

17

Kummôpama Sutta

The Discourse on the Parable of the Tortoise | S 35.240 [Ee S 35.199]

Theme: The benefit of restraining the senses

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2006

1 Tortoise or turtle?

1.1 SCIENTIFIC BACKGROUND

The Kummôpama Sutta uses the phrase *kummo kacchapo*, “turtle-tortoise,” which is almost a tautology. The Pali texts use *kumma* and *kacchapa* indiscriminately for both turtle and tortoise.

There are today 26 species of non-marine turtles and tortoises in India. Depending on the variety of English used, “turtle” may be terrestrial or marine (especially in US and Australian English); as such, the term “marine turtle” is used to refer to the marine variety. British English normally refers to the fresh or brackish water variety of these amphibians as terrapins, the land variety as tortoises, and the sea variety; as terrapins.

However, there are exceptions, such as the Fly River Turtle (also called the Pig Nosed Turtle, *Carettochelys insculpta*) found in Australia and New Guinea. The Americans strictly use “terrapin” for the diamondback terrapin (the *Malaclemys terrapin*, which inhabits brackish water).

The word *terrapin* is derived from the Algonquian word for this animal. The term **chelonian** is popular among scientists, veterinarians, and conservationists, working with these animals to refer to any member of the order Testudines.

1.2 TEXTUAL EXPLANATIONS

1.2.1 The suttas

In the **Kumma Sutta** (S 17.3), *kumma* refers to a lacustrine variety, that is, a “tortoise.”¹ In the **Chiggala Sutta 1** (S 56.47)² and the **Chiggala Sutta 2** (S 56.48),³ it clearly refers to the marine variety, that is, a “turtle.” Here, in the **Kummôpama Sutta** (S 35.240), although both words are used together (*kumma kacchapa*), it clearly refers a land tortoise (since a jackal is mentioned).

1.2.2 The Commentaries

The Commentaries confirm the interchangeability between *kumma* and *kacchapa*, thus:

SA 2:206 ad S 2:227 *mahā,kumma,kulan ti mahantaṃ aṭṭhi,kacchapa,kulaṃ*
 (“*mahā,kumma,kula* means ‘the great family of the bony turtle’”);
 SA 3:92 ad S 4:177 *kummô ti aṭṭhi,kummo, kacchapô ti tass’eva vevacanaṃ*
 (“*kumma* means the bony turtle; *kacchapa* is its synonym”).⁴

Here, *aṭṭhi,kacchapa* clearly denotes a tortoise with a hard shell or carapace. Turtles tend to have softer shells. However, as shown above, we also have *aṭṭhi,kumma*, “hard-shelled turtle.”

¹ S 17.3/2:227. Apparently here the tortoise is hunted (and harpooned) for its meat: the Indians have various recipes for tortoise meat.

² S 56.47/5:455 f.

³ S 56.48/5:456 f.

⁴ See S:B 810 n317.

Buddhaghosa is evidently aware of the natural cycle of sea-turtles (*kacchapa*) that lay their eggs on land.⁵ The word *kacchapa* is also interesting in that its Sanskrit cognate is *kaśyapa*, a personal family name that is spelled *Kassapa* in Pali.⁶

2 Chelonian similes

2.1 The short and simple Kummôpama Sutta aptly compares the practice of sense-restraint to the tortoise's withdrawing itself into its shell at the first sign of danger. The Sutta's parable pairs the tortoise with **the jackal** (*sigāla* or *siṅgāla*), which, observes the Commentary, dislikes wandering in the open, and would lie comfortably in the charnel ground after consuming corpse flesh there (SA 3:71).

2.2 There are at least 4 chelonian similes in the Saṃyutta:

Vammika Sutta	M 23,44	the 5 aggregates are like the limbs and head of a tortoise.
Kumma Sutta	S 17.3	the harpooned tortoise/turtle is symbolic of a heedless person.
Kummôpama Sutta	S 35.240	the turtle with limbs withdrawn is symbolic of sense-restraint.
Chiggala Sutta 1	S 56.47	the blind turtle and the yoke: rarity for a hell-being to be reborn as a human being.
Chiggala Sutta 2	S 56.48	the blind turtle and the yoke: rarity of birth as a human being.

