

# 18

## Pahārāda Sutta

The Discourse to Pahārāda | A 8.19

Theme: The 8 wonderful qualities of the Dharma-Vinaya

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

### 1 Introduction

#### 1.1 SUTTA SUMMARY

**1.1.1 The Pahārāda Sutta** (A 8.19) is a dialogue between the Buddha and the asura chief, Pahārāda, who mention the 8 qualities of the great ocean [§§1-9] to the Buddha. Pahārāda says that the asuras delight (abhiramati) in the great ocean for these 8 reasons. He then asks the Buddha if the monks delight in the Dharma-Vinaya [§9.4-5].

The Buddha replies that the monks delight in the Dharma-Vinaya for 8 reasons, too, elaborating on the same into 8 parables, but elevating them to a spiritual level [§§10-18].

**1.1.2 The Pahārāda Sutta** (A 8.19) only has the teachings on the 8 qualities of the great ocean mentioned by the asura chief Pahārāda, and the Buddha's teaching on the 8 qualities of the Dharma-Vinaya. Due to its brevity, it is likely to be the oldest sutta amongst the 4 "Uposatha Suttas" [1.2].

It is likely that both **the (Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta** (A 8.20) and **the (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta** (U 5.5), and the Vinaya's **Pātimokkha Thapana Khandhaka** (Cv 9.1-2) drew the 3 sets of parables from the Pahārāda Sutta, and made the various additions reflecting the occasion each was taught [1.2].

**1.1.3 The Pahārāda Sutta** (A 8.19) has 2 Chinese parallels. The 1<sup>st</sup> parallel is called 阿修羅經 *ā xiū luó jīng* the Asura Sūtra (MĀ 35).<sup>1</sup> The 2<sup>nd</sup> Chinese parallel, 波呵羅阿須倫 *bō hē luó ā xiū lún* found in the Ekōttara Āgama (EĀ 42.4).<sup>2</sup>

#### 1.2 A FAMILY OF TEXTS ON THE 8 GREAT OCEAN PARABLES

An overview of the relative contents of these 4 texts can be seen here:

		<u>Conclave</u>	<u>False monk</u>	<u>Institution</u>	<u>Parables</u>	<u>Verse</u>	<u>Suspension</u>
<b>Pahārāda Sutta</b>	(A 8.19)			§§1-18			
<b>(Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta</b>	(A 8.20)	§§1-3	§§4-5	§6	§§7-9		
<b>(Samudda) Uposatha Sutta</b>	(U 5.5)	§§1-3	§§4-5	§6	§§7-8	§§9-10	
<b>Pātimokkha Thapana Kh</b>	(Cv 9.1-2)	§§1-3	§§4-5		§§7-9	§§10-11	§12

**Table 1.2** Comparative table of suttas on the 8 great ocean parables

**1.2.1 The Pahārāda Sutta** (A 8.19), using 8 parables, compares the Dharma-Vinaya—the teaching and discipline of the Buddha—to 8 wonderful qualities of the great ocean. These qualities form a well known

<sup>1</sup> 阿修羅經 MĀ 35 (T1.26.475c16); 須倫 K648 (\*35);

<sup>2</sup> 須倫 EĀ 42.4 (T2.125.752c24); K649 (42.4).

set of 8 parables in three other texts, too, that is, **the (Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta 1** (A 8.20)<sup>3</sup> **the (Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta 2** (U 5.5)<sup>4</sup> and **the Pātimokkha Ṭhapana Khandhaka** (Cula,vagga 9 of the Vinaya).<sup>5</sup> [2.0]

**1.2.2 The Pahārāda Sutta** (A 8.19) is a conversation between the Buddha and Pahārāda, the asura leader, and it is the shortest, and clearly the oldest of the 4 texts, as it is a straightforward text on Dharma-Vinaya.<sup>6</sup> Like the other 3 texts, it, too, has the sets of 8 characteristics and 8 parables of the great ocean. The first set is here introduced by Pahārāda, and the second, given the Buddha, applies the nature of the Dharma-Vinaya. (SD 45.18)

Both U 5.5 and Cv 9 close with a verse of uplift (*udāna*), identical to a verse from **the Sirimaṇḍa Thera,gāthā** (Tha 447). This verse, however, is found in neither A 8.19 nor A 8.20.

