1 Summaries and comparative study

1.1 Sutta summaries

1.2.1 Dhamma samādāna

It is clear from the respective contexts of the Dhammā Samādāna Suttas that this common phrase that form their title refers to “undertaking the Dharma,” that is the wrong way of practice, that of self-mortification, and the right path of practice, that is, the middle way that avoids extremes. Further, these 2 suttas, each with 4 approaches to Dharma practice, in terms of pleasure and pain, karma and its fruition, summarized as follows: [2.2]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta (M 45)</th>
<th>Mahā Dhamma Samādāna Sutta (M 46)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ascetic practices (including rituals)</td>
<td>the 10 courses of conduct (karma)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) pleasant now, future pain</td>
<td>(1) painful now, future pain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) painful now, future pain</td>
<td>(2) pleasant now, future pain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) painful now, future pleasure</td>
<td>(3) painful now, future pleasure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) pleasant not, future pleasure</td>
<td>(4) pleasant now, future pleasure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.2.2 The 2 Dhamma samādāna Suttas (M 45 + 46)

1.2.2.1 The Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta (M 45) lists 4 ways of Dharma striving in terms of pleasant or painful conduct that bring pleasant or painful results. Our practice, whether pleasant (enjoying sensual pleasures) or painful (practising self-mortification), will bring either painful results (when wrongly done) or pleasant results (when rightly done).

These 4 ways of undertaking Dharma are summarized, respectively, as follows: [1.2.1]

| (1) indulging in sensual pleasures, | bringing suffering states (including the subhuman states) |
| (2) self-mortification (extreme), | bringing rebirth in the subhuman states |
| (3) driven by lust, haste, delusion, | bringing happy or heavenly rebirth (but no awakening) |
| (4) the practice of the 4 dhyanas, | bringing happy or heavenly rebirth (or awakening) |

Clearly here, the 4th method is the most beneficial, since it is pleasant practice in the present with pleasant future results.

1.2.2.2 The Mahā Dhamma Samādāna Sutta (M 46) similarly lists 4 ways of Dharma undertaking in terms of pleasant or painful conduct that bring pleasant or painful results. These 4 kinds of undertakings are focused on the 10 courses of karma, whether they are unwholesome (akusala kamma, patha), bringing future suffering [§§15 f], or wholesome (kusala kamma, patha), bringing future happiness [§§16 f], as follows:
(1) someone in pain and grief commits the 10 unwholesome courses of action\(^1\)
(2) someone with pleasure and joy commits the 10 unwholesome courses of action
(3) someone in pain and grief abstains from the 10 unwholesome courses of action
(4) someone with pleasure and joy abstains from 10 unwholesome courses of action

Clearly here, the 4\(^{th}\) practice is the best, since it is pleasant moral life in the present with happy future happiness.

1.2 Comparative Study

1.2.1 The Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta or Lesser Discourse on Undertaking the Dharma, which lists 4 ways of moral conduct, has a parallel in the Chinese Madhyama Āgama.\(^2\) The two versions begin by listing 4 ways of undertaking the Dharma, which are either pleasant or else painful now, and each of which may result in future pleasure or in future pain.

The Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta and its Madhyama Āgama parallel agree in presenting what is pleasant now and painful in future as their first and what is pleasant both now and in future as their last alternative. They differ in as much as the Pali version treats the way that is painful now and ripens in pain as its second alternative, and the way that is painful now and ripens in pleasure as its third alternative, while in the Chinese version these middle two appear reversed.

1.2 Such sequential variations often occur between the Pali and their Chinese parallels. What makes this particular case noteworthy is that neither sequence corresponds to the pattern to be expected, since in the discourses such listings usually proceed from the most negative case to the most positive.

This is, in fact, the sequence found in Dīgha Nikāya, in the Saṅgiti Sutta’s (D 33) treatment of the same topic, which begins with the way of undertaking the Dharma that is painful in both respects; followed by what is painful only now; then, what is painful only in the future; and culminates in what is pleasant both now and in the future.\(^3\) [2.2.0]

1.3 In the Majjhima Nikāya, we have the Mahā Dhamma Samādāna Sutta (M 46), which conforms to the same general pattern, as it also places what is painful in both respects first and treats what is pleasant in both respects as the last 2 items.\(^4\)

Thus, in spite of the strong tendency of oral transmission to standardize enumerations, the Pali discourses show considerable differences in their listing in the 2 Dhamma Samādāna Suttas. This is especially remarkable, as these 2 discourses immediately follow one another and belong to the same reciter line-

---

1. *Akusala kamma, patha*, ie, 3 of the body: (1) killing, (2) stealing, (sexual misconduct); 4 of speech: (4) lying, (5) malicious speech, (6) harsh speech, (7) frivolous chatter; and 5 of the mind: (8) covetousness, (9) ill will, and (10) wrong view. See *Samma Diṭṭhi Sutta* (M 9) where Sāriputta defines them as the “roots of unwholesome karma” (*akusala, miśra*, M 9,3-8/1:46 f @ SD 14.1) and *Sāleyyyaka Sutta* (M 41,10/1:286 f), SD 5.7 (2).

2. The parallel is MĀ 174/T1.711b-712c, which agrees with M 45 on the title, 受法 *shòufǎ*, “undertaking the Dharma,” though without the qualification “lesser” (*cūḷa*), and locates the discourse in Jeta’s grove near Sāvatthī. The qualification “lesser” would, in fact, not have suited MĀ 174, as the counts of Chinese characters given at T1.712c3 and T1.713c16 indicate that MĀ 174 is longer than MĀ 175, the Madhyama Āgama parallel to the Greater Discourse on Undertaking Dharma (M 46). This sutta summary is based on Analayo 2006:188-190 (unpublished PhD thesis).

3. M 46,5/1:310 f (SD 59.11), which, however, differs from D 33 in that it has what is pleasant now and painful in future as its second and what is painful now and pleasant in future as its third, whereas D 33 has these two in reverse.
age of the Majjhima reciters (bhānaka), where we would have expected to find the same sequence at least in these two consecutive suttas.

1.4 Variations in the listings

1.4.1 Unlike the Theravāda tradition here, the Sarvāstivāda tradition presents the 4 ways of undertaking the Dharma in a more uniform manner, since the Chinese parallels to the Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta and the Mahā Dhamma Samādāna Sutta agree with each other and with the Saṅgīti,paryāya on the sequence of their presentation.

1.4.2 Possible reasons for the listing variations

1.4.2.1 We would have expected that in an oral tradition, the listings of the 4 ways of undertaking would have all been uniform. However, even within the Majjhima Nikāya—between M 45 and M 46—there are differences in the listing of the 4 ways of undertaking the Dharma. Furthermore, a late canonical listing in the Saṅgīti Sutta (D 33) gives yet its own unique listing (which as we have seen agrees with the Sanskrit version). Further, the Chinese parallels (MĀ 174+175; T83) have their own unique listing (all of which, however, are the same).

