

# 1

## (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta

The Discourse to Nandiya (on the streamwinner) | S 55.40

Or, **Nandiya Sakka Sutta**, the Discourse on Nandiya the Sakya

Theme: A streamwinner should build up his mindfulness practice

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

### 1 Sutta highlights

#### 1.1 SUTTA SUMMARY

**1.1.1 Nandiya's question.** The (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta (S 55.40) is a very instructive Sutta on the necessity of meditation and mindfulness for spiritual progress [2.3.1]. It is a record of the Buddha's answer to **Nandiya the Sakya's** question, "Bhante, when the 4 limbs of streamwinning [2.1] are all completely and totally absent from a noble disciple, would that noble disciple, bhante, be one who dwells negligently [heedlessly] or not?" [§3].

It is obvious that Nandiya is here using the term "**noble disciple**" (*ariya, sāvaka*) in a general sense of "followers," especially both the worldlings and the streamwinners. Technically, however, *ariya, sāvaka* or *ariya* itself, in the suttas, refers to the 4 kinds of saints, that is, the streamwinner, the once-returner, the non-returner, and the arhat.<sup>1</sup> [1.2.1]

#### 1.1.2 Outsiders and worldlings

**1.1.2.1** The Buddha declares that such a follower would be "an outsider (*bāhira*) [1.2.2], one who stands on the side of the worldlings, I say!" [§4]. It is interesting to note here that the Buddha does not object to Nandiya's using *ariya, sāvaka* in such a broad sense, but uses the term himself to answer Nandiya. This non-technicality of terminology is an important clue to the earliness of the sutta.<sup>2</sup>

Let us examine the words "outsider" (*bahira*) and "worldling" (*puthujjana*)—the two words the Buddha uses to describe one who does not practise meditation or mindfulness for the sake of personal development. As a start, it is clear that we need to be a real part of the action, that is, to practise the Dharma, if we are to benefit from it. Yet, we are easily and often distracted from this because we remain "outside" the sphere of wholesome action, caught up with the world and the crowd, living a crowded and stifling life.<sup>3</sup>

**1.1.2.2** In the Buddha's time and in the suttas, there is no notion of "Buddhist" as we have them today, that is, the "statistical Buddhist" or the "nominal Buddhist." There are only 3 categories of those who understand and practise the Buddha's teachings, that is,

---

<sup>1</sup> See **Alagaddûpama S** (M 22,42-47), SD 3.13 & **Ānāpāna, sati S** (M 118,9-12), SD 7.13. Cf "true individual" (*sappurisa*): **Sappurisa S** (M 113), SD 23.7 & **Bāla Paṇḍita S** (M 129,27-50), SD 2.22.

<sup>2</sup> On a sutta's earliness, see **Notion of *ditṭhi***, SD 40a.1 (1.3), on the 2 periods of the Buddha's ministry. See also Reflection, "Buddhism for real," R343, 2014.

<sup>3</sup> See eg **Sambādh'okāsa S** (A 6.26), SD 15.6.

- (1) the good worldlings (*kalyāṇa puthujjana*),<sup>4</sup> or those capable of keeping to the Buddhist training;
- (2) the learners (*sekha*),<sup>5</sup> the saint (ordained and lay) on the path to awakening; and
- (3) the non-learners (*asekha*) or arhats, who have fully attained to the goal of awakening.

The minimum standard for a “Buddhist” is that of being a streamwinner (*sotāpanna*), or at least, the effective aspiration to be one.<sup>6</sup>

Those outside of these categories, especially the second and the third, are regarded as “outsiders” (*bahira*)<sup>7</sup> [1.2.2]. Indeed, from the (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta, we see that even the first category—the good worldlings—are regarded as outsiders, simply because they are not yet members of the holy community of noble ones (*ariya saṅgha*).

There are two vital aspects of Buddhism today that we need to consider. First, there is **the socializing aspect**, that is, such events as celebrating Buddhist festivals, attending Sunday pujas or gatherings, going for Buddhist talks, or becoming members of a Buddhist society. Mundane as these activities may be, they have a cohesive effect in strengthening a Buddhist community.

However, the real test for such a community is its spirituality. This defining and liberating quality comes from the second aspect of Buddhist living, that is, the personal practice of the Dharma “in accordance with the Dharma” [2.1.1(4)], that is, Buddhism as taught by the Buddha. Such a practice must be Dharma-inspired and sutta-based, and begins with personal initiative and sustained by diligence. Externally, we must, as a rule, radiate lovingkind friendliness and wise attention to others so that they are inspired in the Dharma by our presence and example.<sup>8</sup>

On a deeper and more urgent level is our commitment to **personal transformation**, that is, strengthening our moral conduct (wholesome action and speech), cultivating our minds and hearts to be calm and joyful, and leading a life that conduces to opening up to the wisdom and openness of the Dharma, living Buddha-like lives or emulating his noble saints.<sup>9</sup> In this way, we are ready and able to change and better lives in a Dharma-spirited way.

**1.1.2.3** The Sutta theme is that of streamwinning and mental cultivation for a vision of true reality. Streamwinning is the very first real step on the path to awakening. Those who are not walking the path or are far from it are called “worldlings” (*puthujjana*),<sup>10</sup> as they are still caught up with the world, that is, with sense-pleasures and not really knowing how to enjoy them. Hence, they keep on craving for them and clinging to them.

Worldlings who make significant effort to approach the path, that is, at least by way of keeping (to their best effort) the 5 precepts, are known as “good worldlings” (*kalyāṇa puthujjana*). The 5 precepts

<sup>4</sup> Comys often qu an untraced ref: “The Buddha, the Kinsman of the Sun, speaks of these two worldlings: one is the blind worldling, the other the good worldling” (*Duṇe puthujjanā vuttā Buddhena Ādicca, bandhunā andho puthujjano eko kalyāṇ’eko puthujjano ti*): DA 59 = MA 1:21 = SA 2:97 = AA 1:62 = Nm 2:273 = Nc 76 = PmA 1:205 = 266. See also: MA 1:40; ItA 1:61; UA 269,29 = ItA 2:35,13.

<sup>5</sup> On *kalyāṇa, puthujjana, sekha & asekha*, see **Indriya, bhāvanā S** (M 12), SD 17.13.

<sup>6</sup> See **Entering the stream**, SD 3.3 & **(Anicca) Cakkhu S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

<sup>7</sup> Comy uses the term *bāhira* or *bāhiraka*, which has the same sense (MA 2:217,25). For an allusion to this in **Cūḷa Hatthi, padōpama S** M 27,19.3 etc (refrain) + SD 47.1 (1.3.7); see also SD 33.1b (4.4.2.4).

<sup>8</sup> See Reflection, “Be Buddhist, not a Buddhist,” R342, 2014.

<sup>9</sup> See eg **(Tad-ah’) Uposatha S** (A 3.70), SD 4.18.

<sup>10</sup> On the worldling (*puthujjana*), **The nature of identity**, SD 19.1 (7.1) Who is a Buddhist? See also **Nakula, pitā S** (S 22.1) @ SD 5.4 (3).

do not merely train us to refrain from killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, lying and clouding up our minds, but they are reminders for us to know when to stop while indulging our senses.<sup>11</sup>

The 5 precepts are based on the natural and universal notion that we love life, happiness, freedom, truth and wisdom.<sup>12</sup> When we understand and appreciate these values, we would naturally respond to others with compassion, charity, respect, beneficence and openness. In this way, not only are we happy ourselves, but we bring joy to others, too. Indeed, our purpose as practising Buddhists should be to bring as much happiness to as many people and beings as possible. This is how true Buddhists truly enjoy life.<sup>13</sup>

#### 1.1.2.4 The Mahā Vaccha,gotta Sutta (M 73) speaks of the following 6 kinds of noble saints:

- |                            |                            |                             |
|----------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| (1) arhat monks            | celibate                   |                             |
| (2) arhat nuns             | celibate                   |                             |
| (3) laymen non-returners   | celibate                   |                             |
| (4) laymen streamwinners   | “enjoying sense-pleasures” |                             |
| (5) laywomen non-returners | celibate                   |                             |
| (6) laywomen streamwinners | “enjoying sense-pleasures” | (M 73,10-12/1:491), SD 27.4 |

It should be noted here that the arhats and non-returners, whether monastic or lay, are all *naturally celibate* because they are, as a rule, meditators who are dhyana-attainers. Enjoying the suprasomatic (beyond the body) dhyanic bliss, they see bodily pleasures the way adults who have given up childish toys see such toys.

The laymen and laywomen who are **streamwinners**, on the other hand, are all those “enjoying sense-pleasures” (*kāma,bhogī*). In other words, they live worldly (but wholesome) lives, having families, holding jobs, running businesses, or pursuing pleasurable quests. All these are well moderated by the 5 precepts and right livelihood. In short, the lay streamwinners live enjoyable lives in the worldly sense (well grounded in moral virtue) and enjoying spiritual development at the same time.<sup>14</sup>

**1.1.2.5** The (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta is an urgent call for us not to ritualize our Buddhist lives, that is, if we do have noble spiritual qualities—especially wise faith in the 3 jewels, and moral virtue dear to the noble ones—we should make every effort to practise meditation, or at least mindfulness practise by way of the perception of impermanence, so that we are able to see the true nature of reality, that is, the rise and fall of “phenomena” (*dharmā*). Practising this way, we are then truly diligent (*appamāda*) in the spiritual life, which fruits in streamwinning.

Streamwinning is the minimum level of spiritual liberation or noble sainthood that we can and must strive for in this life itself, so that the path is before us and we are advancing on it. If not, we are still “outsiders” who are likely to be reborn in subhuman planes<sup>15</sup> or in unwholesome human lives, and we are still “worldlings,” caught up in the endless cycle of wear and tear, and seeming to enjoy it!<sup>16</sup>

<sup>11</sup> On the 5 precepts, see **Veḷu,dvāreyya S** (S 55.7), SD 1.5 (2); **Sīlānussati**, SD 15.11 (2.2); SD 21.6 (1.2); SD 37.8 (2.2).

<sup>12</sup> These are the 5 “values” underlying each of the 5 precepts, respectively.

<sup>13</sup> See SD 19.1 (7.1): Who is a “Buddhist”?

<sup>14</sup> On the laity & sensual pleasure, see **Runṇa S** (A 3.103) @ SD 37.3 (1.2.1).

<sup>15</sup> See **Pañca,gati S** (A 9.68), SD 2.20 & **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,37-41), SD 49.1 = SD 2.24. See also “World of our own” (R115) 2012 & “We are not born human” (R216) 2011.

<sup>16</sup> See the myth of Sisyphus: **Yodh’ājīva S** (S 42.3), SD 23.3 (1).

### 1.1.3 The 2 kinds of followers

**1.1.3.0** The Buddha then speaks of the 2 kinds of followers, here called “noble disciples” [1.2.1], that is, “one who dwells negligently [heedlessly]” and “one who dwells diligently [heedfully]” [§5], and the whole Sutta elaborates on them.

**1.1.3.1** The first is the “negligent dweller” (*pamāda, vihārī*), that is, one who has all the 4 qualities of a streamwinner—faith in the 3 jewels, and moral virtue of the nobles—but remains on that level without asserting himself further in meditation or mindfulness practice. He is “content” (*santuṭṭha*) with that state and “makes *no* further effort in solitude by day nor in seclusion by night” [§§10+16+22+27].

