notably each time immediately followed by another discourse that treats the 5 mental bondages. These discourses are as follows:

• (Pañcaka) Ceto,khila Sutta	A 5.205/3:248	the 5 mental barrennesses	[3]
• (Navaka) Ceto,khila Sutta	A 9.71/4:460	the 5 mental barrennesses	[4]
• (Pañcaka) Vinibandha Sutta	A 5.206/3:249	the 5 mental bondages and satipatthana	[5]
• (Navaka) Vinibandha Sutta	A 9.72/4:461	the 5 mental bondages and satipatthana	[6]
• (Dasaka) Ceto,khila Sutta	A 10.14/5:17	the 5 bondages and their cure	[7]
• Saṅgīti Sutta	D 33,2.1(19)/3:237,23	a list of the 5 mental barrennesses	[2.3.1]
• Saṅgīti Sutta	D 32,2.1(20)/3:238,12	a list of the 5 mental bondages	[2.3.2]

Note that the two **Ceto,khila Suttas** (A 5.205 & A 9.71) are followed immediately by the **Vinibandha Sutta** (A 5.206) and the **Cetaso Vinibandha Sutta** (A 9.72), respectively.³¹ This may not be a matter of mere coincidence, but points to an inner connection between these two respective sets of five factors.³²

2.3 THE SAṄGĪTI SUTTA ON BARRENNESS AND BONDAGE

2.3.1 The Saṅgīti Sutta (D 33,2.1(19)): The 5 mental barrennesses

The **Saṅgīti Sutta** (D 33) lists the 5 mental barrennesses (*ceto,khila*) (but only the “unabandoned” series) in its section on “fives or pentads.” The listing is almost identical to that in **the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta** (M 16,3-7) except that here Sāriputta is the instructor who addresses the audience as “avuso” (*avuso*, sg+pl),³³ that is, those monks who are his equals or juniors. The last line of each barrenness passage simply ends with “this is the 1st mental barrenness,” while M 16 reads, “this is thus his 1st mental barrenness that has *not* been abandoned.”

SD 51.10(2.3.1)

Saṅgīti Sutta

The Discourse on Recital | D 33,2.1(19)/3:237 f

Theme: The 5 kinds of mental barrenness

(19) The 5 mental barrennesses.

2 (1) Here, *avuso*, a monk [237] is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in **the teacher** [the Buddha].³⁴

3 Any monk, *avuso*, who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in **the teacher**, his mind does not tend to **ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving**.³⁵

³¹ The lists of mental barrenness and mental bondage—besides what is listed at (2.3.1)—also occur in **(Majjhima) Ceto,khila S** (M 16,3-7/1:101), SD 32.14; **A 5.205/3:248 = 9.71/4:460 = 10.14/5:17; J 388/3:291; Vbh 941/377; Vism 7.59/211.**

³² See SD 50.20 (3.1.2).

³³ *Āvuso* is both sg and pl, ie, an invariant voc.

³⁴ *Idha āvuso bhikkhu satthari kaṅkhati vicikicchati nādhimuccati na sampasīdati*. The underscored occurs at Sn p107,16 (re 2 of the Buddha’s 32 marks); D 1:106,2 (re the Buddha’s 32 marks), D 1:109,5 f (re 2 of the 32 marks); M 1:101,10 = A 4:460,13 = 5:17,25 (in the teacher); M 2:135,8 (re the Buddha’s 32 marks).

³⁵ *Yo so avuso bhikkhu satthari kaṅkhati vicikicchati nādhimuccati na sampasīdati, tassa cittaṃ na namati ātap-pāya anuyogāya sātaccāya padhānāya*. Comy: **Ātappāya** is “for the sake of arousing effort in burning away defile-

4 For one whose mind *does not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the **1st mental barrenness**.³⁶

5 (2) Furthermore, avuso, a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the **Dharma [the teaching and the truth]**.³⁷

6 Any monk, avuso, who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the Dharma, his mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

7 For one whose mind *does not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the **2nd mental barrenness**.

8 (3) Furthermore, avuso, a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the **sangha [the noble sangha and the monastic community]**.³⁸

9 Any monk, avuso, who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the sangha, his mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

10 For one whose mind *does not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the **3rd mental barrenness**.

11 (4) Furthermore, avuso, a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the **training**.³⁹

12 Any monk, avuso, who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the training, his mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

13 For one whose mind *does not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the **4th mental barrenness**.

14 (5) Furthermore, avuso, a monk is **angry and displeased with fellow brahmafarrers [celibate colleagues], his heart troubled, unfeeling [callous]**.⁴⁰

15 Any monk, avuso, who is angry and displeased with fellow brahmafarrers, his heart troubled, unfeeling,⁴¹ his mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

ments" (*kilesa, santāpaka, viriya, karaṇ'atthāya*); *anuyogāya* is "yoked to repetitive effort" (*puna-p, puna, yogaya*); *sātaccāya* is omitted; *padhānāya* is "for the sake of striving" (*padahana'atthāya*) (MA 2:68,19). Comy on **Saṅgīti S** (D 33) adds: *Ātappāya* means "for the sake of generating effort"; *anuyogāya*, "yoked to it over and again"; *sātaccāya*, "continued doing"; *padhānāya*, "for the sake of striving" (*Ātappāyāti viriya, karaṇ'atthāya. Anuyogāyāti puna-p, punaṃ yogāya. Sātaccāyāti satata, kiriyāya. Padhānāyāti padahan'atthāya*, DA 3:1030)

³⁶ (**Majjhima**) **Ceto, khila S** (M 16) here reads: "Thus, for him, this is the 1st mental barrenness that has not been abandoned" (*evam assāyaṃ paṭhamo ceto, khilo appahīno hoti*) (M 16). On having faith in the Buddha, see **Buddh-ānussati**, SD 15.7.

³⁷ Comy says that *dhamma* (Dharma) here is scriptural or theoretical teachings (*pariyatti, dhamma*) and breakthroughs into the paths, fruits and nirvana (*paṭivedha, dhamma*) (MA 2:68): on the 3 good dharmas (*saddhamma*), see **The levels of training**, SD 40a.4 esp (2); **Notion of diṭṭhi**, SD 40a.1 (3.4). The Dharma, it must be added, also refers to the reality discovered by the Buddha and the truth of his teaching, and the Buddha's exhortation towards self-effort. The Dharma as training is found below [§6]. Lack of faith may induce us to turn to some form of external agency for succour and salvation, or see Buddhism as such an agency, as often seen in later Buddhisms.

³⁸ Here, *saṅgha* refers both to the noble community of saints and also to the conventional community of renunciants. In the former, it entails faith in the Vinaya rules and monastic practice; in the latter, it is the aspiration to attain the path in this life itself. On the sangha, see **Saṅghānussati**, SD 15.10a.

³⁹ *Sikkhā*, ie the training in moral virtue (*sīla*), mental concentration (*samādhi*), and liberating wisdom (*paññā*). See n on (2) **Dhamma** [§4]. On the 3 trainings, see **Sīla samādhi paññā**, SD 21.6.

⁴⁰ *Puna ca paraṃ avuso bhikkhu sa, brahmacārīsu kupito hoti anattamano āhata, citto khila, jāto*. From *kupito ...* etc: V 3:163,30 = 4:45,2 = 236,9 = D 3:238,10 = M 1:101,23 = A 3:249,8 = 4:460,22 = 5:18,5; A 3:176,1; DhA 1:309,-13. This is the kind of malicious mind that induces a monk to breach the Vinaya (V 3:163).

16 For one whose mind *does not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the 5th mental barrenness.

— evaṃ —

2.3.2 The Saṅgīti Sutta (D 33,2.1(20)): The 5 mental bondages

The Saṅgīti Sutta (D 33) lists the 5 mental bondages (*cetaso vinibandha*) (but only the “unabandoned” series) in its section on “fives or pentads.” The listing is almost identical to that in the (Majjhima) **Ceto,khila Sutta** (M 16,8-12) except that here Sāriputta is the instructor who addresses the audience as “avuso” (*avuso*), that is, those monks who are his equals or juniors. The last line of each bondage passage simply ends with “this is the 1st mental bondage,” while M 16 reads, “this is thus his 1st mental bondage that he has *not* been abandoned.”

