

2c

Pātimokkha Ṭhapana Khandhaka

The Chapter on the Suspension of the Pātimokkha Recitation | Cv 9.1-2 (V 2:236,1-241,4)

Or, simply, **Pātimokkha Ṭhapana** the Suspension of the Pātimokkha

Or, **(Samudda) Uposatha Sutta 3** The 3rd (Ocean) Discourse on the Observance

Theme: The parable of the great ocean

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014, 2021

1 Sutta summary and significance

1.1 SUMMARY AND HIGHLIGHTS

1.1.1 Sutta highlights

1.1.1.1 The Pātimokkha Ṭhapana Khandhaka (Cv 9.1-2) recounts a key historical event in the history of the early sangha: the Buddha's suspension and termination of the recitation of the admonitory code (*ovāda pātimokkha*) to the sangha. The reason for this was the presence of a false monk in the otherwise "pure" assembly gathered for the Pātimokkha recitation by the Buddha himself.

The Sutta, or rather Khandhaka (Maha,vagga chapter), comprises 2 important sections:

- (1) the Buddha suspending the Pātimokkha recitation [1.1.1.1] and
- (2) the related Dharma instructions [1.1.1.2].

1.1.1.2 Like in the other "Pātimokkha suttas" [1.2], this Khandhaka contains the Buddha's teaching of the 8 qualities of the great ocean, which the asuras delight in, and the 8 qualities of the Dharma-Vinaya which true monastics delight in. The Khandhaka closes with an udana followed by Vinaya instructions on the suspension of Pātimokkha recital for disqualified monastics.

1.1.2 The Pātimokkha Ṭhapana Khandhaka (Cv 9.1-2) is a Vinaya account of the 2 sets of 8 parables of the great ocean. This account parallels A 8.20 and U 5.5, along with their closing udāna (Tha 477). The only difference is that the Khandhaka transposes the passage on the Pātimokkha to right at the end, with additional Vinaya details.

Of the 4 texts [1.2], **A 8.19** deals only with the Dharma-Vinaya, while the other 3 texts, all deal with the institutionalization of the Pātimokkha recital as a communal act (*saṅgha,kamma*). Of the Suttas, **U 5.5** is the longest (only slightly), that is, with its closing udana. **A 8.20** and **U 5.5** probably evolved separately based on A 8.19 or an older urtext, but the Vinaya version is clearly the youngest of them.

Only the Vinaya account explains the suspension of the Patimokkha recital for a disqualified monastic. Origin stories behind the Vinaya rules often tend to be late accounts, compiled after the Buddha's passing, when there was an urgent need to authenticate the monastic rules. Hence, of these 4 texts, the Vinaya version is probably the youngest. [1.2]

1.2 THE UPOSATHA SUTTAS

The teaching on the 8 wonderful qualities of the Dharma-Vinaya is given in at least 4 important texts, that is, these "Pātimokkha suttas" (they all contain a similar account of the suspension of the Pātimokkha recitation and the set of 8 parables of the great ocean, thus:

Pahārāda Sutta	A 8.19/4:197-204	SD 45.18
(Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta or (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta 1	A 8.20/4:204-208	SD 59.2a

(Udāna) Uposatha Sutta or (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta 2 U 5.5/53,6-56,31 SD 59.2b
Pātimokkha Ṭhapanā Khandhaka or (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta 3 Cv 9.1-2 (V 2:236-241) SD 59.2c

Of these 4 texts, only **the Pātimokkha Ṭhapanā Khandhaka**, the chapter on the suspension of the Pātimokkha recitation (Cv 9.1.2-4), is not a sutta; it is a Vinaya account with sutta materials.

2 The Uposatha for monastics and laity

2.1 OBSERVANCE DAYS FOR MONASTICS

The Pali term *uposatha*¹ was originally a holy day for non-Buddhists who gathered to listen to the wanderers teach.² For Buddhist monastics, it is the fortnightly Pātimokkha recital day, that is, the full-moon or 15th day of the fortnight, and the new-moon days or the 1st day, except for 6 times a year—2 for each of the 3 seasons of the Indian calendar.³

2.2 OBSERVANCE DAYS FOR THE LAITY

For lay practice, the uposatha comprises the weekly “precept days,” when the monastics assemble to administer the precepts—that is, the 8 precepts⁴ (*uposatha, sīla*)—and give teachings to those assembled. **The laity** traditionally congregates on the 8th day and 14th or 15th day of the fortnight and on special days (*pāṭihāriya, pakkha*)⁵ [1.2.2] for performing puja (personal or communal worship), keeping the 8 precepts, offerings of alms to the monastics, and doing meditation.⁶

— — —

Pātimokkha Ṭhapanā Khandhaka

The Chapter on the Suspension of the Pātimokkha Recitation

Cv 9.1-2 [given within parentheses below]

[Cv 9.1] THE REQUEST FOR PĀTIMOKKHA RECITATION (*pātimokkh’uddesa, yācana*)

[Cv 9.1.1] 1 ⁷At one time, the Blessed Lord Buddha was staying in Migāra’s mother’s mansion⁸ in the Eastern Park, outside Savatthi.

