#### 2. Sutta and commentary

[Note prefixes: "§" before a number refers to passages in the Sutta itself. "Intro" refers to an Introduction section." "Comy" here usually refers to the Commentarial Notes at the end of this chapter. A parenthesized cross-reference without a prefix, eg [8], refers to the section in the same chapter.

Sutta Synopsis
The Kālāmas approach the Buddha.
The moral worth of statements.
The 4 divine abodes.
The 4 self-assurances.
The Kālāmas' exultation.
The Kālāmas go for refuge.

# Kesa, puttiya Sutta The Discourse to the Kesa, puttiyas

4 3.65

[An asterisk (\*) following a word or phrase refers to the commentary (Part 3).]

Translated with notes by Piya Tan, ©2002,2021

[188] Thus have I heard.

# The Kālāmas approach the Buddha

- 1 At one time, the Blessed One was wandering in Kosala with a large community of monks and they arrived at a market town of the Kālāmas\* named Kesa,putta.\*
  - 1.2 Now the Kālāmas of Kesa, putta heard (this):
- "It is said, sirs, that the recluse Gotama,\* a Sakya son, who went forth from the Sakyan clan, has arrived in Kesa,putta."
  - 1.3 Now a good report about that Master Gotama has been going around thus:\*
- "So too, is he the Blessed One:<sup>1</sup> for, he is arhat, fully self-awakened, accomplished in wisdom and conduct, well-farer, knower of worlds, peerless guide of tameable persons, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.
- 1.4 Having realized by his own direct knowledge this world with its gods, its maras and its brahmas, this generation with its recluses and brahmins, its rulers and people, he makes it known to others.

He teaches the Dharma, good in the beginning, good in the middle, good in the end, both in the spirit and in the letter.

He proclaims the holy life that is entirely complete and pure.

1.5 It is good to see such arhats."\*

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Alt tr: "For the following reasons, too, he is the Blessed One [the Lord]..." On the meaning of *iti pi so* verse, see *Buddhânussati*, SD 15.7 (2.2) & n.

1.6 Then, the Kālāmas of Kesa, putta approached the Blessed One.

Having approached, some saluted the Blessed One, and sat down at one side.

Some, exchanged greetings with him, and when they have concluded their greetings and cordial talk, sat down at one side.

Some saluted the Blessed One with lotus-palms, and then sat down at one side.

Some announced their name and clan before the Blessed One, and then sat down at one side. Some kept silent and sat down at one side.<sup>2</sup>

- 1.7 When the Kālāmas of Kesa, putta were all seated, they spoke thus to the Blessed One:
- **2** \*"Bhante, there are some recluses and brahmins who come to Kesa,putta. They expound and explain their own doctrines, but attack, revile, despise and reject the doctrines of others.
- 2.2 And then some other recluses and brahmins come to Kesa, putta [189] and they, too, expound and explain their own doctrines, but attack, revile, despise and reject the doctrines of others.
- 2.3 Bhante, we are uncertain and in doubt: Which of these good recluses and brahmins speak truth and which speak falsehood?"<sup>3</sup>

## The 10 doubtworthy points:4 (1) standards for religious truth

**3** "It is fitting that you are uncertain, that you doubt, <sup>5</sup> Kālāmas. Doubt has arisen in you over what is doubtful. <sup>6</sup>

THE 10 DOUBTWORTHY POINTS:\* (1) STANDARDS FOR RELIGIOUS TRUTH<sup>7</sup>

Come, Kālāmas:8

4 PROPOSITIONS BASED ON TRADITION:

(1) Do not go<sup>9</sup> by tradition [aural revelation].<sup>10\*</sup>
(2) Do not go by lineage [received wisdom].\*

