

# 5

## Soṇa,daṇḍa Sutta

The Discourse to Soṇa,daṇḍa | D 4

Theme: The characteristics of a true brahmin

Translated by Piya Tan ©2009, rev 2010

### 1 Sutta summary and places

**1.1 SUTTA SUMMARY.** The Soṇa,daṇḍa Sutta (D 4) records the meeting between the Buddha and the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, the lord of Campā, a prosperous town in Aṅga country [§1]. Upon learning that his townsfolk are going in droves to see the Buddha, Soṇa,daṇḍa, too decides to go [§§2-3]. His brahmin peers object to his going, but he is able to convince them that the Buddha has even more noble qualities than himself [§§4-7].

However, on the way there, Soṇa,daṇḍa vacillates as he begins to feel unconfident. He worries that he would ask the wrong questions, or in unable to answer the Buddha’s question [§8]. All this would make him look bad before his peers [2.2]. His worries build up as those in the assembly greet the Buddha; he hopes that the Buddha would ask him something he is familiar with, such as the Vedas [§9-10].

The Buddha, reading Soṇa,daṇḍa’s mind, puts him at ease by asking him about the qualities of a brahmin, which delights Soṇa,daṇḍa and he answers the Buddha [§§11-13]. Soṇa,daṇḍa mentions five qualities that make a true brahmin [§§14-15], but on the Buddha’s questions, he pares these down to two qualities, that is, moral virtue and wisdom [§16].

The brahmins present protest that Soṇa,daṇḍa should omit the other qualities [§17]. The Buddha declares that Soṇa,daṇḍa is wise enough to speak for himself [§18], but Soṇadaṇḍa interrupts the Buddha to make his own defence [§19], pointing out that his own nephew, Aṅgaka, is an exemplary not because of the training he has given Aṅgaka, but because he is himself morally virtuous and wise [§20a]. Soṇa,daṇḍa then declares that, like everyone else, Aṅgaka would be immoral if he breaks any of the precepts [§20b], and adds that moral virtue and wisdom are mutually dependent and inseparable [§21].

The Buddha concurs [§22], and goes on to expound the “fruits of recluseship” [§§22-23]. At the end of the teaching, Soṇa,daṇḍa takes refuge and invites the Buddha for a dawn offering [§§24-25]. Soṇa,daṇḍa then confides in the Buddha that he would not openly show his respects to the Buddha, because he fears the disapproval of his peers and this would affect his status and wealth, and that he would do so covertly [§26]. The Buddha gives his closing discourse and departs [§27].

#### 1.2 KEY PLACES

**1.2.1 Campā.** Campā, the capital of Aṅga (one of the 16 Great States) (*mahā janapada*),<sup>1</sup> was located on the east bank of the river Campā (probably modern Candan and the Ganges; J 4:454), which formed the eastern boundary of Magadha. It is very probably today marked by the villages of Campānagara and Campā,pura, 24 mi (34 km) east of modern Bhagalpur.

In the **Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16), Ānanda mentions it as the first of 6 great cities (where the Buddha should pass away at).<sup>2</sup> Campā is also said to be one of another 6 great cities, that is, those built by Mahā Govinda (**Mahā Govinda Sutta**, D 19).<sup>3</sup> From the **Soṇa,daṇḍa Sutta** (D 4), we know that during the Buddha’s time, Campā owed allegiance to the rajah Bimbisāra of Magadha, who gave it as a fief (*brahma,deyya*) to Soṇa,daṇḍa (D 4,1/1:111).

<sup>1</sup> SD 9 (16a).

<sup>2</sup> D 16,5.17/2:146), SD 9.

<sup>3</sup> D 19,36/2:235 (SD 63.4).

**The Vividha,tirtha Kalpa** (a Jaina book on sacred places) tells us that Ajataśatru (Kunika), Bimbisāra' son, abandoned Rāj,grha upon his father's death and made Campā his capital.<sup>4</sup> In the Jātakas, it is called Kāḷa,campā, and **the Mahā Janaka Jātaka** (J 539) speaks of its gate, watch-tower and walls (J 539/6:42).

In ancient times, Campā grew wealthy through maritime trade with Suvaṇṇa,bhūmi (SE Asia) (J 6:-539). Some say that sailors or emigrants could have founded its namesake **Champa** in SE Asia.<sup>5</sup> Champa (approx 7<sup>th</sup>-1832), an Indianized state of Malayo-Polynesian kingship, in what is now southern and central Vietnam, reached its height in the 9th-10<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>6</sup>

**1.2.2 Gaggārā lotus lake.** **The Gaggārā lotus lake** (*gaggārā pokkharanī*) was outside Campā. The Commentary says that queen Gaggārā had it excavated, and adds that on its banks was a grove of champa trees (Malay "cempaka," *Michelia champaka*), renowned for the fragrance of its beautiful white flowers (DA 1:279). When visiting the area, the Buddha would stay there.<sup>7</sup>

Gaggārā, together with the one at Jeta,vana, are cited as examples of very beautiful lotus lakes (AA 2:35). Monks who have difficulty meditating found it conducive for their practice (SnA 1:17).

Amongst the discourses given on its banks are **the Soṇa,daṇḍa Sutta** (D 4/1:111), **the Das'uttara Sutta** (D 34/3:272), **the Kandaraka Sutta** (M 51.1/1:339), **the Karaṇḍava Sutta** (A 8.10/4:168), and **the Bāhuna Sutta** (A 10.81/5:151). A number of teachings centering around the monk poet **Vaṅḡisa** are located there (S 1:195; Tha 1252; Tha 3:197); and **Kassapa,gotta** visits the Buddha there, too (V 1:312).

## 2 Soṇa,daṇḍa

**2.1 SOṆA,DAṆḌA'S PERSONALITY.** Evidently, in the Canon as we have it, Soṇa,daṇḍa appears only in **the Soṇa,daṇḍa Sutta** (D 4). All that we know about him, comes from this one source. Like Pokkhāra,sāti, the lord of Ukkaṭṭhā, of **the Ambaṭṭha Sutta** (D 3),<sup>8</sup> Soṇa,daṇḍa of Campā, too, received his fiefdom (*brahma,deyya*) from the rajah Bimbisāra [§1].

What strikes us most about Soṇa,daṇḍa is his attitude to the Buddha and the Teaching. The following points show his apparently negative idiosyncrasies:

- §8 Soṇa,daṇḍa is worried that he would humiliate himself before his peers if he does not show himself enough to discourse with the Buddha. He thinks of turning back, but is afraid of losing face in doing so.
- §10 Soṇa,daṇḍa finally meets the Buddha, but still has his fears of losing face.
- §19 Soṇa,daṇḍa stops the Buddha from speaking in his (Soṇa,daṇḍa's) defence, and speaks for himself. (The positive thing is that he proves his case by pointing to Aṅgaka's moral virtue and learning as key hallmarks of a true brahmin.)
- §26 Soṇa,daṇḍa confides in the Buddha that he would not openly show deference to the Buddha for fear of displeasing his peers; as such, he would do this only covertly.

Soṇa,daṇḍa's **fear of losing face** is motivated by his desire for respect and patronage of his peers, without which his status and wealth would diminish. After all, he is the lord of Campā, a fief offered to

<sup>4</sup> BC Law, *Some Jaina Canonical Sūtras*, Bombay, 1949: 176.

<sup>5</sup> *Indian Antiquary* 6:229; Yijing 58; Nundolal Dey, "Notes on Ancient Aṅga," *Journal of the Asiatic Soc, Bengal*, 1914.

<sup>6</sup> See BC Law, *Geography of Early Buddhism*, 1932: 6-8; Jack Finegan, *An Archaeological History of Religions of Indian Asia*, NY, 1989: 84 f.

<sup>7</sup> DA 1:280; MA 3:1.

<sup>8</sup> D 3,1.2/1:87 (SD 21.3).

him by the rajah Bimbisāra. This kind of emotion is clearly motivated by “social fearfulness” (*sārajjā*), which has been more fully discussed elsewhere.<sup>9</sup> Suffice it here for us to note the teachings of **the Sārajjā Sutta** (A 5.101), where intrepidity (*vesārajjā*) is given as the opposite of social fearfulness, that is, full confidence or intrepidity.<sup>10</sup>

**2.2 IS SOṆA,DAṆḌA STATUS-CONSCIOUS?** Near the end of the discourse [§26], Soṇa,daṇḍa is recorded as telling the Buddha that his wealth depends on his reputation amongst the brahmins. As such, he would not be publicly demonstrative of showing respect to the Buddha. While this may reflect a social reality of the Buddha’s time, it should be seen in a humorous light, even with compassion, as they reflect an inner spiritual lack.<sup>11</sup>

However, the Commentary explains the reason for Soṇa,daṇḍa’s attitude as that he would be saluting someone *young enough to be his grandson* (DA 292), which is, of course, possible—which means that the Soṇa,daṇḍa Sutta records events very early in the Ministry.<sup>12</sup> Another piece of internal evidence for this is that Soṇa,daṇḍa received his fief from the rajah Bimbisāra<sup>13</sup> [§1].

If we accept this as true, then T W Rhys Davids thinks, “It will be seen from this section that Soṇa,daṇḍa is represented as being a convert only to a limited extent. He still keeps on his school of Vedic studies, and is keenly anxious to retain the good opinion of his students, and of other Brahmins.” (D:RD 1:159 n).

While it may be true that Soṇa,daṇḍa is “a convert in a limited extent”—unlike, for example, the brahmin Pokkhara,sāti, who becomes a streamwinner<sup>14</sup>—Soṇa,daṇḍa remains a worldling (*puthujjana*).<sup>15</sup> However, it is unattested whether he returns to his old brahminical ways. All we can read from this passage is that he is trying to balance his career with his faith. We might have some social insight into his situation if we re-read the above section, replacing “vehicle” with “car,” “assembly” with Parliament or Congress. Soṇa,daṇḍa, concerned more with his status and career, might well be what we today would call an entrepreneur CEO, a politician or a local representative, that is, a VIP Buddhist.

Having said that, it is also obvious that Soṇa,daṇḍa is a man of his world (dependent on the approval and support of his peers so that his wealth grows), yet trying to get the best of both worlds, the mundane and the spiritual—and there are numerous Soṇa,daṇḍas even in our midst. In his pioneer translation of this sutta, T W Rhys Davids (1899) observes:

<sup>9</sup> See **Piṇḍolya S** (S 22.80), SD 28.9a (3).

<sup>10</sup> “**Intrepidity**” (*vesārajjā*) or “moral courage.” The term basically means “free from *sārajjā*”; but is grammatically an abstract formation from *visārada*, often referring to the Buddha’s or an arhat’s perfect self-confidence or intrepidity, which are detailed in **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,22-28/1:71 f). There are the 4 confidences, viz: (1) the highest knowledge, (2) the state of having all the influxes destroyed; (3) recognizing of obstacles, and (4) recognition and teaching the way to awakening: see also D 1:110; M 1:380; A 2:13, 3:297 f, 4:83, 210, 213; Pm 2:194; Nc 466; DA 1:278; KhpA 104; VvA 213; J 2:27; DhA 1:86. See **Sārajjā S** (A 5.101) & SD 28.9a(3): *Sārajjā*; and SD 40a.8 (5.6): Independent realization.

<sup>11</sup> Cf Mahā Brahma’s reaction (by proclaiming his divine status in so many words) & also the inquiring monk who sought out the gods first before questioning the Buddha himself: see **Kevaḍḍha S** (D 11/1:211-223), SD 1.7.

<sup>12</sup> See D:RD 1:158 n1.

<sup>13</sup> **Bimbisāra** was born 5 years before the Buddha, ruled for 52 years (?543-491? BCE), and died at 67, 8 years before the Buddha (c485-405 BCE). He became a lay follower around 30. His son, Ajāta,sattu (Skt Ajāta,śatru), usurping the throne and imprisoning him, reigned from 494/491-461 BCE, and died in 459 BCE, killed by his own son, Udāyi,bhadda. The Oxford Dict of Buddhism gives Bimbisāra’s reign as c465-413 BCE.

<sup>14</sup> D 3,2.21/1:109), SD 21.3.

<sup>15</sup> On *puthujjana*, see SD 28.6 (1.2.3).

It is amazing that Soṇadaṇḍa, as learned as he is wealthy, does not see that this, the logical outcome of the Buddha's argument, and carefully led up to in the final paragraph of the exposition,<sup>16</sup> is really incompatible with the supremacy of the Brahmins in the ordinary sense of that word. He is baffled by the skill with which he is gradually led on, by the usual Socratic method adopted in so many of the Dialogues, to accept one self-evident truth after another. There is indeed nothing, till we come to that last paragraph, which any intelligent Brahman could not, with safety, and with due regard to his own doctrine, fully accept. In other words, the doctrine of Brahman supremacy was intellectually indefensible. It was really quite inconsistent with the ethical standard of the times, which the Brahmins, in common with the rest of the people, fully accepted. (D:RD 1:138)

... The tone of worldliness and love of material comfort, the eager restlessness of modern social, and economic competition, the degradation of learning to a mere means of getting on and making money, are no doubt all unfavourable to any movement for the social and religious elevation of a people. (D:RD 1: 142 f)

The self-promoting Soṇa,daṇḍa makes an interesting contrast to the cynical brahmin **Lohicca**, who before meeting the Buddha holds the view that it is not worthwhile for an accomplished teacher to teach another because it would be tiresome and frustrating if the other party is incapable of understanding the teaching. However, after the Buddha's admonition, he not only goes for refuge, but also gives up his wrong view.<sup>17</sup>

**2.3 IS SOṆA,DAṆḌA KIASU?** The fact that Soṇa,daṇḍa is quixotically restrained in his public display of respect to the Buddha is explained by Soṇa,daṇḍa himself as arising from his fear of losing the respect, support and patronage of the other (clearly non-Buddhist and unbuddhist) brahmins, which would then severely affect his wealth. Clearly, Soṇa,daṇḍa does not hold the Buddha to be his highest spiritual priority, or perhaps spirituality is not in his priority at all, but that he wants to have the Buddha as merely a badge pinned onto his coat. In either case, if he fears losing out to others, he would be said to be "kiasu."

Kiasu (traditional Chinese: 驚輸, *jīngshu*; Hokkien *kia<sup>n</sup>-su*) is a Singapore Hokkien (a form of overseas Fujianese dialect) word that literally and pejoratively means "afraid of losing" (Mandarin Chinese: 怕輸 *pàshū*). Its widespread use, esp in Singapore and Malaysia, reflects a common attitude, amongst locals, of not losing out in a highly competitive high-cost-of-living society (resorting to such antics as piling up too much food on one's plate in a buffet, or camping overnight to be sure of getting the free ticket to the National Day Parade, or displaying a handicapped sticker on one's car to "chope" (reserve) a space in a parking lot, or to the extent of parents imposing heavy study regime upon their children to make them reach the very top above the rest. Growing up with this attitude, these students often become ambitious business-people, desiring to be on the top in wealth and prestige, regardless of whether or not this reflects their true graces and capabilities. Kiasu has been recorded in the Oxford English Dictionary.

### 3 The accomplished brahmin

**3.1 THE QUALITIES OF A BRAHMIN.** The highlight or turning-point of the Soṇa,daṇḍa Sutta is when Soṇa,daṇḍa is asked by the Buddha what the qualities of an "accomplished brahmin" (*samannāgata brahmaṇa*) are [§11]. Soṇa,daṇḍa, confidently answers [§12] that such a brahmin has 5 qualities, as follows [§13]:

<sup>16</sup> See §23 to just before §24a, ie the *sāmañña,phala* passage (on which, see **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16), SD 9 (10d).

<sup>17</sup> See (**Sāla,vatikā**) **Lohicca S** (D 12/1:224-234), SD 34.8.

- (1) He is well born;
- (2) He is accomplished in the Three Vedas and their related learning;
- (3) He is good-looking;
- (4) He is morally virtuous; and
- (5) He is wise.

On being further questioned by the Buddha on which are really the essential qualities of an accomplished brahmin [§§14-15], Soṇa,daṇḍa pares the list down to two essential qualities, that is, the last two qualities, those of **moral virtue and wisdom** [§16].

Soṇa,daṇḍa's declaring that the two qualities, moral virtue and wisdom, are necessary and sufficient qualities of an accomplished brahmin is significant for at least two reasons. **The first reason** is that the first three qualities which are omitted have largely to do with *brahminical charisma*.<sup>18</sup> Ancient Indian society of the Gangetic plains (shaped mostly by brahminical values) attributed charisma to the brahmins on account of their birth (status), their religious virtuosity (authority) and looks (karmic bias). In a sense, *karma* is charisma for those caught in the rut of social values and ambience.

It was the brahmins' "good karma" to be born so; it was their "good karma" to master the Vedas; it was their "good karma" to look impressive and attractive. Of course, the fact that brahmins lived comfortable, sheltered and luxurious lives, allowed them the surplus time to learn Sanskrit and the Vedas, and to keep up their physical appearance.<sup>19</sup> The lot of the less fortunate members of such a feudalistic classed society was rarely anything more than daily routines of hard menial labour and serving the upper classes. Karma was as such used as an unwholesome means or religious excuse by the brahmins to support a class system where they would be the most privileged.

**3.2 THE TWOFOLD TRAINING.** There is a **second reason** for the significance of Soṇa,daṇḍa's two-point definition of an accomplished brahmin as being wise and virtuous rather than charismatic. We might rightly say that this view of Soṇa,daṇḍa's is what spiritually connects him with the Buddha and the Dharma. In fact, from the discourse, we see that the Buddha accepts this same view as the point of departure to deliver the impressive *sāmañña,phala* ("fruits of recluseship") teachings.<sup>20</sup> As **Damien Keown** notes here:

The Buddha signifies his assent to this and repeats the first part of Soṇadaṇḍa's statement almost verbatim. He then specified in what virtue and understanding consist, namely in following the path to Arahatship described throughout the *Collection [Nikāya]* which is here divided into the two components of *sīla* and *paññā*. These are the necessary and sufficient conditions of a true Brahman. The conclusion to be drawn from the passage from the *Discourse of Soṇadaṇḍa* is that moral excellence is an essential dimension of human perfection. This needs emphasizing since it is usually overlooked and almost always made secondary to intellectual development. A second point to note is that the Buddha does not stipulate *samādhi* in his conception of the essential quality of [a] true Brahman, or as we would say "a good man." He includes it as part of the path, but does not specify it as part of the end. (1992: 39)

<sup>18</sup> See **The teacher or the teaching?**, SD 3.14 & Piyasilo, *Charisma in Buddhism*, 1992h, available online: <http://pali.house.googlepages.com/Piyasilo.CharismaInBuddhism.pdf>.