¹ Skt *upavasatha*; BHS *upoṣadha*, *poṣadha*, *poṣatha*; Amg *posaha*; Asokan *posatha*. CPD: ¹uposatha; DP: uposatha.

² On how these days were adopted by the early Buddhists, see SD 4.18 (1.2.3.2).

³ On the Indian calendar, see SD 1.1(1) n.

⁴ On the 8 precepts, see **(Tad-ah’) Uposatha S** (A 3.70,9-16), SD 4.18.

⁵ See SD 4.18 (1.2.2).

⁶ Further see **(Tad-ah’) Uposatha S** (A 3.70) + SD 4.18 (2).

⁷ The parables of the great ocean here recur, with only slight variations, in **Pahārāda S** (A 8.19/4:197-204), SD 45.18; **(Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha S 1** (A 8.20/4:204-208), SD 59.2a; **(Udāna) Uposatha S** (U 5.5/53-56), SD 59.2b. See SD 59.2a (1.2.2).

⁸ “The mansion of Migāra’s mother,” *migāra, mātu pasāde*. For details, see **Satta Jaṭila S** (S 3.11,1/3:11n), SD 14.11.

1.2 Now, at that time, on the day of **the observance** [*uposatha*],⁹ the Blessed One was sitting surrounded by a sangha of monks.

1.3 Then, as the night advanced,¹⁰ when the 1st watch passed,¹¹ the venerable Ānanda rose from his seat, arranged his upper robe over one shoulder, saluted the Blessed One, and said to him:

“Bhante, the night has far advanced. The 1st watch has passed; the sangha of monks has been sitting for a long time. Let the Blessed One recite **the Pātimokkha**¹² to the monks.”

1.4 When this was said, the Blessed One was silent.

THE BUDDHA’S SILENCE

2 As the night (further) advanced, when the middle watch¹³ passed, the venerable Ānanda rose from his seat **a 2nd time**, arranged his upper robe over one shoulder, saluted the Blessed One, and said to him:

“Bhante, the night has far advanced; the middle watch has passed; the sangha of monks has been sitting for a long time.

2.2 Bhante, let the Blessed One recite the Pātimokkha to the monks.”

A 2nd time the Blessed One was silent.

3 As the night (further) advanced, when the last watch passed,¹⁴ day was breaking,¹⁵ dawn’s joyful face beamed through the night, the venerable Ānanda rose from his seat **a 3rd time**, arranged his upper robe over one shoulder, saluted the Blessed One, and said to him:

“Bhante, the night has far advanced; the last watch has passed; dawn is breaking, her joyful face beaming.¹⁶ The sangha of monks has been sitting for a long time.

Bhante, let the Blessed One recite the Pātimokkha to the monks.”¹⁷

3.2 **“This congregation, Ānanda, is not entirely pure.”**¹⁸

⁹ The day of observance (*uposatha*) is the occasion for monastics to gather in conclave to listen to the recitation of the Pātimokkha (the monastic code of disciplinary rules). It occurs twice a lunar month on the days of the full moon and the new moon. See SD 49.11 (2.1); **Tad-ah’uposatha S** (A 3.70), SD 4.18; **Dhammika S** (A 4:254 f = Sn 400 f), SD 27.3(2.1). On the 8 kinds of uposatha: (**Tad-ah’**) **Uposatha S** (A 3.70,1-16), SD 4.18.

¹⁰ *Abhikkantāya rattiyā* refers to the ending (*khaya*) of the 1st watch, what little is left of it (*appāvasiṭṭha*, VA 971,30), ie, approaching or around 10 pm (KhpA 114,2; DA 1:227; MA 2:124,24 ad M 1:142,15); ending of the night as something beautiful (*sundara*), rejoicing in it (*abbhanumodana*), qu above invitation (AA 2:375,19-24, 3:353,4).

¹¹ *Nikkhanto paṭhamo yāmo*, ie just after 10 pm.

¹² This is the exhortatory observance (*ovāda,pātimokkha*) (UA 2:296,28-30, qu 298,27-32 = Dh 184, 183, 185) [SD 16.1(6)]; the other one, the mandated observance (*āṇā,patimokkha*) [§11]: D 14,3.28 (SD 49.8). On the 2 kinds of uposatha or code-recitation (*pātimokkh’uddesa*): VA 1:186,1, 187,8+19; Patmṭ Kkhv) 29,33; UA 298,4.

¹³ *Nikkhanto dutiyamo yāmo*, ie just after 2 am.

¹⁴ *Nikkhante pacchime yāme*, ie just after 6 am.

¹⁵ “Day was breaking” (*uddhaste aruṇe*). So Comy, glossing with *uggate aruṇa,sīse*, “dawn’s head growing”; vl *uddhate* with V 1:288, 2:236; U 27. See foll n.