2.3 While the Kummôpama Sutta uses the tortoise to symbolize all the 6 senses—presumably, its “5 limbs” (4 legs and a head) as *the 5 physical senses*, and the shell as *the mind*—**the Cha,pāṇā Sutta** (S 35.-247) represents each of the 6 sense-faculties with a different animal.⁷

3 Māra the evil one

3.1 PSYCHOLOGICAL DEVICE

Mythologically, the Kummôpama Sutta gives important instructions on how to overcome or prevent Māra the bad one from taking over our mind [§7]. The Buddhist texts present Māra in two broad ways.

In the early Suttas, Māra is often employed as a *psychological* device to explain the unwholesome, where, for example, the 5 aggregates are personified as Māra.⁸ Māra is also depicted as a *mythical* being who secretly shadows the Buddha and tries to distract him (or other meditating renunciants) at every opportunity.⁹

⁵ *Kacchapā...mahā.samuddato nikkhamitvā, samudda,tīre vālik'antare aṇḍaṃ ṭhapetvā...mahā,samuddam eva oṭaranti*, “the turtles, having emerged from the great ocean, lay their eggs buried in the sand of the beach, and then return into the great ocean” (SA 2:30).

⁶ For other refs, see CPD & DP: *kacchapa-*, & DP: *kumma*; see also PED, svv.

⁷ The eye = a snake; the ear = a crocodile; the nose = a bird; the tongue = a dog; the body = a jackal; and the mind = a monkey (S 35.2475+7/4:199 f) & SD 19.15 (2).

⁸ Eg S 3:74, 195, 198, 4:85, 91, 189, 202.

⁹ On Māra as a mythical figure, see SD 52.1 (9.1; 16).

3.2 THE 5 KINDS OF MĀRA

3.2.1 The Commentaries mention a total of **5 kinds of Māra** (*pañca,māra*), namely,

(1) the defilements as Māra,	<i>kilesa,māra</i>
(2) the aggregates as Māra,	<i>khandha,māra</i>
(3) the karma-formations as Māra,	<i>abhisañkhāra,māra</i>
(4) the deity Māra and	<i>deva,putta Māra</i>
(5) death as Māra.	<i>maccu,māra</i>

(Vism 211; ThaA 2:16, 46; VAṬ:Se 1/481; DAaṬ:Be 1:22, 17:6)¹⁰

Of the 5 Māras, the first 3 and the 5th are clearly psychological metaphors, even archetypes.¹¹ The 5th Māra (death) can also be taken as a poetical imagery of a painful or fearful death, being abandoned by our body and sense-faculties, and being propelled onwards by the force of our karma (another form of Māra).¹² The last, Death as Māra, is often mentioned alone in the Suttas.¹³

3.2.2 The Kummôpama Sutta graphically presents the 5 aggregates as Māra [§7], mainly to stress the urgency of the need for sense-restraint as the basis for mental development. It is interesting to see here that Māra (or the devil) is not outside of ourselves, but is really an integral part of our mind and body, that is, the 5 aggregates. Indeed, it is ignorance of the impermanent nature of these aggregates that turn them into Māra, enslaving us to the endless cycle of births and suffering. The liberation from Māra begins with sense-restraint: Māra will not be able to assail us when we close the sense-doors.

4 Restraint of the senses

4.1 THE 3 TRAININGS

The purpose of early Buddhist spiritual training is that of mental calm and clarity leading to awakening, that is, the overcoming of suffering. The best tool for such a training is meditation, that is, mindfulness practice. While meditation deals directly with the mind, it is easily distracted and influenced by our bodily and verbal deeds. However, in mindfulness practice, it is easier to control our body and speech than our mind.

