

4

Accaya Sutta

The Discourse on Transgression | S 11.24

Theme: The foolish knows not right or wrong; The wise is amenable.

Translated by Piya Tan ©2009; 2021

1 Sutta summaries and related suttas

1.1 SUTTA SUMMARIES

1.1.1 Accaya Sutta (S 11.24)

The **Accaya Sutta** (S 11.24/1:239,26-31), themed on anger and forgiveness, has a verse. It is embedded in a brief narrative where one monk offends another who remains silent. The former, realizing his offence, seeks forgiveness from the latter, who refuses to respond. When the matter is brought before the Buddha, he declares that rather than being controlled by anger, we should overcome it.

It has a Chinese parallel, **SĀ 1108** [1.2.2].

1.1.2 Dve Bāla,paṇḍita Sutta (A 2.3.1)

The **Dve Bāla,paṇḍita Sutta** contains only the prose teaching from S 11.24 [1.1.1]. It seems to be an excerpt of it. The prose teaching only speaks of 2 kinds of fools: the one who does not recognize a wrong, and one, when the wrong is pointed out, does not accept it; and 2 kinds of wise persons: the one who recognizes a wrong as a wrong, and when the wrong is pointed out, accepts it to be so.

It has a Chinese parallel, **SĀ 37**, but which is longer than the Pali. [1.2.3]

1.2 RELATED SUTTAS

1.2.1 Longer and shorter texts

1.2.1.1 The brief prose teachings of the **Dve Bāla,paṇḍita Sutta** (A 2.3.1) recurs in the **Accaya Sutta** (S 11.24/1:239,26-31), which also has a verse, and a background story. Although the usual principle is that a shorter sutta is likely to be older than the longer one, here, it is more likely that the prose teaching of **A 2.3.1** [1.1.2] was taken from the longer S 11.24 [1.1.1].

1.2.1.2 The Chinese version, **SĀ 37**, which parallels S 11.24, is much longer than the Pali version. Here, it is likely that SĀ 37 is a late work, with the verses added from other texts, perhaps a commentary. This is a common practice in the Chinese translations of the early Buddhist texts.¹

1.2.2 Chinese parallel: SĀ 1108

The **Accaya Sutta** (S 11.24)²—hence, the teaching of the **Dve Bāla,paṇḍita Sutta** (A 2.3.1), too—have 2 Chinese parallels.³ The first parallel is at **SĀ 1108** (T2.291b24).⁴

¹ On the tendency of including commentarial materials in Chin translations, see Analayo, “The influence of commentarial exegesis on the transmission of Āgama literature,” 2010.

² Korean Buddhist Canon (KBC): K6501(5).

³ See *Buddhist Studies Review* 23,1, 2006 & <http://buddhisticinformatics.chibs.edu.tw/BZA/cluster.xql?base=bza037>.

⁴ KBC indexes it under “T99.1108.” For Chin version, see <https://legacy.suttacentral.net/lzh/sa1108>.

SĀ 1108 is, however, longer than its Pali parallel which has only a 6-line verse. SĀ 1108 closes with the following **5 verses (4 and a half quatrains) and prose** (spoken by the Buddha):

- | | | |
|---|--------------------------------------|---|
| (1) Show no heart of violence to others.
Do not be tangled in aversion, too.
Hold not a grudge for long,
not dwelling in aversion. | 於他無害心，
瞋亦不纏結，
懷恨不經久，
於瞋以不住。 | <i>yú tā wúhài xīn
chēn yì bù chán jié
huáihèn bu jīngjiǔ
yú chēn yǐ bù zhù</i> |
| (2) Even when strong anger arises repeatedly,
utter not any harsh words;
let one not raise new issues.
spreading about others' shortcomings. | 雖復瞋恚盛，
不發於龐言，
不求彼開節，
揚人之虛短。 | <i>suī fù chēnhuì shèng
bù fā yú cū yán
bù qiú bǐ kāi jié
yáng rén zhī xū duǎn</i> |
| (3) Let one always guard oneself.
Let one reflect the significance within oneself.
Show no anger; harm not.
Always be one noble. | 常當自防護，
以義內省察，
不怒亦不害，
常與賢聖俱。 | <i>cháng dāng zì fáng hù
yǐ yì nèi xǐngchá
bù nù yì bù hài
cháng yǔ xián shèng jù</i> |
| (4) When confronted by the bad,
Be strong solid like a rocky mountain.
Even in anger, one is able to control oneself
like leisurely driving a chariot. | 若與惡人俱，
剛彊猶山石，
盛恚能自持，
如制逸馬車。 | <i>ruò yǔ èrén jù
gāng jiàng yóu shānshí
shèng huì néng zìchí
rú zhì yì mǎchē</i> |
| (5) Good is one who is restrained, I say,
Not one who holds a rope. ⁵ | 我說善御士，
非謂執繩者。 | <i>wǒ shuō shàn yù shì
fēi wèi zhí shéng zhě</i> |