¹⁶ *Abhikkantā bhante rattī nikkhanto pacchimo yāmo, uddhastam aruṇam nandi,mukhī rattī*. *Nandi,mukha*, lit “joy-faced” (cf Homer’s “rosy-fingered Dawn,” *Odyssey* 23.240): V 1:288,12, 2:236,17 (Comy), A 4:205,9 (AA 4:112,-12), U 27,6 (UA 186 f) (DP sv). Comy: “*Nandi,mukhī rattī*: at dawn the night appears like a face of delight; hence, it is called *nandi,mukhī rattī*” (*aruṇ’uṭṭhita,kale pīti,mukhā viya rattī khāyati; ten’āha nandi,mukhiyā rattiyā’ti*, VA 1287,-4 f); cf V:O 2:211 n2, 3:299 n1. Refs in Tib & Skt sources, see BHSD: (the time at the end of the night) just before the beating of the dawn drum (ie, substantially, dawn); sv *nandī-mukhā*, °*mukhī*. Curiously and ominously, Edgerton (BHSD) is annoyed by the Comy gloss!

¹⁷ Since dawn has broken, it is a new day, and the *uposatha* day is over. This is before the ruling that the observance should not be carried out on a non-observance day, except by a consensus (V 1:136,7 f). Hence, Ānanda invites the Buddha a 3rd time to recite the *ovāda,pātimokkha*. See SD 59.2a (2.1).

THE FALSE MONK EJECTED

4 Then, it occurred to the venerable Mahā Moggallāna:

“What person was the Blessed One referring to when he said:

‘*This congregation, Ānanda, is not entirely pure*’?”

4.2 Then, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna directed his mind on the whole sangha of monks, scanning their minds with his own mind.¹⁹

2 MAHĀ MOGGALLĀNA

[Cv 9.1.2] 4.3 The venerable Mahā Moggallāna then saw that person sitting in the midst of the sangha of monks:

one who is immoral, evil in nature, impure and suspicious in conduct, secretive in action, not a recluse but claiming to be one, not a celibate but claiming to be one, rotten to the core, wet with lust, a heap of filth.²⁰

4.4 Having seen that person, [²¹] [237] he went up to that person, and said to him:

“Get up, avuso. The Blessed One has seen you. There is no communion for you with the monks!”²² When this was said, that person remained silent.²³

4.5 A second time, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna said to that person:

“Get up, avuso. The Blessed One has seen you. You cannot live in communion with the monks!” When this was said, **a second time** that person remained silent.

4.6 A third time the venerable Mahā Moggallāna said to that person:

“Get up, friend. The Blessed One has seen you. You cannot live in communion with the monks.” When this was said, **a third time** that person remained silent.

5 Then, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna grabbed that person by the arm, cast him out through the outer gatehouse, and bolted the door.²⁴

5.2 Then, he returned to the Blessed One and said to him:

“I have cast out that person, bhante. The congregation is pure. Let the Blessed One recite the Pātimokkha to the monks.”

5.3 “It’s amazing, Moggallāna! It’s unbelievable, Moggallāna! How that hollow man²⁵ waited²⁶ until he was grabbed by the arm!”

¹⁸ Ie, there is some monk present who has not confessed an offence which he has committed. Why does the Buddha remain silent for so long? See (**Aṭṭhaka**) **Uposatha S** (A 8.20,3) n ad loc (SD 59.2a).

¹⁹ *Atha kho āyasmā mahā moggallāno sabbavantam bhikkhu, saṅgham cetasā ceto parica manasākāsi*. On Moggallāna as the foremost of monks with psychic powers (*ddhimantānam*): A 1.190/1:23,19. On how he cultivated these powers: (**Pāsāda, kampana**) **Moggallāna S** (S 51.14,10), SD 27.8.

²⁰ This is stock: see eg **Āsaṃsa Bhikkhu S** (A 3.13,6.2), SD 51.18. On the false monk, see SD 59.2a (2.2).

²¹ Both A 8.20,4.4 (SD 59.2a) + U 5.5,4.4 (SD 59.2b) he adds *uṭṭhāy’āsanā*, “rose from his seat.”

²² *Uṭṭhehi āvuso, diṭṭho’si bhagavatā. N’atthi te bhikkhūhi saddhim saṃvāso’ti*. “Communion” (*saṃvāsa*, “living with,” fellowship, association) def at V 4:315; “to be in communion” (*saṃvāsati*): V 4:138, 214; when “communing with someone” is an offence: Pāc 69 (V 4:137,17-20).

²³ We are not told why he is silent: he may be *psychologically defensive* [SD 7.9], such as being in denial that he has committed any offence [SD 7.9 (3.7)]. If he is silent, actually thinking that he is innocent, it may be an *unconscious defence mechanism*; if he knows he is guilty, and remains silent, he must then be lying.

²⁴ *Sūci, ghaṭikam datvā*, lit “fastened the bolt,” ie, bolted the door. This event is qu at SnA 312,1-4.

[6]²⁷The 8 wonderful qualities of the great ocean (*mahā,samudde aṭṭhe acchariyā*)

[Cv 9.1.3] Then, the Blessed One addressed the monks:

7 “There are, bhikshus, these 8²⁸ strange and wonderful things about **the great ocean**, seeing which, the asuras delight in it.

