8

Cūļa Assa,pura Sutta

The Lesser Discourse at Assa,pura | **M 40** Theme: True recluseship does not depend on external observances Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2013

na nagga,cariyā na jaṭā na paṅkā	Nor going naked, nor matted hair, nor mud,
nânāsakā thaņḍila,sāyikā vā	nor fasting, nor lying down on the ground,
rājo ca jallaṁ ukkuṭika-p,padhānaṁ	nor dust and dirt, nor ritual squatting,
sodhenti maccaṁ avitiṇṇa,kaṅkhaṁ	can purify a mortal who has not crossed over doubt.
(Dh 141; D	0h:Patna 195; Uv 33.1; Mvst 3:412; Divy 339 (Gilgit 3.3.40))

1 The Sutta and its highlights

1.1 Like **the Mahā Assa, pura Sutta** (M 39),¹ the Cūļa Assa, pura Sutta (M 40) or the Lesser Discourse at Assa, pura, explains the nature of a true recluse, that it does not depend on looks or vows, but on the purification of the mind.² While the Mahā Assa, pura Sutta speaks of "the things that make one a recluse and makes one a brahmin" (*dhammā samaņa, karaņā ca brāhmaņa, karaņā ca*), our Sutta here speaks of "the proper way of a recluse" (*samaņa, samīci, pațipadā*).

1.2 The Cūla Assa, pura Sutta has a Chinese parallel in the Madhyama Āgama.³ The Sutta and its Chinese parallel begin with the Buddha exhorting the monks that they should train themselves so that their claim to being a recluse will not be in vain and offerings given to them will be fruitful [§2]. Both versions compare the presence of defiled mental states in a recluse to a sharp weapon, called *mataja*, wrapped in a robe.⁴ [§4]

1.3 The two discourses explain that a renunciant (or anyone) who has not overcome mental defilements is not a recluse, even if he were to wear robes, or observe nakedness, or keep matted hair, or keep standing erect, or undertake ritual bathing.⁵

1.4 According to the Cūla Assa, pura Sutta, the Buddha then points out that if such observances could in themselves bring mental purity, our friends and relatives would surely make us undertake them right

¹ M 39/1:271-280 = SD 10.13.

² Cf **Rūpa S** (A 4.65), SD 3.14 (7).

³ See MĀ 183 @ T1.725c-726c, which agrees with the Pali version on the Sutta's location and on its title ("The Discourse at Horse City," 馬邑經 mǎyìjīng), but without mentioning that it as being the "lesser" one. In the Tib version, both M 39 and M 40 is each referred to by the title *dge sbyong*, "recluse," in an *uddāna* (colophon) in Śamatha, deva's comy on Abhidharmakośa Bhāşya (D4094 mngon pa, ju 235b4 or Q5595 tu 269a4, noted by Skilling 1997a: 339). For a comparative study, see Analayo 2011:260 f.

⁴ M 1:281,27 and MĀ 183 @ T1.726a6. A similar usage of the imagery of a sword in its sheath can be found in the early Jain text Isibhāsiyāim 45.45 (Schubring 1969:551).

⁵ Even though the Sutta centres on the "recluse" (*samaṇa*), the classic "anti-brahmin," it is clear from the suttas that many of these practices are those of brahmin ascetics: see eg Bronkhorst 1998:84. Shiraishi, however, notes that, judging from "the records of ascetics found in the Buddhist canon … the difference between the vanaprastha [forest-dweller] and the parivrajaka [renunciant] might not have been so distinct" (1996:198). Furthermore, at least 2 of these ascetic practices—standing erect and regimented eating—are practices of the Jain ascetic monks: see §5 n ad loc.

after our birth itself.⁶ The Madhyama Āgama version similarly describes how our friends and relatives would try to make us undertake such observances, without, however, specifying that they would do so right after our birth.⁷ As noted by **Analayo**, "Without this specification, however, the illustration loses some of its force" (2011:260).

1.5 The Cūla Assa, pura Sutta and its Chinese version agree that the proper way to true recluseship is to overcome mental defilements. The Pali version stands alone in describing how gladness arises in a monk once his mind is free from defilements, a gladness **[261]** which in turn leads to tranquillity and samadhi⁸ [§8]. Instead, the Chinese version speaks of overcoming the 5 mental hindrances, based on having purified bodily, verbal and mental conduct.⁹

1.6 Both versions next turn to the cultivation of the 4 divine abodes (*brahma*,*vihāra*) [§§9-12]. The Madhyama Āgama version follows this with a reflection directed to the cultivation of insight,¹⁰ so that the influxes will be destroyed and full liberation achieved. This reflection, however, is not found in the Cūla Assa,pura Sutta.

According to both versions, the Buddha gives <u>the parable of a pleasant pond</u> in which a thirsty and tired man, coming from any quarter, can quench his thirst and wash himself¹¹ [§13.1]. This, the Sutta declares in some detail, shows that if any member of the 4 social classes, indeed, anyone at all, were to renounce the world, cultivate the divine abodes, and achieve mental stillness, he is a true recluse [§13.2-6].

1.7 The Pali version introduces a finer distinction at this point, since it regards a renunciant who has attained mental stillness as one who *practises* the proper way of a true recluse,¹² but once the mental influxes are destroyed, such a one *is* a true recluse.¹³ This distinction is not found in the Chinese version. The Pali version thus explicitly advocates the attaining of inner stillness through cultivating <u>the divine</u> <u>abodes</u> as a proper way to true recluseship.

1.8 As such, notes **Analayo**, "the brahmaviharas, although not yet constituting the consummation of recluseship, figure in the Pali version more explicitly as an important factor leading up to the final goal" (2011:261). In fact, it is clear from the usage of the divine abodes, this Sutta is addressed to monks who are erstwhile brahmins and to those who come from the background of theistic beliefs. Such a teaching is a bridge to realizing higher states in the Dharma.

¹² M 1:284,13: samaņa, samīci, paţipadam paţipanno (Be 1:352,25: samaņa, samīci-p, paţipadam).

⁶ M 1:282,14: *jātam eva*.

⁷ MĀ 183 @ T1.726a18.

⁸ M 1:283,23: pāmujjam jāyati, pamuditassa pāti jāyati, pāti,manassa kayo passambhati, passaddha,kāyo sukham vedeti, sukhino cittam samādhiyati (Be 1:352,1: pāmojjam).

⁹ MĀ 183 @ T1.726b19.

¹⁰ MĀ 183 @ T1.726b27: "There is what exists, there is what is gross, there is what is subtle, and there is a going beyond and an escape from perception," 有, 有麤, 有妙, 有想來上出要 yǒu, yǒu cū, yǒu miào, yǒu xiǎng lái shàng chū yào (adopting the 宋 Sòng, 元 Yuán and 明 Míng variant which adds 有 yǒu at the beginning). This appears to correspond to a passage found in M 7/1:38,31: atthi idaṁ, atthi hīnaṁ, atthi paṇītaṁ atthi imassa sañña,gatassa uttariṁ nissaraṇaṁ, see also Analayo 2011:55 n147.

¹¹ M 1:283,36 and MĀ 183 @ T1.726c2. M 12/1:76,27 uses this imagery (but without relating it to the 4 quarters) to illustrate the path to nirvana.

¹³ M 1:284,22: āsavanaṁ khayā samaņo hoti.

1.9 While the Cūla Assa, pura Sutta concludes here [§§14-15], **the Madhyama Āgama** version continues by defining the four terms "recluse," "brahmin," "noble one" and "one purified through bathing," similar to the closing of the Madhyama Āgama parallel to the Mahā Assa, pura Sutta.¹⁴ This is probably a situation, as noted by Analayo (2010), where a translator includes some commentarial materials (for the sake of elucidating certain difficult terms).¹⁵

2 Related suttas

2.1 THE VATTHÛPAMA SUTTA (M 7).

2.1.1 Comparative table

2.1.1.1 M 7 has, for the most part, very similar materials as the Cūla Assa, pura Sutta, and serves as a kind of elaboration on this latter Sutta. Both suttas deal with <u>mental impurities</u> (*cittassa upakkilesa*): the Cūla Assa, pura Sutta lists 12 of them [§3.2], all of which are found in the list of 16 found in the Vatthûpama Sutta (M 7,3) [Table 2.1.1].

While the M 7 list are <u>nouns</u>, the same qualities (where they exist) are listed as <u>adjectives</u> in the M 40 list. The M 7 impurity (1), "covetousness and rampant greed" (*abhijjhā*,*visama*,*lobha*), is a longer term, but is essentially identical with M 40 unwholesome state (1), "covetousness" (*abhijjhā*) (n), which includes "rampant greed." Impurities (2)-(10) are identical in both lists, except that (9) and (10) are switched around.

2.1.1.2 Impurities (11)-(16) are unique to M 7, as they are not found in the M 40 list. The reason for **M 7** having <u>a longer list of impurities</u> is probably that the teaching is for the benefit for the brahmin Sundarika Bhāra, dvāha, who is nearby listenting to the Buddha teaching the monks. He then has a dialogue with the Buddha, after which he converts, joins the order, and in due course becomes an arhat (M 7,19-22).

