

2a

(Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta

The (Eights) Discourse on the Observance | **A 8.20**
or, (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta 1 the 1st (Ocean) Discourse on the Observance

Theme: The parable of the great ocean
Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014, 2021

1 Sutta summary and significance

1.1 SUMMARY AND HIGHLIGHTS

1.1.1 Sutta summary

The (Udāna) Uposatha (A 8.20) records the Buddha presenting the 8 qualities of the great ocean, in which the asuras delight. He then uses these qualities as parables to show the 8 qualities of the Dharma-Vinaya that good monastics delight in.

1.1.2 Full version

The (Udāna) Uposatha Sutta (U 5.5) is a full version of the sutta teaching on the observance (*uposatha*), closing with a verse. It is also found in the Vinaya (V 2:237-241), where it serves as the background story to the rules regarding the suspending of a monk's right to participate in the Pātimokkha recitation. It is referred to in the Sutta Nipāta Commentary (SnA 312).

However, it is possible that both A 8.20 and U 5.5 drew the set of ocean parables from the much older **Pahārāda Sutta** (A 8.19), or all three are rooted in an older urtext.

1.1.3 *Ovāda, pātimokkha*

Up to the time of the events of **the (Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta** (A 8.20) and the other 3 related Suttas [1.2.1], the Buddha has been reciting the “admonitory code” (*ovāda pātimokkha*), also simply called “the Buddha's advice” (*buddh'ovāda*). These many names evince its importance.

The code itself has only **3 verses**, recorded in the suttas,¹ **the Dhammapada** and Commentaries, thus:²

*sabba, pāpassākaraṇaṃ
kusalass'upasampadā
sacitta, pariyodapanam
etam buddhāna sāsanaṃ*

(Dh 183)³

Not doing any bad [evil],
cultivating the good [the wholesome],
purifying one's own mind—
this is the teaching of the buddhas.

*khantī paramaṃ tapo titikkhā
nibbānaṃ paramaṃ vadanti buddhā
na hi pabbajito parūpaghātī
na samaṇo⁴ hoti paramā viheṭṭhayanto*

(Dh 184)⁵

Patience and forbearance are the supreme austerity,
nirvana is supreme, say the buddhas.
Truly, one is not a renunciant, who harms another,
nor is one a recluse, who harms another.

¹ Eg **Mahā'padāna S** (D 14,3.28), SD 49.8a + sd 49.8b (3.33).

² See SD 16.1 (6).

³ Dh 183 || Dh:Patna 357 (19.16) || Uv 28.1 || Mvst 3:420.

⁴ So Be, Dh:Ee; Ce Ee Se, Dh:Patna 239, Uv 26.2 omit *na*. The metre is Aupacchandāsaka (P *opacchandāsaka*): see Anandajyoti, “An outline of the metres of the Pāli canon,” 2006 (2.10).

*anupavādo anupaghāto
pāṭimokkhe ca saṃvaro
mattaññutā ca bhattasimā
panthañ ca sayan'āsanam
adhicitte ca āyogo
etam buddhāna sāsanaṃ*

Neither abusing nor injuring,
and restraint in the Pātimokkha [monastic code],
and moderation in food,
and a remote bed and seat,
and devotion to the higher mind⁶—
(Dh 185)⁷ this is the teaching of the buddhas.⁸

These 4 Suttas marked the end of the Buddha's reciting of the Ovāda Pātimokkha, and the Buddha's mandate that the sangha itself recite **the mandated Pātimokkha** (*āṇā,pātimokkha*) [1.1.4.1], that is, the monastic code of rules, which has been handed down to this day through the Pali tradition.⁹ To understand the significance of this development, see (1.1.4; 2.1).

1.1.4 Meaning of *parisuddhi* in the Sutta account

1.1.4.1 The (Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta (A 8.20) records a key event in early sangha history, marking the end of the Buddha's recitation of the "admonitory code" or "admonition code" (*ovāda pātimokkha*). In other words, up to that point, during the 1st period of the ministry,¹⁰ there was no monastic code (*pātimokkha*) or 220 rules or 227 rules (that is, the "mandated code.")¹¹ For a period, the monks who attended these *ovāda pātimokkha* sessions were all arhats.

The admonitory code is uttered by the Buddha at **the 1st *ovāda pātimokkha* assembly**, attended by all the arhats of the time, totalling 1,250. The significance of the occasion is highlighted by its being called "**the 4-limbed assembly**" (*catur-aṅgika,sannipāta*) for the following reason:

- (1) It is the full moon observance day of the month of Māgha;¹²
- (2) 1,250 monks¹³ assembled spontaneously (*dhammatāya*), unprompted (*anāmantitāni*);
- (3) They are all arhats with the 6 superknowledges (*cha-l-abhiññā*);¹⁴ and
- (4) They have all been personally ordained by the Buddha with the formula "Come, bhikkhu!" (*ehi,-bhikkhu*). (MA 3:209)

⁵ Dh 184 || Dh:Patna 239 (14.1) || Uv 26.2.

⁶ "The higher mind" (*adhicitta*) is meditation leading to spiritual liberation.

⁷ Dh 185 || Uv 31.50.

⁸ These 2 half-lines as at Dh 185ef. For details, see 49.8b (2.6.1).

⁹ On the rules for monks and for nuns, see *The Pātimokkha*, ed W Pruitt, tr K R Norman, 2001. For a summary of the technical points of the Pātimokkha (ie the *āṇā,pātimokkha*), see op cit xxxviii-lv (Intro). For a rev ed of I B Horn-er's *The Book of Discipline* (V:H), see Brahmali (ed & tr), 2014: <https://suttacentral.net/downloads>.

¹⁰ On the periods in the Buddha's ministry, see **Notion of *diṭṭhi***, SD 40a.1 (1.3).

¹¹ On the "over 150" rules, see SD 52.6 (2.2.3.5). On the 227 rules of the Pātimokkha, see SD 46.19 (3.2.3, 3.2.5.2).

¹² This full-moon often coincides with the last day of Chinese New Year, locally known as Chap Goh Meh (or more universally as **Yuan Xiao Jie**), or Lantern Day (not to be confused with the lantern festival of the 8th Chinese moon or Mooncake Festival). It is the day when traditional Chinese hold a special ancestral puja, have a 2nd reunion dinner (the 1st one being on the lunar new year's eve). On the following day, after a fortnight's break, working family members return to their work. The month of Māgha has 30 days, usu falling across Jan-Feb. **Visākha Pūjā** or "Buddha Day" (traditionally said to be on the full-moon day of May) commemorates the Buddha's nativity, awakening and parinirvana. **Āsāḷha Pūjā** or "Dharma Day" commemorates the teaching of the 1st discourse and the start of the rains-retreat (full moon of June-July): see SD 1.1 (3). For the ancient Indian year, see SD 1.1(1)n.

¹³ **Mahā'padāna S** (D 14), too, mentions these 1,250 monks and that they are all arhats (D 14,1.10/2:6) + SD 49.8 (5.1.1.2).

¹⁴ **The 6 powers** (*cha-l-abhiññā*) are: (1) psychic powers, (2) the divine ear, (3) mind-reading, (4) retrocognition, (5) the divine eye, and (6) the knowledge of the destruction of the mental influxes (arhathood): see SD 1.8 (2.2.3).

Traditionally, this event is said to have occurred immediately following the teaching of **the Dīgha-nāka Sutta** (M 74), on the full moon day of the 10th month—the month of Māgha (January-February)—7 lunar months after the great awakening. On this occasion, as the traditional monastic code, the “mandated code” [1.1.4.1], has not yet been instituted, the Buddha gives them the well-known “admonitory code” (*ovāda pāṭimokkha*), which is the essence of monastic training and life.¹⁵

1.1.4.2 Apparently, the Buddha continues to recite these verses of **the admonitory code** to the arhats who gather for the occasion, which clearly must have been on every “uposatha day” (*tad-ah’uposatha*), that is, the full moon and the new moon days. After the 60 monks have been sent out on their 1st “global” mission—“**the great commission**”¹⁶—in 60 different directions, they brought back numerous converts.

During the 2nd year of the ministry, when Sāriputta and Moggallāna joined the Buddha’s sangha, their followers, totalling 500 renunciants, joined the sangha, too.¹⁷ We are not told whether they all became arhats, or even streamwinners.

