

11

Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta

The Lesser Go,siṅga Discourse or The Lesser Discourse in the Go,siṅga (Forest) | **M 31**
 Theme: Silence and the joy of spiritual communion
 Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2008, 2013

1 Sutta summary and highlights

1.1 SUTTA PARALLELS. The Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta, the “Lesser Go,siṅga Discourse” [4.1], gives an account of the Buddha’s visiting a group of 3 monks—Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila¹—who are living together harmoniously in quest of spiritual awakening. This discourse has a Chinese parallel in the Madhyama Āgama and another in the Ekottarika Āgama,² and a Sanskrit parallel has been preserved in a Gandhari fragment.³

The opening narrative of the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta and part of the ensuing exchange between the Buddha and the 3 monks recur in **the (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta** (M 128) [3.1] and **the Mahā,vagga 10** (Mv 10) of the Pali Vinaya,⁴ in relation to the Kosambī incident in the 10th year of the ministry,⁵ and another related account is found in **the Anuruddha Mahā,vitakka Sutta** (A 8.30) [3.2].

While both the (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta and the Vinaya account give the venue of the teaching as the eastern bamboo grove,⁶ the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta locates it in the Go,siṅga (“cow-horn”) sal forest⁷ [§2]. All these Suttas are connected with the Kosambī incident, of which the Mahā,vagga 10 account gives the fullest account. [3]

1.2 SEQUENCE OF EVENTS. Another difference is that in **the (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta**, the 3 monks have not yet reached their goal, while in **the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta**, they are already accomplished arhats [2.3.3]. Although this suggests that the events described in the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta and the (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta take place on different occasions, the introductory narrative shared by these two discourses gives the impression that they are reporting the same episode. This interesting problem will be further examined here.

1.3 TWO PROBLEMS

1.3.1 According to the opening narrative of **the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta** [§3], the Buddha, on arriving at the grove, where the 3 monks are staying, is stopped by the grove-keeper, who apparently does not know that the Buddha is the teacher of the monks who are dwelling in the forest.⁸ Although we may well imag-

¹ For details on these 3 monks, see **(Anuruddha) Upakkilesa S** (M 128), SD 5.18 (5-7).

² MĀ 185 (T1.729b-731a) and EĀ 24.8 (T2.629a-630a) (only partly parallel to the longer discourse). Both agree with M 31 on the location (EĀ 24.8 @ T2.629a15 locates the meeting between the Buddha and the 3 monks Vajjī country, 跋耆國, which corresponds to the area where the Go,siṅga forest is found). The MĀ 185 title, “the discourse on the cow-horn sal forest,” 牛角娑羅林經, without the prefix “lesser,” found in M 31 title. A section of MĀ 185 has been tr in THICH Minh Chau 1964:175-176.

³ Senior Kharoṣṭhī fragment 12, mentioned as a parallel to M 31 in Salomon 2003:79 = 2006:140.

⁴ M 128/3:155,13 (SD 5.8); V 1:350,30.

⁵ V 1:337-360: this is the fullest account of the incident that we have. See SD 5.18 (1).

⁶ M 128/3:155,15 (SD 5.8): *pācīna,vamsa,dāya*, the same location where, according to **Anuruddha Mahā,vitakka S** (A 8.30/4:235,9), SD 19.5, Anuruddha attained arhathood [3.2].

⁷ M 31/1:205,16 (SD 44.11): *go.siṅga,sāla,vana,dāya*.

⁸ M 31/1:205,20 (SD 44.11), M 128/3:155,15 (SD 15.8), Senior Kharoṣṭhī fragment 12r11, MĀ 72 (T1.536b8), MĀ 185 (T1.729c21), and EĀ 24.8 (T2.629b6). These different versions agree in saying that Anuruddha intervenes and

ine that the grove-keeper does not recognize the Buddha on first meeting him, it is more difficult to imagine the same happening again on another occasion. The narrative introductions of the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta and of the (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta, however, give the impression that both discourses are reporting the same visit by the Buddha to the 3 monks, even though the subsequent developments differ from each other.

1.3.2 On further scrutiny, it should be noted that **the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta** begins with the Buddha asking the 3 monks if they are lacking anything and if they are living together in concord.⁹ While in the suttas, the first of these two questions is a standard way of beginning a conversation when the Buddha visits a monk or a group of monks, the Buddha's question *whether they are dwelling together in concord* is unusual. Let us now investigate what, if any, is the reason for this strange question.

2 How many times does the Buddha visit the 3 monks?

2.1 A STRANGE QUESTION? The (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta (M 128) helpfully tells us that the meeting between the Buddha and the 3 monks takes place almost immediately after the Buddha has left the quarrelsome monks of Kosambī. These Kosambī monks have violently disputed with one another over a minor matter of discipline to the extent of rudely rejecting even the Buddha's efforts in resolving the matter.¹⁰

As a result, the Buddha quietly leaves them and spends the rains retreat in solitude. According to the Ekottarika Āgama parallel to the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta, the Buddha's visit to the 3 monks takes place very soon after he has left the Kosambī monks.¹¹ As such, it makes good sense for the Buddha to ask the 3 monks if they are living together harmoniously (*samaggā*) [§6].

2.2 THE KOSAMBĪ INCIDENT. That the Kosambī incident forms the background of the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta is confirmed by the recurrence of **the figures of concord** in the Sutta. The Buddha's asking after the "harmonious living together" (*samagga*) of the 3 monks is a term that recurs in a description of a harmonious company given in **the Parisa Sutta 2** (A 2.5.2).¹² The same Aṅguttara Nikaya discourse and its parallel in a Sanskrit fragment define a disharmonious company in the same way as the (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta speaks of the Kosambī monks.¹³

Then, there is the famous figure of "mixing like milk and water" (*khīrôdaki,bhūta*) used by the Buddha after he has left the Kosambī monks to visit and ask after the 3 monks in the eastern bamboo grove.¹⁴

tells the park keeper to let the Buddha enter the park. EĀ 24.8 @ T2.629b5 refers to the park as 師子國, perhaps misreading *siṅga*, "horn" (or its equivalent) in the original text) for *sīha*, "lion." See also **Mahā Go,siṅga S** (M 32) @ SD 44.12 (1.1).

⁹ M 31,6.1/1:206,12 (SD 44.11): "I hope that you are all dwelling in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, mixing like milk and water, looking at each other with kindly eyes," *kacci pana vā ... samaggā sammodamānā avivadamānā khīrôdaki,bhūtā aññam-aññam piya,cakkhūhi sampassantā viharathāti?*

¹⁰ M 128,2-6 + SD 5.18 (1).

¹¹ EĀ 24.8 (T2.629a13) reports how the Buddha decides to leave the quarrelling Kosambī monks, after which he visits Anuruddha and his companions.

¹² M 31/1:206,12 (SD 44.11) and **Parisa S 2** (A 2.5.2/1:70,22), SD 113.2.

¹³ The term used is "partisan groups" (*vaggā parisa*, A 2.5/1:70,18); or (Skt) *vyagrā pariṣat* in Tripaṭhi 1995: 188; cf M 128,3.2/3:153,3.

¹⁴ V 1:351,18+20+37: the Buddha actually first visits Bhagu who is staying *alone* outside Bālaka,loṇa,kāra,gāma (Mv 10.4.1 @ V 1:350): see M 128 (SD 5.18) (Table 8). Also T1428 @ T22.880a24: 如水乳合, T1421 (T22.160a7): 如水乳合, and EĀ 24.8 @ T2.626b16: 同一水乳. This is stock: M 1:206, 398, 3:156; A 1:70, 3:67, 104; S 4:225.

The same figure of mixing like milk and water recurs in the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta and its Madhyama Āgama parallel to describe how the 3 monks live in concord.¹⁵

2.3 THE BUDDHA'S 2 VISITS

2.3.1 Sequence of events. Analayo concludes that “these parallels support the explicit indication given in the Ekottarika Āgama discourse that the visit to Anuruddha and his companions, described in **the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta** and its parallels, should be placed soon after the Buddha’s unsuccessful attempt to settle the Kosambī quarrel.” (2011:205). The Buddha’s visit to the same group of 3 monks described in **the (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta** (M 128) would then have to be placed at an earlier occasion, when these 3 monks had *not* yet reached the level of meditative proficiency (and arhathood), as recorded in the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta.

As these two accounts are very close together (just over 3 months), the sutta compilers possibly, erroneously inserted the account of the Buddha’s encounter with the grove-keeper into the introductory narrative to *both* meetings, the first one in **the (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta** and the second in **the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta**. As this repetition is found both in the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta and its Madhyama Āgama parallel, it would be safe to surmise that the repetition occurred at some time *before* the Theravada and the Sarvastivada reciter traditions separated from each other, but *after* the Ekottarika Āgama reciter tradition had begun to transmit its version of the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta independently (Analayo id).

2.3.2 The Buddha’s second visit

2.3.2.1 Be that as it may, both the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta and its Madhyama Āgama parallel report that (during the Buddha’s second visit), in reply to his inquiry after their communal concord, Anuruddha informs the Buddha that they are living together with lovingkindness, acting in accordance with the wishes of their companions, so that they may be “of different bodies, but we’re of one mind.”¹⁶ Both Nandiya and Kimbila, too, reply in the same words. [§§6-8]

According to the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta, the Buddha next asks the 3 monks if they are living “diligently,”¹⁷ a term usually used in reference to spiritual practice. In reply, Anuruddha describes their daily routine that is conducted in great harmony. The Madhyama Āgama and Ekottarika Āgama versions, too, give a similar description of the daily routine of the monks as part of their introductory narrative.¹⁸

2.3.2.2 Probing further, the Buddha asks, “But, how, Anuruddhā, do you all **dwell diligent, ardent and resolute?**” [§8]. This is an interesting question, because the terms “diligent” (*appamatta*), “ardent” (*ātāpī*), and “resolute” (*pahitatta*) usually occur as a stock phrase in reference to an intensive practice of meditation.¹⁹ Obviously, here the Buddha is asking the 3 monks about their meditation practice. After

¹⁵ M 31/1:206,13+15+18 & 1:207,7 (SD 4.11): *khīrôdak,bhūtā*, MĀ 185 (T1.730a25+28 &730b3): 合一水乳.