SD 51.10(2.3.2)

Saṅgīti Sutta

The Discourse on the Recital | D 33,2.1(20)/3:238 f

Theme: The 5 kinds of mental bondage

(20) What are the 5 mental bondages?⁴²

2 (1) Here, avuso, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **sensuality**.⁴³

3 For such a monk, avuso, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for sensuality,*

his mind does not tend to ardour [fervent practice], devotion, perseverance, striving.

4 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the 1st mental bondage.⁴⁴

5 (2) Furthermore, avuso, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **his body**.⁴⁵

⁴¹ *Sa, brahma, cārisu kupīto anattamano āhata, citto khila, jāto*: D 3:238,10 = M 1:101,23 = A 3:249,8 = 4:460,22 = 5:18,5; A 3:176,1. A longer stock is *kupīto anattamano anabhiraddho* [“unconciliated, dissatisfied, sulky”] *āhata, citto khila, jāto*: V 3:163,30 (*paṭighena āhataṃ cittaṃ assa*, “his mind troubled by anger,” VA 584,28) = 4:45,2 = 236,19; V 3:255,13, 4:236,9, 238,30. A gloss: *ananvāhata, cetaso’ti* [“unperplexed mind”] *āhata, citto khila, jāto*, DhA 1:309,13; *jarādimhi vyāruddhe āhata, citte satte disvā*, “having seen hostile beings with minds troubled by decay and so on,” SnA 566,30 = NmA 428,7; *duṭṭha, manā ... āhata, cittā* (“a corrupt mind ... troubled heart”), Nm 62,8 (NmA 1:190,15). Opp, *anāhata, citto hoti akhila, jāto*, “an untroubled mind, feeling heart”: *Sammatta, niyāma* S 3 (A 5.153), 2nd of the 5 qualities of one, listening to the Dharma, is able to attain streamwinning (A 5.153/3:176,11), SD 4.4.

⁴² (Majjhima) **Ceto,khila S** (M 16) here reads: *katamāssa pañca cetaso, vinibandhā asamucchinnā honti*, “And what are the 5 mental bondages that have not been cut off?”

⁴³ *Idha avuso bhikkhu kāme avīta, rāgo hoti avigata-c, chando avigata, pemo avigata, pipāso avigata, pariḷāho avigata, taṇho*. Cf (Thīna, middha) **Tissa S** (S 22.84.9), SD 32.12 where this sequence is applied to the 5 aggregates.

⁴⁴ (Majjhima) **Ceto,khila S** (M 16) here reads: *evam assāyaṃ paṭhamo ceto, khilo appahīno hoti*, “This is thus his 1st mental barrenness that has *not* been abandoned,” and so mutatis mutandis for the rest.

⁴⁵ *Puna c’aparam avuso bhikkhu kāye avīta, rāgo hoti avigata-c, chando avigata, pemo avigata, pipāso avigata, pariḷāho avigata, taṇho*. Comy: Here “the body” (*kāye*) refers to his own body (that is, in practice, *our* own body).

6 For such a monk, avuso, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for the body,*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

7 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is **the 2nd mental bondage**.

8 (3) Furthermore, avuso, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **form**.⁴⁶

9 For such a monk, avuso, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for form,*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

10 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is **the 3rd mental bondage**.

11 (4) Furthermore, avuso, **a monk eats and overfills his belly and dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping**.⁴⁷

12 For such a monk, avuso, *who eats and overfills his belly and dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping,*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

13 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is **the 4th mental bondage**.

14 (5) Furthermore, avuso, a monk **lives the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas**, thus: ‘By this moral virtue [ritual]⁴⁸ or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!’⁴⁹

15 For such a monk, avuso, *who lives the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas, thus: ‘By this moral virtue [ritual] or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!’*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

16 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is **the 5th mental bondage**.

— evaṃ —

Foll comy, I take it as locative sg, since it refers to lust and attachment towards our own body (*attano kāye*, MA 2:69,6).

⁴⁶ *Puna c’aparam avuso bhikkhu rūpe avīta,rāgo hoti avigata-c,chando avigata,pemo avigata,pipāso avigata,-pariāho avigata,tanho*. Comy: Here “form” (*rūpa*) refers to external forms (*bahiddhā rūpe*), ie, visual objects, esp the bodies of others that we lust for or are attached to (MA 2:69).

⁴⁷ *Puna ca param avuso bhikkhu yāva-d-attham udarāvadehakaṃ bhuñjitvā seyya,sukham passa,sukham middha,sukham anuyutto viharati*. Comy glosses *middha* as *niddā* (sleep) (MA 2:69): see **Thīna,middha**, SD 32.6 (2.2). **Udarāvadehakaṃ** = *udara*, “belly” + *avadehaka* (*ava*, “down” + absol of *avadihati*, “increases, accumulates,” ie, bloats up). The stock *yāvad-attham ~am bhuñjitvā*: D 3:238,23; M 1:102,3; A 3:222,25, 249,26 4:343,13+ 21, 461,-11, 5:18,23, 20,17; Vbh 378,1; ThaA 1:190,19 ≈ SA 2:107,9 ≈ Vism 33,25 (comys: *~an ti udara,-pūram, tam hi udaram avadehanato ~an ti vuccati*, DA 1031,15); MA 2:69,7 = AA 3:325,27 = VbhA 504,22; *udaram avadihitvā upacinitvā pūretvā*, AA 3:307,18); *~am bhutvā*, Tha 935.

⁴⁸ Considering the mind of such a misguided monk, we would be justified to render *sīla* here more broadly to include “rituals.” On **Pali polysemy**, see SD 1.1 (4.4.5); SD 10.16 (1.3.1-1.3.2).

⁴⁹ *Puna c’aparam avuso bhikkhu aññataram deva,nikāyam pañidhāya brahma,cariyam carati, “iminā’ham sīlena vā vatena vā tapena vā brahma,cariyena vā devo vā bhavissāmi dev’aññataro vā ti*. Comy explains that *deva* means “a mighty deva” (*mahēsakkha,deva*) (incl deva-lords and brahmas) and *dev’aññataro* as “a deva of lesser might” (*appēsakkha,deva*) (ie one of a heavenly host) (MA 2:69,15).

2.3.3 Khila Sutta (S 45.166/5:57), SD 32.14(3.1.2)

A short discourse on the 3 kinds of barrenness: lust, hatred and delusion. The noble eightfold path is to be cultivated (*bhāvetabba*) for the direct knowledge (*abhiññā*) of the barrennesses, for a full understanding (*pariññā*) of them, and for their utter eradication (*parikkhāya*). The 3 barrennesses are different from the 5 barrennesses, and seems to be a later canonical conception than the set of 5 [2.3.1].

— — —

3 (10a) (Pañcaka) Ceto,khila Sutta (A 5.205)

3.1 A discourse on the 5 barrennesses, that is, those arising from doubt in the Buddha, in the Dharma, in the saṅgha, and in the training (*sikkhā*), and from anger against one’s colleagues.

3.2 This is a summary of the first key teaching of **the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta** (M 16) [1.1.1]. This whole discourse is, in fact, found almost verbatim in **the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta** (M 16,3-7), SD 32.14. **M 16**, however, opens with the question, “What are the 5 mental barrennesses that have not been abandoned?” (*Katamā’ssa pañca ceto,khilā appahīnā honti*) and each “mental barrenness” passage closes with the refrain: “This is thus his 1st mental barrenness that has *not* been abandoned,” and so on.

3.3 This discourse is almost identical to the **Saṅgīti Sutta** passage [2.3.1], except that the Buddha is addressing the “monks” here, and there is the closing line [§17].

