

4

Naḷaka,pāna Sutta

The Discourse at Naḷaka,pāna | M 68

Theme: The destinies of true disciples and the purpose of the holy life

Translated by Piya Tan ©2007, 2011

1 Places and names

1.1 NAḶAKA,PĀNA

1.1.1 The village's name. Naḷaka,pāna was a village in Kosala. Its name came from the Naḷaka,pāna (“cane-drinking”) lotus lake (*pokkharāṇī*).¹ The fascinating story behind the lake's name is given in **the Naḷa,pāna Jātaka** (J 20). Once when the Bodhisattva was born as the king of a troop of 80,000 monkeys, he warned them never to eat or drink in any strange places in the forest without his consent.

One day, the thirsty monkeys arrived at a lake, but would not drink until the leader arrived. On arriving, he carefully examined the area and waters, and learned that it was inhabited by an ogre. He provided each of the monkeys with very long reeds (*naḷaka*). By the power of his virtue, the reed became hollow. Using this helpful device, they sat down beside the lake at a safe distance and drank to their hearts' content. By the power of the monkey-king's virtue, the reeds in that area became hollow thenceforth.²

1.1.2 Palāsa,vana. There are two groves near the village, that is, the *ketaka,vana* and the *palāsa,vana* (*vana* means “forest”). The *ketaka* is a screwpine with the botanic name of *Pandanus odoratissimus*, called kedgi or kedva in Hindi.³ The palash (*palāsa*), according to the Majjhima Commentary, is the *kiṃsuka* tree (MA 3:180).⁴ Its botanic name is *Butea monosperma* or *Butea frondosa*. In Bengali and Hindi, it is called “kimshuka” or “palash,” and in Tamil, “porasum,” that is, the parrot tree or flame of the forest.⁵

The palash forest is the venue for at least three discourses, all called **Naḷaka,pāna Sutta** (M 68; A 10.67).⁶ In the former (M 68), the Buddha speaks on the spiritual destinies of his true disciples and the purpose of the holy life.⁷ As for the latter (A 10.67), there are actually two suttas of the same name, both give by Sāriputta—the **Naḷaka,pāna Suttas 1 & 2** (A 10.67+68)—at the Buddha's request. Both Suttas are on the 5 qualities for wholesome growth, that is, faith (*saddhā*), moral shame (*hiri*), moral fear (*ottappa*), effort (*virīya*), and wisdom (*paññā*).⁸

The palash tree is also the subject of **the Palāsa Jātaka** (J 307), a rather uncharacteristic story said to be related by the Buddha in connection with Ānanda's weeping at the door-bolt of the garden shed (*uyyāna,ovarake kapi,sīsam*), grieving that the Buddha would pass away soon. The story is about how a poor brahmin faithfully worships a tree-deity, who rewards him with hidden treasure.⁹ The moral of the story clearly alludes to Ānanda's devotion to the Buddha.

¹ MA 3:180; AA 5:44.

² J 20/1:170-172. Referred to MA 3:178.

³ It is a perennial shrub that grows up to 5 m high, with long leaves and aerial stilt roots: further see <http://ayurvedicmedicinalplants.com/plants/2169.html>.

⁴ For a *kiṃsuka* simile, see **Kiṃsuka S** (S 35.245/4:191-195), SD 53.10.

⁵ For pictures, http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Trees_of_India; for details & refs, see http://wiki.encyclopaediaindica.com/~encyclo3/wiki/index.php?title=PARROT_TREE

⁶ M 68/1:462-468; A 10.67+68/5:122-128.

⁷ M 68/1:462-468 @ SD 37.4.

⁸ *Vuddhi kusala,dhamma* (A 10.67/5:122). See **Udakūpama S** (A 7.15/4:11-15), SD 28.6 (2.1). Cf *ariya,vaddhi*, [§10c] n.

⁹ J 307/3:23-25.

1.2 THE SONS OF FAMILY

1.2.0 The Naḷaka,pāna Sutta (M 68) is a straightforward discourse on the purpose of Buddhist training, or more specifically, the celibate holy life (*brahma,cariya*). Like the opening of **the Ānāpāna,sati Sutta** (M 118),¹⁰ the Naḷaka,pāna Sutta, too, is the occasion for the Buddha to reflect on the presence of a number of prominent young monks, namely,¹¹ **Anuruddha, Bhaddiya**¹² [Nandiya],¹³ **Kimbila** [Kimila],¹⁴ **Bhagu**,¹⁵ **Kuṇḍa,dhana**¹⁶ [Koṇḍañña],¹⁷ **Revata** [1.2.3], and **Ānanda** [§2].

1.2.1 Anuruddha is Mahānāma's brother, from whom he hears of the endless rounds of household chores, and so decides to renounce the world. His mother, however, only consents after his cousin Bhaddiya renounces with him. During the 2nd year of the Buddha's ministry, Anuruddha, Bhaddiya, Kimbila, Bhagu, Ānanda, Devadatta, and their barber, Upāli, approach the Buddha at the Anupiya Mango Grove, where they are ordained.¹⁸ Before the rains residence is over, Anuruddha gains the "divine eye" or clairvoyance (*dibba,cakkhu*), for which he is declared to be foremost amongst the monks (A 1:23; AA 1:135).¹⁹

1.2.2 Kondañña

1.2.2.1 AÑÑĀ KOṆḌAÑÑA. The best known of the Buddha's disciples named Koṇḍañña is clearly Añña Koṇḍañña, the first in the group of 5 monks who attends to the Buddha before his awakening. As such, he is *the seniormost of all the monks*. It is said that he sits in the assembly of monks behind the two chief

¹⁰ M 118,2/3:79 (SD 7.13).

¹¹ Anuruddha, Bhaddiya, Ānanda, Bhagu, Kimbila, Deva,datta, and their barber, Upāli, are said to have ordained together at the Anupiya mango grove during the 2nd year of the Buddha's ministry (V 2:180-183; AA 1:191; DhA 1:133, 4:127; Mvst 3:177-182). **Cūḷa Gosiṅga S** (M 31) has this list: Anuruddha, Nandiya, Kimbila (M 31/1:205,18 f). On their attainments, see AA 1:191; ApA 270.

¹² Be. On **Bhaddiya**, see V 2:182-184; UA 161. Bhaddiya attains arhathood in the same year as his renunciation (AA 1:191 f; VA 1274). His verses are at Tha 842-865. This is a different Bhaddiya from the group of 5 monks at the Buddha's first discourse (S 56.11/5:420-424), SD 1.1.

¹³ Ce Ee.

¹⁴ On **Kimbila**, see **(Anuruddha) Upakkilesa S** (M 128) @ SD 5.18 (7). It is said that at Anupiya Mango Grove, the Buddha, in order to rouse a sense of urgency in Kimbila, projects the hologram of a beautiful woman in her prime who then rapidly passes through the phases of decay into old age. Kimbila keeps up his friendship with Anuruddha and Nandiya, and they dwell together as monks. Once, at Veluvana, when the Buddha asks Kimbila about the benefits of the mindfulness of breathing, he is unable to answer even after being questioned thrice. Ānanda then intercedes and suggests that the Buddha should himself answer the question for the benefit of the monks (S 54.10/5:322 f). Kimbila's verses are found in the **Thera,gātha** (Tha 118, 155 f).

¹⁵ On **Bhagu**, see **(Anuruddha) Upakkilesa S** (M 128) @ SD 5.18 (4). SA 2:304. Bhagu is best known for determination in his meditation. One day, as he is leaving his cell to drive away his drowsiness, he falls on the terrace, which spurs him on to gain liberation there and then. In due course, he wins arhathood. The Buddha later praises him on his solitude. The Buddha discourses to him after the noon meal, right through the night till dawn. (Tha 271-274; ThaA 2:112; cf V 1:350, 2:182; M 3:155; DhA 1:56, 133; J 1:140, 3:489; Miln 107)

¹⁶ Ee Se.

¹⁷ Be.

¹⁸ On **their ordination**, see V 2:180-183; Mvst 3:180 f. See also V 1:350-352; DhA 1:133, 137 f. On their foremost qualities, see DA 1192.

¹⁹ On Anuruddha, further see **(Anuruddha) Upakkilesa S** (M 128) @ SD 5.18 (5) & **Pārileyya S** (S 22.81/3:94-99), SD 6.1 (2).

disciples. Finding that living near the Buddha is too “crowded” (*akiṇṇa*) for him, he decides to go into solitary living.²⁰

After seeking the Buddha’s permission, he retires to the banks of the Mandākini lotus lake in the Chaddanta forest in the Himalayas (the traditional haunt of pratyeka buddhas), where he lives a solitary life for twelve years, finally returning only to take leave of the Buddha for his (Koṇḍañña’s) parinirvana.²¹ **Puṇṇa Mantānī,putta** is his nephew (his mother, Mantānī, is Koṇḍañña’s sister) [1.2.4.2] and is ordained by Koṇḍañña.²²

However, the Sutta says that the monks listed are “sons of family” (*kula,putta*) [§2 passim], which, as a rule, refers to a youth, such as Yasa²³ or Ambaṭṭha,²⁴ The word *kula,putta* means “a person born of a good family, a noble youth (of any birth).”²⁵ Elsewhere, we find no reference to Aññā Koṇḍañña²⁶ as *kula,putta*. It is therefore likely that the reference here is to another Koṇḍañña. There are at least two other well known namesakes, that is, Vimala Koṇḍañña and Khāṇu Koṇḍañña.

1.2.2.2 VIMALA KOṆḌAÑÑA is the son of the courtesan Ambapālī and king Bimbisāra. Vimala was his earlier name, but later he came to be called Vimala Koṇḍañña. Once when the Buddha visits Vesālī, Vimala is impressed by his majesty. He renounces the world and soon attains arhathood. A discourse given by him helps Ambapālī to cultivate insight and gain arhathood (ThīA 207).

Vimala Koṇḍañña’s verse is a riddle:

<i>Dum’avhayāya uppanno</i>	Born of the one named after a tree, ²⁷
<i>jāto paṇḍara,ketunā</i>	he is begotten of the white banner. ²⁸
<i>ketuhā ketunā yeva</i>	With that very banner, the banner-destroyer
<i>mahā,ketuṃ padhaṃsayīti</i>	has destroyed the great bannered one. (Tha 64)

The Commentary explains the riddle as follows. The first line means that Vimala Koṇḍañña is born of Vesālī’s foremost courtesan, Amba,pālī (“protected by the mango tree”), so called because she is said to have been spontaneously born under a mango-tree (ThīA 206). The second line refers to his father being “the white banner” rajah, that is, Bimbisāra, and *jāto* also alludes to his high birth (*abhijāti*). In the third

²⁰ SA 1:280; AA 1:148.

²¹ His moving farewell meeting with the Buddha is recorded in **Koṇḍañña S** (S 8.9/1:193 f; AA 1:148).

²² MA 2:154; AA 200-203; ThaA 1:37 f, 3:111; ApA 272 f.

²³ Comys mention Yasa as a “boy” (*dāraka*) (AA 1:100, 147), ie, not older than a teenager, or as a “son of family” (*kula,putta*) (V 1:15, 350; DhA 1:88; BA 19).

²⁴ D 1:93; but the reality is that he is *akula,putta*, “not born of a good family,” ie a low-born (*dujjāta*, D 1:93).

²⁵ Opp *akula,putta*, “a person of not good family” (J 2:223,22’ *dujjātiko ~o = dukkulīno*). The single quote mark means that it is a gloss in a comy. Its abstract n is *kola,putti* (A 1:38; AA 2:40) & *kola,puttiya* or *kola,puttika* (Nm 80; Vbh 353VA 219; SA 2:210), but they are rare and found mostly in later works.

²⁶ On **Koṇḍañña**, see **Dhamma,cakka Pavattana S** (S 56.11) @ SD 1.1 (1). On the origin of his sobriquet & surname: Aññā (or Aññāta) Koṇḍañña, see V 1:12,18 = S 5:424,10; S 1:193,31 f. On Aññāsi ~, cf V 1:12,17) = A 1:23,-17 (cf AA 1:136-148); J 1:82,11; U 77,1 (Aññāta ~; UA); MA 2:37,19; DhA 1:97,1; ThīA 3,8 (~-*pamukhā aṭṭhārasa brahma,koṭṭiyō*); DhA 1:87,1 (do); DhsA 35,21 (do). Author of Tha 673-688; Ap 48,24-50,5.