The Buddha said to the monks: "Sakra Devānam Indra, ruler of the gods, heavenly king of the heaven of the 33, often endures humiliation. One should constantly praise the patient. You have right faith, homeless; You have renounced to train on the path. You should practise patience. Praise the patient—thus you should train yourself." The Buddha spoke this discourse. The monks, having listened to what he said, rejoiced and heeded him [practised accordingly].	佛告諸比丘： 「釋提桓因於 三十三天為自在王， 常行忍辱， 亦復讚歎行忍者。 汝等比丘正信非家， 出家學道， 當行忍辱， 讚歎忍者，應當學！」 佛說此經已， 諸比丘聞佛所說， 歡喜奉行。	<i>fó gào zhū bǐqiū shì tí huán yīn yú sānshísān tiān wèi zìzài wáng cháng xíng rěnrǔ, yì fù zàntàn xíng rěnzhe rǔ děng bǐqiū zhèngxìn fēi jiā, chūjiā xué dào dàng xíng rěnrǔ, zàntàn rěnzhe, yīng dàng xué fó shuō cǐ jīng yǐ, zhū bǐqiū wén fó suǒ shuō huānxǐ fèngxíng</i>
--	--	--

The other Chinese parallel is SĀ2 37 [1.2.3]. In other words, both SĀ 1108 (Sarvāstivāda) and SĀ2 37 (Kāśyapīya) are themselves parallel Chinese versions of one another, done by different translators.⁶

⁵ 執繩者, "who holds a rope," comes from an ancient Chin proverb, 繩之以法 *shéng zhī yǐ fǎ*, "to bring one to justice; go by the law." Source: 《后汉书·冯衍传》：“以文帝之明，而魏尚之忠，绳之以法则为罪，施之以德则为功，” (*hòu hàn shū*) *yǐ wéndì zhī míng, ér wèi shàng zhī zhōng, shéng zhī yǐ fǎzé wèi zuì, shī zhī yǐ dé zé wèi gōng* (*History of Eastern Han* by 范曄 *fàn yè* [445, 南朝宋 *náncháo_sòng*, Song of the Southern Dynasties]: “With the wisdom of emperor Wen and the loyalty of Wei Shang, the law is wrong to punish when acting in kindness is a virtue.” Hence, the Buddha’s words mean that through patience, we do not need to punish anyone, but show them compassion so that, in the end, they will change for the better. We see here how the Chinese translator has used local idiom in his translation. For another example of Chin tr using local idiom, see **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,11.2), SD 8.10.

1.2.3 Chinese parallel: SĀ2 37

1.2.3.1 The other Chinese parallel to S 11.24 is **SA2 37** (T2.385b04),⁷ which has a slightly longer, but similar, narrative than the Pali S 11.24 [1.1.1].⁸ The SA2 37 locates the Buddha meditating in Andha,vana (the forest of the blind).⁹

During an assembly, 2 monks get into an argument. When one shows anger, the other then remains silent. The angry monk, realizing he is wrong, seeks forgiveness from the silent monk. The silent monk, however, refuses to forgive the former. The assembly is disrupted by a discussion of this development. The Buddha, hearing the clamour through his divine ear, goes to the assembly to investigate. Upon learning of the situation, he admonishes them (but there is no mention of §§5-6 of S 11.24 (= §§1-2 of A 2.3.1).

