

# 11

## Pacalā Sutta

or **Pacalāyamāna Sutta** The Discourse on Nodding Off | **A 7.58<sup>1</sup>** [A:Be 7.61]

Also **(Sattaka) Moggallāna Sutta** The (Sevens) Discourse to Moggallāna

Theme: 8 ways of overcoming drowsiness and nature of true discipleship

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2003

### 1 Moggallāna's struggle

**1.1** The title Pacalā Sutta<sup>2</sup> is found in the colophon (*uddāna*) of the PTS edition. The Siamese texts call it **the Moggallāna Sutta**,<sup>3</sup> and the Burmese and the Siamese World Tipiṭaka, **Pacalāyamāna Sutta** (*pacalāyamāna* means “nodding off”). This Sutta records the efforts of Mahā Moggallāna, the second chief disciple of the Buddha, to attain spiritual liberation during the week after his ordination in the second year of the ministry.

For his intensive training, Moggallāna went to live near a village called Kallavāḷa,mutta or Kallavāḷa,putta (“liquor-dealer’s son”)<sup>4</sup> in Magadha. On the seventh day of his ordination, when he was engaged in meditation, he was troubled by fatigue and torpor. According to the Aṅguttara Commentary, he had been walking up and down vigorously in meditation for 7 days, so when he sat down for his meditation, drowsiness or torpor (*middha*) overcame him (AA 4:41).<sup>5</sup>

**1.2** While listening to the Buddha expounding these teachings on the meditation of the elements (*dhātu, kamma-ṭ, thāna*), Moggallāna won the three higher paths and the apex of a chief disciple’s perfection by attaining arhathood (A 4:85 f; AA 4:42).

**1.3** Moggallāna’s struggle for arhathood here is recounted *dhyana by dhyana* in the first nine discourses of **the Moggallāna Saṃyutta** (S 40.1-9),<sup>6</sup> that is, on the 4 dhyanas, the 4 formless attainments, and the signless meditation. Historically, it is likely that the Pacalā Sutta records Moggallāna’s meditation struggle just before that recorded in **the Paṭhama Jhāna Pañha Sutta** (S 40.1).<sup>7</sup>

Another possibility is that both the discourses—the Pacalā Sutta and the Paṭhama Jhāna Pañha Sutta—are recounting the same event. While the Aṅguttara reciters records how the Buddha admonished Moggallāna on overcoming drowsiness (and also teachings on letting go), the Saṃyutta reciters recounts only the meditation practice itself, and in nine discourses describe his gaining of the form dhyanas and the formless attainments.

<sup>1</sup> Be adds 2 pp of text (A 4:88-90), a single line on p88.

<sup>2</sup> Due to editorial oversight in the PTS Pali ed, this Sutta and the following (Puñña) Mettā S (A 7.58a) are treated as one. See **(Puñña) Mettā S** (A 7.58a/4:88-91), SD 3:2.11a.

<sup>3</sup> Here called **(Sattaka) Moggallāna S**, the (Sevens) Discourse on Moggallāna, to distinguish it from **(Catukka) Moggallāna S**, the (Fours) Discourse on Moggallāna (A 4.167), SD 46.16.

<sup>4</sup> In the Thera, gāthā Comy on Moggallāna’s verses, it is called Kallavāḷa (ThaA 2:162).

<sup>5</sup> Cf Soṇa Koḷivisa who walked up and down in meditation until his feet bled (V 1:179-185; Tha 632-644; AA 1:233 f; Tha:RD 275 f). A shorter text, the **Soṇa (Koḷivisa) S** (A 6.55/3:374-379), SD 20.12, records the Buddha’s instruction on the middle way (simile of the lute) to Soṇa Koḷivisa. He is the foremost of the monks who exert effort (A 1:24).

<sup>6</sup> S 40.1-9/4:262-269 (SD 24.11-19).

<sup>7</sup> S 40.1/4:262 f (SD 24.11).

1.4 Like Sāriputta, Moggallāna was an arhat “freed both ways” (*ubhato, bhāga, vimutta*).<sup>8</sup> Within the same week of striving, Moggallāna not only masters the successive planes of meditative concentration but also wins the “paths of spiritual power” (*iddhi, pāda*), and thus gains direct knowledge (*abhiññā*).

## 2 Problem reading

2.1 The Pali of the first method of overcoming drowsiness [§2] given by the Buddha poses a problem in translation as there are two variant reading that apparently contradict one another, that is, (a) the PTS and Siamese (Se) readings, and (b) the Sinhalese (Ce) and Burmese (Be) readings:

**PTS:** *yathā saññissa te viharato taṃ middhaṃ okkamati, taṃ saññaṃ **manasā’kāsi** taṃ saññaṃ **bahulaṃ akāsi**.*

**Se:** *yathā saññissa te viharato taṃ middhaṃ okkamati, taṃ saññaṃ **manasi, kareyyāsi**, taṃ saññaṃ **bahulaṃ kareyyāsi**.*

**Ce:** *yathā saññino te viharato taṃ middham okkamā ti taṃ saññaṃ **mā manasikāsi** taṃ saññaṃ **mā bahulam akāsi**;*

**Be:** *yathā saññissa te viharato taṃ middhaṃ okkamati, taṃ saññaṃ **mā manasākāsi**, taṃ saññaṃ **mā bahulam-akāsi**.*

2.2 Bodhi (1999) following the Sinhalese (Ce) reading has: “At whatever thought drowsiness befalls you, you should not give attention to that thought.” (A:B). As does Ṭhānissaro (2002): “...whatever perception you have in mind when drowsiness descends on you, don’t attend to that perception, don’t pursue it.”

2.3 However, I have followed the PTS and Siamese (Se) readings: “...when you perceive that drowsiness is descending upon you, you should make a mental note of that perception; frequently make that perception. It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.”

2.4 From a practical angle, both readings—although they appear to contradict one another—are valid. When we try to overcome drowsiness or any distracting thought, we could either (a) simply note it at the sense-door as an objective experience (“drowsiness...”)⁹ or (b) simply disregard it and go on with our meditation.<sup>10</sup>

## 3 Modes of spiritual progress

3.1 There is a whole chapter (*vagga*)—the **Paṭipadā Vagga**—in the Aṅguttara Nikāya dealing with **the modes of spiritual progress** (*paṭipadā*), or simply “ways of progress” (A 4.161-170), of which there are four, namely:<sup>11</sup>

<sup>8</sup> See SD 4.25 (3.3, esp 3.3.2).

<sup>9</sup> **Māluṅkyaputta S:** “When, Māluṅkyāputta, what is to be seen, heard, sensed and cognized by you, | in the seen there will only be the seen; | in the heard there will only be the heard; | in the sensed there will only be the sensed; | in the cognized there will only be the cognized...” (S 35.95,13/4:73), SD 5.9.