3.4 This set of 5—on account of its often being mentioned in the suttas—appears to be the earliest of the teachings on *khila*.⁵⁰ The set of 5 barrennesses is also mentioned in the Abhidhamma, in **the Vibhaṅga** (Vbh 377) and also in the Commentaries.⁵¹

SD 51.10a**(Pañcaka) Ceto,khila Sutta**

The (Fives) Discourse on Mental Barrenness | **A 5.205/3:248 f**

Traditional: A 5.5.1.5 = Aṅguttara Nikāya 5, Pañcaka Nipāta 5, Pañcama Paṇṇāsaka 1, Kimila Vagga 5

Theme: The 5 mental barrennesses

- 1 Bhikshus, there are these 5 mental barrennesses. What are the five?
- 2 (1) Here, bhikshus, a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the teacher.⁵²
- 3 Any monk, bhikshus, who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the teacher, his mind does not tend to **ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving**.⁵³
- 4 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is **the 1st mental barrenness**.⁵⁴

⁵⁰ On *khila*, see SD 32.14 (3.1.2).

⁵¹ Vism 7.59/211; J 3:291; SnA 262.

⁵² *Idha āvuso bhikkhu satthari kaṅkhati vicikicchati nādhimuccati na sampasīdati*. For more nn, see (2.3.4) ad loc.

⁵³ *Yo so avuso bhikkhu satthari kaṅkhati vicikicchati nādhimuccati na sampasīdati, tassa cittam na namati ātap-pāya anuyogāya sātaccāya padhānāya*. For more nn, see (2.3.4) ad loc.

5 (2) Furthermore, bhikshus, *a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the Dharma [the teaching and the truth].*⁵⁵

6 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the Dharma*, his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

7 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is **the 2nd mental barrenness**.

8 (3) Furthermore, bhikshus, *a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the sangha [the noble sangha and the monastic community].*⁵⁶

9 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the sangha*, his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

10 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is **the 3rd mental barrenness**.

11 (4) Furthermore, bhikshus, *a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the training.*⁵⁷

12 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the training*, his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

13 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is **the 4th mental barrenness**.

14 (5) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is **angry and displeased with fellow brahmafarrers [celibate colleagues], his heart troubled, unfeeling [callous].**⁵⁸

15 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is angry and displeased with fellow brahmafarrers, his heart troubled, unfeeling,*⁵⁹ his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

16 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is **the 5th mental barrenness**.

17 These, bhikshus, are the 5 mental barrennesses.

— evaṃ —

4 (10b) (Navaka) Ceto,khila Sutta (A 9.71)

The **(Navaka) Ceto,khila Sutta** (A 9.71) combines the essential teachings from two suttas. From **the (Pañcaka) Ceto,khila Sutta** (A 5.205) [3], is taken the section on the 5 barrennesses [§§1-16],⁶⁰ and from

⁵⁴ **(Majjhima) Ceto,khila S** (M 16) here reads: “Thus, for him, this is the 1st mental barrenness that has not been abandoned” (*evam assāyaṃ paṭhamo ceto,khilo appahīno hoti*) (M 16). On having faith in the Buddha, see **Buddh-ānussati**, SD 15.7.

⁵⁵ See n (2.3.4) ad loc.

⁵⁶ See n (2.3.4) ad loc.

⁵⁷ See n (2.3.4) ad loc.

⁵⁸ *Puna ca paraṃ avuso bhikkhu sa, brahmacārīsu kupīto hoti anattamano āhata, citto khila, jāto*. From *kupīto ...* etc: V 3:163,30 = 4:45,2 = 236,9 = D 3:238,10 = M 1:101,23 = A 3:249,8 = 4:460,22 = 5:18,5; A 3:176,1; DhA 1:309,-13. This is the kind of malicious mind that induces a monk to breach the Vinaya (V 3:163).

⁵⁹ *Sa, brahma, cārīsu kupīto anattamano āhata, citto khila, jāto*. See (2.15).

the **Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta** (M 10,3), SD 13.3, is taken the teaching on the 4 satipatthanas [§18]. In order to destroy the 5 barrennesses, we should cultivate the 4 focuses of mindfulness (*satipaṭṭhāna*).

SD 51.10b

(Navaka) Ceto,khila Sutta

The (Nines) Discourse on Mental Barrenness | A 9.71/4:460

Traditional: A 9.2.2.9 = Aṅguttara Nikāya 9, Navaka Nipāta 2, Dutiya Paṇṇāsaka 2, Satipaṭṭhāna Vagga 9

Theme: The 5 mental barrennesses are overcome by the 4 satipatthanas

THE 5 MENTAL BARRENNESSES

1 Bhikshus, there are these 5 mental barrennesses. What are the five?

2 (1) Here, bhikshus, a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in **the teacher**.⁶¹

3 Any monk, bhikshus, who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the teacher, his mind does not tend to **ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving**.⁶²

4 For one whose mind does not tend to *ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is **the 1st mental barrenness**.⁶³

5 (2) Furthermore, bhikshus, *a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith*, in **the Dharma [the teaching and the truth]**.⁶⁴

6 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the Dharma*, his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

7 For one whose mind does not tend to *ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is **the 2nd mental barrenness**.

8 (3) Furthermore, bhikshus, *a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith*, in **the sangha [the noble sangha and the monastic community]**.⁶⁵

9 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the sangha*, his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

10 For one whose mind does not tend to *ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is **the 3rd mental barrenness**.

11 (4) Furthermore, bhikshus, *a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith*, in **the training**.⁶⁶

12 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the training*, his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

⁶⁰ A 5.205 (SD 51.10a), of which, however, §17, “These, bhikshus, are the 5 mental barrennesses,” is omitted here in A 9.71.

⁶¹ *Idha āvuso bhikkhu satthari kaṅkhati vicikicchati nādhimuccati na sampasīdati*. For more nn, see (2.3.4) ad loc.

⁶² *Yo so avuso bhikkhu satthari kaṅkhati vicikicchati nādhimuccati na sampasīdati, tassa cittaṃ na namati ātap-pāya anuyogāya sātaccāya padhānāya*. For more nn, see (2.3.4) ad loc.

⁶³ (Majjhima) **Ceto,khila S** (M 16) here reads: “Thus, for him, this is the 1st mental barrenness that has not been abandoned” (*evam assāyaṃ paṭhamo ceto,khilo appahīno hoti*) (M 16). On having faith in the Buddha, see **Buddh-ānussati**, SD 15.7.

⁶⁴ See n (2.3.4) ad loc.

⁶⁵ See n (2.3.4) ad loc.

⁶⁶ See n (2.3.4) ad loc.

13 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is the **4th mental barrenness**.

14 (5) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is **angry and displeased with fellow brahmafavers [celibate colleagues], his heart troubled, unfeeling [callous]**.⁶⁷

15 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is angry and displeased with fellow brahmafavers, his heart troubled, unfeeling*,⁶⁸ his mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

16 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is the **5th mental barrenness**.

THE 4 FOCUSES OF MINDFULNESS

17 For the abandonment of these 5 mental barrennesses, bhikshus, **the 4 focuses of mindfulness** should be cultivated. What are the four?

18 Here, bhikshus, a monk⁶⁹

- (1) dwells ⁷⁰exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating body in the body,⁷¹
removing⁷² covetousness and displeasure [discontent]⁷³ in regard to the world;⁷⁴
- (2) he dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating feelings in the feelings,
removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world;
- (3) he dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating mind [thoughts] in the mind,
removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world;
- (4) he dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating dharmas in the dharmas,
removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world.

⁶⁷ *Puna ca param avuso bhikkhu sa, brahmacārisu kupito hoti anattamano āhata, citto khila, jāto*. From *kupito* ... etc: V 3:163,30 = 4:45,2 = 236,9 = D 3:238,10 = M 1:101,23 = A 3:249,8 = 4:460,22 = 5:18,5; A 3:176,1; DhA 1:309,-13. This is the kind of malicious mind that induces a monk to breach the Vinaya (V 3:163).

⁶⁸ *Sa, brahma, cārisu kupito anattamano āhata, citto khila, jāto*. Further see n (2.3.4) ad loc.

⁶⁹ Here "a monk" (*bhikkhu*) may refer to either an ordained monastic or anyone who is meditating (here, doing satipatthana) (DA 3:756; MA 1:241; VbhA 216 f; cf SnA 251): see SD 13.1 (3.1.1.5). Note that in **Dhānañjāni S** (M 97) Sāriputta teaches the divine abodes to the layman Dhānañjāni (addressing him directly) (M 97,32.2), SD 4.9, and that in (**Nānā, karaṇa**) **Mettā S 1** (A 4.125), the subject of each of the stock passages on the 4 divine abodes is "a certain person" (*ekacco puggalo*) (A 4.125,2 etc), SD33.9.