In short, he neither meditates nor practises mindfulness (such as the perception of impermanence).<sup>17</sup> Without any mental cultivation, he does not go beyond the mere limbs of streamwinning, that is, he lacks the wisdom to see the “rise and fall” of phenomena (*dhammā*), the reality of impermanence.<sup>18</sup> Hence, “because phenomena do *not* appear, he is regarded as ‘one who dwells negligently’” [§§13+19 +25+30]. Here, “(because) phenomena do not appear” (*dhammānaṃ apātubhāvā*), and its related form, *dhammā na pātubhavanti*, refer to the wisdom that sees the rise and fall of phenomena, leading to the arising of the “Dharma-eye,” that is, at least streamwinning.<sup>19</sup>

**1.1.3.2** In the case of the “diligent dweller” (*appamāda, vihārī*), or true practitioner, he not only has *all* the 4 limbs of streamwinning—faith in the 3 jewels, and moral virtue of the nobles—but actually asserts himself in some level of meditation or mindfulness (especially the perception of impermanence).<sup>20</sup>

In due course, such a practitioner is able to see the true nature of the “rise and fall” of phenomena (*dhamma*). In other words, “phenomena *do* appear” (*dhammā pātubhavanti*), and “because phenomena *do* appear, he is regarded as ‘one who dwells diligently’” [§§38+44+50+55].

**1.1.3.3** To fully understand the (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta, we need to let go of most, if not all, the fixed views we might have of the nature of streamwinning before reflecting on this Sutta. We may have any, two or three, or all, of the 4 limbs of streamwinning—wise faith in the 3 jewels, and the moral virtue of the noble ones—but *if they are merely ritualized*, we have not yet become streamwinners. At best, we are on the verge of attaining breakthrough into streamwinning, but we are still a worldling.

Being caught up with ritualism is one of **the 3 fetters** (*saṃyojana*) that prevent us from the very first step *to awakening, that of streamwinning*. The other two fetters are those of *self-identity view* (where we identify with our body or mind), and of *doubt* (where we look for happiness and self-transformation outside of ourselves).<sup>21</sup> [2.1.2]

**1.1.3.4** A “ritualized” approach to the 4 limbs of streamwinning [1.1.3.3] means that we take them for granted, without harmonizing **the spiritual faculties** (*pañc’indriya*).<sup>22</sup> The limb or limbs of streamwin-

<sup>17</sup> See eg (Anicca) Cakkhu S (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

<sup>18</sup> See eg Dīgha, jānu S (A 8.54), where this vision of impermanence is called the “accomplishment of wisdom” (*paññā, sampadā*), and def as the “wisdom directed to the rising and falling away (of phenomena) that is noble and penetrative, leading to the complete destruction of suffering” (A 8.54,15), SD 5.10.

<sup>19</sup> The opening of the “Dharma-eye” (*dhamma, cakkhu*) usu refers to the perception of the law of change, denoting the attainment of streamwinning: see Dhamma, cakkha Pavattana S (S 56.11,16), SD 1.1.

<sup>20</sup> See eg (Anicca) Cakkhu S (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

<sup>21</sup> See Abhabba Tayo, dhamma S (A 10.76,6), SD 2.4; Emotional independence, SD 40a.8.

<sup>22</sup> On the 5 spiritual faculties (*pañc’indriya*), see Āpaṇa S (S 48.50) + SD 10.4 (2).

ning we have are merely nurtured by the faculty of faith (*saddh'indriya*)<sup>23</sup> but without that of wisdom (*paññ'indriya*), and merely by the faculty of effort (*viriy'indriya*) without that of samadhi (*samād'indriya*). It is the faculty of mindfulness (*sat'indriya*) that harmonizes all these 4 faculties, so that their full force brings about spiritual breakthrough, that is, seeing with the Dharma-eye.

According to **the (Bāhira) Paṭipanna Sutta** (S 48.18), these 5 spiritual faculties have a direct relationship with the attaining of sainthood. When they are at their wholesome fullest and strongest, we will attain arhathood. Their progressive fullness and strength in us will determine how we attain the progressive stages of sainthood. At their wholesome weakest, we are practising for the fruit of streamwinning. If they are completely and totally absent, then one is an “outsider, one who stands on the side of the worldlings.”<sup>24</sup>

## 1.2 KEY TERMS

### 1.2.1 “Noble disciple” (*ariya,sāvaka*)

**1.2.1.1** This term has a unique sense, as used by Nandiya the Sakya [§3], which the Buddha does not object to, and also uses in his answer to Nandiya’s question. Apparently, in this Sutta, it refers to worldlings and streamwinners [1.1.1].

**1.2.1.2** Technically, however, *ariya,sāvaka* or *ariya* itself, in the suttas, refers to the 4 kinds of saints or noble ones (*ariya*), that is, the streamwinner, the once-returner, the non-returner, and the arhat.<sup>25</sup> **The Kīṭāgiri Sutta** (M 70) mentions 7 kinds of saints,<sup>26</sup> but the better known list is that of the 8 noble individuals (*aṭṭha ariya puggala*),<sup>27</sup> listed here according to their ascending order of attainment:<sup>28</sup>

(1) The path of streamwinning,	<i>sotāpatti,magga</i>
(2) The fruition of streamwinning,	<i>sotāpatti,phala</i>
(3) The path of once-return,	<i>sākadāgāmi,magga</i>
(4) The fruition of once-return,	<i>sākadāgāmi,phala</i>
(5) The path of non-return,	<i>anāgāmī,magga</i>
(6) The fruition of non-return,	<i>anāgāmī,phala</i>

<sup>23</sup> Although the term “wise faith” (*avecca-p,pasāda*) appears in the first 3 of the 4 streamwinning limbs, they are not “blind” (lacking investigation or personal experience, etc) but needs to be harmonized in terms of the 5 spiritual faculties.

<sup>24</sup> **(Bāhira) Paṭipanna S** (S 48.18). SD 47.19.

<sup>25</sup> See **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22,42-47), SD 3.13 & **Ānāpāna,sati S** (M 118,9-12), SD 7.13. Cf “true individual” (*sappurisa*): **Sappurisa S** (M 113), SD 23.7 & **Bāla Paṇḍita S** (M 129,27-50), SD 2.22.

<sup>26</sup> This well known list of the 7 holy persons is found elsewhere in the Canon: **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,2.3(11)/3:254), **Kīṭāgiri S** (M 70), SD 11.1, **Bhaddāli Sutta** (M 65,11-12/1:439 f), **Saviṭṭha S** (A 3.21/1:118-120), and **(Āhuneyyā) Puggalā S** (A 7.14/4:10 f). See also Pm 2:52; Pug 10, 30-36, 73; Vism 659. On (6-7), see Gethin, *The Buddhist Path to Awakening*, 2001:128-133, 135-137, 347.

<sup>27</sup> V 5:117; MA 1:167; ThaA 206; Or, more commonly, *aṭṭha purisa,puggala* (D 2:94, 3:5, 227; M 1:37; S 1:220, 2:69, 4:272, 279, 304, 5:429; A 1:208, 222, 2:34, 56, 3:36, 212, 286, 4:407, 5:183, 330; It 88).

<sup>28</sup> In A 9.10/4:373 & 10.16/5:23, **the lineage-winner** (*gotra,bhū*), referring both to the person and to the state (**lineage change** or change of lineage), is mentioned as the 9<sup>th</sup> noble individual. He is one experiencing the lightning-like consciousness between the state of a worldling and that of a streamwinner; def at Pug 12, 13 & Vism 138, Pm 1:66-68; also at Tikap 154 f, 165, 324, etc; VvA 155. On the late Abhidhamma use of *gotra,bhū*, see Abhs 4.21/114 = Abhs:SR 66-68; Abhs:BRS 168, 355; Abhs:WG 136. Cf *upanissaya* (J 1:235). On the 9 types of saints, see SD 3.3 (3).

- |   |                       |                    |
|---|-----------------------|--------------------|
| (7) The path of arhathood [holiness],     | <i>arahatta,magga</i> |                    |
| (8) The fruition of arhathood [holiness]. | <i>arahatta,phala</i> | (M 70,14), SD 11.1 |

**1.2.1.3** *Ariya* means “noble” in the sense that one is no more of the world, that is, not a worldling swayed by its conditions (gain and loss, fame and obscurity, blame and praise, joy and pain),<sup>29</sup> and is sure of awakening, or has attained full awakening, that is, arhathood.

**1.2.1.4** The Commentaries define *ariya* as referring to any of the buddhas, or pratyeka-buddhas, or disciples of the Buddha.<sup>30</sup> In **the (Sacca) Loka Sutta** (S 56.28), for example, the Buddha is said to be “the noble one” (*ariya*) in the world; hence, the truth he has discovered and teaches is called the “noble truths.”<sup>31</sup>

When only the Buddha is regarded as *ariya*, then the pratyeka-buddha and the Buddha’s disciples are called *sappurisa*, “true individuals,”<sup>32</sup> Or, *ariya* can refer to the “congregation of noble disciples” (*ariya,sāvaka,parisā*), while the “worldly crowd” (*puthujjana,parisā*) is said to be *anariya*, “ignoble” (AA 2:145).

**1.2.1.5** The noble ones are so called because they are “pure, without defilement” (*nikkilesā visuddhā*),<sup>33</sup> or “free from faults” (*niddosa*).<sup>34</sup> This is neither a ritual state—one that is said to arise when certain prayers or rites are performed (as in the brahminical systems)—nor a conferred state (such as “enlightenment” in lineage priesthood in later Buddhism). This is the natural moral purity of a practitioner, who as such, is “beyond good and bad,” that is, will naturally keep to the moral precepts and will never violate them, even at the risk of death.<sup>35</sup>

## **1.2.2 The “outsider” versus the practitioner**

**1.2.2.1** In the Sutta, the Buddha defines an “outsider” [§4] as a follower in two ways: implicitly as one who is not a streamwinner, and explicitly, as one who, even though a streamwinner, does not exert himself “further” (*uttari*) to attain higher stages of sainthood, even full awakening itself, but remains a worldling. [1.1.2]

**1.2.2.2 The (Bāhira) Paṭipanna Sutta** (S 48.18) states that only those who have attained sainthood, at least as streamwinners, are regarded as “practitioners” (*paṭipanna*). Others are still “outsiders” (*bāhira*), as they still have to enter the path. This teaching clearly stresses the urgency of attaining at least streamwinning in this life itself, so that we are not left out of the spiritual life.<sup>36</sup>

The Commentary to the (Bāhira) Paṭipanna Sutta (S 48.18) [1.1.3.4], defines “outsider” (*bāhira*) as one who exists outside of the state of the 8 noble individuals (*bāhira’ti imehi aṭṭhahi puggalehi bahi,-bhūto*, SA 3:236). The 8 individuals are the various kinds of saints in terms of path and of fruition [1.2.1.2]. These outsiders are also known as worldlings [1.1.2.1], as they are still fettered to the world with its ignorance and craving.

<sup>29</sup> **Loka,dhamma S 1+2** (A 8.5+6), SD 42.2+3.

<sup>30</sup> Eg MA 1:21; SA 1:97 (the Buddha etc, *buddh’ādayo*, SA 1:97).

<sup>31</sup> **(Sacca) Loka S** (S 56.28), SD 104.5.

<sup>32</sup> MA 1:21.

<sup>33</sup> MA 4:164; SA 2:251; NcA 76; PmA 2:446; DhsA 249. Cf D 28,18 @ SD 14.14 (noble psychic powers and ignoble psychic powers).

<sup>34</sup> DA 2:537, 895; MA 2:401; AA 3:346.

<sup>35</sup> See **Beyond good and evil**, SD 18,7,

<sup>36</sup> S 48.18 (SD 47.19).

**1.2.2.3** In simple terms, then, “outsider” (*bāhira*) refers to an unawakened Buddhist, although it may be extended to encompass *all* unawakened beings. However, outsider here is not a really a classifier or designator of categories: rather, it is a “reminder” that we need to take further steps on the path to awakening, not to stop, not too long anyway, even as streamwinners.