<sup>10</sup> **Vitakka Saṅṭhāna S:** “(3) If, monks, while the monk is examining the dangers of those thoughts, there still arises in him bad unskillful thoughts connected with desire, hate or delusion, then **he should not mind them, disregard them**” (*asati amanasikāra*). (M 20,5/1:120), SD 1.6.

<sup>11</sup> See (**Vitthāra**) **Paṭipadā S** (A 4.162/2:149 f), SD 18.3, esp (1).

(1) painful progress with slow direct knowledge	<i>dukkhā paṭipadā dandhâbhiññā</i>
(2) painful progress with quick direct knowledge	<i>dukkhā paṭipadā khippâbhiññā</i>
(3) pleasant progress with slow direct knowledge	<i>sukhā paṭipadā dandhâbhiññā</i>
(4) pleasant progress with quick direct knowledge	<i>sukhā paṭipadā khippâbhiññā</i>

(A 4.167, SD 46.16; also A 4.161-170/2:149-152, 154 f; Dhs §§176-180/36 f)

Of the suttas in the chapter, two are called **Sāriputta Moggallāna Sutta** (A 4.167-168). In the **Sāriputta Moggallāna Sutta 1** (A 4.167), Sāriputta visits Moggallāna and on being asked by Sāriputta, Moggallāna tells him that his (Moggallāna's) mode of spiritual progress is painful but with quick direct knowledge.<sup>12</sup> In the **Sāriputta Moggallāna Sutta 2** (A 4.168), Moggallāna visits Sāriputta who says that his own mode of spiritual progress is pleasant with quick direct knowledge.<sup>13</sup>

**3.2** Moggallāna attains arhathood by swift realization (*khippâbhiññā*), that is, in a week, but his progress is difficult (*dukkha, paṭipadā*), but needs the Buddha's help, hence the swiftness in his insight. Sāriputta, on the other hand, takes only slightly longer in his progress (two weeks), but his progress is smooth (*sukha, paṭipadā*) and he swiftly gains insight listening to the Buddha exhorting the wanderer Dīgha, nakha (**Dīgha, nakha Sutta**, M 74).<sup>14</sup>

Although Moggallāna has the Buddha's personal guidance in his progress, he has a lesser range in insight, whereas Sāriputta is not only independent in his progress but has a wider range of insight. Hence, Sāriputta's supremacy in wisdom.<sup>15</sup>

**3.3** The Pacalā Sutta is helpful in giving the methods of priming our meditation practice. It is put in the Sattaka Nipāta (collection of sevens) of the Aṅguttara Nikāya because it lists 7 ways of dispelling drowsiness. The 8<sup>th</sup> factor, not exactly a "solution" for drowsiness, is to take a rest, and is not exactly a "method" of overcoming drowsiness. Hence, the Sutta is not classed in the Aṭṭhaka Nipāta (the collection of eights).

## 4 Cūḷa Tanhā, saṅkhaya Sutta

In the second section of the Sutta, Moggallāna asks the Buddha this question [§11.1]:

"In what way, bhante, in brief, is a monk freed through the destruction of craving, one who has reached the utter end,<sup>16</sup> reached the total security from bondage, reached the highest of the holy life, reached the ultimate goal—the best of gods and humans?" [§11.1]

In the **Cūḷa Tanhā, saṅkhaya Sutta** (M 37), the same question is asked, on the instigation of Moggallāna, by Sakka, the king of the devas, and the Buddha's answer is identical to the passage here. It is pos-

<sup>12</sup> **Sāriputta Moggallāna S 1** (A 4.167/2:154 f), SD 46.16.

<sup>13</sup> **Sāriputta Moggallāna S 2** (A 4.168/2:155), SD 46.17.

<sup>14</sup> M 74, 14/1:500 f (SD 16.1).

<sup>15</sup> Sāriputta, on account of his consistently great compassion, should also be seen as the foremost of monks who are compassionate, as exemplified by stories about his acts in the Dhammapada Commentary. There is officially no monastic declared as the foremost of "those who are compassionate" because every monastic is expected to be so.

<sup>16</sup> "Who has reached utter end," **accanta, niṭṭha** (mfn): *accanta* (Skt *atyanta*) = *ati* + *anta*, "reached the end or limit" of absolute perfection; *niṭṭha* (Ved *niṣṭhā, niḥṣṭhā*) = *nis* + *ṭhā* (from *-ṭhā*, "end, conclusion, perfection, height, summit, object, goal"), as in *niṭṭham gata* = *niṭṭhañ, gata*, "who has attained the goal, perfection" (= *pabbajitānaṃ arahattam patta*), S 3:99 (a-); A 2:175, 3:450, 5:119 f; Dh 351; Pm 1:81, 161; DhA 4:70. See SD 54.8 (2.2; 3).

sible that this passage originally belongs to the Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta, but is added here by the Aṅguttara reciters for a more complete Sutta.<sup>17</sup>

The events of the Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta are clearly later than those of the Pacalā Sutta since the Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta records the awakened Moggallāna as using his psychic powers to visit Sakra in his heaven. In the Pacalā Sutta, Moggallāna is still struggling in his meditation.

## 5 “Nothing is worth clinging to”

### 5.1 BRIEF ADVICE ON LIBERATION THROUGH THE DESTRUCTION OF CRAVING

**5.1.2** In the conclusion of the Pacalā Sutta, Moggallāna asks the Buddha how one is awakened [§11.1]. The Buddha begins by answering that the awakened is one who has learned that “nothing is worth clinging to” (*sabbe dhammā nālaṃ abhinivesāyā*) [§11.2]. The whole section [§11] is well known as “**the brief advice on liberation through the destruction of craving**,”<sup>18</sup> and runs thus:<sup>19</sup>

11.2 Here, the monk has learned [heard] that nothing is worth clinging to. And a monk has learned that nothing is worth clinging to, thus: he directly understands all things [he directly understands the nature of the all].<sup>20</sup> Having directly understood all things, he fully understands<sup>21</sup> all things.

11.3 Having fully understood all things, he knows whatever feelings there are, whether pleasant, painful or neither painful nor pleasant.

As regards to those feelings, he dwells contemplating impermanence in them; he dwells contemplating dispassion [fading away of lust] in them; he dwells contemplating ending [of suffering] in them; he dwells contemplating letting go [of defilements].

When he dwells contemplating impermanence in them, contemplating dispassion [fading away of lust] in them, contemplating ending [of suffering] in them, contemplating letting go [of defilements], he does not cling to anything in the world; not clinging, he is not agitated; not agitated, he attains nirvana for himself.