¹⁶ M 31,6-8/1:206,19 and MĀ 185 (T1.730a6). Engelmajer 2003:42 identifies 3 main themes in the description given of the monks: “lovingkindness towards others, putting others’ needs before one’s own, and taking responsibility” (for things that need to be done); cf also Aronson 1980:32-34.

¹⁷ M 31/1:207,8: *kacci pana vo ... appamattā ātāpino pahitattā viharathāti?*

¹⁸ MĀ 185 (T1.729c5) and EĀ 24.8/T2:629a15; a similar daily routine is described in the context of the *pavāraṇā* regulation in V 1:157,10; for the Dharma,guptaka Vinaya counterpart: see Heirman 2009:64-66. The Skt version, as preserved in Senior Kharoṣṭhī fragment 12, however, omits any mention of the monks’ daily routine altogether.

¹⁹ The 3 terms occur frequently when someone requests a short teaching from the Buddha in order to withdraw into solitude for personal practice, eg, M 145/3:267,9, S 13.1/2:244,20, S 22.159/3:187,12, S 23.23-34/3:198,17, S 35.76/4:48,21, S 35.86/4:54,21, S 35.88/4:60,12, S 35.161/4:145,11, A 7.79/4:143,19, and A 8.53/4:280,15. The

all, he has just asked them about their daily conduct or keeping of moral virtue. Understandably, a question on mental cultivation should follow.²⁰

It is highly unlikely, however, that the 3 monks misunderstand the Buddha's question or that it is a transmission error here.²¹ The monks are simply replying to the Buddha's question here on their practice by picking up from their earlier answer. In reply, they now relate how they spend their day together, such as their routines of almsround, cleaning their almsbowls, putting away seats, preparing water for washing and drinking, cleaning the refectory and setting up the toilet water.²² All this is done in silence. [§9]

2.3.2.3 It is the last remark—their **rule of silence**—that makes the description of their daily chores remarkable. If there is a need of communication, it would be done by way of simple signals [§9.2]. On the fifth day of the week, they would sit up together all night to discuss the Dharma²³ [§9.3].

The Vinaya version, however, only says that the monks are on good terms with one another, but they “neither addressed one another nor conversed.”²⁴ The Madhyama Āgama version records that they will either converse on the Dharma or else spend their time together in noble silence.²⁵ While all the versions mention their keeping the noble silence, *only* the Cūḷa Goṣiṅga Sutta adds that they would spend the fifth night of the week discussing Dharma.

2.3.3 The 3 monks' attainments

2.3.3.1 The Cūḷa Goṣiṅga Sutta and its parallels continue with Anuruddha reporting the progress of their meditation practice to the Buddha. According to the Pali and the Chinese versions, the 3 monks

same terms form part of the standard description of reaching the destruction of the influxes through such solitary personal practice, eg, **D 8/1:177,2**, **9/1:202,33**, **16/2:153,3**, **26/3:76,28**; **M 7/1:40,2**, **27/1:177,15**, **57/1:392,1**, **73/1:496,26**, **75/1:513,3**, **82/2:61,3**, **86/2:103,28**, **89/2:123,14**, **124/3:127,18**; **S 6.3/1:140,22** (or **S2 174/1:307,4**), **7.1/1:161,20** (or **S2 187/1:346,17**), **7.2/1:163,9** (or **S2 188/1:349,24**), **7.10/1:171,24** (or **S2 196/1:368,21**), **12.17/2:21,28**, **22.35/3:36,3**, **22.36/3:37,22**, **22.63/3:74,22**, **22.64/3:75,22**, **22.65/3:76,11**, **22.66/3:77,1**, **35.64/4:38,20**, **35.89/4:64,24**, **35.95/4:76,13**, **41.9/4:302,11**, **47.3/5:144,3**, **47.15/5:166,4**, **47.16/5:166,16**, **47.46/5:188,1**, **47.47/5:188,-23**; **A 3.128/1:282,21**, **4.254/2:249,9**, **5.56/3:70,17**, **5.180/3:217,20**, **6.55/3:376,4**, **6.60/3:399,9**, **8.30/4:235,11**, **8.63/4:301,24**; **U 3.2/23,21**, **3.3/25,24**; **Sn 3.7/p111,23**. Other passages relate these 3 terms to gaining one-pointedness of the mind, **M 125/3:128,17**; to developing the divine eye, **D 23/2:329,18**; to gaining (meditative) vision of lights, **M 128/3:158,8** and **A 8.64/4:302,14**; and to achieving temporary liberation of the mind, **S 4.23/1:120,22** (or **S2 159/1:264,17**).

²⁰ This is the first 2 of the 3 trainings, ie, in moral virtue, in mental cultivation and in wisdom: see *Sīla samādhi pañña*, SD 21.6.

²¹ As suggested by Analayo, 2011:205.

²² Although Madhyama Āgama account does not relate the monk's daily routine to living diligently, ardently, and resolute, it describes how each monk, once he has eaten and cleaned up, will take his sitting mat and retire for meditation (MĀ 185 @ T1.729c9: 入室燕坐), which is not mentioned in the Majjhima account. The Ekottarika Āgama version similarly reports that the monks would sit upright in a secluded spot with set up mindfulness before them, and reflect on the Dharma. EĀ 24.8 @ T2.629a23: 正身正意, 繫念在前, 思惟妙法.

²³ M 31/1:207,24: *pañcāhikam ... mayam ... sabba,rattiyā dhammiyā kathāya sannisīdāma* (M:Be 1:268,8, M:Ce 1:498,11, and M:Se 1:389,10: *sabba,rattikam*).

²⁴ Mv 10.4.5 (V 1:352). The Vinaya is generally regarded as having been compiled much later than the suttas.

²⁵ MĀ 185 (T1.729c21): 或共說法, 或聖默然. The account in EĀ 24.8 (T2.629a24) is relatively brief and does not mention the regular meeting of the monks, although it does record that they live together without breaking out into speech.

have mastered the 4 dhyanas and the 4 formless attainments.²⁶ Interestingly, we should note here that it is Anuruddha who is reporting (on behalf of Nandiya and Kimbila) to the Buddha.

We are later told that, after the Buddha has left, Nandiya and Kimbila ask Anuruddha how he knows of their attainments when neither of them has told him so. Anuruddha replies that he has done so through telepathy, and also that the gods have informed him so [§20]. This is also a clear hint that Anuruddha has awakened before the events of the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta. [2.3.3.4]

2.3.3.2 To the list of attainments mentioned, the two Chinese versions add that they also have developed **the 4 divine abodes** (*brahma, vihāra*).²⁷ This is likely, when we consider that the 3 monks have been living together in lovingkindness (described in detail in the Majjhima Nikaya and the Madhyama versions). What is implicit in the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta [§7] is explicitly stated in the Chinese version.

2.3.3.3 According to the Majjhima Nikāya and Ekottarika Āgama versions, the 3 monks have also attained the cessation of perception and feeling²⁸ [§18.4], which means that they have become arhats. The Madhyama Āgama version adds that they have also attained the 6 superknowledges (*abhiññā*), which is of course, possible if they have mastered the 4th dhyana.²⁹

2.3.3.4 According to all the Sutta versions, Nandiya and Kimbila ask Anuruddha how he is able to declare all their spiritual attainments when they have never told him about them. Anuruddha replies that he has come to know about their attainments through telepathy. The Majjhima Nikaya discourse, the Ekottarika Āgama version, and the Gāndhārī fragment add that he has also been informed of their attainments by devas.³⁰ [2.3.3.1]

2.3.4 The yaksha Dīgha Parajana. The Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta and its parallels all close by saying that a yaksha,³¹ **Dīgha Parajana** [§21], approaches the Buddha and proclaims that the Vajjis are very fortunate to have the Buddha and these 3 monks living among them. The Majjhima Commentary says that he is a divine king (*deva, rāja*), one of the 28 yaksha generals (*sena, pati*) mentioned in **the Āṭānāṭiya Sutta** (D 32).³²

²⁶ Senior Kharoṣṭhī fragment 12r31-43 covers only the first 3 dhyanas, but then continues with the first formless attainment, without mentioning the 4th dhyana. The description of the formless attainments that follow are abbreviated. Clearly, all 4 form dhyanas should be understood as implicit here.

²⁷ MĀ 185 (T1.730b8) and EĀ 24.8 (T2.629c1).

²⁸ M 31/1:209,22 and EĀ 24.8 (T2.629b25). The same appears to be the case for the Senior Kharoṣṭhī fragment 12r50, although the reference is not fully preserved.

²⁹ MĀ 185 (T1.730b28). The 3 discourses qualify the attainments in their respective lists as “superhuman states,” M 31/1:209,19: *uttari, manussa, dhamma*, MĀ 185 (T1.730c6): 人上之法, and EĀ 24.8 (T2.629b27): 上人法. On this term, see also Analayo 2008. In relation to this notion, it is noteworthy that V 3:87,24 (cf also V 3:92,32) and V 4:24,1 include the 4 dhyanas and the 6 superknowledges in a list of such superhuman states, but do not mention the attainment of cessation or the formless attainments, even though these attainments would certainly qualify for being reckoned as “superhuman states.” In fact, the attainment of cessation does not appear to be mentioned at all in the Pali Vinaya. In regard to the attainment of cessation, Schmithausen (1981:249) notes a suggestion made by Nagasaki, that “*nirodha, samāpatti* originally was nothing but a (metaphorical) designation for Nirvāṇa in terms of meditative concentration.” (Nagasaki 1978: 65 f, 70, 6, 73 ff)

³⁰ M 31/1:210,9, Senior Kharoṣṭhī fragment 12v10, and EĀ 24.8 (T2.629c9).