What are the eight?²⁹

(1) The great ocean,³⁰ bhikshus, **slopes gradually**, slides gradually, inclines gradually, not abruptly³¹ like a precipice.³²

Bhikshus, that the great ocean slopes gradually, slides gradually, inclines gradually, not abruptly like a precipice—

this, bhikshus, is the 1st strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(2) Furthermore, bhikshus, the great ocean is by nature **stable**: it does not overflow its margins.³³ Bhikshus, that *the great ocean is by nature stable: it does not overflow its margins—*

this, bhikshus, is the 2nd strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(3) Furthermore, bhikshus, the great ocean **does not associate with the dead**, a carcass.³⁴ Whatever that is dead, a carcass, the great ocean quickly carries it to shore, washes it onto dry land.³⁵

Bhikshus, that the great ocean does not associate with the dead, a carcass:

whatever that is dead, a carcass, the great ocean quickly carry it to shore, wash it onto dry land—

²⁵ *Mogha, purisa*, lit “empty person.” Usu tr as “misguided one.” However, while *mogha* evokes more deeply a spiritual lack, “misguided” connotes more of psychosocial errancy. I’m influenced by T S Eliot’s “Hollow Men” (1925) (where “empty men” is also mentioned) which fully brings out the meaning here but lacks emotional connection for those unfamiliar with the poem: <http://allpoetry.com/The-Hollow-Men>. On *mogha, purisa* as a syn of *asappurisa*, see **Sappurisa S** (M 113) @ SD 23.7 (3.2).

²⁶ All MSS *āgamessati*, fut form of *āgameti* (to wait, stay; CPD sv).

²⁷ Both A 8.20,4.4 (SD 59.2a) + U 5.5,4.4 (SD 59.2b) here [§6] state that the Buddha pronounces that thenceforth the monks should themselves recite the Pātimokkha. In this Vinaya account of the origin story for this decision, it is given at the end of the chapter, as its climax [§5]. The sutta numbering follows those of A 8.20 + U 5.5 for easy comparison.

²⁸ Comy says that the Buddha could have also given, say, 16, 31, 64 or 1000 qualities, if he wishes (AA 4:111). However, 8 qualities suffice (in A 8.19) in response to Pahārāda’s own number, which would also inspire him in the Dharma. (SD 45.18)

²⁹ In **Pahārāda S** (A 8.19/4:197-204), SD 45.18, it is the asura chief, Pahārāda, who gives these parables.

³⁰ On the ancient Indian view of the physical world, see (2.1.2).

³¹ “Not abruptly,” *na āyataka* (adv; a tricky word), “suddenly, all of a sudden, abruptly” (CPD); from *āyataka* (adj), “long, prolonged, long-drawn (of a tone). Perhaps suggests going some distance and then suddenly, dropping off sharply, like a cliff; but note the Pali *na*, “not.”

³² *Mahā,samuddo bhante anupubba,ninno anupubba,poṇo anupubba,pabbhāro na āyataken’eva papāto*. On the great ocean’s gradual deepening, see Intro (2.1.2).

³³ *Puna ca’paraṃ bhante mahā,samuddo ṭhita,dhammo velaraṃ nātivattati*, Comy: It does not overflow its margin when ebbing and flowing (VA 1287).

³⁴ *Puna ca’paraṃ bhante mahā,samuddo na matena kuṇapena saṃvasati* [Se *saṃvattati*].

³⁵ *Yaṃ hoti mahā,samudde mataraṃ kuṇaparaṃ, taraṃ khippam eva tīraṃ vāheti thalaraṃ ussāreti*. Cf *Miln* 187, 250.

this, bhikshus, is the 3rd strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(4) Furthermore, bhikshus, whatever **great rivers** there are, that is to say, the Ganges, the Yamuna, the Aciravati, the Sarabhu, the Mahi,³⁶ upon reaching the great ocean, lose their former names and gotras [origins], come to be known simply as the great ocean.³⁷

Bhikshus, that *whatever great rivers there are, that is to say, the Ganges, the Yamuna, the Aciravati, the Sarabhu, the Mahi, upon reaching the great ocean, losing their former names and gotras [origins], come to be known simply as the great ocean—*

this, too, bhikshus, is **[238]** the 4th strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(5) Furthermore, bhikshus, despite those streams in the world that flow into the great ocean, and the showers that fall from the sky, there is manifest **neither decrease nor fullness** of the great ocean.³⁸

Bhikshus, that *despite those streams in the world that flow into the great ocean, and the showers that fall from the sky, there is neither manifest decrease nor fullness of the great ocean—*

this, bhikshus, is the 5th strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(6) Furthermore, bhikshus, the great ocean has **only one taste**, the taste of salt.³⁹ Bhikshus, that *the great ocean has only one taste, the taste of salt—* this, bhikshus, is the 6th strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(7) Furthermore, bhikshus, the great ocean has **many treasures** [jewels], diverse treasures.⁴⁰ In it there are these treasures, that is to say: pearl,⁴¹ crystal,⁴² beryl,⁴³ conch,⁴⁴ quartz,⁴⁵ coral,⁴⁶ silver, gold, ruby, cat's-eye.⁴⁷

³⁶ *Puna ca'param bhante yā kāci mahā, nadiyo, seyyath'idaṃ gaṅgā yamunā aciravatī sarabhū mahī*. This list of India's 5 great rivers is stock: **Sambhejja Udaka S** (S 13.3/2:135), **Pācīna, ninna Ss 1-6** (S 45.91-96/5:38 f; each river forms its own sutta; the 6th has all 5); **Satta Suriya S** (A 7.62/4:101), SD 47.6; (**Dasaka**) **Appamāda S** (A 10.15/5:22), SD 42.23; Miln 70, 87, 380. See SD 45.18 (2.4.2).

