

4b

Kesa,puttiya Sutta (A 3.65)

A brief comparison of A 3.65 and MĀ 16 (the Pali version and its Chinese translation) by Piya Tan, ©2021

The Kesa,puttiya Sutta and Its Chinese Version

A brief comparative description

	A 3.65	MĀ 16
<i>[Differences are shown in bold.]</i>		
The Buddha arrives in Kesaputta & the Kālāmas	§1	1-13
The Kālāmas visit the Buddha and question him	§2	14-28
The 10 doubtful points (1): religious truth	§3	
The 3 unwholesome roots	§§4-7	29-48
The 10 doubtful points (2): moral ethics	§8	
The 10 doubtful points (3): self-realization. etc	§9	
The 3 wholesome roots	§§10-12	
The 10 unwholesome course of karma		49-103
Moral refrain: Emphatic affirmation	§13	
The 10 doubtful points (4): the common good	§14	
The divine abodes	§15	104-111
The 4 self-assurances (1): The Buddha	§16	112-138
The 4 self-assurances (2): The Kālāmas' exultation	§17	139-167
The Kālāmas' self-realization		168-169
The Kālāmas' refuge-going	§18	170-174

Table 1. The Kesaputtiya Sutta A 3.65 and MĀ 16

1 SIMILARITIES IN A 3.65 AND MĀ 16

1.1 Both **A 3.65** and its Chinese version, **MĀ 16**, open by reporting that the Buddha and the monks have arrived in Kesa,putta country; how the Kālāmas, hearing of the Buddha's reputation as an awakened renunciant, decide to meet him; they go on to question him regarding the intolerant conduct of other preachers [§§1-2; MĀ 16,1-28]. An interesting difference is that only **MĀ 16** mentions the Buddha as residing in a simsapa grove [MĀ 16,4].

1.2 Both Suttas mention the 3 unwholesome roots [§§4-7; MĀ 16,29-48]; only A 3.65 mention the 3 unwholesome roots, too [§§10-12], but they are omitted by MĀ 16. The probable reason for this is discussed below [2.3].

1.3 In both Suttas, the passages on keeping wholesome moral conduct—the purification of body, speech and mind—lead up the cultivation of the 4 divine abodes; but each does this differently. **A 3.65** explains how "the wholesome states" [§§9.2-12] lead up to them.

MĀ 16, however, lists the 10 wholesome courses of karma [MĀ 16,112-138] as the prelude to the divine abodes. The latter also abridges the passages on the last 3 divine abodes (suggesting that it was a late addition in the oral tradition of the Indic text used in the translation).¹

1.4 Both the Suttas report the 4 self-assurances (called "the safe abodes" in the Chinese translation [§16; MĀ 16,112-138]); and both report the Kālāmas as exulting in this teaching by echoing as a refrain [§§17; MĀ 16,139-167].

A difference is that while **A 3.65** only mention once at the start that the noble disciple's mind "without hate, thus, without ill will thus, uncorrupted

¹ This is assuming that the Chinese translators had not abbreviated those passages themselves.

thus, purified thus” wins these 4 self-assurances [§15.2], **MĀ 16** insert a similar refrain—“the heart of a learned noble disciple, without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will readily gains the 4 safe abodes” [MĀ 16,118, 124, 128, 135, 137, 140, 146, 152156, 163, 164].

1.5 MĀ 16 then reports the Kālāmas declaring that they have understood the Buddha’s teaching [168-169]; but this is not reported in A 3.69 [2.3]. Both the Suttas then close with the Kālāmas going for refuge. After giving the full refuge-formula, **A 3.65** closes. **MĀ 16** only briefly states this, closing thus: “All the Kālāmas and the monks who heard the Buddha taught, rejoiced and practised accordingly.”

2 DIFFERENCES BETWEEN A 3.65 AND MĀ 16

2.1 While the Pali **Kesa,puttiya Sutta** (A 3.65) is an early Buddhist classic on the theory of knowledge (true sources of knowing) and moral ethics (wholesome action), the Chinese version (MĀ 16) is only about wholesome action. Hence, what defines spiritual truth by self-effort, free will and free inquiry, in early Buddhism are prominently absent from the Chinese version, which probably reflects the Sarvāstivāda ideology [4.2]. In short, while A 3.65 is about wholesome knowing and doing (wisdom and moral ethics), its Chinese version (MĀ 16) is only about wholesome doing.

2.2 While **the 10 doubtful points** (*kaṅkhāniya-ṭṭhāna*) forms the highlight of **A 3.65**, this decad is significant absent from MĀ 16 [3.2]. From **Table 1**, we can see that this famous pericope appears 4 times in A 3.65:

- (1) §3: as the criteria for religious truth;
- (2) §8: as the standards for wholesome moral ethics;
- (3) §9: self-reliance and self-realization through wholesome moral conduct;
- (4) §14: as the common standard for the common good.

² T1.26.438c24-439b1.

³ See eg **Sāleyyaka S** (M 41): first, the 10 unwholesome courses of karma are listed (§§8-10), and the 10 wholesome courses (§§12-14), SD 5.7.

This set of 10 doubtful points is, however, absent from MĀ 16.

2.3 MĀ 16, however, fully features **the 10 unwholesome courses of karma** (*dasa akusala kamma,patha*) [MĀ 16,49-103]²—but this whole section is not found in **A 3.65**, where the decad is integral to but implicit in the mention of the 3 unwholesome roots [§§4-7]. This latter triad is also mentioned in **MĀ 16** [29-48].

The 10 wholesome courses of karma (*dasa kusala kamma,patha*) are implicit in **A 3.65** as the 3 wholesome roots [§§10-12], but which are omitted by MĀ 16. It mentions only the 10 unwholesome courses [above]. This seems to disrupt the MĀ 16 teaching-sequence (in a significantly long discourse), making it somewhat abrupt or incomplete.³

2.4 MĀ 16 adds an interesting remark, missing from A 3.65: just before going for refuge, the Kālāmas declare that they “have realized it ... have understood” what the Buddha has taught. This remarkable outburst seems to suggest that the Kālāmas (at least some of them) have attained streamwinning [2.4].⁴

3 THE RULE OF CONTEXT

3.1 Scholars who examine only the word of the suttas, and are either ignorant of **the “rule of context,”**⁵ or reject it, are likely to be perplexed by the omission of the whole passage on the 10 doubtful points in the Chinese version. One opinion is that it was probably due to “transmission error.” Yet, it’s difficult to imagine how such an important passage could be missed by the reciters or the translators! We have no clues either whether this passage was removed from the Chinese text.

⁴ Cf **S 12.41,3** (SD 3.3(4.2)).

⁵ On the rule of context in the study of early Buddhist suttas, see SD 53.5 (4.2.3); SD 54.3b (2.3.2.3).