³¹ On *yaksha*, see SD 21.3 (4.2.5); SD 51.11 (3.1.1.2).

³² D 32/3:205,7. Apparently, he is mentioned as speaking with the Buddha only here [§§21-22], and its parallels can be found in Mahā, prajñā, pārāmitā (upadeśa) Śāstra, T1509 (T25.225c2), tr in Lamotte 1970a:1405. On *yakkha*, see M M J Marasinghe, *Gods in early Buddhism*, 1974:213-230 & see index.

According to the Cūḷa Gosiṅga Sutta, its Madhyama Āgama version, and the Gāndhārī fragment, the devas of the different sense-realms up to the Brahma-world joyfully echo this proclamation.³³ In all versions, the Buddha declares the great spiritual benefit of recollecting these 3 great monks.³⁴

The Majjhima Nikaya and Ekottarika Āgama discourses conclude with the yaksha joyfully approving of the Buddha's word. According to the Madhyama Āgama version, the 3 monks, too, rejoice in the Buddha's words.³⁵

3 Relationship to (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta (M 128)

3.1 The (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta (M 128) locates the 3 monks—Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila—in the eastern bamboo grove (*pācīna, vaṁsa, dāya*), also called the eastern bamboo deer grove.³⁶ This is just after the Kosambī incident³⁷ [§§2-4] in the 10th year of the Buddha's ministry, when **the monks Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila** are residing in the eastern bamboo grove on their solitary retreat. The Buddha visits them on his way to the Pārileyya forest for his own solitary rains-retreat that same year.

After greeting the 3 monks, the Buddha asks them whether they are dwelling together in concord. They reply that they show lovingkindness in every way towards one another.³⁸ The Buddha then asks them about their own practice. They reply that they dwell together diligent in their daily duties, all done in silence.³⁹ However, when the Buddha asks them about their attainments, whether they have attained the dhyanas and liberation, they speak of their inability to enter dhyana.⁴⁰ In response, the Buddha instructs them on the 11 kinds of mental impurities (*cittassa upakkilesa*).⁴¹

3.2 The 3 monks spend their rains-retreat in the same new location. This is confirmed by **the Anuruddha Mahā, vitakka Sutta** (A 8.30), which says just this—that Anuruddha (and presumably with his two companions) spend the rains-retreat in the eastern bamboo grove.⁴² The Sutta records the Buddha as traveling astrally from Pārileyya forest (where he is spending the rains-retreat) to see Anuruddha (there is no mention of Nandiya or Kimbila) and teach him about dhyana. Anuruddha then attains arhathood.

The Buddha, however, is recorded as residing in the deer grove in the Bhesakaḷā forest at Suṁsumāra, giri in Bhaggā country (located between Vesālī and Sāvattthī).⁴³ One difficulty is that *only* Anuruddha is

³³ M 31/1:210,20, Senior Kharoṣṭhī fragment 12v23, and MĀ 185 (T1.731a1).

³⁴ While M 31/1:210,35, Senior Kharoṣṭhī fragment 12v17, and EĀ 24.8 (T2.629c21) speak only of recollecting the monks, MĀ 185 (T1.731a20) also refers to recollecting their way of practice, 所行者. Another noteworthy difference recurs in relation to the Buddha's praise of the monks, where EĀ 24.8 @ T2.630a2 has a ref to the 3 incalculable aeons of diligent and difficult practice undertaken by the Buddha-to-be in order to reach unsurpassable awakening, 如我於三阿僧祇劫所行勤苦,成無上道 (adopting the 宋, 元, 明, and 聖 variant 勤 instead of 懃), one of several instances where the Ekottarika Āgama seems to have incorporated later elements. For further examples, see Analayo 2009.

³⁵ MĀ 185 (T1.731a26). Since according to MĀ 185 (T1.730c14), the Buddha has already left the 3 monks, by the time of meeting the yaksha, the Buddha would no longer have been in their company. Although the concluding statement in MĀ 185 could be due to a transmission error, it might also be that it intends to cover the joy felt by the monks together with that felt by the yaksha. In fact, in the Madhyama Āgama such references are not unusual and thus need not be cases of inconsistency: see also Analayo 2011:193 n255 and 545 n83.

³⁶ *Pācīna, vaṁsa, dāye jantu, gāmaṁ* (DA 2:419); *pācīna, vaṁse miga, dāye jantu, gāmaṁ* (AA 1:293).

³⁷ M 128,2-4 @ SD 5.18.

³⁸ M 128,11-12 @ SD 5.18.

³⁹ M 128,13-14 @ SD 5.18.

⁴⁰ M 128,15 @ SD 5.18.

⁴¹ M 128,16 to the end.

⁴² A 8.30,1 @ SD 19.5, where see text nn for details on the place-names here and below.

⁴³ On these places, see SD 5.4 (1).

mentioned here. It is possible that Nandiya and Kimbila are with him, too, and benefit from the same instructions. As it is their habit to practise together, it is likely that they spend this rains-retreat together in the eastern bamboo grove, too.

3.3 The Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta records Anuruddha (who clearly speaks for Nandiya and Kimbila, too), as not only having mastered the 8 attainments [§§10-18], but also that they can, at will, “enter and dwell in the cessation of perception and feeling,” which means that they are already arhats [§18.4]. We can therefore surmise that the Buddha’s visit to these 3 monks in the Go,siṅga sal forest grove occurs *after* the events (especially Anuruddha’s awakening) recorded in the Anuruddha Mahā,viṭakka Sutta (A 8.30).

In other words, after spending retreat in the Bhesakaḷā forest (Bhagga country) (A 8.30), Anuruddha (and presumably Nandiya and Bimbila, too) move on to the Go,siṅga sal forest grove, outside Vesālī. The distance is just over 200 km (124 mi),⁴⁴ which is clearly reachable by the monks within the time-window of our narratives.

Let us tabulate here a chronology of events from these three suttas, thus:

<u>(Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta</u> (M 128), SD 5.18	<u>Anuruddha Mahā,viṭakka Sutta</u> (A 8.30), SD 19.5	<u>Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta</u> (M 31), SD 44.11
Venue: Eastern bamboo grove just before the 10 th rains-retreat* [<i>The Buddha visits the 3 monks</i>]	Eastern bamboo grove during the 10 th rains-retreat [<i>The Buddha appears only to Anuruddha</i>]	Go,siṅga sal forest grove soon after the 10 th rains-retreat [<i>The Buddha visits the 3 monks</i>]
The 3 monks tell the Buddha about their fellowship, silent retreat and inability to attain dhyana. The Buddha advises them on how to meditate.	Anuruddha reflects on the thoughts of the great man; the Buddha teaches him how to attain dhyana. Anuruddha becomes an Arhat.	The Buddha visits them again, they are able to attain dhyana, and mention their attaining cessation, ie, arhathood. The Buddha praises them.

Table 3. Chronology of the 3 monks’ spiritual progress

*The more detailed account of the 3 monks as given in **the (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta**, but without the sections on meditation, is given in the **Vinaya** account (Mv 10 @ V 1:337-353), as such, should be listed here. There, it is said that the Buddha is on his way to Pārileyya forest for his rains retreat (Mv 10.4.6 @ V 1:352).

4 Go,siṅga sāla,vana,dāya

4.1 NAME ORIGIN

4.1.1 Go,siṅga sāla,vana,dāya means the Go,siṅga sal forest grove [§2]. The Sutta’s commentary says that on account of the oldest tree there having a branch forked out like a cow’s horn, the whole forest

⁴⁴ About the distance from Singapore to Melaka, Malaysia. If the monks were to mindfully walk all the way, with proper breaks, they would prob reach their destination within a week.

was given the name of “the forest of the cow-horn sal.” Ordinarily, it is simply called “the forest grove (*vana,dāya*).” Hence, the forest is called the cow-horn [*go,siṅga*] sal forest grove⁴⁵ (MA 3:325,16).

4.1.2 According to **the Mahā,vastu**, a pre-Mahāyāna Buddhist work, however, a woman by the name of Go,sīṅgī donated a sal forest (*sāla,vana*) to the Buddha and the community, an account that suggests the grove to have been named after its donor.⁴⁶ It is regarded as the primary source of a transcendental (non-human) Buddha, common to all the Mahāsaṅghika schools, from which arose what came to be called the Mahāyāna.

The **Mahāvastu** is a composite narrative work, including the past and present lives of the Buddha and his disciples, in many ways parallel to the Pali versions but with some significant differences. It was probably composed between the 2nd century and 4th century BCE. As such, its materials are generally older than those of the Pali Commentaries (such as the Majjhima Commentary here), which were compiled in the 5th century CE by Buddhaghosa.

4.1.3 However, we seem to have no other corroboration for the source of the Mahāvastu account of the lady Gosīṅgī. Nor can we be certain of the Majjhima Nikāya Commentary origin story. If both sources had quoted a common ancient source, we could have been more certain. However, here, we can best simply say that these are the two possible explanations of the origin of the name of this ancient forest.