³⁷ *Tā mahā, samuddaṃ patvā [Be:Ka pattā] jahanti purimāni nāma, gottāni mahā, samuddo tv-eva saṅkhaṃ gacchanti*.

³⁸ *Puna ca'param bhante yā ca [Be:Ka Ee Se yā kāci] loke savantiyo mahā, samuddaṃ appenti, yā ca anta, likkhā dhārā papatanti, na tena mahā, samuddassa ūnattaṃ vā pūrattaṃ vā paññāyati*.

³⁹ *Puna ca'param bhante mahā, samuddo eka, raso loṇa, raso*.

⁴⁰ *Puna ca'param bhante mahāsamuddo bahu, ratano [Be:Ka pahūta, ratano] aneka, ratano*.

⁴¹ "Pearl" (*mutta*), Comy: "Small, large, round, long etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

⁴² "Crystal" (*maṇi*), or "gem," Comy: "Red, cloud-grey, etc." (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

⁴³ "Beryl" (*veḷuriya*), Comy: "The colour of bamboo, of acacia flower, etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305). See Miln:H 1:177.

⁴⁴ "Conch" (*saṅkha*), Comy: "The rightwise spiralled shell, the copper coloured, the hollow, the trumpet shell, etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

⁴⁵ "Quartz" (*silā*), Comy: "Coloured white or black or like a kidney-bean" (A 4:111; UA 2:305).

Bhikshus, that *the great ocean has many treasures, diverse treasures.*

In it there are these treasures, that is to say:

pearl, crystal, beryl, conch, quartz, coral, silver, gold, ruby, cat's-eye—
this, bhikshus, is the 7th strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean,
seeing which, the asuras delight in the great ocean.

(8) Furthermore, bhikshus, the great ocean is **an abode of great [gargantuan] beings.**⁴⁸ [207]
In it there are these beings, that is to say,

the timis,⁴⁹ the timin,galas, the timi,timingalas, asuras,⁵⁰ nagas,⁵¹ gandharvas.⁵²

There are in this great ocean, beings⁵³ with bodies a 100 yojanas⁵⁴ long,⁵⁵ with bodies 200 yojanas long, with bodies 300 yojanas long, with bodies 400 yojanas long, with bodies 500 yojanas long.⁵⁶

Bhikshus, that *the great ocean is an abode of gargantuan beings. In it there are these beings, that is to say, the timis, the timin,galas, the timi,timingalas, asuras, nagas, gandharvas.*

There are in this great ocean, beings with bodies a 100 yojanas long, with bodies 200 yojanas long, with bodies 300 yojanas long, with bodies 400 yojanas long, with bodies 500 yojanas long—
this, bhikshus, is the 8th strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean,
seeing which the asuras delight in the great ocean.

7.2 These, bhikshus, are the 8 strange and wonderful things about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight in the great ocean.

The 8 wonderful qualities of the Dharma-Vinaya

8 [Cv 9.1.3] So, too, bhikshus, there are these 8 astounding and amazing qualities in this Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which, **the monks take delight in it.**

⁴⁶ "Coral" (*pavāḷa*), Comy: "Small, large, pink [pale red], deep red etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

⁴⁷ *Tatr'imāni ratanāni, seyyath'idam, muttā maṇi veḷuriyo saṅkho silā pavāḷam rajatam jāta,rūpaṃ lohitaḥ ma-sāra,gallam.* Comy of "cat's-eye" (*masāra,galla*): "A speckled gem (*kabara,maṇi*), variegated crystal (*citta,phalikaṃ*)" (AA 4:111; UA 3:205).

⁴⁸ *Puna caparam bhante mahāsamuddo mahatam bhūtānam āvāso.*

⁴⁹ Comy: The *timi, timiṅgala* and *timi,timiṅgala* are 3 kinds of fishes or marine creatures. The *timiṅgala* is said to be able to swallow (*gilana*) the *timi*, and the *timi,timiṅgala* is capable of swallowing the both of them. (UA 2:303). Comy to Sutasoma J (J 537) says all 3 feed on "rock seaweeds" or kelp (?) (*pāsāṇa,sevāla*) (J 5:462). SA 2:88 mentions 7 monsters or leviathans, one of which is the whale (*ānanda*). Cf also Miln 85.

⁵⁰ On *asuras*, see **Isayo Samuddaka S** (S 11.10) + SD 39.2 (1.1) & SD 29.6a (4.1.3).

⁵¹ Some *nagas* (*nāga*) dwell on the crests of waves, while others have their own divine mansion (*vimāna*) (AA 4:111; UA 2:303). In Indian mythology, nagas are associated with the submarine (oceans) and subterranean (rivers). The latter is one of the 7 kinds of nagas at SA 3:350. See T W Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, London & NY, 1903:223; J P Vogel, *Indian Serpent-lore*, London, 1926:32.