<sup>17</sup> M 37,15/1:255 f. Requests for brief instructions are found elsewhere in the Canon, eg V 1:39 (Sāriputta to Assaji); S 22.1/3:1-5 (SD 5.4) Nakula,pitā to the Buddha.

<sup>18</sup> *Saṅkhittena taṇhā,saṅkhaya,vimutto (ovādo)*.

<sup>19</sup> M 37,3/1:251 = A 7.58,11/4:88. The vocatives have been omitted. For nn on key terms, see sutta §11 below.

<sup>20</sup> “He directly understands all things,” *so sabbaṃ dhammaṃ abhijānāti*, alt tr, “he directly understands the nature of the all.” Here the “all” (*sabba*) refers to the 6 senses and their respective sense-objects (**Sabba S**, S 35.23/-4:15), SD 7.1.

<sup>21</sup> “He fully understands,” *parijānāti*, here meaning “he comprehends, knows fully for certain.” This spiritual knowledge is called “**full understanding**” (*pariññā*), of which there are 3 kinds: (1) Full understanding of the known (*ñāta,pariññā*), ie the discernment of the specific characteristics of a phenomena (“Form has the characteristic of being oppressed, feeling has the characteristic of being felt, etc”); (2) Full understanding by investigating (*tīraṇa,pariññā*), ie insight wisdom (*vipassanā,paññā*) which has the 3 universal characteristics (impermanence, unsatisfactoriness, non-self) as its objects, and which arises when attributing a universal characteristic to a physical and mental state, eg “Form is impermanent; feeling is impermanent, etc”; (3) Full understanding as overcoming (or abandoning) (*pahāna,pariññā*), ie the insight-wisdom that has the universal characteristics as its objects, and arises after one has overcome the idea of permanence, etc”. (Nm 52; Vism 20.3/606 f). Comy says that “full understanding” here refers to *tīraṇa,pariññā* (AA 4:43). The contemplation of impermanence (*aniccānupassanā*), etc, are given in the final tetrad (*dhammānupassanā*, contemplation of mind-objects) of the breath meditation of **Ānāpāna,sati S** (M 118,21/3:83), SD 7.13 .

He understands. ‘Birth is destroyed, the holy life has been lived, done what is to be done, there is no more for this state of being.’ (M 37,3/1:251), SD 54.8 (= A 7.58,11/4:88), SD 4.11

**5.1.2** This whole famous “brief advice on liberation through the destruction of craving” forms the main theme of **the Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta** (M 37), where the Buddha gives this teaching to Sakra, leader of the devas, in the presence of Moggallāna.<sup>22</sup> To find out whether that Sakra remembered and understood the Buddha’s admonition, Moggallāna then visits the heaven of the 33, where by a skillful means, Moggallāna reminds Sakra and the celestial king Vessavaṇa of the Buddha’s “brief advice” that nothing is worth clinging to.<sup>23</sup> Moggallāna then returns to the Buddha to recount the incident to him.<sup>24</sup> At that time, Sakra is already a streamwinner.<sup>25</sup>

## 5.2 THE ALL

Passage 11.3 of the Pacalā Sutta is very close to that in **the Avijjā Pahāna Sutta 2** (S 35.80).<sup>26</sup> The ensuing passage [S 35.80.6b], however, is very different only in wording, but same in spirit, applying the teaching of “the all” (*sabba*):<sup>27</sup>

“Here, bhikshu, the monk has **learned** [heard] that  
And a monk, having thus learned that nothing is worth clinging to,  
Having directly known all things,  
Having fully understood everything,

He sees **the eye** as *other*.  
He sees forms as *other*.  
He sees eye-consciousness as *other*.  
He sees eye-contact as *other*.

*nothing is worth clinging to.*<sup>28</sup>  
*he directly knows all things.*<sup>29</sup>  
*he fully understands all things.*<sup>30</sup>  
he **sees** all signs as other (*aññato*):<sup>31</sup>

Whatever is pleasant, or painful, or neutral,

that arises on account of eye-contact as condition—that, too, he sees as other.

[The same applies to “the ear ... ,” “the nose ... ,” “the tongue ... ,” “the body, ... ,” “the mind, ... ” (in the 5<sup>th</sup> line onwards) with the appropriate changes.]

**7** Bhikshus, when a monk knows and sees thus, ignorance is abandoned by him and true knowledge arises.” (S 35.80/4:50), SD 16.9

<sup>22</sup> Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S (M 37,2-3/1:251), SD 54.8.

<sup>23</sup> Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S (M 37,11-13/1:254 f), SD 54.8.

<sup>24</sup> Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S (M 37,15/1:255), SD 54.8.

<sup>25</sup> Sakka,pañha S (D 21,2.10/2:289), SD 70.6.

<sup>26</sup> Avijjā Pahāna S 2 (S 35.80,6/4:50), SD 16.9.

<sup>27</sup> Here the “all” (*sabba*) refers to the 6 senses and their respective sense-objects (**Sabba S**, S 35.23/4:15, SD 7.1), here the respective consciousnesses are also included.

<sup>28</sup> *Idha bhikkhu bhikkhuno sutam hoti, “Dhammā nālaṃ abhinivesāyāti.*

<sup>29</sup> *Evañ ce taṃ bhikkhu bhikkhuno sutam hoti, “Sabbe dhamme nālaṃ abhinivesāyāti, so sabbam dhammam abhijānāti.*

<sup>30</sup> This and the next 2 sentences: *sabbam dhammam abhiññāya sabbam dhammam parijānāti, sabbam dhammam pariññāya sabba, nimittāni aññato passati.* “He fully understands,” *parijānāti*, meaning “he comprehends, knows fully for certain.” See Intro 1 (text) 11.2 n for details.

<sup>31</sup> *Sabbam dhammam pariññāya sabba, nimittāni aññato passati; cakkhum aññato passati, rūpe aññato passati, cakkhu, viññānam aññato passati; ... yam p’idaṃ mano samphassa, paccayā uppajjati vedayitam sukhaṃ vā dukkhaṃ vā adukkham asukhaṃ vā. Tam pi annato passato.* See Intro (2).