Here is a summary of the how these discourses list the 4 ways of undertaking the Dharma:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>M 45</th>
<th>M 46</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1) pleasant now, future pain</td>
<td>(2) painful now, future pain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) painful now, future pain</td>
<td>(1) pleasant now, future pain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) painful now, future pleasure</td>
<td>(3) painful now, future pleasure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) pleasant now, future pleasure</td>
<td>(4) pleasant now, future pleasure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1.4: The 4 way of undertakings in the Nikāyas and the Āgamas

5 MĀ 175/T1.712c13 agrees with the sequence found in MĀ 174/T1.711b21. The same sequence recurs in another parallel to M 46, ie, T83/T1.902b15. The reconstruction of the relevant passage from the Skt fragments of Saṅgīti Sūtra in Stache-Rosen 1968a:115 may have suffered from a misprint, since its restoration presents the way that is pleasant in both respects twice. Saṅgīti,paryāya (T1536/T26.398c6), tr in Stache-Rosen 1968a:115, has the same sequence as MĀ 174, as does the Mahā,vyutpatti 1560 in Sakaki 1926:125. The Chinese parallel to the Saṅgīti Sūtra found in Dirgha Āgama (DA 9/T1.50c2) agrees with the Saṅgīti S (Pali), while another Chinese tr of the Saṅgīti Sūtra (T12/T1.229a18), follows the sequence found in M 45 (on the school affiliation of Saṅgīti.paryāya cf also Tri-pathi 1985:198-199).
**1.4.2.2 The Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta** (M 45) have the following sutta structure:

- the 4 ways of undertaking of the Dharma
  - (1) pleasant conduct (sensuality), ripening in future pain
  - (2) painful practice (asceticism), ripening in future pain
  - (3) painful practice (holy life), ripening in future pleasure
  - (4) pleasant practice (dhyana), ripening in future pleasure

**M 45** relates how we practise the Dharma in a broad sense, that is, for renunciants as well as lay practitioners. 1 and 2 refer to the wrong ways of practice: (1) living a life of sensual pleasures (this is actually non-practice!), and (2) self-mortification with wrong views—clearly, both of these will bring future suffering. This reminds of the 2 extreme life-styles mentioned in the Dhamma,cakka Pavattana Sutta (S 56.11).

Ways of undertaking 3 + 4 are wholesome Dharma-based practice. (3) is where, for example, a lay practitioner, despite facing the temptations of lust, hate and delusion, perseveres in his practice (understandably with some difficulty), and as a result he reaps future happiness. (4) is the meditator who enjoys happily the dhyanas, and, in due course, gains greater happiness.

**1.4.2.3 The Mahā Dhamma Samādāna Sutta** (M 46) have the following sutta structure:

- as a rule: desired states diminish, undesired states increase
- the untutored worlding and the noble disciple
- the 2 persons and the 4 ways of undertaking Dharma

*the 10 courses of action (bad karma and good karma)*:

- (2) life of pain and grief (yet also immoral), fruiting in future pain
- (1) life of pleasure and joy (but immoral), fruiting in future pain
- (3) life of pain and grief (yet moral), fruiting in future pleasure
- (4) life of pleasure and joy (and moral), fruiting in future pleasure

**M 46** seems to address mainly the lay practitioner since it focuses on the 10 courses of action (*kamma-patha*), that is, the 5 precepts fully laid out into the full threefold path training of moral virtue, concentration and wisdom. Significantly, we can see this as a training in renunciation (*nekkhamma*), that is, not merely as conventional (monastic renunciation) but as the true letting go of defilements, the wrong ways of the body and the mind. In short, it is a training in true renunciation for the laity.

**M 46** is very similar to the teaching of the 4 kinds of persons listed in the (Tamo,joti) Puggala Sutta (S 3.21 = Pug 4.19), which can be collated with the practitioners of the 4 ways of undertaking, thus:

**Mahā Dhamma Samādāna Sutta** (M 46) **(Tamo,joti) Puggala Sutta** (S 3.21)

- (1) life of pain and grief (also immoral), with future pain
- (2) life of pleasure and joy (but immoral), with future pain
- (3) life of pain and grief (yet moral), with future pleasure
- (4) life of pleasure and joy (and moral), with future pleasure

**1.4.2.4 Both the Saṅgiti Sutta** (D 33) and its Sanskrit parallel in the Chinese Dīrgha Āgama (DĀ 9) list the 4 ways of undertaking in their own unique manner (that is, as 2-3-1-4) against the list in M 45, thus:

---

6 S 56.11,3, SD 1.1 (3.1).
7 (Tamo,joti) Puggala S (S 3.21) = (Saṅkhitta) Puggala S (*A 4.85, SD 82.11) = Pug 4.19 (SD 18.6). In the 4 “darkness/light” sequences, the 2nd and 3rd here are reversed in original suttas here.
This is only a bare list, without any explanation of the topics. From the nature of the Saṅgīti Sutta (D 33)—a comprehensive index of teachings to be recited as a kind of sutta matrix (mātikā)—the tetrad serves only as a memory aid for the teacher and student to expand and reflect on for their personal practice. Hence, the Saṅgīti Sutta neatly lists the 4 ways of undertaking Dharma in 2 pairs: the 1st pair comprises “painful” practice, the 2nd pair of “pleasant” practice, and in each case, there is the fruiting of either future pain or future pleasure.

1.4.2.5 The above analyses [1.4.2] follows the rule of context, that is, giving primacy to the suttas as records of the Buddha’s awakening and the testimonies of the early arhats. This rule reminds us to respect and reflect on the sutta context so that we understand why the teachings have been given in such a manner. Although we may compare how the different parallel versions differ from one another, and we may even be moved to wonder if one version is “better” than another, the real question we should always ask is: Why is this so? What is the sutta trying teaching me?

We must remember that the suttas—the early Buddhist texts (EBT)—are like coded instructions in some kind of Dhamma programme language. Like any computer programme, each sutta needs to read and understood as is, in its own context, and then in the larger Dhamma context, as is. Only then, we will get some profound insight into these records of the Buddha’s awakening and the way of the arhats. Then, they become the clear light that brightens our lives and life itself so that we see them as they really, and awaken to true reality.