On meditation as renunciation, see **Hālidakāni S 1** (S 22.3/3:9-12), SD 10.12; **Bhāvanā**, SD 15.1 (14.7); **Sexuality**, SD 31.7 (1.6.2).

⁷⁰ *Ātāpī sampajāno satimā, vineyya loke abhijjhā, domanassani*. Here we find 4 of the 5 spiritual faculties (*pañc'-indriya*) in action: see SD 13.1 (4.2).

⁷¹ "Contemplating body in the body" (*kāye kāyānupassī*). See SD 13.1 (3.4).

⁷² *Vineyya* can mean "should remove" (as pot, like *vineyya*, Sn 590) or as "having removed" (as ger, like *vinayi-tvā*, Pm 1:244), and both senses apply in Satipatthāna S. U Silananda similarly ends the sentence with "removing covetousness and grief in the world" (1990:177); also 1990:22-25. See SD 13.1 (4.2c) above.

⁷³ "Covetousness and displeasure," *abhijjhā, domanassani*, alt trs: "desire and discontent," "desiring and disliking," or "longing and loathing." Walshe (1995:335 & n632) renders it as "hankering and fretting [in regard to the world]." See SD 13.1 (4.2).

⁷⁴ "World" (*loka*). See SD 13.1 (4.2.4).

19 For the abandonment of these 5 mental barrennesses, bhikshus, these 4 focuses of mindfulness should be cultivated.

— evaṃ —

5 (10c) (Pañcaka) Vinibandha Sutta (A 5.206)

This discourse is almost identical to the second **Saṅgīti Sutta** [2.3.2], except that the Buddha is addressing the “monks” here, where there is also the closing line [§17]. This whole discourse is, in fact, found almost verbatim in **the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta** (M 16,8-12), SD 32.14. M 16, however, opens with the question, “What are the 5 mental bondages that have not been abandoned?” (*Katamā’ssa pañca cetaso,vinibandhanā appahīnā honti*) and each “mental bondage” passage closes with the refrain: “this is thus his 1st mental bondage that has *not* been abandoned,” and so on.

SD 51.10c

(Pañcaka) Cetaso Vinibandha Sutta

The (Fives) Discourse on Mental Bondage | A 5.206/3:249 f

Or (Pañcaka) Vinibandha Sutta The (Fives) Discourse on Bondage

Traditional: A 5.5.1.6 = Aṅguttara Nikāya 5, Pañcaka Nipāta 5, Pañcama Paṇṇāsaka 1, Kimila Vagga 6

Theme: The 5 kinds of mental bondage

- 1 These, bhikshus, are the 5 mental bondages. What are the five?
- 2 (1) Here, bhikshus, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **sensuality**.⁷⁵
- 3 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for sensuality,*
his mind does not tend to ardour [fervent practice], devotion, perseverance, striving.
- 4 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving,
this is **the 1st mental bondage**.⁷⁶
- 5 (2) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **his body**. [§5]
- 6 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for the body,*
his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.
- 7 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving,
this is **the 2nd mental bondage**.
- 8 (3) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **form**.⁷⁷

⁷⁵ *Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu kāmesu* avīta,rāgo hoti avigata-c,chando avigata,pemo avigata,pipāso avigata,pari-lāho avigata,taṇho.* *Kamesu in the same line in **(Majjhima) Ceto,khila S** (M 16,8.2), it reads *kāme*, with the same sense (SD 32.14). Cf **(Thīna,middha) Tissa S** (S 22.84.9), SD 32.12 where this sequence is applied to the 5 aggregates.

⁷⁶ At **(Majjhima) Ceta,khila S** (M 16,8.4), this line reads *evaṃ assāyaṃ paṭhamo ceto,khilo appahīno hoti*, “this is thus his 1st mental bondage that has *not* been cut off,” and so, too, with the rest..

9 For such a monk, bhikkhus, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for form,*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

10 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is **the 3rd mental bondage**.

11 (4) Furthermore, bhikkhus, **a monk eats and overfills his belly and dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping.**⁷⁸

12 For such a monk, bhikkhus, *who eats and overfills his belly and dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping,*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

13 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is **the 4th mental bondage**.

14 (5) Furthermore, bhikkhus, a monk **lives the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas**, thus: ‘By this moral virtue [ritual]⁷⁹ or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!’⁸⁰

15 For such a monk, bhikkhus, *who lives the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas, thus: ‘By this moral virtue [ritual] or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!’*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

16 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is **the 5th mental bondage**.

17 These, bhikkhus, are the 5 mental bondages.

— evaṃ —

⁷⁷ Puna c’aparaṃ, bhikkhave, bhikkhu **rūpe** avīta,rāgo hoti avigata-c,chando avigata,pemo avigata,pipāso avigata,pariāho avigata,taṇho. Comy: Here “form” (rūpa) refers to external forms (bahiddhā rūpe), ie, visual objects, esp the bodies of others that we lust for or are attached to (MA 2:69).

⁷⁸ Puna ca paraṃ bhikkhave bhikkhu yāva-d-atthaṃ udarāvadehakaṃ bhuñjitvā seyya,sukhaṃ passa,sukhaṃ middha,sukhaṃ anuyutto viharati. Comy glosses middha as niddā (sleep) (MA 2:69): see **Thīna,middha**, SD 32.6 (2.2). **Udarāvadehakaṃ** = udara, “belly” + avadehaka (ava, “down” + absol of avadihati, “increases, accumulates,” ie, bloats up). The stock yāvad-atthaṃ ~arṃ bhuñjitvā: D 3:238,23; M 1:102,3; A 3:222,25, 249,26 4:343,13+ 21, 461,11, 5:18,23, 20,17; Vbh 378,1; ThaA 1:190,19 ≈ SA 2:107,9 ≈ Vism 33,25 (comys: ~an ti udara,-pūraṃ, taṃ hi udaraṃ avadehanato ~an ti vuccati, DA 1031,15); MA 2:69,7 = AA 3:325,27 = VbhA 504,22; udaraṃ avadihitvā upacinitvā pūretvā, AA 3:307,18); ~arṃ bhutvā, Tha 935.

⁷⁹ Considering the mind of such a misguided monk, we would be justified to render *sīla* here more broadly to include “rituals.” On Pali polysemy, see SD 1.1 (4.4.5); SD 10.16 (1.3.1-1.3.2).

⁸⁰ Puna c’aparaṃ, bhikkhave, bhikkhu aññataraṃ deva,nikāyaṃ pañidhāya brahma,cariyaṃ carati, “iminā’haṃ sīlena vā vatena vā tapena vā brahma,cariyena vā devo vā bhavissāmi dev’aññatara vā ti. Comy explains that deva means “a mighty deva” (mahēsakkha,deva) (incl deva-lords and brahmas) and dev’aññatara as “a deva of lesser might” (appēsakkha,deva) (ie one of a heavenly host) (MA 2:69,15).

6 (10d) (Navaka) Ceto Vinibandha Sutta (A 9.72)

The (Navaka) Cetaso,vinibandha Sutta (A 9.72) combines the essential teachings from two suttas. From the (Pañcaka) Cetaso,vinibandha Sutta (A 5.206) [5] is taken the section on the 5 bondages [§§1-16],⁸¹ and from the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta (M 10,3), SD 13.3, is taken that on the 4 satipatthanas [§18].

SD 51.10d

(Navaka) Cetaso Vinibandha Sutta

The (Nines) Discourse on Mental Bondage | A 9.72/4:461

Or (Navaka) Vinibandha Sutta The (Nines) Discourse on Bondage

Traditional: A 9.2.2.10 = Aṅguttara Nikāya 9, Navaka Nipāta 2, Dutiyā Paṇṇāsaka 2, Satipaṭṭhāna Vg 10

Theme: The 5 mental bondages are overcome by the 4 satipatthanas

THE 5 MENTAL BONDAGES

1 These, bhikshus, are the 5 mental bondages. What are the five?

2 (1) Here, bhikshus, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **sensuality**.⁸²

3 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for sensuality,*

his mind does not tend to ardour [fervent practice], devotion, perseverance, striving.