The Buddhist spiritual training—called **the 3 trainings**—comprises these 3 aspects:

training in moral virtue	(<i>sīla,sikkhā</i>)	restraint of body and speech;
training in mental concentration	(<i>samādhi,sikkhā</i>)	restraint and focus of the mind;
training in wisdom	(<i>paññā,sikkhā</i>)	wisdom, or the knowledge of true reality.

(D 1:207, 3:220; A 1:229)

¹⁰ For a more detailed study, see **Māra**, SD 36.4.

¹¹ An **archetype**, as used here, is a constantly recurring symbol or motif in literature, painting, or mythology. This is a usage drawn from both comparative anthropology and Jungian archetypal theory.

¹² Comys also mention 4 kinds of Māra (KhA 155; SnA 201; ItA 136): *khandha māra* (the 5 aggregates, S 3:195), *kilesa māra* (mental defilements, DhA 1:289), *abhisañkhāra māra* (karmic accumulation, UA 216) and *deva,putta māra* (the deity, A 2:17, SnA 44). The 4 Māras of the Mahayana texts (Mvst 3:281, Lalv 354.11, 224.8, Daśa,bhūmika S 54.17, Karuṇā,puṇḍarīka 127.7, Śikṣā,samuccaya 198.10 & Dharma Saṅgraha §80) have *mṛtyu māra* (P *maccu māra*) in place of *abhisañkhāra māra*.

¹³ Eg S 1:156; Sn 357, 587; Dh 21, 47.

The first step listed here is the spiritual training in moral strength. More correctly, we should say that moral virtue is the basis for mental concentration and wisdom. Training in moral virtue does not stop with the training in mental concentration. Indeed, the two are interconnected, mutually building and refining each other.¹⁴ Both moral virtue and mental concentration are the bases for the training in wisdom, working as a three-lane or three-ply spiral path to spiritual liberation.

4.2 THE MIND

4.2.1 Training in moral virtue begins and continues with the guarding of the sense-doors (*indriyesu gutta, dvāra*) [§7]. To help understand the implications of this figurative expression, we should first look at a very short Sutta in the Eka, nipāta (the Book of Ones) in the Āṅguttara, that is, a passage that describes a marvellous nature of the mind.

4.2.2 The radiant mind

4.2.2.1 The Pabhassara Sutta (A 1.6.1-2), found in **the Accharā Saṅghāta Vagga** (A 1.5/1:8-10),¹⁵ is a short remarkable text where the Buddha declares that our mind is intrinsically pure and bright (*pabhassara*), that is to say, our “original nature” is that of good and light. In other words, we are not born in sin and that evil is not in our nature. Understandably, since evil is not our true nature, to persist in committing bad would only bring on conflict or suffering.

4.2.2.2 As such, the purpose of the spiritual life is to bring us back to this innate or natural pure goodness.

1 Bhikkhus, this mind is radiant, but it is defiled by adventitious impurities [impurities that “arrive” through the sense-doors].

The uninstructed [ignorant] ordinary person does not understand things as they really are.

Therefore there is no mental development for the uninstructed ordinary person, I say!¹⁶

2 Bhikkhus, this mind is radiant, and it is freed from adventitious impurities [impurities that “arrive” through the sense-doors].

The instructed [wise] noble disciple understands things as they really are.

Therefore there is mental development for the instructed noble disciple, I say!¹⁷

(A 1.6.1-2/1:10; also 1.5.9-10/1:10)¹⁸

4.2.2.3 The 1st verse says that the unguarded mind is defiled “by adventitious impurities” or “by impurities that arrive through the sense-doors” (*āgantukehi upakkilesehi*). The Kummôpama Sutta implicitly explains how this happens: our mind is *unguarded* when we hold on to the “signs and details”¹⁹ of our sense-experiences (seeing, hearing, etc).

¹⁴ On the pervasion of moral virtue throughout spiritual life, incl arhathood, see **Beyond Good and Evil**, SD 18.7 esp §§8-9.