2 Significance of the Cūla Dhamma Samādāna Sutta (M 45)

2.1 TYPES OF PRACTICE

2.1.1 The Sutta Commentary glosses dhamma here as “the entanglements of what is grasped” (gahita, gahanā) (MA 2:371.17). In other words, dhamma here does not specifically refer to the teaching, but to our general conduct of wholesome life or practice. Hence, it is possible to render dhamma here simply as “things.” However, since we are speaking of some kind of moral conduct or spiritual striving, it is best to take it as “life-style” or “practice,” at least in the Cūla Dhamma Samādāna Sutta.

The Cūla Dhamma Samādāna Sutta (M 45) and its Madhyama Āgama parallel (MĀ 174) explain in similar ways that the way of undertaking the Dharma that is pleasant now but ripens in future pain refers to recluses and brahmins who indulge in sensuality, including sexual pleasures, as a result of which they will experience rebirth in hell,11 comparable to the fate of a sal tree gradually overgrown by a creeper [§4.1]. Hence, the word “pleasant” here has a negative connotation, unlike in the last two items, where it has a positive connotation. For this reason, the first item has one whose conduct is “pleasant now but ripens in future pain,” where “pleasant” has a negative sense.

---

8 D 33.1.11(24)/3:229.6.
9 On mātikā or doctrinal summaries, see SD 52.6 (2.1).
10 See SD 53.5 (4.2.3); SD 54.3b (2.3.2.3).
11 Judging from Āpāyika S (A 3.111/1:266,3) [4], the prospect of rebirth in hell awaits not only those who indulge in sex while pretending to be living a celibate life (brahma,coriya), but is also obtains in simply holding this view and acting accordingly, even if this is done without feigning celibacy.
2.1.2 In relation to the simile that illustrates their fate, the Pali version indicates that the seed of such a creeper might become a “no-seed,” \(^{12}\) that is, unviable. Its Chinese parallel clarifies the implication of this expression, as it describes how this seed “might rot and not be a seed (any more),” or 剃鬚髮 huòtì-xūfà (literally, “bereft of hair and beard”).\(^{13}\)

The Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta and its Chinese parallel illustrate the way of undertaking that is painful now and painful in future with the example of various ascetic practices and self-mortifications in vogue in ancient India, practices that according to both versions tend to lead to a lower rebirth. The Chinese list of such practices treats not only the practice of pulling out the hair and beard, mentioned also in the Pali version [§5b], but also lists the practice of shaving the hair and beard.\(^{14}\) However, since Buddhist monks regularly shave the hair and beard, it is curious for the Madhyama Āgama discourse to include shaving the hair and beard among practices that lead to a lower rebirth.

2.1.3 The 2 versions present the way of undertaking the Dharma that is painful now and pleasant in the future in similar ways, indicating that those who live the holy life in its purity, even though they suffer the strong influence of lust, anger or delusion, will be reborn in heaven.\(^{15}\) The way of undertaking the Dharma pleasant both now and in future then stands for the complementary case of someone who lives the holy life without being under the strong influence of lust, anger or delusion.

The Pali version treats the present and future pleasure experienced by this person by describing the attainment of the 4 dhyanas and heavenly rebirth.\(^{16}\) Its Chinese parallel instead describes how this person lives the holy life happily and eradicates the 5 lower fetters, thereby becoming a non-returner.\(^{17}\)

Here, the Madhyama Āgama version’s presentation of the fourth way of undertaking the Dharma evinces a more typically early Buddhist orientation, since for a discourse addressed to a group of monks the attainment of non-returning would be a more appropriate prospect than heavenly rebirth.\(^{18}\)

2.2 THE 4 KINDS OF UNDERTAKINGS

2.2.1 The listing sequence

The theme of the Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta (M 45) is that of karmic result and spiritual fruit of our habitual conduct, that is, the 4 ways of undertaking Dharma, thus:

- (1) conduct that is pleasant now, but resulting in future pain
- (2) conduct that is painful now, and ripening in future pain
- (3) conduct that is painful now, but ripening in future pleasure [happiness]
- (4) conduct that is pleasant now, and ripening in future pleasure [happiness] \([§2]\)

The Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta and its Chinese version in the Madhyama Āgama (MĀ 174) agree in the sequence of the first and last alternatives [1]. However, the Chinese version reverses the middle

\(^{12}\) M 45/1:306,12: abījaṁ vā pan'assa.

\(^{13}\) MĀ 174/T1.711c11: 或敗壞不成種子.

\(^{14}\) MĀ 174/T1.712b15. The same ref to shaving the hair and beard recurs in listings of ascetic practices found in MĀ 18/T1.442a6 and in MĀ 104/T1.592b26, and also in a similar listing in DĀ 8/T1.47c29. M 45.5b/1:308,6 and MĀ 174/T1.712b12 agree, however, on incl another practice undertaken by Buddhist monks in their listing, namely, the wearing of rag-robies.

\(^{15}\) M 45/1:308,21 & MĀ 174/T1.712a20. (Vitthāra) Paṭipadā S (A 4.162) refers to the same situation under the heading dukkha paṭipadā, painful mode of practice. (A 4.162/2:149,18), SD 18.3.

\(^{16}\) M 45,8-12/1:309.

\(^{17}\) MĀ 174/T1.712b27.

\(^{18}\) This section mostly is based on Analayo 2006:188-190 (unpublished).
two alternatives, which actually agrees the listing in the Saṅgīti Sutta (D 33). From the explanation below [2.2.1], however, it is clear that the Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta is perfectly natural in its listing the 2 negative practices first, followed by 2 positive practices. The listing in MĀ 174 and the Saṅgīti Sutta clearly breaks the natural teaching sequence. The Saṅgīti Sutta listing, it should be noted, is simply a listing of teachings, which apparently does not take into account the list’s context.

Taking the Dhamma, cakka-p, pavattana Sutta (S 56.11) as a guide, we will see that the extreme of “devotion to sense-pleasures” is listed first, followed by the extreme of “devotion to self-mortification.” This is especially significant because the Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta defines the 1st alternative (pleasant now, painful later) as sense-indulgence, and the 2nd (painful now, painful later) as self-mortification, too. Hence, the listing of the Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta is the naturally correct one in sutta terms.

On the other hand, the Mahā Dhamma Samādāna Sutta (M 46), which treats the same 4 alternatives only in terms of moral virtue, reverses the first 2 alternatives—that is, listing them as painful now, resulting in future pain, and pleasant now, resulting in future pain, thus.

(5) someone in pain and grief commits the 10 unwholesome courses of action
(6) someone with pleasure and joy commits the 10 unwholesome courses of action
(7) someone in pain and grief abstains from the 10 unwholesome courses of action
(8) someone with pleasure and joy abstains from 10 unwholesome courses of action

Here, the teaching is that we should guard our karmic doors (body, speech and mind), whether we are in a painful grieving state or in a pleasurable joyful state. Understandably, the sequence of this Sutta differs from the listing of the 2 extremes in the Dhamma, cakka-p, pavattana Sutta.