<sup>19</sup> On criticisms of the brahmins' luxurious lives and worldliness, see **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 3,2.8-10/1:104 f), SD 21.3.

<sup>20</sup> Gethin's n: "In **the sīlakkhandha-vagga** the terminology in fact varies. The *Sāmaññaphala-sutta*, while giving the account in full, does not explicitly divide it into three categories. This is true also of the *Kūḍadanta-*, *Mahāli-*, *Jāliya-*, *Kevaddha-* and *Lohicca-suttas*. (The *Paṭṭhapāda-* and *Tevijja-suttas* depart from the standard pattern after the account of the fourth *jhāna*, inserting descriptions of the four formless attainments and four *brahma-vihāras* respectively.) In the *Ambaṭṭha-sutta* the categories are just two, *carāṇa* and *vijjā*; in **the Soṇadaṇḍa-sutta** just as *sīla* and *paññā*; in the *Kassapasihanāda-sutta* they are *sīla-sampadā* and *paññā-sampadā*; in the *Subha-sutta* they are called *sīla-kkhandha*, *samādhi-kkhandha* and *paññā-kkhandha*" (2001:207 n79).

That the Buddha does not highlight the “concentration” (*samādhi*) aspect of the holy life is understandable, as Soṇadaṇḍa’s personality is revealed in the Sutta: he is a man of the world, primarily concerned with wealth and status, hardly one who would have the time or inclination for meditation.<sup>21</sup>

Nevertheless, Soṇadaṇḍa is understandably impressed at the Buddha’s discourse, enough to be motivated to go for refuge in the Three Jewels [§24a]. However, due to his greater priority for his own *social status* [§26]—that his wealth would not decline on account of being openly faithful to the Buddha—he does not attain even streamwinning. He is still basically a man of the world, but a good worldling.

**3.3 THE TI,KAṆṆA SUTTA & THE JĀṆUSSOṆI SUTTA.** Two discourses of the Aṅguttara—the **Ti,kaṇṇa Sutta** (A 3.58) and the **(Te,vijja) Jāṇussoṇi Sutta** (A 3.59)—deal with the definition of a brahmin, more specifically, that of a three-Veda brahmin (*te,vijja brāhmaṇa*),<sup>22</sup> which is another name for an accomplished brahmin, an adept of the Vedas.<sup>23</sup> Both these discourses only mention the qualities of birth and of Vedic learning. The Buddha replies by explaining the 3 knowledges of the arhat, so that they are both impressed.

In such discourses, the 3 knowledges—known to the brahmins as the Three Vedas—are dexterously adapted by the Buddha as the 3 knowledges of spiritual liberation, namely:

- (1) retrocognition (*pubbe,nivāsānussati,ñāṇa*), that is, the recollection of one’s own past lives;
- (2) the divine eye (*dibba,cakkhu*) or clairvoyance, knowing the past lives of others; and
- (3) the knowledge of the destruction of the mental influxes (*āsava-k,khaya,ñāṇa*), that ends rebirth.<sup>24</sup>

We are often reminded of this special quality of the arhat, the true brahmin, in a well known verse from the two discourses, and which is also echoed elsewhere with some variations in the closing line:

*Etāhi tīhi vijjāhi hoti brāhmaṇo  
Tam ahaṃ vadāmi tevijjāṃ  
ñāṇāṃ lapita,lāpanan ti*

That is the brahmin with the three knowledges,  
The one I call “the three-knowledged”  
is not what other babble emptily.

(A 3.58,6/1:165) = (A 3.59,4/1:168)

This paradigm shift is both intentional and significant. The Buddha wishes to draw the audience from the external ritualized religious forms to an internal spiritual life-change. The first two knowledges are essentially those of rebirth (of self and of others). It is the third knowledge—that of the destruction of the mental influxes<sup>25</sup>—that makes one an arhat, a fully-liberated being, here and now.

<sup>21</sup> Cf Keown’s view here: 1992: 38 f. See Gethin 2001:209 f.

<sup>22</sup> Respectively, A 3.58/1:163-166 & A 3.59/1:166-168. For a discussion on the *tevijja brāhmaṇa*, see **Te,vijja S** (D 13/1:235-252), SD 1.8.

<sup>23</sup> On the Vedas, see **Te,vijja S** (D 13), SD 1.8 (2).

<sup>24</sup> See also **D 33**,1.10(58)/3:220, **34**,1.4.(10)/275; **M 6**,17-19/1:35; **A 3.100**,8-10/1:255 f, **3.100**,15/1:258, **5.23**,9-10/3:18 f, **6.2**,5-6/3:280, **9.35**,3/4:421 f, **10.102**/5:211. The 3 knowledges are a summary of the 6 superknowledges (*cha-ḷ-abhiññā*): (1) psychic powers (*iddha,vidhā*); (2) the divine ear (*dibba,sota*) or clairaudience; (3) mind-reading (*paracitta,vijānana,ñāṇa*) or telepathy; (4) retrocognition (*pubbe,nivāsānussati,ñāṇa*); (5) the divine eye (*dibba,-cakkhu*) or clairvoyance; and (6) the knowledge of the destruction of the mental influxes (*āsava-k,khaya,ñāṇa*), that ends rebirth (D 2.95-98/1:81-83 = SD 8.10; D 34.1.7(10)/3:281; M 1:34; A 1:255, 258, 3:17, 280, 4:421).. Cf Tha 25; Thī 26.

<sup>25</sup> “**Mental influxes**,” *āsava*. The term *āsava* (lit “inflow”) comes from *ā-savati* “flows towards or inwards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously translated as taints (“deadly taints,” RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, bad (influence), or simply left untr. The Abhidhamma lists 4 *āsavas*: the influx of (1) sense-desire (*kām’āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav’āsava*), (3) views (*diṭṭh’āsava*),

## 4 Related suttas

Structurally, the narrative of **the Soṇa,daṇḍa Sutta** (D 4) closely parallels that of the Caṅkī Sutta (M 95). Both discourses open with the Buddha arriving in the locality with a large company of monks and are well received. In both cases, the most eminent local brahmins, both being brahmadeya lords, decide to meet the Buddha despite protests of their peers. **The Caṅkī Sutta** records no conversation between the Buddha and Caṅkī: it is the young Kāpaṭhika Māṇava who is the protagonist. The Soṇa,daṇḍa Sutta, on the other hand, records a conversion of sort, as we shall see. [2.2]

**Soṇa,daṇḍa** is initially reluctant to ask the Buddha any question for fear of saying the wrong thing, or of being questioned by the Buddha and giving a wrong answer—and so losing face! Indeed, at the end of the discourse, even after having gone for refuge, he tells the Buddha that he would in public show his respect to the Buddha in other ways than a deep bow or rising in salutation, so that he does not lose face before other brahmins! [§26]. He seems to be a very status-conscious or career-driven brahmin, but things are not quite what they seem, as we shall see [2.2].

To put Soṇa,daṇḍa at ease, the Buddha asks him a familiar question: *what are the basic qualifications of a brahmin*, which he comfortably answers, but he also agrees with Buddha that moral virtue is superior to the external or social qualities of a brahmin. On Soṇa,daṇḍa's further question, the Buddha expounds the "fruits of recluseship" (*sāmañña,phala*) to Soṇa,daṇḍa (no such teaching is given to Caṅkī or Kāpaṭhika). At the end of the Buddha's discourse, Soṇa,daṇḍa *alone* goes for refuge,<sup>26</sup> while in the case of the Caṅkī Sutta, the refuge formula is in the plural, meaning that there are others, besides Kāpaṭhika, who go for refuge.

— — —

# Soṇa,daṇḍa Sutta

## The Discourse to Soṇa,daṇḍa

D 4

[111] Thus have I heard.

### The Buddha in Campā

**1** At one time the Blessed One was wandering (on a Dharma-tour) in Aṅga country with a large number of monks numbering some five hundred, and arrived at Campā.<sup>27</sup>

There the Blessed One stayed on the shore of the Gaggarā lotus lake<sup>28</sup> near Campā.

---

(4) ignorance (*avijjāsava*) (D 16,1.12/2:82, 16,2.4/2:91, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These 4 are also known as "floods" (*ogha*) and "yokes" (*yoga*). *The influx of existence* is the attachment and desire for the realm of form and of formlessness, and as such, is the craving for the dhyanas, on account of *the false views* of eternalism and annihilationism. As such, *the influx of view* is subsumed under the influx of existence (MA 1:67). The list of 3 influxes (omitting the influx of views) is probably older and is found more frequently in the suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these *āsavas* is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict: āsava.

<sup>26</sup> D 4/1:111-126 (SD 30.5).

<sup>27</sup> **Campā**, the capital of Aṅga (one of the 16 Great States: see Intro (1.2.1)).

<sup>28</sup> "**The Gaggarā lotus lake**" (*gaggarā pokkharanī*), a lotus lake outside Campā. See Intro (1.2.2).

Now at that time, the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa was living in Campā, teeming with life,<sup>29</sup> with grass, wood and water, with rice, a royal domain presented (to him) by Seniya Bimbisāra, the rajah of Magadha,<sup>30</sup> as a royal gift, a brahmadeya [a fief].<sup>31</sup>

## The Campā brahmin houselords visit the Buddha

2 Now the brahmin houselords<sup>32</sup> of Campā heard thus:

“It is said, sirs, that the recluse Gotama,<sup>33</sup> a Sakya son, who went forth from the Sakya clan,<sup>34</sup> is wandering [peregrinating] in Campā with a large number of monks numbering some five hundred, has arrived in Campā, staying on the shore of the Gaggarā lake near Campā.

2.2 Now a good report about that master Gotama has been going around thus:<sup>35</sup>

‘So too, is he the Blessed One:<sup>36</sup> for, he is arhat, fully self-awakened, accomplished in wisdom and conduct, well-farer, knower of worlds, peerless guide of tamable persons, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.

Having realized by his own direct knowledge this world with its gods, its Māras and its Brahmās, this generation with its recluses and brahmins, its rulers and people, he makes it known to others.

He teaches the Dharma, good in the beginning, good in the middle, good in the end, both in the spirit and in the letter.

He proclaims the holy life that is entirely complete and pure.’

It is good to see such arhats.”<sup>37</sup> [112]

<sup>29</sup> *Satt’ussadam* = *satta + ussada*, lit “abundance of beings,” ie densely populated with humans and animals.

<sup>30</sup> See Intro (3.2).

<sup>31</sup> *Brahma,deyya* (Skt *brahma,deya*), “a supreme gift,” ie land granted to brahmins by the kings of Kosala (**Ambaṭṭha S** = D 3,1.1.21:87), SD 21.3, or of Magadha (**Kūṭa,danta S** = D 5,1.2/1:127), SD 22.8, for perpetuity. Unlike donated monastic lands, which is the corporate property of the “Sangha of the four quarters,” the brahmadeya is the brahmin’s personal property or fief, which he uses for agriculture. In the case of Kūṭa,danta, we see him using such income to perform a large sacrifice. See Uma Chakravarti 1987:57. On this stock passage, see **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 3,1.1.1/1:87 n), SD 21.3.

<sup>32</sup> *Brāhmaṇa,gahapatikā*, also spelt as *brāhmaṇa,gahapati*, which is invariably a collective term, never an individual, ie, the landed community of of the brahmin villages (*brāhmaṇa,gāma*) or fiefs (*brahma,deya*) as a whole. This classification is based on land-ownership (ie their economic function), who nonetheless still identified with the larger priestly class. As such, individually, theu (such as Kūṭa,danta, Caṅkī, etc) are still referred to simply as *brāhmaṇa*. See Chakravarti 1987:72 f.

<sup>33</sup> This stock passage shows that the brahmin houselords are well acquainted with the Buddha’s background. This para denotes the Buddha’s social *status* (in the minds of the brahmins and the world), which adds a significant sense of charisma to his personality. However, while in **Kūṭa,danta S** (D 5,1/1:127), he is addressed as “the recluse Gotama” (*samaṇo Gotamo*), here he is referred to as “the good Gotama” (*bho Gotamo*), which reflects a formal distance between the brahmins and the Buddha, despite Soṇa,daṇḍa’s refuge-going. See §26(2) n on Soṇa,daṇḍa’s diplomacy.

<sup>34</sup> A stock passage speaks of the Buddha as “the recluse Gotama, a Sakya son who went forth from the Sakya clan” \*(*samaṇo...gotamo sakya,putto sakya,kulā pabbajito*): **Mv 22.2** (V 1:35); **D 4,1/1:111, 13,7/1:236; M 41,2/-1:285; A 3.63,1/1:180; Sn p103**. On his renunciation, see **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,14/1:163), SD 1.11, **Soṇa,daṇḍa S** (D 4,6/1:115), SD 30.5, **Kūṭa,danta S** (D 5,7/1:131), SD 22.8(7a) & **Caṅkī S** (M 95,9/2:167), SD 21.15, the last three of which say that he is “from a high family” (*uccā kulā*).

<sup>35</sup> For details on this recollection on the Buddha’s virtues, see **Buddhānussati**, SD 15.7; or SD 35.4 (endn 1c).

<sup>36</sup> Alt tr: “For the following reasons, too, he is the Blessed One [the Lord] ...” On the meaning of *iti pi so*, see **Buddhānussati**, SD 15.7 (2.2) & n.

<sup>37</sup> For details on this statement, see SD 35.4 (endnote 1d).



2.3 Then the brahmin houselords of Campā left Campā in group after group according to their district,<sup>38</sup> or in small bands, heading for the Gaggarā Lake.

**3** Now at that time, the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa had gone up to the upper terrace of his house for a day rest [siesta].<sup>39</sup>

He saw the brahmin houselords of Campā leaving Campā in bands, group after group, heading for the Gaggarā lake. Seeing them, he addressed an attendant:<sup>40</sup>

“Attendant, why are these brahmin houselords of Campā leaving Campā in bands, group after group, heading for the Gaggarā lake?”

“It is said that master Gotama,<sup>41</sup> the Sakya son, who went forth from a Sakya family, is wandering (on a Dharma-tour) in Magadha country with a large number of monks numbering some five hundred. He has arrived in Campā, and is staying on the shore of the Gaggarā lake near Campā.

Now a good report about that master Gotama has been going round thus:

‘So too, is he the Blessed One: for, he is arhat, fully self-awakened, accomplished in wisdom and conduct, well-farer, knower of worlds, peerless guide of tamable persons, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.’

They are going to see this master Gotama.”

### Soṇa,daṇḍa wishes to see the Buddha

3.2 “In that case, master attendant, approach those brahmin houselords of Campā and say this to them:

‘Sirs, the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa says thus:

“Sirs, could you please wait!<sup>42</sup> The brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, too, will go and see the recluse Gotama.”

“Yes, sir,” the attendant replied to the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, and approached the brahmin houselords of Campā.

Having approached the brahmin houselord of Campā, he said this, **[113]**

“Sirs, the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa says thus:

‘Sirs, could you please wait! The brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, too, will go and see the recluse Gotama.’”

**4** Now at that time, there were some five hundred brahmins from various countries [countries and provinces],<sup>43</sup> staying in Campā, on some business or other. They heard that the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa was going to see the Buddha.

<sup>38</sup> Ce Ee Se *saṅghā saṅghī* [Be *saṅgha,saṅghī*] *gaṇī,bhūtā*; as at D 23,3/2:317; M 95,4/2:164; UA 380. Tr here follows Comy, where *saṅgha* is def as “the separate communities from the districts” (*ekekissāya disāya saṅgho etesaṃ atthī’ti*) (DA 1:280). It is possible that these were tribes or clans. Cf *saṅghānaṃ gaṇānaṃ* (M 25,12/1:231); *nara,gaṇa,saṅgha* ... (A 4.51,4/2:55\*).

<sup>39</sup> “Day rest,” *divā,seyya*, “s bed for the day, siesta”: D 4,3/1:112 (the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa), D 5,3/1:128, 2:317 (the brahmin Kūṭa,danta), D 23,15/1:333 (prince Pāyāsi); M 95,5/2:164 (the brahmin Caṅkī): note here that there is sleeping in the day. The more usual expression here for monastics is *divā,vihāra*, “day-residence,” which entails meditation, eg: V 1:28, 3:208; D 2:130, 182, 356, 3:17-22 passim; M 1:108 f, 147, 229, 359, 447, 502, 2:65 passim; S 1:129, 130, 132-135, 3:91, 235; A 3:75, 4:262, 264, 356, 438; U 5, 35; Pv 2.10.1/28\*; Ap 2:404, 473\*; (pl) *divā,-vihārā*: S 1:193; Thī 48a/128; Ap 1:284\*, 2:417\*; *divā.vihāra,gato: vihāra* 3:37 f passim; S 1:146, 148, 197 f, 203, 225, 233: for other refs search CPD: *divāvihār\** & *divā vihār\**.

<sup>40</sup> *Khattā* (Skt *kṣātrī*) an attendant, a porter, an equerry, a steward (D 1:112, 128; M 2:164).

<sup>41</sup> This stock passage shows that the brahmin houselords are well acquainted with the Buddha’s background. This para denotes the Buddha’s social status (in the minds of the brahmins and the world), which adds a significant sense of charisma to his personality.

<sup>42</sup> *Āgamentu kira bhavanto*.

<sup>43</sup> *Verajjakānaṃ*.

Then the brahmins approach the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa and said this to him:

“Is it true, sir, that the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is going to see the recluse Gotama?”

“Yes, sirs, that is so, I am going to see the recluse Gotama.”

### Soṇa,daṇḍa’s social status<sup>44</sup>

5 “Let not the master Soṇa,daṇḍa go and see the recluse Gotama! It is not worthy of the master Soṇa,daṇḍa to go and see the recluse Gotama!