It is likely that the Buddha continues to admit arhat candidates by himself, using the *ehi bhikkhu* and *ehi bhikkhuṇī* formulas,¹⁸ but to a much lesser degree than during the early years, right to the 20th year, when **the Aṅguli,māla Sutta** (M 86) records the Buddha admitting Aṅguli,māla by the *ehi,bhikkhu* pronouncement.¹⁹ On the other hand, the Buddha also allows the sangha to ordain suitable candidates by their **recitation of the 3 refuges**, and other methods.²⁰ The last and most important method by which the Buddha allows the sangha to ordain is that of “the ordination by an act of 3 proclamations and a resolution” (*ñatti,cattuttha,kammūpasampadā*).²¹

1.1.4.3 Once the Buddha allows the sangha to admit non-arhat candidates, 2 significant changes or “upgrades” need to be introduced:

- (1) **The steps of training** (*sikkhā,pada*), that is, the training in moral virtue, in mental concentration and in insight wisdom.
- (2) **The mandated code** (*āṇā,pātimokkha*) that defines the renunciant and rehabilitates (“purifies”) the errant monastic through the confession of offences (*āpatti.desanā* or **paṭidesanā*).²²

This means that the Buddha mandated the sangha as a “**legal person**” or “**juristic person**” (as against a “**natural person**”). Legal personality refers to the capability of enjoying and being subject to legal rights and duties, of owning property, and possessing the capacity of succession.²³ It also means that the sangha, acting juristically or as a proper assembly, has the capacity to ordain members, deliberate on their actions or status, and expel any of them.

¹⁵ SD 16.1 (6.1).

¹⁶ ***Mahā.cārika** (Mv 1.11.1/V 1:21,1-8), SD 11.2(11).

¹⁷ Mv 1.23.1-24.4 (V 1:39-43).

¹⁸ See **Pabbajjā**, SD 45.16 (1).

¹⁹ M 86,6.5 (SD 5.11) = Tha 870.

²⁰ For a list of 8 methods of admission recorded in Comys and their details, see SD 45.16 (0.2.1).

²¹ SD 45.16 (2.2.2.3; 3).

²² The usual term here is *pāṭidesanīya* or *pāṭidesaniya*, “(an offence) that needs to be confessed” (V 1:172,10, 3:170,18, 4:176,12, 184,20, 5:211,28; A 2:243,7 f). The term *āpatti,desanā*, “acknowledge or confession of an offence” is Comy (VA 1297,6; AA 3:289,10). Interestingly, the Pali canon does *not* have any abstract n for what we today see as “confession” (**paṭidesanā*). That such a common and significant Vinaya act does not have a noun shows that it is not meant to be a fixed or lasting situation, but something that needs to be addressed and be rid of: “to be confessed.”

²³ E A Martin (ed), *A Dictionary of Law*, Oxford Univ Press, 1983, 5th ed 2002.

1.1.4.4 Since such an arrangement means that a candidate for the sangha need not be an arhat, or even attain any of the lower stages of the path. The candidate is simply an ordinary worldlying, who keeps or breaks the monastic rules. Clearly, the silent culprit, the false monk, is such a miscreant, who has broken a Vinaya rule or rules but does not admit it. [§§3-4]

Since there is, at that time, no mandated code, no Pātimokkha, there is no practice of confession of faults. When the Buddha declares that this congregation “is not entirely pure” (*aparissuddhi*) [§3.3], he is simply stating that there is someone amongst them who has failed in the training, probably one who has not renounced in good faith but for any of the wrong reasons.

1.1.4.5 Under **the mandated code** (*āṇā,pātimokkha*), as practised to this day, the phrase “entirely purity” (*parissuddhi*), refers to only those present who have committed no offences, or who have all acknowledged any offence committed, or have completed the penalty for them.²⁴ It should be noted that not all offences are corrected by confession; namely, those entailing defeat (*pārājika*) and those that need rehabilitation by the sangha (*saṅgh’ādi,sesa*).²⁵ Moreover, one who habitually and deliberately breaks rules would not be a bona fide monastic: if he is one who is not amenable to instruction, he is said to be **a hollow person**.

It is probable that the false monk in the Sutta [§3; 2.2] is a hollow person (*mogha,purisa*)²⁶ who is not keeping to the training in Dharma-Vinaya, and has neither faith nor acceptance of the 3 jewels (the Buddha, the Dharma and the noble sangha).²⁷ To correct such a situation—preventing the wrong people from joining the sangha and to rehabilitate bona fide renunciants in the sangha—the Buddha allows the sangha to ordain its own candidates.

This also marks the beginning of **the sangha act** (*saṅgha,kamma*), one that defines monastic Buddhism, governed by the Pātimokkha, the essence and heart of the Vinaya. This sangha act is one of the key reasons for the monastic sangha to be perpetuated down to this day.

1.2 RELATED TEXTS

1.2.1 The **parables on the 8 wonderful qualities of the great ocean** recur in at least 4 texts with only slight variations in the background narrative, as follows below:²⁸

Pahārāda Sutta ²⁹	A 8.19/4:197-204	SD 45.18
(Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta or (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta 1	A 8.20/4:204-208	SD 59.2a
(Udāna) Uposatha Sutta or (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta 2	U 5.5/53,6-56,31	SD 59.2b
Pātimokkha Ṭhapana Khandhaka or (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta 3	Cv 9.1-2 (V 2:236-241)	SD 59.2c

1.2.2 The oldest of these texts, and the source or 1st account of the 8 parables of the great ocean is found in **the Pahārāda Sutta** (A 8.19) [1.1.2].

Details on these 4 suttas are given in **SD 45.18 (1.2)**.

²⁴ See Mv 2.22.1 (V 1:120): V:H 4:158.

²⁵ On “what can be confessed,” see SD 58.4 (2.1).

²⁶ See **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25,24.2,) SD 1.4; **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22,6), SD 3.13.

²⁷ SD 47.1 (3.2.2.1); SD 51.8 (1.3.3.1).

²⁸ For an early scholarly attempt to show the historical relationship amongst these texts, see E Frauwallner, *The Earliest Vinaya*, 1956:146-148.

²⁹ Chin parallels: Asura Sūtra MĀ 35; EĀ 42.4. For an early scholarly attempt to show the historical relationship amongst these texts, see E Frauwallner, *The Earliest Vinaya*, 1956:146-148.

2 Some sutta highlights

2.1 THE BUDDHA'S SILENCE [§§1.4, 2.3, 3.3]

2.1.1 The Buddha's silence throughout the night

2.1.1.1 All the 3 Uposatha Suttas—the (**Aṭṭhaka**) **Uposatha** (A 8.20), the (**Udāna**) **Uposatha Sutta** (U 5.5) and the **Pātimokkha Ṭhapana Khandhaka** (Cv 9.1-2) [1.2.2]—tell us that the Buddha remains silent all night (throughout all the 3 watches), even though he is invited by Ānanda at the end of each watch to recite the Ovāda Pātimokkha [§§1.4, 2.3, 3.3].

Only after Ānanda's 3rd invitation, at the dawn of a new day [2.1.1.2], does the Buddha speak: he declares that "This congregation, Ānanda, is not entirely pure!" There is one amongst them who has not confessed his offence, or has committed some grave offence, or is a false monk [§§4.3, 8(3)] (the same in all the 3 Uposatha Suttas).

2.1.1.2 **What is the significance of the Buddha responding to Ānanda's invitation only at the dawn of a new day?** Since dawn has broken, it is a new day, and the *uposatha* day (full moon day or new moon day) is over. This is before the actual ruling that the observance should not be carried out on a non-observance day, except by a consensus (V 1:136,7 f). Since the uposatha day is over, the Buddha feels free to speak, since he has already made his statement. [2.1.2]

2.1.2 The significance of the Buddha's silence

2.1.2.1 There are at least 2 reasons for the Buddha's silence and non-response when he is invited thrice by Ānanda to recite the Ovāda Pātimokkha [1.1.2]. The 1st reason (given by the Commentary) is quite imaginative, humorous at best. Had the Buddha recited the Pātimokkha with the false monk in the congregation, that monk's head would shatter into 7 pieces! Thus, out of compassion, the Buddha remains silent (AA 2:296,17 f).

Such an extraordinary remark should not be dismissed offhand, but appreciated in the context of the sutta narrative (and its commentarial explanations), and the nature of story-telling in ancient India (indeed, in many ancient cultures); that is, as literature. In fact, **head-shattering** is a literary device to highlight a non-action that is *so morally wrong and socially unacceptable* that it deserves our strongest censure. It is mostly applied in the suttas that record the Buddha's debates with non-Buddhists, when the other party does not answer a reasonable question asked by the Buddha.³⁰

Here, in a rare case, the Commentary applies it to a false monk who does not keep to the decorum of monasticism and rules for Pātimokkha conclave. The false monk's silence shows the monk's immoral status, and is diametrically opposed to **the Buddha's silence** of non-acceptance of such immoral conduct. Like the Buddha's silence on the 10 points,³¹ his silence here, too, reflects the fact that such a false person has no place in the sangha, since such a person is the antithesis of the spirit of his teaching, which is based on truth and openness. This brings us to the 2nd and related reason for the Buddha's silence here.