2.2.2 The 2 extremes

2.2.2.1 The 1st extreme refers to a life of sense-indulgence, while the 2nd is that of self-mortification. These 2 kinds of practices should be given up and avoided. The 3rd undertaking refers to when we have great difficulties with greed, hate or delusion, but we still do not abandon our mental cultivation. The 4th undertaking is the ideal one, as it is easy all the way, and the spiritual fruition is easily obtained, too.

2.2.2.2 The Buddha rejects both the physicalist and the eternalist views as being extremes. However, while the Dhamma, cakka-p, pavattana Sutta (S 56.11) describes “the devotion to sensual pleasures” (kāma, sukh’ allikānuyoga) as being “low, vulgar, worldly, ignoble, not connected with the goal [unprofitable],” (hi no gammo pathujjaniko anariyo anattha, samhito), “the devotion to self-mortification” (atta, kilamathānuyoga) is said to be only “painful, ignoble, not connected with the goal [unprofitable]” (dukkho anariyo anattha, samhito). This is because despite being “painful,” self-mortification, with some moral virtue, can lead to a divine afterlife; but such a goal is still “ignoble, not connected with the goal [unprofitable],” because we are still caught up in samsara, and not liberated from suffering.

---

19 D 33,1.11(24)/3:229,6.
20 M 46/1:309-317 @ SD 59.11.
21 For a discussion, see further Analayo 2006:188-190.
22 M 45/1:305-309 @ SD 32.4.
23 See The body in Buddhism, SD 29.6a (4.1).
2.2.3 The 4 kinds of individual

2.2.3.1 The Cūḷa Dhammas Samādāna Sutta list of 4 undertakings echoes similar ones found in such discourses as the (Tamo,joti) Puggala Sutta (S 3.21),24 which with a bit of re-arrangement would collate thus with the 4 types of individuals in terms of karmic progress, thus:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(Tamo,joti) Puggala Sutta</th>
<th>Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta</th>
<th>Function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1) One in darkness faring into darkness,</td>
<td>(2) painful now, painful later</td>
<td>karmic stagnation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) One in darkness faring into light,</td>
<td>(3) painful now, pleasant later</td>
<td>karmic progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) One in light faring into darkness,</td>
<td>(1) pleasant now, painful later</td>
<td>karmic descent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) One in light faring into light,</td>
<td>(4) pleasant now, pleasant later</td>
<td>karmic ascent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta, as such, can be taken as a canonical commentary on the (Tamo,joti) Puggala Sutta (S 3.21). The descriptions of the 4 kinds of individual by the (Tamo,joti) Puggala Sutta is complemented by the Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta’s instructive explanation of the four kinds of conduct and their fruits. However, an important difference should be noted here. The word “pleasant” in the first item of the 4 in the Cūḷa Samādāna Sutta has a negative connotation, while the term “light” of the (Tamo,joti) Puggala Sutta has a positive connotation. However, their functions or compatibility remain unaffected.

2.3 On Pātavyāta

The word pātvyāta, translated here as “indulgence,” is found both in the Āpāyika Sutta (A 3.111) [above] and in the Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta [93]. It is an important word here, as it describes how lust overpowers us. It is a free translation that tries to reflect the lexical as well as the commentarial definitions, to reflect the Sutta context.

The Pali-English Dictionary (PED) defines pātvyāta as “downfall, bringing to fall, felling,” deriving it from pāteti, “to bring to fall, kill, destroy.” The usual verb that goes with it is āpajjati, “he falls” (a verb that commonly entails a fault or offence) and its various forms (āpajjanti, āpajjiṁsu, mā...āppajji, etc), that is, as pātvyatam āpajjati, etc.25

But the Commentaries derive it from VPIV, “to drink.” The Vibhaṅga Commentary, for example, says that pātvyāta is the using or swallowing of a state which leads to downfall, and for one who asserts thus uses the sense-desire as a defilement among the sense-desires as an object like one who drinks, or who swallows (VbhA 499). In other words, sense-pleasures are seen to be enjoyed as we like.26

The Vibhaṅga itself gives the name “gratification view” (assāda diṭṭhi) to the notion that there is no fault (dosa; Skt dosa) in sense-pleasures, so that we fall headlong (āpajjati pātvyatāmi) into it (Vbh 925/368,26). Technically, this view refers to our inability to understand the nature of such an object, its

---

24 S 3.21/1:93-96 (SD 18.6). Other related discourses are: Saṅgīti Sutta (D 33,1.11(49)/3:233): a bare list of the four types of persons; (Saṅkhitta) Puggala Sutta (A 4.85/2:85 f): the sutta without similes and verses; Puggala Paññatti (Pug 4.19/51 f): the sutta without similes and verses; Bāla,paṇḍita Sutta (M 129.25/3:169 f): description of one “in darkness”; Chaḷābhijāti Sutta (A 6.57/3:384-387): black and white dharmas. See SD 18.6 (1.1).
25 V 4:34, 42; D 27,16/3:89; M 45,3/1:305,28, 307,11; A 3.111/1:266,3-5, 3.151/1:295,6; Vbh 368.
26 Sevitabbari (“to be associated with”), DA 869; pivitaṁbat, yathā, ruci pariḥūṁjitaṁbat (”to be drunk, to be consumed as one likes,” ie sensuality and its objects), MA 2:371; pivitabbari pariḥūṁjitaṁbat (”to be drunk, to be consumed”), AA 2:369; UA 351, 365; pātvyāta, bhāvaṁ pariḥūṁjanam aijhoharanam (“a consuming or partaking of, which is a state which must cause a fall”), VbhA 499.

---

http://dharmafarer.org
arising (samudaya), its ending (atthaṅgama), its gratification (assāda), disadvantage [danger] (ādīnava), and escape (nissaraṇa) from it, often referred to in the Suttas.27

3 The māluvā creeper

3.1 The maluva (māluvā; BHSD, mālu(latā); AMg māluyā), often mentioned in early Buddhism, is a broad-leafed creeper, is also known as pattra valli or pattra latā in Sanskrit.28 This plant is probably the Bauhinia vahlii, a giant climber and one of the most common Bauhinia species found in the sub-Himalayan region up to 3000 m. Its leaves vary in size from 20 to 40 cm in diameter, and are bilobed at the apex, and are used for making cups and plates and for wrapping food. [Fig 3]29

3.2 The maluva often figures in imageries of lust or sensuality, as in this verse from the Sūcī, loma Sutta (S 810):

*Snehajā atta,sambhūtā
girodhass'eva khandhajā

puthū visattā kāmesu
māluvā’va vitatā30 vane

Arisen from affection, born of oneself, just like the trunk-shoots of the banyan, crowded, clinging to sensuality, just as the maluva spread across the woods.