⁵² *Tatr'ime bhūtā, timi timiṅgalo timira,piṅgalo* [Ce *timi,timiṅgalā timira,piṅgalā*; Ee Se *timi,timiṅgalā timira,miṅgalā*] *asurā nāgā gandhabbā.* On *gandharvas* (*gandhabba*), see **Gandhabba S** (S 31.1), SD 86.5.

⁵³ "Beings" (*atta,bhāva*), alt tr "creatures." Lit, "self-state, selfhood" and usu means "bodily form, existence as an individual." Here prob used non-technically to mean some uncertain life-forms, perhaps leviathans.

⁵⁴ Yojana, sometimes tr as "league," the yoke of an Indian plough (J 6:38, 42). As distance, *yojana* ("league" or "yojana") is as far as a yoke of oxen can go in a day, ie, about 11.25 km or 7 mi (DhA 1:108, 2:13). See also V:H 2:90 n8.

⁵⁵ Quoted in DhsA 299.

⁵⁶ *Santi mahā,samudde yojana,satikā'pi atta,bhāvā, dvi,yojana,satikā'pi atta'bhāvā, ti,yojana,satikā'pi atta,bhāvā, catu,yojana,satikā'pi atta,bhāvā, pañca,yojana,satikā'pi atta,bhāvā.*

What are the eight?

(1) Even so, bhikshus, just as *the great ocean slopes gradually, slides gradually, inclines gradually, not abruptly like a precipice—* so, too, in this Dharma-Vinaya, **penetration into final knowledge** occurs by gradual training, not abruptly.⁵⁷

Bhikshus, that *in this Dharma-Vinaya, penetration into final knowledge occurs by gradual training, not abruptly—* this, bhikshus, is the 1st strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(2) Bhikshus, just as, the great ocean is by nature **stable**: it does not overflow its margins;⁵⁸ so, too, bhikshus, in this Dharma-Vinaya, there are training-rules prescribed by me for my disciples, which they would not transgress even for life's sake.

Bhikshus, that, in this Dharma-Vinaya, *training-rules prescribed [239] by me for my disciples, which they would not transgress even for life's sake—* this, bhikshus, is the 2nd strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(3) Bhikshus, just as the great ocean does not associate with the dead, a carcass: whatever that is dead, a carcass, the great ocean **quickly carries it to shore**, washes it onto dry land⁵⁹— so, too, bhikshus, **the sangha does not associate with a person who is immoral**, of bad character, of impure and suspicious conduct, secretive in deeds, not a recluse but pretending to be one, incelibate but pretending to be celibate,⁶⁰ rotten to the core, lustful and filthy by nature⁶¹— the sangha communes⁶² not with such a one, but having quickly assembled, it expels him.⁶³ Even though he sits in the midst of the sangha, yet he is far away from the sangha, and the sangha is far away from him.⁶⁴

Bhikshus, *that the sangha does not associate with a person who is immoral, of bad character, of impure and suspicious conduct, secretive in deeds, not a recluse but pretending to be one, incelibate but pretending to be celibate, rotten to the core, lustful and filthy by nature— the sangha communes not with such a one, but having quickly assembled, it expels him. Even though he sits in the midst of the sangha, yet he is far away from the sangha, and the sangha is far away from him—*

⁵⁷ On the gradual training, see (**Aṭṭhaka**) **Uposatha S** (A 8.20,8(1) n), SD 59.2a.

⁵⁸ *Puna ca'param bhante mahā,samuddo ṭhita,dhammo velam nātivattati*, Comy: It does not overflow its margin when ebbing and flowing (VA 1287).

⁵⁹ See (2.3).

⁶⁰ Or, "Not living the holy life (*brahma,cariya*), but pretending to do so."

⁶¹ *Evam evam kho pahārāda yo so puggalo dussīlo pāpa,dhammo asuci,saṅka-s,sara,samācāro paṭicchanna,kam-manto assamaṇo samaṇa,paṭiñño abrahmacārī brahmacārī,paṭiñño anto,pūti avassuto kasambu,jāto*. §13.2 up to here recurs in **Aggi-k,khandhūpama S** (A 7.68/4:134), SD 89.12. See (2.3.4.1).

⁶² "Communes" (v) or "to be in communion" (*saṃvasati*): see (2.3.5).

⁶³ *Na tena saṅgho saṃvasati, khippam eva nam sannipatitvā ukkhipati*. The vb **ukkkhipati** can also mean "to suspend" (V 2:61, 4:309; Pug 33).