If the master Soṇa,daṇḍa goes and sees the recluse Gotama, the master Soṇa,daṇḍa’s fame will diminish. The recluse Gotama’s fame will increase.

That the master Soṇa,daṇḍa’s fame will diminish, and the recluse Gotama’s fame will increase, it is indeed worthy of<sup>45</sup> the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,daṇḍa instead.

(1) For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa is well born on both the mother’s and the father’s sides for 7 generations, with neither reproach nor defect in terms of birth.<sup>46</sup>

That the master Soṇa,daṇḍa is well born on both the mother’s and the father’s sides for 7 generations, with neither reproach nor defect in terms of birth, it is not worthy of the master Soṇa,daṇḍa to go and see the recluse Gotama. It is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,daṇḍa instead.

(2) For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa is rich, of great wealth, of great means.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,daṇḍa instead.

(3) <sup>47</sup>For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa [114] is a mantra-reciter,<sup>48</sup> a mantra-expert, a master of the Three Vedas, along with their invocations and rituals, phonology and etymology, and the Iti,hāsa Purāṇas<sup>49</sup> as

<sup>44</sup> This whole section and the next are mutatis mutandis as in **Kūṭa,danta S** (D 5.6-7/1:129-132), SD 22.8.

<sup>45</sup> “(Is) worthy of,” *arahati*.

<sup>46</sup> *Bhavaṃ hi soṇa,daṇḍo ubhato sujāto mātito ca pitito ca saṃsuddha,gahaṇiko, yāva sattamā pitāmaha,yugā akkhitto anupakkuṭṭho jāti,vādena*: this is stock: V 4:160; **Soṇa,daṇḍa S** (D 4/1:113 (×2), 120 (×2), 121, 123); **Kūṭa,danta S** (D 5/1:130 (×2), 131 (×2), 137, 138, 139 (×2), 140, 141); **Caṅkī S** (M 95/2:165 (×2), 166 (×2)), **Vāsetṭha S** (M 98/2:196 = Sn p115); **Ti,kaṇṇa S** (A 3.58/1:163); **(Te,vijja) Jāṇussoṇi S** (A 3.59/1:166); **Yassaṃ Disaṃ S** (A 5.134/3:151); **Patthanā S 1** (A 5.135/3:152 f); **Patthanā S 2** (A 5.136/3:154); **Doṇa Brāhmaṇa S** (A 5.192/3:223 (×2), 224, 225, 227, 228 (×2)).

<sup>47</sup> *Ajjhāyako manta,dharo tiṇṇaṃ vedānaṃ pāragū sa,nighaṇḍu,keṭubhānaṃ sākkhara-p,pabhedānaṃ iti,hāsa,-pañcamānaṃ, padako veyyākaraṇo lokāyata,mahā,purisa,lakkhaṇesu anavayo*. This is the “*ajjhāyaka* or *mantra-reciter*” pericope of the Dīgha: **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 3,1.3/1:88), **Soṇa,daṇḍa S** (D 4,5(3)/1:114, 13(2)/1:120, 14(2)/1:121, 20(2)/1:123), **Kūṭa,danta S** (D 5,6(3)/1:130, 14(2)/1:138), 17(3)/1:141; **Ti,kaṇṇa S** (A 3.58,1/1:163), **(Te,vijja) Jāṇussoṇi S** (A 3.59,1/1:166), **Doṇa S** (A 5.192,2/3:223). The Majjhima “*mantra-reciter pericope*” omits the opening words “a mantra-reciter, a mantra-expert” (*ajjhāyako manta,dharo*): **Brahm’āyu S** (M 91,2/2:133, 4/2:134, 26/3:141), SD 63.8; an aged brahmin; **Sela S** (M 92 = Sn 3.7/p105); **Assalāyana S** (M 93,3/2:147), a 16-year-old brahmin youth; **Caṅkī S** (M 95,8/2:165, 11/2:168); **Saṅgārava S** (M 100,3/2:210). Cf Tha 1171 (“expert in the Three Vedas,” *tiṇṇaṃ vedāna pāragu*); also Miln 10, Divy 619.20, 620.19. Cf Tha 1171 (“expert in the Three Vedas,” *tiṇṇaṃ vedāna pāra,-gu*); also Miln 10, Divy 619.20, 620.19. Here *mantra* refers to a particular vedic hymn or sacrificial formula. *Ajjhāyaka* (Skt *ādhyāyika, adhyāyin*) is a vedic student or scholar, one skilled in reciting the Vedas, a brahminical teacher. **Aggañña S** (D 27) plays a humorous pun on its etym: *na ... jhāyanti*, “they do not meditate,” hence, they are called *ajjhāyaka*, “non-meditators”: see D 27,23/3:94 (SD 2.19).

<sup>48</sup> Here, and the foll, “mantra” refers to 3 Vedas. See prec n.

<sup>49</sup> Iti,hāsa Purāṇas are the oral tradition of brahminical legends of kings and sages.

the fifth; learned in the vedic word structure,<sup>50</sup> grammarian,<sup>51</sup> and well versed in nature lore<sup>52</sup> and the marks of the great man.<sup>53</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,-daṇḍa instead.

(4) <sup>54</sup>For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa is handsome, good-looking, pleasing, endowed with the most excellent colour, of perfect complexion,<sup>55</sup> of perfect physique,<sup>56</sup> of no mean appearance, one worthy of being looked at.<sup>57</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,-daṇḍa instead.

(5) For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa is morally virtuous, mature in virtue, endowed with mature virtue.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to go and see the master Soṇa,daṇḍa instead.

(6) For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa has a good voice, a good delivery, endowed with urbane speech, distinctly clear, not driveling [faultless in speech], able to clarify any issue.<sup>58</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,-daṇḍa instead.

(7) For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa is a teacher of teachers of many, uttering the mantras to three hundred brahmin youths. Many are the brahmin youths who come from various quarters and various districts with the desire to learn the mantras and the meaning of the mantras in the master Soṇa,daṇḍa's presence [from the master Soṇa,daṇḍa himself].

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,-daṇḍa instead.

(8) For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa is old, mature, very elderly, long lived, advanced in years. But the recluse Gotama is young, and is a young recluse.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,-daṇḍa instead.

(9) For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa is honoured, respected, held in high esteem, venerated and revered by Seniya Bimbisāra, the rajah of Magadha.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,-daṇḍa instead.

<sup>50</sup> *Padako veyyākaraṇo*, ie, well versed in the *pada,pāṭha* of Sanskrit grammar. Technically, this refers to the *pada* (or literal, word for word) method of reciting (or writing) Veda sentences, ie, "a method of arranging each word of a Vedic text separately in its original form [cf *pada*] without regard to the rules of [sandhi]; cf *krama*- and *samhitā-pāṭha*." (SED).

<sup>51</sup> On *veyyākaraṇa*, see BHS: sv *vyākaraṇa*, = *vaiyākaraṇa* (p517).

<sup>52</sup> *Lokāyata*. This seems to be the early meaning of the term. Its reference to the materialistic philosophy of Cārvāka is apparently later: see Rhys Davids, D:RD 1:166-172. See **Lokāyatikā Brāhmaṇā S** (A 9.38/4:428-432), SD 35.2. See also Jayatilleke 1963:48-58 (§§55-67).

<sup>53</sup> For details, see **Buddhānussati**, SD 15.7(4.1) n.

<sup>54</sup> The same is said of the Buddha at §7(6) below.

<sup>55</sup> *Brahma,vaṇṇī*, lit "Brahmā-like complexion." Brahmā is the Supreme Deity of the popular Indian pantheon in the Buddha's time. As an adj *brahma* simply means "perfect."

<sup>56</sup> *Brahma,vaccasī* (PTS Ce) or *Brahma,vacchasī* (Be Se), lit "Brahmā-like complexion."

<sup>57</sup> *Dassanāya*. On the Indian custom of gazing at a respected, virtuous or religious person, see **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16), SD 9 (7e).

<sup>58</sup> *Bhavaṃ hi soṇa,daṇḍo kalyāṇavāco kalyāṇa,vākkaraṇo poriyā vācāya samannāgato vissaṭṭhāya anelagalāya atthassa viññāpatiyā*. The same is said of the Buddha at §6(8) below.

(10) For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa is honoured, respected, held in high esteem, venerated and revered by the brahmin Pokkhara,sāti.<sup>59</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,-daṇḍa instead.

(11) For the master Soṇa,daṇḍa lives in Campā, teeming with life, with grass, wood and water, with rice, a royal domain presented (to him) by Seniya Bimbisāra, the rajah of Magadha, as a royal gift, a brahmadeya [a fief].<sup>60</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of the recluse Gotama to come and see the master Soṇa,-daṇḍa instead.

### Soṇa,daṇḍa's praise of the Buddha<sup>61</sup>

6 When this was said, the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa said this to the brahmins: **[115]**

"In that case, sirs, listen to me, too, as to why it is worthy of *us* to go and see master Gotama, and that it is unworthy of master Gotama to come and see us.

(1) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama is well born on both the mother's and the father's sides for 7 generations, with neither reproach nor defect in terms of birth.

That the recluse Gotama is well born on both the mother's and the father's sides for 7 generations, with neither reproach nor defect in terms of birth, it is not worthy of master Gotama to come and see us. It is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(2) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama has gone forth, leaving behind a great community of relatives.<sup>62</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(3) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama has gone forth, leaving behind a great amount of gold and silver, both buried underground and visible above ground.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(4) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama, went forth while still young, a black-haired young lad endowed with the blessing of youth, in the prime of life.<sup>63</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(5) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama, though his mother and father wished otherwise and wept with tearful faces, shaved off his hair and beard, put on the saffron robe, and went forth from the household life into the homeless life.<sup>64</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(6) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama is handsome, good-looking, pleasing, endowed with the most excellent colour, of perfect complexion, of perfect physique, of no mean appearance, one worthy of being looked at.<sup>65</sup>

<sup>59</sup> D 3,2.16-22/1:108-110 (SD 21.3).

<sup>60</sup> See §1 nn.

<sup>61</sup> This whole section and the preceding are mutatis mutandis as in **Kūṭa,danta S** (D 5,5-7/1:130-132), SD 22.8.

<sup>62</sup> Comy says 80,000 families each of the mother's and father's sides (DA 1:283). If we reckon 5 to a family, this would total to some 800,000 (D:RD 1:147 n1).

<sup>63</sup> On this stock passage, see SD 49.19 (1.3.3.4). This, and the next section, are also spoken by Kūṭa,danta (**Kūṭa,-danta S**, D 5,7.1/1:131 n, SD 22.8) and other famous brahmins, and by the Buddha himself in **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,14/1:163 n, SD 1.11).

<sup>64</sup> This—and the prec section—spoken by the Buddha himself in **Ariya,pariyesanā S** (M 26,14/1:163), SD 1.11: see n prec para.

<sup>65</sup> The same is said of the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa at §5(4) above.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(7) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama is morally virtuous, noble in virtue, wholesome in virtue, endowed with wholesome virtue.<sup>66</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(8) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama has a good voice, a good delivery, endowed with urbane speech, distinctly clear, not driveling [faultless in speech], able to clarify any issue.<sup>67</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(9) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama is a teacher of teachers of many.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(10) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama has destroyed desire and lust, and abandoned unsteadiness (due to craving).<sup>68</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(11) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama is one who teaches karma, who teaches the action, without any bad intention towards the brahmin race.<sup>69</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(12) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama is one gone forth from a high family, an unadulterated kshatriya family.<sup>70</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(13) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama is one gone forth from a prosperous family of great wealth and means.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead. [116]

(14) Indeed, people beyond the country, beyond the district, come to ask questions of the recluse master Gotama.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(15) Indeed, sirs, many thousands of heavenly beings have gone for refuge in the recluse Gotama for life.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(16) Indeed, sirs, about the recluse Gotama a good report has been going around thus:<sup>71</sup>

‘So too, is he the Blessed One: for, he is arhat, fully self-awakened, accomplished in wisdom and conduct, well-farer, knower of worlds, peerless guide of tamable persons, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.

Having realized by his own direct knowledge this world with its gods, its Māras and its Brahmās, this generation with its recluses and brahmins, its rulers and people, he makes it known to others.

He teaches the Dharma, good in the beginning, good in the middle, good in the end, both in the spirit and in the letter.

He proclaims the holy life that is entirely complete and pure.’

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(17) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama is endowed with the thirty-two marks of the great man.<sup>72</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

<sup>66</sup> *Samaṇo khalu bho gotamo sīlavā ariya, sīlī kusala, sīlī kusala, sīlena samannāgato.*

<sup>67</sup> The same is said of the brahmin Soṇa, daṇḍa at §5(6) above.

<sup>68</sup> *Samaṇo khalu bho gotamo khīṇa, kāma, rāgo vigata, cāpallo.*

<sup>69</sup> *Samaṇo khalu bho gotamo kamma, vādī kiriya, vādī apāpa, purekkhāro brahmaññāya pajāya.*

<sup>70</sup> *Samaṇo khalu bho gotamo uccā, kulā pabbajito asambhinna, khattiya, kulā.* On *asambhinna* vI as *ādīna*, see D:RD 148 n2.

<sup>71</sup> For an explanation of the key points of this passage, see SD 35.4 Comy Notes 1c.

<sup>72</sup> For the 32 marks of the great man, see *Buddhānussati*, SD 15.7(4.1)n.

(18) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama is one who bids (all), ‘Come, welcome,’ congenial, courteous, never frowning, approachable, first to greet others.<sup>73</sup>

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(19) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama is honoured, respected, held in high esteem, venerated and revered by the fourfold company (of monks, nuns, laymen and laywomen).

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(20) Indeed, sirs, many gods and humans have deep faith<sup>74</sup> in the recluse master Gotama.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(21) Indeed, sirs, near whichever village or market-town that the recluse Gotama resides, non-humans do not trouble the humans therein.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(22) Indeed, the recluse master Gotama as the head of an order, the head of a group, a teacher of the many, is regarded as the foremost of the ford-makers to the masses.<sup>75</sup> While some ascetics and brahmins win fame in various insignificant ways,<sup>76</sup> the recluse Gotama does not do so. For his fame comes the recluse Gotama by way attaining unexcelled knowledge and conduct.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(23) Indeed, sirs, Seniya Bimbisāra, the rajah of Magadha, together with his son, his wife, his court, and his household have gone to the recluse Gotama as refuge for life.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(24) The rajah Pasenadi of Kosala, together with his son, his wife, his court, and his household have gone to the recluse Gotama as refuge for life.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(25) The brahmin Pokkhara,sātī, together with his son, his wife, his retinue, and his household, have gone to the recluse Gotama as refuge for life.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(26) The recluse Gotama is honoured, respected, held in high esteem, venerated and revered by Seniya Bimbisāra, the rajah of Magadha.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

(27) The recluse Gotama is honoured, respected, held in high esteem, venerated and revered by the rajah Pasenadi of Kosala.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead. **[117]**

(28)The recluse Gotama is honoured, respected, held in high esteem, venerated and revered by the brahmin Pokkhara,sātī.

That *being the case*, it is indeed worthy of us to go and see master Gotama instead.

The recluse Gotama has arrived at Campā: he is staying in the Gaggarā lake, near Campā.

Now, whatever ascetics or brahmins who have come within our village boundaries, they are our guests. Indeed, we should be honour, respect, hold in high esteem, venerate and revere our guests.

As the recluse Gotama has arrived at Campā—he is staying in the Gaggarā lake, near Campā—the recluse Gotama is to be honoured, respected, held in high esteem, venerated and revered as our guest.

<sup>73</sup> *Samaṇo khalu bho gotamo ehi,sāgata,vādī sakhilo sammodako abbhā,kuṭiko uttāna,mukho pubba,bhāsī.* The brahmin Kūṭa,danta, too, gives the same compliment (**Kūṭa,danta S**, D 5,7.1(18)/1:132) + SD 22.8 (2.2.3); also **DhA 23.3,9 n @ SD 50.35(3).** Cf CA 287, 304.

<sup>74</sup> “Have deep faith,” *abhippasannā.*

<sup>75</sup> *Samaṇo khalu bho gotamo saṅghī gaṇī gaṇī ācariyo puthu,tittha,karānam aggam-akkhāyati.*

<sup>76</sup> Comy: Such as by going about naked (DA 1:288).

That the recluse Gotama has arrived at Campā—staying in the Gaggarā lake, near Campā—one to be honoured, respected, held in high esteem, venerated and revered as our guest, it is indeed worthy of *us* to go and see master Gotama instead.

Only that much, sirs, do I know of master Gotama’s praises. But, sirs, these are not all of them; for, master Gotama’s praise is beyond measure.”

### The brahmins decide to meet the Buddha

7 When this was said, the brahmins said this to the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa:

“The master Soṇa,daṇḍa sings the praise of the recluse Gotama such that it is worth going many yojanas [leagues] with only a travel-bag<sup>77</sup> just to see him.”<sup>78</sup>

“Let us all then go and see the recluse Gotama!”

So the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, together with a large group of brahmins, approached the Blessed One at Gaggarā lake.

### Sona,danda’s reservation

8 Then this thought arose to the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa as he passed through the woods:

(1) “If I were to ask the recluse Gotama a question, and he were to say: ‘Brahmin, the question should not be asked thus; brahmin, the question should be asked in this way,’

then, this company might censure me thus: ‘The brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is foolish. He is incapable. [118] He is unable to ask the recluse Gotama a proper question.

Whomever this company were to censure, his reputation would diminish. One whose reputation diminishes, his wealth would diminish, too. But our wealth depends on the reputation we have gained!

(2) And if the recluse Gotama were to put a question to me, and I were unable to answer it to win over his mind,<sup>79</sup> he would say this to me: ‘The question should not be answered in that way; it should be answered in this way,’

then, this company might censure me thus: ‘The brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is foolish and incapable. He is unable to answer the recluse Gotama’s question!

Whomever this company were to censure, his reputation would diminish. One whose reputation diminishes, his wealth would diminish, too. But our wealth depends on the reputation we have gained!

(3) But, if I having come thus far were to turn back without seeing the recluse Gotama,

then, this company might censure me thus: ‘The brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is foolish and incapable. He is stubborn with conceit [stiff-necked], but he is terrified so he dare not go up to meet the recluse Gotama! How can he turn back after coming so far without seeing the recluse Gotama?’