(S 810*/10.3/1:207) = Sn 27231

3.3 The Saṁyutta Commentary here explains the last line with the maluva figure as follows:

The maluva creeper grows in the forest, supporting itself on tree, weaving itself around that tree again and again, spreading over it from the tree’s foot to its top, and from the top to its foot, so that it stands suspended and spread over.

Even so, the crowd of defilements of sensual desire cling to the objects of sensual desire, or the crowd of beings, on account of their defilements of sensual desire, cling to the objects of sensual desire.32

(SA 1:304; cf Nett 147; SnA 1:304)

The point, notes Bodhi, “rather, seems to be that sensual desire spreads from object to object just as the creeper stretches itself out in the woods by spreading from tree to tree” (S:B 477 n568).

27 See eg Mahā, nidāna S (D 15.34/2:69), SD 5.17; Mahā Dukkha-k, khandha S (M 13.15/1:87), SD 6.9; Assāda S 1 (S 22.26/3:27 f), SD 3.7. On the assāda formula, see (Dhātu) Pubbe Sambodha S (S 14.31/2:170 f), SD 29.17 (1).
28 For philological on māluvā, see Luders, Beobachten §91; Dh:N 103 n162; Sn:N 201 n272.
29 See Čūḷa Dhamma Samādāna S (M 45), SD 32.4 (3). Picture credit: http://online-media.uni-marburg.de/biologie/nutzpflanzen/bilder/vs/12a24_bauhinia_vahlii.jpg.
30 So Ee; Se Ke vitthatā.
31 Eg Sūcī, loma S (S 810*/10.3/11:207). Majjhima Comy says it has a long shape (MA 2:371). See also AA 2:319. Cf malu’va va vilata vani (Dh:G 339).
32 Māluvā’va vitatā vaneti yathā vane māluvā latā yam rukkharā nissāya jāyati, tam mūlato yava aggā, aggato yava mūla punappunam sansisibbivā ajjhoththivā otata, vitatā tiṭṭhati. Evam vatthu, kāmesu puthū kilesa, kāmā visattā, puthū vā sattā tehi kilesa, kāmēhi vatthu, kāmesu visattā.
3.4 The Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta (M 45) has this well known maluva parable:

\[
\text{seyyathā’pi ... māluvā, sipāṭikā phaleyya ... māluvā, bījaṁ aññatarasmīṁ sāla, mūle anipateyya}
\]

suppose ... a maluva creeper pod were to burst open ... a maluva seed ... would to fall at the foot of certain sal tree

The following verses, too, use the maluva creeper as a figure for the reprobate (immoral person):

\[
\text{Yassa accanta, dussīlyaṁ māluvā sālam iv’otataṁ} \]

He who is excessively lacking moral virtue, like a sal tree spread over with maluva, does to himself just as wishes to do to him.

\[
\text{tanhā vaddhati māluvā viya so palavati hurā, hurāṁ} \]

craving grows like the maluva: he bounds about here and there like a monkey seeking fruit in a forest.

In a rare positive imagery, the Khadira Sutta (M 56.32) alludes to the leaves of the maluva, apparently large and useful enough for making baskets that can bear water. The Kathāvatthu similarly uses the maluva in a positive sense in reference to how merit grows (puññaṁ ... māluvā viya vaḍḍhati, Ku 343) and how moral virtue grows (sīlaṁ ... māluvā viya vaḍḍhati, Ku 439).

---

33 Cp ab with ratta, cittam ativevathayanti nam | sālaṁ māluva, latā, va kānane (Kūṇāla J, J 4181cd* at J 536/5:452,-26*-27*). Cp bd with malutā sālam ivo’tatā (Dh:Pkt 306b) & yathā naṁ biṣam icchati (306d).

34 Patna Dh: Yassa accanta, doṣṣillāṁ | malūtā sālam ivo’tatā | karoti so tathā’ttānam | yathā naṁ biṣam icchati (Dh:Ptn 306). Gandhāri Dh: Yasa acada-duṣśili’ā | malū’a va vilada vāni | kuya so tadha [a]tvana | yadha na viṣamu ichadi (Dh:G 330 &n); Udāna,varga: yo asāv atyanta, duḥṣilah | sālavān mālutā yathā | karoty asau tath’āṭmānam | yatha enam dvisad icchati (Uv 11.10).

35 Lines cd: ... hjurō | phalam iccho va vanasma vanaru (Dh:G 91).

36 Brough says this is unmetrical; “the original verse doubtless had vanasmi.” (Dh:G 205 n91). Tha 399 correctly scans vanasmi, but while ThaA reads vanasmi, the lemma reads vanasmī (ThaA 2:170). See also DhA 4:44; UA 237. See ThāN 188 n399.

37 Udāna,varga: manuvajaya pramatta cārinas | trṣṇa vardhati mālutā iha hi [vl māluteva hi] | sa hi samśāre punah phalam | icchann iva vānaro vane (Uv 3.4); Patna Dh: manuvassā pramattā, cārino | tahnā vaddhati mālutā iva | sā prāplavate hurāhuram | phalam eṣi va vanamhi vānaro (Dh:Ptn 137).

38 S 56.32/5:438 f (SD 21.8).

39 Ku 8.5.1/343, 10.9.2/439.
4 The Āpāyika Sutta (A 3.111)

SD 32.4 (4)

The Discourse on the Downfall-bound  |  A 3.111/1:265 f
A 3.3.2.1 = Aṅguttara Nikāya 3, Pañcaka Nipāta 3, Tatiya Paññāsaka 2, Āpāyika Vagga 1
Theme: How we live now moulds how we will live hereafter

Bhikshus, there are these 3 who are downfall-bound, hell-bound, for not abandoning this (conduct).

Which are the three?
(1) He, not living the holy life, claims to be living it.
(2) He who, without basis, accuses one who is living the pure holy life of not doing so.
(3) He who holds such a doctrine, such a view, that there is no fault in sensuality, and falls headlong into sensuality.

These, bhikshus, are the 3 who are downfall-bound, hell-bound, for not abandoning this (conduct).

— evaṁ —

The underlying notion here is that of spiritual falsehood, of not being true to oneself and to others. A few more examples are mentioned in these suttas:

(1) Kukkura, vatika Sutta (M 57), about two ascetics, one behaving as a dog, the other as a cow, thinking that this is “holy.” The Buddha replies as they habitually act, so will they be reborn. (M 57/1:387-392), SD 23.11.
(2) Bāhitika Sutta (M 88). The female wanderer Sundarī, instigated by wanderers jealous of the Buddha, has her accuse him of having an affair with her. The wanderers then murder her and accuses the Buddha of it, but the truth is revealed in due course. (M 88/2:112-117; U 4.8/43-45; J 2:415-417), SD 49.12.
(3) Alagaddūpama Sutta (M 22). The monk Ariṭṭha wrongly thinks that since a streamwinner can indulge in sense-pleasures, a monastic could do so, too (MA 2:103). The Buddha declares that he has constantly taught against just such a wrong view (M 22/1:130-142), SD 3.1.3.