2.1.2.2 The 2nd reason for the Buddha's silence and his not reciting the Ovāda Pātimokkha when thrice invited by Ānanda is that the Buddha is making a statement on his desire to stop reciting the exhortatory code (*tato patthāya ovāda, pātimokkhāraṃ anuddisitu, kāmo tassa vatthuraṃ pākaṭaṃ kātuṃ*, UA 2:296,27-29). After declaring that the monks themselves as a sangha—as a "legal person"—should

³⁰ See eg **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 3,1.20) SD 21.3 (1.1.3); **Cūḷa Saccaka S** (M 35,13-14), SD 26.5.

³¹ See **Silence and the Buddha**, SD 44.1 (5).

conduct the observance and recite the Pātimokkha because “it is impossible and inconceivable that the Tathagata could conduct the observance and recite the Pātimokkha in an impure congregation.” [§6]

2.1.2.3 The Buddha’s silence has a deep significance for the survival and efficacy of his postmortem teaching. The Buddha Dharma is silent and dead to those who neither understand nor keep the moral precepts and the Vinaya, to those who fail to practice and taste the mindfulness of insight and concentration of inner calm and clarity, and the liberating wisdom of the higher training beginning with stream-winning and ending in nirvana.

Those who seek to understand and observe moral virtue, who value and practise mindfulness and concentration, who cultivate liberating wisdom, on the other hand, are still able to hear the Buddha’s voice through the Dharma of the suttas and Vinaya of monasticism. In either case, there is the true vision and practice of **renunciation** (*nekkhamma*) of defilements for the monastics and of views by the laity, so that they can all at least attain streamwinning in this life itself. In this way, when we keep to this path, we will awaken within 7 lives at the most, even meet the future Buddha while we do so.

2.1.3 Sociological aspects of early Buddhism

2.1.3.1 Far from the Buddha dissociating himself from the monastic sangha, he is, in fact, sociologically, “routinizing his charisma.”³² This means that he is transferring his charisma onto the sangha, as it were: the properly constituted conclave or *saṅgha* can now act in a *legal* manner, or “ecclesiastically,” to recite the Pātimokkha, as he has himself done before. Crudely put, the Buddhist sangha is no more a **cult** centering around the Buddha’s person or personality. From thereon, the properly constituted sangha represents him by way of a “sangha act” (*saṅgha,kamma*).

Sociologically, this is the first or the seed of **rationalization**, in early Buddhism, where we see the Buddha’s authority is “rationalized” or transferred to the sangha *as a whole*. This is significant in at least 2 ways. The first is that the sangha, through the Vinaya, is able to ordain monks and nuns, a process which is discussed elsewhere.³³

Secondly, by “routinizing” his teachings, the Dharma, into “suttas” and related teachings, the Buddha ensures the preservation and dissemination of his teachings (the Dharma) and practices (meditation), for the benefit of both his monastics and lay followers. In a worst-case scenario, even when the monastics renege their monastic vows and live worldly lives, watering down the Dharma and “revising” it, as actually done by the post-Buddha sectarian Buddhisms, **the traditional sangha** or **the laity**, keeping to the early Buddhist texts (EBT) are still able to invoke the Buddha’s early teachings and practise them to the same effects and benefits as he has intended.

2.1.3.2 The Weberian³⁴ concept of “**routinization**” helps, in some ways, to explain how the Buddha empowers the early sangha to work on its own as a legal or ecclesiastical institution. In other words, it has the power of accepting or rejecting candidates into **the sangha**, of owning and handing down property. Most importantly, the sangha will work as a Vinaya-based and Dharma-spirited institution, defined by its *moral purity, meditative training, and wisdom* to ensure the proper preservation and dissemination of the Buddha Dharma.

³² See Ray Gordon, “charisma, routinization of,” in *Blackwell Ency of Sociology*, 2007:437 f.

³³ See **Pabbajja: A very short history**, SD 45.16, where, on the Buddha’s authorization of ordination by the sangha, see SD 45.16 (2+3).

³⁴ From Max Weber (1864-1920), sociologist, historian, jurist and political economist, one of the leading theorists of modern social science.

In terms of **religion**, Weber's idea of rationalization refers to “the development of theology by an intellectual stratum, the disappearance and the replacement of sacraments by personal responsibility.”³⁵

In early Buddhism, we see, even in its post-Buddha form (such as in the Pali canon), a systematic teaching, literary, moral, psychological and spiritual, that is, as a rule, coherent, empirical and human-centred.

Even where religious language and lore are used, early Buddhist teachings can be read on a practical, personal and contemporary level. Moreover, it is famously free of dogmas and binding rituals. The Buddha's psychic powers and superknowledges are replaced by the sangha's organized efficacy in ordaining monastics and training them as virtuosi of the faith, widely respected as teachers and exemplars of the Dharma. To this extent, Buddhism is *rationalized* in the Weberian sense.

2.1.3.3 However, there are at least a couple of aspects of Weber's idea of rationalization that do not seem to apply to early Buddhism. His idea, technically, applied to western Europe as she modernized herself, and did not apply to India, especially to Indian Buddhism. However, we do not have to agree with Weber on this, since he is working on other scholars' views of Buddhism, and we have it firsthand.

The concept of rationalization was part of Weber's view of capitalist society as an “iron cage”³⁶ in which the individual, stripped of religious meaning and moral value, would be increasingly subject to government surveillance and bureaucratic regulation.³⁷ “Like Karl Marx's idea of **alienation**, rationalization implies the separation of the individual from community, family and church, and his subordination to legal, political and economic regulation in the factory, school and state.”³⁸

2.1.3.4 Despite Buddhist monastics and laity being naturally subject to their country's laws and ways, we hardly see them, as a rule, “stripped of religious meaning and moral value.” We may, however, notice that in most urban Buddhism, or a group following “modern” ethnic Buddhism, it is likely to be coloured or distracted by modernist values and foreign influences. Often, it is also organized along “bureaucratic regulation,” making it an influential social group in its own way, but limited by its own agenda.

Marx's concept of “alienation”³⁹ may even explain the behaviour of monastics who are drawn to academic attainments or business engagements, thus isolating themselves from the canonical teachings of simplicity, restraint and renunciation of early Buddhism.

However, on account of the personal wealth and influence of such clerical virtuosi, they are able to survive, even prosper, without lay support or devotion. But these secularized virtuosi remain alienated from early Buddhism, in a vital sense, and are dependent on the riches and routine of a capitalist society. They are painfully far from the streamwinners who are “independent of others” (*apara-p-paccayā*)⁴⁰ that is, free from the world.

³⁵ See “rationalization,” *Penguin Dictionary of Sociology*, 3rd ed, 2006:319 f; Swedberg & Agevall, *The Max Weber Dictionary*, 2nd ed 2016:286 f.

³⁶ See <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/weber/> see §4 Modernity.

³⁷ See Ira Cohen, “rationalization,” *The Cambridge Dictionary of Sociology*, 2006:499.

³⁸ See “rationalization,” *Penguin Dictionary of Sociology*, 3rd ed, 2006:319 f

³⁹ In the *Economic and Philosophic Manuscripts* (1844), Marx discusses 4 aspects of the alienation of labour, as it occurs in capitalist society, ie, the alienation from the product of labour; from the activity of labour, from one's own specific humanity; and from others, from society. In Buddhist terms, a worldly person is alienated from his own good within, from showing and sharing that good, from attaining the higher good (that path), and from others who are more evolved than him and who have attained the path.

⁴⁰ See **Nakula S** (A 6.16,4), SD 5.2; **Emotional independence**, SD 40a.8.

2.2 THE FALSE MONK [§§4.3, 8(3)]

2.2.1 Stock passage

2.2.1.1 The false monk is described as being “immoral, of bad character, impure, of suspect conduct, secretive in his actions, not a recluse though claiming to be one, not a celibate though claiming to be one, inwardly rotten [rotten to the core], wet with lust, full of filth” (*dussīlāṃ papa,dhammaṃ asuci,saṅkassara,samācaram paṭicchanna,kammantaṃ assamaṇaṃ samaṇampaṭiññaṃ abrahma,cāriṃ brahma,cāri,-patiññaṃ anto,pūtiṃ avassutaṃ kasambu,jātaṃ*).⁴¹ [§4.3]

The stock in the Dharma-Vinaya parable 3, adds the line: “The sangha communes not with such a one, but having quickly assembled, it expels him.” [8(3)]

All the 3 Uposatha Suttas [2.1.1] describe the “false monk” in full in the same 2 places: first, it is said by the narrator [§4.3]; and in the 2nd case, the Buddha himself mentions him in connection with the 3 parables of *the ocean does not associate with the dead, quickly casting them ashore*. Even so, the sangha (that is, a true monastic sangha) has no communion with such a false monk, and quickly expels him [§8(3)].