2.1.2 While the Vatthûpama Sutta deals only with <u>washing as a ritual purification</u>¹⁶ [§§5(4), 6.16-20], the Cūļa Assa,pura Sutta gives <u>a list of 10 ascetic practices</u> [§5]. The former deals only with a single subject, the brahmin (Sundarika Bhāra,dvaja), while the latter deals with all the social classes and "everyone" [§13.2-6]. Both the suttas mention <u>the divine abodes</u> in full [§§9-12],¹⁷ and the destruction of the mental influxes [§14].¹⁸

2.1.3 In terms of teaching, both suttas have **a parable** each. M 40 uses <u>the parable of the pleasant lotus</u> <u>pond</u> [§13.1] to illustrate the benefits of cultivating the 4 divine abodes and how this benefits everyone. M 73 has the parable of the good cloth (M 7,12) to illustrate mental purification.

¹⁴ MĀ 183 @ T1.726c13, corresponding to the explanation of the same 4 terms found in MĀ 182 @ T1.725c4 (see Analayo 2011:259 n274).

¹⁵ Analayo, "The Influence of Commentarial Exegesis on the Transmission of Āgama Literature," in *Translating Buddhist Chinese, Problems and Prospects,* East Asia Intercultural Studies 3, (ed) K Meisig, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2010:1-20.

¹⁶ M 7,19-20/1:39 (SD 28.12).

¹⁷ M 7,13-16/1:38 (SD 28.12).

¹⁸ M 7,17-18/1:38 f (SD 28.12).

2.1.4 While our Sutta here only briefly mentions "**preparing the mind**" [§8], M 7 gives a detailed explanation of "progress in meditation," mentioning also the joy arising from understand the purpose and nature of the Dharma (*attha*, *veda dhamma*, *veda*). Interestingly, this more detailed explanation is given to a single brahmin (a layman) while the teaching of Cūla Assa, pura Sutta is addressed to the monks. At the close of the respective suttas, while Sundarika goes for refuge, the monks joyfully approve of the Buddha's teaching.

<u>Vatthûpama Sutta (M 7,3), SD 28.12</u>		<u>Cūļa Assa,pura Sutta (M 40,3), SD 41.8</u>			
(1)	Covetousness and rampant g	reed	(1)	<u>covetous</u>	(abhijjhālu)
	(abl	nijjhā,visama.lobh	a) ¹⁹		
(2)	III will	(vyāpada)	(2)	has ill will	(vyāpanna,citta)
(3)	Anger	(kodha)	(3)	has anger	(kodha) ²⁰
(4)	Grudge [Resentment]	(upanāha)	(4)	grudging [resenting]	(upanāha) ²¹
(5)	Scorn [Contempt]	(makkha)	(5)	scornful	(makkha) ²²
(6)	Spite [Malice]	(palāsa)	(6)	spiteful [malicious]	(palāsa) ²³
(7)	Envy	(issā)	(7)	envious	(issā)
(8)	Stinginess [Selfishness]	(macchariya)	(8)	stingy	(macchariya)
(9)	Deceit	(māyā) 🖉 👞	(9)	fraudulent	(sāṭheyya) ²⁴
(10)	Fraud [Hypocrisy]	(sāțheyya) 泽	< (10)	deceitful	(māyā)
(11)	Callousness [Stubbornness]	(thambha) ²⁵	(11)	has bad [evil] wishes	(pāpikā icchā)
(12)	Impetuosity [Rivalry]	(sārambha) ²⁶	(12)	has wrong views	(micchā,dițțhi)
(13)	Conceit	(māna)			
(14)	Arrogance	(atimāna)			

¹⁹ Comy def **abhijjhā** as desire-or-lust (*chanda,rāga*) for our own things, while **visama,lobha** is desire-or-lust for those of others. DA defs *visama,lobha* as excessive greed (or neurotic desire) by way of consuming things (*paribhoga,yuttesu pi ţhānesu atibalava,lobho*), in other words, excessive materialism and consumerism (DA 3:853): see SD 31/7 (7.1). Our sutta comy discussed other distinctions, but concludes that, since all greed is disharmonious (*visama*), the two terms should be understood as synonyms (MA 1:169). However, when *abhijjhā* is used by itself or in the dvandva, *abhijjhā,domanassa*, it is usually rendered as "covetousness and displeasure" (eg M 10.4b/1:56) & SD 13.3 (4.2). I think *abhijjhā,visama,lobha* is synonymous with *chanda,rāga*, so that, likewise, the former (*abhij-jhā*) refers to the desire for an unacquired object, while the latter (*visama,lobha*) is the attachment to the acquired object (Abhidharma,kośa Vyākhyā): see *Kāma-c,chanda* = 32.1 (2.1).

²⁰ A set of 50 suttas (10 sets of 5 pairs of suttas, one negative, one positive) of **Kodha Peyyāla** (the Anger Cycle); the pairs of qualities are (1) anger and grudge, (2) scorn and spite, (3) envy and stinginess, (4) fraud and deceit [sic], and (5) lack of moral shame and lack of moral fear (*ahirikañ ca anottappañ ca*). The first 4 pairs form faults nos 3-10 here, while pair (5) is unique to the Kodha Peyyāla (A 2.180-229/1:95-97).

²³ Palāsa, "spite," ie, causing dispute, competing, not giving in (Vbh 892/357); or, presumption ($yuga-g,gah\bar{a}$) in regarding ourself to be as good another, esp when he is better (MA 1:169).

²⁴ *Sāțheyya,* "fraud," ie, hypocrisy, pretence, pretentiousness (Vbh 894/358).

²¹ Upanāha, "grudge," ie, continuous and worsening anger (Vbh 891/357). It arises after we are repeatedly angry about someone or something (MA 1:169).

²² Makkha (from √MŖKŞ, "to smear"), derogatory action (Vbh 892/357), or devaluation of benefits others place on us (MA 1:169), often coupled with *pa*/āsa: M 1:15; A 1:95, 100, 299, 4:148, 456, 5:39, 156, 209, 310, 361; It 3; Sn 56, 437, 631, 1132; Dh 150, 407; J 5:141; Vbh 357, 380, 389; Pug 18, 22.

²⁵ Thambha. See **Arahatta S** (S 6.76/3:429), where Comys explain *thambha* as inflexibility, "like bellows full of air" (MA 1:170), or "a state of callousness by way of anger and conceit" (*kodha,mānehi thaddha,bhāvaṃ*) (AA 3:411).

²⁶ Sārambha. "impetuosity" (Sn 328c); the drive to outdo other (by way of one-up-manship) (MA 1:170); "the habit of drawing out conflicting action" (*paccanīka,sātatā,saṅkhāto,* SnA 334). See **Paccanīka,sāta S** (S 7.16/1:178).

(15) Mental intoxication [Pride] (mada)

(16) Heedlessness [Negligence] (pamāda)

Table 2.1.1 Lists of impurities in M 7 and M 40²⁷

2.2 THE SATTA JAȚILA SUTTA (S 3.11) mentions seven kinds of recluses, namely, matted-hair ascetics (*jațila*), nirgrantha [Jain] ascetics (*niganțha*), naked ascetics (*acela*), single-robed [loin-clothed] ascetics (*eka,sāțaka*), and wanderers (*paribbājaka*). The Sutta recounts how while the Buddha was sitting by the outer gateway of the mansion of Migāra's mother, they paraded in rows of sevens past him and king Pasenadi. The Sutta tells us:

Now at that time, seven matted-hair ascetics, seven nirgrantha [Jain] ascetics, seven naked ascetics, seven loin-clothed [single-robed] ascetics, and seven wanderers, with long head-hair, long finger-nails and long body-hair, each carrying his pole and khari,²⁸ passed by not far from the Blessed One. (S 3.11,3/1:78) + SD 14.11

The king politely salutes the parading ascetics, and then tells the Buddha that these ascetics must be arhats. The Buddha replies by saying that it is difficult for a worldly person like the king to know another's spiritual state. The Buddha then instructs the king on how to really know another person's character. The king then confides in the Buddha that these "ascetics" are really his spies who have returned from their missions to report to him.

At the close of the Sutta, the Buddha admonishes the monks with these words:

Not easily known is a man by looks or form,
For in the guise of one well restrained

Like a false earring of clay, some move and follow about in disguise,

nor should one trust a casual [quick] glance. the unrestrained wander the world.

like an iron half-cent in the guise of gold, inwardly impure, outwardly beautiful.

(S 3.11/1:77-79), SD 14.11

3 The 10 kinds of recluses [§5]

3.0 RECLUSES AND ASCETICS. The Cūļa Assa, pura Sutta mentions ten kinds of recluses and ascetics, and stating that <u>true recluseship does not depend on external observances</u>. Before we examine what kind of recluses or ascetics they are, a note on the two terms, "recluse" (*samaņa*) and "ascetic" (*tapasa, tapas-sī*). The term *samaņa* is often found in the dvandva, *samaņa,brāḥmaṇa*, "recluses and brahmins," representing the major division between the schools of ideas and ideologies in the Buddha's time.