²⁷ “Tree-named one” (*dum’avhaya*) refers to Amba,pālī (“the mango sheltered”), who is said to be born under a mango tree. The “white-bannered” (*paṇḍara,ketu*) is king Bimbi,sāra, Vimala’s father. The banner-destroyer (*ketu,ha*) is the Buddha himself, and the “banner” (*ketu*) here is conceit (*māna*), which prevents the attaining of arhathood. The other banner is the Dharma (“The Dharma is the seer’s banner,” *dhammo hi isinaṃ dhajo*, S 2:280; A 2:51; J 539/5:509; ie, the 4 paths, 4 fruits & nirvana, SA 2:239; AA 3:90). The “great-bannered one” (*mahā,ketu*) is Māra teh evil one. (ThaA 1:156 f)

²⁸ Our Bodhisattva, when reborn in Tusita, is known as Setamketu, “the white-bannered one” (VA 1:161; MA 1:125; NmA 2:446); see **Seta,ketu J** (J 377/3:232-237), also J 1:401.

line, the first *ketu* (“banner”) means “conceit” (*māna*) while the second *ketu* means “wisdom” (*paññā*). In the fourth line, “the great bannered one” (*mahā, ketu*) refers to Māra and his demonic host, who are routed by Vimala Koṇḍañña when he becomes an arhat (ThaA 1:156 f).

In the time of Vipassī Buddha, it is said, he was a rich householder. One day, while listening to the Buddha teaching to a large crowd, he felt greatly joyful, and offered him four golden flowers. The Buddha then made the flower’s golden hue pervade the whole area.

Vimala soon died and was reborn in Tusita. Forty three aeons ago, it is said, he became king sixteen times under the name of Nemī (ThaA 1:156*).

1.2.2.3 KHĀṆU KOṆḌAÑÑA, it is said, becomes an arhat as a forest monk. One day, while sitting on a flat rock, he enters into dhyana. That night, a gang of thieves, taking him for a tree stump, pile their loot over him, and sleep around him. In the morning, shocked by their mistake, they beg for his forgiveness. After listening to his teaching, they all become monks.

It is this incident that gives him the nick-name of Khāṇu (“stump”), and for which he wins the Buddha’s praise (DhA 2:254 f). Khāṇu Kondañña’s concentration (*samādhi*) here is classified under the “power of samadhi intervention” (*vipphārā samādhi iddhi*), as it is undisturbed even by the chaos of the thieves throwing their loot over him.²⁹

As a meditator who attains deep dhyana, it is likely that Khāṇu Koṇḍañña would dwell alone. Since Khāṇu Koṇḍañña is a lone forest-dweller, and Añña Koṇḍañña is a very old monk, it is most likely that the Koṇḍañña of this Sutta is Vimala Koṇḍañña.

1.2.3 Revata. There are two great elders of the Buddha’s time named Revata. From the Thera, gāthā commentarial list of the 80 great elders (*asīti mahā, therā*), we might deduce that this is Kaṅkhā Revata (the doubter). The relevant excerpt reads: *anuruddho kaṅkhā, revato ānando nandako bhagu nando kimilo bhaddiyo...* (ThaA 3:205). The other great elder named Revata is **Khadira, vaniya Revata**, who lives in an acacia forest, and who is listed later in the same list.³⁰

Kaṅkhā Revata comes from a wealthy Sāvattī family. It is said that, after his noon meal, he goes to listen to the Buddha at Kapila, vatthu, and, inspired by his teaching, joins the order (Ap 539/2:491 f). Before becoming an arhat, he is greatly troubled as to what is allowable for him and what is not. As a result of this, he is nick-named “the doubter” (*kaṅkhā*).³¹ However, through fervent practice, he attains dhyana and is freed. In fact, he is so good in dhyana that the Buddha declares him to be the foremost of dhyana meditators (*jhāyī*) amongst the monks.³²

²⁹ See Vism 12.30-35/380 f (esp §33); DhA 8.10/2:254 f; also BA 24; PmA 497.

³⁰ Sāriputta’s youngest brother (DhA 2:189): see also **Anaṅgaṇa S** (M 5), SD 37.7 (3.3.3.3).

³¹ UA 314 f; Kvu 2:3. See (**Kaṅkhā**) **Revata S** (U 5.7/60), SD 32.15. Following the comy list of the 80 great elders (*asīti mahā, therā*), it is likely that this is Kaṅkhā Revata. The relevant excerpt reads: *anuruddho kaṅkhā, revato ānando nandako bhagu nando kimilo bhaddiyo...* (ThaA 3:205). The other great elder named Revata is Khadira, -vaniya Revata, who lives in an acacia forest, and who is listed later in the same list. On the doubts, see M 1:8 (see UA:M 843 n689); Dhs 1004 = Vbh 365; cf DhsA 354 f.

³² A 1:24 (AA 1:130 f); U 5.7 (UA 314 f); Tha 3 (ThaA 33 f). The word *jhāyī* here, however, can also be tr simply as “meditator.” In fact, the monk is said to be able to attain dhyana the fastest is Mahā Moggallāna, but he is declared as being the foremost of monks with psychic power (*iddhimanta*) (A 1:23).

1.2.4 Ānanda and a few historical issues.

1.2.4.1 ĀNANDA’S GOING-FORTH. When the Buddha visits Kapilavatthu in Phagguna (Feb-Mar) in the second year of the ministry, Ānanda joins the order along with other Sākya boys (*sakya, kumārā*),³³ namely, Bhaddiya, Anuruddha, Bhagu, Kimbila and Devadatta, along with Upāli the barber (V 2:182).³⁴ Upāli is ordained first. The Vinaya, however, also says that Ānanda’s preceptor is Belaṭṭha, sīsa.³⁵

Of the Sakya boys’ going forth, **the Vinaya** simply says, “Then the Blessed One let Upāli the barber go forth first...” (*atha kho bhagavā upāli, kappakaṃ paṭhamam pabbajesi*, V 2:183,18). It is likely that this is a novice initiation (*pabbajjā*), and later when Ānanda goes for ordination (*upasampadā*), Belaṭṭha, sīsa acts as his preceptor (*upajjhāya*).³⁶

1.2.4.2 ĀNANDA’S ATTAINMENTS. After listening to Puṇṇa Mantāni,putta³⁷ [1.2.2.1] giving a discourse on the five aggregates and the notion “I am,” Ānanda becomes a streamwinner (S 3:105). Out of gratitude, Ānanda recounts his experience in **the Ānanda Sutta** (S 20.83). Ānanda has a reputation for being a fast talker. Where an ordinary person speaks one word, he could speak eight. The Buddha could speak sixteen words for each one word of Ānanda (MA 2:53).

In **the Ānanda Thera, gāthā**, twice Ānanda says, “For 25 years I was a learner” (*paṇṇa, vīsati, vassāni sekha, bhūtassa me sato*, Tha 1039 f) and thrice, “For 25 years I served the Blessed One...” (*paṇṇa, vīsati, vassāni bhagavantam upaṭṭhahim*, Tha 1041-1042) [1.2.4.4]. This is apparently the only canonical reference we have as evidence that Ānanda attains streamwinning in the 20th year of the ministry.

The Aṅguttara commentary says, “Not long after going forth in the Blessed One’s presence, hearing a Dharma talk before the venerable Puṇṇa Mantāni,putta, he was established in the fruit of streamwinning”³⁸ (AA 1:292). Surely, this remark is inaccurate, or we must take “not long after” (*na cirass’eva*) as being hyperbolic, since Ānanda goes forth in the second year. However, we could hazard a surmise, that

³³ That Ānanda is referred to as “boy” (*kumāra*) is significant here. Assuming he is born in the same year as Rāhula (Tibetan Dulva (Vinaya): Rockhill 1884:57), who is born when the Bodhisattva renounces the world at 29. Another 8 years (ie, 6 years search: with the 2 teachers and his self-mortification) + 2 year of ministry) passes before he meets Ānanda, who would then be 8 years old.

³⁴ Upāli is instructed by the Sakya youths to bring their rich garments back to Kapila, vatthu. On his way back, he reflects that the Sakyas are fierce warriors, and blaming hm for making the Sakya youths to renounce, the Sakya lords might kill him. Returning to the youths and explains his predicament, and with their acquiescence, Upāli, too, joins the order (V 2:182 f).

³⁵ *Ānandassa upajjhāyo* (V 4:86), but this is the only mention we have. Belaṭṭha, sīsa is a great elder amongst the 1000 matted-hair ascetics (*jaṭila, sahaṣṣ’abbhantaro mahā, thero*, VA 4:838; cf ThaA 1:71). His verse is Tha 16, where Comy says that he gained arhathood after listening to the **Āditta Pariyāya S** (S 35.28/4:19 f = V 1:34 f) (ThaA 1:68). According to Vinaya, he suffers from a skin disease, prob scurvy (V 1:202, 295). The rule against eating stored food is made on his account (Pāc 38 = V 4:86). **Belaṭṭha, sīsa-t, thera Vatthu** (DhA 7.3) however vindicates him by relating how he would store some plain boiled rice, go into dhyana for a few days, after which he would take that rice when he needs food. Since he has done so before the rule is made, and he is satisfied with little, the Buddha declares that he is free of any wrong (DhA 7.3/2:170-173). He is prob identical with Mātulaṅga Phala, dāyaka (Ap 2:446).

³⁶ From **Mv 1.2.12**, which records the Buddha’s allowing the “going-forth and ordination by going for the three refuges” (*ti, saraṇa.gamanehi pabbajjam upasampadam*, V 1:21 f), we learn that a growing number of candidates from various places are asking to join the order, so that the Buddha now permits the monks themselves to accept them. However, it is likely that the Buddha himself continues to accept candidates into the community.

³⁷ Punna is Koṇḍañña’s nephew (Mantāni is Koṇḍañña’s sister), and is ordained by Koṇḍañña. Puñña is the foremost of monks who are Dharma speakers (A 1:23).

³⁸ *Bhagavato santike pabbajitvā na cirass’eva āyasmato puṇṇassa mantāni, puttassa santike dhamma, katham sutvā sotā, patti, phale patiṭṭhahi* (AA 1:292).

this “going forth” (*pabbajjā*) here refers to his ordination under Belaṭṭha, sīsa, which must have occurred during the 20th year of the ministry. This is of course only speculative at the moment.

1.2.4.3 ĀNANDA’S AGE. The commentarial traditions all say that Ānanda was born on *the same day* as the Buddha—meaning that Ānanda would be 55 years old when he becomes personal attendant to the Buddha of the same age! If this were true, it would be strange, for example, that the Buddha, in **the Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16), complains to Ānanda that he (the Buddha) is old and weary, that his body is like “an old cart is kept going by being held together with straps.”³⁹ It would be difficult for an 80-year-old Ānanda to physically look after the Buddha, who is of the same age, even if Ānanda is very healthy and is said to live on until 120 (DhA 2:99).

During the second year of the ministry, the Buddha should be about 37 years old. In **the Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16), the Buddha tells Subhadda that he (the Buddha) is 29 years old when he renounces the world. From this, we can work out the Buddha’s age during the second year, when Ānanda goes forth.

29 when he goes forth (D 16,5.27/2:151*) +
6 years of search: the 2 teachers and self-mortification +
2 years = 37 years old. (The Buddha’s age)

If we accept the Vinaya remark on “Sakya boys” (*sakya, kumāra*, V 2:182), then Ānanda is unlikely to be the Buddha’s age, 37 years. If we accept that *Ānanda is the same age of Rāhula* (born when the Bodhisattva renounced the world),⁴⁰ then he would be 8 years old when he go forth at Anupiya mango grove [1.2.4.1]. Thus, he would be *at least 29 years younger than the Buddha*, that is, he is 26 years old when he becomes the Buddha’s attendant.