**1.2.2.4** The “7 lives” that a streamwinner is said to go through before awakening is a relative term. If we are born in some high heavens—say, the highest form of birth (the realm of neither-perception-nor-non-perception)—we would live a single life-span lasting 84,000 world-cycles! Even the life-span of a non-returner in the pure abode of Akaniṭṭha (the highest of the form worlds) lasts 16,000 world-cycles.<sup>37</sup>

**1.2.2.5** We may see the streamwinner as a “rookie” who has qualified and been accepted as an “employee” of the awakening profession (in the old sense of the word),<sup>38</sup> or better, as a “freshie” (first-year student) in a university, who needs to complete his studies and graduate. As a streamwinner, we are strong in faith, but if we progress further on the path, our wisdom increases, too. We would then be more effective Dharma teachers, but best of all, we are actual exemplars of the Dharma ourselves. The best Dharma exemplar is, of course, the arhat.

A streamwinner who does not strive further, then, is like a university freshie who, upon completing the first academic year, or even graduating from the first-degree programme, takes a long leave of absence. He is so full of learning potential and very well qualified that he should go on to complete the rest of his academic training as soon as possible.<sup>39</sup>

### **1.2.3 “Phenomena” (*dhammā*)**

**1.2.3.1** In the Sutta, the Buddha explains the instrumental role meditation plays in “bringing about” (seeing the rising and falling of) phenomena (*dhammā*), so that we have a vision of true reality. In answer to Nandiya’s question, the Buddha declares that there are **2 kinds of “noble disciples”** (Nandiya’s term).

The 1<sup>st</sup> disciple is one who, despite having any or all of the limbs of streamwinning, does *not* further cultivate his mind properly, thus:

When the mind does not attain samadhi, phenomena [dharmas] do not appear.<sup>40</sup>

Because phenomena do *not* appear, he is regarded as “*one who dwells negligently*.”<sup>41</sup> [§§12-13, etc]

The 2<sup>nd</sup> disciple is one who has the 4 limbs of streamwinning, and practises mental cultivation properly, thus:

When the mind has attained samadhi, phenomena appear.<sup>42</sup>

Because phenomena *do* appear, he is regarded as “*one who dwells diligently*.”<sup>43</sup> [§§37-38, etc]]

<sup>37</sup> The non-returners, however, do not have any craving, so they will never experience lust-based sufferings the way streamwinners still do. See, eg, **Cūḷa Dukkha-k,khandha S** (M 14), SD 4.7. For a table on the 31 planes of existence, see SD 1.7 (Appendix).

<sup>38</sup> Profession: “The profession of religion; the declaration of belief in and obedience to religion, or of acceptance of and conformity to the faith and principles of any religious community; hence, the faith or religion which one professes” (Recorded usages in 1526, 1876) (OED),

<sup>39</sup> See also **Dakkhiṇa Vibhaṅga S** (M 142,5) + nn, SD 1,9.

<sup>40</sup> *Asamāhite citte dhammā na pātubhavanti*.

<sup>41</sup> *Dhammānaṃ apātubhāvā pamāda, vihārītv-eva saṅkhyam gacchati. Vihārītv-eva = vihārī iti eva.*

<sup>42</sup> *Samāhite citte dhammā pātubhavanti*.

**1.2.3.2** Note that *samādhi* is used here, not *jhāna*. *Samādhi* here refers both to *jhāna* and also some level of mental stillness or focus, and the ensuing calm and clarity (after emerging from dhyana or mental stillness) that allows us to clearly see the true nature of reality or phenomena (*dhamma*)<sup>44</sup> [§12].

**1.2.3.3** The commentary here (SA 3:289) and that on **the Pamāda, vihārī Sutta** (S 35.97)<sup>45</sup> explain the sentence, “phenomena do not appear” (*dhammā na pātubhavanti*) [§13], as meaning that the states of calm and insight (*samatha, vipassanā dhammā*) do not appear. (SA 2:385 ad S 35.97/4:78 f). This explanation is rather formal and scholastic, reflecting a time in Sinhala Buddhism (when the Commentaries were compiled) when textual study had apparently been given priority over meditation.

Clearly, the perception of impermanence (*anicca, saññā*) is closely related to attaining of streamwinning, as attested by **the (Anicca) Cakkhu Sutta** (S 25.1).<sup>46</sup> This same reflection is also often used in reflecting on the 5 aggregates, as evident from this stock passage, “Such is form, such is the *arising* of form, such is the *passing away* of form. Such is feeling ... perception ... formations ... consciousness.”<sup>47</sup> [1.2.3.5]

**1.2.3.4** The arising and falling of each aggregate are also often explained by way of conditionality, that is, dependent arising. **The Paṭisallāna Sutta** (S 22.6),<sup>48</sup> for example, explains this by way of diachronic (3-life) conditionality, while **the Upādāna Parivaṭṭa Sutta** (S 22.56)<sup>49</sup> and **the Satta-ṭ, ṭṭhāna Sutta** (S 22.57)<sup>50</sup> by way of synchronic (single-life) conditionality.<sup>51</sup> [2.2.1]

**The Mahā Saḷāyatana Sutta** (M 149) is another great text in this connection. The Sutta comprises two parts. Part I of the Sutta shows how “when the senses are not properly understood,” the aggregates continue to pile up. In short, this is how suffering arises.

In part II (“When the senses are properly understood”), each of the 6 sense-faculties is analyzed into faculty, object, sense-consciousness and sense-contact. Then, the feeling that arises is “known as seen as it really is” (that is, by way of watching its rise and fall). In this way, the 5 aggregates “do not continue to pile up upon one.” This is how suffering does *not* arise.<sup>52</sup>

**1.2.3.5 The (Saḷāyatana) Samādhi Sutta** (S 35.99) explains how samadhi (mental stillness) allows us “to understand things as they really are.” That is to say, with samadhi, we are able to see that the 6 sense-faculties and their respective consciousnesses (attention), contacts and feelings, are all impermanent.<sup>53</sup> Here, in the (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta [§13 etc; §38 etc] and also in **the Pamāda Vihārī Sutta** (S 35.97), it is stated that phenomena appear to a still mind (a mind with samadhi).<sup>54</sup>

In simpler terms, then, “phenomena” (*dhammā*) here refers to the impermanent nature of the body and the mind. This is the true nature of our conscious existence that we should habitually and wisely ob-

<sup>43</sup> *Dhammānaṃ pātubhāvā appamāda, vihārītv-eva saṅkhyam gacchati.*

<sup>44</sup> For a more detailed study, see **Samadhi**, SD 33.1a.

<sup>45</sup> S 35.97 (SD 47.6).

<sup>46</sup> S 25.1/3:225 (SD 16.7), and also the remaining 9 suttas in the same Okkanta Saṃyutta.

<sup>47</sup> See the 2 **Satipaṭṭhāna Ss** (D 22,14/2:301 f; M 10,38/1:61), **(Pañca-k,khandha) Samādhi S** (S 22.5/3:13f), **(Saḷāyatana) Samādhi S** (S 35.99/4:80) & also **Dasa,bala S 1** (S 12.21/2:27 f), **Dasa,bala S 2** (S 12.23/2:29-32), **Sīha S** (S 22.78/3:84-86), **Khemaka S** (S 22.89/3:126-132) and **Nāva S** (S 22.101/3:152-155).

<sup>48</sup> S 22.6/3:15 (SD 48.12).

<sup>49</sup> S 22.56/3:58-61 (SD 3.7).

<sup>50</sup> S 22.57/3:61-65 & SD 29.2.

<sup>51</sup> See **Dependent arising**, SD 5.16 (3+4+13). See S:B 743 n58. See also S:B 1411 n83.

<sup>52</sup> M 149 (SD 41.9).

<sup>53</sup> S 35.99/4:80 (SD 93.13).

<sup>54</sup> S 35.97,4 etc (SD 47.6).



serve. In other words, this is the perception of impermanence applied to the body and to the mind (which is a simpler model of the 5 aggregates).<sup>55</sup>

All this point to the perception of impermanence. Even on a simple level, but habitually and properly done, this meditation can bring about streamwinning in this life itself, as attested by **the (Anicca) Cakkhu Sutta** (S 25.1) and the other nine suttas in the same Okkanta Saṃyutta (S 25). [1.2.3.3]

**1.2.3.6 The perception of impermanence** can be applied to the body in two ways. The first is reflecting on our body as the 5 physical senses (*pañc'indriya*) (the eye, ear, nose, tongue and body). Each of these 5 sense-faculties is impermanent. We often live as if our sense-faculties are permanent, and thus become troubled or traumatized when we fall sick, or any of them fails to function properly, or stops functioning altogether.<sup>56</sup>

Essentially, for each of these aggregates, we should identify the 3 conditions for their arising:

- (1) the sense-faculty (eg, the conscious eye),
- (2) a cognate or related sense-object (a sight, colour, or shape), and
- (3) the appropriate attention.<sup>57</sup>

Even when the sense-faculties are working properly, they do so because of change, which gives meaning to what we sense. We can also reflect on any process of sensing, such as how we see. Such a reflection is a reflection on the sixth element, consciousness.<sup>58</sup>

**1.2.3.7** The second method is the perception of impermanence towards the body, which is done as a **reflection on the 4 elements**. The body is composed of the 4 elements (“earth” = solid aspects, “water” = liquid aspects, “fire” = heat and decay aspects, and “wind” = gaseousness and motion aspects). We can reflect on the 5<sup>th</sup> element as “space,” that is, bodily cavities (such as the oral cavity, the lungs, the belly, and so on).<sup>59</sup>

We first locate the element in our body or body-parts, noting, “This is the internal < ... > element. There is the external < ... > element. They are both simply the < ... > element. This is not mine, this I am not, this is not my self.”<sup>60</sup>

**1.2.3.8** The perception of impermanence should also be applied to **the mind**. In terms of the 5 aggregates, they are feeling, perception, formations, and consciousness.<sup>61</sup> How do the aggregates arise?

**Form** (*rūpa*) arises when we give it a name (*nāma*). A thing “exists” for us when we put our minds to it.<sup>62</sup> In this sense, our world is mind-made.

<sup>55</sup> On the reflection of the 5 aggregates, see SD 42.10 (2).

<sup>56</sup> On the reflection on the 4 elements, see SD 42.10 (2.1).

<sup>57</sup> This is known as a “triangle of experience,” how a sense-impression is formed: see **Madhu, piṇḍika S** (M 18,-16), SD 6.14.

<sup>58</sup> On how to reflect on the sense-faculties, see SD 42.10 (2.5).

<sup>59</sup> The first 5 elements are earth, water, fire, wind and space: see SD 17.2a (2-4).

<sup>60</sup> For the meditation on the 5 elements, see **Mahā Rāhu'ovāda S** (M 62,8-12) + SD 3.11 (1.3.3).

<sup>61</sup> Technically, as “name-and-form” (*nāma,rūpa*), “form” (*rūpa*) is the body [1.2.3.5], and “name” (*nāma*) are “feeling, perception, volition, contact [sense-impression], attention” (S 12.2,12/2:3), SD 5.11. Consciousness is not included because it underlies all the other 4 aggregates: our body is referred to as “the body along with its consciousness” (*sa,viññāṇaka,kāya*): see **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,19.2), SD 1.11 & **Dependent arising**, SD 5.16 (6). See SD 17.2a (12).

<sup>62</sup> Things, however, still exist in our absence, or when we do not perceive them. See **Nibbedhika (Pariyāya) S** (A 6.63), SD 6.11.

**Feeling** (*vedanā*) arises when any of our sense-faculties attends to an external object by way of the triangle of experience.<sup>63</sup> [1.2.3.6]

**Perception** (*saññā*) arises with feeling, when we recognize the hedonistic tone of an object or react with liking towards a pleasurable object, or with dislike towards an unpleasant object, or with neutral feeling towards a neutral object.

**Formations** (*saṅkhārā*) arise when we colour our perceptions with greed, grasping at a desirable object, or with hate, rejecting an undesirable object, or ignoring a neutral object.