(3) Do not go by hearsay.\*

(4) Do not go by scriptural authority.\*

mā anussavena mā paramparāya

mā iti,kirāya

mā piţaka,sampadānena

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> This is likely to be a case of <u>social or emotional distance</u>: see **Silence and the Buddha,** SD 44.1 (2.2). See also **Love**, SD 38.4 (5.3.1.1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> From here on, MĀ 18 reads: "Gotama, having heard this, we are uncertain, in doubt, 'Of these recluses and brahmins, who is truthful, who is false?' The World Honoured One said, "Kālāmas, have neither uncertainty nor doubt. Why is that? Because when there is uncertainty and doubt, there will be perplexity. You lack pure wisdom with which to know whether there is an afterlife or not. You lack pure wisdom about which deeds are unwholesome, which deeds are not." Clearly the tone of the Chin version is very different from the Pali. See Part 2, Intro nn (1.1.4.4).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Kaṅkhāniya-ṭ,ṭhāna. This phrase comes from 3, It is interesting that this key section on the 10 doubtworthy points is completely absent from the Chinese version: see SD 35.4b. On the significance of the 10 points, see also (Licchavī) Bhaddiya S (A 4.193) @ SD 45.8 (1.3).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> On doubt (vicikicchā), see Vicikicchā, SD 32.8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Alañ hi vo, kālāmā, kaṅkhituṁ alaṁ vicikicchituṁ. Kaṅkhanīy'eva pana vo ṭhāne vicikicchā uppannā. However, in MĀ 16, the Chin tr depicts the Buddha as telling them *not* to have doubts (T1.26.438c12). We see a similar difference between the Pali and the Chin tr in **Pāṭaliya S** (S 42.13/4:350,15), SD 65.1, and **MĀ 20** (T1.26.447a22). See Part 3 (1.2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> This is the 1<sup>st</sup> of <u>4 "uses" of these 10 points</u>, as envisioned by the Buddha [§§8, 9, 14].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Philosophically, these 10 doubtworthy points can be grouped into <u>3 classes</u>: I. 4 traditional propositions: (1-4), II. 4 types of reasoning (5-8); III. 2 types of personal authority (9-10) [1.1.4]. For <u>a threefold categorization</u>: (3.2).

<sup>\*</sup> Passages with a suffixed asterisk (\*) have Commentarial Notes (see below).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Comy interprets as mā gaṇhiṭṭha, "Do not take hold of (a notion)" throughout (AA 2:305).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Here, "tradition" includes revelations, prophecies and so on,

#### 4 TYPES OF REASONING:

(5) Do not go by pure reason [by logic].\* mā takka,hetu[,gāhena]
 (6) Do not go by inference (and deduction).\* mā naya,hetu[,gāhena]
 (7) Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious reasoning].\* mā ākāra,parivitakkena

(8) Do not go by acceptance of [being convinced of] a view after pondering on it.\*

mā diţţhi,nijjhāna-k,khantiyā

#### 2 TYPES OF PERSONAL AUTHORITY:

(9) Do not go by (another's) seeming ability.\* mā bhavya,rūpatāya

(10) Do not go by the thought, 'This recluse [holy man] is our teacher.' ['This recluse is respected by us.']\*

mā samaņo no garûti

3.2 When you know for yourselves, Kālāmas,\*

'These things are unwholesome. These things are blamable. These things are censured by the wise. These things, fully undertaken, 11 bring about harm and suffering.'\*

—Then, Kālāmas, you should abandon them. 12

## The 3 unwholesome roots (1) [§10]

**4** GREED. \*What do you think, Kālāmas, when <u>greed</u> arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?" "For his harm, bhante."<sup>13</sup>

"This person, Kālāmas, who is **greedy**, overcome by greed, his mind controlled by greed, destroys life, takes the not-given, violates the women of others, <sup>14</sup> tells lies, and he will also make others do likewise—
which bring him harm and suffering for a long time."
"Yes, bhante."

**5** HATE. "What do you think, Kālāmas, when <u>hatred</u> arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?" "For his harm, bhante."

"This person, Kālāmas, who is **hateful**, overcome by hatred, his mind controlled by hatred, destroys life, takes the not-given, violates the women of others, tells lies,

and he will also make others do likewise-

which will bring him harm and suffering for a long time."

"Yes, bhante."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> "Fully undertaken," *samattā samādinnā*. *Samadinnā* here is past part of *samādiyati*, "he undertakes" (cf *samādiyāmi*, "I undertake" the training-rules). *Samattā* has these senses: (1) (cf Skt *samasta*, Jtkm 31.90) (A 2:193, ie, here; Sn 781 = *paripuṇṇa*, Nm 65); (2) (cf Skt *samāpta*) complete, entire, perfect (Sn 402, 881, 1000; Nm 289, 298; SnA 778; Miln 349); (3) adv, *samattaṁ*, "completely (S 5:175), "accomplished, in full" (Sn 889). The meaning here is that if any of the 10 doubtworthy points were accepted or practised "in full," it would not be beneficial, even be detrimental, to one. See Sn:N 344 n402.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> This whole section on the 10 doubtworthy points is completely absent from the Chinese version: see SD 35.4b.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See **Mūla S** (A 3.69): Greed, hate, delusion are the 3 unwholesome roots of all immoral conduct and all impure mental states (SD 18.2). The Buddha gently and clearly shows the Kālāmas, unlike those religionists, the simple logic or natural goodness of moral virtue, the very basis of his own Dharma training.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Para,dāram pi gacchati, lit "go to the women of others, too." It is likely that all those who have gone to see the Buddha at Kesa,putta are men, since elsewhere and more commonly, the third precept reads kāmesu micchācārā, "misconduct through sense-pleasures" (eg M 1:312), esp in the 5 precepts (pañca,sīla, D 1:146), which applies to all, regardless of gender.