2.2.1.2 The Saṃyutta Commentary says that people will remember his deed with suspicion, or he recalls others with suspicion, and when he sees people talking amongst themselves, he suspects that they must be discussing his faults (SA 3:32 f). He is thus ridden with guilt, and has to put up a front of false goodness, restraint and kindness. Yet, he is nothing but a **hollow person** (*mogha,purisa*), who lacks moral virtue; without moral virtue, he is without a mind of calm or clarity; hence, with neither as basis, he is empty of true wisdom and compassion.

2.2.2 The false monk’s unwholesome qualities may be explained as follows:

1. dussīlāṃ, “immoral.” He is one who does not keep to the Vinaya, rejecting it as being “outdated,” and rationalizing that it is merely some “legalistic convention.” He looks up to titles and qualifications, seeing them as attributing status and charisma that justify living a “Vinaya-free” lifestyle. He even justifies his actions as being “socially engaged,” and that being compassionate is better than keeping to the rules, that it’s better to be “kind” than being right and good.⁴²

2. papa,dhammaṃ, “of bad character.” Being immoral in nature, he conducts himself like a layman, keeping his hair long and unshaven; dressing himself like a layman. He shamelessly frequents places which are **improper** (*agocara*), such as markets, shopping centres, entertainment spots, and places frequented by lay people. He even uses money, buys and sells things, even running a business, and so on.⁴³

⁴¹ This is stock: **Dāru-k,khandha S 1** (S 35.200/4:179-181), SD 28.5; **Āsaṃsa S** (A 3.13/1:108), **Saṅgha,bhedaka S** (A 4.241/2:239 f); **Aggi-k,khandhōpama S** (A 7.68,4/4:128), SD 52.12; **Pahārāda S** (A 8.19/4:201), SD 45.18; **(Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha S** (A 8.20/4:205), SD 59.2a; **(Samudda) Uposatha S 2** (A 8.20/4:239 f = U 5.5/52, 55), SD 59.2b; Pug 27, 36; DA 1:122; SA 3:42; AA 2:177, 4:64; UA 297 (UA:M 761); DhkA 207; Nm 483 :: NmA 455, 338; cf Vism 1.158*/57 (verse 10a).

⁴² On **moral virtue**, see **Sīlānussati**, SD 15.11 (2.2); SD 21.6 (1.2); SD 37.8 (2.2).

⁴³ On **go,cara**, safe and true practice: **Makkaṭṭa S** (S 47.7,12), SD 41.7.

3. asuci, “impure.” Although he has not broken any of the 4 defeat (*pārājika*) rules,⁴⁴ he indulges in habits of “disguised sexuality,” which specifically implies self-abuse, even homosexual acts.⁴⁵ Broadly, it refers to the bonds of coupling (*methuna, saṃyoga*), that is to say:

- (1) enjoying physical contact;
- (2) socializing (especially for the sake of entertainment);⁴⁶
- (3) lusting after the physical form;
- (4) distracted by pleasurable sounds;
- (5) delighting in frivolities with others;
- (6) approving of others indulging in physical pleasures; and
- (7) living the holy life for the sake of going to heaven.

The Buddha’s warning to monastics against these “bonds of coupling” are recorded in **the Methuna Sutta** (A 7.47): they are said to be “the break, the tear, the mottle, the blotch” of the holy life. Like the Buddha, monastics should live “the perfect and pure brahmachari life, unbroken, untorn [consistent], unmixed [not altering the rules], spotless [unblotched].”⁴⁷

4. saṅkassara, samācaram, “of suspect conduct.” One who, for any reason, fails to see the true purpose of renunciation, or resorts to monkhood as **wrong livelihood** (*micchā, ājīva*) or retirement plan, would befriend the rich and powerful to gain their support, patronage and favour, to further their higher education. From there, they seek salaried jobs, live in their own house-viharas just like the laity [2.2.1.8], from whom they continue to receive pious offerings from the lowly and poor.⁴⁸ Sadly, we see here the makings of a Buddhist class culture where Buddhism is seen as *a product, status and lineage*.

5. paṭicchanna, kammantarā, “secretive in his actions.” Monastics in their robes are often respected by others, including those in authority. A dishonest monastic exploits the goodwill of the gullible and deluded to import or export taxable goods and contraband, even currency, in and out of the country. An act of smuggling contraband worth even a few cents by a monastic entails a breach of the 2nd defeat rule.⁴⁹ At **A 2.16**, it is said that such an immoral person of concealed actions may expect to be reborn in hell or the animal womb.⁵⁰

6. assamaṇarā samaṇa, paṭiññarā, “not a recluse though claiming to be one.” A true Buddhist recluse takes the historical Buddha as his only teacher, the Buddha Dharma as the true teaching and path, and aspires to attain the noble sangha. When he discounts the Buddha or disparages the arhats or noble disciples in any way, he is not a true recluse.

Or, like Sāti in **the Mahā Taṇha, saṅkhaya Sutta** (M 38), he holds onto wrong views, such as those rejecting impermanence, suffering and nonself, especially believing in some kind of abiding essence.

⁴⁴ See SD 58.4 (2.1.1.3); SD 52.12 (1.2.1.1).

⁴⁵ Although the suttas and precepts say nothing against homosexuality as a wholesome personal lifestyle or relationship, monastics, on account of their vow of celibacy, must abstain from any form of sexuality. In other words, a homosexual act or any sexual contact of the orifices (mouth, genital, anal), even with an animal or a corpse entails *defeat*. See S Clarke, “Monks who have sex,” 2009, esp 18.

⁴⁶ See SD 21.9 (1(2) n).

⁴⁷ A 7.47/4:54-56 (SD 21.9); SD 31.7 (2.3).

⁴⁸ See **Dhaniya S** (Sn 1.2), where the Buddha declares: “No one’s hiring am I, ... There’s no use for wages” (SD 50.20); and in **Kasī Bhāra, dvāja S** (Sn 1.4, SD 69.6), the Buddha rejects any reward or payment for his teaching: he only accepts offerings out of faith (SD 37.8 (1.4.3)).

⁴⁹ Pārājika 2 (V 4:46,16-20).

⁵⁰ A 2.26/2.3.6/1:60. See also UA 295.

Since he is not a true practitioner, he would never reach the path in this life.⁵¹ To reach the path in this life, he should at least practise the perception of impermanence.⁵²

7. *abrahma, cāriṃ brahma, cāri, patiññam* “not a celibate though claiming to be one.” Like Ariṭṭha in the **Alaggadūpama Sutta** (M 22), the impure monk thinks, secretly or openly, that it is all right, even necessary to socialize, even touch, women.⁵³ The impure monk rationalizes that since the Buddha has himself allowed the “lesser and minor rules” to be abrogated, he does not need to follow any of the Vinaya rules, especially those other than the 4 defeat rules.⁵⁴ The first of these rules that are to be rescinded, in his view, begins with the 1st *saṅghādisesa*, that is, the rule against masturbation.⁵⁵

8. *anto, pūtim*, “inwardly rotten,” that is, “rotten to the core.” His conduct and being are of the nature of rubbish or filth, on account of his defilements, that is, lust, hate and delusion (SA 3:42). He is one rotten to the core, since he has become wet with the rains of lust and so on in his 6 sense-doors (the 5 senses and the mind) (*chahi dvārehi rāg’ādīhi kilesa, vassanena tintattā*, UA 297,21 f).⁵⁶

He is “inwardly rotten” on account of his moral failure (*sīla, vipattiyā*)⁵⁷ in his actions (*kammena*) (of body, speech and mind),⁵⁸ pervading right through to the core of his being (*pūtinā kammena sīla, vipattiyā anto, anupaviṭṭhattā, anti, pūtim*); in short, he is rotten (immoral and evil) to the core. The prefix **anto** highlights the fact that he may appear calm, composed, reticent, even holy, but the hard reality is that he is “inwardly rotten.” Like rotting and foul-smelling filth, he is actually *unpleasant, unkind, unhelpful and false*. Hence, he is dangerous to others since, by mere association, they (we), too, will end up being like him or worse.

Anto, pūti encompasses all the negative qualities mentioned here, so that the **Dāru-k, khandha Sutta 1** (S 35.200) defines *anto, pūti* by this very pericope: “immoral, of bad character, impure, of suspect conduct, secretive in his actions, not a recluse though claiming to be one, not a celibate though claiming to be one, wet with lust, full of filth.”⁵⁹

Buddhaghosa, in his Commentary on the Sutta, describes him as a “**property-owning recluse-person**” (*samaṇa, kuṭimbika puggala*), that is, one who is gainfully employed, earning a living as a farmer and so on (SA 3:32,32 f, especially line 22). In fact, we are seeing the rise of such “professional” monk-persons and nun-persons, with academic titles and salaried jobs, misguided by or exploiting the notion of changing or “modernizing” Buddhism when they themselves are those who should *change* for the better.

The predominant language of **wetness** highlights the worldly monastics’ preoccupation with **sexual pleasures** (including masturbation) in particular, and worldly pleasures in general: sexuality is the root of samsara! [See description of *avussutam*, which follows.]