3.2 Analayo, a specialist scholar in the comparative study of the Pali suttas and its parallels, especially in Chinese translations, reminds us of the difficulty in resolving such issues of the authenticity of certain texts and teachings:

“Although in this case it is not easy to decide which of the two versions has preserved the earlier reading, the difference is significant in so far as the advice to the Kālāmas given in the Pāli version is not supported by its parallel and thus its claim to represent early Buddhist thought does not stand on as firm a ground as it would have if the same position had also been reflected in its parallel.⁶

In other words, discussions of the advice to the Kālāmas need to keep in mind the possibility that the Pāli version could be the result of a change that occurred during transmission and thus its testimony regarding the early Buddhist attitude towards free enquiry and the resolution of doubt is comparatively less certain than other discourses on this and other topic that are supported by their parallels.” (Analayo 2016:11)

Apparently, Analayo does not feel that the Pali suttas can stand by themselves as **the early Buddhist texts**, and that their authenticity must be affirmed by, or, at least, coincide with the texts (the words) of the Chinese translations. Yet, it is well known that the Chinese translations are fraught with great difficulties of, not only language, but also cultural differences, attitude towards religion and authority, the idea of selfhood, even the nature of awakening itself.⁷

Moreover, the Chinese translations were done some 500-700 years after the whole Pali Tipiṭaka had been brought to Sri Lanka, written down, and

⁶ Analayo’s n: “According to Bodhi 2012:73 f, “in contemporary Buddhist circles it has become almost *de rigueur* to regard the Kālāma Sutta as *the* essential Buddhist text ... held up as proof that the Buddha anticipated Western empiricism, free inquiry, and the scientific method, that he endorsed the personal determination of truth ... it has become one of the most commonly quoted Buddhist texts, offered as the key to convince those with modernist leanings that the Buddha was their forerunner.” [A:B 73 f]

transmitted to other parts of mainland SE Asia. Indeed, it is the Pali canon that should be the gold standard for any other version or translation of such early Buddhist texts. The question, then, is not so much as why **A 3.65** (and A 4.193) preserves the 10 doubtful points when their Chinese versions do not, but rather why the Chinese lack these vital teachings that reflect so many salient points found in numerous other suttas taught by the Buddha himself?⁸

4 WHY THE CHINESE TRANSLATIONS OMITTED THE 10 DOUBTFUL POINTS

4.1 Theoretically, the best explanation for the omission of the 10 doubtful points in the Chinese translations is surely *the simplest one*. It is probable that the Chinese translations were based on Indic texts that did not have those passages because they were from a different sectarian school [4.1]. It is left to our imagination to explain the omission.

One point is probably clear: those non-Pali Indic texts belonged to sects or schools that held a view of the Buddha which differed from that in the Pali suttas, or that they reject any kind of free inquiry or personal awakening as the final authority of wisdom. They were clearly traditions, or the beginnings of traditions, that placed the teacher (*garu* or *guru*) above the teaching (*dhamma*), as in the Mahāyāna.

4.2 The simplest explanation for the omission of the 10 doubtful points from the Chinese translations, is that *it was not found in the Indic text used for their translation*. Now let us ask why these Indic texts omitted those 10 points even though they are found in the Pali canon?

The answer: it was probably because the Indic text used for the Chinese translation came from **the Sarvāsti,vāda**,⁹ who held up the Buddha as an un-

⁷ See eg **How Buddhism Became Chinese**: SD 40b.2 (Chinese challenges to Buddhism).

⁸ For cases of other Chinese elisions and inversions of texts found in Pali suttas, see A:B 73 f.

⁹ The Sarvāsti,vāda (“all exist” school) (3rd cent BCE-12th cent CE), centred in Mathura, but extending as far north as Kashmir, NW India, Gandhara and Central Asia (eg, Kucha), was one of the most influential mainstream pre-Mahāyāna schools. The

questionable authority.¹⁰ It is possible, even likely that the Sarvâstivâda re-
 dactors omitted the 10 points because they went against their evolving Bud-
 dhology, basically that the Buddha and his teachings should not be question-
 ed. This is, of course, only a conjectural view, which does not really matter,
 since the point remains that we have an amazing document in the suttas that
 have given us the legacy of both free inquiry and an early Buddhist theory of
 knowledge.

— — —

idea of aspiring full buddhahood (*sammā,sambodhi*)—a teaching not found in the
 suttas—prob originated with them, but developed in the Mahāyāna, esp Mahā,saṅ-
 ghika (influential in India and Gandhara; 3rd cent BCE-6th cent CE). See Thomas, *The
 History of Buddhist Thought*, 1933: ch 13 (166-176).

¹⁰ Our **wise faith** (*avecca-p.pasāda*) is not simply belief in his teachings, but from
 our understanding, through the Dharma, how impermanence underpins all reality,
 how this shows it to be unsatisfactory; on account of both realities, there is nonsel.
 All this can be seen by us even when unawakened, but must be fully realized in due
 course so that we awaken to the path and on to attain nirvana.

Kesa,putta Sutta

The Discourse to the Kesa,puttiyas¹¹
A 3.65/1:188-193 (SD 35.4b)

[188] Thus have I heard.

THE KĀLĀMAS APPROACH THE BUDDHA

1 At one time, the Blessed One was wandering in Kosala with a large community of monks and they arrived at a market town of the Kālāmas named Kesa,putta.

1.2 Now the Kālāmas of Kesa,putta heard (this):
“It is said that the recluse Gotama, the Sakya son, who went forth from a Sakyan family, has arrived in Kesa,putta.”

1.3 Now a good report about that master Gotama has been going round thus:

“So too, is he the Blessed One: for, he is arhat, fully self-awakened, accomplished in wisdom and conduct, well-farer, knower of worlds, peerless guide of tamable people, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.

(一六)中阿含業相應品
伽藍經 第六

MĀ 16 = T1.26.438b14-439c21¹²

1 我聞如是：

2 一時，佛遊伽藍¹³國¹⁴，與大比丘眾 [438b15] 俱，
3 至羈舍子，住羈舍子村北尸攝憇¹⁵林中。

4 [b16] 爾時，羈舍子伽藍人聞沙門瞿曇釋種子捨 [b17] 釋宗族，出家學道。

5 遊伽藍園，與大比丘眾 [b18] 俱，來至此羈舍子，
住羈舍子¹⁶村北尸攝憇林 [b19] 中。

6 彼沙門瞿曇有大名稱，周聞十方。

7 沙門 [b20] 瞿曇：如來、無所著、等正覺、明行成
為、善逝、世間 [b21] 解、無上士道法御、天人師、
號佛、眾祐。

16) Madhyama Āgama

Chapter Related to Karma
Kālāma Sutta, no 6¹⁷

1 Thus have I heard.

2 At one time, the Buddha was wandering in Kālāma country with a large community of monks.
3 He reached the Kesaputta village and stayed in the simsapa⁵ grove to the north.