**Consciousness** (*viññāṇa*) is the stage for all these drama, it is “a tale told by an idiot, full of sound and fury, signifying nothing.”<sup>64</sup> In meditation, we go back to the true basics, and work to see life clearly and directly on its most fundamental level, as it were.<sup>65</sup>

### 1.3 NANDIYA

**1.3.1 Occurrences.** Malalaskera’s Dictionary of Pali Proper Names (DPPN) lists a total of 7 entries for the name “Nandiya.” Only one is a monk; the others are a layman, a householder, a wanderer, a monkey, a deer, and an ancient king. The animals are the Buddha in past lives.<sup>66</sup>

**1.3.2 Nandiya Thera (Nandiya 1),** the elder monk, belonged to a Sakya family and was called Nandiya (“bringing delight”) because his birth brought joy to the family. He renounced at the same time as Anuruddha, Kimbila and the others, and soon attained arhathood. Thereafter he dwelt with his companions in the deer park in the Eastern Bamboo Grove (*pācīna, vamsa mīga, dāya*, V 1:350 f).<sup>67</sup>

It is to them that the teachings of **the (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta** are given (M 128).<sup>68</sup> Later, according to **the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta** (M 31), they seem to be living in the Go,siṅga sal grove (*gosiṅga sāla, vana*).<sup>69</sup> **The Nandiya Thera, gāthā** is a single verse:

<i>Obhāsa, jātaṃ phala, gaṃ cittaṃ yassa abhiṅhaso tādisaṃ bhikkhuṃ āsajja kaṅha dukkhaṃ nigacchasīti</i>	Whose mind is constantly <sup>70</sup> radiant and ever fruitful— attacking such a monk, you will come to grief, Dark One [Kaṅha]!” (Tha 25)
---	---

Its commentary relates that once Mara appears before Nandiya in a terrible form, Nandiya, knowing his nature, drives him away with this verse. (ThaA 1:87)

In the time of Padum’uttara Buddha, it is said, Nandiya built a sandalwood altar at the Buddha’s shrine (*cetiya*) and held great celebrations. Fifteen aeons [world-cycles] ago, Nandiya was eight times born as king under the name of Samatta (or Samagga).<sup>71</sup> He is probably identical with **Saparivāriya** of the Apadāna.<sup>72</sup>

<sup>63</sup> See esp **Madhu, piṇḍika S** (M 18,16-19/1:111-113), SD 6.14.

<sup>64</sup> Shakespeare, *Macbeth* 5.5.28-30.

<sup>65</sup> The nn in this section are almost identical to SD 42.10 (2.6.1), but further see (2.6.2).

<sup>66</sup> The index of PTS ed of **Apadāna** lists “Nandiya (khattiya), 235,” but there is no such ref.

<sup>67</sup> See SD 5.18 (6).

<sup>68</sup> M 128/5.18 (SD 5.18).

<sup>69</sup> M 31,2/1:205 (SD 44.11).

<sup>70</sup> In the translation, lines ab here are the reverse of the Pali lines.

<sup>71</sup> Tha 25; ThaA 82 f.

<sup>72</sup> **Therāpadāna** 144 (Ap 1:172); ApA 441.

The Majjhima Commentary says that he is a “beloved companion” (*piya, sahaāya*), that is, close friend, of Kimbila (MA 2:240). According to **the Mahāvastu**, Nandiya (there called Nandika) is the son of Śukrodana, and brother of Nandana, both of whom renounce the world (Mvst 3:177).

**1.3.3 Nandiya the Sakya layman (Nandiya 2).** A Sakya layman, evidently different from Nandiya 1. He visits the Buddha at the Nigrodh’ārāma in Kapila, vatthu, where, in answer to his question, the Buddha speaks of two kinds of noble disciples, that is, the one who dwells heedless, and the one who is diligent. The heedless one remains content with faith in the 3 jewels and moral virtue, but the diligent one goes on to cultivate mindfulness and meditation to attain at least streamwinning. (S 55.40)<sup>73</sup>

Later, according to **the (Ekā, dasaka) Nandiya Sutta** (A 11.14), when the Buddha returns to Sāvattihī for the rains, Nandiya also goes there, on some business. There, he visits the Buddha from time to time. At the end of the rains, when the Buddha and the monks are about to start on their tour, Nandiya goes to the Buddha and is taught the 11 conditions leading to the destruction of evil.<sup>74</sup>

This is, in fact, the Nandiya of our (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta here.

**1.3.4 Nandiya, a householder of Benares (Nandiya 3).** He is a filial householder of Benares who looks after his parents. When they want him to marry Revatī, he refuses because she belongs to a family who lacks faith in the Buddha. But when Revatī offers to help Nandiya in all his work, he agrees and they marry.

When Nandiya’s parents die, leaving him very wealthy, he uses his wealth to regularly feed the poor and needy. Later, he builds “four halls”<sup>75</sup> in the great monastery at Isi, patana, furnishing it with great splendour. On the day of its dedication to the Buddha and the monks, it is said, as the water of donation falls on the Buddha’s hand, there arises in Tāvatisa a celestial mansion, measuring 12 leagues<sup>76</sup> in each direction, for Nandiya’s use.

According to **the Nandiya Vatthu** (DhA 16.8), during one of Moggallāna’s visits to Tāvatisa, he sees this mansion, and is told by many celestial nymphs there that they are awaiting Nandiya’s arrival.<sup>77</sup> The Vimāna Vatthu Commentary relates that after a life devoted to good deeds, Nandiya dies, and is reborn in his celestial mansion. Revatī, however, after her husband Nandiya’s death, not only stops offering alms but even abuses the monks. (VvA 220-223)

A late pious legend, given in the Vimāna, vatthu Commentary, says that, on account of Revatī’s bad karma, she is cast alive into the “crowded hell” (*ussada niraya*) on the instruction of Vessavaṇa, one of the 4 Great Kings (*cātum, mahā, rājika*), or guardians of the quarters, who guards the northern quarter, in his kingdom of yakshas.<sup>78</sup>

<sup>73</sup> S 55.40 (SD 47.1), see main title below.

<sup>74</sup> A 11.14/5:334-337 (SD 99.2).

<sup>75</sup> “The four halls,” *catus, sālam*. Cf Cūḷa, vaṃsa 73.23. According to Geiger (Cuv:G 2.3.3), this was a “square court surrounded on all sides by halls open to the interior.” It was the name of a hall in Anurādhapura, which was probably seen by Dhammapāla himself. Jayawickrama notes that the cognate term, *catussālāvaka*, is similarly singular. See VvA:M 353 n15.

<sup>76</sup> A league (*yojana*) is generally said to be about 11.2 km (7 mi). So 12 leagues would be about 134.4 km (84 mi). See SD 4.17 (1.2.2).

<sup>77</sup> DhA 16.9/3:290-294. From this story is derived almost verbatim the VvA story of Nandiya’s bad wife, Revatī (VvA 5.2/220 f). Vv 222-222, however, is missing from the DhA. This VvA story is also identical to **Revatī Peta, -vatthu** (Pv 4.4 :: PvA 4.4/257). Interestingly, at this stage in the literary development of Buddhist hagiology and literature, hell-beings and pretas are identical beings. We have a hint here that *peta* simply means “departed ones” in a broad sense, not as a realm of “hungry ghosts” as popularly believed today in ethnic Buddhism.

<sup>78</sup> VvA 222-224 (on **Revatī Vv**, Vv 5.2). It should be understood that Vessavaṇa does not decide on her (or anyone’s) karma, but seems merely to act as karmic agents in a narrative or pious fiction sense: see esp **Neyy’attha Nī’tattha S** (A 2.3.5+6), SD 2.6b. Such stories are late (post-Buddha) hagiographical accounts that regard karma as a

**1.3.5 Nandiya the wanderer (Nandiya 4).** According to **the (Paribbājaka) Nandiya Sutta** (S 45.10), he is a wanderer (*paribbājaka*) who visits the Buddha at Jetavana and asks him about the conditions for attaining nirvana. The Buddha teaches him the noble eightfold path. (S 45.10/5:11)

## 2 Qualities related to streamwinning<sup>79</sup>

### 2.1 THE 4 LIMBS FOR STREAMWINNING (*sotāpatti-y-aṅga*)

**2.1.0 The qualities of a streamwinner.** **The Ogadha Sutta** (S 55.2) simply defines the “qualities of a streamwinner” (*\*sotāpanna,dhamma*) as follows:

(1) wise faith <sup>80</sup> in the Buddha,	<i>buddhe aveccappasāda</i>	[§§8, 33]
(2) wise faith in the Dharma,	<i>dhamme aveccappasādena</i>	[§§14, 39]
(3) wise faith in the Sangha, and	<i>saṅghe aveccappasādena</i>	[§§20, 45]
(4) moral virtue dear to the noble ones.	<i>ariya,kanta sīla</i>	[§§26. 51]

(S 55.2), SD 3.3(4.1.4)

Here, the term “qualities of a streamwinner” is a general one, which is probably an old term, which is later replaced by the phrasal term, “the limbs of streamwinning” (*sotāpannassa aṅga*) [2.2] in contrast to “the limbs for streamwinning” (*sotāpatti-y-aṅga*) [2.1.2]. However, as we will see below, their usages significantly overlap.

**2.1.1 Qualities to be cultivated.** Where the person involved is clearly a non-streamwinner, the qualities he should cultivate for his spiritual development are usually called “**the limbs for streamwinning**” (*sotāpatti-y-aṅga*). According to **the (Sotāpatti-y-) Aṅga Sutta** (S 55.50), these 4 limbs for streamwinning, “when cultivated, often developed, lead to the realization of the fruit of streamwinning,” comprise the following:

(1) Associating with true individuals. <sup>81</sup>	<i>sappurisa,samseva</i>
(2) Hearing the true teaching.	<i>saddhamma,savana</i>
(3) Wise attention.	<i>yoniso,manasikāra</i>
(4) Practice of the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.	<i>dhammānudhamma,paṭipatti</i>

(S 55.50/5:404), SD 70.1(1)<sup>82</sup>

In other words, these are 4 conditions that conduce to the attaining of streamwinning in someone who is not yet a streamwinner.<sup>83</sup>

---

kind of dispensation of rewards and punishments. They should at best be taken to be dramatic personifications of karmic processes. In simple terms, we can say that the impious Revatī suffered a hellish life in due course on account of her selfishness and rudeness.

<sup>79</sup> Before reading this section, see SD 23.2b (1.3) on the differences between *sotāpannassa aṅga* and *sotāpatti-y-aṅga*.

<sup>80</sup> On the def of wise faith (*avecca-p,pasāda*), see **Pañca Vera Bhaya S 1** (S 12.41,10-14) n, SD 3.3(4.2).

<sup>81</sup> “True individuals,” *sappurisā*, also “virtuous persons,” “ideal persons,” ie, true spiritual practitioners. On these qualities, see **Sappurisa S** (M 113/3:37-45), SD 29.6. They are also given at **D 33.2.2(6)/3:252**, **34.1.8(7)/ 3:283**; **Cūḷa Puṇṇama S** (M 110,14-24/3:23 f), SD 45.4; **Dhammaññū S (A 7.64/4:113)**, SD 30.10; **(Mahā,megha) Sappurisa S (A 8.38/4:144)**, SD 30.10, also 23.7.

<sup>82</sup> Also def as such in **Saṅgīti S** (D 3:227); **(Sotāpatti) Sāriputta S 2** (S 55.5/5:347 f), SD 16.5; **(Sotāpatti) Phala S** (S 55.55/5:410 f), SD 3.3(4.1).

**2.1.2 Sotāpatti-y-aṅga as “the limbs of streamwinning.** These are the qualities defining a full-fledged streamwinner, and Anātha,piṇḍika does not know that he is one yet. **The Anātha,piṇḍika Sutta 1** (S 55.26)<sup>84</sup> uses the term *sotāpatti-y-aṅga* in the sense of “the limbs of streamwinning,” that is, as wise faith in the 3 jewels, and moral virtue dear to the noble ones [2.1.0]. Chronologically, this Sutta should probably be placed after the Anātha,piṇḍika Sutta 2 (S 55.27) [2.2.2(2)], that is, when Anātha,piṇḍika is already a streamwinner and does *not* know that he is one. The Sutta recounts how the elder Sāriputta counsels the ailing Anātha,piṇḍika by reminding him of *the 4 limbs of a streamwinner*, and to reflect on them, so that his pains would subside.