While <u>the brahmins</u> were the predominant or mainstream religious "church," the rising popular social and religious reaction against them was represented by the "recluses" or *samaṇa* (Skt *śramaṇa*),²⁹ who constituted the "reform movement," where the Buddha was one of the key antagonists, even the main one, against the brahmins, proclaiming a new spiritual teaching away from theism, priesthood and rituals toward self-effort, personal accountability and mental cultivation.

²⁷ Further see SD 51.8 (Table 3.2).

²⁸ *Khāri*, *vidha*, ie a carrying-pole with the *khāri* container (D 1:101; DA 269; S 1:78 = U 65; J 3:116, 5:204, 207; SA 1:148). A *khāri* is a measure of grain, and is used by ascetics for carrying their requisites.

²⁹ From VśRAM, "to be weary"; but also incl meaning of √śAM (1), "to labour"; cf √śAM (2), "to be quiet." See SD 25.1 (1) & SID: samaṇa,brāhmaṇa,paribbājaka.

Some members of this reform movement, also known as "<u>wanderers</u>" (Skt *parivrājakā*; P *paribbāja-ka*) who were not householders but eremites or wandering renunciants. Those who kept strict rules or practised self-mortification were known as "<u>ascetics</u>" (*tāpasa* or *tapassī*), such as our Bodhisattva when he was undergoing self-mortification.³⁰

In the Cūla Assa, pura Sutta, the term "<u>recluse</u>" (*samana*) is used as a blanket term for all religious and practitioners, including the Buddhists. The focus clearly is more on the Buddhist monastics themselves, to whom the teaching is addressed. Clearly, the Sutta addresses us today, too, if we regard ourselves as Buddhist practitioners, whether ordained or lay. As such, we need to understand and apply at least the spirit of the Sutta.

3.1 *Sainghāțika* [§5(1)] means "the one dressed in a *sainghāți*," which we well know to be a Buddhist monastic's "outer robe" or the third of his or her three robes. Amongst the Theravada monks of today, this third robe is worn as a long folded piece over the left shoulder. When needed, it is spread or refolded to be used as a seat or blanket.³¹ But in the Cūļa Assa, pura Sutta, it carries a broader sense of the garb of a religious or a renunciant.

The Majjhima Commentary reads the word as *saṅghāṭiyā* and glosses it as "silk" (*kosiyā*, MA 2:-325). This probably refers to those holy men or those who claim to be holy men (such as the "sadhus" in modern India), who dress in silk robes or impressive dresses. This could, of course, refer to any robed "holy men" that we sometimes see locally. It is possible (pace the Commentaries) that *saṅghāṭika* is synonymous to or includes the "single-robed ascetics" (*eka,sāṭaka*, sometimes the "loin-clothed") Jain monks who habitually wear only a simple lower robe or waist-cloth reaching the knees or lower leg.³²

3.2 ACELAKA [§5(2)] means "naked ascetic," especially whose nakedness is an expression of the ultimate renunciation: there are no pockets on the human skin! Some of the better known naked ascetics in the suttas are³³

• Upaka	Vinaya; Ariya Pariyesanā Sutta	V 1:8; M 1:171	SD 12.1 (4)
 Punna the cow ascetic & 			
Seniya the dog ascetic	Kukkura,vatika Sutta	M 57/1:387-392	SD 23.11
 Acelaka Kassapa 	Acelaka Kassapa Sutta	S 12.17/2:20	SD 18.5

A short form of the term, *acela*, is often identified as the Ājīvakas,³⁴ whose founder is said to be the fatalist teacher, Makkhali Gosāla.³⁵ Interestingly, such naked ascetics were not really religious teachers but what we would today know as "hippies" or counterculture, even amoral, gurus.

³⁰ See esp **Bhaya,bherava S** (M 4.20/1:20 f), **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12.44-61/1:77-82), **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36.20-30/1:242-246). Traditionally, ie post-canonically, this period of the Bodhisattva's experiment with self-torture methods lasted "six years." However, "[t]he Pali Canon does not, to my knowledge, indicate anywhere how long the future Buddha tried alternative methods. In the later literature [Buddhacarita, Lalitavistara, Mahavastu, J 1:67], however, it is often said that it lasted six years." (Bronkhorst 1993:14 & n18). See also SD 1.11 (2.1) Renunciation & self-mortification.

³¹ On <u>the monastic robes</u>, see <u>http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kasaya (clothing)</u>. For a monastic's reflection on robes: <u>http://sujato.wordpress.com/2010/04/14/my-new-sanghati/</u>.

³² For refs & on problem of identifying them, see CPD sv. Cf V:H 5:191 n6.

³³ See also Acelaka Pațipadā Ss 1 & 2 (A 3.151+152/1:295-297), SD 78.1.

³⁴ A L Basham, *History and Doctrines of the Ājīvikas,* London, 1951; DPPN: Ājīvakā; also K N Jayatilleke, *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge,* 1963:143-145 (see index) & P S Jaini, *Collected Papers on Buddhist Studies,* (1970) 2001:57-61.

³⁵ See **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,18/1:53-55) (SD 8.10).

3.3 *RAJO,JALLIKA* [§5(3)]. These are the "dust and dirt" ascetics, that is, they cover themselves in dust and dirt (MA 2:325). These are probably naked ascetics who "dress" themselves in layers of dust and cakes of dirt, that is, they do not wash at all. Washing or grooming are regarded as sensual activities!

3.4 *UDAK'OROHAKA* [§5(4)] means "one who dips into the water," that is, the <u>baptists</u> of ancient India. **The Asi,bandhaka,putta Sutta** (S 42.6)³⁶ and **the (Kamma,patha) Cunda Sutta** (A 10.176)³⁷ speak of them as "brahmins of the west." These Suttas and the Majjhima Commentary say that these baptist brahmins submerged themselves in the water thrice a day (to cleanse themselves of their wrong-doings).³⁸

A famous example of the baptist brahmin is Sundarika Bhāra.dvāja in **the Vatthûpama Sutta** (M 7), which also records the Buddha's timeless statement on the "inner washing" (M 7).³⁹ In other words, any kind of ritual action without proper reflection and inner purity may be religious, but they are certainly not spiritual. They are merely an impressive show of faith or power at best, but simply lacking in the spirit of true reality and goodness.

3.5 *RUKKHA,MŪLIKA* [§5(5)] is a "tree-foot dweller," that is, a practitioner of the 9th of the 13 strict ascetic practices (*dhutanga*).⁴⁰ This is an ancient practice amongst the wanderers (*paribbājaka*) [3.0] of the Buddha's time and even before him. However, the Buddha allows his monks to voluntarily take up this ascetic practice if they are inclined to. This practice and that of the "open-air dweller" (*abbh'okāsika*) [3.1.7] are the only two from this list of 10 practices that are practised by the Buddhist monks as options.

3.6 *ABBH'OKĀSIKA* [§5(6)], or the "open-air dweller," is listed with other kinds of ascetics (but without the "tree-foot dweller") in **the Mahā Sīha,nāda Sutta** (M 8);⁴¹ in a list of 10 of the 13 ascetic practices in **the Sappurisa Sutta** (M 113);⁴² with "tree-foot-dweller" and others in **the Kaṇha Jātaka**.⁴³ Apparently, "<u>tree-foot dwelling</u>" and "<u>open-air dwelling</u>" are the earliest of the 13 ascetic practices, which is understandable as the early monks were wanderers. Again, merely taking up such a life-style does not make us true recluses. We need to purify mind and body for the sake of spiritual awakening.

3.7 *UBBHA-Ţ*, ŢHAKA [§5(7)] (Skt *ūrdhva,sthaka,* literally, standing tall," connoting one "superior") is the ritual of "one who stands upright," not squatting, sitting down, walking or lying down, all his life as a religious way of life or show of religiosity, that is, <u>a standing asceticism</u>.⁴⁴ **The Cūļa Dukkha-k,khandha Sutta** (M 14) says that some some Nirgranthas (Jains) practise this asceticism.⁴⁵ This practice can still be seen even today in India.

⁴⁵ M 14,16/1:92,18 (SD 4.7).

³⁶ S 42.6,3.1/4:312 (SD 39.9).

³⁷ A 10.176/5:263(SD 79.12).

³⁸ A 10.176/5:263,19-23; MA 2:325.

³⁹ M 7,19-20/1:39) (SD 28.12).

⁴⁰ For a full list, see SD 3.15 (2.1).

⁴¹ M 8,14/1:167,10.

⁴² M 113,20/3:42,5.

⁴³ J 440/4:8,11.

⁴⁴ D 1:167,5 = 3:42,1 = M 1:308,11 = 343,14 = A 1:296,3 (Ee *ubh~; uddhaṁ țhitako,* AA 2:385,27) = 2:206,33 = Pug 55,33 (PugA 233,9 = AA) = Nm 1:417,9 (NA 1:431,19 = AA).