4.2 The only other place where Go,siṅga sal forest grove is mentioned is in **the Kaṇṭaka Sutta** (A 10.72).⁴⁷ According to the Sutta, some great elders are dwelling with the Buddha in the Mahā,vana [great forest], outside Vesālī, where they are visited by large endless crowds of people. Recalling the Buddha’s love for solitude, they retreat to the Go,siṅga sal forest grove, also outside Vesālī. but which is probably more remote.⁴⁸

4.3 The Commentary explains **dāya** as meaning “forest, grove” (*arañña*) (MA 2:235 f), as in *dāya,pāla*, “grove-keeper.” It is also found in the name *miga,dāya*, “a deer grove,” the best known of which is the one outside Benares (S 5:421), where the first discourse is given, as recorded in **the Dhamma,cakka Pavattana Sutta** (S 56.11),⁴⁹ and another in Bhesakalā forest, near where Nakula,pitā and Nakula,mātā live.⁵⁰

— — —

⁴⁵ *Gosiṅgasālavanadāye’ti tattha ekassa jeṭṭhaka,rukkhassa khandhato go.siṅga,saṅṭhānaṃ hutvā viṭapaṃ utṭhahi, taṃ rukkhāṃ upādāya sabbam pi taṃ vanāṃ go.siṅga,sāla,vanaṃ’ti saṅkham gataṃ. Dāyo’ti avisesena araññass’etaṃ nāmaṃ. Tasmā go.siṅga,sāla,vana,dāye’ti go.siṅga,sāla,vana,araññe’ti attho.* (MA 2:235)

⁴⁶ Basak 1963:378,3; Senart 1882:295,15.

⁴⁷ DPPN give 2 separate entries with the same name of “Gosiṅgasālavanadāya,” giving the impression that they are two separate places. This is unlikely because of its unique name, and also all the 3 Suttas mentioning it refer to the country near Vesālī.

⁴⁸ **Kaṇṭaka S** (A 10.72/5:133), SD 80.17.

⁴⁹ S 56.11,1/4:420 @ SD 1.1.

⁵⁰ See **Anumāna S** (M 15,1/1:95), SD 59.3; **Māra Tajjanīya S** (M 50,1/1:332), SD 36.4; **Nakula,pitā S** (S 22.1/3:1), SD 5.4; **Sama,jīvi S** (A 4.55,1/2:61), SD 5.1; **Nakula S** (A 6.16/3:295), SD 5.2; **Nakula,mātā S** (A 8.48,1), SD 5.3. For other refs, search CSCD using “migadāy*”.

Cūḷa Go,sīṅga Sutta

The Lesser Go,sīṅga Discourse

M 31

1 Thus have I heard.

Go,sīṅga sala,vana,dāya: Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila

1.2 At one time, the Blessed One was dwelling in the brick house⁵¹ at Nādikā [Ñātikā].⁵²

2 ⁵³At that time, the venerable **Anuruddha**,⁵⁴ the venerable **Nandiya**, and the venerable **Kimbila** [Kimila], were staying in the Go,sīṅga⁵⁵ [cow-horn] sal forest grove.⁵⁶

3 Now when it was evening, the Blessed One emerged from his solitary retreat and approached the Go,sīṅga sal forest grove.

3.2 The grove-keeper⁵⁷ saw the Blessed One coming from afar. Seeing him, he said this to the Blessed One:

“Recluse,⁵⁸ do not enter this grove. There are here three sons of family engaged in desiring their own good.⁵⁹ Do not disturb them.”⁶⁰

4 The venerable Anuruddha heard the grove-keeper speaking to the Blessed One. Hearing this, he said this to the grove-keeper:

“Friend grove-keeper, do not obstruct the Blessed One. He is our teacher, the Blessed One, who has come.”

⁵¹ The brick house (*giñjak'āvasatha*) is mentioned in **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,2.5/2:91 + 2.10/2:96), SD 9; **Jana,vasabha S** (D 18,1/2:200), SD 62.3; **Cūḷa Go,sīṅga S** (M 31,1/1:205), SD 41.11; V 1:232. It is specially mentioned because generally other buildings are made of wood (MA 2:235).

⁵² **Nādikā** or **Ñātikā** (according to Buddhaghosa, two villages of the same name on the same river bank) was on the highroad between Kuṭṭigārama and Vaiśālī (V 1:230 ff; D 2:90 f, 200; M 1:205). The Buddha's instructions to Ānanda given here are also recorded in the Saṃyutta, which has **Ñātika** as the place-name (S 5:356 ff.). Comys to both the Dīgha and the Saṃyutta confirm it as “Ñātika,” explaining that “There were two villages close by the same pond, inhabited by the sons of two brothers. Thus, both of them were called Ñātika (‘of the relatives’)” (DA 2:543; SA 2:74).

⁵³ From here, §2, until §10,1 almost as at (**Anuruddha**) **Upakkilesa S** (M 128,8-15.1), SD 5.18, where, however, they are said to be “residing in the eastern bamboo park” (*pācīna,vaṃsa,dāye viharanti*) (M 128,8). Cf also V 1:350-352 [3.3: Table 2*] (see V:H 4:501 ff for nn) & M 1:462 and V 2:182.

⁵⁴ Anuruddha. See SD 5.18 (6) & also **Pārileyya S** (S 22.81/3:94-99), SD 6.1 (2).

⁵⁵ On Go,sīṅga, see Intro (4.1).

⁵⁶ “The Go,sīṅga sal forest grove,” *go.sīṅga,sāla,vana,dāya*, as in **Cūḷa Go,sīṅga S** (M 31), SD 41.11, **Mahā Go,sīṅga S** (M 32), SD 41.12. See (4.2), and **Kaṇṭaka S** (A 10.72/5:133), SD 80.17 (where it is prob outside Vesālī). Comy glosses *dāya* as “forest, jungle” (*arañña*, MA 2:235 f).

⁵⁷ “Grove-keeper,” *dāya,pāla*.

⁵⁸ The Buddha is addressed as “Great recluse” (*mahā,samaṇa*) in (**Anuruddha**) **Upakkilesa S** (M 128,8). SD 5.18.

⁵⁹ “Engaged in desiring their own good,” *atta,kāma,rūpā*, ie seeking their own spiritual wellbeing. At M 1:205 = 3:155 = V 1:350 = VvA 11; as *atta,kāma* at A 1:231, 2:236, S 1:75 = 140 = A 2:21 = 4:91, Vv 951. The Vinaya usage is in the negative sense, meaning “one's own desire” (V 3:133,21).

⁶⁰ *Mā tesam aphāsum akāsīti*. Clearly here either the park-keeper does not know it is the Buddha, or does not recognize him. On the significance of this, see **Lakkhaṇa S** (D 30), SD 36.9. On the other hand, (**Anuruddha**) **Upakkilesa S** (M 128,8). SD 5.18, records the park keeper as addressing the Buddha as “great recluse” (*mahā,recluse*), suggesting a greater familiarity with the Buddha.

4.2 Then, the venerable Anuruddha approached the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila. Having approached them, he said this to the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila:

“Come out, bhante! Come out, bhante! Our teacher, the Blessed One, [206] has come!”

5 Then, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila went out to meet the Blessed One. One took the Blessed One’s bowl and robe, one prepared a seat, one set up water for washing the feet.

5.2 The Blessed One sat down on the prepared seat. Having sat down, he washed his feet.

Then, the three venerables saluted the Blessed One and sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, the Blessed One said this to the venerable Anuruddha:

“I hope you (three) find it bearable, Anuruddhā.⁶¹ I hope you’re able to keep going, I hope you have no trouble with almsfood.”⁶²

“It’s bearable, Blessed One. We’re able to keep going, Blessed One. We’ve no trouble with almsfood, bhante.”

Blending like milk and water

6 “Anuruddhā, I hope that you are **all dwelling in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, mixing like milk and water, looking at each other with kindly eyes.**”⁶³

6.2 “Certainly, bhante, we are all dwelling in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, mixing like milk and water, looking at each other with kindly eyes.”

“But how, Anuruddhā, are you all dwelling in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, mixing like milk and water, looking at each other with kindly eyes?”

ANURUDDHA’S PRACTICE

7 “Bhante, here I think thus:

‘It is a gain for me! It is a great gain for me, that **I’m dwelling with such companions in the holy life.**’

7.2 ⁶⁴Bhante, I keep up acts of lovingkindness through deed, both openly and privately, towards these venerables.

Bhante, I keep up acts of lovingkindness through speech, both openly and privately, towards these venerables.

Bhante, I keep up acts of lovingkindness through the mind, both openly and privately, towards these venerables.

⁶¹ *Anuruddhā*, 3 voc pl, lit “Anuruddhas” (as in M:H), ie Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila. This is a unique Pali idiom, known as an elliptical vocative, or multiple vocative, or idiomatic plural vocative, for addressing a group by its leader or seniormost. I have used the orig Pali. Also at **Nalaka, pāna S** (M 68,4.1/1:463), SD 37.4. See SD 13.1 (3.1.1.4).

⁶² *Kacci vo anuruddhā khamanīyaṃ, kacci yāpanīyaṃ, kacci piṇḍakena na kilamathāti?* “Able to keep going” (**yapanīya**), lit “shoud be able to go on,” from *yāpeti* or *yapeti* (caus of *yāti*), (fig) to keep going, keep up (on only one alms, **V** 1:351 = **M** 31,5.2/1:206 = **128**,10/3:155; D 8,14/1:166; Pug 56; J 2:204, 3:67, 4:125, 6:532; Pv 1.5.7, 1.11.7, 3.2.8).

⁶³ **Dhamma, cetiya S** (M 89) reports king Pasenadi making a similar remark to the Buddha about the monks (M 89,11/2:120 f). This is stock: M 31,6/1:206, 33,14/1:222, 59,5/1:398, 128,11/3:156; A 2:43/1:70, 5.54/3:67, 5.78/3:104; S 36.19/4:225. **Parisā S** (A 3.95) uses the rain simile to show how spiritual friendship (defined in the words here) [11] builds up positive qualities in one (A 3.93,/1:243), SD 6.12 (3).