4 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the **1st mental bondage**.⁸³

5 (2) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **his body**. [§5]

6 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for the body,*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

7 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the **2nd mental bondage**.

8 (3) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **form**.⁸⁴

9 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for form,*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

⁸¹ A 5.206 (SD 51.10c), of which, however, §17, “These, bhikshus, are the 5 mental bondages,” is omitted here in A 9.72.

⁸² *Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu kāmesu* avīta,rāgo hoti avigata-c,chando avigata,pemo avigata,pipāso avigata,pari-lāho avigata,taṇho.* *Kamesu in the same line in (Majjhima) Ceto,khila S (M 16,8.2), it reads *kāme*, with the same sense (SD 32.14). Cf (Thīna,middha) Tissa S (S 22.84.9), SD 32.12 where this sequence is applied to the 5 aggregates.

⁸³ At (Majjhima) Ceta,khila S (M 16,8.4), this line reads *evam assāyaṃ paṭhamo ceto,khilo appahīno hoti*, “this is thus his 1st mental bondage that has *not* been cut off,” and so, too, with the rest..

⁸⁴ *Puna c’aparāṃ, bhikkhave, bhikkhu rūpe avīta,rāgo hoti avigata-c,chando avigata,pemo avigata,pipāso avigata,pari-lāho avigata,taṇho.* Comy: Here “form” (*rūpa*) refers to external forms (*bahiddhā rūpe*), ie, visual objects, esp the bodies of others that we lust for or are attached to (MA 2:69).

10 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the **3rd mental bondage**.

11 (4) Furthermore, bhikshus, **a monk eats and overfills his belly and dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping.**⁸⁵

12 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who eats and overfills his belly and dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping,*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

13 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the **4th mental bondage**.

14 (5) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk **lives the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas**, thus: 'By this moral virtue [ritual]⁸⁶ or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!'⁸⁷

15 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who lives the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas, thus: 'By this moral virtue [ritual] or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!'*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

16 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is the **5th mental bondage**.

17 These, bhikshus, are the 5 mental bondages.

THE 4 FOCUSES OF MINDFULNESS

18 For the abandonment of these 5 mental barrennesses, bhikshus, **the 4 focuses of mindfulness** should be cultivated. What are the four?

19 Here, bhikshus, a monk⁸⁸

(1) dwells⁸⁹ exertive, clearly aware, mindful, contemplating body in the body,⁹⁰

⁸⁵ *Puna ca param bhikkhave bhikkhu yāva-d-attham udarāvadehakaṃ bhuñjitvā seyya, sukhaṃ passa, sukhaṃ middha, sukhaṃ anuyutto viharati.* Comy glosses *middha* as *niddā* (sleep) (MA 2:69): see **Thīna, middha**, SD 32.6 (2.2). **Udarāvadehakaṃ** = *udara*, "belly" + *avadehaka* (*ava*, "down" + absol of *avadihati*, "increases, accumulates," ie, bloats up). The stock *yāvad-attham ~am bhuñjitvā*: D 3:238,23; M 1:102,3; A 3:222,25, 249,26 4:343,13+ 21, 461,11, 5:18,23, 20,17; Vbh 378,1; ThaA 1:190,19 ≈ SA 2:107,9 ≈ Vism 33,25 (comys: *~an ti udara, -pūram, tam hi udaram avadehanato ~an ti vuccati*, DA 1031,15); MA 2:69,7 = AA 3:325,27 = VbhA 504,22; *udaram avadhitvā upacinitvā pūretvā*, AA 3:307,18); *~am bhutvā*, Tha 935.

⁸⁶ Considering the mind of such a misguided monk, we would be justified to render *sīla* here more broadly to include "rituals." On Pali polysemy, see SD 1.1 (4.4.5); SD 10.16 (1.3.1-1.3.2).

⁸⁷ *Puna c'aparam, bhikkhave, bhikkhu aññataram deva, nikāyam pañidhāya brahma, cariyam carati, "iminā'ham sīlena vā vatena vā tapena vā brahma, cariyena vā devo vā bhavissāmi dev'aññataro vā ti.* Comy explains that *deva* means "a mighty deva" (*mahēsakkha, deva*) (incl deva-lords and brahmas) and *dev'aññataro* as "a deva of lesser might" (*appēsakkha, deva*) (ie one of a heavenly host) (MA 2:69,15).

⁸⁸ Here "**a monk**" (*bhikkhu*) may refer to either an ordained monastic or anyone who is meditating (here, doing satipatthana) (DA 3:756; MA 1:241; VbhA 216 f; cf SnA 251): see SD 13.1 (3.1.1.5). Note that in **Dhānañjāni S** (M 97) Sāriputta teaches the divine abodes to the layman Dhānañjāni (addressing him directly) (M 97,32.2), SD 4.9, and that in (**Nānā, karaṇa**) **Mettā S 1** (A 4.125), the subject of each of the stock passages on the 4 divine abodes is "a certain person" (*ekacco puggalo*) (A 4.125,2 etc), SD33.9.

On meditation as renunciation, see **Hālidakāni S 1** (S 22.3/3:9-12), SD 10.12; **Bhāvanā**, SD 15.1 (14.7); **Sexuality**, SD 31.7 (1.6.2).

⁸⁹ *Ātāpī sampajāno satimā, vineyya loke abhijjhā, domanassari.* Here we find 4 of the 5 spiritual faculties (*pañc'-indriya*) in action: see SD 13.1 (4.2).

- removing⁹¹ covetousness and displeasure [discontent]⁹² in regard to the world;⁹³
- (2) he dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating feelings in the feelings,
removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world;
- (3) he dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating mind [thoughts] in the mind,
removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world;
- (4) he dwells exertive, clearly aware, mindful,
contemplating dharmas in the dharmas,
removing covetousness and displeasure in regard to the world.

20 For the abandonment of these 5 mental barrennesses, bhikshus, these 4 focuses of mindfulness should be cultivated.

— evaṃ —

7 (10e) (Dasaka) Ceto,khila Sutta (A 10.14)

7.1 The (Dasaka) Ceto,khila Sutta (A 10.14) is a composite of and parallel (with minor differences) with all the preceding four suttas:

			<u>Identical</u> §§	<u>Parallel</u> §§
[3] (Pañcaka) Ceto,khila Sutta	(A 5.205)	SD 51.10a		2-12
[4] (Navaka) Ceto,khila Sutta	(A 9.71)	SD 51.10b		2-12
[5] (Pañcaka) Cetaso Vinibandha Sutta	(A 5.206)	SD 51.10c		15-24
[6] (Navaka) Cetaso Vinibandha Sutta	(A 9.72)	SD 51.10d		15-24
(Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta	(M 16)	SD 32.14	2-12, 15-24	

7.2 Like **the (Navaka) Ceto,khila Sutta** (A 9.71) [4], the (Dasaka) Ceto,khila Sutta also lists the 5 mental barrennesses, and adds the 5 mental bondages (*cetaso vinibandhā*).

The 5 mental bondages are treated as a set on its own two other suttas in the Aṅguttara, that is, in **the (Pañcaka) Vinibandha Sutta** (A 5.206) [5]—which is identical to the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta passage [§§2-7]⁹⁴—and **the (Navaka) Vinibandha Sutta** (A 9.72) [6].

The (Navaka) Vinibandha Sutta (A 9.72) [6] is identical to the (Pañcaka) Vinibandha Sutta, except that the former closes with mentioning that the 4 focuses of mindfulness should be cultivated for the eradication of the 5 mental bondages.⁹⁵ Hence, A 9.72 stands as a separate discourse on the subject.⁹⁶

⁹⁰ “Contemplating body in the body” (*kāye kāyānupassī*). See SD 13.1 (3.4).