9. *avassutam*, “wet with lust.” A colourful description of a lustful, horny monastic! He is said to be horny⁶⁰ on account of wetting him through the raining of the defilements of lust and so on (*rāgādīhi*, UA 297,23 f), just like *anto, pūti* [2.2.2(8)]. The suttas and the Vinaya warn monastics against being in anyway

⁵¹ M 38/1:256-271 (SD 7.10).

⁵² See (**Anicca**) **Cakkhu S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

⁵³ M 22,9/1:133 (SD 3.13).

⁵⁴ See **Mahā, parinibbāna S** (D 16,6.3), SD 9 (12).

⁵⁵ Further see SD 7.9 (4.3.4.4).

⁵⁶ A similar gloss is found in the Comy (*mahā, ṭīkā*) on Vism 1.156/55,7.

⁵⁷ The 5 consequences of moral failure are: (1) great loss of property; (2) gaining ill-repute; (3) lacking confidence before an assembly; (4) dies confused; (5) reborn in a suffering state: **Pāṭali, gāma S** (U 8.6/86).

⁵⁸ Ie, breaking all the moral precepts, or at least one or more habitually.

⁵⁹ S 35.200,12/4:180 f (SD 28.5).

⁶⁰ Cf UA 12; UA:M 761.

enticed by sexual feelings, and that they should not indulge in any self-abuse,⁶¹ sexual activity,⁶² including incest.⁶³

10. kasambu, jātaṃ, “full of filth” (“one full of muck,” U:M 930), one “rotten to the core.” This is a popular phrase, found, for example, in **the Dāru-k, khandha Sutta** (S 35.200),⁶⁴ where its Commentary glosses with “of the nature of rubbish [sweepings], that is, defilements, such as lust and so on” (*rāgādīhi kilesehi kacavara, jāto*, SA 3:42,20) [2.2.2.8]. It is found in **the (Tika) Āsaṃsa Sutta** (A 3.13/1:108,23), where it is glossed with “overgrown with the rubbish that is lust and so on” (*sañjāta, rāgādī, kacavaro*, AA 1:177,28). It is also quoted in **the Puggala Paññatti** (Pug 27,10), where it is glossed with “one filthy, overwhelmed with lust and so on, or *kasambu* is said to be one who has become (like) a corpse drenched, rotting, in filthy water” (*sañjāta, rāgādī, kacavaro, atha vā kasambu vuccati tinta, kuṇapa, gataṃ kasaṭa, udakaṃ*, PugA 207,30).

The phrase *kasambu, jāta* occurs in **the Saṅgha, bheda Sutta** (A 4.241/2:240,1), and is quoted in **the Mahā Niddesa** (Nm 1: 231,21), where it is glossed with “of the nature of rubbish,” *saṅkāra, sabhā* (NmA 1:338,14). A similar quote is found in **the Vinaya** (V 2:236,28), glossed with “of a nature of being densely defiled with the 3 faults (of mind, speech and body)” (*ākiṇṇa, dosatāya saṅkiliṭṭha, jātaṃ*, VA 1287,7). It is also found in **the (Udāna) Uposatha Sutta** (U 5.5,16/53.16), explained as one “drenched in the filth that is lust, etc, through the 6 doors, (and) on account of being thrown out by the morally virtuous” (*chahi dvārehi rāgādīhi kacava, rattā silavantehi chaḍḍetabbatā ca*, UA 297,19), and is quoted by the Vinaya Commentary (VA 254,12 = 596,2). A verse in **the Visuddhi, magga** speaks of such a one being “evil, wet with lust, of the nature of filth” (*kasambu, jāto avassuto pāpo*, Vism 1.158/57,12*).

— — —

(Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta

The (Eights) Discourse on the Observance

A 8.20

1 At one time, the Blessed One was staying in Migāra’s mother’s mansion in the Eastern Park, outside Savatthi.

OBSERVANCE DAY

1.2 Now, at that time, on the day of **the observance** [*uposatha*],⁶⁵ the Blessed One was sitting surrounded by a sangha of monks.

⁶¹ On Seyyasaka, see SD 46.17 (2.2); on the 2 novices: SD 31.7 (7.2).

⁶² Eg V 4:211-213; VA 4:901,5; DA 1:18; MA 1:4; UA 12; KhpA 101.

⁶³ Incest between mother and son: **Mātā, putta S** (A 5.55/3:67-69).

⁶⁴ S 35.200,12/4:181 f (SD 28.5).

⁶⁵ **The day of observance** (*uposatha*) is the occasion for monastics to gather in conclave to listen to the recitation of the Pātimokkha (the monastic code of disciplinary rules). It occurs twice a lunar month on the days of the full moon and the new moon. See **Tad-ah’uposatha S** (A 3.70) + SD 4.18 (1+2); **Dhammika S** (A 4:254 f = Sn 400 f), SD 27.3(2.1).

1.3 Then, when the night was far advanced,⁶⁶ when the 1st watch passed,⁶⁷ the venerable Ānanda rose from his seat, arranged his upper robe over one shoulder, saluted the Blessed One, and said to him: “Bhante, the night has advanced. The 1st watch has passed; the sangha of monks has been sitting for a long time. Let the Blessed One recite **the Pātimokkha**⁶⁸ to the monks.”

1.4 When this was said, the Blessed One was silent. [205]

THE BUDDHA’S SILENCE

2 As the night (further) advanced, when the middle watch passed,⁶⁹ the venerable Ānanda rose from his seat **a 2nd time**, arranged his upper robe over one shoulder, saluted the Blessed One, and said to him:

2.2 “Bhante, the night has far advanced; the middle watch has passed; the sangha of monks has been sitting for a long time.

Bhante, let the Blessed One recite the Pātimokkha to the monks.”⁷⁰

2.3 A 2nd time the Blessed One was silent.

3 As the night (further) advanced, when the last watch passed,⁷¹ day was breaking [the sun was rising],⁷² dawn’s joyful face beaming, the venerable Ānanda rose from his seat **a 3rd time**, arranged his upper robe over one shoulder, saluted the Blessed One, and said to him:

3.2 “Bhante, the night has far advanced; the last watch has passed; dawn is breaking, her joyful face beaming.⁷³ The sangha of monks has been sitting for a long time.

Bhante, let the Blessed One recite the Pātimokkha to the monks.”

3.3 **“This congregation, Ānanda, is not entirely pure.”**⁷⁴

THE FALSE MONK EJECTED

4 Then, it occurred to the venerable Mahā Moggallāna:

“What person was the Blessed One referring to when he said:

‘*This congregation, Ānanda, is not entirely pure?*’”

⁶⁶ *Abhikkantāya rattiyā* refers to the ending (*khaya*) of the 1st watch, what little is left of it (*appāvasiṭṭha*, VA 971,30), ie, approaching or around 10 pm (KhpA 114,2; DA 1:227; MA 2:124,24 ad M 1:142,15); ending of the night as something beautiful (*sundara*), rejoicing in it (*abbhanumodana*), qu above invitation (AA 2:375,19-24, 3:353,4).

⁶⁷ *Nikkhanto paṭhamo yāmo*, ie just after 10 pm.

⁶⁸ This is the *ovāda, pātimokkha*, “exhortatory code” (UA 2:296,28-30, qu 298,27-32 = Dh 184, 183, 185), 1st recited to the 1250 assembled arhats on Māgha Pūjā: SD 16.1 (6).

⁶⁹ *Nikkhanto dutiyamo yāmo*, ie just after 2 am.

⁷⁰ *Uddisatu bhante bhagavā bhikkhūnaṃ pātimokhan’ti*.

⁷¹ *Nikkhante pacchime yāme*, ie just after 6 am.

⁷² “Day was breaking” (*uddhaste aruṇe*). So Comy, glossing with *uggate aruṇa, sīse*, “dawn’s head growing”; v *uddhate* with V 1:288, 2:236; U 27.

⁷³ *Abhikkantā bhante rattī nikkhanto [acchimo yāmo, uddhastarṃ aruṇarṃ nandi, mukhī rattī*. *Nandi, mukha*, lit “joy-faced” (cf Homer’s “rosy-fingered Dawn,” *Odyssey* 23.240): V 1:288,12, 2:236,17 (Comy), A 4:205,9 (AA 4:112,-12), U 27,6 (UA 186 f) (DP sv). Comy: “*Nandi, mukhī rattī*: at dawn the night appears like a face of delight; hence, it is called *nandi, mukhī rattī*” (*aruṇ’uṭṭhita, kale pīti, mukhā viya rattī khāyati; ten’āha nandi. mukhiyā rattiyā’ti*, VA 1287,-4 f); cf V:O 2:211 n2, 3:299 n1. Refs in Tib & Skt sources, see BHSD: (the time at the end of the night) just before the beating of the dawn drum (ie, substantially, dawn); sv *nandī-mukhā*, °*mukhī*. Curiously and ominously, Edgerton (BHSD) is annoyed by the Comy gloss!