⁶⁴ The foll 3 verses contain the first 3 of the 6 “principles of cordiality” (*cha dhammā sārāṇīyā*) given in **Kosambiya S** (M 48). The remaining 3 are: (4) sharing of gains with virtuous companions in the holy life; (5) compatible high moral virtues; (6) compatible right view and practice (M 48.6/1:322 f, 2:250; D 3:245; A 3:288 f, 5:89; DhsA 294; J 5:382. Cf *sārāṇīyaṃ dhamma, kathaṃ suṇāti*, DhA 4:168 & BHS *samraṇḥjaṇīyaṃ dharmam samādāya*, Divy 404).

7.3 Here, bhante, I think thus:

‘Why don’t [207] I put aside my own mind and instead subject myself to the minds of these venerables?’⁶⁵

Then, bhante, I set aside what I wish to do and instead do what these venerables wish to do.⁶⁶

7.4 It seems, bhante, that **we may be of different bodies, but we’re of one mind!**⁶⁷

Bhante, this is how we all dwell in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, mixing like milk and water, looking at each other with kindly eyes.”

NANDIYA’S PRACTICE

7.5 Then, the venerable **Nandiya**, too, said this to the Blessed One:

“Bhante, here we,⁶⁸ too, think thus: ‘It is a gain for me! It is a great gain for me, that I am dwelling with such companions in the holy life.’

7.6 *Bhante, we keep up acts of lovingkindness through deed, both openly and privately towards these venerables.*

Bhante, we keep up acts of lovingkindness through speech, both openly and privately towards these venerables.

Bhante, we keep up acts of lovingkindness through the mind, both openly and privately towards these venerables.

7.7 Here, bhante, we think thus:

‘Why don’t I put aside my own mind and instead subject myself to the minds of these venerables?’

Then, bhante, we set aside what we wish to do and instead do what these venerables wish to do.

7.8 It seems, bhante, that **we may be of different bodies, but we’re of one mind!**

Bhante, this is how we all dwell in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, mixing like milk and water, looking at each other with kindly eyes.”

KIMBILA’S PRACTICE

7.9 Then, the venerable **Kimbila**, too, said this to the Blessed One:

“Bhante, here we, too, think thus: ‘It is a gain for me! It is a great gain for me, that I am dwelling with such companions in the holy life.’

7.10 *Bhante, we keep up acts of lovingkindness through deed, both openly and privately towards these venerables.*

Bhante, we keep up acts of lovingkindness through speech, both openly and privately towards these venerables.

Bhante, we keep up acts of lovingkindness through the mind, both openly and privately towards these venerables.

7.11 Here, bhante, we think thus:

‘Why don’t I put aside my own mind and instead subject myself to the minds of these venerables?’

Then, bhante, we set aside what we wish to do and instead do what these venerables wish to do.

7.12 It seems, bhante, that **we may be of different bodies, but we’re of one mind!**

⁶⁵ *Yan nūnaḥaṃ sakaṃ cittaṃ nikkhipitvā imesaṃ yeva āyasmantānaṃ cittassa vasena vatteyyan’ti.* Lit, “Why don’t I cast aside my own mind, and should yield to the power (*vasa*) of just these venerable’s minds?” This sentence evokes a powerful sense to humility in Anuruddha, also Nandiya [§7.7] and Kimbila [§7.11]. I have idiomatically rendered the sentence to reflect this.

⁶⁶ *So kho ahaṃ bhante sakaṃ cittaṃ nikkhipitvā imesaṃ y’eva āyasmantaṃ citassa vasena vattāmi.*

⁶⁷ *Nānā hi kho so bhante kāyā, ekañ ca pana maññe cittaṃ ti.*

⁶⁸ Note that where Anuruddha (above) uses the 1st person, here Nandiya, and also Kimbila below use the 2nd person (“we” etc), showing their respect for their monastic senior, Anuruddha, and concord with one another.

Bhante, this is how we all dwell in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, mixing like milk and water, looking at each other with kindly eyes.”

8 “Sadhu [Excellent]! Sadhu! Anuruddhā! I hope you all dwell diligent, ardent and resolute.”
“Certainly, bhante, we dwell *diligent, ardent and resolute.*”⁶⁹

Dwelling together with diligence

8.2 “But, how, Anuruddhā, do you all **dwell diligent, ardent and resolute?**”⁷⁰

9 “Here, bhante, whichever of us returns first from the almsround in the village, he prepares the seats, sets up water for drinking and for washing, and sets up the refuse bin.

Whichever of us returns last from the almsround in the village, if he wishes, he eats the leftovers.

Or, if he wishes, he would throw them away where there is no greenery or pour them away into water where there is no life. He puts away the seats and the water for drinking and for washing. After washing the refuse bin, he puts it away, and sweeps the refectory.

Whoever notices that the vessels of water for drinking or for washing or for the toilet are low or empty, he sets them up.

9.2 If he is unable to manage them, he would signal another with his hand, and by joining hands, they set them up.

As such, bhante, there is no cause for us to break into speech.⁷¹

9.3 On **every fifth day** (of the week),⁷² bhante, we sit together all night⁷³ discussing the Dharma.

⁶⁹ From here on, **Cūḷa Go,siṅga S** (M 31,10/1:208) takes a different turn. On spiritual friendship, see S 5:2-30; A 1:14-18; It 10. See **Meghiya S** (A 9.3/4:354-358 ≈ U 4.1/34-37), SD 34.2 (2.1); also see Piya Tan, *The Buddha and His Disciples*, 2004 ch 5 (on Sāriputta & Moggallāna).

⁷⁰ “Dwell diligent, ardent and resolute,” *appamattā ātāpino pahitattā viharatha*. Comys explain this well known phrase as “diligent through the presence [non-absence] of mindfulness; ardent by way of intensity of effort; resolute, ie, committed (to the Dharma), without any regard for limb or life” (*satiyā avippavāsenā appamattasa; vīriy’-ātāpena ātāpino*. *Kāye ca jīvite ca anapekkhatāya pahit’attāssa, pesitattassāti attho*, MA 1:126; AA 2:262, 4:89; ItA 2:137; SnA 2:503; VA 1:162). More broadly, diligent refers to moral training; ardent to mental training; and resolute to wisdom training.

The full passage is an abridgement of **Mahā,vagga** 10.4.1-7 (V 1:350-352), where it is stated that the monks are on good terms with one another, but they “neither addressed one another nor conversed” (V 1:157). The Buddha speaks against such unwholesome silence (or silence for its own sake) and admonishes the monks to communicate with one another: see **Araṇa Vibhaṅga S** (M 139), SD 7.8 (2). In **Anuruddha) Upakkilesa S** (M 128,13.2), the Buddha asks them the same question, but the reply relates to their almsfood and mundane routines, all done in silence. Then, they speak of their inability to enter dhyana, after which the Buddha instructs them on the 11 kinds of mental impurities (*cittassa upakkilesa*) (M 128,16.2 to the end). Clearly **Cūḷa Go,siṅga S** (M 31) relates a later occasion (possibly at the end of the rains-retreat when the Buddha visits them again), when the monks have attained dhyana. See Intro (3.3).

⁷¹ Evidently, they dwell together observing the rule of silence, as the Buddha admonishes in **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26): “When you gather together, bhikshus, you should either discuss the Dharma or keep noble silence” (M 26, -4/ 1:161). The 2nd jhāna is known as “the noble silence” (*ariya,tuṅhī,bhāva*), explains the **Kolita S** (S 2:273), because within it initial thought and sustained application (thinking and pondering) (*vitakka,vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur. In **Kāma,bhū S 2** (S 4:293) *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī,saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. Comy on Ariyapariyesana S says that those who cannot attain *jhāna* are advised to maintain “noble silence” by attending to their basic meditation subject (MA 2:169). See prev n.

⁷² “Every fifth day (of the week),” *pañcāhikam*, ie in addition to the 8th and 14th/15th days, which are the usual days for listening to the Dharma, Nandiya and Kimbila would go to Anuruddha’s residence for Dharma discussion (MA 2:242; KhA 147). In modern terms, this is clearly a Friday (ie once a week). On the full moon and new moon days, the monks recite the Pāṭimokkha (code of monastic rule) and the laity visit the monasteries to listen to the

This is how, bhante, we dwell diligent, ardent and resolute.”

THE 9 PROGRESSIVE ATTAINMENTS⁷⁴

Attainment of the 4 dhyanas

10 “Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā!

But, Anuruddhā, while you were dwelling thus diligent, ardent and resolute, [208] abiding in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones,⁷⁵ have you attained **the superhuman state**?⁷⁶”

(1) THE 1ST DHYANA

10.2 “Why not, bhante?⁷⁷

10.3 Here, bhante, whenever we wish,

quite detached from sense-objects, detached from unwholesome mental states,

we enter and dwell in **the first dhyana**,

accompanied by *initial application* and *sustained application*,

accompanied by *zest* and *joy*, born of *seclusion*.⁷⁸

Dharma and to meditate. On the *uposatha* day of the fortnight —ie the 8th (*aṭṭhamī*), the 14th (*cātuddasī*) or 15th (*pañnarāsī*) days, and sometimes incl the 5th day (*pañcamī*)—the laity observe the 8 *uposatha* precepts (V 1:87, 102; M 1:39, 2:74; A 4:248; Sn 401; Vv 37.11; Thī 31; J 4:1, 5:173, 194, 6:232; C 1.10.4; Vism 227 f). On *pañcamī-aṭṭhamī, cātuddasī, pañnarāsī* *uposatha, divasā*, see Ujl 192,28. The *pāṭihāriya, pakkha* (“extraordinary half”) is an ancient extra holy day now not observed (AA 2:234; SnA 378; Ujl 2:55; Thī:N 67 f n31). The “eight days” of observance mentioned here probably includes the “extra holy day,” observed during the commentarial times, ie 4 days of observance for each of the 2 fortnights of the moon. See **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16) @ SD 9 (7b) n on “the monthly 8 observances.”