1.2.4.4 ĀNANDA AS THE BUDDHA’S ATTENDANT. During the first 20 years of his ministry, the Buddha has never had any regular or satisfactory personal attendant. Among them are Nāga, samāla, Nāgita, Upavāna, Sunakkhatta, Cunda Saman’uddesa (“the novice”), Sāgata, Rādha and Meghiya.⁴¹ Ānanda, at 26, becomes the Buddha’s personal attendant giving the Buddha these **8 conditions**, the first 4 negative requests (*paṭikkhepa*) and the other 4 positive requests (*āyacana*):

- (1) The Buddha should never pass on to him any choice robes he has received.⁴²
- (2) The Buddha should never give him any choice almsfood he has received.
- (3) The Buddha should never appoint a separate “fragrant cell” (residence) for him.
- (4) The Buddha should never include him in any personal invitations.

³⁹ Bodhi also notes that if Comys (DA 2:425; ApA 58, 358; J 1:63) were right in saying that Ānanda was born on the same day as the Bodhisattva, this passage would hardly make sense, “for the Buddha would not need to insist on the frailties of old age if Ānanda too was an old man” (S:B 1920 n141). Bodhi thinks that Ānanda “must have been considerably younger than the Buddha, perhaps by as much as thirty years” (S:B 804 n296). It is interesting that the Tibetan sources (eg the Dulva or Vinaya) says that Ānanda is the same age as Rāhula (Rockhill 57), which should be a good age for one to be the Buddha’s life-long personal attendant. On the differences of opinion regarding Ānanda’s age amongst the early Buddhist schools, see C Witanachchi, “Ānanda,” *Ency of Buddhism* 1:529. See also Thomas 1949:123; Rhys Davids’ article on “Devadatta” in ERE; also DPPN 1:268.

⁴⁰ Tibetan Dulva (Vinaya): Rockhill 1884:57.

⁴¹ ThaA 3:112 ad Tha 1018; DA 2:418-421; SA 1:258 f; J 4:95 f; UA 217.

⁴² It is interesting to note that only once did the Buddha share an offering of robes with Ānanda, that is, the offering of the robes of burnished gold cloth by Pukkusa, a Malla minister, which is clearly a later addition to the Mahā Parinibbāna Sutta, D 2:134; see D:W 573 n421.

- (5) If Ānanda receives an invitation, he has the privilege of transferring it to the Buddha.
- (6) If visitors come from outlying areas, he has the privilege of bringing them to the Buddha.
- (7) If Ānanda has any doubt, he can ask the Buddha for clarification at any time.
- (8) If the Buddha gives any discourse in his absence, the Buddha should repeat them to him.

(J 4:96; ThaA 3:112)⁴³

The first four requests are to prevent any gossip that Ānanda is the Buddha's personal attendant for some personal material gain. The other four requests are for the benefit of faithful devotees. The last request is especially significant since Ānanda is foremost amongst the disciples with a retentive memory (A 1:23). He could remember anything up to 60,000 lines upon hearing it only once. As such, he is able to memorize every teaching given to him.⁴⁴ This special request would later be of great benefit to posterity when Ānanda recites the Dharma before the first council.

82,000 teachings I received from the Buddha, 2,000 from the monks.
These 84,000 teachings have come to pass (*dharmā pavattino*). (Tha 1024)

2 The Naḷaka, pāna Sutta teachings

2.1 SUTTA SUMMARY AND COMMENTS

2.1.1 Key points. The *Naḷaka, pāna Sutta* (M 68) is about *the spiritual destinies of true disciples of the Buddha and the purpose of the holy life*. The Sutta opens with the Buddha surveying the congregation [§1-2]. The Buddha then asks those assembled whether these young monks “delight in their holy life,” that is, whether they are happy in their practice, but the congregation remains silent [§3].

The reason for their silence is probably because those monks do not have the power of mind-reading, and, as such, are unable to verify it. The Buddha then decides to question the renowned young monks themselves. The Buddha's intention is more obvious now: it is for the benefit of those assembled who have not yet attained any meditative state or the path, that is, not yet saints.

The Buddha addresses **Anuruddhā** (in the plural vocative), which suggests either that Anuruddha is sitting closest to him, or that he is the seniormost of those renowned young monks. Anuruddha answers the Buddha's question in the affirmative [§4]. The Buddha approves of this, adding that they have renounced the world not because of any worldly reason, but for the sake of “making an end of this whole mass of suffering,” affirming that they have renounced “out of faith” (*saddhā*) [§5] [3.1].

The Buddha then goes on to state *the task of such monks*, that is, to overcome all the mental hindrances, meaning, to attain dhyana.⁴⁵ Clearly, this means that they are not awakened yet, and the Buddha is exhorting them to work towards arhathood [§6]. This is confirmed by the list of mental hindrances, which comprises the traditional five plus two more, that is, discontent and drowsiness [2.1.2].

In the next section, the Buddha asks Anuruddha and the monks regarding their faith in him, that is, the Buddha's own awakening. Anuruddha affirms his faith in the Buddha, that is, he is one awakened and he lives mindfully on that account. [§7]

The Buddha then explains to Anuruddha and the monks why he often announces the destinies of those saints who have died [§8], that is, not for worldly gains, but for the sake of inspiring the unawakened to work for their own liberation [§9]. The liberating qualities of each of the saints are

⁴³ Cf W W Rockhill, *The Life of the Buddha*, 1884:57 f, for a Tibetan version on how Ānanda becomes the Buddha's attendant.

⁴⁴ MA 2:336; ThaA 3:117.

⁴⁵ See **Dhyana**, SD 8.4.

defined: the monks who are arhats [§10], non-returners [§11], once-returners [§12] and streamwinners [§13], and, similarly, the nuns who are saints [§§14-17]. Then are mentioned the laymen⁴⁶ who are non-returners [§18], once-returners [§19] and streamwinners [§20], and, finally, the laywomen who are such saints [§§21-23].

2.1.2 Broader significance of the mental hindrances

2.1.2.1 THE HINDRANCES AND THE FETTERS. In the Naḷaka,pāna Sutta, the Buddha tells the renowned young monks that their task is to overcome all the mental hindrances, that is, to attain dhyana [§5]. The list of mental hindrances total *seven* instead of the traditional five, that is, it includes discontent and drowsiness [§6]. The five mental hindrances (*pañca,nīvaraṇa*) are:

(1) sensual lust	(<i>kāma-c,chanda</i>),
(2) ill will	(<i>vyāpāda</i>),
(3) restlessness and worry	(<i>uddhacca,kukkucca</i>),
(4) sloth and torpor	(<i>thīna,middha</i>), and
(5) doubt	(<i>vicikicchā</i>). ⁴⁷
[6] discontent	(<i>arati</i>);
[7] drowsiness	(<i>tandī</i>).

In the Naḷaka,pāna Sutta, the first hindrance is known by its older name, covetousness (*abhijjhā*). The Sutta lists two additional hindrances, namely, discontent (*arati*) and “drowsiness” (*tandī*). This list of seven hindrances refers to the whole path, not just the attainment of dhyana. As such, we can take them to be “spiritual hindrances,” that is, stumbling blocks to the attaining of the path to sainthood.

These seven spiritual hindrances, when expanded and re-arranged into a set of ten, become the better known **10 fetters** (*dasa saṃyojanā*),⁴⁸ which are as follows, showing their basic connection with the relevant mental hindrances, thus:

<u>The 10 fetters</u>	<u>dasa saṃyojanā</u>	<u>The 5 mental hindrances</u>
(1) self-identity view	(<i>sakkāya,dīṭṭhi</i>) ⁴⁹	sensual lust [+discontent]
(2) spiritual doubt	(<i>vicikicchā</i>)	doubt
(3) attachment to rituals and vows	(<i>sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa</i>) ⁵⁰	doubt
(4) sensual lust	(<i>kāma,rāga</i>)	sensual lust
(5) aversion	(<i>paṭigha</i>)	ill will
(6) greed for form existence	(<i>rūpa,rāga</i>)	doubt
(7) greed for formless existence	(<i>arūpa,rāga</i>)	doubt
(8) conceit	(<i>māna</i>)	doubt
(9) restlessness	(<i>uddhacca</i>)	restlessness & worry; [+drowsiness]; sloth & torpor
(10)ignorance	(<i>avijjā</i>)	doubt

⁴⁶ On the omission of arhatness for the laity, see (3) below.

⁴⁷ See **Mental hindrances** (SD 32) & **Saṅgārava S** (S 46.55), SD 3.12. Cf **Mahā Assa,pura S** (M 39.13/1:274); see also **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22.13); **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.36) on how to deal with the hindrances during meditation; **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2.68/1:71), SD 8.10 (def of dhyana with imageries).

⁴⁸ S 5:61; A 5:13; Vbh 377; On the 10 fetters & sainthood, see **Kiṭṭa,gi S** (M 70), SD 11.1 (5.1).

⁴⁹ See **Antā S** (S 22.103), SD 14.1.

⁵⁰ See **Kukkura,vatika S** (M 57/1:387-392), SD 23.11.

2.1.2.2 DISCONTENT AND DROWSINESS. Discontent (*arati*) here refers to the predominance of the fourth fetter, “sensual lust,” which is *partly* overcome by the once-returner, and *fully* overcome by the non-returner and the arhat. Similarly, drowsiness (*tandī*) is only fully overcome by the arhat. In the better known set of 10 fetters, *tandī* is called *uddhacca*, “restlessness.”

Since *uddhacca* is restlessness in the sense of mental agitation, distraction and excitement, it is as such, the negative opposite of worry.⁵¹ Their positive opposite is mental stillness.⁵² In the context of the Naḷaka, pāna Sutta set here, *uddhacca* is, more specifically, *dhamm’uddhacca*, that is, “Dharma restlessness” or spiritual restlessness.

Dhamma’uddhacca is significantly mentioned in **the (Yuganaddha) Paṭipadā Sutta** (A 4.170), where it refers to *restlessness* in its description of one of the ways to attain final liberation.⁵³ According to this discourse, we can still reach the path that leads to final liberation even when the mind is under the influence of *dhamm’uddhacca*, that is, restlessness related to the Dharma. Once the mind settles down and becomes focused, the path is attained.⁵⁴

An important aspect of *dhamm’uddhacca* refers to “mental distress brought on by eagerness to realize the Dhamma, a state of spiritual anxiety that sometimes can precipitate an instantaneous awakening experience.”⁵⁵ An example of this is that of **Bāhiya Dāru, cīriya’s** awakening (U 1.10).⁵⁶

The best known and most important application of this teaching of the two attainments of either arhathood or non-returning is found in a number of discourses, such as **the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta** (M 10), where it is famously stated:

Whoever, bhikkhus, were to cultivate these 4 focuses of mindfulness *in this way*⁵⁷ for just 7 years...even just seven days, one of two fruits is to be expected: either **arhathood** in this very life or, if there is any residue [trace] of clinging left,⁵⁸ **non-returning**.⁵⁹

Simply put here, if the meditator, at this peak of practice, well founded by moral virtue and concentration, is able to abandon all attachments, even to “the Dharma” itself (that is, all views on the teaching or reality), then he would become an arhat. If, however, he has some subtle attachment or concern, even for the Dharma, he would become a non-returner.

⁵¹ See **Naḷaka, pāna S** (M 68) @ SD 37.4 (1.1.2).

⁵² See **Uddhacca, kukkucca**, SD 32.7 (2.1).

⁵³ A 4.170.5/2:157 @ SD 41.5.

⁵⁴ On *uddhacca*, see further **Kim Mūlaka S** (A 8.83) @ SD 32.10 (2.5.3).

⁵⁵ Nyanaponika & Bodhi, *Numerical Discourses of the Buddha*, 1999:294 n69.

⁵⁶ See **(Yuganaddha) Paṭipadā S** (A 4.170/2:156 f), SD 41.5; **(Arahatta) Bāhiya S** (U 1.10/8), 33.7. See also **Uddhacca, kukkucca**, SD 32.7 (2.2.2).

⁵⁷ *Evam bhāveyya*. The guarantee of spiritual liberation here should be understood in connection with this crucial phrase, “were to cultivate in this way” (*evam bhāveyya*). See **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10.46/1:62), SD 13.3 + 13.1 (7).