1.2.3.2 Another significant difference is that, although SĀ2 37 closes with a similar Sakra story, it has 6 verses (spoken by Sakra in the Sudhamma hall) that differ from the succinct §7 of S 11.24. The **6 verses of SĀ2 37 and its closing** are as follows:¹⁰

(1) 'Tis like taking a gourd scoop, filling it with butter to use as a lamp; the flame, burning, growing, will consume the gourd, too.	譬如用瓢器， 斟酥以益燈， 火然轉熾盛， 反更燒瓢器。	<i>pìrú yòng piáo qì zhēn sū yǐ yì dēng huǒ rán zhuǎn chìshèng fǎn gèng shāo piáo qì</i>
(2) So is the angry mind; it turns on itself and burns one's wholesome roots. We should never harbour anger. Having found anger, disperse it.	瞋心亦如是 還自燒善根， 我終不含怒， 瞋已尋復散。	<i>chēn xīn yì rúshì hái zì shāo shàngēn wǒ zhōng bù hán nù chēn yǐ xún fù sàn</i>
(3) Don't get caught in a whirlpool, circling around ceaselessly. Even in anger, speak not harshly, say not what is better held unsaid.	不如水漩流， 迴復無窮已， 雖瞋不惡口， 不觸汝所諱。	<i>bùrú shuǐ xuán liú huí fù wúqióng yǐ suī chēn bù è kǒu bù chù rǔ suǒ huì</i>
(4) Silent on what's best unsaid, we hurt them not at all. Well restraining oneself benefits one greatly.	所諱如要脈， 我終不傷害， 調伏於身已， 於己即有利。	<i>suǒ huì rú yào mài wǒ zhōng bù shānghài tiáofú yú shēn yǐ yú jǐ jí yǒulì</i>
(5) With neither anger nor violence, they are the noble ones, the followers of the noble ones; those one should ever befriend.	無瞋無害者， 彼即是賢聖， 亦賢聖弟子， 常應親近之。	<i>wú chēn wúhài zhě bǐ jí shì xián shèng yì xián shèng dìzǐ cháng yīng qīnjìn zhī</i>

⁶ See SD 58.1 (5.4.5.4(3)+(4)).

⁷ Also numbered as T100.37.

⁸ For the Chin of SĀ2 37: <https://legacy.suttacentral.net/lzh/sa-2.37>. For an English tr of SA2 37, see <https://legacy.suttacentral.net/en/sa-2.37>.

⁹ *Andha,vana* (not far from Jeta,vana) is located a quarter yojana (*gavuta*) south of Sāvattihī, the capital of (northern), Kosala country. Sāvattihī (Skt *śrāvastī*), now Sahet-Maheth, is between Akaona (5 mi) and Balrampur (12 mi), and some 175 km (109 mi) NE of Lucknow, capital of Uttar Pradesh.

¹⁰ These are not the traditional Chinese pentasyllabic poetry, but simply a form of 5-syllable Buddhist free verse to reflect the Buddhist textual verses.

(6) Those with anger and hatred
are hindered by a mountain of burden |
When there is anger or hatred,
one is able to restrain oneself at least a bit, |
this, then, is called good karma
like taming an unruly horse. ||

諸有瞋恚者，
重障猶如山。 |
若有瞋恚時，
能少禁制者， |
是名為善業，
如轡制惡馬。 ||

zhū yǒu chēnhuì zhě
zhòng zhàng yóurú shān
ruò yǒu chēnhuì shí
néng shǎo jìnzhì zhě
shì míng wéi shàn yè
rú pèi zhì è mǎ

The Buddha said to the monks:
“Sakra Devānam Indra, ruler of the gods,
though at ease among them, is still able to
practise patience; he praises those with
patience. How could you monks
who have gone forth, disfigured by shaving your
heads bald, not be patient and praise patience?”
The Buddha said this.
The monks, having listened to what he said,
rejoiced and heeded him [practised accordingly].