Sāriputta then reminds Anātha,piṇḍika that he also has the 10 rightness (*sammatta*), that is, when he “sees” or reflects on (*samanupassati*) his own right view, right thought, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right samadhi, right knowledge, and right freedom, he would free himself of his pains. This is called the “4 limbs of streamwinning in their 10 modes.”<sup>85</sup>

It is correct to regard the “4 limbs of streamwinning in their 10 modes” (*\*dasākāra sotāpatti-y-aṅga*) as a technical term (tt) because it has a fixed technical sense. The phrase *sotāpatti-y-aṅga*, however, is *not* strictly speaking, a technical term, as it has different senses, depending on how the Buddha uses it or its context. Such words can be called “**phrasal terms**,” whose special meanings comes from their context. This is an interesting characteristic, even hallmark, of the early Buddhist texts: technical terms are rare, or not as common as later works.<sup>86</sup>

## 2.2 THE 4 LIMBS OF A STREAMWINNER (*sotāpannassa aṅga*)

**2.2.1 Definition.** Traditionally, the 4 limbs of a streamwinner comprise wise faith<sup>87</sup> in the 3 jewels, and moral virtue dear to the noble ones, as defined in **the Ogadha Sutta** (S 55.2) [2.1.0]. These qualities are *usually* used for those of a full-fledged streamwinner. In one case at least, the fourth limb—moral virtue dear to the noble ones—is replaced by that of charity (*cāga*),<sup>88</sup> as in **the Thapati Sutta** (S 55.6).<sup>89</sup> In some contexts, this phrasal term refers to a virtuous person who is not yet a streamwinner, which we will now examine.

**2.2.2 Not yet streamwinners.** This definition of the “limbs of a streamwinner” (*sotāpannassa aṅga*) is found, for example, in **the Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 1** (S 12.41)<sup>90</sup> and **the Anātha,piṇḍika Sutta 2** (S 55.-27).<sup>91</sup> In all these contexts, they clearly refer to those who are *not* yet streamwinners.<sup>92</sup> In other words, a follower may have any or all of such qualities, but they have yet to attain streamwinning. We might call them “good worldlings” (*kalyāṇa puthujjana*), as they are not yet aryas or noble saints (*ariya*), but have the potential of further evolving spiritually.

<sup>83</sup> For details on these 4 qualities, see SD 3.3 (4.1.1).

<sup>84</sup> S 55.26,6-9/5:381 f @ SD 23.2a.

<sup>85</sup> *Sotāpatti-y-aṅgāni dasahi akarehi*: S 55.26,6-9/5:381 f @ SD 23.2a.

<sup>86</sup> For another example, see the usage of “spiritual faculty” (*indriya*) in the early texts: SD 10.4 (3.1.1.0).

<sup>87</sup> On the def of wise faith (*avecca-p,pasāda*), see **Pañca Vera Bhaya S 1** (S 12.41,10-14) n, SD 3.3(4.2).

<sup>88</sup> For details, see Vism 7.107-114/223 f.

<sup>89</sup> “He dwells at home with a heart free from the stain of stinginess, devoted to charity, open-handed, delighting in giving, devoted to charity, delighting to have a share in giving” (*vigata,mala,maccherena cetasā ajjh’āgāraṃ vasati mutta,cāgo payata,pāṇi vossagga,rato yāca,yogo dāna,samvibhāga,rato*): S 55.6,24(4), SD 42.7.

<sup>90</sup> S 12.41,10-14/2:68-70 @ SD 3.3 (4.2).

<sup>91</sup> S 55.27,8/5:386 f @ SD 23.2b.

<sup>92</sup> On the streamwinner (*sotāpanna*), see SD 3.3 (5).

(1) In the **Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta** (S 12.41), the practitioner first cultivates moral virtue by keeping to the 5 precepts, so that he overcomes the 5 hates (*vera*) (killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, lying and intoxication) and has no more fears (*bhaya*) of the repercussions of such bad karma. In this way, he builds up his faith in the 3 jewels and moral virtue dear to the noble ones. With such a spiritual foundation, he goes on to “clearly see and penetrate with wisdom” the noble way (*ariya ñāya*), that is, he understands the nature of conditionality (*idap,paccayatā*) and dependent arising (*paṭicca samuppāda*). Thus, overcoming the 5 hates and fears, accomplishing the 4 limbs of streamwinning, and seeing and penetrating the noble way, he becomes a streamwinner.<sup>93</sup>

(2) **The Anātha,piṇḍika Sutta 2** (S 55.27) records how the elder Ānanda counsels the ailing Anātha,piṇḍika (clearly not yet a streamwinner) by reminding him that he is free of the fear of death of those who are faithless, that is, lacking faith in the 3 jewels and moral virtue dear to the noble ones. Anātha,piṇḍika, on the other hand, has wise faith in the 3 jewels and moral virtue dear to the noble ones. Anātha,piṇḍika then responds by declaring that he indeed has these 4 limbs of a streamwinner.

The Sutta closes with Ānanda declaring, “You have declared the fruit of streamwinning.”<sup>94</sup> However, only in **the Anātha,piṇḍika Sutta 1** (S 55.26), after Sāriputta’s admonition, does Anātha,piṇḍika become fully aware of his attaining streamwinning (that is, with Sariputta’s mention of the “4 limbs of streamwinning in their 10 modes”) [2.1.2].

## 2.3 USAGES OF TERMS

**2.3.1 The (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta on streamwinning.** The (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta defines **the 4 limbs of streamwinning** (*sotāpatti-y-aṅgā*) as wise faith in the 3 jewels, and moral virtue dear to the noble ones [§§8+14+20+26+33+39+45+51]. We have noted the usage of *sotāpatti-y-aṅga* as “the limbs of streamwinning,” when it refers to someone who already *has* those limbs (faith in the 3 jewels, and moral virtue dear to the noble ones), but is *not* yet a streamwinner [2.1.1]. This is, in fact, how the phrasal term [2.1.2] is used in this Sutta.

This usage is clearly intentional, that is, to stress on the necessity of meditation and mindfulness for spiritual progress, that is, having mere faith, even wise faith, in the 3 jewels, and mere moral virtue, even if they are dear to the noble ones, *are not enough*. We need to take a further step, that of cultivating the mind so that we are able to see directly into true reality, so that we attain self-awakening. [3.2].

### 2.3.2 Table of usages

**2.3.2.1** Here is a table of the terms related to the characteristics, their English translations, and how they are used:

<u>Pali term</u>	<u>English translation</u>	<u>Usage</u>	
(1) <i>sotāpatti-y-aṅga</i> 1	the limbs for streamwinning	for one <i>not yet</i> a streamwinner	[2.1.1]
(2) <i>sotāpatti-y-aṅga</i> 2	the limbs of streamwinning	for a <i>latent</i> streamwinner <sup>95</sup>	[2.1.2]
(3) <i>sotāpannassa aṅga</i> 1	the limbs of a streamwinner	for one <i>going to be</i> a streamwinner <sup>96</sup>	[2.2.2]
(4) <i>sotāpannassa aṅga</i> 2	the limbs of a streamwinner	of one who <i>is</i> a streamwinner	[2.2.1]

<sup>93</sup> S 12.41/2:68-70 @ SD 3.3(4.2).

<sup>94</sup> S 55.27,8/5:386 f @ SD 23.2b.

<sup>95</sup> Such a person is one who has not realized that he has attained streamwinning, ie, he has all the qualities of a streamwinner. However, in time, esp with a deeper understanding of the Dharma or through wise counsel of a noble saint, he would come to accept that he is a streamwinner.

<sup>96</sup> One who is *not yet* a streamwinner, ie, not even attained streamwinning of the path (*sotāpatti,magga*).

**2.3.2.2** The first term (*sotāpatti-y-aṅga 1*) refers to the qualities that need to be fulfilled before we can become a streamwinner. This term is used in reference to the qualities as listed in **the (Sotāpatti-y-) Aṅga Sutta** (S 55.50), that is, association with true individuals, hearing the true teaching, wise attention, and proper Dharma practice [2.1.1].

**2.3.2.3** The second term (*sotāpatti-y-aṅga 2*), “the limbs of streamwinning (*sotāpatti-y-aṅga 2*), are the qualities of a latent streamwinner, that is, one, like Anātha,piṇḍika in **the Anātha,piṇḍika Sutta 2** (S 55.27) [2.1.2], who has all the qualities of a streamwinner, but being one, he does not know it. He is made aware of his true state or he himself realizes it in time. In this Sutta, it is the arhat Sāriputta who declares to Anātha,piṇḍika that he is a streamwinner [2.1.2].

**2.3.2.4** The third term (*sotāpanassa aṅga 1*), “the limbs of a streamwinner,” are the qualities of a virtuous person who is *not* yet a streamwinner, as clear from the (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta. Here, despite having all such qualities, the person has yet to cultivate his mind toward seeing into the true reality of things or “phenomena” (*dhamma*) [1.2.3]. The Sutta stresses the urgency of making this effort.

As such, we can, alternatively, translate this term as “the limbs *for* being a streamwinner,” which brings out this sense, but which is a bit awkward. Although we may “externally” show the qualities of a streamwinner—that is, faith in the 3 jewels and moral virtue dear to the noble ones—we may still not be a streamwinner yet. However, with sustained practice, it is just a matter of time that we will attain it, and then we may or may not declare it to the world.<sup>97</sup>

**2.3.2.5** The fourth term (*sotāpannassa aṅga 2*)—which is equivalent to the second—refers to the qualities of one who has attained streamwinning, a full-fledged streamwinner. In other words, he is one enjoying the fruit of streamwinning, like Anātha,piṇḍika in **the Anātha,piṇḍika Sutta 1** (S 55.26), who has all the qualities of a streamwinner, and is yet unaware of it [2.2.2].

### 3 Streamwinning and beyond

#### 3.1 MEDITATION PROGRESS

##### 3.1.1 Basic practice

**3.1.1.1** The (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta is a very instructive Sutta on the necessity of meditation and mindfulness for spiritual progress towards self-liberation. In sutta terms, this vital initial effort is **the perception of impermanence** (*anicca,saññā*), or that this perception should be explained to the practitioner so that he will understand its significance and so practise it.

**3.1.1.2** The Sutta’s key line alluding to meditation is this:

When the mind has attained samadhi, phenomena appear (*samāhite citte dhammā pātubhavanti*).  
[§37]

---

<sup>97</sup> It is vital to note that we are *not* streamwinners simply because we declare ourselves so. A streamwinner might jubilantly declare this fact in a spontaneous utterance (*udāna*), and in the right context. He would never use this as a title or status marker. In short, he is a thoroughly humble, inspiring and exemplary person. A monastic, on the other hand, would *never* declare his attainment, for fear of breaking the 4<sup>th</sup> defeat rule (Pār 1 @ V 3:91,19-25), or that the laity would misconstrue such an attainment, even if it were true.