⁵⁸ *Upādi*, “trace (of clinging),” according to Comys “material support (the result of past karma)” (MA 4:55, UA 151), ie, the 5 aggregates (*khandha*). In the suttas, the term mostly occurs in this context and in the sentence, “Here the Tathāgata passed into the remainderless (*anupādi, sesa*) nirvana-element.” (A 4:118). Cf secular use in the parable of the man shot with a dart, “trace (of poison)” (M 105.19). In D:W 350 (2 places), Walshe renders it as “substrate,” probably confounding it for *upadhi* (life-basis), which is a very close term.

⁵⁹ “One of two fruits ... non-returning,” as at **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 2:314); **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 1:62); **Kiṭṭagiri S** (M 1:481); **Aññātara S** (S 5:129); **Nirodha S** (S 5:133); **Añña S** (S 5:191); **Dve Phalā S** (S 5:236); **Phalā S 1** (S 5:311); **Phalā S 2** (S 5:314); **Iddhi, pāda S** (A 3:82); **Sati Supaṭṭhita S** (A 3:143); **Pabbajjā S** (A 5:108); **Paṭisallāna S** (It 39); **Sikkhānisaṃsa S** (It 40); **Jāgariyo S** (It 41); **Dvayatānupassanā S** (Sn pp140, 148). “Either final knowledge ... non-returning,” *diṭṭhe ca dhamme aññā sati vā upādisese anāgāmiti ti*.

2.1.2.3 THE SUTTA'S DEFINITIONS OF SAINTHOOD. The main section of the Naḷakapāna Sutta gives definitions of sainthood in terms of the four assemblies, that is, monks, nuns, laymen and laywomen. These definitions are quite standard, and found elsewhere in the suttas. **The arhat** (*arahata*) is defined as one “established in final knowledge” [§10a]. The same definition is given to a nun arhat [§14]. No definition of an arhat for the laity is given [4].

This definition of the arhat, and the other definitions that follow, are not for the sake of technicality: they are to inspire the audience to follow the saints' example and attain liberation like them. It is also stated that the monks in the audience know for themselves that this arhat who has died was one who has “lived well,” that is, “his moral virtue is thus, his nature thus, his wisdom thus, he lived thus, he is freed thus” [§10.2].

These five “thus” (*evam*) qualities are actually a summary for the tenfold rightness (*sammattā*), that is, the noble eightfold path, right knowledge, and right liberation.⁶⁰ These are the qualities of the adept (*asekha*), that is, the arhat. However, these qualities also appear in connection with the other three kinds of saints, where they apply, as appropriate, to that level of attainment.

Here, too, “thus” (*evam*) is a word of truth and reality, meaning that the arhat, the non-returner, the once-returner, and the streamwinner, are those who have led authentic lives of spirituality and reached their respective goals. The unawakened practitioner, inspired by the saints' example, “directs his own mind to the goal,” recollecting his faith (*saddhā*), moral virtue (*sīla*), learning (*suta*), charity (*cāga*) and wisdom (*paññā*)—these are the qualities for noble growth (*ariya,vaḍḍha*).⁶¹

The non-returner (*anāgāmi*) [§11] is defined as one who has “destroyed the 5 lower fetters” [2.1.-2.1] and is “spontaneously reborn (*opapātika*) in the Pure Abodes, and “does not return to this world,” that is, no more reborn here.⁶² This definition applies equally to all the members of the 4 assemblies, that is, monks, nuns, laymen and laywomen. [§§11, 15, 18, 21]

The Sutta defines **the once-returner** (*sākadāgāmi*) [§12] as one who has “destroyed the 3 fetters⁶³ and diminished lust, hate and delusion,” that is, abandoned self-identity view, spiritual doubt and attachment to rituals and vows [2.1.2.1], and weakened greed, hate and delusion. He is reborn only once more here to exhaust his karma, and then attains liberation [§12a]. This definition applies to monks, nuns, laymen and laywomen alike. [§§12, 16, 19, 22]

Finally, **the streamwinner** (*sotāpanna*) [§13] is defined as one who has “totally destroyed the three fetters” and on account of his moral virtue (keeping to the precepts), will never be reborn in the subhuman realms (that is, amongst the asuras, the pretas, the animals, and the hell-beings), and is assured of liberation within 7 lives. [§§13, 17, 20, 23]

The Naḷakapāna Sutta closes with the Buddha's reminding us that he has spoken of the attainments of spiritual distinctions (*visesa*)⁶⁴ by his disciples (who have passed on), “not for the sake of deceiving people, nor for the sake of popular talk, nor for the sake of such benefits as gains, praises and renown, nor hoping, ‘*May people know me to be so and so*’”: this last statement meaning that his statements are

⁶⁰ D 3:271, 292; M 1:42; A 5:212, 240.

⁶¹ See **Saṅkhār'upapatti S** (M 120.3/3:99), SD 3.4; **Vaḍḍhi S 1+2** (A 5.63+64/3:80) & SD 3.4 (3-4). These are also qualities that empower us to decide our own wholesome rebirth, if we choose to (see M 120). Cf a similar set where “exertion of effort” (*viriy'ārambha*) replaces “charity” (*cāga*), constituting the qualities for moral courage (*vesāraja,karaṇa dhamma*): see **Sāraja S** (A 5.101/3:127), SD 28.9a(3.1). Charity, in other words, is broadened to incl non-material gifts (*nirāmisa dāna*).

⁶² On the non-returner (*anāgāmi*), see **Sa,upadisesa S** (A 9.12/4:378-382), SD 3.3(3). On abandoning the lower fetters via dhyana, see **Mahā Māluṅkya,putta S** (M 64.9/1:435 f), SD 21.10.

⁶³ For details on the 3 fetters, see **Emotional independence**, SD 40a.8.

⁶⁴ More fully, “progressively higher distinction” (*uḷāraṇi pubbenāparam visesaṇi*), ie, the 4 stages of sainthood: see eg **Anāpāna,sati S** (M 118.2/3:78), SD 7.13 & n. On laymen non-returners, once-returners and streamwinners, see **Laymen saints**, SD 8.6 (12).

not to be construed as being “miraculous” statements, but so that those with wise faith would be “greatly inspired, greatly gladdened, who having heard this, will direct their minds to such a goal.” In other words, we too would walk the path of the saints.

3 The purpose of renunciation

3.1 RENOUNCING OUT OF FAITH. The main theme of the Naḷaka,pāna Sutta is that of the true purpose of renunciation. This teaching is both a reminder to practitioners, the monastics who have renounced the world “out of faith” [§3], as well for us today who are heirs to this Sutta and who love the Dharma. Monastics who “delight in the holy life” are those who, firstly, have renounced the world because they have truly seen that we are all “immersed” in suffering and “overwhelmed” by it [§5d], and so wish to make “an end of this whole mass of suffering” [§5e].

Secondly, towards that end, renunciants work to end the mental hindrances so that they are able to attain the dhyanas, and using them as the bases for mental purification, attain various stages of distinction, that is, sainthood [§6b]. Insofar as monastics are able to attain dhyanas, they would be able to attain even to the highest, that is, arhathood, if not at least non-returning. For those who are more taken up with sense-pleasures (*kāma,bhogī*), especially the laity, we are still capable of attaining at least streamwinning or once-returning.⁶⁵

For **monastics**, renunciation (*nekkhamma*) or “going forth” (*pabbajjā*) refers to the abandoning of their wealth, relatives, social status and whatever ties them to a worldly life,⁶⁶ so that their energies, mental and physical, are directed to moral virtue (sense-restraint and wholesome speech), mental cultivation (mindfulness and meditation) and insight wisdom, leading to spiritual liberation here and now, especially the attainment of arhathood, or at least non-returning.

For **the laity**, renunciation refers to the respect for life (self and others), for property, for the person (or freedom), for truth, and for the mind—in other words, keeping to the five precepts—which are the bases for a truly human life, or at least for not falling into subhuman life-styles of the asuras, the pretas, the animals, and the hell-beings. On a higher level, as *lay practitioners*, we need to train ourselves in letting go of *selfishness, self-doubt and superstition*, that is, breaking the first 3 fetters of self-identity view, doubt, and attachment to rituals and vows [2.1.2.3: streamwinner]. One of the most effective mindfulness practices in this connection is the perception of impermanence.⁶⁷

3.2 THE JĪVĪKA SUTTA. In **the Jīvika Sutta** (It 3.5.2), the Buddha declares that alms-gathering (*piṇḍolya*) is the “lowest of livelihoods” (*antam jīvikānam*).⁶⁸ Yet, sons of family, intent on the goal, “take it up for a good reason: not out of the fear of rajahs, nor for the fear of thieves, nor on account of debts, not for the sake of livelihood.”⁶⁹

The Jīvika Sutta defines the true purpose of renunciation in the same words as **the Naḷaka,pāna Sutta** (M 68), that is, the renunciant lives the holy life, purposefully reflecting thus:

⁶⁵ On streamwinning and the laity, see **Entering the stream**, SD 3.3.

⁶⁶ See eg **Soṇa,danda S** (D 4.6/1:114 f), SD 30.5; **Kūḷa,danta S** (D 5.5-7/1:130-132), SD 22.8.

⁶⁷ See the 10 suttas of **Okkanta Saṃyutta** (S 25/3:225-228), esp **(Cakkhu) Anicca S** (S 25.1/3:225), SD 16.7. See also **Araka S** (A 7.70/4:136-139), SD 16.17 & ending of **Velāma S** (A 9.20.5b/3:395 f), SD 16.6.

⁶⁸ More fully, *antam idaṃ, bhikkhave, jīvikānam yad idaṃ piṇḍolyaṃ* = It 89,10 qu at DA 1:103,10 & Sadda,nīti 360,27 *antam = lāmakam*. *Anta* usu means “extreme,” but here has the sense of “worst, low(est), mean(est), contemptible.”

⁶⁹ *Attha,vasikā paṭicca, n’eva rājābhinīta na corābhinīta na iṇaṭṭa na bhayaṭṭā na ājīvika pakatā* (It 3.5.2.2/89), SD 28.9b.

I am immersed in birth, decay, death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, and despair; overwhelmed by suffering, overcome by suffering.

Perhaps, there is a making an end of this whole mass of suffering to be found!

(It 91.3/89) = §5.5 (plural form)

The Jīvika Sutta goes on to describe a false renunciant as one who “is covetous, strongly lusting after sense-pleasures, with a mind of ill will, with a mind of corrupted intentions,⁷⁰ muddle-headed, without clear comprehension, lacking concentration, scatter-brained, loose in faculty.”⁷¹ Such a false renunciant is compared to “a firebrand of a funeral pyre” (*chavāḷata*), burning at both ends, with cow-dung smeared in between, useful only at the cremation, useless elsewhere (cannot be used as firewood either at home or in the forest).⁷² The worst of such false religious, those who persist in using religion in exploiting others, are called “the yellow-necked” or “yellow-necks” (*kāsāva,kaṇṭha*).⁷³ They are bad by nature, unrestrained, and on account of their bad karma, will face painful consequences.⁷⁴

3.3 THE BRAHMA,CARIYA SUTTA. Another important discourse related to the proper attitude of monastic renunciation is given in **the Brahma,cariya Sutta** (A 4.25). Here the purpose of the holy life is described in positive language.

SD 37.4(3.3)

Brahma,cariya Sutta

The Discourse on the Holy Life | A 4.25/2:26

A 4.1.3.5 | Aṅguttara Nikāya 4, Catukka Nipāta 1, Paṭhama Paṇṇāsaka 3, Uruvela Vagga 5

The true purpose of spiritual practice or religion

1 Bhikshus, this holy life is *not* lived for the sake of deceiving people, nor for the sake of popular talk, nor for the sake of such benefits as gains, praises and renown, nor for the sake of extrication from malicious talk (for one’s advantage),⁷⁵ nor hoping, “May people know me to be so.”⁷⁶

2 Rather, bhikshus, this holy life is lived

for the sake of restraint

saṃvar’attham,

for the sake of letting go

pahān’attham,

for the sake of dispassion

virāg’attham,

for the sake of cessation

nirodh’attham.