⁹¹ *Vineyya* can mean “should remove” (as pot, like *vineyya*, Sn 590) or as “having removed” (as ger, like *vinayitvā*, Pm 1:244), and both senses apply in Satipaṭṭhāna S. U Silananda similarly ends the sentence with “removing covetousness and grief in the world” (1990:177); also 1990:22-25. See SD 13.1 (4.2c) above.

⁹² “Covetousness and displeasure,” *abhijjhā, domanassā*, alt trs: “desire and discontent,” “desiring and disliking,” or “longing and loathing.” Walshe (1995:335 & n632) renders it as “hankering and fretting [in regard to the world].” See SD 13.1 (4.2).

⁹³ “World” (*loka*). See SD 13.1 (4.2.4).

⁹⁴ A 5.206/3:249 (SD 51.10c); M 16,2-7/1:101 (SD 51.10).

⁹⁵ A 9.72/4:460,25-26 (SD 51.10d).

⁹⁶ A 9.72/4:460 f (SD 51.10d).

7.3 THE TWO LONGEST SUTTAS. Of all the five suttas in this chapter, **the (Dasaka) Ceto,khila Sutta** (A 10.14) is the closest to **the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta** (M 16). However, the M 16 introduction (§§1-2) and the concluding sections (§26 on the 5 bases; §§27+30 on the 15 factors; §§28-29 on the parable of the hatchlings; closing line) are not found in A 10.14 or any of the other 3 suttas.

7.4 UNIQUENESS. The following passages are unique to **A 10.14: §§1+13 on decline and growth**. In **§§13+25**, it refers to both “monks and nuns,” but not in the rest of the Sutta. Of all the five suttas, only A 10.14 has the parables of **the waning moon [§14]** and of **the waxing moon [§25.2]**.

The Saṅgīti Sutta passages on mental barrenness [2.3.1] and on mental bondage [2.3.2] are common to both **M 16** and **A 10.14**. This is understandable because **the Saṅgīti Sutta** works as a kind of compendium of teachings found in the suttas.

7.5 SUTTA AGE

7.5.1 It is likely that the two sets—those of the 5 mental barrenness and the 5 mental bondages—are very early teachings (of the 1st period),⁹⁷ which are later combined and fully treated in **the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta** (M 16) [1.1.1]. Hence, we can see the Ceto,khila Suttas and the Vinibandha Suttas as the likely sources or as abridged versions or variations of the (Majjhima) Ceto,khila Sutta.

7.5.2 The oldest suttas of this collection are probably the shorter ones: A 5.205 + 206 and A 9.71 + 72, each dealing separately with the 5 mental barrennesses and the 5 mental bondages. From their collocation (consecutively arranged in the Pañcaka Nipāta and the Navaka Nipāta of the Aṅguttara) it shows that their materials are connected. Evidently, the Buddha presented the teachings both separately [A 5.206+207, A 9.71+72] and as consecutive sets [M 16 + A 10.14], depending on his audience.

SD 51.10e

(Dasaka) Ceto,khila Sutta

The (Tens) Discourse on Mental Barrenness | **A 10.14/5:17-21**

Traditional: A 10.1.2.4, Aṅguttara Nikāya 10, Dasaka Nipāta 1, Paṭhama Paṇṇāsaka 2, Nātha 4

Theme: The 10 kinds of mental barrenness

THE “UNABANDONED” (NEGATIVE) CYCLE

The 5 mental barrennesses (ceto,khila)

1 Bhikshus, for whomever, a monk or a nun, who has not abandoned **his 5 mental barrennesses** and has not cut off **his 5 mental bondages**,

then, come night or day, only decline in the wholesome states is to be expected, not *growth*.⁹⁸

2 What are **his 5 mental barrennesses** that have *not* been abandoned?⁹⁹

3 (1) Here, bhikshus, a monk¹⁰⁰ is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in **the teacher** [the Buddha].¹⁰¹ [2.1.1]

⁹⁷ Ie, taught in the first 10-20 years of the Buddha’s ministry. On the 2 periods, see SD 1.1 (2.2); SD 40a.1 (1.3).

⁹⁸ *Yassa kassaci bhikkhave bhikkhussa vā bhikkhuniyā vā pañca ceto,khilā appahīnā pañca cetaso,vinibandhā asamucchinnā, tassa yā ratti vā divaso vā āgacchati, hāniy’eva pāṭikañkhā kusalesu dhammesu no vuddhi.*

⁹⁹ See **(Majjhima) Ceto,khila S** (M 16,3) n, SD 32.14.

¹⁰⁰ Note that from hereon, only *bhikkhu* is mentioned, without any mention of *bhikkhunī* until §13.

3.2 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the teaching*, his mind does not tend to **ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving**.¹⁰²

3.3 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, [18] perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **1st mental barrenness** that has *not* been abandoned.¹⁰³

4 (2) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in **the Dharma** [the teaching and the truth].¹⁰⁴ [2.1.2]

4.2 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the Dharma*, his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

4.3 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **2nd mental barrenness** that has *not* been abandoned.

5 (3) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in **the sangha** [the noble sangha and the monastic community].¹⁰⁵ [2.1.3]

5.2 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the sangha*, his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

5.3 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **3rd mental barrenness** that has *not* been abandoned.

6 (4) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in **the training**.¹⁰⁶ [2.1.4]

6.2 Any monk, bhikshus, *who is doubtful, uncertain, lacking commitment, lacking faith, in the training*, his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

6.3 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **4th mental barrenness** that has *not* been abandoned.

¹⁰¹ *Idha bhikkhave bhikkhu satthari kaṅkhati vicikicchati nādhimuccati na sampasīdati*. The underscored occurs at Sn p107,16 (re 2 of the Buddha's 32 marks); D 1:106,2 (re the Buddha's 32 marks), D 1:109,5 f (re 2 of the 32 marks); M 1:101,10 = A 4:460,13 = 5:17,25 (in the teacher); M 2:135,8 (re the Buddha's 32 marks).

¹⁰² *Yo so bhikkhave bhikkhu satthari kaṅkhati vicikicchati nādhimuccati na sampasīdati, tassa cittaṃ na namati ātappāya anuyogāya sātaccāya padhānāya*. Comy: **Ātappāya** is "for the sake of arousing effort in burning away defilements" (*kilesa, santāpaka, viriya, karaṇ'atthāya*); **anuyogāya** is "yoked to repetitive effort" (*puna-p, puna, yogāya*); **sātaccāya** is omitted; **padhānāya** is "for the sake of striving" (*padahana'atthāya*) (MA 2:68,19). Comy on **Saṅgīti S** (D 33) adds: **Ātappāya** means "for the sake of generating effort"; **anuyogāya**, "yoked to it over and again"; **sātaccāya**, "continued doing"; **padhānāya**, "for the sake of striving" (**Ātappāyāti viriya, karaṇ'atthāya. Anuyogāyāti puna-p, punaṃ yogāya. Sātaccāyāti satata, kiriyāya. Padhānāyāti padahan'atthāya**, DA 3:1030)

¹⁰³ *Evam assāyaṃ paṭhamo ceto, khilo appahīno hoti*. On having faith in the Buddha, see **Buddhānussati**, SD 15.7.

¹⁰⁴ Comy says that *dhamma* (Dharma) here is scriptural or theoretical teachings (*pariyatti, dhamma*) and breakthroughs into the paths, fruits and nirvana (*paṭivedha, dhamma*) (MA 2:68): on the 3 good dharmas (*saddhamma*), see **The levels of training**, SD 40a.4 esp (2); **Notion of diṭṭhi**, SD 40a.1 (3.4). The Dharma, it must be added, also refers to the reality discovered by the Buddha and the truth of his teaching, and the Buddha's exhortation towards self-effort. The Dharma as training is found below [§6]. Lack of faith may induce us to turn to some form of external agency for succour and salvation, or see Buddhism as such an agency, as often seen in later Buddhisms.

¹⁰⁵ Here, **saṅgha** refers both to the noble community of saints and also to the conventional community of renunciants. In the former, it entails faith in the Vinaya rules and monastic practice; in the latter, it is the aspiration to attain the path in this life itself. On the sangha, see **Saṅghānussati**, SD 15.10a.