4 At that time, the Kālāmas heard that the recluse Gotama, a Sakya son, had renounced from the Sakya clan, left home, to learn the path.

5 He was wandering in Kālāma country with a large community of monks, reached Kesaputta, and was staying in the simsapa grove to the north.

6 That recluse Gotama had a great reputation, well known in all the 10 directions:

7 “The recluse Gotama is the tathagata, freed from attachments [an arhat], fully awakened, accomplished in knowledge and conduct, well gone, knower of worlds, peerless guide of trainable persons, teacher of gods and humans, the Buddha [awakened], blessed [the lord].¹⁸

¹¹ This comparative table show parallel passages that are not necessarily translations of one another.

¹² For nn, Part 3, comy (§3.0) 1-3.

¹³ 伽藍 *qiélán*, *kālāma*.

¹⁴ Text reads 園 *yuán* “park, grove” amended to 國 *guó* “country.”

¹⁵ 尸攝憇 *shī shè hé* (onomatopoeic), *simsapa*: 35.4a (2) comy

¹⁶ 羈舍子 *jī shě zǐ*, *kesaputta*.

¹⁷ For trs: Analayo, 2013:89-96; Charles Patton: https://canon.dharmapearls.net/01_agama/madhyama/MA_016.html. Often faulty trs.

¹⁸ On these 9 virtues of the Buddha (10, with *tathagata*): SD 57.7 (3); SD 15.5 (2).

Having realized by his own direct knowledge this world with its gods, its Māras and its Brahmās, this generation with its recluses and brahmins, its rulers and people, he makes it known to others.

He teaches the Dharma, good in the beginning, good in the middle, good in the end, both in the spirit and in the letter.

He proclaims the holy life that is entirely complete and pure.

1.4 It is good to see such arhats."

1.5 Then, the Kālāmas of Kesa,putta approached the Blessed One.

Some greeted him with lotus-palms; some exchanged greetings and cordial talk with him; some announced their name and clan before the Blessed One—and then sat down at one side. Some kept silent and sat down at one side.

8 彼於此 [b22] 世，天及魔、梵、沙門、梵志，從人至天，自知自覺，[b23] 自作證成就遊。

9 彼若說法，初善、中善、竟亦善，[b24] 有義有文，具足清淨，顯現梵行。

10 若見如來，[b25] 無所著、等正覺，尊重禮拜，供養承事者，快得 [b26] 善利。

11 我等應共往見沙門瞿曇，禮事供養。

12 [b27] 羈舍子伽藍人聞已，各與等類眷屬相隨，從 [b28] 羈舍子出，北行至尸攝憇林，13 欲見世尊禮 [b29] 事供養。

14 往詣佛已，彼伽藍人或稽首佛足，[438c1] 却坐一面；15 或問訊佛却坐一面；16 或叉手向佛，[c2] 却坐一面；17 或遙見佛已，默然而坐。

8 In this world, with its gods, maras, brahmas, recluses and brahmins, from humans up to the gods, he has (won) self-knowledge and self-awakening, and dwells thus self-realized. [98]

9 The Dharma that he teaches is good in the beginning, good in the middle, good in the end, too, replete with meaning and phrasing, fully pure, clearly showing the holy life.

10 If those who meet the Tathagata, freed from attachment, fully self-awakened, were to honour, venerate, give offerings, serve him, they will quickly gain benefits.

11 We should go together to see the recluse Gotama to honour, make offerings, and serve him."

12 Hearing this, the Kālāmas of Kesaputta each left Kesaputta with their relatives, and went north to the simsapa grove, 13 wishing to meet the World Honoured One¹⁹ to honour, give offerings, and serve him.

14 Upon arriving, some of the Kālāmas bowed their heads to the Buddha's feet, and sat down at one side. 15 Some greeted the Buddha, and sat down at one side. 16 Some saluted the Buddha with folded palms, and sat down at one side. 17 Some looked at the Buddha from afar and silently sat down.

¹⁹ "World Honoured One," 世尊 *shì zūn*, from *loka, nātha* (ts), *loka, jeṭṭha*; also *bhagavā*.

1.6 When the Kālāmas of Kesa,putta were all seated, they spoke thus to the Blessed One:

2 “Bhante, there are some recluses and priests who come to Kesa,putta. They expound and explain their own doctrines, but attack, revile, despise and reject the doctrines of others.

2.2 And then some other recluses and priests come to Kesa,putta [189] and they, too, expound and explain their own doctrines, but attack, revile, despise and reject the doctrines of others.

2.3 Bhante, we are uncertain and in doubt: Which of these good recluses speak truth and which speak falsehood?”

18 彼時，伽藍 [c3] 人各坐已定，佛為說法。19 勸發渴仰，成就歡 [c4] 喜。20 無量方便為彼說法。

21 勸發渴仰，成就歡 [c5] 喜已，默然而住。

22 時，伽藍人，佛為說法，勸發渴 [c6] 仰，成就歡喜已，23 各從坐起，偏袒著衣，叉手 [c7] 向佛，

24 白世尊曰：

25 “瞿曇，有一沙門梵志來詣 [c8] 伽藍，26 但自稱歎己所知見，而訾毀他所知 [c9] 所見。27 瞿曇，復有一沙門梵志來詣伽藍，亦自 [c10] 稱歎己所知見，而訾毀他所知所見。

28²⁰ 瞿曇，[c11] 我等聞已，便生疑惑，此沙門梵志何者為實？ [c12] 何者為虛？”

18 Then, when the Kālāmas had all sat down and settled, the Buddha taught them the Dharma. 19 The Buddha exhorted, encouraged, inspired, delighted them. 20 He taught them Dharma in countless skillful ways. 21 The Buddha, having taught Dharma, exhorting, encouraging, inspiring, delighting them, then remained silent.

22 Then, the Kālāmas, having been taught the Dharma by the Buddha, having been exhorted, encouraged, inspired, delighted, 23 one by one, rose from their seat, adjusted their robes to bare one shoulder, saluted the Buddha with their palms together; 24 said to the World Honoured One,

25 “Gotama, there was a recluse or brahmin who came to (us) Kālāmas. 26 He just praised his own knowledge and views, and disparaged the knowledge and views of others. 27 Again, Gotama, another recluse or brahmin came to (us) Kālāmas, and he, too, praised his own knowledge and views, and disparaged the knowledge and views of others.

28 Gotama, having heard them, we had this doubt, “Which of these recluses or brahmins is true [right], which of them false?”

²⁰ For tr of these 6 lines, see Part 2: tr of A 3.65,2.2 n.