Samvar’attham pahān’attham

For the sake of restraint, for the sake of letting go,

brahma,cariyam anītiham

is the holy life, not based on hearsay,⁷⁷

⁷⁰ *Paduṭṭha,mana,saṅkappo.*

⁷¹ *Abhijjhālu kāmesu tibba,sārāgo, byāpanna,citto paduṭṭha,mana,saṅkappo, muṭṭha-s,sati asampajāno asamāhito vibbhanta,citto pākat’indriyo* (It 91.4/90), SD 28.9b. On these terms, see n ad loc.

⁷² This is, as it were, an ironic presage of “funeral monastics” of later times, who earn a living by performing the last rites, often charging high fees for them, but “moneytheists,” lacking in restraint and moral virtue.

⁷³ *Kāsāva,kaṇṭhā.* They will go about with only a piece of yellow cloth around their necks or arms, and will support their wives and children by engaging in trade and farming, etc (MA 5:74 f). See M 142.8/3:246 @ SD 1.9 & nn.

⁷⁴ It 91.9*/90 (SD 28.9b); see also S 22.80,18.2-19/3:91-94 (SD 28.9a) & Miln 32.

⁷⁵ *Na iti,vāda-p,pamokkh’ānisams’attham,* which is not in **Kuhana S 1** (It 1.8/28): see foll n.

⁷⁶ *Na kho, anuruddhā, tathāgato jana,kuhan’attham na jana,lapan’attham, na lābha,sakkāra,silok’ānisams’attham, na iti,vāda-p,pamokkh’ānisams’attham, na ‘iti maṃ jano jānātūti:* as in **Kuhana S 1** (It 1.8/28 except for the underscored phrase.

⁷⁷ Dhammapāla interprets *anītiha* in various ways, the main one being “the serial killer of catastrophes” (It:M 29; ItA:M 1:279); see also ItA 1:111 f.

*adesayi so bhagavā
nibbān'ogadha, gāminam
esa maggo mahantehi
anuyāto mahēsibhi*

the Blessed One said—
leading to the firm footing that is nirvana.
This is the path taken by the great ones,
followed by the great seers.

*Ye ca taṃ paṭipajanti
yathā buddhena desitaṃ
dukkhass'antaṃ karissanti
satthu, sāsana, kārino'ti*

They who practise it
just as it is taught by the Buddha,
will make an end of suffering—
they have done the Buddha's teaching.

— evaṃ —

4 Laymen arhats

4.1 The Naḷaka, pāna Sutta, in its definitions of the saints [§§10-23], omits the attainment of arhathood by the laity. A similar passage on “the mirror of the Dharma,” where the Buddha, in answer to Ānanda's queries, discloses the spiritual attainments of various disciples at Nādikā, too, does not mention any laymen or laywomen arhats.⁷⁸

4.2 First of all, it must be clearly understood that nowhere in the suttas is it ever said that lay practitioners are incapable of attaining arhathood, or that only the renunciants are capable of attaining it. On the contrary, we have major teachings, such as those of **the Satipatthāna Suttas** (D 22, M 10), which are taught to *lay people*, that is, the Kurus of Kammāsa, damma.⁷⁹ Those who properly practise satipatthana, that is, the 4 focuses of mindfulness, for as short as a week or up to seven years, can expect “either arhathood in this very life or, if there is any residue [substrate] of clinging left,⁸⁰ non-returning.”⁸¹

4.3 Furthermore, we do have examples of laymen arhats in the suttas. The most famous example is that of Bāhiya Dāru, ciriya, as recorded in **the (Arahatta) Bāhiya Sutta** (U 1.10).⁸² The Commentaries tell us that he does not become a monk due to his premature death. In due course, the tradition arose that any layman attaining arhathood has either to join the order, or will attain final nirvana that same day, a view that first appeared in **the Milinda, pañha** (Miln 264).⁸³

⁷⁸ D 16,2.5-9/2:91-94 (SD 9); see also **Laymen saints**, SD 8.6 (14+15).

⁷⁹ D 22,1.1/2:290 (SD 12.3); M 10,1/1:55 (SD 13.3).

⁸⁰ *Upādi*, “trace (of clinging),” according to Comys “material support (the result of past karma)” (MA 4:55, UA 151), i.e. the 5 Aggregates (*khandha*). In the Suttas, the term mostly occurs in this context and in the sentence, “Here the Tathāgata passed into the remainderless (*anupādi, sesa*) nirvana-element.” (A 4:118). Cf secular use in the parable of the man shot with a dart, “trace (of poison)” (M 105,19). In D:W 350 (2 places), Walshe renders it as “substrate,” probably confounding it for *upadhi* (life-basis), which is a very close term.

⁸¹ “One of two fruits is to be expected: either final knowledge here and now, or, if there is any residue [substrate] of clinging left, non-returning,” *dvinnam phalanam aññataram phalam paṭikaṅkham diṭṭhe ca dhamme aññā sati vā upādisese anāgāmitā ti*. as at **Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna S** (D 22,22/2:314,12); **Sati'paṭṭhāna S** (M 10,46/1:62); **Kiṭṭagiri S** (M 70,27/1:481); **Aññātara S** (S 46.57/5:129); **Nirodha S** (S 46.76/5:133); **Dve Phalā S** (S 48.65/5:236); **Phalā S 1+2** (S 54.4+5/5:313 f); **Iddhi, pāda S** (A 5.67/3:82); **Sati Supaṭṭhita S** (A 5.122/3:143); **Pabbajjā S** (A 10.59/5:108); **Paṭisālāna S** (It 2.2.8/39,15); **Sikkhānisamsa S** (It 2.2.9/40,12); **Jāgariyo S** (It 2.2.10/41,11); **Dvayatānupassanā S** (Sn pp 140,13, 148,13).

⁸² U 1.10/6-9 (SD 33.7).

⁸³ On laymen arhats, further see **Laymen saints**, SD 8.6 (13) Why no mention of lay arhats? On destiny of laymen arhats, see SD 8.6 (19) & **Sabba Kamma Jaha S** (U 3.1) @ SD 39.3 (1.4.4). See also Somaratne 2009.

There is a simple practical reason for why laymen who become arhats need to ordain. An arhat has fully all defilements and desires, and become a being of wholesome routine life until his final nirvana. A layman arhat would simply stop seeking any kind of employment, even gainful ones, but would rather lead a joyful life of meditation and solitude. Since he is a layman, other laity are not likely to support him, since they are unable to recognize an arhat.

However, once a layman arhat ordains, he keeps to the Vinaya. In the morning, he goes for alms-round and has his meal. Whether he lives with a community of monastics or live a solitary itinerant life, he is every ready to teach and comfort others when they need it. In other words, the monastic life is a living routine that supports the arhat's life that allows him to properly spend the rest of his natural life and also keeps him spiritually available to the unawakened world whenever people need him for instruction and succour.

4.4 As regards the suttas, there are at least 3 reasons, I think, **why the layman arhat is not given the limelight in the early Canon**. The first two reasons are related. Firstly, as evident from the parable of the fields (S 42.7), the Buddha, like a wise farmer, would first attend to the most fertile field, namely, the monastics who have dedicated their lives to wisdom and awakening.⁸⁴ However, the laity is a very close second kind of field which could also give good yields.

The second reason, the more important one, as already stated earlier, is that the secret of the success of the spread of the Buddha Dharma is not that the Buddha preached to the masses, that is, not by mass evangelism, but *rather that he chooses his audience wisely, giving priority to them according to their readiness (upanissaya) to understand and practise what he has taught*.⁸⁵

4.5 The third reason relates to the difficulty of the laity in attaining arhathood or non-returning, on account of their lifestyle. This difficulty arises from the laity's indulgence in sensual pleasure (*kāma, bhogī*).⁸⁶ In **the Cūḷa Dukkha-k, khandha Sutta** (M 14), for example, the layman Mahānāma, a once-returner,⁸⁷ complains to the Buddha that he (Mahānāma) still has defiled mental states, especially lustful thoughts, despite understanding the nature of the 3 unwholesome roots. The Buddha explains the reason for this is that Mahānāma still enjoys sensual desires (*kāma*)⁸⁸ and that he would not be able to transcend sensual desires unless he has experienced "zest and joy (*pīti, sukha*) that are apart from sensual pleasures or something more peaceful than that,"⁸⁹ that is, the mental pleasures of dhyana (*jhāna*).⁹⁰

Lay Buddhists who are non-celibate, enjoying sense-pleasures (*kāma, bhogī*)⁹¹—that is, anyone enjoying sense-pleasures *and* also desirous of living a moral and happy life—should only indulge them-

⁸⁴ S 42.7/4:315-317: see **Laymen saints**, SD 8.6 (4).

⁸⁵ See **Laymen saints**, SD 8.6 (13) (Why no mention of lay arhats?).

⁸⁶ On *kāma, bhogī*, see **Mahā Vaccha, gotta S** (M 73,10/1:491), SD 27.4.

⁸⁷ Comy says that Mahānāma had long ago attained the fruit of once-returning, which only weakens lust, hate and delusion, but does not eradicate them. He had the mistaken notion that lust, hate and delusion were eradicated by the path of once-returning. Thus, when he saw that they were not abandoned and asked the Buddha the cause of their arising. Even saints on the path (short of arhats) can be mistaken about which defilements are abandoned by which path (MA 2:61).

⁸⁸ It should be noted here that *kāma* as used in this sutta has a broad sense, that is, both as the subjective defilement (*kilesa*) or "sensual desire" and as the object of desire (*vatthu*) or "(objects of) sensual pleasure" (Nm 1,1, Vbh 256, DhsA 62; cf A 3:410 f). See Gethin, *The Buddhist Path to Awakening*, 2001:192 f.

⁸⁹ *Aññatr'eva kāmehi...pīti, sukhaṃ adhiḅacchati aññañ [vā] tato santatarāṃi*.

⁹⁰ M 14/1:91-95 @ SD 4.7. On the importance of zest and joy (*pīti, sukha*) in meditation and *jhāna* in general, see esp Brahmavamso, *The Jhānas*, 2003.

⁹¹ On *kāma, bhogī*, see **Mahā Vaccha, gotta S** (M 73.10/1:491), SD 27.4.

selves in such pleasures *within the limits and spirit of the 5 precepts*, that is, they should know *when to stop* and to avoid sexual misconduct (*kāmesu micchācārā*). In fact, such people, who enjoy sense-pleasures in a wholesome manner and yet do not neglect their spiritual development, are still capable of attaining streamwinning in this life itself,⁹² and fully awakening to spiritual liberation within 7 lives at the most.⁹³

— — —

Naḷaka,pāṇa

The Discourse at Naḷaka,pāṇa

M 68

1 Thus have I heard.

The sons of family who have gone forth

At one time the Blessed One was staying in a palash [flame-of-the-forest] forest,⁹⁴ near Naḷaka,pāna,⁹⁵ in Kosala country.

2 Now at that time, many well known sons of family had gone forth out of faith from home into homelessness under the Blessed One, that is to say,

the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Bhaddiya, the venerable Kimbila [Kimila], the venerable Bhagu, the venerable Koṇḍañña, the venerable Revata, the venerable Ānanda, and many other well known sons of family.⁹⁶

The Buddha asks about the young renunciants

3 Now at that time, the Blessed One [463] was sitting in the open surrounded by a community of monks.

Then the Blessed One addressed the monks concerning these sons of family,

“Bhikkhus, these sons of family who have gone forth out of faith from home into homelessness under me. Do you think, bhikkhus, if they are monks who delight in the holy life?”⁹⁷

⁹² See **Mahā Vaccha,gotta S** (M 73,10/1:491), SD 27.4.

⁹³ See **Sa,upadisesa S** (A 9.12,10/4:381), SD 3.3 (3). See also **Kāma-c,chanda**, SD 32.2 (Wholesome sexual conduct). On laymen saints, further see SD 47.11 (11): Uttiya 4 (Kvu). On the destiny of laymen arhats, see SD 8.6 (19); **Sabba Kamma,jaha S** (U 3.1) @ SD 39.3 (1.4.4).