We have already noted that the phrase “**phenomena appear**” (*dharmā pātubhavanti*), according to the Commentaries, refers to the arising of the states of calm and insight (*samatha, vipassanā dhammā*) in connection with the 3 characteristics of the 5 aggregates [1.2.3.3]. This meditation is described in the stock passage, “Such is form, such is the arising of form, such is the passing away of form; such is feeling... perception ... formations ... consciousness,” which is found in such suttas as the following:

<b>Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta</b>	D 22,14/2:301 f	SD 13.2
<b>Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta</b>	M 10,38/1:61	SD 13.3
<b>(Khandha) Samādhi Sutta</b>	S 22.5/3:13f	SD 7.16
<b>(Saḷāyatana) Samādhi Sutta</b>	S 35.99/4:80	SD 107.7
<b>Dasa,bala Sutta 1</b>	S 12.21/2:27 f	SD 104.3
<b>Dasa,bala Sutta 2</b>	S 12.22/2:28 f	SD 104.4
<b>(Anicca) Sīha Sutta</b>	S 22.78/3:84-86	SD 42.10
<b>Khemaka Sutta</b>	S 22.89/3:126-132	SD 14.13
<b>Vāsi,jaṭa Sutta</b>	S 22.101,4/3:152-155	SD 15.2

We are also reminded to see the Sutta’s lesson in practical terms, and practise the perception of impermanence. [1.2.3.5]

### 3.2 STREAMWINNING AS LAUNCHING-PAD FOR AWAKENING

#### 3.2.1 Point of departure

**3.2.1.1** The (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta stresses the necessity of meditation and mindfulness for spiritual progress, that is, having mere faith, even wise faith, in the 3 jewels, and mere moral virtue, even if they are dear to the noble ones, *are not enough*. We need to take a further step, that of cultivating the mind so that we are able to see directly into true reality, so that we attain self-awakening [2.3.1].

This is, in fact, early Buddhism’s vital point of departure from the later teachings, especially those of classical Mahāyāna and later teachings. The Lotus Sutra (a text written about the 1st century CE, around the rise of Christianity), for example, teaches that the arhat’s awakening is “not enough,” and that they need to become “Buddhas.” Such a notion is clearly against the Buddha declaring, at the close of **the Arhata Suttas 1 & 2** (S 22.76+77), that the arhats are “the foremost, the best in the world”<sup>98</sup>

**3.2.1.2** There are also forms of later Buddhism, especially those of the “Pure Land” affiliation, which teaches pure faith in the Buddha Amitābha (a non-historical “cosmic” Mahāyāna Buddha) whose paradise, Sukhāvātī (“the Happy Realm” or “Western Paradise”) where we are reborn merely by reciting the homage-mantra to his name, *Namo amitābhāya buddhāya* (or its various ethnic versions). Is this a late Buddhist response to the God-centred teaching of “grace through faith,” or is it a sign of theistic influence on later Buddhism?

Such a belief is apparently based on the teaching of the “recollection on the Buddha” (*buddhānusati*), where, for example, we keep reciting *buddho* while recalling the Buddha’s virtues, as an aid to

<sup>98</sup> The full statement is: “Bhikkhus, to whatever extent there are the abodes of beings, even up to the foremost existence [viz, the sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception], they are the foremost, the best in the world, that is to say, the arhats” (*Yāvatā bhikkhave satt’āvāsā yāvatā bhav’aggam, ete aggā ete seṭṭhā lokasmim yad idam arahantōti*), S 22.76,10/3:83 @ SD 26.7 = S 22.77,26/3:84 @ SD 42.9. See also Reflection, “To be Bodhisattva, be arhat first,” R198, 2011.



mental concentration or stillness.<sup>99</sup> Such a practice is acceptable, even expeditious, in the light of the Buddha’s teaching. Beyond this, however, as a ritual of faith in some cosmic Buddha introduced after the time of the historical Buddha and contrary to his teaching, it is unlikely to bring such benefits of mental cultivation as a basis for self-awakening as taught in early Buddhism.<sup>100</sup>

### **3.2.2 Properly preparing for the journey**

**3.2.2.1 STREAMWINNING.** The first step on the path, then, is the attaining of streamwinning. This is the real start on the journey following the noble eightfold path heading for the “ancient city” of nirvana.<sup>101</sup> How do we begin such an inward spiritual journey, one of enjoying the blissfully beautiful inner space that opens up into self-awakening and full freedom?

To properly begin a spiritual journey (as in any journey), we have the faith that we will reach our destination. We must have faith in both the journey (including the path) and the goal itself. This is our faith in the 3 jewels (*ratana-t, taya*), that is, the Buddha, the Dharma and the sangha, and cultivate moral virtue dear to the noble ones. The Buddha is our ideal or vision of self-awakening. The Dharma is the path of self-cultivation towards that ideal. The sangha are noble saints who are the inspiring exemplars of such self-awakened liberated individuals. Moral virtue is our personal health so that we are strong enough to complete the journey. [3.2.2.5]

**3.2.2.2 FAITH IN THE HISTORICAL BUDDHA.** A streamwinner has faith in only the “original” or historical Buddha,<sup>102</sup> that is, Gotama Buddha, whose teaching we still remember and whose example we follow. The future “Buddha” is *not* a buddha yet. It is **Gotama Buddha** who, in his wisdom and compassion, bequeathed to us the liberating Dharma. For this, we show our deep gratitude by practising it—this is our supreme worship.<sup>103</sup> This is like inheriting our parents’ estate and honour. We would not say that we are waiting for some future parent! We don’t need to, as we have our inheritance to enjoy and guard. This way, we are truly Dharma heirs.

If we say that some later teaching, no matter how “powerful” or remarkable, is “more advanced” than the Buddha’s own suttas, we are only and surely rejecting the Buddha Dharma. If we say that a later or new sectarian teaching could not be understood by the Buddha’s audience and was hidden away mysteriously for a later time, we are saying that the Buddha does not know any skillful means to speak on the level of his audience.<sup>104</sup> If we say that such a later teaching was hidden in some naga world or fabulous place, we must take it only as a myth that has spun a new dogma.

**3.2.2.3 ARHATHOOD PERICOPES.** If we (quoting, say, the Lotus Sutra) say that the arhats have not completed their training, or still need to become Buddhas, we are clearly contradicting what is repeatedly declared in **the *abbhaññāsi* pericope** or “essential arhathood stock passage,” thus:

<sup>99</sup> See *Buddhānussati*, SD 15.7.

<sup>100</sup> See eg Reflection, “Back to the Buddha,” R 367, 2014.

<sup>101</sup> On the parable of the ancient city, see **Nagara S** (S 12.65,19-21), SD 14.2.

<sup>102</sup> “Original” is within quote-marks because there is only one Buddha in our universe. It does not mean that there are other Buddhas in our own times (within a buddha-period). This is just like there is only one captain of a ship, or that we only need to discover fire once (once the Buddha Dharma has been discovered and declared, the Dharma wheel need not be turned again, except in personal practice). To speak of any more “Wheel-turnings” (with the big W) is to degrade the Buddha and ritualize the Dharma.

<sup>103</sup> See **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16,5.3.2) + SD 9 (7.2).

<sup>104</sup> See **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16), where the Buddha declares that he is able to speak convincingly to any audience (D 16,3.21-23), SD 9.

He directly knew: “Birth is ended, the holy life has been lived, done what is to be done, there is no more of this state of being.”

And the venerable <so-and-so> became one of the arhats.

(D 16,5.31), SD 9<sup>105</sup>

Or, more succinctly, this is stated in **the *paṭicaya pericope*** or shorter arhathood stock passage as that “the arhat has nothing further that needs to be done or to repeat what has been done.”<sup>106</sup> Any suggestion that an arhat needs to do “more” (such as becoming a Buddha) is a very serious wrong view. This kind of misrepresentation of the Buddha and his teaching is wrong, because there arises “reasonable ground” (*saha, dhammika*) for disputation and censure.<sup>107</sup> Our karmic retributions are worse: rebirth as animals, if we persist in such base ignorance; or hellish sufferings, if we induce others to believe such false views.<sup>108</sup>

In **the Mahā Tanhā,saṅkhaya Sutta** (M 38), for example, the monk Sāti is warned by the monks, “Do not misrepresent the Blessed One: it is not good to misrepresent the Blessed One.”<sup>109</sup> When he persists in holding on to his wrong view (that it is the “same consciousness” that is reborn), the Buddha reprimands him to be “a misguided one” (*mogha, purisa*), a phrase which translates as “hollow person,” and goes on to warn him, “[Y]ou, misguided one, have misrepresented us by your wrong grasp and injured yourself, and stored up much demerit—for, this will bring you harm and suffering for a long time.”<sup>110</sup>

Elsewhere, the Buddha is even more intolerant of wrong views. To Puṇṇa the dog ascetic, the Buddha declares that if we behave like an animal we would be reborn as one. However, if we hold the wrong view that, “By this moral virtue, or this vow, or this asceticism, or this celibacy, I will become a deva or one amongst them”—this is wrong view. “Puṇṇa, there are two destinies for one with wrong view, I say: either hell or the animal kingdom!”<sup>111</sup>

**3.2.2.4 FAITH IN THE DHARMA.** Faith in the Dharma means that we look up to the Buddha Dharma as the only means of personal and mental cultivation for the sake of awakening in this life itself, at least as streamwinners (*sotāpanna*). If we are diligent in overcoming a bit more of the 3 unwholesome roots (*akusala, mūla*) of greed, hate and delusion,<sup>112</sup> we would become once-returners (*sākadāgāmi*), meaning

<sup>105</sup> This is itself part of the longer arhathood pericope, see **Mahā, parinibbāna S** (D 16,5.31/2:153, Subhadda). For other occurrences, see **Mahā Sīha, nāda S** (D 8,24/1:176 f, Acela Kassapa), **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9,56/1:203, Citta Hatthi, sāri,putta), **Cakka, vatti Sīha, nāda S** (D 26,26/3:77, Saṅkha); **Vatthūpama S** (M 7,22/1:40, Sundarika Bhāra, dvāja), **Kukkura, vatika S** (M 57,15/1:391 f, Seniya Kukkura, vatika), **Mahā Vaccha, gotta S** (M 73,26/1:496, Vaccha, gotta), **Māgandiya S** (M 75,28/1:513), **Ratṭha, pāla S** (M 82,14/2:61), **Aṅguli, māla S** (M 86,16/2:103), **Sela S** (M 92,27/2:146 = Sn p 112), **Bakkula S** (M 124,39/3:127); **S 1:140** (Brahma, deva), 161 (a Bhāra, dvāja), 163 (Akkosaka Bhāra, dvāja), 170 (Sundarika Bhāra, dvāja), **2:22** (Acela Kassapa), **3:35** (a monk), 74 (a monk), **4:38** (Miga, jāla), 64 (Bāhiya), 76 (Māluṅkyā, putta), 302 (Acela Kassapa), **5:144** (a monk), 166 (Bāhiya), 187 f (a monk); **A 1:282** (Anuruddha), **2:249** (Māluṅkyā, putta), **3:70** (a monk), 217 (Gavesī), 376 (Soṇa), 399 (Citta Hatthi, sāri, putta), **4:235** (Anuruddha), 301 (a monk); **U 23** (Nanda); **Sn p16** (Kasi Bhāra, dvāja), p112 (Sela = M 92): see S:B 433 n 376. See also **Puṇṇ’ovāda S** (M 145,2/3:267); **S 2:244**, **3:35**, 36, 73, 187, 198, 199, **4:37**, 48, 54, 60, 63, 72, 145, **5:143**, 165, 166 (×2), 187, 188; **A 2:248**, **4:143**, 299. On the vimutti arhathood pericope (refs), see **(Catukka) Samaṇa S** (A 4.239,5.2) n, SD 49.14.

<sup>106</sup> *N’atthi khv-āvuso arahato uttari karaṇiyam, katassa vā paticayo.* **Silavanta S** (S 22.122,19), SD 47.4. On *paṭicaya* and more refs for this pericope, see SD 47.4 (2.2).

<sup>107</sup> For details, see **(Majjhima) Jīvaka S** (M 55,3.2) n, SD 43.4..

<sup>108</sup> **Lohicca S** (D 12,10 etc) + SD 34.8 (3).

<sup>109</sup> M 38,3.4 (SD 7.10).

<sup>110</sup> M 38,5.4 (SD 7.10).