**6** DELUSION. "What do you think, Kālāmas, when <u>delusion</u> arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?"

"For his harm, bhante." [190]

"This person, Kālāmas, who is **deluded**, overcome by delusion, his mind controlled by delusion, destroys life, takes the not-given, violates the women of others, tells lies,

and he will also make others do likewise—

which will bring him harm and suffering for a long time."

"Yes, bhante."

## Moral refrain 1: Emphatic rejection\*

7 "What do you think, Kālāmas,

are these things wholesome or unwholesome?" "Unwholesome, bhante."

"Blamable or not blamable?" "Blamable, bhante."

"Censured or praised by the wise?"

"Censured by the wise, bhante."

"These things, fully undertaken, do they bring about harm and suffering?

What do you think of this?"

"These things, bhante, fully undertaken,

bring about harm and suffering.
So indeed it is to us in this matter."

## 10 doubtworthy points: (2) standards for moral ethics<sup>15</sup>

8 \*"Thus I have spoken, Kālāmas; it is for this reason that I have spoken thus:\*

'Come, Kālāmas:

Do not go by tradition [aural tradition]. Do not go by lineage [received wisdom].

Do not go by hearsay.

Do not go by scriptural authority.

Do not go by pure reason [by logic].

Do not go by inference (and deduction).

Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious reasoning].

o not go by acceptance of [being convinced of] a view after pondering on it.

Do not go by (another's) seeming ability.

Do not go by the thought, "This recluse is our teacher." ["This recluse is respected by us."]

8.2 When you know for yourselves, Kālāmas,

"These things are unwholesome. These things are blamable. These things are censured by the wise. These things, fully undertaken, bring about harm and suffering."

—Then Kālāmas, you should abandon them.'

Thus I have spoken; it is for this reason that I have spoken thus.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Morality is not a code of rules or routine of rituals and vows serving as "tenets of confession," or for crowd-control, but allows individuals the latitude for wholesome faith and personal practice in keeping with the common good [§14].

## 10 doubtworthy points: (3) standard for self-realization<sup>16</sup>

9 Come Kālāmas:17

Do not go by aural tradition [received wisdom].

Do not go by lineage [received wisdom].

Do not go by hearsay.

Do not go by scriptural authority.

Do not go by pure reason.

Do not go by inference (and deduction).

Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious reasoning].

Do not go by acceptance of [being convinced of] a view after pondering on it.

Do not go by (another's) seeming ability.

Do not go by the thought, 'This recluse [holy man] is our teacher.' ['This recluse is respected by us.']

## Right view as virtuous action18

9.2 When you know for yourselves, Kālāmas,

'These things are wholesome.

These things are not blamable.

These things are praised by the wise.

These things, fully undertaken, bring good and happiness.'\*

—Then, Kālāmas, you should live cultivating them.

## The 3 wholesome roots (2) [§3.2]

**10** Non-Greed. What do you think, Kālāmas, this person, in whom <u>non-greed</u> [charity] arises, does it arise for his good or for his harm?"

"For his good, bhante."

"This person, Kālāmas, who is **not greedy**, not overcome by greed, his thoughts not controlled by it, does not destroy life, does not take the not-given, does not violate the women of others, does not tell lies, and he will also <u>not</u> make others do likewise, [191]

which will bring good and happiness for the long time."

"Yes, bhante."

**11** NON-HATRED. "What do you think, Kālāmas, this person, in whom <u>non-hatred</u> [lovingkindness] arises, does it arise for his good or for his harm?"

"For his good, bhante."