⁷³ “All night” (*sabba, rattim*) could mean right through all the 3 watches: 1st watch (6-10 pm), the middle watch (10-2 am) and last watch (2-6 am), or they could sleep from 2-4 am. As at V 1:352. This practice is qu as an example of “timely listening Dharma” (*kālena dhamma-s, savanam*) in **Maṅgala S** (Khp 5.9/3* = Sn 265) at KhpA 147 f & SnA 300.

⁷⁴ Ie the 4 dhyanas [§§10-13], the 4 formless attainments [§§14-17], and the cessation of perception and feeling [§18]: see §18 + §18.4n. From hereon, the Vinaya account (V 1:352) continues differently.

⁷⁵ “The distinction...of the noble ones” (*alam-ariya, ñāṇa, dassana, vivesa*) is often used in the suttas to refer to the higher degrees of spiritual knowledge characteristic of the saints. In **Mahā Sīhanāda S** (M 12,2/1:68), Comy ad loc says that it means specifically the supramundane path that Sunakkhatta is denying the Buddha (MA 2:21 f). From here on, the Sutta continues differently from (**Anuruddha**) **Upakkilesa S** (M 128,15.1/3:157), SD 5.18: see §3 above, where the parallel starts.

⁷⁶ “The superhuman state,” *uttari, manussa, dhamma*, While the highest of ordinary human virtues are the 5 precepts, the 10 precepts, the 10 wholesome courses of actions (*kusala, kamma, patha*) (**Sammā Diṭṭhi S**, M 9.6/1:47; **Sāleyyaka S**, M 41,12-14/ 1:288), the virtues of the saints, called “the superhuman states,” include the dhyanas (*jhāna*), the superknowledges (*abhiññā*), and the paths (*magga*) and fruits (*phala*) (DA 2:388, 3:817; MA 2:21; AA 3:412). **Vinaya** includes the dhyanas in its def of *uttari, manussa, dhamma* (V 3:92, 4:24).

⁷⁷ *Kiñhi no siyā, bhante*. This reply is significant, reflecting jubilation at the monks’ ability to attain dhyana. When similarly asked by the Buddha before the rains-retreat, they could only relate their preparatory duties and fellowship [3.3], but (after the rains-retreat), they announce their success. This response (*kiñhi no siyā*) here is the same as saying, “Certainly,” *taggha*, as is found in different contexts above: §6.2 & §8. Anuruddha is here speaking from his telepathic knowledge [§20].

⁷⁸ *Vivicc’eva kāmehi vivicca akusalehi dhammehi sa, vitakkaṃ sa, vicāraṃ viveka, jaṃ pīti, sukhaṃ paṭhama-j, jhānaṃ upasampajja viharāma*.). “Seclusion” (*viveka*) here is “mental seclusion” (*citta, viveka*) [SD 20.4 (4.2)], ie, the

10.4 REFRAIN. This, bhante, is how we, dwelling diligent, ardent and resolute, having attained a further superhuman state,⁷⁹ abide in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.”⁸⁰

(2) THE 2ND DHYANA

11 “Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā!

11.2 *But, Anuruddhā, while you, dwelling thus diligent, ardent and resolute, abiding in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones, [208]*

have you attained any further superhuman state,

*one which surpasses that abiding by way of the subsiding of that abiding?”*⁸¹

11.3 “Why not, bhante?

11.4 Here, bhante, whenever we wish,⁸²

with the stilling of initial application and sustained application,

by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind,

we enter and dwell in **the second dhyana**,

free from initial application and sustained application,

accompanied by *zest* and *joy*, born of *concentration*.⁸³

11.5 REFRAIN. *This, bhante, is how we, dwelling diligent, ardent and resolute, having attained a further superhuman state, abide in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.”*

(3) THE 3RD DHYANA

12 “Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā!

12.2 *But, Anuruddhā, while dwelling thus diligent, ardent and resolute, abiding in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones,*

have you attained any further superhuman state,

one that surpasses that abiding by way of the subsiding of that abiding?”

12.3 “Why not, bhante?

12.4 Here, bhante, whenever we wish,

with the fading away of zest,

we dwell equanimous, mindful and fully aware, and feel joy with the body.

We enter and dwell in **the third dhyana**,

of which the noble ones declare, “Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.”⁸⁴

overcoming of all the 5 hindrances (*pañca, vīvaraṇa*) [SD 32]. The *italicized* words in the prec line and here refer to the dhyana-factors (*jhān’āṅga*). See **Dhyana**, SD 8.4 (5.1).

⁷⁹ “A further superhuman state,” *añño uttari, manussa, dhamma*, where *anno* = *añña*, lit “other, another.” Also below [§§11.2, 11.5, etc]. “Further” here implies that these states, starting with the 1st dhyana, are connected successive meditative experiences, not arising on their own.

⁸⁰ *Ayaṃ kho no bhante amhākaṃ appamattānaṃ ātāpīnaṃ pahitattānaṃ viharantānaṃ uttari manussa, dhammā alam-ariya, ñāṇa, dassana, viśeso adhigato phāsu, vihāro’ti.*

⁸¹ The whole section: *Etassa pana vo anuruddhā vihārassa samatikkamāya etassa vihārassa paṭippassaddhiyā atth’añño uttari manussa, dhammā alam-ariya, ñāṇa, dassana, viśeso adhigato phāsu, vihāro’ti?*

⁸² At V 3:92, 4:24, the dhyanas form part of the def of “superhuman state” (*uttari, manussa, dhamma*).

⁸³ *Idha mayaṃ, bhante, yāvad-eva ākaṅkhāma vitakka, vicāraṃ vūpasamā ajjhataṃ sampasadānaṃ cetaso eko-di, bhāvaṃ avitakkaṃ avicāraṃ samādhi. jaṃ pīti, sukhaṃ dutiya-j, jhānaṃ upasampajja viharāma.* See **Dhyana**, SD 8.4 (5.2).

⁸⁴ *Idha mayaṃ, bhante, yāvad-eva ākaṅkhāma pītiyā ca virāgā ca upekhako ca viharati sato ca sampajāno, sukhaṃ ca kāyena paṭisaṃvedeti yan taṃ ariyā ācikkhanti, “upekhako satimā sukha, vihārī ti tatiya-j, jhānaṃ.* See **Dhyana**, SD 8.4 (5.3).

12.5 REFRAIN. *This, bhante, is how we, dwelling diligent, ardent and resolute, having attained a further superhuman state, abide in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.*"

(4) THE 4TH DHYANA

13 "Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā!

13.2 *But, Anuruddhā, while dwelling thus diligent, ardent and resolute, abiding in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones, have you attained any further superhuman state, one that surpasses that abiding by way of the subsiding of that abiding?"*

13.3 "Why not, bhante?"

13.4 Here, bhante, whenever we wish, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain— and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure— we attain and dwell in **the fourth dhyana** that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.⁸⁵

13.5 REFRAIN. *This, bhante, is how we, dwelling diligent, ardent and resolute, having attained a further superhuman state, abide in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.*"

(5) THE SPHERE OF INFINITE SPACE

14 "Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā!

14.2 *But, Anuruddhā, while dwelling thus diligent, ardent and resolute, abiding in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones, have you attained any further superhuman state, one that surpasses that abiding by way of the subsiding of that abiding?"*

14.3 "Why not, bhante?"

14.4 Here, bhante, whenever we wish, by completely transcending the perceptions of form, with the disappearance the perceptions of sense-reaction,⁸⁶ with non-attention to perceptions of diversity, aware that 'Space is infinite,' attain and dwell in **the base of infinite space**.⁸⁷ [209]

14.5 REFRAIN. *This, bhante, is how we, dwelling diligent, ardent and resolute, having attained a further superhuman state, abide in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.*"

(6) THE SPHERE OF INFINITE CONSCIOUSNESS

15 "Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā!

15.2 *But, Anuruddhā, while dwelling thus diligent, ardent and resolute,*

⁸⁵ *Idha mayarṃ, bhante, yāvad-eva ākaṅkhāma sukhasa ca pahānā dukkhasa ca pahānā pubbe'va somanassa, -domanassānaṃ atthaṅgamā adukkham asukhaṃ upekkhā, sati, parisuddhiṃ catuttha-jjhānaṃ. See Dhyana, SD 8.4 (5.4).*

⁸⁶ "Perceptions of sense-reaction," *pañiḡha, saññā*, also "sensory impact" (M:ÑB 267), "resistance-perception, reflex-perception" (BDict), said to be absent in the formless dhyanas. This is one of those terms that are only used contextually. See Vibh 245, §262; Vism 10.12-16.

⁸⁷ *Idha mayarṃ, bhante, yāvad-eva ākaṅkhāma sabbaso rūpa, saññānaṃ samatikkamā pañiḡha, saññānaṃ atthaṅgamā nānatta, saññānaṃ amanasikārā "ananto ākāso'ti ākāsānañcāyatanarṃ upasampajja viharāma.*

*abiding in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones,
have you attained any further superhuman state,*

one that surpasses that abiding by way of the subsiding of that abiding?”

15.3 “Why not, bhante?”

15.4 Here, bhante, whenever we wish,

by completely transcending the base of infinite space,

aware that ‘Consciousness is infinite,’ attain and dwell in **the base of infinite consciousness**.⁸⁸

15.5 REFRAIN. *This, bhante, is how we, dwelling diligent, ardent and resolute,
having attained a further superhuman state,*

abide in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.”

(7) THE SPHERE OF NOTHINGNESS

16 “Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā!

16.2 *But, Anuruddhā, while dwelling thus diligent, ardent and resolute,*

*abiding in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones,
have you attained any further superhuman state,*

one that surpasses that abiding by way of the subsiding of that abiding?”

16.3 “Why not, bhante?”