<sup>111</sup> M 57,3/1:388 + SD 23.11 (5.1.3). Cf **(Ānanda) Subha S** (D 10), which states that actions done through wrong views bring about rebirth in “a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell” (D 10,2.33.2), SD 40.13.

<sup>112</sup> On the 3 unwholesome roots, see **Mūla S** (A 3.69/1:201-205), SD 18.2; **(Kamma) Nidāna S** (A 3.33), SD 4.14 (1.5).

that we would fully awaken in the following life. Both these spiritual paths entail our keeping to at least the 5 precepts and keeping ourselves mindful in wholesome ways.

If we aspire further, especially as renunciants (as monks and nuns, or as lay renunciants), then we need also to keep to the “holy life” (*brahma, cariya*), that is, observe celibacy. This means having neither sex nor family (the two are closely related), so that we can fully devote ourselves to the practice of meditation for the attaining of dhyana.<sup>113</sup>

Based on this profound sense-freed mental calm and clarity, our mindfulness becomes so clear and joyful that we simply are no more attracted to physical pleasures. We are naturally and profoundly blissful almost all the time, which is greatly conducive to the rise of liberating wisdom. If we still have some concern for others or the world, then we would become non-returners (*anāgāmī*). If we are fully free from all taints and views, then we would become arhats (*arahata*).<sup>114</sup>

**3.2.2.5 AT LEAST STREAMWINNING.** In short, we only need to aspire to attain **streamwinning** in this life itself [3.2.2.1]. Only streamwinning prevents us from falling into the lower realms of the exploitative asuras, the cyclic rut of the animals, the addictive preta underworld, or the violently painful hell-beings. Even if we are reborn in the heavens on account of some merits we have accumulated, when that karmic support is exhausted, we fall straight into the lower worlds, even the hells! This is a game of cosmic snakes and ladders.<sup>115</sup>

**3.2.2.6 THE PATH OF INDIVIDUAL AWAKENING.** The suttas teach us an alternative path to awakening if we, for any reason, have difficulty in following the disciples’ path (*sāvaka, bodhi*), as streamwinners, once-returners, non-returners or arhats [3.2.2.4]. This alternative path is that of the pratyeka buddha or individual self-awakened ones (*pacceka, buddha*).

The pratyeka-buddhas are the subject of an ancient discourse, the famous **Khagga, visāṇa Sutta** (Sn 1.3),<sup>116</sup> and some of their names are mentioned in **the Isi, gili Sutta** (M 116).<sup>117</sup> The term *pacceka, bodhi*, “individual awakening,” is found in **the Nidhi, kaṇḍa Sutta** (Khp 8),<sup>118</sup> and the second of the 4 chapters of **the Apadāna** is dedicated to pratyeka-buddhas.<sup>119</sup> In other words, the doctrine of the pratyeka-buddha is well attested by the ancient texts, although the teaching itself is not as common as that of the path of the disciples.

The doctrine of the pratyeka-buddha is an inspiring teaching for those of us in this age when the Buddha Dharma is being systematically diluted and distorted in sophisticated ways by theology, racism and worldliness. The burning house of religion is haunted and infested with gurus proclaiming eternal Buddhas, imaginative paradises, and race-based pietism, and where monastics are seduced by wealth and worldliness. Those who forget the freedom of the forest are doomed to be walled in by the world.

When we know and see the Dharma, and truly enjoy its truth and beauty, we are true renunciants. Like the Buddha under the Bodhi tree, we are each courageously alone. For, we understand that we must stand alone in the Dharma, like a lotus always stands alone, rooted in the mud, rising through the waters, blossoming alone in the sun. But there are always other lotuses all around us.

<sup>113</sup> See **Dhyana**, SD 8.4.

<sup>114</sup> For the technical details on these 4 kinds of saints, see **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22,42-47), SD 3.13; **Ānāpāna, sati S** (M 118,9-12), SD 7.13; **Samāṇa-m-acala S 1** (A 4.87), SD 20.13 + **S 2** (A 4.88), SD 20.14.

<sup>115</sup> See **(Nānā, karaṇa) Puggala S 1** (A 4.123/2:126-128), SD 23.8a.

<sup>116</sup> Sn 1.3/35-75/p6-12 (SD 99.5).

<sup>117</sup> M 116/3:68-71 (SD 99.6).

<sup>118</sup> Khp 9,15/7 @ SD 99.7

<sup>119</sup> Ch 2 of the 4 chapters of Apadāna is called **Pacceka, buddh’āpadāna** (“Heroic stories of pratyeka-buddhas,” Ap 7-14), where the Buddha answers Ānanda’s questions about pratyeka-buddhas.

**3.2.2.7 FAITH IN THE SANGHA.** Faith in the sangha does not merely mean supporting worthy monastics in a material way or joining a fan club for monks or nuns. It means practising just as the true saints of the noble sangha would, habitually reflecting on the impermanence of everything around us. It means seeing the Dharma within ourselves.

If we want to truly follow the Buddha’s teaching, then we should aspire to be streamwinners in this life itself.<sup>120</sup> This is the true meaning of having deep faith in the sangha, that is, to aspire to be spiritually a part of it. For a streamwinner, whether a monastic or a lay practitioner, is a member of the noble sangha. He is *not* a Bodhisattva, and does not need to be one.

For, in the suttas, the only Bodhisattva is the Buddha himself before his great awakening. His life as Bodhisattva lasted for 100,000 aeons and 4 incalculables ago.<sup>121</sup> During that time, he learns about the nature of suffering, like a traveller who has experienced the whole journey, and then teaches us how to travel safely and quickly on that path to true happiness. Hence, he is said to be the “way-shower” (*akkhātāra*, Dh 276).

Nowhere in the suttas is it ever stated that we need to be a Bodhisattva or that there is a “Bodhisattva” path. Nor do we need to become Buddhas. For, awakening is a quality; it is liberation; it is neither a person nor deity. There is no other path, only the eightfold path. (Dh 274)

**3.2.2.8 MORAL VIRTUE.** Cultivating moral virtue dear to the noble ones is living a life (action and speech) that emulates those of the noble saints. This means understanding the nature of right speech—communication that is truthful, unifying, pleasant, and beneficial—and practising right livelihood.<sup>122</sup> On a deeper level, we make every effort to restrain our senses so that our minds are not scattered or distracted with thoughts and views.

The idea is to simplify our lives (body and mind) so that we can bring happiness to others, too, especially those near and dear to us. We can then focus and enjoy the present and what is before us, and cultivate our own inner peace, joy and clarity. This is a lifestyle that is ever ready with mindfulness and prepared for mental cultivation for a breakthrough into self-awakening.<sup>123</sup>

— — —

## (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta

### The Discourse to Nandiya

### (on the Streamwinner)

S 55.40

#### The 2 kinds of noble disciples

**1** At one time, the Blessed One was staying in Nigrodha’s park, outside Kapilavastu, in Sakya country.

<sup>120</sup> See **(Anicca) Cakkhu S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

<sup>121</sup> An “aeon” (*kappa*; Skt *kalpa*) is a world-cycle; an “incalculable” (*asaṅkheyya*; Skt *asaṅkhyeyya*) is most commonly given as 10<sup>51</sup>, 10<sup>59</sup> or 10<sup>63</sup> years.

<sup>122</sup> See **Right livelihood**, SD 37.8.

<sup>123</sup> See Reflection, “I will wait for you,” R362, 2014.

2 Then, **Nandiya the Sakya**<sup>124</sup> approached the Blessed One, saluted him and sat down at one side. Seated thus at one side, Nandiya the Sakya said this to the Blessed One:

3 “Bhante, **when the 4 limbs of streamwinning**<sup>125</sup> **are all completely and totally absent from a noble disciple**,<sup>126</sup> would that noble disciple, bhante, be one who dwells negligently [heedlessly] or not?”<sup>127</sup>

4 “Indeed, Nandiya, *when the 4 limbs of streamwinning are all completely and totally absent from a noble disciple, he is an outsider, one who stands on the side of the worldlings*, I say!<sup>128</sup>

5 And how, Nandiya, is **a noble disciple ‘one who dwells negligently [heedlessly]’ and ‘one who dwells diligently [heedfully]’?**

Listen carefully, Nandiya, pay attention, I will speak.” [398]

6 “Yes, bhante,” replied Nandiya the Sakya in assent. The Blessed One said this:<sup>129</sup>

### The negligent dweller

7 And how, Nandiya, is **a noble disciple one who dwells negligently** (*pamāda, vihāri*)?

(1) HE DOES *NOT* GO BEYOND FAITH IN THE BUDDHA

8 Here, Nandiya, a noble disciple has wise faith in the Buddha, thus:

9 ‘So too, is he the Blessed One: for, he is  
arhat [worthy],  
fully self-awakened one,  
accomplished in wisdom and conduct  
well-farer,  
knower of worlds,  
peerless guide of persons to be tamed,  
teacher of gods and humans  
awakened,  
blessed.’<sup>130</sup>

10 Content with that wise faith in the Buddha, he makes *no* further effort in solitude by day nor in seclusion by night.<sup>131</sup>

<sup>124</sup> On the identity of this **Nandiya**, see (1.3.3).

<sup>125</sup> *Sotāpatti-y-aṅga*: on the 4 limbs of streamwinning, see (2.1.0); see also “I”: **The nature of identity**, SD 19.1 (7.1).

<sup>126</sup> It is obvious that Nandiya is here using the term “noble disciple” (*ariya, sāvaka*) in a general sense to include both the worldlings and the streamwinners. Technically, *ariya, sāvaka* or *ariya* itself, in the suttas, refers to the 4 kinds of saints: see (1.1.1).

<sup>127</sup> *Yass’eva nu kho bhante ariya, sāvakassa cattāri sotāpatti-y-aṅgāni sabbena sabbam sabbathā sabbam n’atthi, so evam* [Be sv-eva] *nu kho bhante ariya, sāvako pamāda, vihārīti*.

<sup>128</sup> “... He is...I say!” *Tam aham bāhiro puthujjana, pakkhe t̥hito’ti vadāmi*. As in (**Bāhira**) **Paṭipanna S** (S 48.18), SD 47.19, but where the 5 spiritual faculties (*pañc’indriya*) are referred to.

<sup>129</sup> Ce omits this para.

<sup>130</sup> For details on each of these qualities, see **Buddhānussati**, SD 15.7.

<sup>131</sup> *So tena Buddhhe avecca-p, pasādena santuṭṭho na uttariṃ vāyamati divā pavivekāya rattiṃ paṭisallānāya*. In other words, he does not spend time in solitary reflection and meditation. Both the terms *paviveka* and *paṭisallāna* here have effectively the same sense of “solitary meditation and its related solitude.” We can distinguish them in the sense that “solitude,” *paviveka*, refers to mostly outdoor activity related to meditation, while “seclusion,” *paṭisallāna*, refer to similar activity indoors. Technically, *paviveka* (see **Paviveka S**, A 3.92 @ SD 44.2), and the

- 11 <sup>132</sup>When he thus dwells *negligently*, there is no gladness.<sup>133</sup>  
 When there is no gladness, there is no zest.<sup>134</sup>  
 When there is no zest, there is no tranquillity.<sup>135</sup>  
 When there is no tranquillity, he dwells unhappily.<sup>136</sup>  
 An unhappy mind does not attain samadhi.<sup>137</sup>
- 12 When the mind does not attain samadhi, phenomena [dharmas] do not appear.<sup>138</sup>
- 13 Because **phenomena** do not appear,<sup>139</sup> he is regarded as ‘one who dwells negligently.’<sup>140</sup>

## (2) HE DOES NOT GO BEYOND FAITH IN THE DHARMA

14 Furthermore, Nandiya, a noble disciple has wise faith in the Dharma, thus:

- 15 ‘Well taught is the Blessed One’s true teaching,  
 visible here and now,  
 immediate [having nothing to do with time],  
 inviting one to come and see,  
 accessible [to bring oneself up to it],  
 to be personally known by the wise.’<sup>141</sup>

16 Content with that wise faith in the Dharma, he makes *no* further effort in solitude by day nor in seclusion by night.