佛告諸比丘：
釋提桓因處天王位，
天中自在，尚能修忍，
讚嘆忍者，況汝比丘，
出家毀形，
而當不忍讚嘆於忍？
佛說是已，
諸比丘聞佛所說，
歡喜奉行。

fó gào zhū bīqiū
shì tí huán yīn chù tiānwáng wèi
tiān zhōng zìzài, shàng néng xiū
rěn
zàntàn rěnzhe, kuàng rǔ bīqiū
chūjiā huǐ xíng
ér dāng bùrěn zàntàn yú rěn
fó shuō shì yǐ
zhū bīqiū wén fó suǒ shuō
huānxǐ fèngxíng

2 Monastic offences and confession

2.1 WHAT CAN BE CONFESSED

2.1.1 An offence (āpatti)

2.1.1.1 A monastic offence (āpatti) is committed when a monastic (a monk or a nun) intentionally (*sa-**cittakena*)¹¹ breaks a monastic rule or precept (*sikkhā,pada*) of discipline (*vinaya*), whether they are listed in the code of discipline (*pātimokkha*)¹² or in the Vinaya Piṭaka itself. The Vinaya— especially the Sutta Vibhaṅga (the legal aspects of the rules)¹³ and the Khandhaka (their historical background).¹⁴

Technically, a thought, even an intention, alone, bad as it may be (which should be corrected with mental training and meditation), is not sufficient for a monastic offence. Such an intention must be expressed through a **bodily act** (*kāyena*) or through **speech** (*vācāya*) (V 5:118,6). An offence done through the body is that of sexual intercourse or stealing;¹⁵ an offence through speech is that of claiming superhuman attainments;¹⁶ or either means entails an offence, such as that of killing (encouraging killing or suicide, and that of killing itself).¹⁷ These are, in fact, the very first 4 Vinaya rules, those of “defeat” (*pārājika*). [2.1.1.3]

2.1.1.2 Breaking a monastic rule may be morally wrong or may be legally wrong, that is, the former is based on **natural morality** (*pakati,sīla*) while the latter, **prescribed morality** (*paññatti,sīla*). Breaking a rule

¹¹ **Parivāra** uses the difficult term *saññā,vimokkha/nosaññā,vimokkha* (V 5:116,4; Miln 159,2-5; Kkhv 24,6 f; VA 7:1321; MilnṬ 29,1-4) [V:H 6:175; Miln:H 1:xlviij f]. The term *saññā,vimokkha* means “(having) acquittal because of (lacking) awareness” (Kkhv:NKP 2018 1:83,1-7; discussion: 568 App 16). Also Kieffer-Pülz 2013:l [Z 25].

¹² On the Pātimokkha or Pātimokkha, and related terms, see Upasak, *Dictionary of Early Buddhist Monastic Terms*, 1975: 152-154; Ency Bsm 7, 2003:363-365 Pātimokkha.

¹³ On the Sutta,vibhaṅga of the Vinaya, see Norman, *Pali Literature*, 1983b:18-22 (§2.1).

¹⁴ On the Khandhaka of the Vinaya, see Norman, op cit 22-26 (§2.2).

¹⁵ Sexual intercourse, Pār 1 + Bhī Pār 1 (V 3:23,33-36); stealing, Pār 2 + Bhī Pār 2 (V 3:46,16-20).

¹⁶ Pār 4 + Bhī Pār 4 (V 3:91,19-25).

¹⁷ Pār 3 + Bhī 3 (v 3:73,10-16).

of natural morality entails a “natural fault” (*pakati,vajja*). A natural fault means a breach of a rule that brings on oneself its karmic consequences. The 5 precepts (against killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, lying and drunkenness) are rules of natural morality (*pakati,sīla*); as are the rules of defeat (*pārājika*).¹⁸

Many monastic rules are technically based on prescribed morality, since they have been promulgated by the Buddha or deliberated by the sangha, and prohibited for monastics (KhpA 23,4).¹⁹ This is merely a technical point: that breaking the rule per se does not entail any karmic consequences.