⁷⁴ *Aparisuddhā ānanda parisā’ti*, ie, there is some monk present who has not confessed an offence which he has committed. Why does the Buddha remain silent for so long? See (2.1.2.1; 1.1.4.4).

4.2 Then, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna focused his mind on the whole sangha of monks, scanning their minds with his own mind.⁷⁵

4.3 The venerable Mahā Moggallāna then saw that person sitting in the midst of the sangha of monks: one who was **immoral**, of bad character, impure, of suspect conduct, secretive in his actions, not a recluse though claiming to be one, not a celibate though claiming to be one, inwardly rotten, wet with lust, full of filth.⁷⁶

4.4 Having seen him, he rose from his seat, went up to that person, and said to him: “Get up, avuso. The Blessed One has seen you. You cannot live in communion with the monks!” When this was said, that person remained silent.⁷⁷

4.5 **A 2nd time**, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna said to him: “Get up, avuso. The Blessed One has seen you. You cannot live in communion with the monks!” When this was said, a second time that person remained silent.

4.6 **A 3rd time**, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna said to that person: **[206]** “Get up, friend. The Blessed One has seen you. You cannot live in communion with the monks.” When this was said, a third time that person remained silent.

5 Then, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna grabbed that person by the arm, cast him out through the outer gatehouse, and bolted the door.⁷⁸

5.2 Then, he returned to the Blessed One and said to him:

“I have cast out that person, bhante. The congregation is pure. Let the Blessed One recite the Pātimokkha to the monks.”

5.3 “It’s amazing, Moggallāna! It’s unbelievable, Moggallāna! How that hollow man waited⁷⁹ until he was grabbed by the arm.”

UPOSATHA AS MONASTIC PRACTICE

6 Then, the Blessed One addressed the monks:

“Now, bhikkhus, **you yourselves should conduct the observance and recite the Pātimokkha.**

From today onward, I will no longer do so. It is impossible and inconceivable that the Tathagata could conduct the observance and recite the Pātimokkha in an impure congregation.⁸⁰

⁷⁵ On Moggallāna as the foremost of monks with psychic powers (*iddhimantānaṃ*): A 1.190/1:23,19. On how he cultivated these powers: (**Pāsāda,kampana**) **Moggallāna S** (S 51.14,10), SD 27.8.

⁷⁶ “Immoral ... depraved,” *dussīlaṃ papa,dhammaṃ asuci,saṅkassara,samācaram paṭicchanna,kammantaṃ asamaṇaṃ samaṇa,paṭiññāṃ abrahma,cāriṃ brahma,cāri,paṭiññāṃ anto,putiṃ avassautam kasambu,jātam* [2.2].

⁷⁷ We are not told why he is silent: he may be *psychologically defensive* [SD 7.9], such as being in denial that he has committed any offence [SD 7.9 (3.7)]. If he is silent, actually thinking that he is innocent, it may be an *unconscious defence mechanism*; if he knows he is guilty, and remains silent, he must then be lying.

⁷⁸ *Sūci,ghaṭikam datvā*, lit “fastened the bolt,” ie, bolted the door. This event is qu at SnA 312,1-4.

⁷⁹ Be Ee U *āgamissati*; Ce (Cv 9.1.2, qv) *āgamessati*. Both are fut forms of *āgacchati* (to come, come near; attain; CPD sv) + *āgāmeti* (to wait, stay; CPD sv). Clearly, the latter sense applies here.

⁸⁰ Both (**Aṭṭhaka**) **Uposatha S** (A 8.20,6) and (**Samudda**) **Uposatha S** (U 5.5,6), SD 59.2b, locate this pronouncement of **Pātimokkha recital** as a monastic institution before the parables of the great ocean. The Vinaya version (Cv 9.1-2), however, is the introduction of the suspension of the Pātimokkha recitation (*pātimokkha,ṭhapana*) for an “impure” monk, ie, one with an unconfessed offence (*s’āpattika*). This account of the suspension of the Pātimokkha is located right *after* the parables of the great ocean and the Buddha’s udana, ie, at the close of the whole account: SD 59.2c.

The 8 qualities of the great ocean

7 “There are, bhikshus, these 8⁸¹ strange and wonderful things about the great ocean, seeing which, the asuras delight in it.

What are the eight?⁸²

(1) The great ocean,⁸³ bhikshus, **slopes gradually**, slides gradually, inclines gradually, not abruptly⁸⁴ like a precipice.⁸⁵

Bhikshus, that the great ocean slopes gradually, slides gradually, inclines gradually, not abruptly like a precipice—

this, bhikshus, is the 1st strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(2) Furthermore, bhikshus, the great ocean is by nature **stable**: it does not overflow its margins.⁸⁶ Bhikshus, that *the great ocean is by nature stable: it does not overflow its margins—*

this, bhikshus, is the 2nd strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(3) Furthermore, bhikshus, the great ocean **does not associate with the dead**, a carcass.⁸⁷ Whatever that is dead, a carcass, the great ocean quickly carries it to shore, washes it onto dry land.⁸⁸

Bhikshus, that the great ocean does not associate with the dead, a carcass:

whatever that is dead, a carcass, the great ocean quickly carries it to shore, washes it onto dry land—

this, bhikshus, is the 3rd strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(4) Furthermore, bhikshus, whatever **great rivers** there are, that is to say, the Ganges, the Yamuna, the Aciravati, the Sarabhu and the Mahi,⁸⁹ upon reaching the great ocean, lose their former names and gotras [origins], come to be known simply as the great ocean.⁹⁰

⁸¹ Comy says that the Buddha could have also given, say, 16, 32, 64 or 1000 qualities, if he wishes. However, 8 qualities suffice here in response to Pahārāda’s own number [A 8.19,1.4, SD 45.18], which would also inspire him in the Dharma. (AA 4:111,9-12)

⁸² In **Pahārāda S** (A 8.19/4:197-204), SD 45.18, it is the asura chief, Pahārāda, who gives these parables.

⁸³ On the ancient Indian view of the physical world, see SD 45.18 (2.1.2).

⁸⁴ “Not abruptly,” *na āyataka* (adv; a tricky word), “suddenly, all of a sudden, abruptly” (CPD); from *āyataka* (adj), “long, prolonged, long-drawn (of a tone). Perhaps suggests going some distance and then suddenly, dropping off sharply, like a cliff; but note the Pali *na*, “not.”

⁸⁵ *Mahā,samuddo bhante anupubba,ninno anupubba,poṇo anupubba,pabbhāro na āyaten’eva papāto*. On the great ocean’s gradual deepening, see SD 45.18 (2.1.2).

⁸⁶ *Puna ca’param bhante mahā,samuddo ṭhita,dhammo velam nātivattati*, Comy: It does not overflow its margin when ebbing and flowing (VA 1287).

⁸⁷ *Puna ca’param bhante mahā,samuddo na matena kuṇapena saṁvasati* [Se saṁvattati].

⁸⁸ *Yaṁ hoti mahā,samudde mataṁ kuṇapam, taṁ khippam eva tīram vāheti thalam ussāreti*. Cf Miln 187, 250.

⁸⁹ *Puna ca’param bhante yā kāci mahā,nadiyo, seyyath’idaṁ gaṅgā yamunā aciravatī sarabhū mahī*. This list of India’s 5 great rivers is stock: **Sambhejja Udaka S** (S 13.3/2:135), **Pācīna,ninna Ss 1-6** (S 45.91-96/5:38 f; each river forms its own sutta; the 6th has all 5); **Satta Suriya S** (A 7.62/4:101), SD 47.6; (**Dasaka**) **Appamāda S** (A 10.15/5:22), SD 42.23; Miln 70, 87, 380. See SD 45.18 (2.4.2).

⁹⁰ *Tā mahā,samuddam patvā [Be:Ka pattā] jahanti purimāni nāma,gottāni mahā,samuddo tv-eva saṅkham gacchanti*.