16.4 Here, bhante, whenever we wish,

by completely transcending the base of infinite consciousness,

aware that ‘There is nothing,’ attain and dwell in **the base of nothingness**.⁸⁹

16.5 REFRAIN. *This, bhante, is how we, dwelling diligent, ardent and resolute,
having attained a further superhuman state,*

abide in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.”

(8) THE SPHERE OF NEITHER-PERCEPTION-NOR-NON-PERCEPTION

17 “Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā!

17.2 *But, Anuruddhā, while dwelling thus diligent, ardent and resolute,*

*abiding in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones,
have you attained any further superhuman state,*

one that surpasses that abiding by way of the subsiding of that abiding?”

17.3 “Why not, bhante?”

17.4 Here, bhante, whenever we wish,

by completely transcending of the sphere of nothingness,⁹⁰

we enter and dwell in **the sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception**.⁹¹

17.5 REFRAIN. *This, bhante, is how we, dwelling diligent, ardent and resolute,
having attained a further superhuman state,*

⁸⁸ *Idha mayaṃ, bhante, yāvad-eva ākaṅkhāma sabbaso ākāsaṇaṅc’āyatanaṃ samatikkamma “anantaṃ viññāṇan’ti viññāṇaṅc’āyatanaṃ upasampajja viharāma.*

⁸⁹ *Idha mayaṃ, bhante, yāvad-eva ākaṅkhāma sabbaso ākāsaṇaṅc’yatanaṃ samatikkamma “anantaṃ viññāṇan’ti viññāṇaṅc’āyatanaṃ upasampajja viharāma.*

⁹⁰ Note that here there is 1st person phrase, “aware that” or contemplating on the nature of the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception because it is too subtle (lacking any mental process) for any kind of mentation. See foll n.

⁹¹ *Idha mayaṃ, bhante, yāvad-eva ākaṅkhāma sabbaso ākiñcaṅñ’āyatanaṃ samatikkamma n’eva,saññā,nāsaññ’-āyatanaṃ upasampajja viharāma.* Note here (and at §18.40), there is no contemplation in quotes (as in §§14.4, 15.4, 16.4). In both cases, the state is too subtle for any kind of recollection: we can only experience it is itself: see prec n & SD 41.2 (3.1.2.2) & 3.2.

abide in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.”

(9) THE CESSATION OF PERCEPTION AND FEELING

18 *“Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā!*

18.2 *But, Anuruddhā, while dwelling thus diligent, ardent and resolute, abiding in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones, have you attained any further superhuman state, one that surpasses that abiding by way of the subsiding of that abiding?”*

18.3 *“Why not, bhante?”*

18.4 Here, bhante, whenever we wish, through the utter transcending of the sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, we enter and dwell in **the cessation of perception and feeling**,⁹² and by our seeing wisdom, we utterly destroyed the influxes.⁹³

18.5 REFRAIN. *This, bhante, is how we, dwelling diligent, ardent and resolute, having attained a further superhuman state, abide in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.*

18.6 And, bhante, **we do not see any other comfortable abiding higher or more sublime than this.**⁹⁴

18.7 *“Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā!*

There is, indeed, no other comfortable abiding higher or more sublime than this!”

ANURUDDHA

Nandiya and Kimbila question Anuruddha

19 Then, the Blessed One instructed, inspired, roused and gladdened the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila, with a Dharma talk.⁹⁵

20 Then, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila accompanied the Blessed One some distance, and then turned back, **[210]**

and then the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila said this to the venerable Anuruddha,

20.2 *“Now when did we ever say this to the venerable Anuruddha,*

‘We have attained such and such abidings and attainments,’⁹⁶

⁹² With this attainment of cessation, we have altogether mention of the 9 “progressive abodes” (*anupubba, vihāra*) in this Sutta. On the 9 progressive abodes, see (**Anupubba**) **Vihāra Ss** (A 9.32+33/4:410-414), SD 95.1+2.

⁹³ *Idha mayaṃ, bhante, yāvad-eva ākaṅkhāma sabbaso n’eva, saññā, nāsaññāyatanaṃ samatikkamma saññā, vedayita, nirodhaṃ upasampajja viharāma, paññāya ca no divā āsavā parikkhīṇā.*

⁹⁴ *Imaṃhā ca mayaṃ, bhante, phāsu, vihārā aññaṃ phāsu, vihāraṃ uttaritaraṃ vā paṇītaraṃ vā na samanupassāma’ti.*

⁹⁵ *Dhammiyā kathāya sandasseti samādapeti samuṭṭejeti sampahaṃseti: V 1:18; D 1:126, 149, 2:86, 98, 109, 110, 127, 3:27, 209; M 1:209, 176ī2, 177ī2, 354, 2:123ī4, 139ī2, 140, 354, 3:155, 189; S 1:112ī2, 113ī3, 114, 189, 190, 192ī2, 210, 2:215, 280ī3, 2:139, 3:95, 155, 4:183, 5:155; A 3.90/1:236, 237, 380, 4.48/2:51ī3, 67, 118, 307ī 2, 9.4/-4:358, 5:122, 125; U 39, 74ī2, 80ī3, 81, 82, 87. These 4 qualities are, in fact, the sixth or last of the ideal skills of a Dharma speaker: see (**Dhamma Desaka**) **Udāyī S** (A 5.159/3:184) @ SD 46.1; **Kathā, vatthu S** (A 3.67/1:197-199) @ SD 46.11; & on the Buddha’s treatment of visitors, see **Mahā Suññata S** (M 122) @ SD 11.4 (4). On the stages of teaching, see **Mahā Suññata S** (M 122) @ SD 11.4 (4.3).*

⁹⁶ *Imāsaṃ ca imāsaṃ ca vihāra, samāpattīnaṃ mayaṃ lābhino’ti.* Comy says that this refers to the dhyana and attainments that are both worldly and supramundane (*lokita, lok’uttara*, MA 2:244).

that the venerable Anuruddha declared our having attained the destruction of the influxes before the Blessed One?”⁹⁷

20.3 “The venerables have never told me that they have attained such and such abidings and attainments—

20.4 but by fully grasping the venerables’ minds with my own, I knew⁹⁸ that the venerables have attained to such and such abidings and attainments.

20.5 The devas, too, told this matter to me, that the venerables have attained to such and such abidings and attainments.

Then, I declared this matter when questioned directly by the Blessed One.”⁹⁹

THE YAKSHA DĪGHA PARAJANA

The yaksha’s exultation

21 Then, the yaksha Dīgha Parajana¹⁰⁰ approached the Blessed One, saluted him, and then stood at one side.

Standing thus at one side, he said this to the Blessed One,

21.2 “It is a gain indeed, bhante, for the Vajjī people, a great gain indeed, that the Tathagata—the arhat [worthy], fully self-awakened one, dwells amongst them, and these three sons of family, that is, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila, do, too!”¹⁰¹

The exultation of the devas

21.3 (1) Having heard the words of the yaksha Dīgha Parajana, the earth-bound [terrestrial] devas proclaimed,¹⁰²

“It is a gain indeed, bhante, for the Vajjī people, a great gain indeed, that the Tathagata—the arhat, fully self-awakened one—dwells amongst them, and these three sons of family, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila, do, too!”

21.4 (2) Having heard the words of the earth-bound [terrestrial] devas, the devas of 4 great kings [cātum-mahārājika deva] proclaimed,

⁹⁷ *Yaṃ no āyasmā anuruddho bhagavato sammukhā yāva āsavānaṃ khayā pakāsetīti?* Nandiya and Kimbila are wondering how Anuruddha is so certain of their awakening (without being told so) that he declares it to the Buddha himself.

⁹⁸ *Api ca me āyasmantānaṃ cetasā ceto paricca vidito.* See SD 49.1 (6).

⁹⁹ *Tam enaṃ bhagavatā pañhābhipuṭṭhena vyākatan’ti.* This significant passage shows that all the 3 monks have awakened as arhats, but without informing anyone else (until the Buddha’s visit). However, as we have noted, it is Anuruddha who awakens first (as recorded in **Anuruddha Mahā, vitakka S** (A 8.30), SD 19.5: see Intro (3.3).

¹⁰⁰ Dīgha Parajana is a divine king (*deva, rāja*), one of the 28 yaksha generals (*senā, pati*) mentioned in **Āṭānāṭiya S** (D 32/3:205,7). Apparently, he is mentioned as speaking with the Buddha only here [§§21-22], whose parallels can be found in Mahā, prajñā, pārāmitā(, upadeśa) Śāstra (T1509 @ T25.225c2), tr in Lamotte 1970:1405. On *yakkha*, see M M J Marasinghe, *Gods in early Buddhism*, 1974:213-230 & see index.

¹⁰¹ This whole section: *Lābhā vata bhante vajjīnaṃ, suladdha, lābhā vajjī, pajāya, | yattha tathāgato viharati ara-haṃ sammā, sambuddho, ime ca tayo kula, puttā, āyasmā ca anuruddho āyasmā ca nandiyo āyasmā ca kimilo’ti.*

¹⁰² This divine exultation cycle is as in **Dhamma, cakka Pavattana S** (S 56.11), SD 1.1 = (Mv 1.6.30 @ V 1:11 f); its opposite, the divine lament cycle (at Sudinna’s misdeed prompting the intro of the 1st pārājika rule), Pār 1.5.9 @ V 3:18 f: see SD 1.10 (2.3).

“It is a gain indeed, bhante, for the Vajjī people, a great gain indeed, that the Tathagata—the arhat, fully self-awakened one—dwells amongst them, and these three sons of family, that is, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila, do, too!”

21.5 (3) Having heard the words of *the devas of 4 great kings, the devas of the 33* [tāva, tiṃsa deva] proclaimed,

“It is a gain indeed, bhante, for the Vajjī people, a great gain indeed, that the Tathagata—the arhat, fully self-awakened one—dwells amongst them, and these three sons of family, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila, do, too!”