This may be a common excuse for “modern” monastics who have effectively set aside the Vinaya. However, since they have taken monastic vows and present themselves as monastics to the laity, yet disregarding the Vinaya rules, living false lives, as such, entails a serious habitually bad karma of lying, wrong livelihood, to say the least. If we are to accept the sutta teachings, such a habitual karma brings rebirth in the suffering subhuman states.²⁰

2.1.1.3 The Vinaya matrices (*mātikā*)²¹ (that is, the *dve mātikā*:²² the Pātimokkhas of the monks (227 rules) and of the nuns (311 rules) give the following 5 kinds of offences (an early list). The actual names of rules as classified in the Pātimokkha are listed in **bold** (named after the offence that they entail), their abbreviations, along with their references in the monk’s Pātimokkha and the number of rules),²³ thus:²⁴

(1) <i>pārājika</i>	(Pār) “defeat”; an offence entailing one’s total falling away or being excluded from the state of a monastic; rules 1-4 (4 rules)	V 3:11-109
(2) <i>saṅghādisesa</i>	(Saṅgh) (literally, “initial and subsequent meeting of the sangha”), “a formal sangha meeting”; rules 5-17 (13 rules)	V 3:110-186
<i>aniyata</i>	(Aniy) the 2 rules on <u>the undetermined</u> (<i>aniyata</i>) follow; rules 18-19 (2 rules) [see below *]	V 3:187-194
(3) <i>pācittiya</i>	“expiation,” of which there are 2 categories: (1) <i>nissaggiya pācittiya</i> , “expiation with forfeiture” (Nis); rules 20-49 (30 rules) and (2) <i>suddha pācittiya</i> (Pāc), “simple expiation”; rules 50-141 (92 rules)	V 3:195-266 V 4:1-174
(4) <i>pātidesanīya</i>	(Pāti) “to be confessed;” rules 142-145 (4 rules: V 4:175-184).	V 4:185-206
<i>sekhiya</i>	(Sekh) the rules for training (decorum); rules 146-220 (75 rules)	V 4:207
<i>adhikaraṇa,samatha</i>	“settlement of legal processes”; rules 221-227 (7 clauses) ²⁵	V 4:207

¹⁸ See Ency Bsm 2 1966:22 f Āpatti.

¹⁹ For tr, see KhpA:Ñ 18.

²⁰ In **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22), the Buddha warns that by distorting the Dharma, “you have injured yourself, and stored up much demerit. For, this will lead to your harm and suffering for a long time.” The Sutta episode of Ariṭṭha is found in 2 places in the Vinaya: the commission of an offence entailing expiation (*pācittiya*) in refusing to do so after repeated admonitions (V 4:133 f), and the announcement of the act of suspension (*ukkhepaniya,kamma*) on Ariṭṭha for refusing to give up his false view (V 2:25).

²¹ On *mātikā*, see SD 58.1 (5.3.2.2).

²² See *The Pātimokkha*, ed W Pruitt, tr K R Norman, 2001, esp xxxviii-lv Intro.

²³ V 5:91,13-15 (VA 7:1314,27); DhsA 394,19-21; cf VA 2:236,4-7.

²⁴ See *The Pātimokkha* (Pruitt & Norman), 2001.

²⁵ These 7 clauses are not rules, but a list of 7 methods to be used to settle 4 kinds of litigation [*The Pātimokkha*, 2001:liv]. They are explained in the Vinaya (V 2:73,1-104,11 (V:H 5:95-140), 5:91,1-113,9 (V:H 6:132-167); Nolot, “Studies in Vinaya technical terms, I-III,” 1996:92 nn2+3; and **Sāma,gāma S** (M 104,12-20/2:247,3-250,21), SD 62.4; Nolot 1996:92 n5.

- (5) *dukkāṭa* (literally, “what is bad”), “wrong action,” a broad term for any kind of unwholesome act not amounting to any of the stated offences, except the *sekhiya*, when violated entails *dukkāṭa*.²⁶

*In the Bhikkhu Pātimokkha, there is a category of 2 rules entailing indefinite offences (*dve aniyatā dhammā*). These 2 matters, however, will be determined to fall under one of the other categories (an offence entailing defeat, entailing a formal meeting, or entailing expiation), depending on the circumstances of the offence.