Bhikshus, that *all the great rivers, that is to say, the Ganges, the Jumna [Yamuna], the Aciravati, the Sarabhu and the Mahi, upon reaching the great ocean, losing their former names and gotras [origins], come to be known simply as the great ocean—*
 this, bhikshus, is the 4th strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean,
 seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(5) Furthermore, bhikshus, despite those streams that flow into the great ocean, and the showers that fall from the sky, there is manifest **neither decrease nor fullness** of the great ocean.⁹¹
 Bhikshus, that *despite those streams that flow into the great ocean, and the showers that fall from the sky, there is manifest neither decrease nor fullness of the great ocean—*
 this, bhikshus, is the 5th strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean,
 seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(6) Furthermore, bhikshus, the great ocean has **only one taste**, the taste of salt.⁹²
 Bhikshus, that *the great ocean has only one taste, the taste of salt—*
 this, bhikshus, is the 6th strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean,
 seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(7) Furthermore, bhikshus, the great ocean has **many treasures** [jewels], diverse treasures.⁹³ In it there are these treasures, that is to say:
 pearl,⁹⁴ crystal,⁹⁵ beryl,⁹⁶ conch,⁹⁷ quartz,⁹⁸ coral,⁹⁹ silver, gold, ruby, cat's-eye.¹⁰⁰
 Bhikshus, that *the great ocean has many treasures, diverse treasures.*
In it there are these treasures, that is to say:
pearl, crystal, beryl, conch, quartz, coral, silver, gold, ruby, cat's-eye—
 this, bhikshus, is the 7th strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean,
 seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(8) Furthermore, bhikshus, the great ocean is **an abode of great [gargantuan] beings.**¹⁰¹ **[207]**
 In it there are these beings, that is to say, the timis,¹⁰² the timin,galas, the timi,timin.galas, asuras,¹⁰³

⁹¹ *Puna ca'param bhante yā ca [Be:Ka Ee Se yā kāci] loke savantiyo mahā,samuddam appenti, yā ca anta,likkhā dhārā papatanti, na tena mahā,samuddassa ūnattam gā pūrattam vā paññāyati.*

⁹² *Puna ca'param bhante mahā,samuddo eka,raso loṇa,raso.*

⁹³ *Puna ca'param bhante mahāmsamuddo bahu,ratano [Be:Ka pahūta,ratano] aneka,ratano.*

⁹⁴ "Pearl" (*mutta*), Comy: "Small, large, round, long etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

⁹⁵ "Crystal" (*maṇi*), or "gem," Comy: "Red, cloud-grey, etc:" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

⁹⁶ "Beryl" (*veḷuriya*), Comy: "The colour of bamboo, of acacia flower, etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305). See Miln:H 1:177.

⁹⁷ "Conch" (*saṅkha*), Comy: "The rightwise spiralled shell, the copper coloured, the hollow, the trumpet shell, etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

⁹⁸ "Quartz" (*silā*), Comy: "Coloured white or black or like a kidney-bean" (A 4:111; UA 2:305).

⁹⁹ "Coral" (*pavāḷa*), Comy: "Small, large, pink [pale red], deep red etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

¹⁰⁰ *Tatr'imāni ratanāni, seyyath'idam, muttā maṇi veḷuriyo saṅkho silā pavāḷam rajatam jāta,rūpam lohitako masāra,gallam.* Comy of "cat's-eye" (*masāra,galla*): "A speckled gem (*kabara,maṇi*), variegated crystal (*citta,phalikaṃ*)" (AA 4:111; UA 3:205). On these 7 jewels, see SD 45.18 (2.8.1).

¹⁰¹ *Puna caparam bhante mahāsamuddo mahatam bhūtānam āvāso.*

¹⁰² Comy: The *timi*, *timiṅgala* and *timi,timiṅgala* are 3 kinds of fishes or marine creatures. The *timiṅgala* is said to be able to swallow (*gilana*) the *timi*, and the *timi,timiṅgala* is capable of swallowing the both of them (UA 2:303). Comy to Sutasoma J (J 537) says all 3 feed on "rock seaweeds" or kelp (?) (*pāsāṇa,sevāla*) (J 5:462). SA 2:88 mentions 7 monsters or leviathans, one of which is the whale (*ānanda*). Cf also Miln 85.

¹⁰³ On asuras, see **Isayo Samuddaka S** (S 11.10) + SD 39.2 (1.1) & SD 29.6a (4.1.3).

nagas,¹⁰⁴ gandharvas.¹⁰⁵

There are in this great ocean, beings¹⁰⁶ with bodies a 100 yojanas¹⁰⁷ long,¹⁰⁸ with bodies 200 yojanas long, with bodies 300 yojanas long, with bodies 400 yojanas long, with bodies 500 yojanas long.¹⁰⁹ Bhikshus, that *the great ocean is an abode of gargantuan beings. In it there are these beings, that is to say, the timis, the timin,galas, the timi,timingalas, asuras, nagas, gandharvas.*

There are in this great ocean, beings with bodies a 100 yojanas long, with bodies 200 yojanas long, with bodies 300 yojanas long, with bodies 400 yojanas long, with bodies 500 yojanas long— this, bhikshus, is the 8th strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight in the great ocean.

7.2 These, bhikshus, are the 8 strange and wonderful things about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight in the great ocean.

The 8 qualities of the Dharma-Vinaya

8 So, too, bhikshus, there are these 8 astounding and amazing qualities in **this Dharma-Vinaya**, seeing which, **the monks take delight in it.**

What are the eight?

(1) Even so, bhikshus, just as *the great ocean slopes gradually, slides gradually, inclines gradually, not abruptly like a precipice—*

so, too, in this Dharma-Vinaya, **penetration into final knowledge** occurs by gradual training, not abruptly.¹¹⁰

Bhikshus, that, in this Dharma-Vinaya, **penetration into final knowledge** occurs by gradual training, not abruptly—

this, bhikshus, is the 1st strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(2) Even so, bhikshus, just as, the great ocean is by nature **stable**: it does not overflow its margins.¹¹¹ Bhikshus, that *the great ocean is by nature stable: it does not overflow its margins—*

¹⁰⁴ Some nagas (*nāga*) dwell on the crests of waves, while others have their own divine mansion (*vimāna*) (AA 4:111; UA 2:303). In Indian mythology, nagas are associated with the submarine (oceans) and subterranean (rivers) depths. The latter is one of the 7 kinds of nagas at SA 3:350. See T W Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, 1903:223; J P Vogel, *Indian Serpent-lore*, 1926:32.

¹⁰⁵ *Tatr'ime bhūtā, timi timiṅgalo timira,piṅgalo* [Ce *timi,timiṅgalā timira,piṅgalā*; Ee Se *timi,timiṅgalā timira,-miṅgalā*] *asurā nāgā gandhabbā*. On gandharvas (*gandhabba*), see **Gandhabba S** (S 31.1), SD 86.5.

¹⁰⁶ "Beings" (*atta,bhāva*), alt tr "creatures." Lit, "self-state, selfhood" but usu means "bodily form, existence as an individual." Here used non-technically to mean some exotic life-forms, prob leviathans.

¹⁰⁷ Yojana, sometimes tr as "league," the yoke of an Indian plough (J 6:38, 42). As distance, *yojana* ("league" or "yojana") is as far as a yoke of oxen can go in a day, ie, about 11.25 km or 7 mi (DhA 1:108, 2:13). See also V:H 2:90 n8.

¹⁰⁸ Quoted in DhA 299.

¹⁰⁹ *Santi mahā,samudde yojana,satikā'pi atta,bhāvā, dvi,yojana,satikā'pi atta'bhāvā, ti,yojana,satikā'pi atta,bhāvā, catu,yojana,satikā'pi atta,bhāvā, pañca,yojana,satikā'pi atta,bhāvā*.

¹¹⁰ For an explanation of the gradual training (by Ānanda), see **Gaṇaka Moggallāna S** (M 107,3-11), SD 56.3. On the 3 trainings (*ti,sikkhā*): **(Ti) Sikkhā S** (A 3.88), SD 24.10c; **Sīla samādhi paññā**, SD 21.6; SD 1.11 (5).

¹¹¹ *Puna ca'param bhante mahā,samuddo ṭhita,dhammo velam nātivattati*, Comy: It does not overflow its margin when ebbing and flowing (VA 1287).

so, too, bhikshus, in this Dharma-Vinaya, there are training-rules prescribed by me for my disciples,
which they would not transgress even for life's sake—

Bhikshus, that, *in this Dharma-Vinaya, there are training-rules prescribed by me for my disciples,
 which they would not transgress even for life's sake—*

this, bhikshus, is the 2nd strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya,
 seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(3) Even so, bhikshus, just as the great ocean does not associate with the dead, a carcass:
 whatever that is dead, a carcass, the great ocean **quickly carries it to shore**, washes it onto dry land¹¹²—
 so, too, bhikshus, **the sangha does not associate with a person who is immoral**,¹¹³ of bad character,
 of impure and suspicious conduct, secretive in deeds, not a recluse but pretending to be one,
 incelibate but pretending to be celibate,¹¹⁴ rotten to the core, lustful and filthy by nature¹¹⁵—
 the sangha communes¹¹⁶ not with such a one, but having quickly assembled, it expels him.¹¹⁷
 Even though he sits in the midst of the sangha, yet he is far away from the sangha,
 and the sangha is far away from him.¹¹⁸

Bhikshus, *that the sangha does not associate with a person who is immoral, of bad character,
 of impure and suspicious conduct, secretive in deeds, not a recluse but pretending to be one,
 incelibate but pretending to be celibate, rotten to the core, lustful and filthy by nature—
 the sangha communes not with such a one, but having quickly assembled, it expels him.
 Even though he sits in the midst of the sangha, yet he is far away from the sangha,
 and the sangha is far away from him—*

this, bhikshus, is the 3rd strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya,
 seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(4) Even so, bhikshus, just as whatever great rivers there are, that is to say,¹¹⁹
 the Ganges, the Jumna, the Aciravati, the Sarabhu and the Mahi,
 upon reaching the great ocean, losing their former names and gotra [origins],
 come to be known simply as the great ocean—
 so, too, bhikshus, when **these 4 classes**¹²⁰—
 the kshatriyas, the brahmins, the vaishyas, the shudras—
 having gone forth from the house for the homeless life in the Dharma-Vinaya
 proclaimed by the Tathagata,¹²¹

¹¹² Alluded to at Miln 1:188, 2:250. See SD 45.18 (2.3).