"What do you think, Kālāmas, this person, who is **not hateful**, not overcome by hatred, his thoughts not controlled by it,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Fully: Self-reliance and self-realization through wholesome moral conduct. <u>Full and true moral virtue</u> cannot be rightly dictated by any religion, group or person, but must be properly understood and freely practised by each individual for the common good. [§14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Note that the "doubtworthy points" passage is repeated only here (for the unwholesome roots), but not after the statement of the wholesome roots [§14], where it is merely stated once. This clearly shows these doubtworthy points are related to the unwholesome roots and as such should be rejected.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> See (Licchavī) Bhaddiya S (A 4.193) @ SD 45.8 (1.4).

does not destroy life, does not take the not-given, does not violate the women of others, does not tell lies, and he will also not make others do likewise,

which will bring good and happiness for the long time." "Yes, bhante."

**12** NON-DELUSION. "What do you think, Kālāmas, this person in whom <u>non-delusion</u> [wisdom] arises, does it arise for his good or for his harm?"

"For his good, bhante."

"This person, Kālāmas, who is **not deluded**, not overcome by delusion, his mind not controlled by it, does not destroy life, does not take the not-given, does not violate the women of others, does not tell lies, and he will also <u>not</u> make others do likewise,

which will bring good and happiness for the long time." "Yes, bhante."

## Moral refrain 2: Emphatic affirmation<sup>19</sup>

13 \*"What do you think, Kālāmas,

are these things wholesome or unwholesome?"

"Blamable or not blamable?"

"Censured or praised by the wise?"

"These things, fully undertaken,

do they bring good and happiness?"

"Wholesome, bhante."

"Not blamable, bhante."

"Praised by the wise, bhante."

"These things, bhante, fully undertaken,

bring good and happiness."

So indeed it is to us in this matter."

## 10 doubtworthy points: (4) the common good<sup>20</sup>

14 "Thus I have spoken, Kālāmas; it is for this reason that I have spoken thus:\*

'Come, Kālāmas:

Do not go by aural tradition [received wisdom].

Do not go by lineage [received wisdom].

Do not go by hearsay.

Do not go by scriptural authority.

Do not go by pure reason [by logic].

Do not go by inference (and deduction).

Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious reasoning].

Do not go by acceptance of [being convinced of] a view after pondering on it.

Do not go by (another's) seeming ability.

Do not go by the thought, "This recluse [holy man] is our teacher." ["This recluse is respected by us."]'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> For Moral Refrain 1, see §7 & n.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> The 10 undoubtworthy points serve as the criteria for <u>the universal or common good</u>, both religious and secular, as "the universal moral precepts."

#### Right view as virtuous action<sup>21</sup>

14.2 When you know for yourselves, Kālāmas,

'These things are wholesome. These things are not blamable. These things are praised by the wise. These things, fully undertaken, bring good and happiness.'

—Then Kālāmas, you should live [192] cultivating them.

Thus I have spoken; it is for this reason that I have spoken thus.

#### The divine abodes\*

- 15 Now, Kālāmas, that noble disciple—thus free from covetousness, free from ill will, unconfused, clearly comprehending, ever mindful\*22—
  - (1) [LOVINGKINDNESS] dwells pervading with a heart of lovingkindness, dwells suffusing one quarter; so, too, the second; so, too, the third; so, too, the fourth;

thus above, below, across, everywhere, and to everyone as well as to himself,<sup>23</sup> he dwells suffusing all the world with lovingkindness

that is vast, grown great [exalted], <sup>24</sup> immeasurable, without hate, without ill-will. <sup>25</sup>