3.8 *PARIYĀYA, BHATTIKA* [§5(8)]. This is the practice of <u>regimented or measured eating</u>. The Commentary says that the practitioner eats only once a month or a fortnight (MA 2:325). This is probably an allusion to a practice of *āhāra, paryāpti* ("food-morsels") of the Jain monks, especially the Dīgambara (the naked ones) who take only a single meal a day. Neither the Dīgambara nor the Śvetambara (the white-clad ones) beg for food, but may accept a meal from a householder who is pure of mind and body, and offers the food of his own volition and in the prescribed manner. During such an encounter, the Jain monk remains standing and eats only a measured amount.

3.9 *MANT'AJJHĀYAKA* [§5(9)] are <u>the Veda-reciters</u>.⁴⁶ Even *ajjhāyaka*, "reciters" or pejoratively, "nonmeditators," commonly refers to brahmins engaged in learning the Vedas.⁴⁷ Here *mantra* refers to a specific vedic hymns or sacrificial formulae. *Ajjhāyaka* (Skt *ādhyāyika*, *adhyāyin*) is a vedic student or scholar, one skilled in reciting the Vedas, a brahminical teacher.

Interestingly, in later Buddhist literature, with growing brahminization of Buddhism, especially in Sri Lanka, *adhyayaka* comes to mean "teacher" (eg Rasa,vahīni 19). In Thailand, the word for "puja recitation," that is, a daily offices of Pali chants (which includes selected passages from the suttas, sometimes full suttas themselves) is "swod montr," where *montr* is *mantra*.

3.10 JAŢILAKA [§5(10)] or jațila refers to ascetics with matted (thick and untidy) hair (UA 74, 330), sometimes classed as "seers" (*isi*, Nc 149), sometimes as "sages" (*muni*, Nc 513). The best known <u>matted-hair ascetics</u> are the 3 Kassapa brothers (Mahā Kassapa, Uruvelā Kassapa and Nadī Kassapa), known as "former matted-hair ascetics " (*purāņa jațila*, V 1:24-35). They became arhats on listening to **the Āditta, pariyāya Sutta** (S 35.28).⁴⁸

_ _ _

⁴⁶ J 6:209; SnA 192. This term begins the full stock passage: "a mantra-reciter, a mantra-expert, a master of the Three Vedas, along with their invocations and rituals, phonology and etymology, and the Iti,hāsa Purāņas as the fifth; learned in the vedic padas, grammarian, and well versed in the Lokāyata [nature-lore] and the marks of the great man" (*ajjhāyako manta,dharo tiņņam vedānam pāragū sa,nighaņḍu,keṭubhānam sākkhara-p,pabhedānam iti,hāsa,pañcamānam padako veyyākaraņo lokāyata,mahā.purisa.lakkhaņesu anavayo*): **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 3.1.3/-1:88), **Soṇa,daņḍa S** (D 4,5(3)/1:114), **Kūṭa,danta S** (D 5,6(3)/1:130); **Ti,kaṇṇa S** (A 3.58,1/1:163), **(Tevijja) Jāņussoņī S** (A 3.59,1/1:166), **Doṇa Brāhmaṇa S** (A 5.192.2.4+6/3:223 f). **Aggañña S** (D 27) plays a humorous pun on its etym: *na ... jhāyanti*, "they do not meditate," hence they are called *ajjhāyaka*, ie non-meditators: see D 27,23/3:94 = SD 2.19.

⁴⁷ D 1:88,4; M 2:154,4; A 1:163,10, 166,18, 3:223,17; Tha 1171; B 2:6

⁴⁸ S 35.28 = V 1:33f = SD 1.3. Cf **Pāyāsi S** (D 23,21/2:339-342) @ SD 39.4. See also V 1:246, 4:109.

The Lesser Discourse at Assa, pura

M 40

1 Thus have I heard.

The Buddha in Anga country

1.2 At one time, the Blessed One lived amongst the Angas. There was a market-town named Assa,pura.⁴⁹

1.3 There the Blessed One addressed the monks, "Bhikshus!" 'Bhante!" the monks replied to the Blessed One in assent. The Blessed One said this:

What really is a recluse?

2 "'Recluse, recluse (*samana*),' bhikshus, so people perceive you,

and when you are asked, 'Who are you" (ke tumhe),⁵⁰ you claim, 'We're recluses.'

2.2 Bhikshus, since you are <u>designated</u> so, and you <u>declare</u> so, you should train yourself thus: 'We will practise <u>the proper way of a recluse</u>.⁵¹

This way, this designation of ours would be true, and this claim would be real.⁵²

2.3 And whatever robes, almsfood, lodging and support for the sick and medicinal requisites we use, would bring us great fruit, great benefit,

so that this going-forth of ours will not be fruitless [barren], but be fruitful and fertile.'53

The stains of a recluse

3 And how, bhikshus, is a monk *not* accomplished in the proper way of a recluse?

3.2 Bhikshus, any monk⁵⁴

(1)	is covetous,	whose covetousness is not abandoned;	abhijjhālu
(2)	who has ill will,	whose ill will is not abandoned;	vyāpanna,citta
(3)	who has anger,	whose anger is not abandoned;	kodha ⁵⁵

280) = SD 10.13, our Sutta speaks of "the proper way of a recluse" (*samaņa,samīci,pațipadā*).

⁵² Evaṁ no ayaṁ amhākaṁ samaññā ca saccā bhavissati pațiññā ca bhūtā.

⁵⁴ In **Vatthûpama S** (M 7), these 12 "faults of a recluse" are part of a list of 16 "mental impurities" (*cittassa upak-kilesa*) (M 7,3) + SD 28.12 (2.1.1). They are an elaboration based on the 3 unwholesome roots (*akusala mūla*).

⁵⁵ A set of 50 suttas (10 sets of 5 pairs of suttas, one negative, one positive) of **Kodha Peyyāla** (the Anger Cycle); the pairs of qualities are (1) anger and grudge, (2) scorn and spite, (3) envy and stinginess, (4) fraud and deceit [sic], and (5) lack of moral shame and lack of moral fear (*ahirikañ ca anottappañ ca*). The first 4 pairs form faults nos 3-10 here, while pair (5) is unique to the Kodha Peyyāla (A 2.180-229/1:95-97).

⁴⁹ Ekaṁ samayaṁ bhagavā aṅgesu viharati assapuraṁ nāma aṅgānaṁ nigamo.

⁵⁰ **Moliya Phagguna S** (S 12.12) says this is a question "wrongly put": we should ask "*What* are you?" (S 12.12/-2:12-14) = SD 20.5. Here however we have a worldly situation and the tr reflects this conventional reality.

⁵¹ Yā samaņa, sāmīci-p, paţipadā, tam paţipajjissāma. While **Mahā Assa, pura S** (M 39) speaks of "the things that make one a recluse and makes one a brahmin" (*dhammā samaņa, karaņā ca brāhmaņa, karaņā ca*) (M 39/1:271-

⁵³ Yesañ ca mayam cīvara, piņdapāta, senāsana, gilāna-p, paccaya, bhesajja, parikkhāram paribhuñjāma, tesam te kārā amhesu maha-p, phalā bhavissanti mahânisamsā, amhākañ c'evâyam pabbajjā avañjhā bhavissati sa, phalā sa, -udrayâti.

(4) who is grudging [resentful],	whose grudge is not abandoned;	upanāha ⁵⁶
(5) who is scornful,	whose denigrating is not abandoned;	makkha ⁵⁷
(6) who is spiteful [malicious],	whose spite is not abandoned;	paļāsa ⁵⁸
(7) who is envious, ⁵⁹	whose envy is not abandoned;	issā
(8) who is stingy,	whose stinginess is not abandoned;	macchariya
(9) who is fraudulent,	whose fraud is not abandoned;	sāţheyya ⁶⁰
(10)who is deceitful,	whose deceit is not abandoned;	māyā
(11)who has bad [evil] wishes,	whose bad wishes are not abandoned;	pāpikā icchā
(12) who has wrong views,	whose wrong views are not abandoned.	micchā diţţhi
3.3 Bhikshus, on account of not a	abandoning these stains of a recluse, faults of a	recluse, dregs of a

3.3 Bhikshus, on account of <u>not</u> abandoning these stains of a recluse, faults of a recluse, dregs of a recluse, grounds for downfall [loss], to be experienced in suffering states—he has *not* practised the proper way of the recluse, I say!⁶¹

The mataja parable

4 Bhikshus, just like a weapon called *mataja* [the "death-bringer"], double-edged and whetted sharp, wrapped and folded in his sanghati [upper robe],⁶²

even so, bhikshus, is this going-forth of a monk, I say!63

Recluseship is in neither ritual nor appearance⁶⁴

5 (1) Bhikshus, there is <u>no</u> recluseship for <u>a sanghati-wearer</u>	saṅghāṭika ⁶⁵
merely on account of wearing a sanghati [upper robe], I say!	
(2) Bhikshus, there is no recluseship for a naked ascetic.	acelaka ⁶⁶
merely on account of nakedness, I say!	