¹⁰⁶ *Sikkhā*, ie the training in moral virtue (*sīla*), mental concentration (*samādhi*), and liberating wisdom (*paññā*). See n on (2) Dhamma [§4]. On the 3 trainings, see **Sīla samādhi paññā**, SD 21.6.

7 (5) Furthermore, bhikkhus, a monk is **angry and displeased with fellow brahmafarrers [celibate colleagues], his heart troubled, unfeeling [callous]**.¹⁰⁷ [2.1.5]

7.2 Any monk, bhikkhus, *who is angry and displeased with fellow brahmafarrers, his heart troubled, unfeeling*,¹⁰⁸ his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

7.3 For one whose mind *does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **5th mental barrenness** that has *not* been abandoned.

These are his 5 mental barrennesses that have *not* been abandoned.

The 5 mental bondages (cetaso vinibandha)

8 What are his **5 mental bondages** that have not been cut off?¹⁰⁹

8.2 (1) Here, bhikkhus, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **sensuality**.¹¹⁰ [2.2.1]

8.3 For such a monk, bhikkhus, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for sensuality*,

his mind does not tend to ardour [fervent practice], devotion, perseverance, striving.

8.4 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is thus his **1st mental bondage** that has *not* been cut off.¹¹¹

9 (2) Furthermore, bhikkhus, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **his body**.¹¹² [2.2.2]

9.2 For such a monk, bhikkhus, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for the body*,

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

¹⁰⁷ *Puna ca param bhikkhave bhikkhu sa, brahmacārīsu kupito hoti anattamano āhata, citto khila, jāto*. From *kupito* ... etc: V 3:163,30 = 4:45,2 = 236,9 = D 3:238,10 = M 1:101,23 = A 3:249,8 = 4:460,22 = 5:18,5; A 3:176,1; DhA 1:309,13. This is the kind of malicious mind that induces a monk to breach the Vinaya (V 3:163).

¹⁰⁸ *Sa, brahma, cārīsu kupito anattamano āhata, citto khila, jāto*: D 3:238,10 = M 1:101,23 = A 3:249,8 = 4:460,22 = 5:18,5; A 3:176,1. A longer stock is *kupito anattamano anabhiraddho* [“unconciliated, dissatisfied, sulky”] *āhata, citto khila, jāto*: V 3:163,30 (*paṭighena āhataṃ cittam assa*, “his mind troubled by anger,” VA 584,28) = 4:45,2 = 236,19; V 3:255,13, 4:236,9, 238,30. A gloss: *ananvāhata, cetaso’ti* [“unperplexed mind”] *āhata, citto khila, jāto*, DhA 1:309,13; *jarādimhi vyāruddhe āhata, citte satte disvā*, “having seen hostile beings with minds troubled by decay and so on,” SnA 566,30 = NmA 428,7; *duṭṭha, manā ... āhata, cittā* (“a corrupt mind ... troubled heart”), Nm 62,8 (NmA 1:190,15). Opp, *anāhata, citto hoti akhila, jāto*, “an untroubled mind, feeling heart”: *Sammatta, niyāma* S 3 (A 5.153), 2nd of the 5 qualities of one, listening to the Dharma, is able to attain streamwinning (A 5.153/3:176,11), SD 4.4.

¹⁰⁹ *Katamāssa pañca cetaso, vinibandhā asamucchinnā honti*.

¹¹⁰ *Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu kāme* avīta, rāgo hoti avigata-c, chando avigata, pemo avigata, pipāso avigata, pariḷāho avigata, taṇho*. *Kame: The same line in (**Pañcaka**) **Cetaso Vinibandha S** (A 5.206,2), this reads *kāmesu*, with the same sense (SD 51.10c). Cf (**Thīna, middha**) **Tissa S** (S 22.84.9), SD 32.12 where this sequence is applied to the 5 aggregates.

¹¹¹ *Yassa cittam na namati ātappāya anuyogāya sātaccāya padhānāya, evam assāyaṃ paṭhamo ceto, khilo appahīno hoti*.

¹¹² *Puna c’aparam, bhikkhave, bhikkhu kāye avīta, rāgo hoti avigata-c, chando avigata, pemo avigata, pipāso avigata, pariḷāho avigata, taṇho*. Comy: Here “the body” (*kāye*) refers to his own body (that is, in practice, *our own body*). Foll comy, I take it as locative sg, since it refers to lust and attachment towards our own body (*attano kāye*, MA 2:69,6).

9.3 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is thus his **2nd mental bondage** that has *not* been cut off.

10 (3) Furthermore, bhikkhus, a monk is not rid of lust, *not* rid of desire, *not* rid of love, *not* rid of thirst, *not* rid of fever, *not* rid of craving for **form**.¹¹³ [2.2.3]

10.2 For such a monk, bhikkhus, *who is not rid of lust, not rid of desire, not rid of love, not rid of thirst, not rid of fever, not rid of craving for form,*

his mind does not tend [**19**] to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

10.3 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is thus his **3rd mental bondage** that has *not* been cut off.

11 (4) Furthermore, bhikkhus, **a monk eats and overfills his belly** and **dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping**.¹¹⁴ [2.2.4]

11.2 For such a monk, bhikkhus, *who eats and overfills his belly and dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping,*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

11.3 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is thus his **4th mental bondage** that has *not* been cut off.

12 (5) Furthermore, bhikkhus, a monk **lives the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas**, thus: ‘By this moral virtue [ritual]¹¹⁵ or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!’¹¹⁶ [2.2.5]

12.2 For such a monk, bhikkhus, *who lives the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas, thus: ‘By this moral virtue [ritual] or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!’*

his mind does not tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

12.3 For one whose mind does *not* tend to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving, this is thus his **5th mental bondage** that has *not* been cut off.

These are his 5 mental bondages that have *not* been cut off.

13 Bhikkhus, for whomever, a monk or a nun, who has *not* abandoned **these 5 mental barrennesses** and has *not* cut off **these 5 mental bondages**,

then, come night or day, only decline in the wholesome states is to be expected, not growth. [§1]

¹¹³ *Puna c’aparam, bhikkhave, bhikkhu rūpe avīta, rāgo hoti avigata-c, chando avigata, pemo avigata, pipāso avigata, pariāho avigata, taṇho.* Comy: Here “form” (*rūpa*) refers to external forms (*bahiddhā rūpe*), ie, visual objects, esp the bodies of others that we lust for or are attached to (MA 2:69).

¹¹⁴ *Puna ca param bhikkhave bhikkhu yāva-d-attham udarāvadehakarṃ bhuñjivā seyya, sukham passa, sukham middha, sukham anuyutto viharati.* Comy glosses *middha* as *niddā* (sleep) (MA 2:69): see **Thīna, middha**, SD 32.6 (2.2). **Udarāvadehakarṃ** = *udara*, “belly” + *avadehaka* (*ava*, “down” + absol of *avadihati*, “increases, accumulates,” ie, bloats up). The stock *yāva-d-attham ~am bhuñjivā*: D 3:238,23; M 1:102,3; A 3:222,25, 249,26 4:343,13+ 21, 461,11, 5:18,23, 20,17; Vbh 378,1; ThaA 1:190,19 ≈ SA 2:107,9 ≈ Vism 33,25 (comys: *~an ti udara, -pūram, tam hi udaram avadehanato ~an ti vuccati*, DA 1031,15); MA 2:69,7 = AA 3:325,27 = VbhA 504,22; *udaram avadihitvā upacinitvā pūretvā*, AA 3:307,18); *~am bhutvā*, Tha 935.

¹¹⁵ Considering the mind of such a misguided monk, we would be justified to render *sīla* here more broadly to include “rituals.” On Pali polysemy, see SD 1.1 (4.4.5); SD 10.16 (1.3.1-1.3.2).

¹¹⁶ *Puna c’aparam, bhikkhave, bhikkhu aññataram deva, nikāyam pañidhāya brahma, cariyam carati, “iminā’ham sīlena vā vatena vā tapena vā brahma, cariyena vā devo vā bhavissāmi dev’aññataro vā ti.* Comy explains that *deva* means “a mighty deva” (*mahēsakkha, deva*) (incl deva-lords and brahmas) and *dev’aññataro* as “a deva of lesser might” (*appēsakkha, deva*) (ie one of a heavenly host) (MA 2:69,15).