It should be noted here that the prospect of rebirth in hell awaits not only those who indulge in sex while pretending to be living a celibate life (brahma, cāriya), but also obtains for monastics who hold this view and act accordingly.

— — —

40 Tayo’mē, bhikkhave, āpāyikā nerayikā idam appahāya. Comy explains the phrase “for not abandoning this” as meaning not having given up this claim to leading a holy life when the mind is by nature evil, and so on (Idam ap-pahāyāti idam brahma,cāri, paṭiññat’ādim pāpa, dhamm’attayaṁ avijahitvā, AA 2:368).
41 N’atthī kāmesu doso ti, so tāya kāmesu pātavyatam ṣapajjati. As at Vbh 368, where Comy def this as “a consuming or partaking of, which is a state that must cause a fall” (pātabba, bhāvaṁ paribhuṆjanāṁ ajjhoharanāṁ, VbhA 499).

http://dharmafarer.org
Cūḷa Dhamma Samādāna Sutta
The Lesser Discourse on Undertaking the Dharma
M 45

1 Thus have I heard.
At one time the Blessed One was staying in Anātha,piṇḍika’s park in Jeta’s grove outside Sāvatthī. There the Blessed One addressed the monks thus,
“Bhikshus!”
“Bhante!” the monks answered the Blessed One in assent.

The 4 ways of undertaking the Dharma

2 The Blessed One said this:
“Bhikshus, there are these 4 ways of undertaking the Dharma. What are the four?
(1) There is, bhikshus, a Dharma-undertaking, that is pleasant now, but ripening as pain in the future.
(2) There is, bhikshus, a Dharma-undertaking, that is painful now, and ripening as pain in the future.
(3) There is, bhikshus, a Dharma-undertaking, that is painful now, but ripening as pleasure in the future.
(4) There is, bhikshus, a Dharma-undertaking, that is pleasant now, and ripening as pleasure in the future.

Pleasant now, painful later

3 (1) And what, bhikshus, is the Dharma-undertaking that is pleasant now, ripening as pain in the future?
There are, bhikshus, certain recluses and brahmins who hold such a doctrine, such a view, that
‘There is no fault in sensuality.’
They fall into the indulgence in sense-pleasures.
They solicit the top-knotted female wanderers. They spoke thus:
‘Seeing what future fear [danger] in sense-pleasures do these good recluses and brahmins speak of the abandoning of sense-pleasures, and declare a full understanding of sense-pleasures?’

---

42 Jeta,vana, so called, says Comy, because it is “grown, maintained and guarded by prince Jeta” (tañ hi Jetena rāja,kumārena ropitam sanvaddhitam paripālitaṁ) (MA 1:60; KhpA 111; PmA 3:533). As such, it is not an ordinary wild forest, but a cultivated grove.
43 On tr sāvatthiyaṁ as “near (samīpe) Sāvatthī,” rather than “in Sāvatthī,” see Comys, eg SA 1:13; AA 1:15; KhpA 112; UA 57; PmA 3:534.
44 Bhikkhavo (only here); hereafter, bhikkhave. On bhikkhavo: SD 59.7 (2.4).
46 Te kāmesu pātavyataṁ āpajjanti. On pātavyata, see Intro (2.3).
47 ‘Kīṃsu nāma te bhonto samana,brāhmaṇa kāmesu anāgata,bhayaṁ sappassamānā kāmānāṁ pahānam ēhaṁsu, kāmānaṁ pariññāṇaṁ paññapenti?”
Saying, ‘Blissful is the touch of the arm and soft hair of these young female wanderers,’ they fall into the indulgence in sense-pleasures.

Having fallen into the indulgence in sense-pleasures, with the body’s breaking up, after death, they are reborn in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell. There, they suffer sensations of sharp, piercing, racking pains. They spoke thus:

‘This is the future fear [danger] that these good recluses and brahmins see in sense-pleasures when they speak of the abandoning of sense-pleasures, and declare a full understanding of sense-pleasures!

For, it is because of these sense-pleasures, [306] on account of these sense-pleasures that we suffer these sensations of sharp, piercing, racking pains.’

The parable of the strangled sal tree

4.1 Bhikshus, suppose that in the last month of the hot season, a maluva-creeper pod were to burst open.

Then, bhikshus, a maluva seed would fall at the foot of a certain sal tree.

Then, bhikshus, a certain deity living in that sal tree would fall into fear, awe and trembling.

4.2 But, bhikshus, the deity’s friends and companions, relative by blood and marriage—park deities, forest deities, tree deities, and deities dwelling in medicinal herbs, grass and forest trees—gathered and assembled together, and would give comfort, thus:

‘Fear not, sir! Fear not, sir! Perhaps a peacock will swallow it, or a wild beast [deer] will eat it, or forest-fire will burn it, or woodsmen [forest workers] will carry it off, or termites will devour it, or it might even not be viable!’

But, bhikshus, no peacock swallowed it, nor a wild beast [deer] ate it, nor forest-fire burnt it, nor woodsmen [forest workers] carried it off, nor termites devoured it, but it was in fact viable.

Then, indeed, having been rained upon by a downpour from a rain-cloud, it would fully sprout, so that the maluva creeper, its soft creeping hairy tendrils would cling around that sal tree.

4.3 Then it occurs to the deity dwelling in that sal tree, thus:

‘Seeing what future fear [danger] in sense-pleasures do my good friends and companions, relative by blood and marriage—park deities, forest deities, tree deities, and deities dwelling in medicinal herbs, grass and forest trees—gathered and assembled together, and would give comfort, thus:

“Fear not, sir! Fear not, sir! Perhaps a peacock will swallow it, or a wild beast [deer] will eat it, or forest-fire will burn it, or woodsmen [forest workers] will carry it off, or termites will devour it, or it might even not be viable!”—
4.4 Pleasant is the touch of this maluva creeper, its soft creeping clinging hairy tendrils!’
The creeper would envelope the sal tree.
Having enveloped the sal tree, it would make a canopy over it.
Having made a canopy above it, it would weigh downwards with its denseness.\textsuperscript{54}
Weighing down with its denseness, it splits one big branch after big branch of the sal tree.