THE 10 DOUBTFUL POINTS

3 “It is fitting that you are uncertain, that you doubt, Kālāmas. Doubt has arisen in you over what is doubtful.

THE 10 DOUBTFUL POINTS. Come Kālāmas:

- (1) Do not go by received tradition [aural tradition].
- (2) Do not go by lineage [successive tradition].
- (3) Do not go by hearsay.
- (4) Do not go by scriptural authority.
- (5) Do not go by pure reason [by logic].
- (6) Do not go by inference (and deduction).
- (7) Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious reasoning].
- (8) Do not go by acceptance of [being convinced of] a view after pondering on it.
- (9) Do not go by (another’s) seeming ability.
- (10) Do not go by the thought, ‘This recluse [holy man] is our teacher.’ [‘This recluse is respected by us.’]

[The 10 doubtful points are not found in the Chinese Āgama version.]

A close comparative of such texts may throw more light on this matter.

See SD 35.4a (1.1.4.4).

THE 3 UNWHOLESOME ROOTS

3.2 When you know for yourselves, Kālāmas, ‘These things are unwholesome. These things are blamable. These things are censured by the wise. These things, when undertaken and practised, bring about harm and suffering’—

Then, Kālāmas, you should abandon them.

29 世尊告曰：**30** “伽藍，汝等莫生疑惑。[c13] **31** 所以者何？**32** 因有疑惑，便生猶豫。**33** 伽藍，汝等 [c14] 自無淨智，**34** 為有後世，為無後世。

35 伽藍，汝 [c15] 等亦無淨智，所作有罪，所作無罪。

36 伽藍，當 [c16] 知諸業有三因：習、本、有。**37** 何云為三？

29 The World Honoured One told them, **30** “Kālāmas, don’t have these doubts. **31** Why is that? **32** As a result of having doubts, you will be hesitant. **33** Kālāmas, they come from your own lack of pure knowledge **34** regarding whether there is an after-life or no afterlife.

35 Kālāmas, you also lack pure knowledge about which actions are unwholesome and which are wholesome.

36 Kālāmas, you should know that all actions have 3 causes, habits, origins, becoming. **37** What are the 3?

4 What do you think, Kālāmas, when **greed** arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?”

“For his harm, bhante.”

This person, Kālāmas, who is greedy, overcome by greed, his mind controlled by it, *will destroy life, take what is not given, violate the women of others, and tell lies, and he will also make others to do likewise, which will bring about harm and suffering for a long time.*”

“Yes, bhante.”

5 “What do you think, Kālāmas, when **hatred** arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?”

“For his harm, bhante.”

“This person, Kālāmas, who is hateful, overcome by hatred, his mind controlled by it, will destroy life, take what is not given, violate the women of others, and tell lies, and he will also make others to do likewise, which will bring about harm and suffering for a long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

6 “What do you think, Kālāmas, when **delusion** arises in a person, is it for his good or for his harm?”

“For his harm, bhante.” [190]

“This person, Kālāmas, who is deluded, overcome by delusion, his mind controlled by it, will destroy life, take what is not given, violate the women of others, and tell lies, and he will also makes others do likewise, will bring about harm and suffering for a long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

38 伽藍，謂貪 [c17] 是諸業因，習、本、有。**39** 伽藍，恚及癡是諸業因，習、[c18] 本、有。

40 伽藍，貪者為貪所覆。**41** 心無厭足。**42** 或殺 [c19] 生、或不與取、或行邪淫、或知己妄言、或復飲 [c20] 酒。

43 伽藍，恚者為恚所覆。**44** 心無厭足。**45** 或殺生、[c21] 或不與取、或行邪淫、或知己妄言、或復飲 [c22] 酒。

46 伽藍，癡者為癡所覆。**47** 心無厭足。**48** 或殺生、[c23] 或不與取、或行邪淫、或知己妄言、或復飲 [c24] 酒。

38 Kālāmas, **greed** is a cause—habit, origin, becoming—of actions [karma]. **39** Kālāmas, **hatred** and **delusion** are causes—habits, origins, becoming—of actions.

40 Kālāmas, one **greedy** is overwhelmed by greed. **41** His heart is never satisfied. **42** Such a one may kill living beings, or take the not-given, or engage in sexual misconduct, or knowingly speak falsehood, or take intoxicants.

43 Kālāmas, one **hateful** is overwhelmed by hatred. **44** His heart is never satisfied. **45** *Such a one may kill living beings, or take the not-given, or engage in sexual misconduct, or knowingly speak falsehood, or take intoxicants.*

46 Kālāmas, one **deluded** is overwhelmed by delusion. **47** His heart is never satisfied. **48** *Such a one may kill living beings, or take the not-given, or engage in sexual misconduct, or knowingly speak falsehood, or take intoxicants.*

7 EMPHATIC AFFIRMATION. “What do you think, Kālāmas, are these things wholesome or unwholesome?”

“Unwholesome, bhante.”

“Blamable or not blamable?”

“Blamable, bhante.”

“Censured or praised by the wise?”

“Censured by the wise, bhante.”

“These things, when undertaken and practised, do they bring about harm and suffering?”

“These things, bhante, when undertaken and practised, bring about harm and suffering for a long time.

So indeed it is to us in this matter.”

[MĀ 16 omits the 10 doubtful points.]

See note following T438c12 above.

8 “It is because of this, Kālāmas, that I say:

‘Come Kālāmas:

Do not go by aural tradition [received wisdom].

Do not go by lineage [successive tradition].

Do not go by hearsay.

Do not go by scriptural authority.

Do not go by pure reason.

Do not go by inference [by logic].

Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious reasoning].

Do not go by acceptance of [being convinced of] a view after pondering on it.

Do not go by (another’s) seeming ability.

Do not go by the thought, “This recluse is our teacher.” [“This recluse is respected by us.”]

When you know for yourselves, Kālāmas,
“These things are unwholesome. These things
are blamable. These things are censured by the
wise. These things, when undertaken and practised,
bring about harm and suffering.”

—Then Kālāmas, you should abandon them.’

—So I have spoken; it is for this reason that I
have spoken.

9 Come Kālāmas:

Do not go by aural tradition [received wisdom].

Do not go by lineage [successive tradition].

Do not go by hearsay.

Do not go by scriptural authority.

Do not go by pure reason.

Do not go by inference [by logic].

Do not go by reasoned thought [by specious
reasoning].

Do not go by acceptance of [being convinced of]
a view after pondering on it.

Do not go by (another’s) seeming ability.

Do not go by the thought, ‘This recluse is our
teacher.’ [‘This recluse is respected by us.’]

[MĀ 16 omits the 10 doubtful points.]

See note following T438c12 above.