- (2) [COMPASSION] He dwells with a heart of compassion, he dwells suffusing one quarter, so, too, the second; so, too, the third; so, too, the fourth; thus above, below, across, everywhere, and to everyone as well as to himself, he dwells suffusing all the world with compassion that is vast, grown great [exalted], immeasurable, without hate, without ill-will.
- (3) [GLADNESS] He dwells with a heart of gladness, he dwells suffusing one quarter, so, too, the second; so, too, the third; so, too, the fourth; thus above, below, across, everywhere, and to everyone as well as to himself, he dwells suffusing all the world with gladness that is vast, grown great [exalted], immeasurable, without hate, without ill-will.
- (4) [EQUANIMITY] He dwells with a heart of equanimity, he dwells suffusing one quarter, so, too, the second; so, too, the third; so, too, the fourth; thus above, below, across, everywhere, and to everyone as well as to himself, he dwells suffusing all the world with equanimity that is vast, grown great [exalted], immeasurable, without hate, without ill-will.<sup>26</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> See (Licchavī) Bhaddiya S (A 4.193) @ SD 45.8 (1.4).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Evaṁ vigatâbhijjho vigatâvyāpādo asammūļho sampajāno paṭissato. This describes the saint's mind; cf description of the ordinary mind at §15.2 etc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Iti uddham adho tiriyam sabbadhi sabb'attatāya. This underscored word is a better reading than sabbatthatāya (PED "on the whole") since sabbadhi ("everywhere") precedes it. It is resolved as sabba + atta + the suffix -tā (making it an abstract noun), giving the sense of "all-and-self-ness." The word sabbattatāya is dative, giving the sense, "to alland-selfness," or as **Bodhi** translates it: "to all as to himself" (2005:90).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> The mind "grown great" ( $maha-g,gat\bar{a}$ ) or exalted perception refers to the mind in dhyana, ie in the form sphere (rūpâvacara). See Catuttha Jhāna Pañha S (S 40.4), SD 24.14 (4).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> The recurrence of these last 2 phrases—"without hate, without ill will"—attests to the fact that lovingkindness is the basis for all the other 3 abodes, ie, they are actually a refinement of lovingkindness applied on deeper and broader levels.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> On how this practice leads to spiritual liberation, see **Kara.ja,kāya Brahma,vihāra S** (A 10.208/5:299), SD 2.10.

## The 4 self-assurances (assāsa)

15.2 Kālāmas, this noble disciple—his mind without enmity thus,

his mind without ill will thus,

hs mind uncorrupted thus,

his mind purified thus<sup>27</sup>—wins these 4 self-assurances right here in this life:\*

16 Definition of the 4 Self-Assurances\*

#### (1) The 1st self-assurance [The 1st self-assurance he has won is this:]

'If there *is* an afterlife [another world], and if good and bad karmic deeds bear fruit and result, it is possible then that when the body breaks up, after death,

I shall re-appear in a state of joy, a happy destination, in heaven.'28

This is the 1st self-assurance he has won.29

#### (2) The 2<sup>nd</sup> self-assurance [The 2<sup>nd</sup> self-assurance he has won is this:]

'If there is *no* afterlife, and if good and bad karmic deeds do not bear fruit and results, then, still right here, in this life, free from enmity, from ill will, I live happily.'<sup>30</sup>

This is the 2<sup>nd</sup> self-assurance he has won.<sup>31</sup>

## (3) The 3<sup>rd</sup> self-assurance [The 3<sup>rd</sup> self-assurance he has won is this:]

'Suppose bad *does* come to the bad-doer:

but how can I—who intends no bad towards anyone, who has done no bad—be touched by suffering?'32

This is the 3<sup>rd</sup> self-assurance he has won.<sup>33</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Evaṁ avera,citto evaṁ avyāpajjha,citto evaṁ asaṅkhiliṭṭha,citto evaṁ visuddha,citto. This describes the ordinary mind; cf description of the saint's mind at §15a.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Sace kho pana atthu para,loko atthi sukaṭa,dukkaṭānaṁ kammānaṁ phalaṁ vipāko ṭhānaṁ ahaṁ kāyassa bhedā param maraṇā sugatiṁ saggaṁ lokaṁ uppajjissāmîti. In such a scenario, we <u>naturally</u> arise in a heavenly state on account of our own good actions and mind without any need of outside agency.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> The Chin version, **MĀ 16**, reads thus: (1) "If there is this world and other worlds, if there is fruition of good and bad deeds, I gain the right view in connection with karma; I fully uphold it. With the breaking up of the body, after death, I will surely go to a good state, even be reborn in a heaven. The noble disciple who has heard much, has a mind free from fetters, from enmity, from ill will, from strife." (T1.26.439b10-13): SD 35.4b.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Whether or not there is heaven, hell, etc, what matters is that we have lived well with our present happiness.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> MĀ 16 reads thus: (2) "If there is neither this nor other worlds, and no results of good and bad deeds, I will, in this teaching, still not be faulted by others (for my deeds), but will be praised by those with right wisdom. Also, those progressing (on the path), those with right view, say that this is so (this and other world; karma and its fruition). The noble disciple who has heard much, has a mind free from fetters, from enmity, from ill will, from strife." (T1.26.439b14-17): SD 35.4b.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Sace kho pana karoto karīyati pāpaṁ na kho panâhaṁ kassaci pāpaṁ cetemi akarontaṁ kho panamaṁ pāpaṁ kammaṁ kuto dukkhaṁ phusissatîti. Even when bad things do happen to good people (as commonly seen in life), the good will not suffer any unwholesome karma as for those who commit those bad deeds upon them. The bad-doers here are already unhappy and unwise in some way to be compelled to act so negatively, and will further face future negative karmic fruits.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> **MĀ 16** reads thus: (3) "If karma exists, I've surely done no evil; I think no evil. Since I've done no evil, how can suffering come to me? The noble disciple who has heard much, has a mind free from fetters, from enmity, from ill will, from strife." (T1.26.439b18-21): SD 35.4b.