Whomever this company were to censure, his reputation would diminish. One whose reputation diminishes, his wealth would diminish, too. But our wealth depends on the reputation we have gained!”<sup>80</sup>

<sup>77</sup> *Puṭosena*, vl *puṭaṃsena* (mostly Comys), a bag for carrying food when travelling, a knapsack.

<sup>78</sup> *Puṭosenāpi tathā,rūpo ayaṃ bhikkhave bhikkhu,saṅgho, tathā,rūpā ayaṃ parisā* (Ce Ee Ka). As at D 1:117, 133 (= *pātheyyaṃ gahetvā, puṭo aṃse assā ti*, “with provision in hand, a bag over the shoulder,” Comy); M 3:80; A 2:183 (*puṭaṃsenāpi*). Chaṭṭha Saṅgāyanā MSS (WT; VRI) add *iti* here, signifying that the next sentence is spoken by Soṇa,daṇḍa.

<sup>79</sup> “And I were unable to win over his mind,” *tassa cāhaṃ pañhassa veyyākaraṇena cittaṃ na ārādheyyaṃ*; cf V 1:173,9,11; D 1:175,14-15; M 1:85, 2:10, 341,14-342,5 = 2:159,17-160,14.

<sup>80</sup> See Intro (2.2), “Is Soṇa,daṇḍa status-conscious?”

## The brahmins meet the Buddha

9 So the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa approached the Blessed One. Having approached the Blessed One, he exchanged greetings with him. When this courteous and friendly exchange was concluded, he sat down at one side.

Some of the brahmin householders of Campā, too, exchanged greetings with him. When this courteous and friendly exchange was concluded, they sat down at one side.

Some greeted him with their palms together, and then sat down at one side.

Some announced their name and clan before the Blessed One, and then sat down at one side.

Some kept silent<sup>81</sup> and sat down at one side. [119]

10 So the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa sat down right there still thinking those numerous thoughts:

“(1) If I were to ask the recluse Gotama a question, and he were to say: ‘Brahmin, the question should not be asked thus; brahmin, the question should be asked in this way,’

then, this company might censure me thus: ‘The brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is foolish. He is incapable. He is unable to ask the recluse Gotama a proper question.

Whomever this company were to censure, his reputation would diminish. One whose reputation diminishes, his wealth would diminish, too. But our wealth depends on the reputation we have gained!

(2) And if the recluse Gotama were to put a question to me, and I were unable to answer it to win over his mind,<sup>82</sup> he would say this to me: ‘The question should not be answered in that way; it should be answered in this way,’

then, this company might censure me thus: ‘The brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is foolish and incapable. He is unable to answer the recluse Gotama’s question!

Whomever this company were to censure, his reputation would diminish. One whose reputation diminishes, his wealth would diminish, too. But our wealth depends on the reputation we have gained!

(3) If only the recluse Gotama would question me on my own learning [expertise],<sup>83</sup> that is, the Three Vedas! Then I would surely indeed be able to win his mind with an answer to the question!”<sup>84</sup>

## The Buddha questions Soṇa,daṇḍa accordingly

11 Now, the Blessed One, knowing the mind of the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, thought:

“This brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is troubled by his own heart. What now if I were to question him on his own learning, that is, the Three Vedas?”<sup>85</sup>

Then the Blessed One said this to the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa:

“Now, brahmin, by how many qualities do the brahmins declare one an accomplished brahmin, so that one who declares, ‘I am a brahmin,’ would be speaking rightly,<sup>86</sup> and would not be guilty of falsehood?”

<sup>81</sup> This is likely to be a case of social or emotional distance: see **Silence and the Buddha**, SD 44.1 (2.2).

<sup>82</sup> See §8(2) n.

<sup>83</sup> “My own learning,” *sakam ācariyakam*, a stock phrase: **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,3.7+8/2:104 f, 16,3.35/112 f) = **Cetiya S** (S 51.10,11-13/5:261 f) = **Bhūmi,cāla S** (A 8.70,8/4:310 f) = **Āyu,saṅkhār’osajjana S** (U 6.1/63 f); **Ariya,-pariyesanā S** (M 26,15/1:164 f) = **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36,14/1:240) = **Bodhi Rāja,kumāra S** (M 85,12/2:93) = **Saṅgā-rava S** (M 100,11/2:212); where it means “his/her/their own teacher’s or Teachers (the Buddha’s) teaching,” glossed by Comys as “one’s own teacher’s word,” *attano ācariya,vādam* (DA 2:400, 556; SA 3:253; AA 4:151; UA 326; VA 1154). However, here in **Soṇa,daṇḍa S** (D 4,10/1:119), it prob simply means “subject of learning, discipline, trade, craft, profession; system of tenets, (traditional) doctrine, creed” (CPD).

<sup>84</sup> *Addhā vat’assāham cittam ārādheyyam pañhassa veyyākaraṇenā’ti.*

<sup>85</sup> For a similar approach, in response to the evangelical wanderer Nigrodha, see **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25,7.2/3:40), SD 1.4.



**12** Then, this occurred to the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, [120]

“What I wished for, what I desired, what I had in mind, what I had hoped for—that the recluse Gotama questions me on my own learning, that is, the Three Vedas—and it is on that learning of my own, that is, the Three Vedas, that the recluse Gotama asks me! I would surely indeed be able to win his mind with an answer to the question!”

### The 5 qualities of a brahmin

**13** Then, the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, straightening up his body, looked around at the assembly, and said this to the Blessed One:

“By 5 qualities, master Gotama, do the brahmins declare one an accomplished brahmin, so that one who declares, ‘I am a brahmin,’ would be speaking rightly, and would not be guilty of falsehood.

By what 5 qualities?

(1) Here, master Gotama, he is well born on both the mother’s and the father’s sides for 7 generations, with neither reproach nor defect in terms of birth.<sup>87</sup>

(2) He is a mantra-reciter, mantra-expert, a master of the Three Vedas, along with their invocations and rituals, phonology and etymology, and the Iti,hāsa Purāṇas<sup>88</sup> as the fifth; learned in the vedic word structure, grammarian, and well versed in nature lore and the marks of the great man.<sup>89</sup>

(3) He is handsome, good-looking, pleasing, endowed with the most excellent colour, of perfect complexion,<sup>90</sup> of perfect physique, of no mean appearance, one worthy of being looked at.<sup>91</sup>

(4) He is morally virtuous, mature in virtue, endowed with mature virtue.<sup>92</sup>

(5) And he is learned and wise, the first or second to hold out the sacrificial ladle.<sup>93</sup>

These, master Gotama, are the five qualities by which the brahmins declare one an accomplished brahmin: such a one who declares, ‘I am a brahmin,’ would be speaking rightly, and would not be guilty of falsehood.”

### The Buddha’s questions

**14** “Now, brahmin, of these 5 qualities, can we leave out one, by which the brahmins could still declare one an accomplished brahmin: such a one who declares, ‘I am a brahmin,’ would be speaking rightly, and would not be guilty of falsehood?”

“We can, master Gotama. Of these 5 qualities, we could leave out complexion [colour].<sup>94</sup> For, what does complexion matter? If he were to have the other 4 qualities—that is,

<sup>86</sup> The phrase *vadamāno sammā vadeyya*, “(one who) declares...would be speaking rightly” is stock only here (D 4/1:119,32, 120,12+25+30, 121,9+13+23+27+35, 123,28+32. Elsewhere we see the phrase *sammā vadamāno vadeyya*, “(one) speaking rightly would say...,” which is a very common stock in all the 4 Nikāyas and the Vinaya, eg: **Jana.vasabha S** (D 18/2:217,12+ 15); **Pāsādika S** (D 29/3:126,12+15+24, 127,1+9+11); **Bhaya Bherava S** (M 4/1:21,-25+28), **Mahā Sīha,nāda S** (M 12,14+17), **Cha-b,bisodhana S** (M 112/3:28,35, 29,3+8+11), **Bāla Paṇḍita S** (M 129/-3:165,15+17, 172,2+4); cf 3:274,13-14. For other occurrences, search CSCD with “sammā vadamāna vadeyya”.

<sup>87</sup> Same as at §5(1), where see nn.

<sup>88</sup> Iti,hāsa Purāṇas are the oral tradition of brahminical legends of kings and sages.

<sup>89</sup> As at §5(3), where see nn.

<sup>90</sup> *Brahma,vanṇī*, lit “Brahmā-like complexion.”

<sup>91</sup> As at §5(4), where see nn.

<sup>92</sup> As at §5(5), where see nn.

<sup>93</sup> *Paṇḍito ca medhāvī paṭhamo vā dutiyo vā sujarāṇ paggaṇhantānaṃ*. This confirms the brahmin’s leading roles in a Vedic fire (*homa*) puja. As at **Kūṭa,danta S** (D 5,14(4)/1:138), SD 22.8. See also §15(3) below.

(1) Master Gotama, he is well born on both the mother’s and the father’s sides for 7 generations, [121] with neither reproach nor defect in terms of birth.

(2) Master Gotama, he is a mantra-reciter, mantra-expert, a master of the Three Vedas, along with their invocations and rituals, phonology and etymology, and the Iti,hāsa Purāṇas<sup>95</sup> as the fifth; learned in the vedic word structure, grammarian, and well versed in nature lore and the marks of the great man.<sup>96</sup>

(3) Master Gotama, he is morally virtuous, mature in virtue, endowed with mature virtue.<sup>97</sup>

(4) And, master Gotama, he is learned and wise, the first or second to hold out the sacrificial ladle.<sup>98</sup>

These, master Gotama, are the 4 qualities, master Gotama, by which the brahmins declare one an accomplished brahmin: such a one who declares, ‘I am a brahmin,’ would be speaking rightly, and would not be guilty of falsehood.”

15 “Now, brahmin, of these 4 qualities, can we leave out one, by which the brahmins could still declare one an accomplished brahmin: such a one who declares, ‘I am a brahmin,’ would be speaking rightly, and would not be guilty of falsehood?”

“We can, master Gotama. Of these 4 qualities, we could leave out the mantras. For what do the mantras matter? If he were to have the other 3 qualities—that is,

(1) master Gotama, he is well born on both the mother’s and the father’s sides for 7 generations, with neither reproach nor defect in terms of birth;

(2) Master Gotama, he is morally virtuous, mature in virtue, endowed with mature virtue.<sup>99</sup>

(3) And, master Gotama, he is learned and wise, the first or second to hold out the sacrificial ladle.<sup>100</sup>

These, master Gotama, are the three qualities, master Gotama, by which the brahmins declare one an accomplished brahmin: such a one who declares, ‘I am a brahmin,’ would be speaking rightly, and would not be guilty of falsehood.”

16 “Now, brahmin, of these 3 qualities, can we leave out one, by which the brahmins could still declare one an accomplished brahmin: such a one who declares, ‘I am a brahmin,’ would be speaking rightly, and would not be guilty of falsehood?”

“We can, master Gotama. Of these 3 qualities, we could leave out birth (jāti). For what does birth matter? If he were to have the other 2 qualities—that is,

(1) Master Gotama, he is morally virtuous, mature in virtue, endowed with mature virtue.<sup>101</sup>

(2) And, master Gotama, he is learned and wise, the first or second to hold out the sacrificial ladle.<sup>102</sup>

These, master Gotama, are the 2 qualities, master Gotama, by which the brahmins declare one an accomplished brahmin: such a one who declares, ‘I am a brahmin,’ would be speaking rightly, and would not be guilty of falsehood.” [122]

<sup>94</sup> *Vaṇṇa* here refers to one’s complexion or “colour.” The brahmins and kshatriyas often pride themselves as descendants of fair-skinned Aryans. Colour alone, however, does not constitute caste, which comes from the Portuguese *casta*, first used to describe this ancient Indian social feature, but “caste” can refer to either *jāti* or *vaṇṇa*, depending on the context. K R Norman proposes that *jāti* be tr as “descent” (Sn:N 48). And *jāti* as birth means that one born into a brahmin caste is a brahmin, one born into a low caste is lowly. Caste in ancient India is, in fact, a complex interrelationship of birth and occupation, and skin colour may play a secondary role. See **Kaṇṇaka-ṭṭhala S** (M 80) & SD 10.8 (6). See also A L Basham, *The Wonder That Was India*, London 1967: ch V & Piyasilo, *Life of the Buddha*, 1987d:252-258 (App II).

<sup>95</sup> Iti,hāsa Purāṇas are the oral tradition of brahminical legends of kings and sages.

<sup>96</sup> Same as at §5(3), where see nn.

<sup>97</sup> Same as at §5(5), where see nn.

<sup>98</sup> See §13(5) & n.

<sup>99</sup> Same as at §5(5), where see nn.

<sup>100</sup> As at §13(5) above.

<sup>101</sup> Same as at §5(5), where see nn.

<sup>102</sup> See §13(5) & n.

## The brahmins protest

**17** When this was said, the brahmins said this to the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa:

“Do not speak thus, master Soṇa,daṇḍa! Do not speak thus, master Soṇa,daṇḍa!

The master Soṇa,daṇḍa has spoken ill of complexion, spoken ill of mantras, spoken ill of birth.

The master Soṇa,daṇḍa is going over wholesale to recluse Gotama’s doctrine!”

**18** Then the Blessed One said this to the brahmins:<sup>103</sup>

“If you, brahmins, think

that the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is unlearned,

that the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa speaks badly,

that the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is unwise,

that the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa should not discuss with the recluse Gotama with these words,

let the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa stop.

But if you, brahmins, think

that the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is learned,

that the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa speaks well,

that the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa is wise,

that the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa should consult the recluse Gotama with these words,

then, *you*, please stop. Let the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa discuss with me.”

## Soṇa,daṇḍa’s explanation

**19** When this was said, the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa said this to the Blessed One:

“Let the good Gotama stop! Let the good Gotama be silent! Let me myself reply them justly!”<sup>104</sup>

Then the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa said this to the brahmins:

“Say not so, sirs! Say not so, sirs, thus: ‘The master Soṇa,daṇḍa, has spoken ill of complexion, spoken ill of mantras, spoken ill of birth. **[123]** The master Soṇa,daṇḍa is going over wholesale to recluse Gotama’s doctrine!’

Sirs, I do not speak ill of complexion or of mantras or of birth.”

**20** AṅGAKA MĀNAVA. Now at that time, a brahmin youth named Aṅgaka, the son of the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa’s sister, was sitting in the assembly. Then the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa said this to the brahmins:

“Do you, masters, not see this brahmin youth Aṅgaka, our nephew?”

“We do, sir.”

(1) “Sirs, the brahmin youth Aṅgaka is handsome, good-looking, pleasing, endowed with the most excellent colour, of perfect complexion, of perfect physique, of no mean appearance, one worthy of being looked at.

None in this assembly is equal to him in complexion, except for the recluse Gotama.

(2) The brahmin youth Aṅgaka, sirs, is a mantra-reciter, mantra-expert, a master of the Three Vedas, along with their invocations and rituals, phonology and etymology, and the Iti,hāsa Purāṇas as the fifth; learned in the vedic word structure, grammarian, and well versed in nature lore and the marks of the great man.

I myself taught him the mantras.

(3) The brahmin youth Aṅgaka, sirs, is well born on both the mother’s and the father’s sides for 7 generations, with neither reproach nor defect in terms of birth.

<sup>103</sup> For a similar situation involving Ambaṭṭha Māṇava, see **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 3,1.17/1:93 f), SD 21.3.

<sup>104</sup> *Aham eva tesarṇ saha,dhammena paṭivacanarṇ karissāmī’ti.*

I know his parents.

**20.2** Sirs, if the brahmin youth Aṅgaka

were to destroy life, or

were to take the not-given, or

were to go for the women of others, or

were to speak falsehood, or

were to drink intoxicants,

*pāṇam pi haneyya;*

*adinnam pi ādiyeyya;*

*para,dāram pi gaccheyya;*

*musā pi bhaṇeyya;*

*majjam pi piveyya;*

what now, sirs, would complexion do here? What would mantras do here? What would birth do here?

Insofar, sirs, a brahmin

(1) is morally virtuous, mature in virtue, endowed with mature virtue;

(2) and is learned and wise, the first or second to hold out the sacrificial ladle;

endowed with the two qualities, sirs, brahmins declare such a one an accomplished brahmin: such a one who declares, 'I am a brahmin,' would be speaking rightly, and would not be guilty of falsehood."

### Moral virtue and wisdom

**21** "But, brahmin, of these two things, is it possible to leave out one, and to declare one with that single quality a brahmin, and if such a one declares, 'I am a brahmin,' he would be speaking rightly, and would not be guilty of falsehood?" [124]

"Not at all, master Gotama!

**For moral virtue, master Gotama, is purified by wisdom; wisdom purified by moral virtue.**

Where there is moral virtue, there is wisdom. Where there is wisdom, there is moral virtue. For the morally virtuous, there is wisdom; for the wise, there is moral virtue.

And moral virtue and wisdom are declared to be foremost in the world.

Master Gotama, just as one might wash one hand with the other, or one foot with the other, even so, wisdom is fully washed by moral virtue, moral virtue is fully washed by wisdom.<sup>105</sup>

**Where there is moral virtue, there is wisdom; where there is wisdom, there is moral virtue. One who has moral virtue has wisdom; one who has wisdom, has moral virtue. Moral virtue and wisdom are declared to be foremost in the world."**

**22** "So it is, brahmin.

Indeed, brahmin, moral virtue is purified by wisdom; wisdom purified by wisdom.

Where there is moral virtue, there is wisdom. Where there is wisdom, there is moral virtue. For the morally virtuous, there is wisdom; for the wise, there is moral virtue.

And moral virtue and wisdom are declared to be foremost in the world.

But, brahmin, **what is that moral virtue? What is that wisdom?**"<sup>106</sup>

"Regarding this matter, master Gotama, we only know this much at best. It would be good if master Gotama were to explain the meaning of what has been spoken here."<sup>107</sup>

<sup>105</sup> *Seyyathā'pi bho gotama hatthena vā hatthaṃ dhoveyya pādena vā pādaṃ dhoveyya, evam eva kho bho gotama sīla, paridhotā paññā, paññā, paridhotam sīlam.*

<sup>106</sup> It is on account of this question of the Buddha's, reflecting Soṇa,daṇḍa's own earlier statement, that the whole *sāmañña, phala* is here presented only, as it were, as "conduct" and "wisdom," when the usual presentation would follow the "three-training" (*ti, sikkhā*) sequence. See n at header "(A) Moral Development," just before §23a.