21.6 (4) Having heard the words of *the devas of the 33, the Yāma devas* proclaimed,

“It is a gain indeed, bhante, for the Vajjī people, a great gain indeed, that the Tathagata—the arhat, fully self-awakened one—dwells amongst them, and these three sons of family, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila, do, too!”

21.7 (5) Having heard the words of *the Yāma devas, the Tusita devas* proclaimed,

“It is a gain indeed, bhante, for the Vajjī people, a great gain indeed, that the Tathagata—the arhat, fully self-awakened one—dwells amongst them, and these three sons of family, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila, do, too!”

21.8 (6) Having heard the words of *the Tusita devas, the devas who delight in creation* [nimmāna, -rati deva] proclaimed,

“It is a gain indeed, bhante, for the Vajjī people, a great gain indeed, that the Tathagata—the arhat, fully self-awakened one—dwells amongst them, and these three sons of family, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila, do, too!”

21.9 (7) Having heard the words of *the devas who delight in creation, the devas who lord over the creations of others* [paramnimmita, vasavatti deva] proclaimed,

“It is a gain indeed, bhante, for the Vajjī people, a great gain indeed, that the Tathagata—the arhat, fully self-awakened one—dwells amongst them, and these three sons of family, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila, do, too!”

21.10 (8) Having heard the words of *the devas of gods who delight in creation, the Brahma, kāyika devas* proclaimed,

“It is a gain indeed, bhante, for the Vajjī people, a great gain indeed, that the Tathagata—the arhat, fully self-awakened one—dwells amongst them, and these three sons of family, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila, do, too!”

21.11 Thus, at that moment, at that second, at that instant,¹⁰³ the venerable ones were known as far as the Brahma-world.

RECOLLECTION OF THE NOBLE SANGHA

The group cycle¹⁰⁴

22 “So it is, Dīgha! So it is, Dīgha!

¹⁰³ On “at that instant ...,” see SD 17.2b (1.1.1.1).

¹⁰⁴ The resort cycle [§§22.2-22.7]—comprising the family, the family generation, the village, the market-town, the city and the country—is a locational sequence reflecting an ascending—or *vertical*—societal grouping to which monastics may resort. The last—the “world”—refers to global mobility or Buddhist oikoumene (the inhabited world). This contrasts against the class cycle [§§22.8-12]—the kshatriyas, the brahmins, the vaishyas, the shudras, the world—which is a *horizontal* class grouping based on economic growth (human occupation or activity). Cf **Sevi-tabbāsevitabba S** (M 114,54-58+60-64 respectively), where the two cycles are used in a different context.

22.2 So, too, Dīgha, if **the family** from which these three sons of family went forth from home into homelessness,

were to recall with an inspired heart these three sons of family,
it would be for the good and welfare of that family for a long time.¹⁰⁵

22.3 So, too, Dīgha, if **the family generation [circle]**¹⁰⁶ from which these three sons of family [211] went forth from home into homelessness,

were to recall with an inspired heart these three sons of family,
it would be for the good and welfare of that family retinue for a long time.

22.4 So, too, Dīgha, if **the village** from which these three sons of family went forth from home into homelessness,

were to recall with an inspired heart these three sons of family,
it would be for the good and welfare of that village for a long time.

22.5 So, too, Dīgha, if **the market-town** from which these three sons of family went forth from home into homelessness,

were to recall with an inspired heart these three sons of family,
it would be for the good and welfare of that market-town for a long time.

22.6 So, too, Dīgha, if **the city** from which these three sons of family went forth from home into homelessness,

were to recall with an inspired heart these three sons of family,
it would be for the good and welfare of that city for a long time.

22.7 So, too, Dīgha, if **the country** from which these three sons of family went forth from home into homelessness,

were to recall with an inspired heart these three sons of family,
it would be for the good and welfare of that country for a long time.

The resort cycle¹⁰⁷

22.8 If, Dīgha, **all the kshatriyas** [nobles] were to recall these three sons of family with an inspired heart,¹⁰⁸
it would be for the good and welfare of all these kshatriyas for a long time.¹⁰⁹

22.9 If, Dīgha, **all the brahmins** [priest class members] were to recall these three sons of family with an inspired heart,
it would be for the good and welfare of all these brahmins for a long time.

22.10 If, Dīgha, **all the vaishyas** [merchant class members] were to recall these three sons of family with an inspired heart,
it would be for the good and welfare of all these vaishyas for a long time.

22.11 If, Dīgha, **all the shudras** [worker class members] were to recall these three sons of family with an inspired heart,
it would be for the good and welfare of all these shudras for a long time.

¹⁰⁵ The reason for this benefit is that this is the cultivation of lovingkindness (*mettā bhāvan*): see **Karaṇīya Metta S** & SD 38.3 (6).

¹⁰⁶ “Family generation,” *kula,parivaṭṭa* or *~parivatta*, is “family circle; a family generation,” meaning all the living relatives of that family (D 2:148,18; M 1:210,37; J 4:436,26).

¹⁰⁷ See §22 header, “The group cycle” n.

¹⁰⁸ *So ce pi ... ete tayo kula,putte pasanna,citto anussareyya.*

¹⁰⁹ The reason for this benefit is that this is a recollection of the sangha (*saṅghānussati*): see **Saṅghānussati**, SD 15.10a.

22.12 If, Dīgha, **the world**, with its Mara and Brahma, along with its recluses and priests, this generation along with the devas and humans,
*were to recall these three sons of family with an inspired heart,
 it would for a long time be for the good and welfare of the world, with its Mara and Brahma,
 along with its recluses and priests, this generation along with the devas and humans.*

The true saints benefit the world

22.13 See, Dīgha, how these three sons of family have practised
for the good of the many, for the happiness of the many,
 out of compassion for the world,
 for the benefit, the good and the happiness of gods and humans.”¹¹⁰

22.14 The Blessed One said this.
 Satisfied, the yaksha Dīgha Parajana rejoiced in the Blessed One’s word.

— evaṃ —

Bibliography

- Analayo
 2008n “Uttarimanussadhamma,” in *Encyclopaedia of Buddhism* 8,2, Sri Lanka: Dept of Buddhist Affairs, 2008:462-465.
 2009A “Zeng-yi A-han,” in *Ency Bsm* 8,3. Sri Lanka: Dept of Buddhist Affairs, 2009:822-827.
 2011 *A Comparative Study of the Majjhima-nikāya* [2006]. 2 vols. [v1 Intro, suttas 1-90; v2 suttas 91-152; concl, abbrev, refs, app.] Taipei: Dharma Drum Publishing Corp, 2011: 318-320.
- Aronson, Harvey B
 1980 *Love and Sympathy in Theravada Buddhism*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1980.
- Basak, Radhagovinda
 1963a Mahāvastu Avadāna, vol 1. Calcutta Sanskrit College Research Series. Calcutta: Sanskrit College, 1963.
- Engelmajer, Pascale
 2003 “Perfect or perfecting? Reflections on the Arahant in the Nikayas,” *Contemporary Buddhism* 4,1 2003:33-54.
- Heirman, Ann
 2009 “Speech is silver, silence is golden? Speech and silence in the Buddhist saṅgha,” *The Eastern Buddhist* 40,1/2 2009:63-92.
- Lamotte, Étienne
 1944-1980 *Le Traité de la Grande Vertu de Sagesse de Nagarjuna* (Mahāprajñāpāramitāśāstra), Publication de l’Institut Orientaliste de Louvain 25, 26, 2, 12, 24: vol 1 1944/1981; vol 2 1949/-

¹¹⁰ This is a brief form of the “great commission” pericope, orig given by the Buddha to first 60 arhats and, by default, to all saints and to the Buddhist community as a whole, to propagate the Dharma (Mv 11.1 @ V 1:21), SD 11.2(11); (**Māra**) **Pāsa S 2**, S 4.5/1:105 f; Mvst 3:415 f).

- 1981; vol 3 1970; vol 4 1970/1976; vol 5 1980. Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut Orientaliste, 1944-1980.
- 1970 see 1944.
- Nagasaki, Hojun 長崎法潤
- 1978 “Self-realization in the Āgama – With special reference to *nirodha-samapatti*” [阿含における自覚の一考察 – 解脱と想受滅] Kyoto, *Journal of Nippon Buddhist Research Assoc* [Nihon bukkyō gakkai nenpō], 1978:65-80.
- Salomon, Richard
- 2003 “The Senior Manuscripts, another collection of Gandharan Buddhist scrolls,” *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 123,1 2003:73-92.
- 2006 “New manuscript sources for the study of Gandharan Buddhism,” in *Gandharan Buddhism, Archaeology, Art, Texts*, (edd) P Brancaccio et al, Vancouver: UBS Press, 2006: 135-147.
- Schmithausen, Lambert
- 1981 “On some aspects of descriptions or theories of ‘liberating insight’ and ‘enlightenment’ in early Buddhism,” in *Studien zum Jainismus und Buddhismus, Gedenkschrift für Ludwig Alsdorf. Alt- und Neu-Indische Studien, 23*, (edd) K Bruhn et al, Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner, 1981:199-250.
<https://discourse.suttacentral.net/uploads/default/original/2X/4/47d112c29ba8c0e8d1d120c0abe51e6a7f3551bb.pdf>.
- Senart, Émile
- 1882a *Le Mahavastu, Texte sanscrit publié pour la première fois et accompagné d'introductions et d'un commentaire*. Société Asiatique, Collection d'Ouvrages Orientaux, Seconde série. Paris: Imprimerie Nationale, vol 1 1882; vol 2 1890; vol 3 1897:
- THICH Minh Chau
- 1964 *The Chinese Madhyama Āgama and the Pali Majjhima Nikāya*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1964.

131217 131223 141215r 150526 170723 180318 190617