PARABLE OF THE WANING MOON

13.2 Bhikshus, just as during the dark fortnight, come night or day, the moon only wanes in beauty, in roundness, in brightness, in height and girth,¹¹⁷

13.3 so, too, bhikshus, *for whomever, a monk or a nun, who has not abandoned **these 5 mental barrennesses** and has not cut off **these 5 mental bondages**, then, come night or day, only decline in the wholesome states is to be expected, not growth.*

THE “ABANDONED” (POSITIVE) CYCLE

14 Bhikshus, for whomever, a monk or a nun, who has abandoned **his 5 mental barrennesses** and has well cut off **his 5 mental bondages**,¹¹⁸

then, come night or day, only growth in the wholesome states is to be expected, not *decline*.¹¹⁹

The 5 mental barrennesses (*ceto,khila*) abandoned

15 What are **his 5 mental barrennesses** that *have* been abandoned?

(1) Here, bhikshus, a monk is *neither* doubtful *nor* uncertain, but committed and faithful in **the teacher**.¹²⁰ [§3]

15.2 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is neither doubtful nor uncertain, but committed and faithful to the teacher,*

his mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

15.3 For one *whose mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving,* this is thus his **1st mental barrenness** that *has* been abandoned.

16 (2) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is *neither* doubtful *nor* uncertain, but committed and faithful to **the Dharma**. [§4]

16.2 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is neither doubtful nor uncertain, but committed and faithful in the Dharma,*

his mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

16.3 For one *whose mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving,* this is thus his **2nd mental barrenness** that *has* been abandoned.

17 (3) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is *neither* doubtful *nor* uncertain, but committed and faithful to **the sangha**. [§5]

16.2 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is neither doubtful nor uncertain, but committed and faithful in the sangha,*

¹¹⁷ *Seyyathā’pi bhikkhave kāḷa,pakkhe candassa yā ratti vā divaso vā āgacchati, hāyat’eva vaṇṇena hāyati maṇḍalena hāyati ābhāya hāyati āroha,pariṇāhena.* The phrase **āroha,pariṇāhena** means “height or length, and breadth or circumference: S 16.7 (2:206,14 + 207,1+22), SD 88.4, S 16.8/2:208,2 (SD 1.10 (4.4)) = A 10.14 (5:19,11 + 21,5), SD 32.14 = A 10.67 (5:123,16 + 124,5+29 & 125,13), SD . See CPD: āroha-pariṇāha. **Sigāl’ovāda S** (D 31,6*) compares the waning moon to one who transgresses the Dharma through desire, hate, fear or delusion; the good who do not do so are like the waxing moon (SD 4.1).

¹¹⁸ *Yassa kassaci bhikkhave bhikkhussa vā bhikkhuniyā vā pañca ceto,khilā pahīnā pañca cetaso,vinibandhā su-samucchinā.*

¹¹⁹ *Tassa yā ratti vā divaso vā āgacchati, vuddhi-yeva pāṭikākhā kusalesu dhammesu no pariḥāni.*

¹²⁰ *Idha bhikkhave bhikkhu satthari na kaṅkhati na vicikicchati adhimuccati sampasīdati.*

his mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

16.3 For one *whose mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **3rd mental barrenness** that *has* been abandoned.

18 (4) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is *neither doubtful nor uncertain*, but committed and faithful to the training. [§6]

16.2 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is neither doubtful nor uncertain, but committed and faithful in the training*,

his mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

16.3 For one *whose mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **4th mental barrenness** that *has* been abandoned.

19 (5) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is **neither angry nor displeased with fellow brahmafarsers**, his heart untroubled, not unfeeling [not callous].¹²¹

19.2 For such a monk, bhikshus, who is neither angry nor displeased with fellow brahmafarsers, his heart untroubled, not unfeeling,

his mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving. [103]

19.3 For one *whose mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **5th mental barrenness** that *has* been abandoned.

These are his 5 mental barrennesses that *have* been abandoned.

The 5 mental bondages (*cetaso,vinibandhana*) abandoned

20 What are his 5 mental bondages that have been well cut off?¹²²

20.2 (1) Here, bhikshus, a monk is rid of lust, rid of desire, rid of love, rid of thirst, rid of fever, rid of craving for **sensuality**. [§8.2]

20.3 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is rid of lust, rid of desire, rid of love, rid of thirst, rid of fever, rid of craving for sensuality*,

his mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

20.4 For one *whose mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **1st mental bondage** that *has* been well cut off.¹²³

21 (2) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is rid of lust, rid of desire, rid of love, rid of thirst, rid of fever, rid of craving for **his body**.¹²⁴ [§9]

21.2 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is rid of lust, rid of desire, rid of love, rid of thirst, rid of fever, rid of craving for the body*,

his mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

¹²¹ *Puna ca param bhikkhave bhikkhu sa,brahma.cārīsu na kupito hoti atta,mano* [Be na anatta,mano; Ce Ee atta,-mano] *anāhata,citto akhila,jāto*.

¹²² *Katamā'ssa pañca cetaso,vinibandhā susamucchinnā honti*.

¹²³ *Yassa cittaṃ namati ātappāya anuyogāya sātaccāya padhānāya, evam assāyaṃ paṭhamo cetaso,vinibandho susamucchinno hoti*.

¹²⁴ *Kāye*, which, foll comy, I take as locative sg, since it refers to lust and attachment towards our own body (MA 2:69,6).

21.3 For one *whose mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **2nd mental bondage** that *has* been well cut off.

22 (3) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk is rid of lust, rid of desire, rid of love, rid of thirst, rid of fever, rid of craving for **form**. [§10]

22.3 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who is rid of lust, rid of desire, rid of love, rid of thirst, rid of fever, rid of craving for form*,

his mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

22.4 For one *whose mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **3rd mental bondage** that *has* been well cut off.

23 (4) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk ***neither eats to overfill his belly nor dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping***.¹²⁵ [§11]

23.2 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who neither eats to overfill his belly nor dwells indulging in the pleasures of the bed, of lying down, of sleeping*,

his mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

23.3 For one *whose mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **4th mental bondage** that *has* been well cut off.

24 (5) Furthermore, bhikshus, a monk ***does not live the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas***, thus: 'By this moral virtue or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!' [§12]

24.2 For such a monk, bhikshus, *who **does not live the holy life aspiring for a certain host of devas***, thus: 'By this moral virtue or vow or asceticism or holy life, may I become this deva or that deva!'

his mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving.

24.3 For one *whose mind tends to ardour, devotion, perseverance, striving*, this is thus his **5th mental bondage** that *has* been well cut off.

These are his 5 mental bondages that *have* been well cut off.

25 Bhikshus, for whomever, a monk or a nun, who has abandoned **these 5 mental barrennesses** and has cut off **these 5 mental bondages**,

then, come night or day, only growth in the wholesome states is to be expected, not decline. [§1] [15]

PARABLE OF THE WAXING MOON

25.2 Bhikshus, just as during the bright fortnight, come night or day, the moon only waxes in beauty, in roundness, in brightness, in height and girth,¹²⁶

25.3 so, too, bhikshus, *for whomever, a monk or a nun, who has abandoned **these 5 mental barrennesses** and has cut off **these 5 mental bondages**,*

then, come night or day, only growth in the wholesome states is to be expected, not decline.

— evaṃ —

Bibliography: see SD 51.end & SD 32.16

170717 170722 170908 180815

¹²⁵ *Puna ca param bhikkhave bhikkhu na yāvad-attham udarāvadehakaṃ bhuñjitvā seyya, sukhaṃ passa, sukhaṃ middha, sukhaṃ anuyutto viharati.*

¹²⁶ *Seyyathā'pi bhikkhave juṇha, pakkhe candassa yā ratti vā divaso vā āgacchati vaḍḍhateva vaṇṇena vaḍḍhati maṇḍalena vaḍḍhati ābhāya vaḍḍhati āroha, pariṇāhena. On **āroha, pariṇāhena**, see n at §13.2.*