2.1.1.4 The word-commentary (*pada, bhājanīya*) and rule analysis (*vibhaṅga*) sections of the Vinaya and commentaries give a total of **7 kinds of rules** (that is, kinds of offences), that is, with 2 additional ones,²⁷ (only the additional offences are defined), thus:²⁸

- (1) *pārājika*, [2.1.1.3]
(2) *saṅghādisesa* [2.1.1.3]
(3) *thullaccaya* “grave offence” (*thulla*, “fat” + *accaya*, “transgression”); of an offence that comes close to *pārājika* or *saṅghādisesa*.²⁹
(4) *pācittiya* [2.1.1.3]
(5) *pāṭidesanīya* [2.1.1.3]
(6) *dukkata* [2.1.1.3]
(7) *dubbhāsita* “wrongly spoken; bad speech” (*du* + *bhāsita*); any kind of negative speech against the Buddha, the Dharma, the sangha, or any person.

Like *dukkāṭa* [2.1.1.3], both *thullaccaya* and *dubbhāsita* are not names for rules but broadly refer to kinds of offences: while *thullaccaya* refers to the gravity of an offence, *dukkāṭa* refers to an offence committed bodily, and *dubbhāsita* to an offence via speech. They all refer to “light or minor offences” (*lahuk’āpatti*), that is, not amounting to a full blown offence. [2.2.1(2)]

2.2 CORRECTIVE PROCEDURES

2.2.1 Gravity of offences

The various monastic offences are graded into 3 general categories of 2 subdivisions each, thus:

- | | | |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------|---|
| (1) <i>duṭṭhullā āpatti</i> | “grave offences” | <i>pārājika</i> and <i>saṅghādisesa</i> |
| <i>aduṭṭhullā āpatti</i> | “non-grave offences” | the other 5 classes of offences [see following] ³⁰ |
| (2) <i>garukā āpatti</i> | “heavy or major offences” | <i>pārājika</i> and <i>saṅghādisesa</i> |
| <i>lahukā āpatti</i> | “light or minor offences” | <i>thullaccaya</i> , <i>pācittiya</i> , <i>pāṭidesanīya</i> , <i>dukkāṭa</i> , <i>dubbhāsita</i> (VA 3:1368-1420) |

²⁶ See *Dictionary of Early Buddhist Monastic Terms*, 1975:114 *Dukkaṭa*.

²⁷ V 5:91,23-25 (VA 7:1314,28; DhsA 394,21-24).

²⁸ On the meaning of these 7 terms, see *The Pātimokkha*, 2001:xliii-liv.

²⁹ Eg, a monastic attempts to commit suicide; or, attempts to threaten the peace and unity of the sangha; or if he steals something trifling (worth more than 1 but less than 5 *māsakā*, about 5 Malaysian sen). A *māsaka* may be taken as the lowest unit of local currency. For cases of *thullaccaya*, see the *Pārājika* section of the Vinaya; see V:H 1 index: “grave offence.”

³⁰ V 4:31; VA 886.

- (3) *anavasesā āpatti* “total offences,”³¹ those that are “incurable” (*atekiccha*) (*pārājika* offences)³²
sāvasesā āpatti “partial offences,” those that are remediable (all offences except *pārājika*)

Although these terms seem to be technical, they often overlap in their senses, the oldest of which seems to be (2), which are found both in the Vinaya and in the suttas. (1) are more often found in the Vinaya; while (3) are the least common.

2.2.2 “Rising out” of an offence

2.2.2.1 The Vinaya prescribes 3 methods how an offender is to be cleared of his offence, that is, to “rise up or emerge from an offence” (*āpatti, vuṭṭhāna*), that is:

- (1) *parivāsa* living under “probation”;
 (2) *abbhāna* rehabilitation of a monastic who has undergone penance for an expiable offence;
 (3) *mānatta* a penance connected related to the *saṅghādisesa* offence.³³

These procedures may apply to any offence, except for *pārājika*, by which the offender falls from his monastic state, and will never be able to ordain again.

2.2.2.2 Other than offences entailing *pārājika* and *saṅghādisesa*, all the other offences are remediable through **confession** (*paṭidesanā*), or may have confession as a part of the corrective process. These 6 types of offences are expiated through confession: *thullaccaya*, *pācittiya* (both kinds), *pāṭidesaniya*, *dukkaṭā* and *dubbhāsita*. [2.1.1.4]

An offence entailing **expiation** (*pācittiya*) rectified through confession. The wording is found in **the Khudda, sikkhā** (p 115,13-16).³⁴ In fact, the words of the confession for matters to be confessed (*pāṭidesaniya*) are contained in the rules themselves. A monk confesses to another monk³⁵; a nun to another nun.³⁶ A confession of an offence against the rules of training (*sekhiya*) is made through a general confession without specifying the offence. The words for this confession are found in **the Mūla, sikkhā** (p 129,23-27).