<sup>107</sup> Cf the response of monks here: "Bhante, our teachings are rooted in the Blessed One, guided by the Blessed One, have the Blessed One as refuge. It would be good indeed if the Blessed One were to explain its meaning. Having heard the Blessed One, the monks would remember it." This is stock: *Bhagavam, mūlakā no bhante dhammā, bhagavaṃ nettikā, bhagavaṃ paṭisaraṇā. Sādhu vata bhante bhagavata-ñ'eva paṭibhātu etassa bhāsītassa attho. Bhagavato sutvā bhikkhū dhāressantīti.* This is stock: *Bhagavam, mūlakā no bhante dhammā,*

## THE FRUIT OF RECLUESHIP<sup>108</sup>

### (A) MORAL DEVELOPMENT<sup>109</sup>

**23** “In that case, brahmin, listen, pay careful attention. I will speak.”  
“Yes, sir,” the brahmin replied to the Blessed One.

### The fruits of recluseship<sup>110</sup>

The Blessed One said this:

**40** Here, brahmin, there arises in the world the Tathagata [Thus Come One], an arhat and fully self-awakened, accomplished in knowledge and conduct, well-farer, knower of the worlds, unexcelled trainer of tamable persons, teacher of beings human and divine, awakened, blessed.

Having realized by his own direct knowledge this world with its gods, its Māras, and its Brahmās, this generation with its recluses and brahmins, its rulers<sup>111</sup> and people, he makes it known to others. He teaches the Dharma, good in its beginning, good in its middle, good in its end, endowed with meaning and phrasing. He proclaims the holy life that is entirely complete and pure.

**41** A householder or householder’s son, hearing the Dharma, **[63]** gains faith<sup>112</sup> in the Tathagata and reflects:

---

*bhagavaṃ nettikā, bhagavaṃ paṭisaraṇā. Sādhu vata bhante bhagavata-ñ’eva paṭibhātu etassa bhāsitaṃ attho. Bhagavato sutvā bhikkhū dhāressantīti.* This is stock: **Mahā Dhamma, samādāna S** (M 46,2/1:309 f), SD 59.11; **Vīmaṃsaka S** (M 47,3/1:317), SD 35.6; **Naḷakapāna S** (M 68,8/1:465), SD 37.4; **Mahā Suññata S** (M 122,19/3:115), SD 11.4; **Bālena Paṇḍita S** (S 2:24), SD 21.1, **Parivīmaṃsanā S** (S 12.51/2:81), SD 11.5, **Candūpama S** (S 16.3/2:199), SD 38.2; **Sammā, sambuddha S** (S 22.58/3:66), SD 49.10; **Sall’atthana S** (S 36.6/4:208), SD 5.5, **Ānanda S 2** (S 36.16/4:221); **(Tika) Añña Titthiyā S** (A 3.68/1:199), SD 16.4; **Loka, dhamma S** (A 8.6/4:158), SD 48.3; **Kim Mūlaka S** (A 8.83/4:338), SD 32.10; **Sambodhi Pakkhika Dhamma S** (A 9.1/4:351), SD 82.1; **Bhagavā Mūlaka S** (A 10.58/5:106), SD 57.20; **(Ekādasaka) Samādhi S 2** (A 11.20/5:355).

<sup>108</sup> The whole *sāmañña, phala* section here [§§40-99] is nearly the same as that of **Ambaṭṭha S** (D 3,2.2/1:100), SD 21.13, most of which is in turn imported from **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1). The only difference is that §§67-74 of **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2), is listed by Ambaṭṭha S under “conduct” (*carāṇa*), but here (D 4) is listed under “moral virtue” (*sīla*). Ambaṭṭha S puts the dhyanas (*jhāna*) under “conduct,” but are here under “wisdom” (*paññā*). “Wisdom,” as such, incl the dhyanas and the knowledges or “wisdom” (*vijjā*) [§§85, 23a]. “Moral virtue,” as in Ambaṭṭha S, has the same 8 sections. On the *headings* differ; the passages are the same. For a summary of this whole section on moral virtue, see **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2), SD 8.10 (3).

<sup>109</sup> It is on account of the Buddha’s question, “But, brahmin, what is that moral virtue? What is that wisdom?” [§22], reflecting Soṇa, daṇḍa’s own earlier statement [§21], that the whole *sāmañña, phala* pericope is here presented only, as it were, as “conduct” and “wisdom,” when the usual presentation would follow the “3-training” (*ti, sikkhā*) sequence. This is an example of the Buddha’s skillful means in teaching: see **Skillful Means**, SD 30.8.

<sup>110</sup> This important section [§§40-42]—as at **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2,40-42/1:62 f), SD 8.10—shows the true motivation for renunciation and becoming monastics, ie, they are the “higher fruits” of recluseship. This section follows the para no & page no of D 2.

<sup>111</sup> *deva*, here in the sense of “devas by convention” (*sammati, deva*), ie kings. The other 2 types of *deva* are “gods by rebirth” (*upapatti, deva*) and “gods by purification” (*visuddhi, deva*), ie the Buddhas, Pratyeka Buddhas and Arhats. (Nc 307; KhA 123). See §2, “Your majesty” n.

<sup>112</sup> “Faith,” *saddhā*. There are 2 kinds of faith (*saddhā*): (1) “rootless faith” (*amūlika, saddhā*), baseless or irrational faith, blind faith. (M 2:170,21); (2) “faith with a good cause” (*ākāravati, saddhā*), faith founded on seeing (M 1:320,8 401,23); also called *avecca-p, pasāda* (S 12.41.11/2:69). “Wise faith” is syn with (2). *Amūlaka* = “not seen, not heard, not suspected” (V 2:243 3:163 & Comy). **Gethin** speaks of two kinds of faith: the cognitive and the

‘The household life is stifling, a dusty path.<sup>113</sup> The life of renunciation is like the open air. It is not easy living in a house to practise the holy life completely, in all its purity, like a polished conch-shell. What if I were to shave off my hair and beard, put on the saffron robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?’

So after some time he abandons his accumulation of wealth, great and small; he gives up his circle of relatives, great and small; shaves off his hair and beard, puts on the saffron robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness.

**42** When he has thus gone forth, he lives restrained by the rules of the monastic code [Pāṭimokkha], possessed of proper conduct and resort.<sup>114</sup>

Having taken up the rules of training, he trains himself in them, seeing danger in the slightest faults.

He comes to be endowed with wholesome bodily and verbal deeds, his livelihood is purified, and he is possessed of moral virtue.

He guards the sense-doors, is possessed of mindfulness and clear comprehension, and is content.<sup>115</sup>

### THE SHORT SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE

[The moralities §43-63<sup>116</sup> = Brahma,jāla Sutta, D 1.8-27/1:4-11]

#### Right bodily conduct [D 1.8/1:4]

##### **45 And how, brahmin, is a monk accomplished in moral virtue?**

(1) Here, brahmin, having abandoned the destruction of life, a monk<sup>117</sup> abstains from destroying life. He dwells with rod and weapon laid down, conscientious,<sup>118</sup> merciful, compassionate for the welfare of all living beings.

This is part of his moral virtue.<sup>119</sup>

affective (eg ERE: Faith & Jayatilleke, *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge*, 1963:387): “Faith in its cognitive dimension is seen as concerning belief in propositions or statements of which one does not—or perhaps cannot—have knowledge proper (however that should be defined); cognitive faith is a mode of knowing in a different category from that knowledge. Faith is its affective dimension is a more straightforward positive response to trust or confidence towards something or somebody ... the conception of *saddhā* in Buddhist writings appears almost, if not entirely affective, the cognitive element is completely secondary.” (Gethin 2001:107; my emphases).

<sup>113</sup> *Sambādhō gharavāso rajā, patha*. There is a wordplay on *sambādhā*, “crowded, stifling, narrow, full of hindrances,” which also refers to the sexual organ, male (V 1:216, 2:134) or female (V 4:259; Sn 609; J 1:61, 4:260). *Rajā, patha*, “a dusty path,” here refers to “the dust of passion,” and to “the path of returning” (*āgamana, patha*), ie rebirth (DA 1:180,17 = MA 2:179,20; UA 237,27).

<sup>114</sup> “Resort” (*gocara*), lit “the cow’s routine path or pasture.” Here it refers to two aspects of the renunciant’s life. In the Canon, it refers to places that are regarded as suitable for collecting almsfood (V 2:208). In this sense, *agocara* refers to places that are unsuitable for renunciants to resort to (whether for alms or visit) (D 1:63 = It ???; M 1:33; S 5:187; It 96; cf Dh 22). In Comys, *gocara* refers to places suitable for meditation (Vism 127). We can also take *go, cara* here in the psychological sense of *ārammana*, that is, sense-objects. In other words, one “possessed of proper conduct and resort” means “accomplished in proper conduct of body and of mind.”

<sup>115</sup> Ṭhānissaro abridges this section.

<sup>116</sup> The 3 sections (comprising 13 items or groups) on moral virtue occur verbatim (in whole or with some omissions) in all of the first 13 suttas and may once have formed a separate “tract” (D:RD 1:3 n1). See Gethin 2001: 195 f. See Intro (3) above.

<sup>117</sup> *Bhikkhu*: in **Brahma,jāla S** (D 1,8-28/1:3-13), SD 25.2, the reading is *samaṇo Gotamo* throughout.

<sup>118</sup> *lajjī*, “feel shame, modest”, explain in the Comy on S 1:73 as “one who has moral shame (*hiri*) and moral fear (*ottappa*).” Opp *alajjī*, shameless.

(2) Having abandoned the taking of what is not given, he abstains from taking what is not given. He takes only what is given, accepts only what is given, lives not by stealth but by means of a pure mind.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

(3) Having abandoned incelibacy, he lives a celibate life, living apart, abstaining from the sexual act<sup>120</sup>, the way of the village.<sup>121</sup>

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

### **Right Speech** [D 1.9]

**45.2** (4) Having abandoned false speech, he abstains from false speech.

He speaks the truth, the truth is his bond,<sup>122</sup> trustworthy, reliable, no deceiver of the world.<sup>123</sup>

(5) Having abandoned divisive speech, he abstains from divisive speech.

What he has heard here, he does not tell there to break those people apart from these people here.

**[64]** What he has heard there, he does not tell here to break these people apart from those people there.

Thus reconciling those who have broken apart or consolidating those who are united, he loves concord, delights in concord, enjoys concord, speaks words conducive to concord.<sup>124</sup>

(6) Having abandoned abusive speech, he abstains from abusive speech.

He speaks words that are gentle, pleasant to the ear, loving, touching the heart, urbane, delightful and pleasing to the people.<sup>125</sup>

(7) Having abandoned idle chatter, he abstains from idle chatter.

he speaks at the right time,<sup>126</sup> speaks what is true, speaks what is beneficial,<sup>127</sup> speaks what is the teaching,<sup>128</sup> what is the discipline;<sup>129</sup>

<sup>119</sup> *Idam pi'ssa hoti sīlasmim*, lit "this too is in his moral virtue." **Brahmajāla S** refrain: *Thus the ordinary person would praise the Tathāgata* (D 1,8).

<sup>120</sup> *Brahma, cariya* is the supreme conduct or holy life, ie celibacy. DA points out that it involves abstaining from other forms of erotic behaviour besides intercourse.

<sup>121</sup> *gāma, dhamma*, ie the way of the householder, vulgar (in the sense of being associated with the masses).

<sup>122</sup> "The truth is his bond," *sacca, sandha*. Comy glosses as *saccena saccam sandahati*, "he joins truth with truth" (MA 1:206 = DA 1:73).

<sup>123</sup> *Sacca, vādī sacca, sandho theto paccayiko avisamvādako lokassa*. This line as in **Lakkhaṇa S** (D 30,2.16/3:170), SD 36.9.

<sup>124</sup> These 2 lines: *Iti samaggānaṃ vā bhattā, bhinnānaṃ vā anuppadātā, vagg, ārāmo, vagga, rato, vagga, nandī, vagga, karaṇim vācam bhāsītā hoti*. This para is stock, eg **Sāleyyaka S** (M 41,9/1:286 f), SD 5.7 & **Sevitabbāsevitabba S** (M 114,6.7/3:49), SD 39.8.

<sup>125</sup> *Yā sā vācā nelā kaṇṇa, sukhā pemaṇiyā hadayaṃ, gamā porī bahu.jana, kantā bahu.jana, manāpā tathā, rūpim vācam bhāsītā hoti*.

<sup>126</sup> *Kāla, vādī ... bhāsītā hoti kālena*. Here, *kāla-* means "befitting the occasion," while *kālena* means "in time," ie neither too early nor too late.

<sup>127</sup> *Bhūta, vādī attha, vādī*. Comy glosses *attha, vādī*, as that he speaks about what is connected with the spiritual goal here and now, and hereafter (MA 2:208; DA 1:76). However, here, I have rendered *attha* as "the beneficial, the good (incl the goal)," which fits the flow of ideas better. As *attha* (as "goal") appears at the end of this stock passage, I have rendered this closing word as "the goal," which seems more fitting.

he speaks words worth treasuring, spoken in time, [D 1:5] well-reasoned, well-defined [not rambling], connected with the goal.<sup>130</sup>  
This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

### General [D 1.10]

**45.3** (8) He abstains from damaging seeds and plant life.<sup>131</sup>

### Sāmaṇera, sikkhā 6-10 [D 1:6]

- (9) He eats only once a day, abstaining from the evening meal and from food at improper times.<sup>132</sup>
- (10) He abstains from dancing, singing, music and from watching shows.
- (11) He abstains from wearing garlands and from beautifying himself with scents and make-up.
- (12) He abstains from high and luxurious beds and seats.
- (13) He abstains from accepting gold and silver [money].

### General

- (14) He abstains from accepting uncooked grain; raw meat; women and girls; male and female slaves; goats and sheep, fowl and pigs; elephants, cattle, horses, and mares.
- (15) He abstains from accepting fields and lands [property].<sup>133</sup>
- (16) He abstains from running messages [or errands].
- (17) He abstains from buying and selling.
- (18) He abstains from dealing with false scales, false metals, and false measures.
- (19) He abstains from bribery, deception, and fraud.
- (20) He abstains from wounding, executing, imprisoning, highway robbery, plunder, and violence.  
This, too, is part of his moral moral virtue.

## THE MEDIUM SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE

**46**<sup>134</sup> [D 1.11] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on<sup>135</sup> damaging seeds and plant life such as these: plants propagated from roots, stems, joints, buddings, and seeds [65]—he abstains from damaging seeds and plant life such as these.

<sup>128</sup> He speaks on the 9 supramundane things (*nava lok'uttara, dhamma*) (MA 2:208 = DA 1:76), ie the 4 paths, 4 fruitions, nirvana (Dhs 1094).

<sup>129</sup> *Dhamma, vādī vinaya, vādī*. The disciplines of restraint (*saṁvara*) (of the senses) and of letting go (*pahāna*) (of defilements) (MA 2:208 = DA 1:76). We can also connect *attha, vādī* (in the prec line) here, as alt have “He speaks on meanings, he speaks on teachings, he speaks on the discipline.”

<sup>130</sup> *Nidhāna, vatim vācam bhāsita kālena sâpadesam pariyanta, vatim attha, saṁhitam*. *Pariyanta, vati* means “within limits, well defined.” On “the goal” (*attha*), see n on “speaks on the beneficial” above here.

<sup>131</sup> Curiously, this replaces the precept against intoxicants which is omitted.

<sup>132</sup> “Improper times” here means between noon and the following dawn (V 1:83).

<sup>133</sup> The Buddha however accepted land from rajahs like Bimbisāra and Pasenadi, and others like Anāthapiṇḍaka and Visākhā, which were received in the name of the Sangha. What is connoted here is accepting land on a personal basis.

<sup>134</sup> From here on, the numberings of PTS ed & Bodhi's tr (1989) agree. See D 2,17a n (SD 8.10).

<sup>135</sup> “Bent on,” *anuyutta*.



This, too, is part of his moral virtue. [D 1:6]

**47** [D 1.12] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on consuming stored-up goods such as these: stored-up food, stored-up drinks, stored-up clothing, stored-up vehicles, stored-up bedding, stored-up scents, and stored-up meat—he abstains from consuming stored-up goods such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**48** [D 1.13] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on watching shows such as these: dancing, singing, music, plays, ballad recitations, hand-clapping, cymbals and drums, painted scenes,<sup>136</sup> acrobatic and conjuring tricks,<sup>137</sup> elephant fights, horse fights, buffalo fights, bull fights, goat fights, ram fights, cock fights, quail fights; fighting with staves, boxing, wrestling, war-games, roll calls, battle arrays, and troop movements—he abstains from watching shows such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**49** [D 1.14] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are addicted to heedless and idle games such as these—eight-row chess, ten-row chess, chess in the air, hopscotch, spillikins [or jackstraws], dice, stick games, hand-pictures,<sup>138</sup> ball-games [marbles], blowing through toy pipes [playing whistling games with folded leaves], playing with toy ploughs, turning somersaults [acrobatics], playing with toy windmills, toy measures, toy chariots, toy bows, guessing letters drawn in the air or on one's back, guessing thoughts, mimicking deformities—[D 1:7] he abstains from heedless and idle games such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**50** [D 1.15] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are addicted to high and luxurious furnishings such as these—over-sized couches, couches adorned with carved animals, long-haired coverlets, multi-colored patchwork coverlets, white woollen coverlets, woollen coverlets embroidered with flowers or animal figures, stuffed quilts, coverlets with fringes, silk coverlets embroidered with gems; large woollen carpets; elephant, horse, and chariot rugs, antelope-hide rugs, deer-hide rugs; couches with awnings, couches with red cushions for the head and feet—[66] he abstains from using high and luxurious furnishings such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**51** [D 1.16] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, enjoy scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these: rubbing powders into the body, massaging with oils, bathing in perfumed water, kneading the limbs, using mirrors, ointments, garlands, scents, creams, face-powders, mascara [darkening one's eye-lashes], bracelets, head-bands, decorated walking sticks, ornamented water-bottles, swords, fancy sunshades, decorated sandals, turbans, gems, yak-tail whisks, long-fringed white robes—he abstains from using scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

<sup>136</sup> *Sobha, nagarakam*, “of the city of Sobha” (the city of the Gandharvas or heavenly musicians). RD thinks it refers to a ballet with fairy scenes. Bodhi: “art exhibitions.”