### 5.3 MEANING OF “NOTHING IS WORTH CLINGING TO”

#### 5.3.1 The essential teaching

The teaching that “nothing is worth clinging to,” *sabbe dhamma nālaṃ abhinisāya*, which literally means, “all things (*dhammā*) are not worth clinging to.” According to the Commentary, “All things” here refer to the 5 aggregates, the 12 sense-bases and the 18 elements, all of which are not fit to be clung to.<sup>32</sup> These 3 basic sets of teachings can be graphically represented as follows:

<u>5 aggregates</u> ( <i>pañca-k,khandha</i> )	<u>(6 sense-faculties)</u> <i>saḷ-āyatana</i>	<u>12 sense-bases</u> <i>dvādas'āyatana</i>	<u>the 18 elements</u> <i>aṭṭhārasa dhātuyo</i>			
(1) form	{ eye ear nose tongue body mind	eye	form	eye	form	eye-consciousness
(2) feeling		ear	sound	ear	sound	ear-consciousness
(3) perception		nose	smell	nose	smell	nose-consciousness
(4) formations		tongue	taste	tongue	taste	tongue-consciousness
(5) consciousness		body	touch	body	touch	body-consciousness
		mind	thought	mind	thought	mind-consciousness

**Figure 5.3.1: The “all” of our being**

#### 5.3.2 Epistemology

**5.3.2.1 The “all”** (*sabba*) stated above is only briefly defined as the 6 sense-faculties and their respective 6 sense-objects or sense-bases in **the Sabba Sutta** (S 35.23).<sup>33</sup> This is all that is our *means* of knowing (the sense-faculties), *what* can be known (the sense-bases), and *how* we can know them (the sense-consciousnesses). Philosophically, these form the early Buddhist theory of knowledge or **epistemology**. [5.2]

**5.3.2.2** While the “18-element” model gives us a “horizontal” pattern of how we know or “sense” things (that is, *cognize*), the “5-aggregate” model represents a “vertical” pattern of how we conceive or “mind” things, that is, project ideas and cling to them. While the 18-element model presents to us a “conscious body” (*sa,viññāṇaka kāya*),<sup>34</sup> the 5-aggregate model gives a mental level of how that conscious body functions beyond mere sensing, trying to “stay” and evaluate or value-add the experience (hence, its “vertical” pattern).

**5.3.2.3** Basically, the 18-element model show how we can merely experience things on a “sense-door” level, as it happens in the present moment, without inflating them to be more than what they are, taking them just as they are. This is known as **the Bāhiya teaching**, that is, we should train ourself, thus:

<sup>32</sup> *Ettha sabbe dhammā nāma pañca-k,khandhā dvādasāyatanaṇi aṭṭhārasa dhātuyo* (AA 4:43,6-8).

<sup>33</sup> S 35.23 (SD 7.1).

<sup>34</sup> On *sa,viññāṇaka kaya*, see SD 17.8a (12.3).



<b>In the seen</b>	<b>there will only be the seen;</b>	<i>diṭṭhe</i>	<i>diṭṭha,mattam bhavissati</i>
<b>in the heard</b>	<b>there will only be the heard;</b>	<i>sute</i>	<i>suta,mattam bhavissati</i>
<b>in the sensed</b>	<b>there will only be the sensed;<sup>35</sup></b>	<i>mute</i>	<i>muta,mattam bhavissati</i>
<b>in the known</b>	<b>there will only be the known.</b>	<i>viññāte</i>	<i>viññāta,mattam bhavissati</i>

**(Arahatta) Bāhiya S** (U 1.10,15-17) + SD 33.7 (1)

This verse is the crux of insight (*vipassanā*) through *satipaṭṭhāna* (focus of mindfulness).<sup>36</sup> In sutta terms, such experiences are not to be seen as “This is mine” (*etam mama*) (which arises through craving, *taṇhā*), or as “This I am” (*eso’ham asmi*) (due to conceit, *māna*), or as “This is my self” (*eso me attā*) (due to wrong view, *diṭṭhi*).<sup>37</sup> In short, such experiences are not “beliefs” but direct experiences of reality.<sup>38</sup>

In simple Abhidhamma terms, such a process should be left at the sense-doors, and not be allowed to reach the mind-door. As long as the experience of sensing is mindfully left at its sense-door and taken for what it really is, that is an experience of reality (*param’attha*); after it has reached the mind-door and evaluated, it becomes conventional (*paññatti*) reality, that brings one suffering due to greed, hate or delusion. When such sense-experiences are mindfully left on the reality level, one would in due course see the 3 characteristics of impermanence, unsatisfactoriness and non-self.<sup>39</sup>

**5.3.2.4** The phrase, “**nothing is worth clinging to**” or “all things are not worth clinging to,” refers to the basic attitude we should cultivate as true Buddhists, that is, if we are to enjoy the fruiting and benefits of the path of awakening. It is the spirit of true renunciation (*nekkhamma*) for both monastics and the laity. Monastics, as a rule, are those who have taken the vow to “leave the world,” meaning to eschew sensual pleasures and socializing with people. They train themselves to let go of their negative emotions, cultivate a wholesome mind and work of liberation here and now. In this way, they also become exemplars of the Buddha Dharma for others.

Lay Buddhists, too, should understand the spirit of renunciation and practise it in progressive stages. A lay person should practise renunciation in 2 ways: the “horizontal” and the “vertical.” **The horizontal practice of renunciation** begins with diligently understand the 5 precepts and keeping them.<sup>40</sup> Then, whenever they can, they should practise meditation, especially the breath meditation<sup>41</sup> and the cultivation of loving-kindness.<sup>42</sup>

While breath meditation generates inner peace, lovingkindness inspires us to accept ourself and others conditionally, and helps us keep the precepts more easily as well as enhance our good karma and weaken the effects of our bad ones.<sup>43</sup> Lovingkindness is also a good background for us to practise the perception of impermanence (*anicca,saññā*), which brings us streamwinning in this life itself.<sup>44</sup>

**5.3.2.5** Our basic on-going practice as lay Buddhists—especially when we need to empower ourself to practice the above [5.3.2.4]—is that of giving (*dāna*) and charity (*cāga*). **Dāna** is basically happily giving

<sup>35</sup> *Muta*, that is, what is tasted, smelt and touched. See SD 53.5 (1.1.3).

<sup>36</sup> AA 4:43,6-11. See the satipaṭṭhāna refrain, SD 13.1 (3.7).

<sup>37</sup> **Anatta Lakkhaṇa S** (S 22.59,17-21/3:68), SD 1.2.

<sup>38</sup> See Peter Harvey, *The Selfless Mind*, 1995:32 f.

<sup>39</sup> See Mahasi Sayadaw, *A Discourse on Malukyaputta Sutta*, tr U Htin Fatt, Rangoon, 1981.

<sup>40</sup> On the 5 precepts, see SD 1.5 (1); **Dīgha,jānu S** (A 8.54,13,) SD 5.10; **Sīlānussati**, SD 15.11 (2.2); SD 21.6 (1.2); SD 37.8 (2.2).