## (4) The 4<sup>th</sup> self-assurance [The 4<sup>th</sup> self-assurance he has won is this:]

'Suppose bad does *not* come to the bad-doer:

then, right here in this life, I see myself purified both ways.'34

This is the 4<sup>th</sup> self-assurance he has won.<sup>35</sup>

Kālāmas, this noble disciple—

his mind without enmity thus,

his mind without ill will thus,

his mind uncorrupted thus,

his mind purified thus—wins these 4 self-assurances right here in this life."

#### The Kālāmas' exultation\*

17 "So it is, Blessed One! So it is, well-farer!

Indeed, bhante, this noble disciple—

his mind without enmity thus,

his mind without ill will thus,

his mind uncorrupted thus,

his mind purified thus—wins [193] these 4 self-assurances right here in this life:

#### (1) The 1st self-assurance he has won is this:

'If there is an afterlife [another world], and if good and bad karmic deeds bear fruit and result,

it is possible then that when the body breaks up, after death,

I shall re-appear in a state of joy, a happy destination, in heaven.'

This is the 1<sup>st</sup> self-assurance he has won.

## (2) The 2<sup>nd</sup> self-assurance he has won is this:

'If there is no afterlife, and if good and bad deeds do not bear fruit and results, still right here in this life, free from enmity, from ill will, I live happily.'

This is the 2<sup>nd</sup> self-assurance he has won.

#### (3) The 3<sup>rd</sup> self-assurance he has won is this:

'Suppose bad does come to the bad-doer: but how can I—who intends no bad towards anyone, who has done no bad—be touched by suffering?'

This is the 3<sup>rd</sup> self-assurance he has won.

#### (4) The 4<sup>th</sup> self-assurance he has won is this:

'Suppose bad does not come to the bad-doer: then, right here in this life, I see myself *purified both* ways.'

This is the 4<sup>th</sup> self-assurance he has won.

17.2 ndeed, bhante, this noble disciple—

his mind without enmity thus,

his mind without ill will thus,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Because he does no bad, no bad will come to him (Comy). Whether karma and rebirth are true or not, whether we believe in them or not, living free <u>from greed</u>, hate and delusion brings us a life of true humanity and happiness.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> **MĀ 16** reads thus: (4) "If karma exists, I've surely done no evil. I've done no wrong in the world; hence, there is no question of fear or no fear. I always have love and compassion for all the world. My mind quarrels not with sentient beings. It is not clouded, but joyful. The noble disciple who has heard much, has a mind free from fetters, from enmity, from ill will, from strife." (T1.26.439b22-26): SD 35.4b.

his mind uncorrupted thus,

his mind purified thus—wins these 4 self-assurances right here in this life.

## The Kālāmas go for refuge\*

**18** Excellent, bhante<sup>36</sup> Gotama! Excellent, bhante!

Just as if, bhante, one were to place upright what had been overturned,

or, were to reveal what was hidden, or, were to show the way to one who was lost,

or, were to hold up a lamp in the dark so that those with eyes can see forms,

in the same way, in numerous ways, has the Dharma been made clear by master Gotama. We, bhante, go to the Blessed One for refuge, to the Dharma, and to the community of monks.

May master Gotama remember us as lay followers who have gone to him for refuge from this day forth for life."

— pañcamaṁ —

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> In this refuge-going passage, the Kālāmas address the Buddha <u>both</u> as *bhante* and as *bho*. The latter is a common vocative used amongst brahmins. Throughout the rest of the discourse, they address the Buddha as *bhante*. Three explanations are possible: (1) Originally, *bhante* and *bho* are synonymous. (2) The reciters who composed this Sutta use the standard Buddhist vocation in its main body, but left the refuge-going passage with its own brahminical vocative. (3) The refuge as a formula or ritual for brahmins would, as a rule, use *bho* as the vocative.