4.5 Then, bhikshus, this occurs to that deity dwelling in the sal tree,
‘It is about this that those good friends and companions, relative by blood and marriage—park deities, forest deities, tree deities, and deities dwelling in medicinal herbs, grass and forest trees—had gathered and assembled together, and gave comfort, thus:
“Fear not, sir! Fear not, sir! Perhaps, a peacock will swallow it, or a wild beast [deer] will eat it, or forest-fire will burn it, or woodsmen [forest workers] will carry it off, or termites will devour it, or it might even not be viable!”
And it is because of these sense-pleasures, on account of these sense-pleasures that I suffer these sensations of sharp, piercing, racking pains.’

4.6 Even so, bhikshus, there are certain recluses and brahmans who hold such a doctrine, such a view, that
‘There is no fault in sensuality.’
They fall into the indulgence in sense-pleasures. They solicit the top-knotted female wanderers.
They spoke thus:
‘Seeing what future fear [danger] in sense-pleasures do these good recluses and brahmans speak of the abandoning of sense-pleasures, and declare a full understanding of sense-pleasures?’
Saying, ‘Blissful is the touch of the arm and soft hair of these young female wanderers,’ they fall into the indulgence in sense-pleasures.
Having fallen into the indulgence in sense-pleasures, with the body’s breaking up, after death, they are reborn in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell. There, they suffer sensations of sharp, piercing, racking pains.
They spoke thus:
‘This is the future fear [danger] that these good recluses and brahmans see in sense-pleasures when they speak of the abandoning of sense-pleasures, and declare a full understanding of sense-pleasures!
For, it is because of these sense-pleasures, on account of these sense-pleasures that we suffer these sensations of sharp, piercing, racking pains.’
This, bhikshus, is called the Dharma-undertaking that is pleasant now, ripening as pain in the future.\textsuperscript{55}

Painful now, painful later

5.1 (2) And what, bhikshus, is the Dharma-undertaking that is \textbf{painful now, ripening as pain in the future}?

5.2 \textsuperscript{56}Here, bhikshus, someone is a \textbf{naked ascetic},\textsuperscript{57} of loose habits [flouting conventions],\textsuperscript{58}

\textsuperscript{54} \textit{Upari vitabhiṁ karitvā oghanāṁ janeyya}. Comy explains \textit{oghanāṁ janeyya} as that “it would create a denseness below (\textit{heṭṭha ghanaṁ janeyya}). Climbing upwards and encircling the whole tree, then falling downwards again so that it might touch the earth.” (MA 2:372). \textit{Oghana} = “a pushing downwards, downwards pressure; a thick or dense entanglement” (DP sv): foll this I have rendered it freely.

\textsuperscript{55} On \textit{types of practice}, see Intro (2).

\textsuperscript{56} This whole section is, mutatis mutandis, at: \textbf{Kassapa Siha,ṇāda S} (D 8,14/1:165-167), SD 77.1; \textbf{Udumbarikā Siha,ṇāda S} (D 25,8.2/3:41), SD 1.4; \textbf{Mahā Siha,ṇāda S} (M 12,45/1:77 f), the Bodhisattva’s self-mortification (SD 49.1); \textbf{Cūḷa Dhamma,sa,mādāna S} (M 45,5.2/1:307 f), practices painful now, painful later, SD 32.4; \textbf{Kandaraka S} (M 51,8/1:342 f), SD 32.9; \textbf{Apaṇṇaka S} (M 60,36/1:412), SD 35.5; \textbf{Ghoṭa,mukha S} (M 94,10/2:161), SD 77.2; \textbf{Paṭipadā

\url{http://dharmafarer.org}
licking his hands;\textsuperscript{59} not coming when invited, not stopping when invited; not accepting food that is brought nor food specially prepared nor a meal invitation; accepting nothing from a pot, from a bowl, across a threshold, among the firewood, among the rice-pounders, from two eating together, from a pregnant woman, from a woman giving suck, from a woman in the midst of men,\textsuperscript{60} from a food-distribution centre, from where a dog is waiting, from where flies are swarming;

He accepts neither fish nor meat; drinking no wine nor beer nor cereal brew.\textsuperscript{61} He keeps himself to one house (when collecting alms), to one morsel; he keeps himself to 2 houses, to 2 morsels ... keeps to 7 houses, to 7 morsels;

He lives on one small serving (of food) a day; on 2 small servings a day ... on 7 small servings a day;\textsuperscript{62} He takes food once a day; once every 2 days ... once every 7 days—thus even up to a fortnight, he dwells pursuing the practice of taking of food at such regular intervals.

He is an eater of greens, \textsuperscript{308} or of millet, or of wild rice, or of hide-parings, or of water-lettuce,\textsuperscript{63} or of rice-bran, or of rice-remnants,\textsuperscript{64} or of sesame seed flour, or of grass, or of cow-dung.

He lives on forest roots and fruits, a windfall-eater.


\textbf{Acelaka S} (A 3.141/1:295), SD 78.1; \textbf{Atta,daṇḍa Sutta Nd} (Nm 15/416 f). This set of practices are sometimes called “medium self-mortification” (eg M 12, 51) The Dīgha pericope (D 8 + 25) has 6 additional self-mortifying observances.


\textsuperscript{58} \textit{Mutṭ’ācāro}.

\textsuperscript{59} Hatthāpalekhanī. Cf Sekh 52 (V 4:98) which prescribes hand-licking: D 1:166, 3:40; M 1:77, 238, 307; A 1:295; Pug 55.

\textsuperscript{60} \textit{Puris’antara’gatā}. This phrase is used to define \textit{gīhi,gata}, “gone gone to a layperson” (V 4:322); defines \textit{ittih, “woman”} at MA 2:209, DA 78. Comys say that this is a danger to their pleasure (as such putting the ascetic at a disadvantage).

\textsuperscript{61} \textit{Na surāṁ, na merayāṁ, na thuś’odakaṁ pivati}. “Rice-wine,” \textit{thus’odaka} (Skt \textit{tuśodaka}, “rice chaff”) “sour rice-or barley-gruel” (SED, sv \textit{tuśāmbu}). Comys: “a drink called Soviraka made from (the husk of) all kinds of grain” (\textit{sabba,sassa,sambhārehi kataṁ sovirakam}, DA 2:355 = NmA 431 = PugA 232; \textit{sabba,sassa,sambhārehi kata,sovirakam}, AA 2:385: all add that \textit{thusodaka} is a strong drink and as such blamable (\textit{ettha ca surā,pānem eva sāvajjām}). On “salted Soviraka (sour gruel)” (\textit{lona,soviraka}); see Vinaya, where it is mentioned as a cure for stomach wind, and allowed as a beverage if mixed with water (Mv 6.16.3/V 1:210); mentioned in a list of drinks given to monks (Vv 177/2.2.6/23). \textit{Suśruta Sahhīta} describes preparation of \textit{tuśodaka} as a medicine (SuśSaṁ 44, 40cd-44ab). It is said to be sour gruel prepared with unhusked cereals; in Suś-Saṁ it refers to “fermented liquors of barley with husks” used as a purgative (GI Meulenbeld (tr), \textit{Mādhvanidāna}, Leiden, 1974:408 f). When boiled with pulse and barley, it becomes an aceto fermentation called \textit{tuśāmbu}. D:RD 3:38, “gruel”; M:NB 1:104 “rice gruel.” See D:RD 1:229 n2, D:W n196. My tr is contextual which suggests some kind of fermented drink.