<sup>137</sup> *Caṇḍālaṃ vaṃsaṃ dhopanaṃ*, an obscure phrase. The performers were presumable of the lowest caste. DA thinks of an iron ball (used for juggling?). Cf Citta Sambhūta J (J 4:390) where the phrase appears.

<sup>138</sup> The hand is dipped in paint or dye, then struck on the ground or a wall, so that the player creates the figure of an elephant, a horse, etc. In classical Thai literature, the boy genius Sri Thanonchai is well known for this skill.

**52** [D 1.17] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on low chatter,<sup>139</sup> such as these: talking about kings, robbers, ministers of state; armies, dangers, and wars; food and drink; clothing, furniture, garlands, and scents; relatives; vehicles; villages, towns, cities, the countryside; women [D 1:8] and heroes; the gossips of the street and at the well; tales of the dead; tales of diversity [philosophical discussions of the past and the future], the creation of the world and of the sea, and talk of whether things exist or not [or, talk about gain and loss]<sup>140</sup>—he abstains from talking about low topics such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**53** [D 1.18] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, are bent on debates such as these—

‘You do not understand this Dharma [Teaching] and Vinaya [Discipline]. I understand this Dharma and Vinaya. What could you understand of this Dharma and Vinaya? You are practising wrongly. I am practising rightly. I am being consistent. You are inconsistent. What should be said first you said after. What should be said after you said first. What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your viewpoint has been overthrown. You are defeated. Go and try to salvage your viewpoint; extricate yourself if you can!’<sup>141</sup>

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**54** [D 1.19] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, [67] are bent on relaying messages and running errands for people such as these: kings, ministers of state, noble warriors, brahmins, houselords, or youths [who say],

‘Go here, go there, take this there, fetch that here’—he abstains from running messages and errands for people such as these.

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**55** [D 1.20] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, engage in deceitful pretensions [to attainments], flattery [for gain], subtle insinuation or hinting (for gain), pressuring (for offerings), and pursuing gain with gain, he abstains from such pretensions and flattery.<sup>142</sup>

This, too, is part of his moral virtue. [D 1:9]

### THE GREAT SECTION ON MORAL VIRTUE<sup>143</sup>

**56** [D 1.21] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

reading marks on the limbs [eg, palmistry, sole-reading];

<sup>139</sup> *Tiracchāna, kathā*, lit animal talk. As animals mostly walk parallel to the earth, so this kind of talk does not lead on upwards. Cf Lohicca S (D 1:228).

<sup>140</sup> *Iti, bhavābhāva, kathā*, may be rendered as “being and non-being” or as “profit and loss”, but according to Walshe, the philosophical sense (as in Horner and Ñāṇamoli translations of Sandaka S, M 76) is preferable.

<sup>141</sup> This is stock: **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1:8), **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 1:66), **Pāsādika S** (D 3:117), **Saṅgīti S** (D 3:210), **Mahā Sakuludāyi S** (M 2:3), **Sāmagāma S** (M 2:245), **Hālidakāni S 1** (S 3:12), **Viggāhika Kathā S** (S 5:418) and **Mahā Niddesa** (Nm 1:173). See Brahmajāla S, D 1:2 f. Cf **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22) where a similar statement is made regarding the wrong reason for learning the Dharma (M 22.10/1:133).

<sup>142</sup> For details, see Vism 1.61-82.

<sup>143</sup> For Pali listing and nn, see **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1.21-27), SD 25.2.

reading omens and signs;  
 interpreting celestial events [lightning, falling stars, comets];  
 interpreting dreams;  
 reading marks on the body [eg, physiognomy, phrenology];  
 reading marks on cloth gnawed by mice;  
 offering fire oblations, oblations from a ladle, oblations of husks, rice powder, rice grains, ghee, and oil;  
 offering oblations using oral spells;  
 offering blood-sacrifices;  
 making predictions based on the fingertips;  
 determining whether the site for a proposed house or garden is propitious or not [geomancy];  
 making predictions for officers of state;  
 laying demons in a cemetery;  
 laying spirits;  
 reciting house-protection charms [or knowledge of charms recited by those living in an earthen house];  
 snake charming, treating poisoning, curing scorpion-stings and rat-bites;  
 interpreting animal and bird sounds and the cawing of crows;  
 foretelling the remaining duration of life;  
 reciting charms for protection against arrows;  
 reciting charms to understand the calls of birds and animals  
 —he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.  
 This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**57** [D 1.22] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:  
 determining lucky and unlucky gems, staffs, garments, swords, arrows, bows, and other weapons;  
 determining lucky and unlucky women, men, boys, girls, male slaves, female slaves;  
 determining lucky and unlucky elephants, horses, buffaloes, bulls, cows, goats, rams, fowl, quails, lizards [or iguana], long-eared rodents,<sup>144</sup> tortoises, and other animals  
 —he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.  
 This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**58** [D 1.23] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such **[68]** as forecasting thus: [D 1:10]  
 the leaders [rajahs]<sup>145</sup> will march forth [advance];  
 the leaders will return [retreat];  
 our leaders will attack, and their leaders will retreat;  
 their leaders will attack, and our leaders will retreat;  
 there will be triumph for our leaders and defeat for their leaders;  
 there will be triumph for their leaders and defeat for our leaders;  
 thus there will be triumph, thus there will be defeat

<sup>144</sup> *Kaṇṇika, lakkaṇaṃ*, from *kaṇṇa*, “ear.” DA thinks it means either ear-rings or house-gables, both of which do not fit here. Walshe follows the Thai *tr* which, probably following an old tradition, has *tun*, “bamboo-rat” (see McFarland, *Thai-English Dictionary*, p371). Franke says “an animal that is always mentioned with the hare” and considers that it must mean an animal with long ears.

<sup>145</sup> *Raṇṇaṃ* (gen pl), ie the joint leaders (rajah) of a republican state in ancient India.

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.  
This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**59** [D 1.24] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as forecasting thus:

there will be a lunar eclipse;  
there will be a solar eclipse;  
there will be an occultation of an asterism;  
the sun and moon will go their normal courses;  
the sun and moon will go astray;  
the asterisms will go their normal courses;  
the asterisms will go astray;  
there will be a meteor shower;  
there will be a darkening of the sky;  
there will be an earthquake;  
there will be thunder coming from a clear sky;  
there will be a rising, a setting, a darkening, a brightening of the sun, moon, and asterisms;  
such will be the result of the lunar eclipse, of the solar eclipse *and so on*

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these. [D1:11]  
This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**60** [1.25] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such **[69]** as forecasting thus:

there will be abundant rain; there will be a drought;  
there will be plenty; there will be famine;  
there will be rest and security; there will be danger;  
there will be disease; there will be health [freedom from disease];  
or they earn their living by counting, accounting, calculation,  
composing poetry, or teaching hedonistic arts and doctrines

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.  
This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**61** [D 1.26] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:

calculating auspicious dates for marriages (where the bride is brought home or leaves the house), betrothals, divorces;  
calculating auspicious dates for collecting debts or making investments and loans; reciting charms for becoming attractive or unattractive;  
curing women who have undergone miscarriages or abortions [or, reviving the fetuses of abortive women];<sup>146</sup>  
reciting spells to bind a man's tongue, to paralyze his jaws, to make him lose control over his hands, or to bring on deafness;  
getting oracular answers to questions addressed to a mirror, to a young girl, or to a spirit medium;  
worshipping the sun, worshipping Mahā Brahmā, bringing forth flames from the mouth, invoking the goddess of luck

—he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.

<sup>146</sup> *Viruddha, gabbha, karaṇam.*

This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

**62** [D 1.27] Or, whereas some good recluses and brahmins, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood through the low arts such as:  
 promising gifts to deities in return for favors; fulfilling such promises;  
 demonology;  
 teaching house-protection spells;  
 inducing virility and impotence;  
 consecrating sites for construction;  
 giving ceremonial mouthwashes and ceremonial bathing;  
 offering sacrificial fires;  
 preparing emetics, purgatives, expectorants, diuretics, headache cures;  
 preparing ear-oil, eye-drops, oil for treatment through the nose, collyrium [eye-wash] and counter-medicines;  
 curing cataracts, practising surgery, practising as a children’s doctor, administering medicines and treatments to cure their after-effects  
 —he abstains from wrong livelihood through such low arts as these.<sup>147</sup> [D 1.27 ends here.] [D1:12]  
 This, too, is part of his moral virtue.

### **Confidence through practising the above moralities**

**63** A monk, brahmin, thus accomplished in moral virtue sees no danger anywhere owing to his restraint through moral virtue. Just as a head-anointed noble kshatriya rajah who has defeated his enemies sees no danger anywhere from his enemies, [70] in the same way the monk thus accomplished in moral virtue sees no danger owing to his restraint through moral virtue.

Possessing this aggregate of noble moral virtue, he experiences within himself a joy that is blameless.

This is how, brahmin, a monk is accomplished in moral virtue.<sup>148</sup>

## (B) MENTAL DEVELOPMENT

### Sense-restraint (Custody of the senses)

**64** And how, brahmin, does a monk guard the sense-doors?

<sup>149</sup>Here, brahmin, on seeing a form with the eye, a monk does not grasp at its sign [appearance] or its details.<sup>150</sup> For, on account of dwelling without restraint over the eye-faculty, bad, unwholesome qualities such as covetousness or discontent might assail him.

<sup>147</sup> It is the practice of medicine for gain that is here condemned. (Walshe)

<sup>148</sup> For a summary of this whole section on moral virtue, see **Sāmañña, phala S** (D 2), SD 8.10 (3).

<sup>149</sup> This whole para: *Idha mahārāja bhikkhu cakkhunā rūpaṃ disvā na nimitta-g, gāhī hoti nānuyyañjana-g, gāhī. Yatvādhikaraṇaṃ enaṃ cakkhundriyaṃ asaṃvutaṃ viharantaṃ abhijjhā, domanassā pāpakā akusalā dhammā an-vāssaveyyuṃ tassa saṃvarāya paṭipajjati, rakkhati cakkhundriyaṃ, cakkhundriye saṃvaraṃ āpajjati.*

<sup>150</sup> *Na nimitta-g, gāhī hoti nānuyyañjana-g, gāhī*, lit “he is not one who grasps at a sign, he is not one who grasps at a detail (feature).” Comys say that “**sign**” (*nimitta*) here refers to a grasping arising through one’s sensual lust (*chanda, rāga, vasena*) or on account of one’s view (*diṭṭhi, matta, vasena*): see **Nimitta**, SD 19.7; “**details**” (*anuyyañjana*) here refers to finding delight by grasping at another’s limb or body part (eyes, arms, legs, etc) (Nm 2:390; Nc 141,

On hearing a sound with the ear, a monk does not grasp at its sign or its details. For, on account of dwelling without restraint over the ear-faculty, bad, unwholesome qualities such as covetousness or discontent might assail him.

On smelling a smell with the nose, a monk does not grasp at its sign or its details. For, on account of dwelling without restraint over the nose-faculty, bad, unwholesome qualities such as covetousness or discontent might assail him.

On tasting a taste with the tongue, a monk does not grasp at its sign or its details. For, on account of dwelling without restraint over the tongue-faculty, bad, unwholesome qualities such as covetousness or discontent might assail him.

On feeling a touch with the body, a monk does not grasp at its sign or its details. For, on account of dwelling without restraint over the body-faculty, bad, unwholesome qualities such as covetousness or discontent might assail him.

On cognizing a mind-object with the mind, a monk does not grasp at its sign or its details. For, on account of dwelling without restraint over the mind-faculty, bad, unwholesome qualities such as covetousness or discontent might assail him.

Possessing this noble restraint over the sense-faculties, he experiences within himself a joy that is blameless.

This, brahmin, is how a monk guards the sense-doors.

## Mindfulness and clear comprehension<sup>151</sup>

**65** And how, brahmin, is a monk possessed of mindfulness and clear comprehension?

Here, brahmin, when going forward and returning, he acts with clear comprehension:

- |   |                                       |
|---|---------------------------------------|
| (1) in going forward or going backward [stepping back],   | clearly comprehends what he is doing. |
| (2) In looking forward or looking back,   | clearly comprehends what he is doing. |
| (3) In bending or stretching,   | clearly comprehends what he is doing. |
| (4) In carrying his upper robe, outer robe and bowl,  | clearly comprehends what he is doing. |
| (5) In eating, drinking, chewing and tasting,   | clearly comprehends what he is doing. |
| (6) In voiding or peeing,   | clearly comprehends what he is doing. |
| (7) In walking, in standing, in sitting, in being asleep,<br>in being awake, <sup>152</sup> in talking, or in remaining silent, | clearly comprehends what he is doing. |

This, brahmin, is how **[71]** a monk is possessed of mindfulness and clear comprehension.

## Contentment

**66** And how is a monk content?

Here, brahmin, he is content with robes to protect his body and with almsfood to sustain his belly, and wherever he goes he sets out only with these with him.

Here, just as a bird, wherever it goes, flies with its wings as its only burden; so too is he content with robes to protect his body and with almsfood to sustain his belly, and wherever he goes, he takes only these with him.

---

141; DhsA 400, 402; cf MA 1:75, 4:195; SA 3:4, 394; Nc 1:55; DhA 1:74). See *Nimitta & anuvyañjana*, SD 19.14. On other meanings of *nimitta*, see SD 13 §3.1a.

<sup>151</sup> *Sati, sampajañña = sati*, “mindfulness,” *sampajañña*, “clear comprehension.” In *Satipaṭṭhāna Ss*, however, this section is “clear comprehension” (*sampajañña*); “mindfulness” (*sati*). See SD 13 (3.6.1+2+3).

<sup>152</sup> “When asleep, when awake” *sutte jāgarite* (both loc of reference). Comy glosses *sutte* as *sayane*, “lying down, reclining.” See SD 13.1 (3.6.2).

This, brahmin, is how a monk is content.

### Abandoning the mental hindrances

**67** Possessing this aggregate of noble moral virtue and this aggregate of noble sense-restraint and this aggregate of noble mindfulness and clear comprehension and this aggregate of noble contentment, he seeks out a secluded dwelling: a forest, the foot of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, a jungle grove, the open air, a heap of straw.<sup>153</sup>

Returning from his almsround, after his meal, he sits down, crosses his legs, keeps his body erect, and establishes mindfulness before him.<sup>154</sup>

**68** (1) Abandoning **covetousness** with regard to the world, he dwells with a mind devoid of covetousness. He cleanses his mind of covetousness.

(2) Abandoning **ill will and anger**, he dwells with a mind devoid of ill will, sympathetic with the welfare of all living beings. He cleanses his mind of ill will and anger.

(3) Abandoning **sloth and torpor**, he dwells with a mind devoid of sloth and torpor, mindful, alert, perceiving light. He cleanses his mind of sloth and torpor.

(4) Abandoning **restlessness and worry**, he dwells undisturbed, his mind inwardly stilled. He cleanses his mind of restlessness and worry.

(5) Abandoning **spiritual doubt**, he dwells having crossed over doubt, with no perplexity with regard to wholesome mental states. He cleanses his mind of doubt.

### Similes for the hindrances

**69** (1) Suppose, brahmin, a man, taking a loan, invests it in his businesses. His businesses succeed. He repays his old debts and there is a surplus for maintaining his wife. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, taking a loan, I invested it in my businesses. **[72]** Now my businesses have succeeded. I have repaid my old debts and there is a surplus for maintaining my wife.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

**70** (2) Suppose, brahmin, a man falls sick, in pain and seriously ill. He does not enjoy his meals, and there is no strength in his body. As time passes, he recovers from that sickness. He enjoys his meals and there is strength in his body. The thought would occur to him,

'Before, I was sick. Now, I have recovered from that sickness. I enjoy my meals and there is strength in my body.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

**71** (3) Suppose, brahmin, a man is bound in prison. As time passes, he eventually is released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him,

<sup>153</sup> This stock phrase of 9 places conducive to meditation are found at D 1:72, 207, 2:242, 3:49; M 1:181, 269, 274, 346, 440, 441, 2:162, 226, 3:3, 35, 115-117; A 2:210, 3:92, 100, 4:436, 5:207; Nm 1:26, 140, 2:341; Miln 369. A shorter list, probably later, is mentioned in **Anāpāna,sati S** (M 118): "Here, monks, a monk who has gone to the forest or to the foot of a tree or to an empty place, sits down, and having crossed his legs and keeping his body upright, establishes mindfulness before him." (M 118,17/3:82).

<sup>154</sup> Comy. He applies mindfulness towards his meditation subject; or he sets it up in the region of the mouth. As such, it is said in the Vibhaṅga: "This mindfulness is set up, set up well, at the tip of the nose or at the sign of the mouth" (Vbh §537/252). Nṭ: The "sign of the mouth" (*mukha,nimitta*) is the middle region of the upper lip, against which the air strikes when it comes out of the nose.

‘Before, I was bound in prison. Now, I am released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.’ Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

**72** (4) Suppose, brahmin, a man is a slave, subject to others, not subject to himself, unable to go where he likes. As time passes, he eventually is released from that slavery, subject to himself, not subject to others, free, able to go where he likes. The thought would occur to him,

‘Before, I was a slave ... Now I am released from that slavery, subject to myself, not subject to others, freed, able to go where I like.’ **[73]** Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

**73** (5) Suppose, brahmin, a man, carrying money and goods, is journeying on a road through the wilderness. As time passes, he eventually emerges from the wilderness, safe and sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him,

‘Before, carrying money and goods, I was journeying on a road through the wilderness. Now I have emerged from the wilderness, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.’ Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

**74** In the same way, brahmin, when these 5 hindrances are not abandoned in himself, the monk regards it as a debt, a sickness, a prison, slavery, a journey on a road through the wilderness.<sup>155</sup>

**75** When he is aware that these 5 hindrances are abandoned in him, he regards it as solvency, good health, release from prison, emancipation, a place of security.