¹¹³ On the false monk, see [2.2].

¹¹⁴ Or, “Not living the holy life (*brahma, cariya*), but pretending to do so.”

¹¹⁵ *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda yo so puggalo dussīlo pāpa, dhammo asuci, saṅka-s, sara, samācāro paṭicchanna, kam-
 manto assamaṇo samaṇa, paṭiñño abrahmacārī brahmacāri, paṭiñño anto, pūti avassuto kasambu, jāto*. The stock on
the false monk, beginning with “a person who is immoral ...” up to here, recurs in **Aggi-k, khandhūpama S** (A 7.68/-
 4:134), SD 89.12. Here, this parable adds the foll 3 lines. See SD 45.18 (2.3.4.1).

¹¹⁶ “Communes” (v) or “to be in communion” (*saṃvasati*): see SD 45.18 (2.3.5).

¹¹⁷ *Na tena saṅgho saṃvasati, khippam eva naṃ sannipatitvā ukkhipati*. The vb **ukkkhipati** can also mean “to
 suspend” (V 2:61, 4:309; Pug 33).

¹¹⁸ *Kiñcāpi so hoti majjhe bhikkhu, saṅghassa sannisinno, atha kho so ārakā'va saṅghamhā saṅgho ca tena*. On the
false monk, see [2.2]. Cf **Saṅghāṭi, kaṇṇā S** (It 92, 2/91), SD 24.10a: see SD 45.18 (2.3.4.2).

¹¹⁹ This parable and the foll [(15)] are combined in Miln 70,

¹²⁰ On the 4 classes (*vaṇṇa*), see SD 45.18 (2.4.2.4).

¹²¹ *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda cattāro'me vaṇṇā khattiyā brāhmaṇā vessā suddā, te tathāgata-p, pavedite dham-
 ma, vinaye agārasmā anagāriyam pabbajitvā*.

they abandon their former names and gotras [lineages], and are simply known as **‘Sakya-putta recluses’** [‘recluses who are sons of the Sakya’]¹²²—

Bhikshus, *when these 4 classes—*

the kshatriyas, the brahmins, the vaishyas, the shudras—

*having gone forth from the house for the homeless life in the Dharma-Vinaya proclaimed by the Tathagata,*¹²³

they abandon their former names and gotras, and are simply known as

*‘Sakya-putta recluses’ [‘recluses who are sons of the Sakya’]*¹²⁴—

this, bhikshus, is the 4th strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(5) Bhikshus, despite those streams that flow into the great ocean, and the showers that fall from the sky, there is manifest neither decrease nor fullness of the great ocean—

so, too, bhikshus, although many monks attain **the nirvana-element without residue**,¹²⁵ there is manifest neither decrease or fullness¹²⁶ of that nirvana-element is evident¹²⁷—

Bhikshus, *although many monks attain the nirvana-element without residue, neither the decrease nor the increase of that nirvana-element is evident—*

this, bhikshus, is the 5th strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.¹²⁸

(6) Bhikshus, just as the great ocean has only one taste, the taste of salt— so, too, bhikshus, this Dharma-Vinaya has only one taste, **the taste of freedom**.¹²⁹

Bhikshus, that *this Dharma-Vinaya has only one taste, the taste of freedom—*

this, bhikshus, is the 6th strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(7) Bhikshus, the great ocean has many treasures, diverse treasures.

In it there are these treasures, that is to say:

pearl, crystal, beryl, conch, quartz, coral, silver, gold, ruby, cat’s-eye¹³⁰—

so, too, bhikshus, **this Dharma-Vinaya** has many treasures, various treasures.

Here, there are these treasures, that is to say [the 37 limbs of awakening in 7 sets].¹³¹

1. the 4 focuses of mindfulness, *catu satipaṭṭhāna*
2. the 4 right strivings, *catu samma-p, padhāna*

¹²² *Jahanti purimāni nāma, gottāni samaṇā sakya, puttiyā tv-eva* [Be:Ka Se samaṇo sakya, puttiyo tv-eva] *saṅkham gacchanti*. On *sakya, putta*, see SD 45.18 (2.4.3).

¹²³ *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda cattāro’me vaṇṇā khattiyā brāhmaṇā vessā suddā, te tathāgata-p, pavedite dhamma, vinaye agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitvā*.

¹²⁴ Alluded to as “classlessness” at **Pabbajita Abhiṅha S** (A 10.48,2(1)), SD 48.9.

¹²⁵ “Nirvana-element without remains” (*anupādi, sesā nibbāna, dhātu*) refers to the nirvana of someone who has passed away: see SD 45.18 (2.5).

¹²⁶ The parable at §14 and this are combined in Miln 70; also Bhagavad-Gita 2.70.

¹²⁷ *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda bahū ce’pi bhikkhū anupādi, sesāya nibbāna, dhātuyā parinibbāyanti, na tena nibbāna, dhātuyā ūnattam vā pūrattam vā paññāyati*. On this parable, incl *anupādisesa nibbana, dhatu*, see SD 45.18 (2.5).

¹²⁸ On this parable and application, see SD 50.1 (1.1.4.2).

¹²⁹ *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda ayaṃ dhamma, vinayo eka, raso vimutti, raso*. See (2.6).

¹³⁰ On these 10 “treasures,” see SD 45.18 (2.7).

¹³¹ The foll are the famous “7 sets”: see SD 45.18 (2.8).

- | | |
|---|--------------------------------|
| 3. the 4 paths to spiritual success, | <i>catu iddhi,pādā</i> |
| 4. the 5 spiritual faculties, | <i>pañc'indriya</i> |
| 5. the 5 spiritual powers, | <i>pañca bala</i> |
| 6. the 7 awakening-factors, | <i>satta bojjaṅga</i> |
| 7. the noble eightfold path. ¹³² | <i>ariya aṭṭh'āṅgika magga</i> |

Bhikshus, *this Dharma-Vinaya has many treasures, various treasures.*

Here, there are these treasures, that is to say:

the 4 focuses of mindfulness, the 4 right strivings, the 4 paths to spiritual success, the 5 spiritual faculties, the 5 spiritual powers, the 7 awakening-factors, the noble eightfold path—

this, bhikshus, is the 7th strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(8) Bhikshus, the great ocean is **an abode of great beings**.¹³³

In it there are these beings, that is to say,

the timis, [208] the timingalas, the timitimingalas, asuras, nagas, gandharvas.

There are in this great ocean, beings a 100 yojanas long, 200 yojanas long, 300 yojanas long, 400 yojanas long, 500 yojanas long—

so, too, bhikshus, this Dharma-Vinaya is the dwelling of great beings.

Here, there are these beings, that is to say,

streamwinners and	those practising for the realization of the fruit of streamwinning,
once-returners and	those practising for the realization of the fruit of once-returning,
non-returners and	those practising for the fruit of non-returning,
arhats and	those practising for the fruit of arhathood.

Bhikshus, *this Dharma-Vinaya is the dwelling of gargantuan beings.*

Here, there are these beings, that is to say,

<i>streamwinners and</i>	<i>those practising for the realization of the fruit of streamwinning,</i>
<i>once-returners and</i>	<i>those practising for the realization of the fruit of once-returning,</i>
<i>non-returners and</i>	<i>those practising for the fruit of non-returning,</i>
<i>arhats and</i>	<i>those practising for the fruit of arhathood¹³⁴—</i>

this, bhikshus, is the 8th strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

9 These, bhikshus, are the 8 astounding and amazing qualities in this Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks take delight in it.

210617 210707 210927

¹³² *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda ayaṃ dhamma,vinayo bahu, ratano aneka, ratano, tatr'imāni ratanāni, seyyath'idam cattāro sati'paṭṭhānā cattāro samma-p, padhānā cattāro iddhi, pādā pañc'indriyāni pañca balāni satta bojjaṅga ariya aṭṭh'āṅgiko maggo.*

¹³³ Alluded to at Miln 2:250.

¹³⁴ See SD 45.18 (2.9).