THE 3 WHOLESOME STATES

9.2 When you know for yourselves, Kālāmas,
 ‘These things are wholesome. These things are
 not blamable. These things are praised by the wise.
 These things, when undertaken and practised, bring
 good and happiness.’

Then Kālāmas, you should live cultivating them.

10 What do you think, Kālāmas, this person, in
 whom **non-greed** [charity] arises, does it arise for
 his good or for his harm?”

“For his good, bhante.”

“This person, Kālāmas, who is not greedy, not
 overcome by greed, his thoughts not controlled by
 it, *will not destroy life, will not take what is not
 given, will not violate the women of others, and will
 not tell lies*, and he will also not make others to do
 likewise, **[191]** which will bring good and happiness
 for the long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

11 “What do you think, Kālāmas, this person, in
 whom **non-hatred** [lovingkindness] arises, does it
 arise for his good or for his harm?”

“For his good, bhante.”

“What do you think, Kālāmas, this person, who
 is not hateful, not overcome by hatred, his mind not
 controlled by it, will not destroy life, will not take
 what is not given, will not violate the women of
 others, and will not tell lies, and he will also not
 make others to do likewise, which will bring good
 and happiness for the long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

12 “This person, Kālāmas, in whom **non-delusion** [wisdom] arises, does it arise for his good or for his harm?”

“For his good, bhante.”

“This person, Kālāmas, who is not deluded, not overcome by delusion, his mind not controlled by it, will not destroy life, will not take what is not given, will not violate the women of others, and will not tell lies, and he will also not make others to do likewise, which will bring good and happiness for the long time.”

“Yes, bhante.”

[The section on the 10 courses of karma found only in MĀ 16]

49 伽藍，多聞聖弟子離殺斷殺，棄捨刀杖。

[c25] 50 有慚有愧，有慈悲心，饒益一切，乃至蝼蟲。

[c26] 51 彼於殺生淨除其心。

52 伽藍，多聞聖弟子離不與取，斷不與取，與之乃取，53 樂於與取，常 [c28] 好布施，54 歡喜無悋，不望其報。55 彼於不與取 [c29] 淨除其心。

56 伽藍，多聞聖弟子離 [439a01] 非梵行，斷非梵行，勤修梵行，57 精勤妙行，58 清淨無穢，離 [a02] 欲斷婬。59 彼於非梵行淨除其心。

would be simply *kāmesu micchācāra*, “sexual misconduct.”

The 10 wholesome courses of karma

49 (1) Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple [who has heard much], abstains from **killing**, gives up killing, puts aside sword and staff. 50 With moral shame, moral fear, lovingkindness, compassion, he is beneficent to all living beings, even insects [84]. 51 He purifies his mind regarding killing living beings.

52 (2) Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple abstains from **taking the not-given**, gives up taking the not-given, takes (only) the given. 53 He is happy have a share in giving, and always loves doing charity. 54 Rejoicing in having no stinginess, he expects no reward. 55 He purifies his mind regarding taking the not-given.

56 (3) Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple abstains from **incelibacy**,²¹ gives up incelibacy, diligently cultivates celibacy. 57 He is diligent in his celibacy, energetic in this good conduct. 58 He is pure and undefiled, having abandoned sensual desires. 59 He purifies his mind regarding incelibacy.

²¹ 非梵行 *fēi fàn xíng* (非 “not,” 梵行 *brahmacariya*) incelibacy. This seems out of place here since the Kālāmas are mostly family people. The Pali term here

60 伽藍，多聞 [a03] 聖弟子離妄言，斷妄言，真諦言，61 樂真諦，[a04]住真諦不移動，62 一切可信，不欺世間。63 彼於妄言淨除其心。

64 伽藍，多聞聖弟子離兩 [a06] 舌，斷兩舌，行不兩舌。65 不破壞他。

66 不聞此 [a07] 語彼，欲破壞此，67 不聞彼語此，欲破壞彼。

68 [a08] 離者欲合，合者歡喜。69 不作群黨，不樂群黨，[a09] 不稱群黨。70 彼於兩舌淨除其心。

71 伽藍，多聞 [a10] 聖弟子離麤言，斷麤言。72 若有所言，辭氣麤 [a11] 獷，惡聲逆耳，73 眾所不喜，眾所不愛，使他苦 [a12] 惱，令不得定。74 斷如是言。

75 若有所說，清和 [a13] 柔潤，76 順耳入心，可喜可愛，使他安樂。77 言聲 [a14] 具了，不使人畏，令他得定。說如是言。

78 彼於 [a15] 麤言淨除其心。

60 (4) Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple abstains from **false speech**, gives up false speech. He speaks truthfully. 61 He enjoys the truth, is firmly established in the truth. 62 He is well trustworthy, and does not deceive the world. 63 He purifies his mind regarding false speech.

64 (5) Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple abstains from **slander**, gives up slandering. He does not engage in slander. 65 He does not divide others.

66 Hearing something here, he does not tell it there, with the desire to divide them from those here. 67 He does not hear something there and tell it here, with the desire to divide them from those there.

68 He wishes to unite the divided, rejoicing in unity. 69 He does not take sides, and does not enjoy taking sides [partisanship]. 70 He purifies his mind regarding slander.

71 (6) Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple abstains from **harsh speech**, gives up harsh speech. 72 When he speaks, he avoids using words rough and rude, offensive words that hurt the ear, 73 that people neither enjoy nor desire, that cause suffering and vexation in others, that is not conducive to mental concentration. 74 He avoids such speech.

75 When he speaks, his words are clear, peaceful, gentle, beneficial, 76 pleasant to the ear and touches the heart, enjoyable and desirable, evoking peace and joy in others, 77 words that clarify, that do not evoke fear in others, that is conducive to mental concentration. 78 He purifies his mind regarding harsh speech.

79 伽藍，多聞聖弟子離綺語，[a16] 斷綺語。
80 時說、真說、法說、義說、止息說。81 樂止
[a17] 息說，事順時得宜，善教善訶。82 彼於綺語淨
[a18] 除其心。

83 伽藍，多聞聖弟子離貪伺，斷貪伺。[a19] 84 心
不懷諍。85 見他財物諸生活具，不起貪伺，
[a20] 欲：“令我得。”86 彼於貪伺淨除其心。

87 伽藍，多聞[a21] 聖弟子離恚，斷恚。88 有慚有
愧，有慈悲心，饒[a22] 益一切，乃至蠅虫。89 彼於
嫉恚淨除其心。

90 伽 [a23] 藍，多聞聖弟子離邪見，斷邪見。91 行
於正見 [a24]，而不顛倒。92 如是見，如是說：

93 ‘有施、有齋，亦有 [a25] 呪說。94 有善惡業
報。95 有此世彼世。96 有父有 [a26] 母。97 世有真
人往至善處；善去、善向。98 此世彼 [a27] 世，
自知自覺，自作證成就遊’。99 彼於邪見淨 [a28] 除
其心。

²² 有慚有愧 *yǒu cán yǒu kuì* (P *hiri,ottappa*).