⁵⁶ Upanāha, "grudge," ie, continuous and worsening anger (Vbh 891/357). It arises after we are repeatedly angry about someone or something (MA 1:169).

⁵⁷ Makkha (from √MRKS, "to smear"), derogatory action (Vbh 892/357), or devaluation of benefits others place on us (MA 1:169), often coupled with *palāsa*: M 1:15; A 1:95, 100, 299, 4:148, 456, 5:39, 156, 209, 310, 361; It 3; Sn 56, 437, 631, 1132; Dh 150, 407; J 5:141; Vbh 357, 380, 389; Pug 18, 22.

⁵⁸ Palāsa, "spite," ie, causing dispute, competing, not giving in (Vbh 892/357); or, presumption ($yuga-g,gah\bar{a}$) in regarding ourself to be as good another, esp when he is better (MA 1:169).

⁵⁹ This phrase and the next: *issukissa issā appahīnā hoti*. See **Sallekha S** (M 8,12(28) n), SD 51.8.

⁶⁰ Sāțheyya, "fraud," ie, hypocrisy, pretence, pretentiousness (Vbh 894/358).

⁶¹ Imesam kho aham bhikkhave samaṇa,malānam samaṇa,dosānam samaṇa,kasaṭānam āpāyikānam ṭhānānam duggati,vedaniyānam appahānā, na samaṇa,sāmīci-p.paṭipadam paṭipanno'ti vadāmi.

⁶² Seyyathā'pi bhikkhave matajam nāma āvudha, jātam ubhato, dhāram pīta, nisitam, tad assa sanghāţiyā sampārutam sampaliveţhitam. Comy glosses sanghāţi as "silk" (kosiyā, MA 2:325), but I take it as a monastic "upper robe," which I think is intended here, that is to say, the idea of a monastic having such a dreadful weapon so intimately close to himself or herself. The robe should be respected with great care and diligence.

⁶³ Tathûpamâhaṁ bhikkhave imassa bhikkhuno pabbajjaṁ vadāmi.

⁶⁴ All these observances, except for (5+6), are not found in the Buddha's teaching. Although *sanghāți* is a Buddhist monastic's "upper robe," the *sanghāțika* here is not any of the 13 strict practices (*dhutanga*) [SD 3.15 (2)] nor anywhere else in the suttas (MA 2:325).

⁶⁵ Saṅghāțika: see Intro (3.1).

⁶⁶ Acelaka: see Intro (3.2).

(3)	Bhikshus, there is <i>no</i> recluseship for <u>one living in dust and dirt</u> .	rajo,jallika ⁶⁷
	merely on account of dust and dirt, I say!	
(4)	Bhikshus, there is no recluseship for <u>a ritual bather</u> .	udak'orohaka ⁶⁸
	merely on account of ritual bathing, I say!	
(5)	Bhikshus, there is <i>no</i> recluseship for <u>a tree-foot dweller</u> . [282]	rukkha,mūlika ⁶⁹
	merely on account of dwelling at a tree-foot, I say!	
(6)	Bhikshus, there is no recluseship for an open-air dweller.	abbh'okāsika ⁷⁰
	merely on account of living in the open, I say!	
(7)	Bhikshus, there is no recluseship for an upright stander.	ubbha-ţ,ţhaka ⁷¹
	merely on account of standing upright, I say!	
(8)	Bhikshus, there is <i>no</i> recluseship for <u>a regimented eater</u> .	pariyāya,bhattika ⁷²
	merely on account of regimented eating, I say!	
(9)	Bhikshus, there is no recluseship for a mantra reciter.	mant'ajjhāyaka ⁷³
	merely on account of reciting mantras, I say!	
(10)	Bhikshus, there is no recluseship for a matted-hair ascetic.	jațilaka ⁷⁴
	merely on account of having matted hair, I say!	

RECLUSESHIP IS NOT AN EXTERNAL LIFESTYLE

(1) Recluseship is not merely wearing a sanghati

6 If, bhikshus, merely on account of <u>wearing a sanghati</u> [upper robe], **a sanghati-wearer** (*saṅghāțika*)

	who is covetous	were to abandon covetousness,
	who has ill will	were to abandon ill will,
	who has anger	were to abandon anger,
	who is grudging	were to abandon grudge,
	who is scornful	were to abandon scorn,
	who is spiteful	were to abandon spite,
	who is envious	were to abandon envy,
	who is stingy	were to abandon stinginess,
	who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
	who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
	who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
	who has wrong views	were to abandon wrong views—
2	Alexan such and has to be any futaneous and a	فماحد ادحماط ادبيم ممريك احدر ممريح ممالم

6.2 then, when he is born, friends and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only need to make him <u>a sanghati-wearer</u>, and have him take upon himself that *sanghati-wearing*, thus:

'Come now, Bhadra, mukha [Good-face], 75 be <u>a sanghati-wearer</u>!

⁶⁷ *Rajo, jallika:* see Intro (3.3).

⁶⁸ Udak'orohaka: see Intro (3.4).

⁶⁹ Rukkha, mūlika: see Intro (3.5).

⁷⁰ Abbh'okāsika: see Intro (3.6).

⁷¹ Ubbh'ațțhaka: see Intro (3.7).

⁷² Pariyāya, bhattika: see Intro (3.9).

⁷³ Mant'ajjhāyaka: see Intro (3.9).

⁷⁴ *Jațilaka:* see Intro (3.10).

6.3 Merely by your wearing the sanghati,

· · · ·	
when you are covetous,	you will abandon covetousness;
when you have ill will,	you will abandon ill will;
when you are angry,	you will abandon anger;
when you are grudging,	you will abandon grudge;
when you are scornful,	you will abandon scorn;
when you are spiteful,	you will abandon spite;
when you are envious,	you will abandon envy;
when you are stingy,	you will abandon stinginess;
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
when you have a wrong view,	you will abandon wrong views.'—

6.4 But, bhikshus, I still see some <u>sanghati-wearers</u> here who are *covetous, show ill will, angry, grudging, scornful, spiteful, envious, stingy, deceitful, fraudulent, have bad wishes, and have wrong views*.

6.5 Therefore, there is no recluseship for <u>a sanghati-wearer</u> merely on account of *wearing a sanghati*, I say!

(2) Recluseship is not merely through naked asceticism

	or being <u>marca</u> , a marca accus (acchana)
who is covetous	were to abandon covetousness,
who has ill will	were to abandon ill will,
who has anger	were to abandon anger,
who is grudging	were to abandon grudge,
who is scornful	were to abandon scorn,
who is spiteful	were to abandon spite,
who is envious	were to abandon envy,
who is stingy	were to abandon stinginess,
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
who has wrong views	were to abandon wrong views—
7 then when he is he is horn frid	ands and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only

6.7 then, when he is he is born, friends and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only need to make him <u>a naked ascetic</u>, and have him take upon himself that *naked asceticism*, thus:

'Come now, Bhadra, mukha [Fortune-face], be a naked ascetic!

6.8 Merely by your <u>being naked</u>,

when you are covetous,	you will abandon covetousness;
when you have ill will,	you will abandon ill will;
when you are angry,	you will abandon anger;
when you are grudging,	you will abandon grudge;
when you are scornful,	you will abandon scorn;

⁷⁵ Bhadra,mukha or bhadda,mukha, lit "auspicious-faced," one whose face brings blessings, meaning something like "my noble friend," or "this honourable one," or even "this dear fellow," a complimentary or affectionate or intimate mode of address (M 2:53,27, 210,11 f; S 1:74; J 2:261; Vism 92,21; J 2:261,14). See S:RD 1:100 n3, S:B 401 n211.

when you are spiteful,	you will abandon spite;
when you are envious,	you will abandon envy;
when you are stingy,	you will abandon stinginess;
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
when you have a wrong view,	you will abandon wrong views.'—

6.9 But, bhikshus, I still see some <u>naked ascetics</u> here who are *covetous, show ill will, angry, grudging, scornful, spiteful, envious, stingy, deceitful, fraudulent, have bad wishes, and have wrong views.*

6.10 Therefore, there is no recluseship for a naked ascetic merely on account of being naked, I say!

(3) Recluseship is not merely through living in dust and dirt

6.11 If, bhikshus, merely on account of dust and dirt, one living in dust and dirt (rajo, jallika)

	<u>aast and ant</u> , one nong in adst and ant
who is covetous	were to abandon covetousness,
who has ill will	were to abandon ill will,
who has anger	were to abandon anger,
who is grudging	were to abandon grudge,
who is scornful	were to abandon scorn,
who is spiteful	were to abandon spite,
who is envious	were to abandon envy,
who is stingy	were to abandon stinginess,
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
who has wrong views	were to abandon wrong views—

6.12 then, when he is he is born, friends and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only need to make him <u>one living in dust and dirt</u>, and have him take upon himself that *living in dust and dirt*, thus:

'Come now, Bhadra, mukha [Fortune-face], be one living in dust and dirt!