⁹⁴ *Palāsa,vana*, which also features in **Naḷaka,pāna Ss 1 & 2** (A 10.67/5:122 + 68/5:125). Comys gloss *palāsa* as the *kiṃsuka* tree (MA 3:180). Botanic name: *Butea monosperma* or *Butea frondosa*: Bengali & Hindi “kimshuka” or “palash,” Tamil “porasum,” ie, the parrot tree or flame of the forest. Cf **Palāsa J** (J 307/3:23); also cf *kiṃsuka* simile at S 4:193. See R Morris, *Folklore Journal* 3, 1880: 855. For pictures, http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Trees_of_India; for details & refs, see http://wiki.encyclopaediaindica.com/~encyclo3/wiki/index.php?title=PARROT_TREE

⁹⁵ On Naḷaka,pāna, see Intro (1.1.1).

⁹⁶ For details on each saint, see Intro (1.2). Cf opening of **Mahā Go,siṅga S** (M 32,1/1:212), SD 44.12.

⁹⁷ *Ye te, bhikkhave, kulaputtā mamaṃ uddissa saddhā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitā, kacci te, bhikkhave, bhikkhū abhiratā brahmacariye’ti?* Paraphrased: “I wonder if these young men from good families who have renounced the world out of faith in me live their monastic lives happily?”

When this was said, the monks remained silent.

For the second time, the Blessed One addressed the monks concerning these sons of family, “Bhikshus, these sons of family who have gone forth out of faith from home into homelessness under me. Do you think, bhikshus, if they are monks who delight in the holy life?”

For the second time, the monks remained silent.

For the third time, the Blessed One addressed the monks concerning these sons of family, “Bhikshus, these sons of family who have gone forth out of faith from home into homelessness under me. Do you think, bhikshus, if they are monks who delight in the holy life?”

For the third time, the monks remained silent.

The youths delight in the holy life

4 Then this occurred to the Blessed One:

“What now if I were to ask the sons of family themselves?”

Then the Blessed One addressed the venerable Anuruddha,

“Anuruddhā [Anuruddhas],⁹⁸ do you delight in the holy life?”

“Surely, bhante, we delight in the holy life!”

5 “Good, good, Anuruddhā!

It is proper that you, sons of family, who have gone forth out of faith from home into homelessness, delight in the holy life.

The youths have renounced out of faith

5.2 You are young, Anuruddhā, blessed with youth, endowed with the prime of life, black-haired youths who have still not fully enjoyed sense-pleasures,⁹⁹

5.3 yet, you all, Anuruddhā, blessed with youth, endowed with the prime of life, black-haired youths, have gone forth from home into homelessness.

5.4 And indeed, Anuruddhā,¹⁰⁰

you have gone forth from home into homelessness *not* because of
 you have gone forth from home into homelessness *not* because of
 you have gone forth from home into homelessness *not* because of
 you have gone forth from home into homelessness *not* because of

*being forced by the king;*¹⁰¹
*being forced by robbers;*¹⁰²
*debts;*¹⁰³
*fear;*¹⁰⁴

⁹⁸ Meaning “Anuruddha and all present,” *anuruddhā* (3 m pl), ie, the Buddha is addressing Anuruddha and the monks named above [§2]. Also at **(Anuruddha) Upakkilesa S** (M 128.11/3:156), SD 5.18. See M:H 1:257 n4. This is an elliptical vocative or multiple vocative, an idiom unique to Pali: see SD 13.1 (3.1.1.4).

⁹⁹ *Yena tumhe, anuruddhā, bhadrēna yobbanena samannāgatā paṭhamena vayasā susu, kāḷa, kesā kāmē paribhuñ-jeyyātha*. The main sentence here is stock: **Sambahula S** (S 4.21/1:117+118), **Piṇḍola Bhāra, dvāja S** (S 35.127/-4:110+111+112×2), SD 27.6a.

¹⁰⁰ The rest of this section is stock: M 68,5.4/1:463, SD 37.4; S 22.8/3:93 (SA 2:301 f); It 5.2/89 (ItA 2:113); Miln 32; SnA 1:340; UA 106.

¹⁰¹ *N’eva rājābhiniṭā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitā*, ie a king, having caught a wrong-doer, tells him, “If you go forth, you will be free.” (MA 3:180).

¹⁰² *Na corābhiniṭā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitā*, ie, having being caught by robbers, plead to them that one is on the way to joining the monastery, so as to escape being killed by them (MA 3:180; SA 2:302; ItA 2:113).

¹⁰³ *Na iṇaṭṭā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitā*, ie, where the creditor releases the debtor if he becomes a monk (MA 3:180), or if he goes forth to flee from creditors (ItA 2:113). The figure of the debtor is often used for one caught up with sensual pleasure: see **Te, vijja S** (D 13.6/1:72), SD 8.10; MA 2:318; see also **Nīvaraṇa**, SD 32.1 (3.2.1).

you have gone forth from home into homelessness *not* for the sake of *livelihood*.¹⁰⁵

5.5 But rather you have done so, thinking,¹⁰⁶

‘I am immersed in birth, decay, death, sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain, and despair; overwhelmed by suffering, overcome by suffering.

Perhaps, there is a making an end of this whole mass of suffering to be found!’¹⁰⁷

5.6 What now, Anuruddhā, have you not thus gone forth from home into homelessness out of faith?”

“Yes, bhante, we have.”

Duties of a renunciant

6 “And what now, Anuruddhā, should be done by a son of family who has gone forth from home into homelessness in this way?

6.2 THE MENTAL HINDRANCES. Anuruddhā, so long as he does *not* attain to zeal and joy on account of being secluded from sensual pleasures and secluded from unwholesome mental states, or some other state that is more peaceful than that,¹⁰⁸

covetousness ¹⁰⁹	(<i>abhijjhā</i>)	invades his mind and remains there,
ill will	(<i>avyāpdā</i>)	invades his mind and remains there,
sloth and torpor	(<i>thīna, middha</i>)	invade his mind and remains there,
restless and worry	(<i>uddhacca, kukkucā</i>)	invade his mind and remains there,
doubt	(<i>vicikicchā</i>)	invades his mind and remains there, [464]
discontent ¹¹⁰	(<i>arati</i>)	invades his mind and remains there,
drowsiness ¹¹¹	(<i>tandī</i>)	invades his mind and remains there.

This is the case, Anuruddhā, so long as he does not attain to zeal and joy on account of being secluded from sensual pleasures and secluded from unwholesome mental states, or some other state that is more peaceful than that.

6.3 OVERCOMING THE MENTAL HINDRANCES. Anuruddhā, so long as he attains to zeal and joy on account of being secluded from sensual pleasures and secluded from unwholesome mental states, or some other state that is more peaceful than that,¹¹²

<i>covetousness</i>	does not continue to seize his mind,
<i>ill will</i>	does not continue to seize his mind,
<i>sloth and torpor</i>	do not continue to seize his mind,

¹⁰⁴ *Na bhayaṭṭā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitā*, ie, SA says that these are the “fears” of kings, thieves, hunger, illness and debt (SA 2:302; MA 3:180).

¹⁰⁵ *N’ājīvikā, pakatā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitā*, ie, during famines or difficulties, one goes forth so that one does not have earn a living (MA 3:180).

¹⁰⁶ As at **Piṇḍolya S** (S 22.80.18c/3:93), SD 28.9a.

¹⁰⁷ *Appeva nāma imassa kevalassa dukkha-k, khandhassa anta, kiriyā paññāyethāti*.

¹⁰⁸ *Vivekaṃ, anuruddhā, kāmehi vivekaṃ akusalehi dhammehi pīti, sukhaṃ nādhigacchati aññaṃ vā tato santataraṃ*. Apparently, this passage (negatively phrased) is found only here. Its positive version is found in **Cūḷa Dukkha-k, khandha S** (M 1:91×2, 92×2). Here, the “zeal and joy on account of being secluded from sensual pleasures and secluded from unwholesome mental states” refers to the 1st and 2nd dhyanas, while “some other state that is more peaceful than that” refers to 3rd and 4th dhyanas, and the 4 paths (MA 2:63, cf 3:181).

¹⁰⁹ On this list of mental hindrances, see Intro (2.1.2).

¹¹⁰ *Arati*. See **Aratī S** (S 8.2/1:186 f), SD 53.6 & **Māra Dhītu S** (S 4.25/1:125-127), SD 36.6.

¹¹¹ *Tandī*. Here, as a non-tt, it prob means a deeper sense of sloth, a total lack of effort or desire to do so. See **Thīna, middha**, SD 32.6 (2.2).

¹¹² *Vivekaṃ, anuruddhā, kāmehi vivekaṃ akusalehi dhammehi pīti, sukhaṃ nādhigacchati aññaṃ vā tato santataraṃ*. Apparently this phrase is found only here.

<i>restless and worry</i>	do not continue to seize his mind,
<i>doubt</i>	does not continue to seize his mind,
<i>discontent</i>	does not continue to seize his mind,
<i>drowsiness</i>	does not continue to seize his mind.

This is the case, Anuruddhā, so long as he attains to zeal and joy on account of being secluded from sensual pleasures and secluded from unwholesome mental states, or some other state that is more peaceful than that.

The arhats' knowledge of the Buddha

7 What then, Anuruddhā, do you think of me, thus:

'Those influxes¹¹³ that defile, that bring about rebirth, that are troubling, that ripen in suffering, that bring about future birth, decay and death, have *not* been abandoned by the Tathagata;¹¹⁴ therefore, the Tathagata, having considered,¹¹⁵ uses one thing; having considered, endures another; having considered, avoids another; having considered, removes another.'¹¹⁶

"No, indeed, bhante, we do not think of the Blessed One thus:

'Those influxes that defile, that bring about rebirth, that are troubling, that ripen in suffering, that bring about future birth, decay and death, have not been abandoned by the Tathagata; therefore, the Tathagata, having considered, uses one thing; having considered, endures another; having considered, avoids another; having considered, removes another.'

The Buddha is well freed

7.2 We, bhante, think of the Blessed One, thus:

'Those influxes that defile, that bring about rebirth, that are troubling, that ripen in suffering, that bring about future birth, decay and death,

¹¹³ *Āsava*, Skt *āsrava*; BHS *āśrava*, *āsrava*. Here, *āsava* is a tt for the obstacle(s) to the attainment of arhathood. As "mental influxes," the oldest list is probably a set of 3 influxes—of sense-desire (*kām'āsava*), of existence (*bhav'āsava*), and of ignorance (*avijj'āsava*), as in **Saṅgīti S** (D 33), **Sammā,diṭṭhi S** (M 9), **Āsava S** (S 38.8), **Ti,kaṇṇa S** (A 35.8), **(Te,vijja) Jāṇussoṇi S** (A 3.59), **Nibbedhika Pariyāya S** (A 6.63). The Abhidhamma and Comys give a list of 4 influxes, which is also found in the Nikāyas, that is, the influxes of (1) sense-desire (*kām'āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav'āsava*), (3) views (*diṭṭh'āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijj'āsava*). These 4 are also known as "floods" (*ogha*) and "yokes" (*yoga*).

¹¹⁴ *Ye āsavā saṅkilesikā ponobbhavikā sadarā dukkha,vipākā āyatim jāti,jarā,marañiyā, appahinā te tathāgatas-sa*. This sentence up to *appahinā* is stock: M 1:250×4, 331×2, 464×2.

¹¹⁵ "Having considered" (*saṅkhaya*), as at **Pabbajitassa Roga S** (A 4.157.2/2:143,19); **Sn 1041: Lakkhaṇa S** (D 30) @ SD 36.9 (3.1). See also Sn:N 404 n1041.

¹¹⁶ *Tasmā tathāgato saṅkhāy'ekam paṭisevati, saṅkhāy'ekam adhvāseti, saṅkhāy'ekam parivajjeti, saṅkhāy'ekam vinodetīti?* From *saṅkhāy'ekam...vinodeti* is stock: **M 68,6/1:464×4**; **A 9.2.3/4:354**, **10,20.7/5:30**. See esp **Sabb'āsava S** (M 2), where they refer to the practices of those training to prevent the arising of latent tendencies that have not yet been abandoned (M 2,4/1:7), SD 30.3. In **Saṅgīti S** (D 33), the 4 statements are mentioned in connection with the 4 supports or modes of attention (*apassena*, from *apa* + *assaya*) (D 33,1.11(8)-/3:224). They are constant reflections that help prevent or mitigate the arising of mental defilements in connection with physical things.

have been abandoned by Tathagata;
 therefore, the Tathagata,
 having considered, uses one thing;
 having considered, endures another;
 having considered, avoids another;
 having considered, removes another.”