²³ The right view stock passage follows: cf M 177,7 (SD 6.10); SD 10.16 (1.8.2).

²⁴ 呪說 *zhòu shuō*, lit, “*dharanī/mantra talk*.” No Pali cognate or parallel of this. The Pali here has “There is

79 (7) Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple abstains from **frivolous chatter**, gives up frivolous chatter. 80 He speaks at the right time, speaks truthfully, speaks the Dharma, meaningful and calming. 81 He delights in words that calm. He teaches well, admonishes well, at the right time, in the right way. 82 He purifies his mind regarding idle chatter.

83 (8) Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple abstains from **covetousness**, gives up covetousness. 84 His heart is conflict-free. 85 Seeing other’s wealth or lifestyle, he covets it not, wishing: ‘If only I can have that!’ 86 He purifies his mind regarding covetousness.

87 (9) Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple is free from **ill will**, gives up ill will. 88 With moral shame and moral fear,²² lovingkindness and compassion, he is beneficent to all living beings, even insects [45]. 89 He purifies his mind regarding ill will.

90 (10) Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple is free from **wrong view**, gives up wrong view. 91 He conducts himself in **right view**; hence, he is not confused. 92 Thus viewing, thus speaking, (he says):²³

93 ‘There is giving, there is observance (of precepts), there is mantra-recitation.²⁴ 94 There are deeds, wholesome and unwholesome, and their fruits. 95 There is this world, there is the other-world [after-life]. 96 There is father, there is mother. 97 There are

what is given, what is offered, what is sacrificed” (*atthi dinnam, atthi yittham, atthi hutam*) (M 177,7), SD 6.10.

13 EMPHATIC AFFIRMATION. "What do you think, Kālāmas, are these things wholesome or unwholesome?"

"Wholesome, bhante."

"Blamable or not blamable?"

"Not blamable, bhante."

"Censured or praised by the wise?"

"Praised by the wise, bhante."

"These things, when undertaken and practised, do they bring good and happiness?"

"These things, bhante, when undertaken and practised, bring good and happiness.

So indeed it is to us in this matter."

14 "It is because of this, Kālāmas, that I say:

'Come Kālāmas:

Do not go by aural tradition [received wisdom].

Do not go by lineage.

Do not go by hearsay.

²⁵ What follows seem to be an abbreviated version of the 5 hindrances (*pañca nīvaraṇa*): (1) sensual desire (*kāma-c, chanda*); (2) ill will (*vyāpāda*); (3) restless and

100 如是，伽藍，多聞聖弟子成就身淨 [a29] 業、成就口、意淨業。**101** 離恚離諍，除去睡眠。**102** 無 [439b01] 調貢高、斷疑、度慢。**103** 正念正智，無有愚癡。

true individuals in this world who are heading for true attainment; who are well gone and well directed; **98** who in this world and the other world have *(won) self-knowledge and self-awakening, and dwells thus self-realized.*' [8]. **99** He purifies his mind regarding wrong views.

100 Thus, Kālāmas, a learned noble disciple attains purity of bodily conduct, attains purity of verbal and mental conduct. **101** He gives up ill will and strife, discards sloth and torpor.²⁵ **102** He is without restlessness and conceit; he cuts off doubt. He rises above arrogance. **103** He has right mindfulness and right knowledge, and has no delusion.

worry (*uddhacca, kukkucca*); (4) sloth and torpor (*thīna, middha*); (5) doubt (*vicikicchā*): D 13,30 (SD 1.8); SD 32.1.

Do not go by scriptural authority.

Do not go by pure reason.

Do not go by inference.

Do not go by reasoned thought.

Do not go by acceptance of a view after
pondering on it.

Do not go by (another's) seeming ability.

Do not go by the thought, "This recluse is our
teacher." ["This recluse is respected by us."]

When you know for yourselves, Kālāmas,
'*These things are wholesome. These things are not
blamable. These things are praised by the wise.
These things, when undertaken and practised, bring
good and happiness.*'

—Then Kālāmas, you should live [192] cultivat-
ing them.

—So I have spoken; it is for this reason that I
have spoken.

[MĀ 16 omits the 10 doubtful points.]

See note following T438c12 above.

THE DIVINE ABODES

15 (1) Lovingkindness. Now, Kālāmas, that noble
disciple—thus free from covetousness, free from ill
will, unconfused, fully aware, mindful—dwells per-
vading one quarter with a mind of lovingkindness:
likewise the 2nd quarter, the 3rd quarter and the 4th
quarter.

Thus above, below, across, everywhere and to
everyone as well as to himself, he dwells pervading
the whole world with lovingkindness that is vast,
great, boundless, free from hate, free from ill will.

[b02] **104** 彼心與慈俱，遍滿一方成就遊。**105** 如
是，二三 [b03] 四方，四維上下，普周一切。**106** 心與
慈俱，**107** 無結 [b04] 無怨，無恚無諍。**108** 極廣甚
大，無量善修，遍滿 [b05] 一切世間成就遊。

109 如是悲、喜，心與捨俱。

104 He dwells pervading one quarter with a heart
of lovingkindness. **105** Likewise, the 2nd, the 3rd, and
the 4th quarters, above and below, all around and
everywhere. **106** With a heart filled with lovingkind-
ness, **107** free from fetters and resentment, without
ill will, without conflict [quarrel]. **108** He dwells
boundless, exalted, immeasurable, well cultivated,
pervading the whole world (with lovingkindness).

109 So it is with a heart of **compassion** ...

〈 ... **joy** ... 〉

〈 ... and **equanimity** ... , 〉

(2) Compassion. Now, Kālāmas, that noble disciple—thus free from covetousness, free from ill will, unconfused, fully aware, mindful—dwells pervading one quarter with a mind of **compassion**: likewise the 2nd quarter, the 3rd quarter and the 4th quarter.

Thus above, below, across, everywhere and to everyone as well as to himself, he dwells pervading the whole world with compassion that is vast, great, boundless, free from hate, free from ill will.

(3) Joy. Now, Kālāmas, that noble disciple—thus free from covetousness, free from ill will, unconfused, fully aware, mindful—dwells pervading one quarter with a mind of **joy**: likewise the 2nd quarter, the 3rd quarter and the 4th quarter.

Thus above, below, across, everywhere and to everyone as well as to himself, he dwells pervading the whole world with altruistic joy that is vast, great, boundless, free from hate, free from ill will.

(4) Equanimity. Now, Kālāmas, that noble disciple—thus free from covetousness, free from ill will, unconfused, fully aware, mindful—dwells pervading one quarter with a mind of **equanimity**: likewise the 2nd quarter, the 3rd quarter and the 4th quarter.