6.13 Merely by your <u>living in dust and dirt</u>,

· · · · <u> </u>	
when you are covetous,	you will abandon covetousness;
when you have ill will,	you will abandon ill will;
when you are angry,	you will abandon anger;
when you are grudging,	you will abandon grudge;
when you are scornful,	you will abandon scorn;
when you are spiteful,	you will abandon spite;
when you are envious,	you will abandon envy;
when you are stingy,	you will abandon stinginess;
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
when you have a wrong view,	you will abandon wrong views.'—

6.14 But, bhikshus, I still see some <u>living in dust and dirt</u> here who are *covetous, show ill will, angry, grudging, scornful, spiteful, envious, stingy, deceitful, fraudulent, have bad wishes, and have wrong views*.

6.15 Therefore, there is no recluseship for <u>one living in dust and dirt</u> merely on account of *being dusty and dirty*, I say!

(4) Recluseship is not merely through ritual bathing

6.16 If, bhikshus, merely on account of ritual bathing [baptism], a ritual bather (udak'orohaka)

who is covetous	were to abandon covetousness,
who has ill will	were to abandon ill will,
who has anger	were to abandon anger,
who is grudging	were to abandon grudge,
who is scornful	were to abandon scorn,
who is spiteful	were to abandon spite,
who is envious	were to abandon envy,
who is stingy	were to abandon stinginess,
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
who has wrong views	were to abandon wrong views—

6.17 then, when he is born, friends and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only need to make him <u>a ritual bather</u> [a ritual washer], and have him take upon himself that *ritual bathing* [*ritual washing*], thus:

'Come now, Bhadra, mukha [Fortune-face], be one living by ritual bathing!

6.18 Merely by your <u>ritual bathing</u>,

when you are covetous,	you will abandon covetousness;
when you have ill will,	you will abandon ill will;
when you are angry,	you will abandon anger;
when you are grudging,	you will abandon grudge;
when you are scornful,	you will abandon scorn;
when you are spiteful,	you will abandon spite;
when you are envious,	you will abandon envy;
when you are stingy,	you will abandon stinginess;
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
when you have a wrong view,	you will abandon wrong views.'—

6.19 But, bhikshus, I still see some <u>ritual bathers</u> here who are *covetous, show ill will, angry, grudging, scornful, spiteful, envious, stingy, deceitful, fraudulent, have bad wishes, and have wrong views*.

6.20 Therefore, there is no recluseship for ritual bathers merely on account of ritual bathing, I say!

(5) Recluseship is not merely dwelling under a tree

6.21 If, bhikshus, merely on account of <u>dwelling at the foot of a tree</u>, **a tree-foot dweller** (*rukkha,-mūlika*)

who is covetous	were to abandon covetousness,
who has ill will	were to abandon ill will,
who has anger	were to abandon anger,
who is grudging	were to abandon grudge,

who is scornful	were to abandon scorn,
who is spiteful	were to abandon spite,
who is envious	were to abandon envy,
who is stingy	were to abandon stinginess,
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
who has wrong views	were to abandon wrong views—
5	5

6.22 then, when he is born, friends and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only need to make him a tree-foot dweller, and have him take upon himself that dwelling at the foot of a tree, thus:

'Come now, Bhadra, mukha [Fortune-face], be one living by tree-foot dwelling!

6.23 Merely by your dwelling at the foot of a tree,

	<u></u> ,
when you are covetous,	you will abandon covetousness;
when you have ill will,	you will abandon ill will;
when you are angry,	you will abandon anger;
when you are grudging,	you will abandon grudge;
when you are scornful,	you will abandon scorn;
when you are spiteful,	you will abandon spite;
when you are envious,	you will abandon envy;
when you are stingy,	you will abandon stinginess;
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
when you have a wrong view,	you will abandon wrong views.'—

6.24 But, bhikshus, I still see some tree-foor dwellers here who are covetous, show ill will, angry, grudging, scornful, spiteful, envious, stingy, deceitful, fraudulent, have bad wishes, and have wrong views.

6.25 Therefore, there is no recluseship for tree-foot dwellers merely on account of dwelling at the foot of a tree, I say!

(6) Recluseship is not merely open-air dwelling

6.26 If, bhikshus, merely on account of open-air dwelling, an open-air dweller (abbh'okāsika)

were to abandon covetousness,
were to abandon ill will,
were to abandon anger,
were to abandon grudge,
were to abandon scorn,
were to abandon spite,
were to abandon envy,
were to abandon stinginess,
were to abandon fraud,
were to abandon deceit,
were to abandon bad wishes,
were to abandon wrong views—

6.27 then, when he is born, friends and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only need to make him <u>an open-air dweller</u>, and have him take upon himself that *open-air dwelling*, thus:

'Come now, Bhadra, mukha [Fortune-face], be one living by open-air dwelling!

6.28 Merely by your open-air dwelling,

when you are covetous,	you will abandon covetousness;
when you have ill will,	you will abandon ill will;
when you are angry,	you will abandon anger;
when you are grudging,	you will abandon grudge;
when you are scornful,	you will abandon scorn;
when you are spiteful,	you will abandon spite;
when you are envious,	you will abandon envy;
when you are stingy,	you will abandon stinginess;
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
when you have a wrong view,	you will abandon wrong views.'—

6.29 But, bhikshus, I still see some <u>open-air dwellers</u> here who are *covetous, show ill will, angry, grudging, scornful, spiteful, envious, stingy, deceitful, fraudulent, have bad wishes, and have wrong views*.

6.30 Therefore, there is no recluseship for <u>open-air dwellers</u> merely on account of *open-air dwelling*, I say!

(7) Recluseship is not merely standing upright

6.31 If, bhikshus, merely on account of standing upright, an upright stander (ubbh'ațțhaka)

, , ,	
who is covetous	were to abandon covetousness,
who has ill will	were to abandon ill will,
who has anger	were to abandon anger,
who is grudging	were to abandon grudge,
who is scornful	were to abandon scorn,
who is spiteful	were to abandon spite,
who is envious	were to abandon envy,
who is stingy	were to abandon stinginess,
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
who has wrong views	were to abandon wrong views—
 المستعاد والمستعادة المستعاد والمستعاد والمستعاد	مناجما معراط لمعرم ممينا والمعر بمراجع

6.32 then, when he is born, friends and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only need to make him <u>an upright stander</u>, and have him take upon himself that *upright standing*, thus: 'Come now, Bhadra,mukha [Fortune-face], be one living by *standing upright*!

6.33 Merely by your <u>standing upright</u>,

when you are covetous,	you will abandon covetousness;
when you have ill will,	you will abandon ill will;
when you are angry,	you will abandon anger;
when you are grudging,	you will abandon grudge;
when you are scornful,	you will abandon scorn;
when you are spiteful,	you will abandon spite;

when you are envious,	you will abandon envy;
when you are stingy,	you will abandon stinginess;
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
when you have a wrong view,	you will abandon wrong views.'—

6.34 But, bhikshus, I still see some <u>upright standers</u> here who are *covetous, show ill will, angry, grudging, scornful, spiteful, envious, stingy, deceitful, fraudulent, have bad wishes, and have wrong views*.

6.35 Therefore, there is no recluseship for <u>upright standers</u> merely on account of *standing upright*, I say!

(8) Recluseship is not merely regimented eating

6.36 If, bhikshus, merely on account of regimented eating, a regimented eater (pariyāya, bhattika)

who is covetous	were to abandon covetousness,
who has ill will	were to abandon ill will,
who has anger	were to abandon anger,
who is grudging	were to abandon grudge,
who is scornful	were to abandon scorn,
who is spiteful	were to abandon spite,
who is envious	were to abandon envy,
who is stingy	were to abandon stinginess,
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
who has wrong views	were to abandon wrong views—

6.37 then, when he is born, friends and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only need to make him <u>a regimented eater</u>, and have him take upon himself that *regimented eating*, thus:

'Come now, Bhadra, mukha [Fortune-face], be one living by regimented eating!

6.38 Merely by your regimented eating,

when you are covetous,	you will abandon covetousness;
when you have ill will,	you will abandon ill will;
when you are angry,	you will abandon anger;
when you are grudging,	you will abandon grudge;
when you are scornful,	you will abandon scorn;
when you are spiteful,	you will abandon spite;
when you are envious,	you will abandon envy;
when you are stingy,	you will abandon stinginess;
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
when you have a wrong view,	you will abandon wrong views.'—

6.39 But, bhikshus, I still see some <u>regimented eaters</u> here who are *covetous, show ill will, angry, grudging, scornful, spiteful, envious, stingy, deceitful, fraudulent, have bad wishes, and have wrong views*.

6.40 Therefore, there is no recluseship for <u>regimented eaters</u> merely on account of *regimented eating*, I say!

(9) Recluseship is not merely mantra-reciting

6.41 If, bhikshus, merely on account of	f mantra-reciting, a mantra reciter	(mant'ajjhāyaka)
---	-------------------------------------	------------------

who is covetous	were to abandon covetousness,
who has ill will	were to abandon ill will,
who has anger	were to abandon anger,
who is grudging	were to abandon grudge,
who is scornful	were to abandon scorn,
who is spiteful	were to abandon spite,
who is envious	were to abandon envy,
who is stingy	were to abandon stinginess,
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
who has wrong views	were to abandon wrong views—

6.42 then, when he is he is born, friends and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only need to make him <u>a mantra reciter</u>, and have him take upon himself that *mantra reciting*, thus:

'Come now, Bhadra, mukha [Fortune-face], be one living by reciting mantras!