¹⁵ “The chapter on the finger-snap.”

¹⁶ *Pabhassaram idam bhikkhave cittam tañ ca kho āgantukehi upakkilesehi upakkiliṭṭham. Tam assutavā puthujano yathā, bhūtam n’appajānati. Tasmā assutavato puthujanassa citta, bhāvanā n’atthi ti vadāmī ti.* Qu at MA 1:167; DhA 1:23; NmA 1:22; PmA 1:242; DhsA 68.

¹⁷ *Pabhassaram idam bhikkhave cittam tañ ca kho āgantukehi upakkilesehi vippamuttam. Tam sutavā ariya, sāva-ko yathā, bhūtam pajānati. Tasmā sutavato ariya, sāvakassa citta, bhāvanā atthi ti vadāmī ti.*

¹⁸ See SD 8.3(6).

¹⁹ *Nimitta* and *anuvyañjana*: see SD 19.14.

4.2.2.4 The “**signs**” (*nimitta*) are the notions or images that we conceive as being *pleasurable or beautiful*, and being taken up by such mental projections glossed over the sense-experience. This is then further reinforced by our looking for the “**details**” (*anuvyañjana*), such as the person’s hand, foot, smile, laughter, voice, posture, gesture, etc, or relating the experience to a certain memory. Such actions tend to be reinforced into habits (*nati*) of lust, embedded in our unconscious as latent tendencies (*anusaya*).²⁰

4.2.2.5 Similarly, when we look at *painful or ugly* sense-experiences and dwell on their signs and details, our actions become habits of aversion or dislike, embedded in our unconscious as latent tendencies. Furthermore, when the mind is not preoccupied with either such thoughts—that is, *neither with pleasant nor painful* sense-objects—it simply sinks into boredom, ignorance is reinforced. During any of these phases of sense-experience, the simplest and safest thing to do is to contemplate on its *impermanence*.

4.3 GUARDING THE SENSE-DOORS

4.3.1 The sense-objects themselves are “neutral” in the sense that they are neither pleasant nor unpleasant: it is our thinking that defines them so. **The Nibbedhika Pariyāya Sutta** (A 6.63) is very clear about this:

There are these 5 cords of sensual pleasures (*kāma,guṇa*):

Forms cognizable by the eye that are desirable, attractive, pleasant, endearing, associated with sensuality, delightful;

Sounds cognizable by the ear that are ... delightful;

Smells cognizable by the nose that are ... delightful;

Tastes cognizable by the tongue that are ... delightful;

Touches cognizable by the body that are desirable, attractive, pleasant, endearing, associated with sensuality, delightful.

—Monks, these are not sensual objects (*kāma*), but in the noble discipline, they are called “cords of sensual desire” (*kāma,guṇa*).²¹

The thought of passion is a person’s sensuality:

There is no sensuality in what is beautiful (*citra*) in the world.

The thought of passion is a person’s sensuality:

What is beautiful in the world remains as they are.

So here the wise remove the desire for them.²² (A 6.63,3/3:411), SD 6.11

4.3.2 It is when we project thoughts of liking, or of disliking, or of unconcern, towards the sense-objects, that our mind becomes defiled. When we become preoccupied with *liking* something, we reinforce that liking, strengthening it as craving or lust. When we are preoccupied with *disliking* something, we reinforce that disliking, strengthening it as hate or aversion.

When we unmindfully let “boring” sense-experiences occur without noting their impermanence, we reinforce our ignorance. This is when Māra the evil one will enter our mind through the sense-doors and

²⁰ On *anusaya*, see SD 31.3.

²¹ *Api ca kho bhikkhave n’ete kāmā, kāma,guṇā nam’ete ariyassa vinaye vuccanti*. This is an enigmatic statement whose meaning is clarified in the verse that follows. See foll n.