2.2.2.3 Traditionally, a monastic confession is made as follows. A monastic arranges his upper robe over the left shoulder, approaches another monk, usually a senior, kneels down and, with hands raised in anjali, repeats the confessions formula. The monk to whom the offence is to be confessed must be a part of the sangha, that is, does not belong to a schismatic faction, and has not been suspended. He must not be guilty of not having made a confession of the same offence that the former is confessing.

As a rule, monks are to declare their purity of unconfessed offences before listening to the Pātimokkha. Should a monk, while listening to the Pātimokkha recital, knowing or realizing that he has an unconfessed offence must tell one of his neighbouring monks of the offence when the recitation comes to the relevant, and promise to confess it when the recitation is over. Otherwise, if he tells no one, he incurs a *pācittiya* for telling a conscious lie (by not saying the truth).

³¹ *Anavasesa*, V 1:354.31 ≈ A 1:20,30; V 5:115,5; Sn 14.

³² *Atekiccha*, V2:202,8 ≈ It 85,8; V 5:202,9; M 1:393,3.

³³ V 3:1122, 4:225.

³⁴ See also Thanissaro, *The Buddhist Monastic Code*, 1976:542.

³⁵ See *The Pātimokkha* 2001:85, 87. For a detailed discussion, see Nolot 1966:96-99.

³⁶ See op cit 225, 227.

2.2.2.4 The confession formula of the various Theravāda sects³⁷ is generally based on the one given in the Culla Vagga (Cv 4.14.30).³⁸ Since the confession formula is to be repeated by every monk before the recitation of the Pātimokkha, the procedure has become little more than a formality. *The Vinaya Mukha* recommends that a monk conscious of having committed a particular offence should mention it to another monk in their own language before reciting the Pali formula.³⁹

This is an example of the working of spiritual friendship in the sangha, whereby the monastics help one another to build moral strength by giving one another spiritual support through the Dharma-Vinaya. Confession, then, is calling a Dharma colleague to witness that we are open to learning, especially about ourselves and about others—by seeing a fault as a fault (*yo accayaṃ accayato passati*)—and determined to grow towards the path and to progress on it.

3 The Dve Bāla,paṇḍita Sutta (A 2.3.1)

SD 58.4(3)

Dve Bāla,paṇḍita Sutta

The Discourse on the 2 Kinds of Fools and Wise Persons | A 2.3.1⁴⁰ [Be A 2.21]
Theme: The foolish know not right or wrong; The wise is amenable.

- 1** Bhikshus, there are these 2 kinds of **fools**. What are the two?
One who does not see the wrong as wrong,⁴¹
and one, when the wrong is pointed out to him according to the Dharma [according to the truth],
does not accept it.⁴²
Bhikshus, there are these 2 kinds of fools.
- 2** Bhikshus, there are 2 kinds of **wise persons**. What are the two?
One who sees wrong as wrong,⁴³
And one, when the fault is pointed out to him according to the Dharma [according to the truth],
accepts it.⁴⁴
- 3** Bhikshus, these are the 2 kinds of wise persons.

paṭhamam

³⁷ With the exception of the “modern” Vinayaless priests of Sri Lanka (which includes most of the “missionary preachers” outside Sri Lanka, who neither observe the Vinaya nor meet fortnightly in conclave to recite the Pātimokkha).

³⁸ See Thanissaro 1976:542-544.

³⁹ See Vajirañāṇavarorasa, *Vinaya Mukha, The entrance to the Vinaya*, vol 2, Bangkok: Mahāmakut Rājavidyālaya Press, 1921 (Thai), 1972 (English), various reprs, 1973:155-161 ch xxi Vinayakamma.

⁴⁰ Recurs as §§5-6 of **Accaya S** (S 11.24/1:239,26-31), SD 58.4, with a verse; all embedded in a story. It has Chin parallels at SĀ 298 (T2.85) [1.2.2] and SA² 37 (T2.385) [1.2.3].