## Resultant joy and peace

**76**<sup>156</sup> Seeing that they have been abandoned within him, he becomes glad. For one who is glad, zest arises. For one whose mind is zestful, the body becomes tranquil. One tranquil in body becomes happy. For one who is happy, the mind concentrates.<sup>157</sup>

## THE 4 DHYANAS<sup>158</sup>

### The 1<sup>st</sup> dhyana

<sup>155</sup> MA 2:318-321 explains this section in some detail: see App to **Mahā Assa,pura S** (M 39), SD 10.13.

<sup>156</sup> From here on, the numbering breaks off from the PTS ed and follows Bodhi’s (1989:40). See §46 n.

<sup>157</sup> *Tass’ime pañca nīvaraṇe pahīṇe attani samanupassato pāmojjaṃ jāyati. Pamuditassa pīti jāyati. Pīṭimanassa kāyo passambhati. Passaddha,kāyo sukhaṃ vedeti. Sukhino cittaṃ samādhīyati.* This important stock passage is found throughout the Nikāyas: **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,76/1:73), **Poṭṭhapāda S** (D 9,10.1/1:182), **Subha S** (D 10,2.-21/1:207), **Kevaḍḍha S** (D 11,44/1:214), **Tevijja S** (D 13/1:250), **Saṅgīti S** (D 33/3:241, 243), **Das’uttara S** (D 34/-3:279 (×5)), **Vatthūpama S** (M 7/1:38 (×3)), **Cūḷa Assa,pura S** (M 40,8/1:283); **Ānāpāna,sati S** (M 118/3:86 (×2), 87 (×2)); **Pamāda,vihārī S** (S 35.97/4:78 (×2), 79 (×2)); **Pāṭaliya S** (S 42.13/4:352 (×2), 353-358); **Sīla S** (S 46.3/5:69 (×2)), **Upakkilesa S** (S 46.33/5:92), **Anupakkilesa S** (S 46.34/5:93 (×2)), **Bhikkhuṇī Vāsaka S** (S 5:156 (×2)), **Ānanda S** (S 54.13/5:332 (×2), *sambojjhaṅga*), **Bhikkhū S** (S 54.16/5:339 (×2), *sambojjhaṅga*), **Nandiya S** (S 55.40/5:398 (×3), 399); **Parisa S** (A 3.93/1:243), **Ājāniya S** (A 3.94/1:244), **Jāta,rūpa S** (A 3.100 /1:254, 257, 258); **Vimuttāyatana S** (A 5.26/3:21, 22 (×2), 23 (×2)); **(Agata,phala) Mahānāma S** (A 6.10/3:285 (×2), 286, 287 (×2), 288); **(Dasaka) Cetanā,karaṇīya S** (A 10.2/5:3); **(Eka,dasaka) Cetanā,karaṇīya S** (A 11.2/5:312), **Paṭhama Mahānāma S** (A 11.12/-5:329, 330 (×2), 331 (×2), 332), **Dutiya Mahānāma S** (A 11.13/5:334).

<sup>158</sup> Note that this is listed under Wisdom, when usu it would be under Concentration (which is not mentioned here). See n at header “(A) Moral Development,” just before §23a. See Intro (3.2).



**77** (1) Quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states, he reaches and dwells in the **first dhyana**, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness, born of solitude.<sup>159</sup>

He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body<sup>160</sup> with the zest and happiness born of solitude.<sup>161</sup> [74]

**78** Brahmin, just as if a skilled bathman or bathman’s apprentice would pour bath powder into a brass basin and knead it together, sprinkling it again and again with water, so that his ball of bath lather—saturated, moisture-laden, permeated within and without—would not drip; even so, the monk permeates—this very body with the zest and happiness born of solitude. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and happiness born of solitude.

## The 2<sup>nd</sup> dhyana

**79** (2) And, furthermore, brahmin, with the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he reaches and dwells in **the second dhyana**, free from initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration.<sup>162</sup>

He permeates and pervades, [75] floods and fills this very body with the zest and happiness born of concentration.

**80** Brahmin, just as a lake with spring-water welling up from within, having *no* inflow from the east, *no* inflow from the west, *no* inflow from the north, or *no* inflow from the south, and the skies not pouring frequent and timely torrents.<sup>163</sup> Yet the cool spring welling up from within the lake would permeate and pervade, flood and fill it with cool waters—there being no part of the lake unpervaded by the cool waters.

Even so, the monk permeates this very body with the zest and happiness born of concentration. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by zest and happiness born of concentration.

## The 3<sup>rd</sup> dhyana

**81** (3) And furthermore, brahmin, with the fading away of zest, he dwells equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and experiences happiness with the body. He reaches and dwells in **the third dhyana**, of which the noble ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’

He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the happiness free from zest.

<sup>159</sup> On the omission of “one-pointedness of mind” (*cittassa ek’aggatā*) and “concentration” (*samādhi*) here, see **The Laity and Dhyana**, SD 8.4.

<sup>160</sup> Here “body” (*kāya*) refers to the “mental body” (*nāma,kāya*), ie feeling (*vedanā*), perception (*saññā*), formations (*saṅkhāra*), and consciousness (*viññāṇa*) (Vism 4.175/169).

<sup>161</sup> These are the dhyana factors: *vitakka vicāra pīti sukhasa ek’aggatā*, respectively.

<sup>162</sup> The 2<sup>nd</sup> dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (*ariya,tuṅhī,bhāva*) because within it initial application and sustained application (*vitakka,vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur. (S 2:273); cf. S 4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī,saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. In Ariya,pariyesanā S (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate).

<sup>163</sup> Be Ee *devo ca na kālena kālaṃ sammā dhāraṃ anupaveccheyya. Ce devo ca kālena kālaṃ sammā dhāraṃ nānupaveccheyya. Se omits na: devo ca kālena kālaṃ sammā dhāraṃ anupaveccheyya. See D 1:74 n6. For preferring the na reading, see Dhyana, SD 8.4 (8.2).*

**82** Brahmin, just as in a pond of the blue lotuses, red and white lotuses, or white lotuses,<sup>164</sup> born and growing in the water, stay immersed in the water and flourish without standing up out of the water, so that they are permeated, pervaded, suffused and filled with cool water from their roots to their tips, and nothing of those lotuses would be unpervaded with cool water; even so, the monk permeates this very body with the happiness free from zest, so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded with this happiness free from zest.

## The 4<sup>th</sup> dhyana

**83** (4) And furthermore, brahmin, with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain,<sup>165</sup> and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure, attains and dwells in **the fourth dhyana** that is neither painful nor pleasant, and with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.<sup>166</sup>

He sits, pervading the body with a pure, bright mind,<sup>167</sup> so that there is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded by a pure, bright mind.

**84** Brahmin, just as if a man were sitting covered from head to foot with a white cloth, [76] so that there would be no part of his body to which the white cloth did not extend; even so, the monk sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright mind. There is no part of his entire body that is not pervaded by pure, bright mind.

## Insight knowledge

**85** <sup>168</sup>Furthermore, brahmin, with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and cleansed, unblemished, free from defects,<sup>169</sup> pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable, he directs and inclines it to **knowledge and vision**. This wisdom of his, too, brahmin, is that **wisdom**.<sup>170</sup> He understands thus:

<sup>164</sup> *uppala* (Skt *utpala*), *paduma* (*padma*) and *puṇḍarīka* respectively. This simile also found in **Kāya, gatā, sati S** (M 119,20/3:93 f). See **Āyācana S** (S 6.12/1:138) where the simile of lotuses in a pond is applied to beings of different spiritual dispositions.

<sup>165</sup> “Joy ... pain,” *sukha-dukkha*: this refers to the physical feelings. The next phrase—“pleasure and displeasure,” *domanassa-somanassa*—refers to mental feelings, which have been transcended earlier. Mental feelings need to be overcome first so that the mind is not distracted by itself, as it were. Then, all the other feelings (arising from the physical sense-contacts) are transcended. On the significance of this, see **Sall’atthana S** (S 36.6/4:207-210), SD 5.5.

<sup>166</sup> Here, **Vibhaṅga** gives 3 factors of the 4<sup>th</sup> dhyana—equanimity (*upekkhā*), mindfulness (*sati*) and one-pointedness of mind (*cittassa ek’aggatā*)—according to the Sutta analysis (Vbh 261), and 2 factors—equanimity and one-pointedness of the mind—according to the Abhidhamma analysis (Vbh 164; Vism 4.183/165). See **Dhyana**, SD 8.4 (5.4).

<sup>167</sup> See **Accharā Vagga** (A 1.6.1-2): “Monks, this mind is radiant (*pabhassara*), but it is defiled by defilements from outside. The untutored ordinary person does not understand this as it really is. As such, for him there is no personal development.” (A 1:10). On reaching the 4<sup>th</sup> dhyana, the practitioner becomes directly aware of the truly and naturally pure nature of the mind. See also A:ÑB 1999 §4.

<sup>168</sup> This and foll passage = **Subha S** (D 10,2.21-22/1:209).

<sup>169</sup> *upakkilesa*: to be distinguished from *kilesa*, “defilement.” Perhaps the 10 “imperfections of insight” listed in Vism 20.105-130/633-638 are meant here, but potential hindrances at a certain stage of insight meditation. (Walshe)

<sup>170</sup> See heading “(A) Moral Development” n, just before §23a.

‘This body of mine is form composed of the four great elements,<sup>171</sup> born from mother and father, nourished with rice and porridge, subject to inconstancy, rubbing, pressing, dissolution, and dispersion.<sup>172</sup> And this consciousness of mine lies attached here, bound up here.’<sup>173</sup>

**86** <sup>174</sup>Brahmin, just as if there were a beautiful beryl<sup>175</sup> gem of the purest water—eight faceted, well polished, clear, limpid, consummate in all its aspects, through which runs a blue, or yellow, or red, or white thread, or brown thread<sup>176</sup>—and a man with good eyesight, taking it in his hand, were to reflect on it thus:

‘This is a beautiful beryl gem of the purest water—eight faceted, well polished, clear, limpid, consummate in all its aspects, through which runs a blue, or yellow, or red, or white, or brown thread.’

Even so, brahmin—with his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and cleansed, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and utterly unshakable*—

he directs and inclines it to knowledge and vision.

He understand thus:

‘This body of mine is form, composed of the four great elements, born from mother and father, nourished with rice and porridge, subject to uncertainty, rubbing, pressing, breaking up and destruction. **[77]** And this consciousness of mine lies attached here, bound up here.’<sup>177</sup>

## Knowledge of the mind-made body

<sup>171</sup> The 4 great (or primary): earth (*mahā, bhūtā*), water, fire, wind (D 1:214; Vism 11.27; Abhs 154).

<sup>172</sup> See **Vammika S** (M 23,4/1:144) for parable of the anthill (representing the body).

<sup>173</sup> This statement means that consciousness here (in a physical being) is dependent on the physical body. RD points out that this and other passages disprove the idea that the consciousness (*viññāṇa*) transmigrates. For holding such a view, Sāti was severely rebuked by the Buddha (M 38). A new re-linking consciousness (*paṭisandhi*) arises at conception, dependent on the old one (see Vism 17.164 ff).

<sup>174</sup> This and prev passage = **Subha S** (D 10,2.21-22/1:209) = **Mahā Sakuludāyi S** (M 77,29/2:17). The beryl simile, relating to the Bodhisattva’s gestation period (as a foetus), at **Mahāpadāna S** (D 14,1.21/2:13) = **Acchariya Abbhūta S** (M 123,12/3:121). *Paṇḍu.sutta* is found in **Vidhura Paṇḍita J** (J 545/6:305), where E B Cowell & W H D Rouse tr it as “white thread” (J:C&R 6:147).

<sup>175</sup> *Veluriya*: from a metathesis of *veruliya* comes Greek *beryllos* “beryl”, whence German *Brille* “spectacles” (originally of beryl). (Walshe)

<sup>176</sup> “Through which runs ... etc,” *tatra suttam āvutam nilam vā pītam vā lohitaṃ vā odātam vā paṇḍu, suttam vā*. Rhys Davids tr *pīta* here as “orange-coloured,” and *paṇḍu* as “yellow” (D:RD 1:87), while Bodhi has as “yellow” and “brown” respectively (1989:44). *Paṇḍu, sutta* is found in **Vidhura Paṇḍita J** (J 545/6:305), where Cowell & Rouse tr it as “white thread” (J:C&R 6:147). Both *pīta* and *paṇḍu* sometimes refer to “yellow.” SED def *pāṇḍu* as “yellowish white, white, pale.” Comys offer no explanation, except that the gem “is like the physical body, and the thread running through it is like insight knowledge (*vipassanā, ñāṇa*)” (DA 1:211). DANṬ (New Subcomy) corrects “insight knowledge” to “insight consciousness” (*vipassanā, viññāṇa*, DANṬ :VRI 2:126). **Jothiko**: “Generally, ‘knowledge and vision’ is the ability, the state of clarity, enabling one to see even hidden things clearly. So the image of a transparent gem. It is both ‘higher than Jhāna’, if the absorptions are taken as ‘pleasant abiding in the here and now.’ And ‘less than the absorptions’ if they are used as a way of reaching full enlightenment. So, obviously, it is not the *sammā ñāṇa*—knowledge of liberation. The colors at old were often associated with natural phenomena. *Paṇḍu* is earthen colors, the word used even today to denote the dyeing of robes: various natural hues of brown, mostly. Just as *lohita* is both ‘blood’ and the color of ‘red,’ *pitta [pīta]* is ‘bile’ and its shades, mostly ‘light green,’ off yellow.” (email 13 Nov 2006). It is possible that the six colours represent the six sense-consciousnesses. The first 4 colours are those of the colour *kaṣiṇa* meditations: see **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16,3.29-32/2:110 f), SD 9. See **Viññāṇa**, SD 17.8a (4.1).

<sup>177</sup> This statement means that consciousness here (in a physical being) is dependent on the physical body.

**87** With his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he directs and inclines it to creating a **mind-made body**.<sup>178</sup> From this body he creates another body, endowed with form,<sup>179</sup> mind-made, complete in all its parts, not inferior in its faculties.

**88** Brahmin, just as if a man were to draw a reed from its sheath, the thought would occur to him: 'This is the sheath, this is the reed. The sheath is one thing, the reed another, but the reed has been drawn out from the sheath.'

Or, brahmin, as if a man were to draw a sword from its scabbard. The thought would occur to him: 'This is the sword, this is the scabbard. The sword is one thing, the scabbard another, but the sword has been drawn out from the scabbard.'

Or, brahmin, as if a man were to pull a snake out from its slough. The thought would occur to him: 'This is the snake, this is the slough. The snake is one thing, the slough another, but the snake has been pulled out from the slough';

even so, brahmin, with his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he directs and inclines it to creating a mind-made body. From this body he creates another body, endowed with form, mind-made, complete in all its parts, not inferior in its faculties.

## KNOWLEDGE OF THE MODES OF SUPERNORMAL POWER

### *Mundane superknowledge [§89-98]*

#### (1) Psychic powers

**89** With his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he directs and inclines it to **[78] the manifold psychic powers**.<sup>180</sup>

Having been one he becomes many; having been many he becomes one.

He appears, and vanishes.

He goes unhindered through walls, through ramparts, and through mountains as if through space.

He dives in and out of the earth as if it were water.

He walks on water without sinking as if it were earth.

Sitting cross-legged, he flies through the air like a winged bird.

With his hand he touches and strokes even the sun and the moon, so mighty and powerful.

He has power over his body up to as far as the Brahmā world.

<sup>178</sup> "Mind-made body," *mano, mayā kāya*. Peter Harvey: "This shows that consciousness is seen as able to leave the physical body by means of a mind-made body. Such a body could be seen as a kind of 'subtle body,' for a being with a mind-made body is said to feed on joy (D 1:17), not on solid nutriment (D 1:195): it thus lacks the four great elements of the physical body (solidity, cohesion, heat and motion, D 1:195). As such a body relates to the 'realm of (pure) form,' the subtle matter composing it can only be visible and audible matter (Vbh 405). However, the mind-made body is invisible to the normal eye (Pm 2:209). It occupies space, but does not impinge on gross physical matter, for the 'selfhood' of a certain god with a mind-made body is said to be as large as two or three fields, but to cause no harm to anyone (A 3:122). With such a body, a person can exercise psychic powers such as going through solid objects, being in many places at once, or flying (D 1:78)." (1993:8 digital ed)

<sup>179</sup> Exactly the same as the physical body (but mentally created). This mind-made body is what is mistaken for a soul or self.

<sup>180</sup> *Iddhi, vidhā*. Cf **Kevalāḍḍha S** (D 11,5) where the Buddha disapproves of exhibiting such powers.

**90** Brahmin, just as a skilled potter or his assistant could craft from well-prepared clay whatever kind of pottery vessel he likes, or, brahmin, as a skilled ivory-carver or his assistant could craft from well-prepared ivory any kind of ivory-work he likes, or, brahmin, as a skilled goldsmith or his assistant could craft from well-prepared gold any kind of gold article he likes—

even so, brahmin, with his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he has power over his body up to as far as the Brahmā world. [79]

## (2) Clairaudience (divine ear)

**91** With his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he hears, by means of the **divine-ear element**,<sup>181</sup> purified and surpassing the human, both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far.

**92** Brahmin, just as if a man travelling along a highway were to hear the sounds of bheri [conical drum], mridanga [tom-tom],<sup>182</sup> conch-shell, cymbals, and dindima [small drum], he would know,

‘That is bheri sound; that is mridanga sound; that is conch sound; that is cymbal sound; that is dindima sound’—

even so, brahmin, with his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he hears, by means of the divine ear-element, purified and surpassing the human, both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far.

## (3) Mind-reading

**93** With his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he directs and inclines it to **the knowledge of mind-reading**.