⁶⁴ *Kiñcāpi so hoti majjhe bhikkhu,saṅghassa sannisinno, atha kho so ārakā'va saṅghamhā saṅgho ca tena*. Cf **Saṅghāṭi,kannā S** (It 92,2/91), SD 24.10a: see (2.3.4.2).

this, bhikshus, is the 3rd strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(4) Even so, bhikshus, just as whatever great rivers there are, that is to say, the Ganges, the Yamuna, the Aciravati, the Sarabhu and the Mahi,⁶⁵ upon reaching the great ocean, losing their former names and gotra [origins], come to be known simply as the great ocean—
so, too, bhikshus, when **these 4 classes**⁶⁶—
the kshatriyas, the brahmins, the vaishyas, the shudras—
having gone forth from the house for the homeless life in the Dharma-Vinaya proclaimed by the Tathagata,⁶⁷
they abandon their former names and gotras [lineages], and are simply known as
‘Sakya-putta recluses’ [‘recluses who are sons of the Sakya’]⁶⁸—

Bhikshus, *when these 4 classes*—
the kshatriyas, the brahmins, the vaishyas, the shudras—
*having gone forth from the house for the homeless life in the Dharma-Vinaya proclaimed by the Tathagata,*⁶⁹
they abandon their former names and gotras, and are simply known as
‘Sakya-putta recluses’ [‘recluses who are sons of the Sakya’]⁷⁰—
this, bhikshus, is the 4th strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(5) Bhikshus, despite those streams that flow into the great ocean, and the showers that fall from the sky, there is manifest neither decrease nor fullness of the great ocean—
so, too, bhikshus, although many monks attain **the nirvana-element without residue**,⁷¹ there is manifest neither decrease or fullness⁷² of that nirvana-element is evident⁷³—

Bhikshus, *although many monks attain the nirvana-element without residue, neither the decrease nor the increase of that nirvana-element is evident*—
this, bhikshus, is the 5th strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.⁷⁴

⁶⁵ This parable and the foll [§15] are combined in Miln 70,

⁶⁶ On the 4 classes (*vaṇṇa*), see (2.4.2.4).

⁶⁷ *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda cattāro’me vaṇṇā khattiyā brāhmaṇā vessā suddā, te tathāgata-p,pavedite dhamma,vinaye agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitvā.*

⁶⁸ *Jahanti purimāni nāma,gottāni samaṇā sakya,puttiyā tv-eva* [Be:Ka Se samaṇo sakya,puttiyo tv-eva] *saṅkhaṃ gacchanti.* On *sakya,putta*, see (2.4.3).

⁶⁹ *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda cattāro’me vaṇṇā khattiyā brāhmaṇā vessā suddā, te tathāgata-p,pavedite dhamma,vinaye agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitvā.*

⁷⁰ Alluded to as “classlessness” at **Pabbajita Abhiṇha S** (A 10.48,2(1)), SD 48.9.

⁷¹ “Nirvana-element without remains” (*anupādi,sesā nibbāna,dhātu*) refers to the nirvana of someone who has passed away: see (2.5).

⁷² The parable at §14 and this are combined in Miln 70; also Bhagavad-Gita 2.70.

⁷³ *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda bahū ce’pi bhikkhū anupādi,sesāya nibbāna,dhātuyā parinibbāyanti, na tena nibbāna,dhātuyā ūnattaṃ vā pūrattaṃ vā paññāyati.* See Intro (2.5).

⁷⁴ On this parable and application, see SD 50.1 (1.1.4.2).

(6) Bhikshus, just as the great ocean has only one taste, the taste of salt—
so, too, bhikshus, this Dharma-Vinaya has only one taste, **the taste of freedom**.⁷⁵

Bhikshus, that *this Dharma-Vinaya has only one taste, the taste of freedom—*
this, bhikshus, is the 6th strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya,
seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(7) Bhikshus, the great ocean has many treasures, diverse treasures.
In it there are these treasures, that is to say:

pearl, crystal, beryl, conch, quartz, coral, silver, gold, ruby, cat's-eye⁷⁶—

so, too, [240] bhikshus, **this Dharma-Vinaya** has many treasures, various treasures.

Here, there are these treasures, that is to say [the 37 limbs of awakening in 7 sets]:⁷⁷

- | | |
|--|--------------------------------|
| 1. the 4 focuses of mindfulness, | <i>catu satipaṭṭhāna</i> |
| 2. the 4 right strivings, | <i>catu samma-p, padhāna</i> |
| 3. the 4 paths to spiritual success, | <i>catu iddhi, pādā</i> |
| 4. the 5 spiritual faculties, | <i>pañc'indriya</i> |
| 5. the 5 spiritual powers, | <i>pañca bala</i> |
| 6. the 7 awakening-factors, | <i>satta bojjaṅga</i> |
| 7. the noble eightfold path. ⁷⁸ | <i>ariya aṭṭh'aṅgika magga</i> |

Bhikshus, *this Dharma-Vinaya has many treasures, various treasures.*

Here, there are these treasures, that is to say:

*the 4 focuses of mindfulness, the 4 right strivings, the 4 paths to spiritual success, the 5 spiritual
faculties, the 5 spiritual powers, the 7 awakening-factors, the noble eightfold path—*

this, bhikshus, is the 7th strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya,
seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

(8) Bhikshus, the great ocean is **an abode of great beings**.⁷⁹

In it these are these beings, that is to say,

the timis, the timingalas, the timitimingalas, asuras, nagas, gandharvas.

There are in this great ocean, beings a 100 yojanas long, 200 yojanas long, 300 yojanas long, 400
yojanas long, 500 yojanas long—

so, too, bhikshus, this Dharma-Vinaya is the dwelling of great beings.

Here, there are these beings, that is to say,

streamwinners and	those practising for the realization of the fruit of streamwinning,
once-returners and	those practising for the realization of the fruit of once-returning,
non-returners and	those practising for the fruit of non-returning,
arhats and	those practising for the fruit of arhathood.