⁴¹ *Yo ca accayaṃ accayato na passati*. Comy: Having a wrong (*aparādham*), he sees it not (*na passati*); having been meted corrective action (*daṇḍa,kammaṃ āharitvā*, lit “given his punishment”), he does not ask for forgiveness (*na khamāpeti*) (AA 2:117,12-15).

⁴² These 2 lines: *Yo ca accayaṃ desentassa yathā,dhammaṃ na paṭigaṇhāti*.

⁴³ *Yo accayaṃ accayato passata*: see (2.2.2.4).

⁴⁴ These 2 lines: *Yo ca accayaṃ desentassa yathā,dhammaṃ paṭigaṇhāti*.

Accaya Sutta

The Discourse on Transgression

S 11.24

1 At one time, the Blessed One was staying in Anātha,piṇḍika's park, in Jeta's grove, outside Savatthī.⁴⁵

Two monks quarrelled

2 Now at that time, two monks had a quarrel. One monk had committed an offence.⁴⁶ Then, the former monk confessed his transgression before the other monk, but the latter would not pardon him.⁴⁷

3 Then, a number of monks approached the Blessed One, saluted to him, sat down at one side. Seated at one side, the monks said this to the Blessed One:

4 "Here, bhante, *two monks had a quarrel. One monk had committed an offence. Then, the former monk confessed his transgression before the other monk, but the latter would not pardon him.*

2 kinds of fools and wise ones

5 Bhikshus, there are these 2 kinds of **fools**. What are the two?

One who does not see the wrong as wrong,⁴⁸

and one, when the wrong is pointed out to him according to the Dharma [according to the truth], does not accept it.⁴⁹

Bhikshus, there are these 2 kinds of fools.

6 Bhikshus, there are 2 kinds of **wise persons**. What are the two?

One who sees wrong as wrong,⁵⁰

And one, when the fault is pointed out to him according to the Dharma [according to the truth], accepts it.⁵¹

Bhikshus, these are the 2 kinds of wise persons.

Sakra

7 Once upon a time, bhikshus, **Sakra**, lord of the devas, instructing the Tavatimsa devas in the Sudhamma assembly hall, on that occasion uttered this verse:⁵²

⁴⁵ Be Ce so; Ee *sāvatthiyāṃ ... pe*.

⁴⁶ *Tatr'ekp hikkhu accasarā. Accasarā* is aor of *atisarati*, "To transgress, commit an offence." We are not told what the offence is, or if he has transgressed against another. It is possible that this was done before the recitation of the Pātimokkha.

⁴⁷ *Atha kho so bhikkhu tassa bhikkhuno santike accayaṃ accayato desesi; so bhikkhu na paṭigaṇhāti.*

⁴⁸ *Yo ca accayaṃ accayato na passati.* Comy: Having a wrong (*aparādhā*), he sees it not (*na passati*); having been meted corrective action (*daṇḍa, kammaṃ āharitvā*, lit "given his punishment"), he does not ask for forgiveness (*na khamāpeti*) (AA 2:117,12-15).

⁴⁹ These 2 lines: *Yo ca accayaṃ desentassa yathā, dhammaṃ na paṭigaṇhāti.*

⁵⁰ *Yo accayaṃ accayato passati:* see (2.2.2.4).

⁵¹ These 2 lines: *Yo ca accayaṃ desentassa yathā, dhammaṃ paṭigaṇhāti.*

SD 58.4
SD 58.4(3)

S 11.24/1:239 f • Accaya Sutta
A 2.3.1/1:59 • Dve Bālapaṇḍita Sutta

Keep your anger under control.
Let there be no decay in your friendships.
Blame not the blameless.
Speak not divisive speech.
For, anger crushes bad people
like a mountain crashing down on one.”

*kodho vo vasam āyātu
mā ca mittehi vo jarā
agarhiyaṃ mā garahittha
mā ca bhāsittha pesuṇaṃ
atha papa, janaṃ kodho
pabbato cābhiddatīti*

210403 210408 210716

⁵² On Sakra’s virtue in keeping his anger under control, see eg **Dubbāṇḍiya S** (S 11.22), SD 54.16.