6.43 Merely by your mantra-reciting,

when you are covetous,	you will abandon covetousness;
when you have ill will,	you will abandon ill will;
when you are angry,	you will abandon anger;
when you are grudging,	you will abandon grudge;
when you are scornful,	you will abandon scorn;
when you are spiteful,	you will abandon spite;
when you are envious,	you will abandon envy;
when you are stingy,	you will abandon stinginess;
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
when you have a wrong view,	you will abandon wrong views.'—

6.44 But, bhikshus, I still see some <u>mantra reciters</u> here who are *covetous, show ill will, angry, grudging, scornful, spiteful, envious, stingy, deceitful, fraudulent, have bad wishes, and have wrong views*.

6.45 Therefore, there is no recluseship for <u>mantra reciters</u> merely on account of *reciting mantras*, I say!

(10) Recluseship is not merely having matted hair

6.46 If, bhikshus, merely on account of having matted hair, a matted hair ascetic (jațilaka)

were to abandon covetousness,
were to abandon ill will,
were to abandon anger,
were to abandon grudge,

who is scornful	were to abandon scorn,
who is spiteful	were to abandon spite,
who is envious	were to abandon envy,
who is stingy	were to abandon stinginess,
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
who has wrong views	were to abandon wrong views—

6.47 then, when he is born, friends and colleagues, relatives and blood relations, would only need to make him <u>a matted-hair ascetic</u>, and have him take upon himself that *keeping of matted-hair*, thus:

'Come now, Bhadra, mukha [Fortune-face], be one living by keeping matted hair!

6.48 Merely by your having matted hair,

when you are covetous,	you will abandon covetousness;
when you have ill will, [283]	you will abandon ill will;
when you are angry,	you will abandon anger;
when you are grudging,	you will abandon grudge;
when you are scornful,	you will abandon scorn;
when you are spiteful,	you will abandon spite;
when you are envious,	you will abandon envy;
when you are stingy,	you will abandon stinginess;
who is fraudulent	were to abandon fraud,
who is deceitful	were to abandon deceit,
who has bad [evil] wishes	were to abandon bad wishes,
when you have a wrong view,	you will abandon wrong views.'—
, ,	,

6.49 But, bhikshus, I still see some <u>matted hair ascetics</u> here who are *covetous, show ill will, angry, grudging, scornful, spiteful, envious, stingy, deceitful, fraudulent, have bad wishes, and have wrong views.*

6.50 Therefore, there is no recluseship for <u>matted-hair ascetics</u> merely on account of *keeping matted hair*, I say!

THE TRUE RECLUSE

Qualities of a true recluse

- 7 And how, bhikshus, is a monk accomplished in the proper way of a recluse?
- 7.2 Bhikshus, any monk
 - (1) was covetous,
 - (2) who had ill will,
 - (3) who had anger,
 - (4) who was grudging [resentful],
 - (5) who was scornful [contemptuous],
 - (6) who was spiteful [malicious],
 - (7) who was envious,
 - (8) who was stingy [selfish],
 - (9) who is fraudulent
 - (10) who is deceitful
 - (11) who has bad [evil] wishes

whose covetousness *is* abandoned; whose ill will *is* abandoned; whose anger *is* abandoned; whose grudge *is* abandoned; whose scorn *is* abandoned; whose spite *is* abandoned; whose envy *is* abandoned; whose stinginess *is* abandoned; whose fraud *is* abandoned; whose deceit *is* abandoned; whose wishes *are* abandoned, (12) who had wrong views, whose wrong views *are* abandoned.
7.3 Bhikshus, on account of abandoning these <u>stains of a recluse</u>, faults of a recluse, dregs of a recluse, grounds for downfall [loss], to be experienced in suffering states—he *has* practised the proper way of the recluse, I say!

Preparing the mind

8 He sees himself <u>purified</u> [freed] of all these bad unwholesome states.⁷⁶ Seeing himself purified [freed] of all these bad unwholesome states,

gladnessarises (in him).On account of gladness,
On account of a zestful mind,
On account of a tranquil body,
On account of happiness,zest arises.
the body is tranquil.
he feels happy.
his mind attains samadhi [his mind is stilled].
THE 4 DIVINE ABODES78

pāmojja pīti passaddha sukha samādhi

(1) Cultivation of lovingkindness

9 With a heart of lovingkindness, he dwells suffusing one quarter,

so, too, the second; so, too, the third; so, too, the fourth;

thus above, below, across, everywhere, and to everyone as well as to himself,

he dwells suffusing all the world with lovingkindness

that is vast, grown great [exalted],⁷⁹ immeasurable, without hate, without ill-will.⁸⁰

(2) Cultivation of compassion

10 Further, with a heart of compassion, he dwells suffusing one quarter,

⁷⁸ This whole section on <u>the 4 divine abodes</u> is stock: **Cakka,vatti Sīha.nāda S** (D 26,31/3:78), SD 36.10, says that it is "the wealth for a monk (*bhikkhuno bhogasmim*)." **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,1.11(6)/3:223, calls it "the immeasurables" (*appamañña*). **Mahā Vedalla S** (M 43,31/1:297), SD 35.1, **(Ceto,vimutti) Anuruddha S** (M 127,4-7/3:146 f), SD 54.10 & **Go,datta S** (S 41.7,5/4:296), SD 60.4, call it "the immeasurable freedom of mind" (*appamāņā ceto,vimutti*). According to **Aṭṭhaka,nāgara S** (M 52,8-11/1:351 f) = **Dasama Gaha,pati S** (A 11.17/5:344), SD 41.2, if one stabilizes these states, reflecting on its impermanence, etc, one attains arhathood; if not, one attains non-return. **(Majjhima) Jīvaka S** (M 55,6/1:369), SD 43.4, presents the Buddha as Brahmā. **Dhānañjāni S** (M 97,32-33/2:195), SD 4.9, and **(Brahma,vihāra) Subha S** (M 99,24-27/2:207 f), SD 38.6, call it the path to companionship with Brahmā (communion with God). **(Saṅgha) Uposatha S** (A 4.190,4/2:184), SD 15.10b, concerns one "attained to Godliness," *brahma-p,patta*. **Pm** 5.20/2:39 calls it "freedom that is focussed on only the beautiful," *subhan t'eva adhimutto hotî ti vimokkho*); **Vbh** 13/272-276 (*sutta,niddesa*), 276-282 (*abhidhamma,niddesa*), 282-284 (comy). On this practice, see **Brahma,vihāra**, SD 38.5. For a table of refs, see SD 38.5 (2.1.3.2).

⁷⁹ The mind "grown great" (*maha-g,gatā*) or exalted perception refers to the mind in dhyana, ie in <u>the form</u> <u>sphere</u> ($r\bar{u}p\hat{a}vacara$). See **Catuttha Jhāna Pañha S** (S 40.4), SD 24.14 (4).

⁸⁰ The recurrence of these last two phrases—"without hate, without ill will"—attests to the fact that <u>lovingkind-ness</u> is the basis for all the other three abodes, ie, they are actually a refinement of lovingkindness applied on deeper and broader levels.

⁷⁶ So sabbehi imehi pāpakehi akusalehi dhammehi visuddham attānam [Ce Ke Se vimuttam attānam] samanupassati.

⁷⁷ This is the *vimutt'āyatana* pericope: see SD 10.15 (4.4.2).

so, too, the second; so, too, the third; so, too, the fourth;

- thus above, below, across, everywhere, and to everyone as well as to himself, he dwells suffusing all the world with <u>compassion</u>
 - that is vast, grown great [exalted], immeasurable, without hate, without ill-will.

(3) Cultivation of gladness

11 Further, with a heart of gladness, he dwells suffusing one quarter, so, too, the second; so, too, the third; so, too, the fourth; thus above, below, across, everywhere, and to everyone as well as to himself, he dwells suffusing all the world with gladness that is vast, grown great [exalted], immeasurable, without hate, without ill-will.

(4) Cultivation of equanimity

12 Further, with a heart of equanimity, he dwells suffusing one quarter,

so, too, the second; so, too, the third; so, too, the fourth;

- thus above, below, across, everywhere, and to everyone as well as to himself, he dwells suffusing all the world with <u>equanimity</u>
 - that is vast, grown great [exalted], immeasurable, without hate, without ill-will.

Parable of the pleasant lotus pond⁸¹

13 Bhikshus, just as there is <u>a lotus pond</u> with water, clear, sweet and cool, with a beautiful stretch of pleasant white sand,⁸² [284]

and if a person were to come from <u>the east</u>, all scorched up, overcome by the heat, tired, parched and thirsty.⁸³

Having come to that lotus pond, he would quench his thirst and feverish heat.

And if a man were to come from <u>the west</u>, too.

And if a man were to come from the north, too.