<sup>41</sup> On the breath meditation, see **Ānāpāna,sati S** (M 118,5-7+15-22), SD 7.13.; **Mahā Rāhu’ovāda S** (M 62,24-30), SD 3.11.

<sup>42</sup> On the cultivation of lovingkindness, see **Karaṇīya Metta S** (Khp 9 = Sn 1.8) & SD 38.3 (6).

<sup>43</sup> On how lovingkindness limits karma, see SD 2.10 (2).

<sup>44</sup> See **(Anicca) Cakkhu S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

to others, especially worthy monastics, any or all of their requisites of almsfood, robes, shelter and health care. Given in the right spirit, such giving to the laity—especially to full-time lay Dharma workers and the needy—also empower us with the joy to seek higher spiritual goals in the Dharma.

**Cāga** or charity—or better, “letting go” begins with clearing away whatever we don’t need to remove or at least cut down clutter in our lives. Then, we should share or give away what surplus we have that are beneficial to others. A great way to practise charity is to encourage others to make offerings to the worthy and the needy, and to have a share of such giving.<sup>45</sup> The greatest charity is to sacrifice our time for Dharma and sutta study so that we can educate, heal and inspire other in bettering themselves—this is the gift of the Dharma.

**5.3.2.6** Finally, we should constantly reflect on what it means that “nothing is worth clinging.” We reflect on how even our views change as our understanding grows, and as we age: we learn to let go of our views. We reflect how this moment—peacefully and blissfully reading this will end in a moment—how time flies. And yet, time is the value and priority we place on things in our life. If we love the people, we always have time for them; if we love the Dharma, we always have time for it—time for Dharma is the best time for our spiritual growth.

The truth is that when we leave this life, we cannot take anything with us except our karma, the good and bad we have done. We cannot take anything we have collected in this life, not even our body. Even our breath—what we take in, we have to give back.<sup>46</sup> We cannot bring with us anything we have gotten or received—only the good that we have honestly and happily given away.<sup>47</sup>

## 6 Related suttas

**6.1** There are a number of suttas, like the Pacalā Sutta, giving practical steps in overcoming distractions to meditation and spiritual development. **The (Thīna,middha) Tissa Sutta** (S 22.84) also deals with overcoming sloth and torpor, but through the application of insight.<sup>48</sup>

**6.2 The Vitakka Saṅṭhāna Sutta** (M 20) teaches 5 methods of “stilling the mind,” that is, ridding of distracting thoughts, namely:

- (1) applying a different meditation sign (thought displacement);
- (2) examining the dangers of the distracting thought (aversion therapy);
- (3) disregarding the distracting thought (non-attention or avoidance);
- (4) identifying the causes of the distraction (thought reduction); and
- (5) sustained effort.<sup>49</sup>

In regards to method (3), the Majjhima Commentary suggests 6 other methods:

- (1) occupy ourselves with something else;
- (2) recite some work explaining a doctrine;
- (3) read a Dharma text (like a pūjā book);

<sup>45</sup> **Dīgha, janu S** (A 8.54,14), SD 5.10; SD 42.7 (3.2).

<sup>46</sup> On meditation as renunciation, see **Hāliddakāni S 1** (S 22.3/3:9-12), SD 10.12; **Bhāvanā**, SD 15.1 (14.7); **Sexuality**, SD 31.7 (1.6.2).

<sup>47</sup> On the arhat’s *cāga*, see **Dhātu Vibhaṅga S** (M 140,27), SD 4.17.

<sup>48</sup> **(Thīna,middha) Tissa S** (S 22.84/3:106-109), SD 32.12.

<sup>49</sup> See **Vitakka Saṅṭhāna S** (M 20/1:118-122), SD 1.6.



- (4) examine the parts of an object from his bag, like fire-sticks (“this is the upper stick; this is the lower stick”);
- (5) carefully and reflectively examine his requisites (“this is the awl; this is a pair of scissors; this is the nail cutter; this is the needle”;
- (6) darn the worn-out parts of the robe. (MA 3:90 f).

### 6.3 The Āghāta Paṭivīnaya Sutta (A 5.161) gives 5 methods for putting away ill will:

- (1) by cultivating lovingkindness (towards the person);
- (2) by cultivating compassion;
- (3) by cultivating equanimity;<sup>50</sup>
- (4) by simply disregarding the person;
- (5) by applying the thought that we are each the owner of our karma, the heir to our karma, karma is the source (“womb”) of our being, karma is our real relations, karma is our refuge, and that we are responsible for our deeds. (A 5.161)<sup>51</sup>

— — —

## Pacalā Sutta

### The Discourse on Nodding Off

A 7.58

**[85]**

**1** Thus have I heard.

At one time the Blessed One was staying in the Deer Park in the Bhesakaḷā Forest<sup>52</sup> at Sumsumāra,-gira<sup>53</sup> in the Bhaggā country.<sup>54</sup>

#### MAHĀ MOGGALLĀNA’S DROWSINESS

1.2 At that time the venerable Mahā Moggallāna was sitting and nodding [while trying to meditate] in the village of Kallavāḷa,mutta<sup>55</sup> in Magadha. Through the divine eye [clairvoyance],<sup>56</sup> purified and sur-

<sup>50</sup> Comy: Gladness is omitted here since it is very difficult for such a person to cultivate it at this point. (AA 3:294).

<sup>51</sup> **Āghāta Paṭivīnaya S** (A 5.161/3:186), SD 12.23.

<sup>52</sup> So called because it is the home of the yakshini Bhesakaḷā (SA 2:249). The house of Nakula,pitā and Nakula,-mātā is nearby.

<sup>53</sup> *Sumsumāra,gira*: see **Nakula,pitā S** (S 22.1), SD 5.4(1).

<sup>54</sup> For details regarding Bhaggā, see **Nakula,pitā S** (S 22.1), SD 5.4 Intro & Appendix.

<sup>55</sup> See Intro (1) above.

<sup>56</sup> *Dibba,cakkhu*, clairvoyance, not to be confused with the Dharma-eye (*dhamma,cakkhu*) (D 2,95/1:82), which is an advanced form of clairvoyance, incl the recollection of past lives: **Sāmañña,phala S** (D 2,95.2 (SD 8.10). It is, however, inferior to the wisdom eye (*paññā,cakkhu*) which is the wisdom of the arhat. The Cūḷa Niddesa mentions **5 kinds of eyes**: (1) the physical eye (*maṁsa,cakkhu*); (2) the divine eye (*dibba,cakkhu*); (3) the wisdom eye (*paññā,-cakkhu*) of the arhats; (4) the Buddha eye (*Buddha-cakkhu*); and (5) the universal eye (*samanta,cakkhu*), the omniscience of the buddhas (Nc 235; nos 1-2 are at It 52). On the Buddha’s omniscience, see **Kaṇṇaka-t,thala S** (M 90/2-:125-133) , SD 10.8 (2) & **Sandaka S** (M 76), SD 35.7.

passing the human, the Blessed One saw the venerable Mahā Moggallāna sitting and nodding in the village of Kallavāḷa,mutta in Magadha.