²² This verse, which explains the previous prose sentence, “plays upon the double meaning of *kāma*, emphasizes that purification is to be achieved by mastering the defilement of sensuality, not by fleeing [from] sensually enticing objects.” (A:ÑB 1999:302 n34)

take control of us. This is a colourful way of saying that if we fail to notice the impermanent nature of our sense-experiences, we will move through life on autopilot, losing control of ourselves and heading for certain disaster.

4.3.3 To live mindfully is to dwell with our sense-doors guarded. The practice of guarding the sense-doors can be summarized in this way:²³

Look less,	see more;
Hear less,	listen more;
Smell less,	breathe more;
Eat less,	taste more;
Touch less,	feel more;
Think less,	mind more:
Talk less,	ask more;
Do less,	be more;
Be true;	no more. ²⁴

With this kind of self-training, we can easily keep the precepts²⁵ so that they form the fertile ground for mindfulness practice.

4.3.4 Sense-restraint or guarding the sense-doors is clearly an essential part of mindfulness practice,²⁶ its purpose is not to react negatively in the face of covetousness and discontent [§7].²⁷ Mindfulness, as such, is an alert, non-reactive state of mind²⁸ of “letting come, letting go” of sense-objects through sustained effort (*ātāpī*) leads one to mental concentration (*samādhi*). In short, mindfulness “does not change [an] experience, but only deepens it.” (Analayo 2003:58)

— — —

Kummôpama Sutta

The Discourse on the Parable of the Tortoise

S 35.240

The tortoise and the jackal

3²⁹ Once upon a time, bhikshus, **a tortoise**³⁰ was foraging for food along the bank of a river in the evening.

²³ See SD 17.3 (3).

²⁴ That is, once you have directly seen *true reality*, there is no *more* suffering.

²⁵ On details of the precepts, see **Sāleyakka S** (M 41/1:285-290), SD 5.7 (2); see also **Veḷu, dvāreyya S** (S 55.7), SD 1.5; **Pañca, bhera, bhaya S** (S 12.41/2:68-70), SD 3.3; **Vera S** (A 5.174/3:204-206), SD 6.4.

²⁶ See SD 13.1 (3.1c).

²⁷ See SD 13.1 (4.2e).

²⁸ On the “non-reactive state of mind,” see Analayo 2003:175 f.

²⁹ I follow PTS numbering: §§1-2: *Evam me sutam. Ekaṃ samayaṃ bhagavā sāvatthiyaṃ...pe...āmantesi. bhagavā etad avoca.* See S 4:172,19.

³⁰ *Kummo kacchapo*, a tautology. See Intro (1).

Now, bhikshus, on that same evening, a jackal, too, was foraging for food along the bank of the same river.

4 Bhikshus, when the tortoise saw the jackal from afar foraging for food, [178] it drew its 5 limbs —its legs and neck³¹—into its shell and passed the time keeping still [at ease] and silent.³²

5 The jackal, too, bhikshus, had from afar seen the tortoise foraging for food. Having seen the tortoise from afar, he approached it and waited nearby, thinking:

“When this tortoise extends one or other of its 5 limbs, I will grab it right there, pull it out, and eat it!”

6 But, bhikshus, because the tortoise did not extend one or other of its 5 limbs, the jackal, failing to gain access to the tortoise, was disheartened and left.

Māra is always close by

7 Even so, bhikshus, **Māra the evil one** is constantly and always waiting close by you, thinking:

“Perhaps in the case of this person:

I would gain access to him through	the eye!
Or, I would gain access to him through	the ear!
Or, I would gain access to him through	the nose!
Or, I would gain access to him through	the tongue!
Or, I would gain access to him through	the body!
Or, I would gain access to him through	the mind!”

Guard your sense-doors!

Therefore, bhikshus, dwell with your **sense-doors guarded!**

(1) Having seen **a form** with the eye, *do not grasp its signs or details.*³³

For, if you leave the eye-faculty unguarded,

bad unwholesome states of covetousness and discontent³⁴ might assail you.

Practise restraining your eye: guard the eye faculty, keep up the restraint of the eye-faculty!

(2) Having heard **a sound** with the ear, do not grasp its signs or details.