\textsuperscript{62} “Small serving,” \textit{datti}. Comys say that a \textit{datti} is a small bowlful from which they leave out the main food (MA 2:45).

\textsuperscript{63} “Water-lettuce,” \textit{hato}, a kind of water-plant, Pistia stratiotes (PED) of the Aroales order.

\textsuperscript{64} “Rice-remnants,” \textit{acāma}, “the moisture of boiled rice, rice-scum, rice-water (without condiments, a mean unsavoury food—hence, prob interpreted as the burnt crust sticking to the pot)” (CPD): DA 356,15 = MA 2:45,12 = AA 2:355,17 = PugA 232,25; ie “burnte rice remnants in a pot,” or “kerak nasi” in Malay.
He pulls out (his) hair and beard, and is devoted to this practice.
He stands continuously, rejecting seats.
He squats continuously, and is devoted to such a posture.
He uses a matting of thorns, sleeps on the matting of thorns.
He engages in (the ritual of) bathing in water three times a day, including the evening.\(^{66}\)
Thus in these various ways he dwells keeping to the practice of tormenting himself and mortifying the body.\(^{67}\)

5.3 With the body’s breaking up, after death, he is reborn in a plane of misery, an evil destination, a lower realm, in hell.
This, bhikshus, is the way of undertaking the Dharma that is painful now, ripening as pain in the future.\(^{68}\)

**Painful now, pleasant later**

6.1 (3) There is a way of undertaking the Dharma, bhikshus, that is painful now, ripening as pleasure in the future?
Here, bhikshus, someone,
is by nature strongly lustful, and he constantly feels bodily and mental suffering born of lust;
is by nature strongly hateful, and he constantly feels bodily and mental suffering born of hate;
is by nature strongly delusive, and he constantly feels bodily and mental suffering born of delusion.

6.2 And yet, despite his pain, despite his grief, weeping with tearful face,\(^{69}\) he lives the holy life fully and perfectly.\(^{70}\)
With the body’s breaking up, after death, he is reborn in a happy state, in a heavenly world.
This, bhikshus, is a way of undertaking the Dharma that is painful now, ripening as pleasure in the future.\(^{71}\)

**Pleasant now, pleasant later**

7 (4) There is a way of undertaking the Dharma, bhikshus, that is pleasant now, ripening as pleasure in the future.
Here, bhikshus, someone,
is by nature is not strongly lustful, and does not constantly feel bodily and mental suffering born of lust;
is by nature not strongly hateful, and does not constantly feel bodily and mental suffering born of hate;
is by nature not strongly delusive,\(^{[309]}\) and does not constantly feel bodily and mental suffering born of delusion.

---

\(^{65}\) Shrouds collected from corpses in a charnel ground.
\(^{66}\) Apparently to wash away his “sins” as related in (Udaka Suddhika) Saṅgārava S (§ 7.21,11/1:182), SD 79.3.
\(^{67}\) This passage [§5.2] is at Apaṇṇaka S (M 60.36), where this last sentence is replaced by “This is called the person who torments himself and is intent on tormenting himself.” (M 60,36/1:412), SD 35.5.
\(^{68}\) On types of practice, see Intro (2).
\(^{69}\) Comy: His teachers and preceptor inflict upon him punishments, whose frequency causes him pain and grief, or on account of his karma, he is full of attachment and so on, while another does not (MA 2:373).
\(^{70}\) So sahāpi dukkhena, sahāpi domanassena, assu,mukho’pi rudamāno pariṇṇaṁ parisuddham brahma,cariyam carati.
\(^{71}\) On types of practice, see Intro (2).
8 Quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states, he enters and remains in the 1\textsuperscript{st} dhyana\textsuperscript{,}
accompanied by initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness, born of seclusion.

9 With the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquility and oneness of mind, he enters and remains in the 2\textsuperscript{nd} dhyana\textsuperscript{,} free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration.

10 With the fading away of zest, he dwells equanimous, mindful and fully aware, and experiences happiness with the body, he enters and remains in the 3\textsuperscript{rd} dhyana\textsuperscript{,} of which the Noble Ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’

11 With the abandoning of joy and abandonment of pain\textsuperscript{,} and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure, attains and dwells in the 4\textsuperscript{th} dhyana\textsuperscript{,} that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.

12 With the body’s breaking up, after death, he is reborn in a happy state, in a heavenly world. This, bhikshus, is a way of undertaking the Dharma that is pleasant now, ripening as pleasure in the future.\textsuperscript{These, bhikshus, are the 4 ways of undertaking the Dharma.}

13 The Blessed One said this. Satisfied, the monks approved of the Blessed One’s word.

— evam —

100317 100418 101126 110113 150302 170723 180723 200423 211002

\textsuperscript{72} For a more detailed description of the jhāna with similes, see Sāmaññaphala S (D 2.75-82/1:73-76), SD 8.10.
\textsuperscript{73} “Joy... pain,” sukha... dukkha: this refers to physical feelings. The next phrase—“pleasure and displeasure,”
\textsuperscript{74} domanassa... somanassa—refers to mental feelings, transcended earlier. Mental feelings must be overcome first
\textsuperscript{75} so that the mind is not distracted by itself, as it were. Then, all the other feelings (arising from the physical sense-
\textsuperscript{ contacts) are transcended. On the significance of this, see Sall'atthena S (S 36.6/4:207-210), SD 5.5.
\textsuperscript{76} Here, Vibhaṅga, in its Sutta analysis (Vbh 261), gives 3 factors of the 4\textsuperscript{th} dhyana—equanimity (upekkhā), mindfulness (sati) and one-pointedness of mind (cittassa ek'aggaṭā)—but in its Abhidhamma analysis (Vbh 164; Vism 4.183/-
\textsuperscript{165) gives only 2 factors—equanimity and one-pointedness of the mind. See also Sāmañña,phala S (D 2.83/1:75), SD
\textsuperscript{8.10 & Dhyana}, SD 8.4 (5.4).
\textsuperscript{77} On types of practice, see Intro (2).