Bhikshus, *this Dharma-Vinaya is the dwelling of gargantuan beings.*

Here, there are these beings, that is to say,

⁷⁵ *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda ayaṃ dhamma, vinayo eka, raso vimutti, raso.* See (2.6).

⁷⁶ On these 10 “treasures,” see SD 45.18 (2.7).

⁷⁷ The foll are the famous “7 sets”: SD 45.18 (2.8).

⁷⁸ *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda ayaṃ dhamma, vinayo bahu, ratano aneka, ratano, tatr'imāni ratanāni, seyyath'idam
cattāro sati'paṭṭhānā cattāro samma-p, padhānā cattāro iddhi, pādā pañc'indriyāni pañca balāni satta bojjaṅgā
ariyo aṭṭh'aṅgiko maggo.*

⁷⁹ Alluded to at Miln 2:250.

*streamwinners and those practising for the realization of the fruit of streamwinning,
once-returners and those practising for the realization of the fruit of once-returning,
non-returners and those practising for the fruit of non-returning,
arhats and those practising for the fruit of arhathood⁸⁰—*

this, bhikshus, is the 8th strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya,
seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

9 These, bhikshus, are the 8 astounding and amazing qualities in this Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks take delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

The Buddha's udana

10 Then, the Blessed One, understanding this significance of this matter, at that very moment, uttered this udana:⁸¹

<p>11 <i>Suchannam ativassati⁸² vivaṭaṃ nātivassati tasmā channaṃ vivaretha⁸³ evaṃ taṃ⁸⁴ nātivassatīti.⁸⁵</i></p>	<p>It rains hard upon the well covered, it rains not hard on the opened. Therefore, let one open the covered— It will then not rain hard on it.</p>
---	---

[Cv 9.2] THE SUSPENSION OF PĀTIMOKKHA RECITATION (*pātimokkha ṭṭhapanā*)

12 Then, the Blessed One addressed the monks:

“Now, bhikshus, from today onward, I will no longer conduct the observance and recite **the Pātimokkha**.⁸⁶ You yourselves should conduct the observance and recite the Pātimokkha.

12.2 It is impossible and inconceivable that the Tathagata could conduct the observance and recite the Pātimokkha in an impure congregation.

12.3 Nor, bhikshus, should the Pātimokkha be heard by one who had an offence.⁸⁷ Whoever such should hear it, there is an offence of **wrong-doing** (*dukkata*).

12.4 I allow you, bhikshus, to suspend the Pātimokkha for him who, having an offence, hears the Pātimokkha.⁸⁸

12.5 And this, bhikshus, is how it should be suspended: On an observance day, whether it be the 14th or the 15th when the person is present, **[241]** this should be pronounced in the midst of the sangha:

⁸⁰ See SD 45.18 (2.9).

⁸¹ *Atha kho bhagavā etam atthaṃ viditvā tāyaṃ velāyaṃ imaṃ udānaṃ udānesi*. This verse, not found in **(Aṭṭha-ka) Uposatha S** (A 8.20), SD 59.21, recurs in Tha 447, Pk 25, 202, Nett 153. For a discussion, see Tha:N 196 n447. For nn, see **U 5.5,10*** (SD 59.2b).

⁸² *Ativassati* (wr *ativivassati*). See **(Samudda) Uposatha S** (U 5.5,10*) n, SD 59.2b.

⁸³ It's clear from the context and Comy that it is 3rd person sg: **U 5.5,10*** n (SD 59.2b).

⁸⁴ Foll Comy, **taṃ** denotes the person who has committed the offence.

⁸⁵ If the arhat is meant in line d, then we need to tr it as “It will then not rain on it,” for the right idiom, since “rain” refers to defilements (craving, conceit, views, etc).

⁸⁶ This is the exhortatory observance (*ovāda, pātimokkha*); the foll is the mandatory observance (*āṇā, pātimokkha*) [§1.3 n].

⁸⁷ See Mv 2.27.1.

⁸⁸ *Anujānāmi bhikkhave yo sāpattiko pātimokkhaṃ suṇāti tassa pātimokkhaṃ ṭṭhpetuṃ*. Cv 1.5.1 says that a monk who has been formally censured (*tajjaniya.kamma, katena*) is not allowed to suspend (*ṭṭhpeti*) the Pātimokkha recitation for a regular (*pakat'atta*) monk (V 2:5,12).

‘Bhante,⁸⁹ may the sangha hear me! This individual named so-and-so has an offence. I suspend the Pātimokkha on his account, not be recited in his presence. The Pātimokkha has been suspended. The Pātimokkha should not be recited in his presence. The Pātimokkha has been suspended.’”⁹⁰

210630 210708 210926

⁸⁹ Plural.

⁹⁰ *Suṇātu me bhante saṅgho. Itthannāmo puggalo sâpattiko tassa pātimokkham ṭhapemi. Tasmim sammukhī, bhūte na pātimokkham uddisitabban’ti. Ṭhapitam hoti pātimokkhan’ti.* This is the text of the formal act (*kamma, vācā*).