7.3 “Good, good, Anuruddhā, those influxes that defile, that bring about rebirth, that are troubling, that ripen in suffering, that bring about future birth, decay and death, have been abandoned by Tathagata,

having cut them off at the root, made them like a palm-tree stump, done away with them so that they are not subject to further growth.¹¹⁷

7.4 Anuruddhā, just as a palm tree whose crown has been cut off is incapable of further growth, even so, Anuruddhā, those influxes that defile, that bring about rebirth, that are troubling, that ripen in suffering, that bring about future birth, decay and death,

have been abandoned by Tathagata,
cut off at the root, made them like a palm-tree stump, done away with them so that they are not subject to further growth.

7.5 *Therefore, Anuruddhā, the Tathagata, having considered, uses one thing; having considered, endures another; having considered, avoids another; having considered, removes another.*

The Buddha’s purpose in declaring his disciples’ liberation

8 What do you think, Anuruddhā? Seeing what purpose does the Tathagata declare the reappearance of a disciple who has passed away, who has died, thus:¹¹⁸

‘So-and-so had reappeared in such-and-such a place. So-and-so had reappeared in such-and-such a place’?”¹¹⁹ [465]

8.2 “Bhante, our teachings are rooted in the Blessed One, guided by the Blessed One, have the Blessed One as refuge. It would be good indeed if the Blessed One were to explain its meaning. Having heard the Blessed One, the monks would remember it.”¹²⁰

¹¹⁷ *Ucchinna, mūlā tālā, vatthu, katā anabhāvaṃ, katā āyatim anuppāda, dhammā.* This is stock: **M 22.32/1:139×2, 36.47/1:250×2, 43.35-37/1:298×3, 49.30/1:331×2, 68.7/1:464×2, 72.20/1:488×3, 73.6/1:490, 140.27/3:245; S 22.3.9/3:10(×3) +11, 22.25.3+5+6/3:27, 22.111.2+7/3:161, 22.112.3+6+7/3:162, 23.9.4+5+6+7/3:193, 23.10.4+5+6+7+8/3:194, 35.103.6/4:83 f, 35.104.4+9/4:85×2, 41.5.4/4:292×3, 41.7.11+12+13/4:297×3, 44.1.15+16+17+18+19+30+31+32+33+34/4:376-379, 54.12.5/5:327+328; A 3.69.10/1:204 f×3, 11/1:205×3, 3.33.2c/1:135 f, 4.36.38/2:38×2, 4.195.9/2:199, 4.254.1/2:249, 5.71.4+5+6+7+8/3:84+85, 5.72.4+5+6+7+8/3:85 (pl), 86, 8.11.2/4:173, 3/4:174, 8/4:175×2, 9/176, 8.12.7/4:184×4; Nm 1:56, 90, 100, 189×3, 198×4, 206, 207×2, 334, 430×2, 432, 442, 443; Nc (×24); V 1:235×2, 236×2 (Mv), 3:2×2, 3×4 (Pār). §§7cd are also in **Mahā Saccaka S** (M 36.47/1:250), SD 49.4.**

¹¹⁸ *Taṃ kiṃ maññasi, anuruddhā, kaṃ attha, vasaṃ sampassamāno tathāgato sāvake abbatāte kālaṃ, kate upapattīsu vyākaroti.*

¹¹⁹ Cf **Jana, vasabha S** (D 18.1/2:200), SD 62.3.

¹²⁰ *Bhagavam, mūlakā no bhante dhammā, bhagavaṃ nettikā, bhagavaṃ paṭisaraṇā. Sādhū vata bhante bhagavatañ-ñ’eva paṭibhātu etassa bhāsītassa attho. Bhagavato sutvā bhikkhū dhāressantī ti.* This is stock: **Mahā Dhamma Samādāna S** (M 46.2/1:309 f), **Vīmaṃsaka S** (M 47.3/1:317), **Naḷakapāna S** (M 68.8/1:465), **Mahā Suññata S** (M 122.19/3:115), SD 11.4; **Bālena Paṇḍita S** (S 2:24), SD 21.1, **Parivīmaṃsanā S** (S 12.51/2:81), SD 11.5, **Candūpama S** (S 16.3/2:199), **Sammāsambuddha S** (S 22.58/3:66), **Sall’atthana S** (S 36.6/4:208), SD 5.5, **Ānanda S 2** (S 36.16/4:221); A 3.68/1:199, A 8.6/4:158, A 8.83/4:338, A 9.1/4:351, A 10.58/5:106, A 11.20/5:355. See esp **Bhagava Mūlaka S** (A 10.58/5:106 f), SD 67.4.

9 “Anuruddhā, it is not for the sake of deceiving people, nor for the sake of popular talk, nor for the sake of such benefits as gains, praises and renown, nor hoping, ‘May people know me to be so and so,’¹²¹

that he declare the reappearance of a disciple who has passed away, who has died, thus:

‘So-and-so had reappeared in such-and-such a place. So-and-so had reappeared in such-and-such a place.’

9.2 And indeed, Anuruddhā, there are sons of family with faith, greatly inspired,¹²² greatly gladdened, who having heard this, will direct their minds to such a goal. This, Anuruddhā, is for their good and happiness for a long time.

Being inspired by a monk’s arhathood

10 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

‘**Monk** so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that he was established in **final knowledge**.’¹²³

10.2 Moreover, he has seen that venerable one¹²⁴ himself, or heard it said of him, thus:¹²⁵

‘Such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s	<u>moral virtue</u> ;	<i>sīla</i>
such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s	<u>Dharma</u> [nature];	<i>dhamma</i> ¹²⁶
such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s	<u>wisdom</u> ;	<i>pañña</i>
such, too, indeed, was how that venerable	<u>lived</u> ;	<i>vihārī</i>
such, too, indeed, was how that venerable was	<u>freed</u> .’	<i>vimutta</i> ¹²⁷

10.3 He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.¹²⁸

¹²¹ *Na kho, anuruddhā, tathāgato jana,kuhan’attham na jana,lapan’attham na lābha,sakkāra,silok’ānisaṃs’attham [na iti,vāda-p,pamokkh’ānisaṃs’attham]* na iti maṃ jano jānātūti*: also in **Kuhana S 1** (It 1.8/28), **Brahma-cariya S** (A 4.25/2:26) except that it has additional phrase [*], which means “not for the sake of extrication from malicious talk (for one’s advantage)”; also in **Kuhana S 2** (It 1.9/29). See above Intro (3). On the last ulterior motive, Comy says that it is with the hope that people will know him and his reputation would grow (MA 3:182).

¹²² Comy glosses as “with great joy” (*mahanta,tuṭṭhino*, MA 3:182).

¹²³ *Itthan,nāmo bhikkhu kālaṅ,kato, so bhagavatā vyākato, aññāya saṅṭhaḥīti*. Here *aññā*, “final knowledge,” is the arhat’s direct knowledge of true reality that also characterizes his liberation.

¹²⁴ *Āyasmā*, a general term of polite address, which also applies to the laity: see eg §18b & passim.

¹²⁵ *So kho pan’assa āyasmā sāmāṃ diṭṭho vā hoti anussava-s,suto vā*. These 5 points are actually a summary for the tenfold rightness (*sammattā*), ie, the noble eightfold path, right knowledge, and right freedom (D 3:271, 292; M 1:42; A 5:212, 240). These are the qualities of the adept (*asekha*), ie the arhat. This interpretation applies only on the passages on the arhat. The same formula appears for all the other “learners” (*sekha*), ie, non-arhat saints, referring to their respective attainments. See Intro (1.1.2.3).

¹²⁶ By virtue of its position here, btw “moral virtue” (*sīla*) and “wisdom” (*pañña*), *dhamma* refers to “meditation,” ie *samādhi*. That is, the refer to the 3 trainings: see **Ti,sikkhā S** (A 3.88/1:235), SD 24.10 & **Sīla samādhi pañña**, SD 21.6.

¹²⁷ Above [§10a], the Sutta simply def the arhat as one “established in final knowledge,” a succinct def unique to **Naḷaka,āna S**. The whole passage here reads: *evaṃ,sīlo so āyasmā ahosi iti’pi, evaṃ,dhammo so āyasmā ahosi iti’pi, evaṃ,pañño so āyasmā ahosi iti’pi, evaṃ,vihārī so āyasmā ahosi iti’pi, evaṃ,vimutto so āyasmā ahosi iti’pīti*. These are the defining characteristics of an arhat. A more common def of an arhat is this: “having right here and now realized for himself through direct knowledge, attained and dwelled in the freedom of mind and freedom by wisdom that are influx-free with the destruction of the mental influxes” (*yo āsavānaṃ khayā anāsavaṃ ceto,vimuttiṃ paññaṃ,vimuttiṃ diṭṭhe’va dhamme sayam abhiñña sacchikatvā upasampajja viharatī*), eg, **Mahā Vaccha-gotta S** (M 73,7/1:490), SD 27.4. See (1.1.2.3).

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk's abiding in comfort.¹²⁹

Being inspired by a monk's non-returning

11 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

'Monk so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that having destroyed the 5 lower fetters,¹³⁰

he is **spontaneously arisen** (in the pure abodes),¹³¹ who thereby attains nirvana, and of a nature not to return from that world?'¹³²

11.2 Moreover, he has seen that venerable one for himself, or heard it said of him, thus:

'Such, too, indeed, was that venerable's moral virtue;
such, too, indeed, was that venerable's nature (dhamma);
such, too, indeed, was that venerable's wisdom;
such, too, indeed, was how the venerable lived;
such, too, indeed, was how that venerable was freed.'

11.3 He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk's abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a monk's once-returning

¹²⁸ These 5 qualities—faith (*saddhā*), moral virtue (*sīla*), learning (*suta*), charity (*cāga*) and wisdom (*wisdom*)—are the qualities of “noble growth” (*ariya,vaḍḍhi*): see **Saṅkhār'upapatti S** (M 120,3/3:99), SD 3.4; **Vaḍḍhi S 1 + 2** (A 5.63+64/3:80) & SD 3.4 (3-4). These are also qualities that empower us to decide our own wholesome rebirth, if we choose to (see M 120). See above [1.1.2.3].

¹²⁹ *Evam pi kho, anuruddhā, bhikkhuno phāsu,vihāro hoti.*

¹³⁰ **The 10 fetters** (*dasa saṃyojana*) are: (1) self-identity view (*sakkāya,diṭṭhi*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rituals and vows (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*), (4) sensual lust (*kāma,rāga*), (5) repulsion (*paṭigha*), (6) greed for form existence (*rūpa,rāga*), (7) greed for formless existence (*arūpa,rāga*), (8) conceit (*māna*), (9) restlessness (*uddhacca*), (10) ignorance (*avijjā*) (S 5:61; A 5:13; Vbh 377). In some places, no 5 (*kāma,rāga*) is replaced by ill will (*vyāpāda*). The first 5 are the lower fetters (*orambhāgiya*), and the rest, the higher fetters (*uddhambhāgiya*). The abandonment of the lower 5 fetters makes one a non-returner (*opapātika* or *anāgāmī*) (see **Ānāpānasati S**, M 118.10 = 7.13). This verse technically refers to the non-returner, but here is spoken of an arhat, one who has broken all 10 fetters: see **Laṭukikopama S** (M 66.17/1:454), SD 28.11.

¹³¹ The Pure Abodes (*suddh'āvāsa*) are the 5 highest heavens of the form world (*rūpa,loka*) inhabited only by non-returners who assume their last birth to and attain nirvana as arhats (D 3:237, M 3:103, Vbh 425, Pug 42-46). The 5 pure abodes, ie their inhabitants and respective lifespans, are: These worlds are Āviha (“Non-declining,” 1000 MK), Ātappa (“Unworried,” 2000 MK), Sudassā (“Clearly Visible,” 4000 MK), Sudassī (“Clear-visioned,” 8000 MK) and Akaṇiṭṭhā (“Highest,” 16000 MK) (D 3:237, M 3:103, Vbh 425, Pug 42-46). MK = *Mahā Kappa*. that is, a full cycle of a world-period or cycle of the universe (V 3:4 = D 3:51, 111 = It 99; D 1:14; A 2:142). For celestial map, see **Kevalāḍḍha S** (D 11/1:211-223), SD 1.7; for world cycle, see **Aggañña S** (D 27/3:80-97), SD 2.19.