1.3 Then, just as a strong man would stretch his flexed arm or would flex his stretched arm, the Blessed One disappeared from the Deer Park in the Bhesakalā Forest at Surṃsumāra,giri in Bhaggā country and immediately appeared before the venerable Mahā Moggallāna sitting and nodding in the village of Kallavāḷa,mutta in Magadha.

The Blessed One sat down on the prepared seat.

## The 8 ways of overcoming drowsiness

1.4 Having sat down, the Blessed One said this to the venerable Mahā Moggallāna:

“Are you nodding, Moggallāna? Are you nodding, Moggallāna?”

“Yes, bhante.”

**2** (1) MENTAL NOTING. “In that case, Moggallāna, when you perceive that drowsiness is descending upon you, you should **make a mental note** of that perception; **[86]** frequently make that perception.<sup>57</sup>

It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.<sup>58</sup>

**3** (2) REFLECTION. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should think about, ponder over, **mentally attend to a teaching** that you have learned,<sup>59</sup> that you have mastered.

*It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.*

**4** (3) RECITATION. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should **recite in detail a teaching** that you have learned. It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.

**5** (4) MESSAGE. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should **rub both your ears** [in a circular manner with your palms] **and massage your limbs**.<sup>60</sup>

*It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.*

<sup>57</sup> “When you perceive ... of that perception,” PTS *yathā saññissa te viharato taṃ middham okkamati, taṃ saññāṃ manasākāsi taṃ saññāṃ bahulam akāsi*. Se *yathā saññissa te viharato taṃ middham okkamati, taṃ saññāṃ manasi,kareyyāsi, taṃ saññāṃ bahulam kareyyāsi*. But there are variants: Ce *yathā saññino te viharato taṃ middham okkamī ti taṃ saññāṃ mā manasikāsi taṃ saññāṃ mā bahulam akāsi*; Be *yathā saññissa te viharato taṃ middham okkamati, taṃ saññāṃ mā manasākāsi, taṃ saññāṃ mā bahulam-akāsi*. Bodhi, 1999: “At whatever thought drowsiness befalls you, you should not give attention to that thought.” (A:B). Ṭhānissaro, 2002: “Whatever perception you have in mind when drowsiness descends on you, don’t attend to that perception, don’t pursue it.”

<sup>58</sup> This method includes “labelling” it simply as “drowsy ... drowsy..” or “sleepy ... sleepy ...”. Or, smiling at the sleepiness, showing it lovingkindness, and then reverting to the meditation-object.

<sup>59</sup> “That you have learned,” *yathā,sutam*, lit “according to what you have heard.”

<sup>60</sup> “Rub both your ears ... massage your limbs,” *tato tvaṃ...ubho kaṇṇa,sotāni āvijeyyāsi pāṇinā gattāni anumajjeyyāsi*. I take *āvijeyyāsi* as pot 2<sup>nd</sup> sg of *āvijjhati*, to move in a circular motion (instead of *āvijjati*, to pull, to draw, to attract). See CPD: *āvijjhati*, etc. The word *anumajeyyasi*, “you should massage,” is pot 2<sup>nd</sup> sg of *anumajjati*, (a) to rub along, to stroke; (b) to beat, flog, pound (CPD). For the first phrase, the Thai tr has แต่ฉันขอเพียงยอนช่องหูทั้งสองข้าง, “then you should put your fingers into both ears.”

**6** (5) LOOK AROUND. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should rise, wash your eyes with some water, **look around yourself** [at the surrounding] **and look up at the stars and constellations**.

*It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.*

**7** (6) PERCEPTION OF LIGHT. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should practise **the perception of light**, determine the perception of daylight: just as day is, so is night; just as night is, so is day.<sup>61</sup> Thus through a mind that is open and unhindered, you should cultivate a mind of bright light.<sup>62</sup> It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.<sup>63</sup> **[87]**

**8** (7) WALKING MEDITATION.<sup>64</sup> If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, Moggallāna, you should, **perceiving before and after**, be resolute in walking back and forth,<sup>65</sup> *with the senses turned inward, with the mind not straying outward*.<sup>66</sup>

*It is possible that when you do so, that drowsiness would go away.*<sup>67</sup>

**9** (8) REST. If, Moggallāna, that drowsiness still would not go away, then, mindful and fully aware, you should lie down lion-like on your right side, placing foot on foot, keeping in mind the time for rising; and on awaking, Moggallāna, you would rise quickly, thinking, ‘I will dwell without indulging in the pleasure of sleep, or in the pleasure of reclining, or in the pleasure of drowsiness.’<sup>68</sup>

<sup>61</sup> Comy to **Iddhi,pāda Vibhaṅga S** (S 51.20,10/5:278), SD 28.14 on the perception of light (*āloka,saññā*), gives the foll instructions: “A monk [meditator] sits in an open space [*aṅgaṇa*] attending to the perception of light, now shutting his eyes, now opening his eyes. When, having opened his eyes, he closes them and, it appears just as if he sees (*olokentassa viya*), then the perception of light has arisen. It is also called ‘the perception of day’ (*divā,saññā*), and with its arising in the night, it is said to be well mastered.” (SA 3:260).

<sup>62</sup> *Iti vivaṭṭena* [v *vivaṭṭena*] *cetasā aparīyonaddhena sappabhāsam cittaṃ bhāveyyāsi*. Here, “**open and unhindered**” (*vivaṭṭena...aparīyonaddhena*) alludes to avoiding the first 2 of the “4 faults” (*catu,dosa*) in meditation, ie, against being “too slack” (*atīlīna*) or “too tense” (*atipaggahita*): see **Iddhi,pāda Vibhaṅga S** (S 51.20/5:276-281), SD 28.14. See §8n below on the last 2 of the 4 faults.

<sup>63</sup> As at **Samādhi Bhāvanā S** (A 4.41,3/2:45), SD 24.1, & **(Anussatiṭṭhāna) Udāyi S** (A 6.29/3:322-325), SD 24.8. See also **Thīna,middha**, SD 32.6 (3.2).

<sup>64</sup> This whole para: *No ce te evaṃ viharato taṃ middhaṃ pahīyetha, tato tvaṃ moggallāna pacchā,pure,saññī* [v *pacchā,pure tathā,saññī*] *caṅkamaṃ adhiṭṭhaheyyāsi anto,gatehi indriyehi abahigatena mānasena. Ṭhānaṃ kho paṇ’etaṃ vijjati, yaṃ te evaṃ viharato taṃ middhaṃ pahīyetha*.