Thus above, below, across, everywhere and to everyone as well as to himself, he dwells pervading the whole world with equanimity that is vast, great, boundless, free from hate, free from ill will.

110 無 [b06] 結無怨，無恚無諍。111 極廣甚大，無量善修，遍 [b07] 滿一切世間成就遊。

[The Chinese Āgama version of the 4 self-assurance, called “peaceful abodes,” is abbreviated here.]

110 *free from fetters and resentment, without ill will, without conflict.* 111 *He dwells boundless, exalted, immeasurable, well cultivated, pervading the whole world (with compassion).*

[109 So it is with a heart of **joy** ...

110 *free from fetters and resentment, without ill will, without conflict.* 111 *He dwells boundless, exalted, immeasurable, well cultivated, pervading the whole world (with joy).*]

[109 So it is with a heart of **equanimity** ...

110 *free from fetters and resentment, without ill will, without conflict.* 111 *He dwells boundless, exalted, immeasurable, well cultivated, pervading the whole world (with equanimity).*]

THE 4 SELF-ASSURANCES

15.2 Kālāmas, this noble disciple—his mind without hate thus, without ill will thus, uncorrupted thus, purified thus—wins these 4 self-assurances right here in this life:

(1) The 1st self-assurance

16 [The 1st self-assurance he has won is this:]

‘If there is an afterlife, and if good and evil deeds bear fruit and results, it is possible that when the body breaks up, after death, I shall re-appear in a state of joy, a happy destination, in heaven.’

This is the 1st self-assurance he has won.

(2) The 2nd self-assurance

[The 2nd self-assurance he has won is this:]

‘If there is no afterlife, and if good and evil deeds do not bear fruit and results, still right here in this life, free from hate, from ill will, I live happily.’

This is the 2nd self-assurance he has won.

112 如是，伽藍，多聞聖弟 [b08] 子心無結無怨，無恚無諍。**113** 便得四安隱住 [b09] 處。

114 ²⁶云何為四？

115 ‘有此世彼世，有善惡業報。**116** [b10] 我得此正見相應業，受持具足，**117** 身壞命終，必 [b11] 至善處，乃生天上。’

118 如是，伽藍，多聞聖弟子 [b12] 心無結無怨，無恚無諍。

119 是謂得第一安隱 [b13] 住處。

120 ²⁷復次，伽藍，‘無此世彼世，無善惡業報。[b14] **121** 如是我於現法中，非以此故為他所毀。

122 但 [b15] 為正智所稱譽，**123** 精進人，正見人說其有。’

124 如 [b16] 是，伽藍。多聞聖弟子心無結無怨，無恚無 [b17] 諍。

125 是謂得第二安隱住處。

112 Thus, Kālāmas, the heart of a learned noble disciple, without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will, **113** readily gains **the 4 safe abodes**.²⁸ [141-142]

114 What are the four?

115 (1) ‘If there’s the present world and another world, and there are the fruits of good and bad actions, **116** then, I have this right view regarding karma, fully keeping to it. **117** When my body breaks up, with life’s end, I will surely go to a good state, even arise in a heaven.’ [144-146]

118 Thus, Kālāmas, *the heart of a learned noble disciple is without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will.*

119 This is the meaning of gaining **the 1st safe abode**.

120 (2) Again, Kālāmas, ‘If there’s *neither* this world *nor* another world, there are *no* fruits of good and bad actions, **121** then, in this Dharma, I am not censured by others for this view, **122** but praised for having right knowledge, **123** as one who is diligent, who has right view.’ [149-152]

124 Thus, Kālāmas, *the heart of a learned noble disciple is without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will.*

125 This is the meaning of gaining **the 2nd safe abode**.

²⁶ For a tr, see Sutta §16 (1) n.

²⁷ For a tr, see Sutta §16 (2) n.

²⁸ “Safe abodes,” 安隱住處 *ān yīn zhùchù* = “self-assurances” (*assāsa*) or “safe bets,” at §15.2 [com, SD 35.4a (3)].

(3) The 3rd self-assurance

[The 3rd assurance he has won is this:]

‘Suppose evil does come to the evil-doer: but how can I—who intends no evil towards anyone, who has done no evil—be touched by suffering?’

This is the 3rd self-assurance he has won.

(4) The 4th self-assurance

[The 4th assurance he has won is this:]

‘Suppose evil does not come to the evil-doer: then, right here in this life, I see myself purified both ways.’

This is the 4th self-assurance he has won.

Kālāmas, this noble disciple—his mind without hate thus, without ill will thus, uncorrupted thus, purified thus—wins these 4 self-assurances right here in this life.”

126²⁹復次，伽藍，‘若有 [b18] 所作，必不作惡，我不念惡。**127** 所以者何？自不 [b19] 作惡，苦何由生？’

128 如是，伽藍，多聞聖弟子心 [b20] 無結無怨，無恚無諍。

129 是謂得第三安隱住 [b21] 處。

130³⁰復次，伽藍，‘若有所作，必不作惡，**131** 我不 [b22] 犯世，怖與不怖。**132** 常當慈愍一切世間。**133** 我心 [b23] 不與眾生共諍，**134** 無濁歡悅。’

135 如是，伽藍，多聞 [b24] 聖弟子心無結無怨，無恚無諍。

136 是謂得第 [b25] 四安隱住處。

137 如是，伽藍，多聞聖弟子心無 [b26] 結無怨，無恚無諍。

138 是謂得四安隱住處。”

126 (3) Again, Kālāmas, (he thinks,) ‘Whatever I’ve done, I have certainly done no evil, and thought no evil. **127** Why is that? Since I have done no evil, from where will suffering arise for me?’

128 Thus, Kālāmas, *the heart of a learned noble disciple is without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will.*

129 This is the meaning of gaining the 3rd safe abode.

130 (4) Again, Kālāmas, ‘Whatever I may have done, I have certainly done no evil, **131** I have not violated (the laws of) the world, either out of fear or from lack of fear. **132** I always have lovingkindness and compassion for the whole world. **133** My mind is free of conflict with beings, **134** untainted, joyful.’

135 Thus, Kālāmas, *the heart of a learned noble disciple is without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will.*

136 This is the meaning of gaining the 4th safe abode.

137 Thus, Kālāmas, *the heart of a learned noble disciple is without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will.*

138 This is the meaning of gaining the 4 safe abodes.”

²⁹ For a tr, see Sutta §16 (3) n.

³⁰ For a tr of this passage, see Sutta §16 (4) n.

(1) The 1st self-assurance he has won is this:

‘If there is an afterlife, and if good and evil deeds bear fruit and results, it is possible that when the body breaks up, after death, I shall re-appear in a state of joy, a happy destination, in heaven.’