And if a man were to come from <u>the south</u>, too, all scorched up, overcome by the heat, tired, parched and thirsty.

Having come to that lotus pond, he would quench his thirst and feverish heat.

⁸¹ This is a well known parable, used in different contexts, recurring with some variations in **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,42.3/1:76), SD 49.1; **Cūļa Assa,pura S** (M 40,13/1:283), SD 41.8; **Aputtaka S 1** (S 3.19,5/1:90 + 6/1:91), SD 22.4; **Āghāta Paţivinaya S 2** (A 5.163,11/3:188 + 17/3:190), SD 39.6; **Kāraṇa,pālī S** (A 5.194,1.5(5)/3:238) @ SD 45.11.

⁸² Seyyathâpi āvuso pokkharaņī acch'odakā sāt'odakā sīt'odakā setakā supatitthā ramaņīyā. "With a beautiful stretch of white sand," setakā supatiţţhā. Comy says it is a level (sama) stretch (AA 3:296). Other Comys gloss supatiţţhā as "beautiful" (sundara) (DA 2:569; UA 403). A slightly longer version of this passage continues with "shaded by various trees" (nānā,rukkhehi sañchannā), a stock passage that describes eg Tapodā, a lake with warm streams (V 3:108,14); Kakuţţha river: Mahā Parinibbāna S (D 16,4.22/2:129) = (U 8.5/63,13).

⁸³ Puratthimāya ce'pi disāya puriso āgaccheyya ghammâbhitatto ghamma,pareto kilanto tasito pipāsito. This passage, without puratthimāya ce'pi disāya—ie as atha puriso āgaccheyya...tasito pipāsito is stock: Mahā Sīha,-nāda S (M 12,37-41/1:74, 75×3, 76x2); Sammasa S (S 22.85/2:110, 111); Kosambī S (S 22.86/2:118); Āghāta Pați-vinaya S 2 (A 5.194,11/3:187, 188, 190); Kāraņa,pālī S (A 5.194,17/3:238), SD 45.11.

ANY RENUNCIANT CAN BE A RECLUSE

(1) The renunciation of a kshatriya

13.2 Even so, bhikshus, if one from <u>a kshatriya family</u>⁸⁴ [from royalty or ruling class] were to go forth as a renunciant from the household into homelessness and come to the Dharma-Vinaya declared by the Tathagata,

having cultivated lovingkindness, compassion, gladness and equanimity in this way, he attains inner stillness.

Having been inwardly stilled, he is one who has practised the proper way of a recluse, I say!

(2) The renunciation of a brahmin

13.3 If, bhikshus, one from <u>a brahmin family</u>⁸⁵ [from the priestly or teaching profession] were to go forth as a renunciant from the household into homelessness and come to the Dharma-Vinaya declared by the Tathagata,

having cultivated lovingkindness, compassion, gladness and equanimity in this way, he attains inner stillness.

Having been inwardly stilled, he is one who has practised the proper way of a recluse, I say!

(3) The renunciation of a vaishya

13.4 If, bhikshus, if one from <u>a vaishya family</u>⁸⁶ [from the business class] were to go forth as a renunciant from the household into homelessness and come to the Dharma-Vinaya declared by the Tathagata,

having cultivated lovingkindness, compassion, gladness and equanimity in this way, he attains inner stillness.

Having been inwardly stilled, he is one who has practised the proper way of a recluse, I say!

(4) The renunciation of a shudra

13.5 If, bhikshus, one from <u>a shudra family</u>⁸⁷ [a working class] were to go forth as a renunciant from the household into homelessness and come to the Dharma-Vinaya declared by the Tathagata,

having cultivated lovingkindness, compassion, gladness and equanimity in this way, he attains inner stillness.

Having been inwardly stilled, he is one who has practised the proper way of a recluse, I say!

(5) Any renunciant can attain recluseship

13.6 If, <u>anyone</u> from whatever family were to go forth as a renunciant from the household into homelessness and come to the Dharma-Vinaya declared by the Tathagata,

⁸⁴ *Khattiya*, a noble or warrior, ie one from the ruling or governing class.

⁸⁵ *Brāhmaņa,* a priest or, today, one of the teaching profession.

⁸⁶ Vessa, a merchant, ie one of the business class.

⁸⁷ *Sudda*, a worker, ie one from the working class.

having cultivated lovingkindness, compassion, gladness and equanimity in this way, he attains inner stillness.

Having been inwardly stilled, he is one who has practised the proper way of a recluse, I say!

ANY RECLUSE CAN STRIVE FOR AWAKENING

(1) The awakening of a kshatriya

14 If one from <u>a kshatriya family</u> [from royalty or ruling class] were to go forth as a renunciant from the household into the homeless life,

and having destroyed the mental influxes,⁸⁸

having realized for himself by direct knowledge, here and now,

attains and dwells in the mental liberation and liberation by wisdom that is influx-free⁸⁹— he is a recluse on account of destroying the influxes.⁹⁰

(2) The awakening of a brahmin

14.2 If one from <u>a brahmin family</u> [from the priestly or teaching profession] were to go forth as a renunciant from the household into the homeless life,

and having destroyed the mental influxes,

having realized for himself by direct knowledge, here and now,

attains and dwells in the mental liberation and liberation by wisdom that is influx-free he is a <u>recluse</u> on account of destroying the influxes.

(3) The awakening of a vaishya

14.3 If one from <u>a vaishya family</u> [from the business class] were to go forth as a renunciant from the household into the homeless life,

and having destroyed the mental influxes,

having realized for himself by direct knowledge, here and now, attains and dwells in the mental liberation and liberation by wisdom that is influx-free—

he is a <u>recluse</u> on account of destroying the influxes.

⁸⁸ The oldest list is prob a set of <u>3 influxes</u>—of sense-desire (*kām'āsava*), of existence (*bhav'āsava*), and of ignorance (*avijjâsava*), as in **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,1.10(20)/3:216,9), **Sammā,diṭṭhi S** (M 9,70/1:55,10), **Cūļa Suññata S** (M 121,11/-3:108,18), **Āsava S** (S 38.8/4:256,4 = 45.163/5:56,15 = 47.50/189,29), **Ti,kaṇṇa S** (A 3.58/1:165,16), **(Te,vijja) Jāņussoņi S** (A 3.59.4/1:167,22), **Nibbedhika Pariyāya S** (A 6.63/3:414,11); **Vbh 914/**384,13. The Nikāyas, Abhidhamma and Comys give a list of <u>4 influxes</u>: (1) sense-desire (*kām'āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav'āsava*), (3) views (*diţţh'āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijj'āsava*).⁸⁸ These 4 are also known as "floods" (*ogha*) and "yokes" (*yoga*): V 3:5,27 f; D **16**,1.12/2:81,26 = 84,5 & passim, **33**,1.11(31)/3:230,10 f; **MA** 1:62,6 f (ad M 1:6, 22, quoting S 4:256,4; SA 2:65,1 f); **AA** 2:355 (ad A 1:241,24), 3:79,1 (ad A 2:38,28), 3:321,24 (ad A 3:245,15), 3:395,20 (ad A 3:388,1); **ThaA** 1:202,23, 214,26; **Vbh** 373,34 f; **Dhs** 1:448; **Kvu** 515,2; **Abhs** 32,6; **Mohv** 97,8; **Vism 7.59/**211,1, **22.56**/683,34.

⁸⁹ Idha bhikkhave bhikkhu āsavānam khayā anāsavam ceto,vimuttim paññā,vimuttim diţţheva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharati. This is the "arhat vimutti" pericope: Mahā Sīha,nāda S (M 12,19/-1:71),SD 49.1; Cūļa Assa,pura S (M 40,14/1:284), SD 41.8; Phāsi,vihara S (A 5.94/3:119), (Aţţhaka) Saddhā 2 S (A 8.72/4:316), Santa Vimokkha S (A 10.9/5:12), (Dasaka) Sīha,nāda S (A 10.21/5:36), SD 81.2; Adhivutti,pada S (A 10.22/5:38); Pm 2:176; Pug 3.1/27.

⁹⁰ Comy: Since he has stilled (*samita*) all defilements, he is a recluse in the ultimate sense (*param'attha samaṇa*) (MA 2:316).

(4) The awakening of a shudra

14.4 If one from <u>a shudra family</u> [from the working class] were to go forth as a renunciant from the household into the homeless life,

and having destroyed the mental influxes,

having realized for himself by direct knowledge, here and now,

attains and dwells in the mental liberation and liberation by wisdom that is influx-free he is a recluse on account of destroying the influxes.

(5) Any renunciant can attain arhathood

14.5 If <u>anyone</u> from any family were to go forth as a renunciant from the household into the homeless life,

and having destroyed the mental influxes,

having realized for himself by direct knowledge, here and now,

attains and dwells in the mental liberation and liberation by wisdom that is influx-free he is a <u>recluse</u> on account of destroying the influxes.

15 The Blessed One said this. The monks joyfully approved of the Buddha's word.

— evaṁ —

130112 130122 130329 130727 140529 150726 161209 170712 210719