<sup>65</sup> *Pacchā,pure saññī caṅkamaṃ adhiṭṭheyyāsi*. Here, “perceiving before and after,” *pacchā,pure saññī*, has a simple spatial meaning: be mindful of what is behind us, what is in front of us, and also refers to the exercise as a whole. The phrase *pacchā,pure* is also found in **Iddhi,pāda Vibhaṅga S** (S 51.20), where it simply refers to the whole practice, from beginning to end: S 51.20/5:277 f (SD 28.14). Hence, in our practice, both senses should be applied (albeit, noting that the latter meaning prevails: see foll n).

<sup>66</sup> *Anto,gatehi indriyehi abahi,gatena manasena*. “with senses turned inward” (*adhiṭṭheyyāsi ... anto,gatehi indriyehi*) is actually synonymous with the foll phrase, “with the mind not straying outwards” (*adhiṭṭheyyāsi ... abahi,gatena manasena*), to avoiding it from being “distracted externally” (*bahiddhā vikkhitta*). Comy explains “with the senses turn inward” as follows: “What is internal is not distracted with the external, with the pervasion of the 5 sense-faculties” (*anto,gatehi indriyehī bhi avikkhittehi anto anupaviṭṭheh’eva pañcahi indriyehi*, AA 4:41). On the 5 benefits of walking meditation, see **Caṅkamaṇa S** (A 5.29/3:29 f), SD 76.3.

<sup>67</sup> See Nyanadhammo, “Walking meditation in the Thai Forest Tradition,” 2003. Accessible at [http://www.forestsangha.org/Ajahn\\_Nyanadhammo\\_Walking\\_Meditation.pdf](http://www.forestsangha.org/Ajahn_Nyanadhammo_Walking_Meditation.pdf).

<sup>68</sup> “Mindful and fully aware ... or in the pleasure of reclining, or in the pleasure of drowsiness,” *tato tvaṃ moggallāna dakkhiṇena passena sīha,seyyaṃ kappeyyāsi pādena pādaṃ accādhāya sato sampajāno uṭṭhāna,saññāṃ manasikarivā, paṭibuddhena ca te moggallāna khippaṃ yeva paccuṭṭhāttabbaṃ ‘na seyya,dukhaṃ na passa,sukhaṃ na*

Thus, Moggallāna, you should train yourself.

## CONDITIONS CONDUCTIVE TO CONCENTRATION

### Humility

**10** Therefore, Moggallāna, you should train yourself, ‘**I shall not approach families [for alms] with my nose in the air.**’<sup>69</sup> Thus, Moggallāna, you should train yourself.

10.2 If, Moggallāna, a monk approaches a family with his nose in the air—and Moggallāna there are families that are busy with various kinds of business who do not think about a monk who has come—then such a monk might think, ‘Who I wonder has cut me off from this family. Now these people seem to be displeased with me.’<sup>70</sup>

10.3 Thus through not receiving [almsfood], he becomes discontented; being discontented, he becomes restless; being restless, he becomes unrestrained [in his senses]; being unrestrained, his mind will be far from attaining concentration.

### Non-confrontational speech

10.4 Therefore, Moggallāna, you should train yourself thus, ‘**I shall not speak in a confrontational manner.**’<sup>71</sup> Thus, Moggallāna, you should train yourself.

10.5 When there is confrontational talk, there would surely be wordiness; with wordiness, there is restlessness; with restlessness, there is lack of restraint [of the senses]; when there is lack of restraint, the mind is far from concentration.

### Suitable dwelling place

10.6 Moggallāna, neither do I praise all (worldly) engagements<sup>72</sup> nor do I, Moggallāna, **[88]** blame all (worldly) engagements either.

Moggallāna, I do not praise the association between householders and renunciants;

but as regards association with dwellings with few sounds, little noise, cooled by breezes, secluded from humans, suitable for solitude<sup>73</sup>—this I praise.”

---

*midḍha, sukhaṃ anuyutto viharissāmi ti.* ‘Reclining’ here is *passa*, lit “lying on the side.” On the significance of this passage, see SD 76.3 (1.2.2).

<sup>69</sup> “With my nose in the air,” *uccā, sonḍa*, lit “(of an elephant) with the trunk raised high,” ie with pride, arrogantly. This could be the origin of this common saying.

<sup>70</sup> “Now these people seem to be displeased with me,” *viratta, rūpā dānīme mayi manussā* (following Be).

<sup>71</sup> *Na viggāhika, kathaṃ kathessāmi*. On *viggāhika, kathā*, cf D 1:8; Sn 930; Nm 1:394 (which quotes this sutta). See also M 2:3; S 3:12.

<sup>72</sup> “(Worldly) engagements,” *saṃsagga*, also “association, contact.”

<sup>73</sup> This is stock: V 1:39; D 3:38; M 2:118, 3:13.

## THE REALIZATION OF INSIGHT

“Nothing is worth clinging to”

(The brief advice on liberation through the destruction of craving)<sup>74</sup>

11 When this was said, the venerable Mahā Moggallāna said this to the Blessed One:

“In what way, bhante, in brief, is a monk freed through the destruction of craving, one who has reached the utter end,<sup>75</sup> reached the total security from bondage, reached the highest in the holy life, reached the ultimate goal—the best of gods and humans?”<sup>76</sup>

11.2 <sup>77</sup>“Here, Moggallāna, the monk has learned [has heard]<sup>78</sup> that **nothing is worth clinging to** [all things are not worth adhering to].<sup>79</sup>

And, Moggallāna, when a monk has learned that *nothing is worth clinging to*, he directly knows<sup>80</sup> all things [he directly knows the nature of the all].<sup>81</sup>

Having directly known the nature of all things, he fully understands<sup>82</sup> all things.

11.3 Having fully understood all things,  
he fully understands whatever **feelings** there are,  
whether pleasant, painful or neither painful nor pleasant.

<sup>74</sup> This whole section is at **Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S** (M 37,2-3/1:251), SD 54.8, whose events are clearly set after those of the Pacalā S since the Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S records the awakened Moggallāna as using his psychic powers to visit Sakra in his heaven. §§11.1+2 are found in **Avijjā Pahāna S 2** (A 35.80,6/4:88,11-15) + SD 16.9 (2.6). Their ensuing passages, however, are different. See (5).