This is the 1st self-assurance he has won.

THE KĀLĀMAS’ EXULTATION

17 “So it is, bhante! So it is, well-farer!

Indeed, bhante, this noble disciple—his mind without hate thus, without ill will thus, uncorrupted thus, purified thus—wins **[193]** these 4 self-assurances right here in this life:

(2) The 2nd self-assurance he has won is this:

‘If there is *no* afterlife, and if good and evil deeds do not bear fruit and results, still right here in this life, free from hate, from ill will, I live happily.’

This is the 2nd self-assurance he has won.

139 伽 [b27] 藍白世尊曰：

140 “如是，瞿曇，多聞聖弟子心無 [b28] 結無怨，無恚無諍。**141** 得四安隱住處。

142 云何為 [b29] 四？

143 ‘有此世彼世，有善惡業報，**144** 我得此正見 [439c01] 相應業，受持具足。**145** 身壞命終，必至善處，乃至 [c02] 天上。’

146 如是，瞿曇，多聞聖弟子心無結無怨，[c03] 無恚無諍。

147 是謂得第一安隱住處。

148 復次，瞿 [c04] 曇，‘若無此世彼世，無善惡業報，**149** 如是我於現法 [c05] 中，非以此故為他所毀，**150** 但為正智所稱 [c06] 譽，**151** 精進人，正見人說其有。’

152 如是，瞿曇，多聞 [c07] 聖弟子心無結無怨，無恚無諍。

153 是謂得第 [c08] 二安隱住處。

139 The Kālāmas said to the World Honoured One,

140 “Thus, Gotama, *the heart of a learned noble disciple, without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will*, **141** readily gains **the 4 safe abodes**. [112-113]

142 What are the four?

143 (1) ‘*If there’s the present world and another world, and there are the fruits of good and bad actions, 144 then, I have this right view regarding karma, fully keeping to it. 145 When my body breaks up, with life’s end, I will surely go to a good state, even arise in a heaven.*’ [115-117]

146 Thus, Gotama, *the heart of a learned noble disciple is without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will.*

147 This is the meaning of gaining the **1st safe abode**.

148 (2) Again, Gotama, ‘*If there’s neither this world nor another world, there are no fruits of good and bad actions, 149 then, in this Dharma, I am not censured by others for this view, 150 but praised for having right knowledge, 151 as one who is diligent who has right view.*’ [120-124]

152 Thus, Gotama, *the heart of a learned noble disciple is without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will.*

153 This is the meaning of gaining the **2nd safe abode**.

(3) The 3rd self-assurance he has won is this:

‘Suppose evil does come to the evil-doer; but how can I—who intends no evil towards anyone, who has done no evil—be touched by suffering?’

This is the 3rd self-assurance he has won.

154 復次，瞿曇，‘若有所作，必不作 [c09] 惡，我不念惡。**155** 所以者何？自不作惡，苦何由 [c10] 生？’

156 如是，瞿曇，多聞聖弟子心無結無怨，無 [c11] 恚無諍。

157 是謂得第三安隱住處。

(4) The 4th self-assurance he has won is this:

‘Suppose evil does *not* come to the evil-doer: then, right here in this life, I see myself purified both ways.’

This is the 4th self-assurance he has won.

158 復次，瞿曇，[c12] ‘若有所作，必不作惡，**159** 我不犯世，怖與不 [c13] 怖。**160** 常當慈愍一切世間。**161** 我心不與眾生共 [c14] 諍，**162** 無濁歡悅。’

163 如是，瞿曇，多聞聖弟子心無 [c15] 結無怨，無恚無諍。

164 是謂得第四安隱住處。

165 [c16] 如是，瞿曇，多聞聖弟子心無結無怨，無恚 [c17] 無諍。

166 是謂得四安隱住處

154 (3) Again, Gotama, ‘Whatever I’ve done, I have certainly done no evil, and thought no evil. **155** Why is that? Since I have done no evil, from where will suffering arise for me?’

156 Thus, Gotama, *the heart of a learned noble disciple is without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will.*

157 This is the meaning of gaining the 3rd safe abode.

158 (4) Again, Gotama, Again, Kālāmas, ‘Whatever I may have done, I have certainly done no evil, **159** I have not violated (the laws of) the world, either out of fear or from lack of fear. **161** I always have lovingkindness and compassion for the whole world. **161** My mind is free of conflict with beings, **162** untainted, joyful.’

163 Thus, Gotama, the heart of the noble disciple, much heard, is without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will.

164 This is the meaning of gaining the 4th safe abode.³¹

165 Thus, Gotama, the heart of the noble disciple, much heard, is without fetters, without enmity, without anger, without ill will.

166 This is the meaning of gaining the 4 safe abodes.

Indeed, bhante, this noble disciple—his mind without hate thus, without ill will thus, uncorrupted thus, purified thus—wins these 4 self-assurances right here in this life.

³¹ §§163 f repeats as §§165 f in the Chinese.

167 THE KĀLĀMAS' REALIZATION

168 瞿曇，我已知；169 善 [c18] 逝，我已解。

168 Gotama, we³³ have realized it, 169 Sugata [well gone]; we have understood it.³⁴

The Kālāmas go for refuge

18 “Excellent, bhante Gotama! Excellent, bhante!

Just as if, bhante, one were to place upright what had been overturned,

or, were to reveal what was hidden,

or, were to show the way to one who was lost,

or, were to hold up a lamp in the dark so that

those with eyes can see forms,

in the same way, in numerous ways, has the Dharma been made clear by master Gotama.

May master Gotama remember us as lay followers who have gone to him for refuge from this day forth for life.”

pañcamāṃ

070109 070328 081218 101222 110906a 150114
190301 211210

170 世尊，我等盡自歸佛、法及比丘 [c19] 眾。

171 唯願世尊受我等為優婆塞。

172 從今日始，[c20] 終身自歸，乃至命盡。

173 佛說如是。

174 一切伽藍人 [c21] 及諸比丘聞佛所說，歡喜奉行。[c22]

伽藍經第六竟
(一千九百八十七字)³²

170 World Honoured One, we all go for refuge in the Buddha, the Dharma and the sangha of monks.

171 May the World Honoured One accept us as lay followers. 172 Starting today, we go (to the 3 jewels) for refuge until life's end.”

173 The Buddha spoke thus.

174 All the Kālāmas and the monks who heard the Buddha taught, rejoiced and practised accordingly.

The Kālāma Sutta no. 6 is concluded.

³² “1987 Chinese characters” (scholiast).

³³ 我 *wǒ*, “I” (sg) should be read as plural, 我等 *wǒděng*, “we.”

³⁴ This remarkable outburst seems to suggest that those individuals have attained streamwinning [2.4].