For, if you leave the ear-faculty unguarded,

bad unwholesome states of covetousness and discontent might assail you.

Practise restraining your ear: guard the ear faculty, keep up the restraint of the ear-faculty!

³¹ *Soṇḍi, pañcamānaṃ aṅgānaṃ*, lit “its limbs with the neck as the fifth.”

³² “Keeping still and silent,” *appossukko tuṇhī, bhūto saṅkasāyati*. This phrase is used in a neg sense of not being helpful in **Nava (Bhikkhu) Bhikkhu S** (S 21.4), SD 72.13. The word **appossukka** is resolved as *appa* (little) + *ussuka* (zealous), meaning “not busy, inactive,” used in reference to our mindful non-action, refraining from busily engaging in various activities. The word is often tr as “living at ease” (eg S 9.10/1:202, 21.4/2:277, 51.10/5:262), but here “keeping still” fits better. The n *appossukkatā* is used at **Āyācana S** (S 6.1.5/1:137, SD 12.2, qv n) in ref to the Buddha’s inclination, immediately after his awakening towards a life of quietude rather than the busy task of teaching the Dharma. For an analysis of *appossukka*, see S:B 361 n54.

³³ See Intro (4.3).

³⁴ *Abhijjhā, domanassa*, simply refers to liking and disliking, but technically, here refers to the 5 mental hindrances (*pañca, nīvaraṇa*): (1) sense-desire, (2) ill will, (3) sloth and torpor, (4) restlessness and worry, and (5) doubt. See SD 13.1 (4.2.5).

(3) Having smelt a **smell** with the nose, do not grasp its signs or details.

For, if you leave the nose-faculty unguarded,

bad unwholesome states of covetousness and discontent might assail you.

Practise restraining your nose: guard the nose faculty, keep up the restraint of the nose-faculty!

(4) Having tasted a **taste** with the tongue, do not grasp its signs or details.

For, if you leave the tongue-faculty unguarded,

bad unwholesome states of covetousness and discontent might assail you.

Practise restraining your tongue: guard the tongue faculty, keep up the restraint of the tongue-faculty!

(5) Having felt a **touch** with the body, do not grasp its signs or details.

For, if you leave the body-faculty unguarded,

bad unwholesome states of covetousness and discontent might assail you.

Practise restraining your body: guard the body faculty, keep up the restraint of the body-faculty!

(6) Having cognized a **mind-object** with the mind, do not grasp its signs or details.

For, if you leave the mind-faculty unguarded,

bad unwholesome states of covetousness and discontent might assail you.

Practise restraining your mind: guard the mind faculty, keep up the restraint of the mind-faculty!

8 Bhikshus, when you dwell with the sense-doors guarded,³⁵ Māra, failing to gain access to you, will be disheartened and leave, just as the jackal left the tortoise. [179]

9 ³⁶*Kummo'va aṅgāni sake kapāle
samodahaṃ bhikkhu mano, vitakko
anissito aññaṃ aheṭṭhayāno
parinibbuto n'upavadeyya kiñci'ti*

Like the tortoise drawing its own limbs into its shell,
a monk, drawing in the mind's thoughts.
Independent, not troubling others,
fully quenched, would blame no one.

— evaṃ —

Bibliography

Anālayo, Sāmaṇera

2003 *Satipaṭṭhāna: The direct path to realization*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 2003.
[The biblio is very comprehensive.]

070705 080401 090620 130814 181223 190117 210930 211109

³⁵ *Indriyesu gutta, dvārā viharatha*, lit “dwell with the doors to the senses guarded!”

³⁶ This verse as at **Dukkara S** (S 34*/1.17/1:7): see SD 54.3g (1.3). Bodhi: “As the verse is not preceded by the usual sentence stating that the Buddha spoke it on this occasion, it seems the redactors of the canon have tacked it on by reason of the tortoise simile.” (S:B 1424 n186). [The asterisk * means that S 34 is a verse.]