<sup>75</sup> “Who has reached utter end,” **accanta,niṭṭha** (mfn): *accanta* (Skt *atyanta*) = *ati* + *anta*, “reached the end or limit” of absolute perfection; *niṭṭha* (Ved *niṣṭhā, niḥṣṭhā*) = *nis* + *ṭhā* (from *-ṭhā*, “end, conclusion, perfection, height, summit, object, goal”), as in *niṭṭham gata* = *niṭṭhaṅ gata*, “who has attained the goal, perfection” (= *pabbajitānaṃ arahattam patta*), S 3:99 (a-); A 2:175, 3:450, 5:119 f; Dh 351; Pm 1:81, 161; DhA 4:70.

<sup>76</sup> *Kittāvatā nu kho bhante bhikkhu saṅkhittena taṇhā,saṅkhaya,vimutto hoti accanta,niṭṭho accanta,yoga-k,khemī accanta,brahma.cārī accanta,pariyosāno seṭṭho deva,manussānan’ti*. The underlined phrase: *accanta,niṭṭho ... accanta,pariyosāno*, M 1:251,18; A 1:291,25, 4:88,9, 5:326,26 also pl ~ā, etc, D 2:283,1; S 3:13,7 (VA 2:401,3; DA 2:449,3; SA 2:319,12; AA 3:432,19); also epithet to *nibbāna*: M 3:4,24. In **Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S** (M 37,15), SD 54.8, Sakra, the leader of the gods, on the instigation of Moggallāna, asks the same question and the Buddha’s answer is identical to the passage here. It is possible that this passage originally belongs to Cūḷa Taṇhā,saṅkhaya S, but is added here by the Aṅguttara reciters for a more complete Sutta. Requests for brief instructions are found elsewhere in the Canon, eg V 1:39 (Sāriputta to Assaji); S 22.1/3:1-5 (Nakula,pitā to the Buddha).

<sup>77</sup> This passage [11.2] recurs in **Avijjā Pahāna S 2** (A 35.80), SD 16.9. The ensuing passages, however, are different [4].

<sup>78</sup> “Has learned,” *suta*, lit, “has heard.”

<sup>79</sup> *Idha moggallāna bhikkhuno sutam hoti: sabbe dhammā nālaṃ abhinivesāyāti*. “Nothing is worth clinging to,” *sabbe dhammā nālaṃ abhinivesāyā*, lit “all things are not worthy of adhering to.” See (5.3) above.

<sup>80</sup> “He directly knows,” *abhiñānāti*, here meaning to know for oneself by insight, ie through higher self-knowledge or *abhiññā*. Traditionally, there are **6 superknowledges** (*abhiññā*): (1) psychic powers (*iddhi,vidhā*), (2) the “divine ear” or clairaudience (*dibba,sota*), (3) mind-reading, ie the ability to read the thoughts of others (*parassa ceto,pariya,ñāṇa*), (4) the recollection of one’s own past lives (*pubbe,nivāsānussati*), (5) the “divine eye” (*dibba,cakkhu*), ie the knowledge of the passing away and arising of beings, faring according to their karma, and (6) the destruction of mental influxes (*āsava-k,khaya*), ie arhathood. Nos 4-6 are known as “the 3 knowledges (*te,vijjā*) (D 3:281; A 3:280). Comy says that the knowledge here refers to “full understanding of the known” (*ñāta,pariññā*) (A 4:43): see foll n.

<sup>81</sup> “He directly knows all things,” *so sabbam dhammam abhiñānāti*, alt tr, “he directly knows the nature of the all.” Here the “all” (*sabba*) refers to the 6 senses and their respective sense-objects (**Sabba S**, S 35.23/4:15 @ SD 7.1).

<sup>82</sup> “He fully understands,” *parijānāti*: see (6.1), (11.2) n.

11.4 As regards to those feelings,  
 he dwells contemplating impermanence in them.  
 He dwells contemplating dispassion [fading away of lust] in them.  
 He dwells contemplating ending [of suffering] in them'  
 He dwells contemplating letting go [of defilements].<sup>83</sup>

11.5 When he dwells contemplating impermanence in them—  
 contemplating *dispassion* [fading away of lust] in them,  
 contemplating *ending* [of suffering] in them;  
 contemplating *letting go* [of defilements]<sup>84</sup>—

he does not cling to anything in the world.

Not clinging, he is not agitated;  
 being not agitated, he attains nirvana for himself.<sup>85</sup>

11.6 He understands,  
 'Birth is destroyed, the holy life has been lived, done what is to be done, there is no more for this  
 state of being.'<sup>86</sup>

11.7 This, Moggallāna, is, in brief, how a monk is freed through the destruction of craving, that is,  
 one who has reached the utter end, *accanta,niṭṭhā*  
 reached the total security from bondage, *accanta,yoga-k.khemī*  
 reached the highest in the holy life, *accanta,brahma.cārī*  
 reached the ultimate goal— *accanta,pariyosāna*  
 the best of gods and humans."<sup>87</sup> *setṭho,deva.manussanaṃ*

— evaṃ —

040817 rev061023 071208 081228 091202r 100527 111031 121231 131015 141028 150930 160806 170823  
 180525 190208 210826 211101 240412.2

<sup>83</sup> The monk effects the abandoning of the mental hindrances by the contemplations on impermanence (*aniccānupassanā*), fading away (of lust) (*viragānupassanā*), cessation (of suffering) (*nirodhānupassanā*) and of letting go (of defilements) (*paṇinissaggānupassanā*), and thus comes to look upon feelings (all experiences) with equanimity.

<sup>84</sup> The monk effects the abandoning of the mental hindrances by the contemplations of impermanence (*aniccānupassanā*), fading away (of lust) (*viragānupassanā*), cessation (of suffering) (*nirodhānupassanā*) and of letting go (of defilements) (*paṇinissaggānupassanā*), and thus comes to look upon feelings (all experiences) with equanimity.

<sup>85</sup> *Anupādiyaṃ na paritassati, aparitassaṃ paccattañ,ñeva parinibbāyati. On paccattaṃ yeva parinibbāyati, cf Cūḷa Taṇhā.saṅkhaya S* (M 37,3/1:251 f, by fully understanding “the all, *sabba*”), SD 54.8; *Pacālā S* (A 7.58/4:88, by contemplating “nothing is worth clinging to”), SD 4.11. Comy says that he brings himself to nirvana (ie by his own efforts) by the utter extinction of defilements (*sayam eva kilesa,parinibbānena parinibbāyati*, MA 2:18, 299).

<sup>86</sup> This para describing the arhat is stock: V 1:14; D 1:84; M 2:39; S 2:82.

<sup>87</sup> As a result of this teaching, Moggallāna is fully freed as an arhat (AA 4:44,23). On this passage’s significance, see **Entering the stream**, SD 3.3 (1.5).