- 17 *When he thus dwells negligently, there is no gladness.*  
*When there is no gladness, there is no zest.*  
*When there is no zest, there is no tranquillity.*  
*When there is no tranquillity, he dwells unhappily.*  
*The unhappy mind does not attain samadhi.*
- 18 *When the mind does not attain samadhi, phenomena do not appear.*
- 19 Because **phenomena** do not appear, he is regarded as ‘one who dwells negligently.’

## (3) HE DOES NOT GO BEYOND FAITH IN THE SANGHA

20 Furthermore, Nandiya, a noble disciple has wise faith in the Sangha, thus:

- 21 The Blessed One’s community of disciples are well-practised [keeps to the good way];  
 the Blessed One’s community of disciples keeps to the straight way [are straight in  
 practice]; the Blessed One’s community of disciples keeps to the right way;

---

important term, *viveka*, have a broader compass of solitude of body, of mind, and of liberation: see **Viveka, nissita**, SD 20.4; while *paṭisallāna* has a more limited and practical sense of “meditative retreat,” as in the stock phrase, “alone in seclusion” (*raho, gata paṭisallānā*, eg (**Pasenadi**) **Piya S**, S 3.4 + SD 38.8 (2); **Raho, gata S**, S 36.11 @ SD 33.6): see **Paṭisallānā S** (It 45), SD 41.4.

<sup>132</sup> From here on, and also the section on living diligently, as in **Pamāda, vihārī S** (S 35.97/4:78 f), SD 47.6. This is an allusion to the *vimutt’āyatana* pericope: see SD 10.15 (4.4.2).

<sup>133</sup> *Tassa evaṃ pamattassa viharato pāmojjaṃ na hoti*. Alt tr: “One who dwells thus negligently does not feel glad.”

<sup>134</sup> *Pāmojje asati pīti na hoti*.

<sup>135</sup> *Pītiyā asati passaddhi na hoti*.

<sup>136</sup> *Passaddhiyā asati dukkhaṃ viharati*. Alt tr: “When there is no tranquillity, he dwells unhappily.”

<sup>137</sup> *Dukkhiro cittaṃ na samādhīyati*. Alt tr: “For the mind of one who is unhappy, phenomena [dharmas] do not arise.” On “phenomena” (*dhammā*), see foll n.

<sup>138</sup> *Asamāhite citte dhammā na pātubhavanti*. On **dhammā na pātubhavanti**, see (1.2.3).

<sup>139</sup> “Phenomena do not appear (to him)”: see (1.2.3).

<sup>140</sup> *Dhammānaṃ apātubhāvā pamāda, vihārītv-eva saṅkhyarṃ gacchati*. *Vihārītv-eva = vihārī iti eva*.

<sup>141</sup> For details on each of these virtues, see **Dhammānussati**, SD 15.9.

the Blessed One's community of disciples keeps to the proper way.  
 These are the 4 pairs of persons, the 8 individuals:  
*this* Blessed One's community of disciples is  
 worthy of offerings,  
 worthy of hospitality,  
 worthy of gifts,  
 worthy of salutation with the lotus-palms,  
 a supreme field of merit for the world.<sup>142</sup>

22 Content with that wise faith in the Sangha, he makes *no* further effort for solitude by day nor for seclusion by night.

- 23 When he thus dwells negligently, there is no gladness.  
 When there is no gladness, there is no zest.  
 When there is no zest, there is no tranquillity.  
 When there is no tranquillity, he dwells unhappily.  
 The unhappy mind does not attain samadhi.  
 24 When the mind does not attain samadhi, phenomena do not appear.  
 25 Because **phenomena** do not appear, he is regarded as 'one who dwells negligently.'

(4) HE DOES NOT GO BEYOND MORAL VIRTUE

26 Furthermore, Nandiya, a noble disciple has virtues dear to the noble ones,<sup>143</sup> unbroken, untorn, unmixed, spotless, liberating, praised by the wise, untarnished, giving rise to samadhi [stillness].<sup>144</sup>

27 Content with those virtues dear to the noble ones, he makes *no* further effort for solitude by day nor for seclusion by night.

- 28 When he thus dwells negligently, there is no gladness.  
 When there is no gladness, there is no zest.  
 When there is no zest, there is no tranquillity.  
 When there is no tranquillity, he dwells unhappily.  
 The unhappy mind does not attain samadhi.  
 29 When the mind does not attain samadhi, phenomena do not appear.  
 30 Because **phenomena** do not appear, he is regarded as 'one who dwells negligently.'

31 In this way, Nandiya, the noble disciple is 'one who dwells negligently.'

## The diligent dweller

32 And how, Nandiya, is a noble disciple one who dwells diligently [heedfully] (*appamāda, vihāri*)?

(1) BEYOND WISE FAITH IN THE BUDDHA

33 Here, Nandiya, a noble disciple has **wise faith in the Buddha**, thus:

34 'So too, is he the Blessed One: for, he is arhat [worthy],

<sup>142</sup> For details on each of these qualities, see **Aṭṭha, puggala S 1** (A 8.59), SD 15.10a(1).

<sup>143</sup> "Virtues dear to the noble ones," *ariya, kantāni sīlāni*. The noble one's moral virtue is explained at Vism 7.101-106/221 f. SA says that the noble ones do not violate the 5 precepts; hence, this virtue is dear to them (SA 2:74).

<sup>144</sup> "Unbroken, ... giving rise to concentration," *akhaṇḍehi acchiddehi asabalehi akammāsehi bhujissehi viññūpa-saṭṭhehi aparāmaṭṭhehi samādhi, sarivattanikehi*. See UA 268.

fully self-awakened one,  
 accomplished in wisdom and conduct  
 well-farer,  
 knower of worlds,  
 peerless guide of persons to be tamed,  
 teacher of gods and humans  
 awakened,  
 blessed.<sup>145</sup>

**35** Not content with that wise faith in the Buddha, he makes further effort in solitude by day and in seclusion by night.<sup>146</sup>

<b>36</b> When he thus dwells <u>diligently</u> ,	gladness arises. <sup>147</sup>	<i>pāmuja</i>
When gladness arises,	zest arises. <sup>148</sup>	<i>pīti</i>
When zest arises,	there is bodily tranquillity. <sup>149</sup>	<i>passaddhi</i>
The tranquil body	feels happy [joyful]. <sup>150</sup>	<i>sukha</i>
The happy mind	attains samadhi [stillness]. <sup>151</sup>	<i>samādhi</i>
<b>37</b> When the mind has attained samadhi, <sup>152</sup>	phenomena [dharma] appear. <sup>153</sup>	<i>dhammā</i>
<b>38</b> Because <b>phenomena</b> <u>do appear</u> , he is regarded as ‘one who dwells diligently.’ <sup>154</sup>		

(2) BEYOND WISE FAITH IN THE DHARMA

**39** Furthermore, Nandiya, a noble disciple has **wise faith in the Dharma**, thus

**40** ‘Well taught is the Blessed One’s true teaching,  
 visible here and now,  
 immediate [having nothing to do with time],  
 inviting one to come and see,  
 accessible [to bring oneself up to it],  
 to be personally known by the wise.’<sup>155</sup>

**41** *Not* content with that wise faith in the Dharma, he makes *further* effort in solitude by day and in seclusion by night.<sup>156</sup>

<b>42</b> <i>When he thus dwells</i> <u>diligently</u> ,	<i>gladness arises.</i>
<i>When gladness arises,</i>	<i>zest arises.</i>

<sup>145</sup> For details on each of these qualities, see *Buddhānussati*, SD 15.7.

<sup>146</sup> *So tena buddhe avecca-p,pasādena asantuṭṭho uttari vāyamati divā pavivekāya rattim paṭisallānāya.*

<sup>147</sup> *Tassa evaṃ appamattassa viharato pāmojjaṃ jāyati.* Alt tr: “In one who dwells thus heedfully [diligently] gladness arises.” Dative *tassa* tr as locative.

<sup>148</sup> *Pamuditassa pīti jāyati.*

<sup>149</sup> *Pīti,manassa kāyo passambhati.*

<sup>150</sup> *Passaddha,kāyo sukhaṃ vediyati.*

<sup>151</sup> *Sukhino cittaṃ samādhīyati.*

<sup>152</sup> Note that *samādhi* is used here, not *jhāna*. *Samādhi* here refers not only to *jhāna*, or some level of mental stillness or focus, and the ensuing calm and clarity (after emerging from dhyana or mental stillness) allows us to clearly see the true nature of reality or phenomena (*dhamma*). See §12 n on *dhammā*. See (1.2.3).

<sup>153</sup> *Samāhite citte dhammā pātubhavanti.* Comy here (SA 3:289) and to **Pamāda,vihārī S** (SA 2:385 ad S 35.97/-4:78 f) explain **dhammā pātubhavanti** as meaning that the states of calm and insight (*samatha,vipassanā dhammā*) do not appear. See (1.2.3).

<sup>154</sup> *Dhammānaṃ pātubhāvā appamāda,vihārītv-eva saṅkhyarṃ gacchati.*

<sup>155</sup> For details on each of these virtues, see *Dhammānussati*, SD 15.9.

<sup>156</sup> *So tena buddhe avecca-p,pasādena asantuṭṭho uttari vāyamati divā pavivekāya rattim paṭisallānāya.*



- When zest arises,  
The tranquil body  
The happy mind
- there is bodily tranquillity.  
feels happy.  
attains samadhi.
- 43 When the mind has attained samadhi,  
phenomena appear.
- 44 Because **phenomena do appear**, he is regarded as 'one who dwells diligently.'

## (3) BEYOND WISE FAITH IN THE SANGHA

45 Furthermore, Nandiya, a noble disciple has wise faith in the Sangha, thus:

- 46 'The Blessed One's community of disciples are well-practised [keeps to the good way];  
the Blessed One's community of disciples keeps to the straight way [are straight in practice];  
the Blessed One's community of disciples keeps to the right way;  
the Blessed One's community of disciples keeps to the proper way.

These are the 4 pairs of persons, the 8 individuals:

this Blessed One's community of disciples is  
worthy of offerings,  
worthy of hospitality,  
worthy of gifts,  
worthy of salutation with the lotus-palms,  
a supreme field of merit for the world.<sup>157</sup>

47 Not content with that wise faith in the Sangha, he makes *further* effort in solitude by day and in seclusion by night.

- 48 When he thus dwells diligently,  
When gladness arises,  
When zest arises,  
The tranquil body  
The happy mind
- gladness arises.  
zest arises.  
there is bodily tranquillity.  
feels happy.  
attains samadhi.
- 49 When the mind has attained samadhi,  
phenomena appear.
- 50 Because **phenomena do appear**, he is regarded as 'one who dwells diligently.'

## (4) BEYOND NOBLE MORAL VIRTUE

51 Furthermore, Nandiya, a noble disciple has **virtues dear to the noble ones**, unbroken, untorn, unmixed, spotless, liberating, praised by the wise, untarnished, giving rise to samadhi [stillness].

52 Not content with those virtues dear to the noble ones, he makes *further* effort for solitude by day and for seclusion by night.

- 53 When he thus dwells diligently,  
When gladness arises,  
When zest arises,  
The tranquil body  
The happy mind
- gladness arises.  
zest arises.  
there is bodily tranquillity.  
feels happy.  
attains samadhi.
- 54 When the mind attains samadhi,  
phenomena appear.
- 55 Because **phenomena do appear**, he is regarded as 'one who dwells diligently.'

56 In this way, Nandiya, is the noble disciple 'one who lives diligently.'"

— evaṃ —

140915 140923 141201 150922 160508 171226 181224

<sup>157</sup> For details on each of these qualities, see **Aṭṭha, puggala S 1** (A 8.59), SD 15.10a(1).