He knows the minds of other beings, other individuals, having encompassed them with his own mind.<sup>183</sup>

*He knows a mind with lust as a mind with lust,*

*and a mind without lust as a mind without lust. [80]*

*He knows a mind with aversion as a mind with aversion,*

*and a mind without aversion as a mind without aversion.*

*He knows a mind with delusion as a mind with delusion,*

*and a mind without delusion as a mind without delusion.*

*He knows a contracted mind [due to sloth and torpor] as a contracted mind,*

*and a distracted mind [due to restlessness and worry] as a distracted mind.*

*He knows an exalted mind [through the lower or higher dhyana] as an exalted mind,*

*and an unexalted mind [not developed by dhyana] as an unexalted mind.*

*He knows a surpassable mind as a surpassable mind,*

<sup>181</sup> “Divine-ear element,” *dibba,sota,dhātu*, clairaudience.

<sup>182</sup> “Mridanga,” *mutiṅgā*, vl *mudiṅgā* (V 1:15, S 2:267). See **Āṇi S** (S 20.7.2) n, SD 11.13.

<sup>183</sup> The following section (italicized) is a list of mental states is apparently taken from **Satipaṭṭhāna Ss** (D 22,12/-2:299 = M 10,34/1:59), where it fits more appropriately. (Walshe, D:W 546 n131). On another def of mind-reading (4 kinds), see **Sampasādaniya S** (D 28,6/3:103 f), SD 14.10.

*and an unsurpassable mind as an unsurpassable mind<sup>184</sup>.  
He knows a concentrated mind as a concentrated mind,  
and an unconcentrated mind as an unconcentrated mind.  
He knows a released mind as a released mind,  
and an unreleased mind as an unreleased mind.*

**94** Brahmin, just as if a **young man or woman, fond of ornaments**, examining the reflection of his or her own face in a bright mirror or a bowl of clear water would know ‘blemished’ if it were blemished, or ‘unblemished’ if it were not—

even so, brahmin, with his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he knows the minds of other beings, other individuals, having encompassed them with his own mind.

*He knows a mind with lust as a mind with lust,  
and a mind without lust as a mind without lust.  
He knows a mind with aversion as a mind with aversion,  
and a mind without aversion as a mind without aversion.  
He knows a mind with delusion as a mind with delusion,  
and a mind without delusion as a mind without delusion.  
He knows a contracted mind [due to sloth and torpor] as a contracted mind,  
and a distracted mind [due to restlessness and worry] as a distracted mind.  
He knows an exalted mind [through the lower or higher dhyana] as an exalted mind,  
and an unexalted mind [not developed by dhyana] as an unexalted mind.  
He knows a surpassable mind as a surpassable mind,  
and an unsurpassable mind as an unsurpassable mind<sup>185</sup>.  
He knows a concentrated mind as a concentrated mind,  
and an unconcentrated mind as an unconcentrated mind.  
He knows a released mind as a released mind,  
and an unreleased mind as an unreleased mind.*

—he knows each of them just as it is. **[81]**

#### **(4) The knowledge of the recollection of past lives**

**95** With his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he directs and inclines it to **the knowledge of the recollection of past lives**.<sup>186</sup>

He recollects manifold past existence, that is to say,

one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births,  
ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births,  
one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births,  
many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion,  
many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:

<sup>184</sup> Unsurpassable (*anuttaram*) mind, probably synonymous with “developed” mind. See D:W 592 n667.

<sup>185</sup> Unsurpassable (*anuttaram*) mind, probably synonymous with “developed” mind. See D:W 592 n667.

<sup>186</sup> *Pubbe, nivāsanānussati*, lit “recollection of past abiding [existence].” The remainder of this is expanded into 4 sections in **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1,1.31-34/1:13-16 + SD 25.3(76.3)) and 3 sections in **Sampasādaniya S** (D 27,15-17/3:-107-112), SD 10.12. In both cases, each explains how the eternalist view arose.

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’

Thus, brahmin, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details.<sup>187</sup>

**96** Just as if a man were to go from his home village to another village, and then from that village to yet another village, and then from that village back to his home village. The thought would occur to him,

‘I went from my home village to that village over there. There I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way. From that village I went to that village over there, and there I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way. From that village I came back home’;<sup>188</sup> **[82]**

Even so, brahmin, with his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

*he recollects his manifold past existence, that is to say,*

*one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births,  
ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births,  
one hundred births, one thousand births, one hundred thousand births,  
many aeons of cosmic contraction, many aeons of cosmic expansion,  
many aeons of cosmic contraction and expansion, thus:*

‘There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of joy and pain, such my life-span. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.’

Thus, brahmin, he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes and details.<sup>189</sup>

## (5) The knowledge of the rebirth of beings (the divine eye)

**97** With his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he directs and inclines it to **the knowledge of the passing away and re-arising of beings**.<sup>190</sup>

He sees—by means of the divine eye [clairvoyance],<sup>191</sup> purified and surpassing the human—

beings passing away and re-arising,

and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, in the heavens, in the suffering states,

faring in accordance with their karma:

‘These beings—who were endowed with bad conduct of body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—after death,

<sup>187</sup> This knowledge is detailed at Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

<sup>188</sup> The 3 villages are the world of sense-desire, the form world, and the formless world (DA).

<sup>189</sup> This knowledge is detailed at Vism 13.13-71/411-423.

<sup>190</sup> *Cutūpapāta ñāṇa*, or “knowledge of rebirth according to karma” (*yathā,kammūpaga ñāṇa*), or “the divine eye” (*dibba,cakkhu*): see foll n.

<sup>191</sup> *Dibba,cakkhu*, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (*dhamma,cakkhu*) (see n in §104). On the relationship of this knowledge to the 62 grounds for wrong views, see **Brahma,jāla S (D 1) @ SD 25.3(76.3)**. See prec n.

when the body has broken up, have re-arisen in a plane of misery, an bad destination, a lower realm, in hell.

But these beings—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—after death, when the body has broken up, have reappeared in a happy destination, in heaven.’

Thus, brahmin, by means of the divine eye, **[83]** purified and surpassing the human—

*beings passing away and re-arising,  
and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate,  
in the heavens, in the suffering states,  
faring in accordance with their karma.*

**98** Brahmin, just as if there were a mansion in the central square [where four roads meet], and a man with good eyesight standing on top of it were to see people entering a house, leaving it, wandering along the carriage-road, and sitting down in the central square [where four roads meet]. The thought would occur to him,

‘These people are entering a house, leaving it, walking along the streets, and sitting down in the central square [where four roads meet].’<sup>192</sup>

Even so, brahmin, with his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

he sees by means of the divine eye, purified and surpassing the human—

*beings passing away and re-arising,  
and he knows how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate,  
in the heavens, in the suffering states,  
faring in accordance with their karma.*

### (C) DEVELOPMENT OF WISDOM

## (6) The knowledge of the destruction of mental influxes

**99** With his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady and utterly unshakable,*

the monk directs and inclines it to **the knowledge of the destruction of the mental influxes.**<sup>193</sup>

<b>99.2</b> He knows, as it really is, that	this is suffering;
he knows, as it really is, that	this is the arising of suffering;
he knows, as it really is, that	this is the ending of suffering;
he knows, as it really is, that	this is the path to the ending of suffering; <sup>194</sup>

<sup>192</sup> On the significance of this simile in confirming canonical acceptance of the intermediate state (*antarā, bhava*), see “**Is Rebirth Immediate?**” SD 2.17.8.

<sup>193</sup> *Āsava-k, khaya, ñāṇa*. The term *āsava* (lit “flow”) comes from *ā-savati* “flows towards” (ie either “into” or “out” towards the observer). It has been variously translated as canker, taints (“deadly taints”, RD), corruptions, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, bad (influence), or simply left untr. The Abhidhamma lists four *āsava*: the influx of (1) sense-desire (*kām’āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence or becoming (*bhav’āsava*), (3) views (*ditṭh’-āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjāsava*) (D 16,2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These four are also known as “floods” (*oghā*) and “yokes” (*yogā*). The list of 3 influxes (omitting the influx of views) is probably older and is found more frequently in the Suttas (D 33.1.10(20)/3216; M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). The destruction of these *āsavas* is equivalent to arhathood. See BDict under *āsava*.



He knows, as it really is, that	these are mental influxes;
he knows, as it really is, that	this is the arising of influxes;
he knows, as it really is, that	this is the ending of influxes;
he knows, as it really is, that	this is the path to the ending of influxes. <sup>195</sup>

**99.3** His mind, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the influx of sensual desire, the influx of existence, the influx of ignorance.<sup>196</sup> With release, there is the knowledge, ‘Released (am I)!’ He knows that ‘Birth is ended, the holy life has been lived, done is that which needs to be done. There is nothing further beyond this.’<sup>197</sup>

**99.4** Brahmin, just as if there were a pool of water in a mountain glen, clear, limpid, unsullied,<sup>198</sup> where, a person with good eyes, from its edge, would see shellfish and shells, or gravel and pebbles, or shoals of fish moving about or resting in it,<sup>199</sup> and it would occur to him,

‘This pool of water is clear, limpid, and unsullied. Here are these shells, gravel, and pebbles, and also these shoals of fish swimming about and resting’—even so, with his mind thus *concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and utterly unshakable,*

**99.5** the monk directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the ending of the mental influxes.

<i>He knows, as it is really is, that</i>	<i>this is suffering;</i>
<i>he knows, as it really is, that</i>	<i>this is the arising of suffering;</i>
<i>he knows, as it really is, that</i>	<i>this is the ending of suffering;</i>
<i>he knows, as it really is, that</i>	<i>this is the path to the ending of suffering;</i>

<i>He knows, as it really is, that</i>	<i>these are mental influxes;</i>
<i>he knows, as it really is, that</i>	<i>this is the arising of influxes;</i>
<i>he knows, as it really is, that</i>	<i>this is the ending of influxes;</i>
<i>he knows, as it really is, that</i>	<i>this is the path to the ending of influxes.’</i>

His mind, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the influx of sensual desire, the influx of existence, the influx of ignorance. With release, there is the knowledge, ‘Released (am I)!’ He knows that ‘Birth is ended, the holy life has been lived, done is that which needs to be done. There is nothing further beyond this.’

**99.6** This wisdom of his, too, brahmin, is that **wisdom**.<sup>200</sup>

<sup>194</sup> These 4 statements on suffering pose an interesting problem: they are not called “noble truths” here (nor in **Ariya,pariyesanā S**, M 26,43). Norman remarks that these four statements, which also likewise appear in **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36,42/1:249), but are not referred to as the noble truths about suffering, “and since they appear to be subordinate to the four statements about the *āsavas*, it is possible that the statements about misery are a later addition [here], which led to a parallel, but inappropriate, set of four statements being evolved about the *āsavas*, to provide a symmetry” (Norman 1990:26). For a discussion on the formulation of the noble truths, see Norman 1982:377-91 & also Schmithausen 1981:205.

<sup>195</sup> As in **Ariya,pariyesanā S** (M 26,42), SD 1. On the application of the 4-truth template to both *dukkha* and to *āsava* here, see Analayo 2003:224 n28 & SD 17.4(8.4)

<sup>196</sup> See §97a n.

<sup>197</sup> *Nāparam itthatāya*: lit, “there is no more of ‘thusness.’” See SD 53.1 (3.2.2).

<sup>198</sup> “Clear, limpid, unsullied,” *accho vipassanno anāvalo*.

<sup>199</sup> *Udaka,rahado accho vipassanno anāvalo tattha cakkhumā puriso tīre t̄hito passeyya sippi,sambukam pi sak-khara,kat̄halam pi maccha,gumbam pi carantam pi tiṭṭhantam pi*. This whole section also in **Pañihita Acchanna Vagga** (A 1.5.5-6) in the same context, differently worded.

## Sona,daṇḍa goes for refuge

**24** When this was said, the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa said this to the Blessed One:

“Excellent, master Gotama! Excellent, **[125]** master Gotama! Just as if, master Gotama, one were to place upright what had been overturned, were to reveal what was hidden, were to show the way to one who was lost, or were to hold up a lamp in the dark so that those with eyes could see forms, in the same way, in numerous ways, the Dharma has been made clear by master Gotama.

I go to the Blessed Gotama [the Lord] for refuge, to the Dharma, and to the community of monks. May the Blessed Gotama remember me as a layman who has gone for refuge, from this day forth, for life.

May master Gotama, along with the community of monks, accept a meal tomorrow.”

The Blessed One consented by his silence.

## The Buddha accepts Soṇa,daṇḍa’s alms-offering

**24.2** Then, the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, having known the Blessed One’s consent, rose from this seat, saluted the Blessed One, and keeping him to the right, departed.

Then the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, prepared exquisite foods, hard and soft, at his own sacrificial arena,<sup>201</sup> and when the night had passed [at dawn], announced the time to the Blessed One:

“Master Gotama, it is time for the meal.”

**25** Then, the Blessed One, along with the order of monks, to the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa’s sacrificial arena. Having arrived there, he sat down on the prepared seat.

Then the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa, with his own hands, served the order of monks headed by the Buddha, with his own hand, exquisite food, hard and soft, and satisfied them.

When the Blessed One had finished his meal and taken his hand out of his bowl, the brahmin Soṇa,daṇḍa sat on a low seat at one side.

## Soṇa,daṇḍa’s diplomacy and “faith” in the Buddha

Seated thus at one side, he said this to the Blessed One:

**26** (1) “Master Gotama, if when I, having gone into in an assembly, were to rise from my seat and salute<sup>202</sup> master Gotama, the assembly would censure me. Whomever this company were to censure, his reputation would diminish. One whose reputation diminishes, his wealth would diminish, too. Our wealth depends on the reputation we have gained!<sup>203</sup>

Master Gotama, if when I, having gone into in an assembly, were to clasp my palms in anjali, let master Gotama take that as my rising up to him.<sup>204</sup>

<sup>200</sup> See heading “(A) Moral Development” n, just before §23a. See also SD 56.1 (5.2.2.3).

<sup>201</sup> Sacrificial pit, *yaññāvāṭa* (Ce PTS) (Skt *yajña, vāṭa*): better reading is *yañña, vāṭa* (Be Ce), and as suggested by Kern (*Toevoegselen*, sv): D 1:142, 148; J 1:135.3:45. 517, 6:215 (*yaññavāṭa*); cf *yaññavāṭaka* (C 1.7,2). Cf CPD: *avaṭa*, a hole; a pit (or basin).

<sup>202</sup> “(Were to) salute,” *abhivādeyyaṃ*, ie with palms together, bow respectfully before someone by way of greeting, or sending off, or departing.

<sup>203</sup> Here, Soṇa,daṇḍa verbally expresses his thoughts at §8. See Intro (2).

<sup>204</sup> *Ahañ c’eva kho pana bho gotama parisa,gato samāno añjalim paggaṇheyyaṃ, āsanā me taṃ bhavaṃ gotamo paccuṭṭhānaṃ dhāretu.*

And, master Gotama, if when I, [126] having gone into in an assembly, were to take off my turban, let master Gotama take that as my salutation with my head.

(2) Master Gotama, if when I, going in a vehicle, were to step down from the vehicle and salute master Gotama, the assembly would censure me. Whomever this company were to censure, his reputation would diminish. One whose reputation diminishes, his wealth would diminish, too. Our wealth depends on the reputation we have gained!

Master Gotama, if when I, going in a vehicle, were to raise up my staff of my goad, let master Gotama take that as my stepping down from the vehicle.<sup>205</sup>

And, master Gotama, if when I, going in a vehicle, were to lower my parasol, let master Gotama take that as my saluting master Gotama with me head."<sup>206</sup>

27 Then, the Blessed One instructed, inspired, roused and gladdened him with a Dharma talk,<sup>207</sup> rose from his seat and departed.

— evaṃ —

## Bibliography

- Chakravarti, Uma  
1987 *The Social Dimensions of Early Buddhism*. Delhi: Munishiram Manoharlal, 1996.
- Gethin, Rupert  
2001 *The Buddhist Path to Awakening: A study of the Bodhi-pakkhiyā Dhammā*. [Leiden: EJ Brill, 1992.] 2<sup>nd</sup> ed sb Oxford: Oneworld, 2001.
- Keown, Damien  
1992 *The Nature of Buddhist Ethics*. London: Macmillan, 1992; esp 38 f.
- Rhys Davids, T W  
1899 (tr) *Dialogues of the Buddha* part 1 [tr of Dīgha Nikāya 1-13]. London: Pali Text Society, 1899: 137-143. For tr & intro essay, see <http://www.sacred-texts.com/bud/dob/dob-04in.htm>.

090820 090922 091207 100730 101130 111225 120918 130915 151218 161207 171030 180906 190809  
201201 220428

<sup>205</sup> *Ahañ c'eva kho pana bho gotama yāna,gato samāno patoda,laṭṭhiṃ abbhunnāmeyyaṃ, yānā me bhavaṃ gotamo paccorohanāṃ dhāretu.*

<sup>206</sup> *Ahañ c'eva kho pana bho gotama yāna,gato samāno chattaṃ apanāmeyyaṃ, sirasā me taṃ bhavaṃ gotamo abhivādanaṃ dhāretū'ti.* Comy explains the reason for Soṇa,daṇḍa's attitude as that he would be saluting someone young enough to be his grandson (DA 292), but see Intro (2.2). Both T W Rhys Davids (1899) and M Walshe (1995, 1996) have mistranslated a few key words in this section. These curious remarks may be explained by the fact that to Soṇa,daṇḍa, the Buddha "was young enough to be his grandson" (DA 292): see Intro (2.2).

<sup>207</sup> "Instructed, ... and gladdened them," *dhammiyā kathāya sandassetvā samādapetvā samuttejetvā sampahaṃsetvā*. This action sequence reflects the basic structure of the Buddha's teaching method: (1) the Dharma is shown (*sandassetvā*); (2) the listener/s are filled with enthusiasm (*samādapetvā*); (3) they are fired with commitment (*samuttejetvā*); and (4) filled with joy (*sampahaṃsetvā*). The Comys explain that by instructing, the Buddha dispels the listener's **delusion**; by inspiring him, **heedlessness** is dispelled; by rousing him, **indolence** is dispelled; and by gladdening, brings the practice to a **conclusion**. In short, when we teach Dharma to benefit others, we should do our best to **bring instruction, inspiration, motivation and joy** to the listener (DA 1:300; UA 242; SnA 446). These four qualities are, in fact, the sixth or last of the ideal skills of a Dharma speaker (**Udāyi S**, A 3:184).