¹³² *Pañcannaṃ orambhāgiyānaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ parikkhayā opapātiko tattha parinibbāyī anāvatti,dhammo tasmā lokāti.* This def of a non-returner, beginning from “having destroyed...,” is stock: **D** 1:156, 2:92, 93, 3:107, 108, 132; **M** 1:34, 350, 352, 436, 465, 467, 490, 2:52, 146, 3:247; **S** 5:69, 70×13, 237, 285, 314, 346, 356, 358, 359 ×2, 376, 378, 406×2; **A** 1:232, 233×5, 234×4, 235, 290×3, 2:5. 89, 238, 4:12, 14×2, 70, 7×4, 72×5, 73×3, 74, 146, 380×2, 399, 423×2, 424, 425, 426×2, 5:343, 344×2, 345, 346×2; **Pug** 16×2, 17×3, 18, 62, 63, 72.

12 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

‘**Monk** so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that, having destroyed the 3 fetters and diminished lust, hate and delusion, he is a **once-returner**,

and returning only once to this world, he will make an end of suffering.’¹³³

12.2 Moreover, he has seen that venerable one for himself, or heard it said of him, thus:

‘Such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s moral virtue;
such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s Dharma [nature];
such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s wisdom;
such, too, indeed, was how the venerable lived;
such, too, indeed, was how that venerable was freed.’

12.3 He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk’s abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a monk’s streamwinning

13 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

‘**Monk** so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that, having totally destroyed the 3 fetters,

he is a **streamwinner**,

not bound for the lower world,

sure of going over to self-awakening.’¹³⁴

13.2 Moreover, he has seen that venerable one for himself, or heard it said of him, thus:

‘Such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s moral virtue;
such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s Dharma [nature];
such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s wisdom;
such, too, indeed, was how the venerable lived;
such, too, indeed, was how that venerable was freed.’

13.3 He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk’s abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a nun’s arhathood

14 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

‘**Nun** so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that she was established in **final knowledge**.’

14.2 Moreover, she has seen that sister for himself, or heard it said of her, thus:

¹³³ *Tiṇṇaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ parikkhayā rāga, dosa, mohānaṃ tanuttā sakadāgāmī sakid eva imaṃ lokam āgantvā dukkhass’antaṃ karissatīti.* This def of a once-returner, beginning from “having destroyed,” is stock: **D** 1:156, 2:92, 93, 200, 201×2, 203, 252, 3:107, 108, 132; **M** 1:34, 226, 465, 466, 467, 468, 3:80; **S** 3:357, 359, 377, 378, 406×2; **A** 1:232, 233, 234, 2:89, 238, 4:12, 380; **Pug** 16, 63, 72.

¹³⁴ *Tiṇṇaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ parikkhayā sot’āpanno avinipāta, dhammo niyato sambodhi, parāyaṇo’ti.* This def of a streamwinner, beginning from “Having fully destroyed...,” is stock: **D** 1:156, 3:107, 108, 132; **M** 1:34, 466, 467, 5:377, 379; **A** 1:232, 2:89, 238, 4:12; **U** 50; **Pug** 16×3, 63, 72.

'Such, too, indeed, was that sister's	<u>moral virtue</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was that sister's	<u>Dharma</u> [nature];
such, too, indeed, was that sister's	<u>wisdom</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was how that sister	<u>lived</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was how that sister was	<u>freed</u> .'

14.3 *He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.*

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk's abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a nun's non-returning

15 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

'**Nun** so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that having destroyed the 5 lower fetters, she is **spontaneously arisen** (in the Pure Abodes), who thereby attains nirvana, and of a nature not to return from that world?'

15.2 *Moreover, he has seen that sister for himself, or heard it said of her, thus:*

'Such, too, indeed, was that sister's	<u>moral virtue</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was that sister's	<u>Dharma</u> [nature];
such, too, indeed, was that sister's	<u>wisdom</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was how that sister	<u>lived</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was how that sister was	<u>freed</u> .'

15.3 *He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.*

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk's abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a nun's once-returning

16 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

'**Nun** so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that having destroyed the 3 fetters and diminished lust, hate and delusion, she is a **once-returner**, and returning only once to this world, she will make an end of suffering.'

16.2 *Moreover, he has seen that sister for himself, or heard it said of her, thus:*

'Such, too, indeed, was that sister's	<u>moral virtue</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was that sister's	<u>Dharma</u> [nature];
such, too, indeed, was that sister's	<u>wisdom</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was how that sister	<u>lived</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was how that sister was	<u>freed</u> .'

16.3 *He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.*

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk's abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a nun's streamwinning

17 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

'**Nun** so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that

having totally destroyed the 3 fetters,
 she is a **streamwinner**,
 not bound for the lower world,
 sure of going over to self-awakening.’ [467]

17.2 Moreover, he has seen that sister for himself, or heard it said of her, thus:

‘Such, too, indeed, was that sister’s	<u>moral virtue</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was that sister’s	<u>Dharma [nature]</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was that sister’s	<u>wisdom</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was how that sister	<u>lived</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was how that sister was	<u>freed</u> .’

17.3 He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk’s abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a layman’s non-returning¹³⁵

18 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

‘**Layman** [Upasaka] so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that having destroyed the 5 lower fetters, he is **spontaneously arisen** (in the Pure Abodes), who thereby attains nirvana, and of a nature not to return from that world?’

18.2 Moreover, he has seen that venerable one¹³⁶ for himself, or heard it said of him, thus:

‘Such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s	<u>moral virtue</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s	<u>Dharma [nature]</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s	<u>wisdom</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was how the venerable	<u>lived</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was how that venerable was	<u>freed</u> .’

18.3 He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk’s abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a layman’s once-returning

19 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

‘**Layman** so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that, having destroyed the 3 fetters and diminished lust, hate and delusion, he is a **once-returner**, and returning only once to this world, he will make an end of suffering.’

19.2 Moreover, he has seen that venerable one for himself, or heard it said of him, thus:

‘Such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s	<u>moral virtue</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s	<u>Dharma [nature]</u> ;
such, too, indeed, was that venerable’s	<u>wisdom</u> ;

¹³⁵ On the attainment of arhathood by the laity, see Intro (4).

¹³⁶ *Āyasmā* is a general form of polite address; here used throughout even for layman, which is common in the suttas: see above §11b.

such, too, indeed, was how the venerable lived;

such, too, indeed, was how that venerable was freed.'

19.3 *He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.*

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk's abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a layman's streamwinning

20 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

'**Layman** so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that,

having totally destroyed the 3 fetters,

he is a **streamwinner**,

not bound for the lower world,

sure of going over to self-awakening.'

20.2 *Moreover, he has seen that venerable one for himself, or heard it said of him, thus:*

'*Such, too, indeed, was that venerable's moral virtue;*

such, too, indeed, was that venerable's Dharma [nature];

such, too, indeed, was that venerable's wisdom;

such, too, indeed, was how the venerable lived;

such, too, indeed, was how that venerable was freed.'

20.3 *He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.*

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk's abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a laywoman's non-returning

21 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

'**Laywoman** [Upasika] so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that

having destroyed the 5 lower fetters,

she is one **spontaneously arisen** (in the Pure Abodes), who thereby attains nirvana,

and of a nature not to return from that world?'

21.2 *Moreover, he has seen that sister for himself, or heard it said of her, thus:*

'*Such, too, indeed, was that sister's moral virtue;*

such, too, indeed, was that sister's Dharma [nature];

such, too, indeed, was that sister's wisdom;

such, too, indeed, was how that sister lived; [468]

such, too, indeed, was how that sister was freed.'

21.3 *He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.*

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk's abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a laywoman's once-returning

22 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

'**Laywoman** so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that

having destroyed the 3 fetters and diminished lust, hate and delusion,

she is a **once-returner**,

and returning only once to this world, she will make an end of suffering.’

22.2 *Moreover, he has seen that sister for himself, or heard it said of her, thus:*

<i>‘Such, too, indeed, was that sister’s</i>	<i><u>moral virtue</u>;</i>
<i>such, too, indeed, was that sister’s</i>	<i><u>Dharma [nature]</u>;</i>
<i>such, too, indeed, was that sister’s</i>	<i><u>wisdom</u>;</i>
<i>such, too, indeed, was how that sister</i>	<i><u>lived</u>;</i>
<i>such, too, indeed, was how that sister was</i>	<i><u>freed</u>.’</i>

22.3 *He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.*

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk’s abiding in comfort.

Being inspired by a laywoman’s streamwinning

23 Here, Anuruddhā, a monk hears thus:

‘Laywoman so-and-so has passed away. The Blessed One has declared that having totally destroyed the 3 fetters, she is a **streamwinner**, not bound for the lower world, sure of going over to self-awakening.’

23.2 *Moreover, he has seen that sister for himself, or heard it said of her, thus:*

<i>‘Such, too, indeed, was that sister’s</i>	<i><u>moral virtue</u>;</i>
<i>such, too, indeed, was that sister’s</i>	<i><u>Dharma [nature]</u>;</i>
<i>such, too, indeed, was that sister’s</i>	<i><u>wisdom</u>;</i>
<i>such, too, indeed, was how that sister</i>	<i><u>lived</u>;</i>
<i>such, too, indeed, was how that sister was</i>	<i><u>freed</u>.’</i>

23.3 *He directs his own mind to the goal, recollecting his faith and moral virtue and learning and charity and wisdom.*

Such, indeed, Anuruddhā, is the monk’s abiding in comfort.

Conclusion

24 Anuruddhā, it is not for the sake of deceiving people, nor for the sake of popular talk, nor for the sake of such benefits as gains, praises and renown, nor hoping, ‘May people know me to be so and so,’¹³⁷

*that the Tathagata declare the reappearance of a disciple who has passed away, who has died, thus:*¹³⁸

‘So-and-so had reappeared in such-and-such a place. So-and-so had reappeared in such-and-such a place.’

24.2 For, indeed, Anuruddhā, there are sons of family with faith, greatly inspired, greatly gladdened, who having heard this, will direct their minds to such a goal. This, Anuruddhā, is for their good and happiness for a long time.”

¹³⁷ *Na kho, anuruddhā, tathāgato jana,kuhan’attham na jana,lapan’attham na lābha,sakkāra,silok’ānisaṃs’attham [na iti,vāda-p,pamokkh’ānisaṃs’attham]* na ‘iti maṃ jano jānātūti: also in **Kuhana S 1** (It 1.8/28) = **Brahma,-cariya S** (A 4.25/2:26) except that it has additional phrase [*], which means “not for the sake of extrication from malicious talk (for one’s advantage)”; also in **Kuhana S 2** (It 1.9/29). See above Intro (3).*

¹³⁸ *Tam kiṃ maññasi, anuruddhā, kam attha,vasam sampassamāno tathāgato sāvake abbatīte kālaṅ,kate upapattīsu vyākaroti.*

25 The Blessed One said this. Satisfied, the venerable Anuruddha rejoiced in the Blessed One's word.

— evaṃ —

Bibliography

Rockhill, W Woodville

1884 (tr) *The Life of the Buddha and the Early History of his Order derived from Tibetan works in the bKah-hGyur and bsTan-hGyur, followed by notices on the early history of Tibet and Khoten*. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner, 1884; repr Petaling Jaya (Malaysia): Mandala, 1987.

Somaratne, G A

2009 "White-clothed celibate arahants in early Buddhism." In *Buddhist and Pali Studies in Honour of the Venerable Professor Kakkapalliye Anuruddha*, (edd) K L Dhammajoti, Y Karunadasa, Hong Kong: Centre of Buddhist Studies, The University of Hong Kong, 2009:151-167.

111014 111026 111110 111212 121210 131223 141020 150526 161218 170723 181007 191002 200822
220428