**1.2.3 The (Aṭṭhaka) Uposatha Sutta 1** (A 8.20) opens with an incident concerning the recital of the Pātimokkha after which the Buddha alone simply lists the two sets of 8 parables, omitting the closing verse. This version seems to be a rehash of the Pahārāda Sutta, but with the Buddha giving both the 8 qualities and the 8 parables, for instructing the monks. Both also do not have **Tha 477** as udāna (as in U 5.5 and the Cv text) [1.2.2]. Of the two suttas here, A 8.20 is very likely to be the later. (SD 59.2a)

**1.2.4 The (Samudda) Uposatha Sutta** (U 5.5)—the Udāna version—is identical with A 8.20, except that U 5.5 has the closing udāna (Tha 477). Since it is longer, and with an udāna appended, it is likely to be even younger than A 8.20. While sutta compilers are more likely to have expanded on available texts, it is very unlikely that they would have lopped off sections of texts. (SD 59.2b)

**1.2.5** The Vinaya version—**the Pātimokkha Ṭhapana Khandhaka**—closely parallels U 5.5, along with its udāna (Tha 477), except that certain words are transposed to the end of the passage. The Udāna version is slightly more detailed. These two texts probably evolved separately based on A 8.19 or another urtext, but the Vinaya version is probably the youngest of them.

So we have only A 8.19 dealing only with the Dharma-Vinaya, while the other three texts, all dealing with the institutionalization of the Pātimokkha recital. Origin stories behind the Vinaya rules often tend to be late accounts, compiled after the Buddha’s passing, when there was an urgent need to authenticate the monastic rules. Hence, of these four texts, the Vinaya version is probably the youngest.

### 1.3 THE DHARMA-VINAYA

**1.3.1** Throughout the Sutta, the Buddha’s teaching is referred to the “Dharma-Vinaya” (*dhamma,vinaya*), that is, the doctrine and the discipline. **The “doctrine”** (*dhamma*) refers to the teachings of the Buddha and his immediate disciples as preserved in the suttas and the Vinaya. **The “discipline”** (*vinaya*) specifically deals with the monastic rules and way of life. Teachings on lay discipline are included in the suttas themselves.<sup>7</sup>

**1.3.2** *Dhamma,vinaya* is the earliest term used by the suttas to refer to the Buddha’s teachings whether as oral transmission or as textual tradition. Today, we know the Dharma as represented by the texts of

<sup>3</sup> A 8.20/4:204-208 (SD 59.2a).

<sup>4</sup> U 5.5/53,6-56,31 (SD 59.2b).

<sup>5</sup> Cv 9.1.2-4 @ V 2:237-240 (SD 59.2c).

<sup>6</sup> E Frauwallner is of the same opinion: *The Earliest Vinaya and the Beginnings of Buddhist Literature*, Rome, 1956: 147 f.

<sup>7</sup> On these lay teachings, see esp **Sigāl’ovāda S** (D 31), SD 4.1.

the Sutta Piṭaka, and the Vinaya as the records of the Vinaya Piṭaka. Even then, these two Piṭakas or “baskets” of teachings, as we have them, were compiled at least a couple of centuries after the Buddha, probably by Asoka’s time (3<sup>rd</sup> century BCE), by which time the early texts were “closed” and called the Ti-piṭaka, “the 3 baskets.”

**1.3.3** The 3<sup>rd</sup> “basket” is the Abhidhamma Piṭaka, a collection of texts of the Abhidhamma tradition, composed probably, at the earliest, around 200 BCE and 200 CE.<sup>8</sup> Where the term *abhidhamma* does appear in the suttas or Vinaya, it has no technical sense (certainly not the Abhidhamma as text), but simply meaning “concerning the Dharma.”<sup>9</sup>

**1.3.4** The Abhidhamma Piṭaka, in short, is a collection of texts that mostly reflect the sectarian aspect of Theravāda, with its own post-Buddha philosophy and metaphysics, like the other pre-Mahāyāna Indian schools.<sup>10</sup> However, such texts can still be useful to students of early Buddhism and those interested in meditation, where they keep to sutta teachings and explicate them for us without contradicting the early teachings.

## 2 The 8 wonderful qualities of the Dharma-Vinaya

**2.0** As already noted, the teaching on the two sets of the 8 qualities of the Dharma, vinaya and the 8 similes of the parable of the great ocean are given in at least 4 important texts [Table 1.2]. Each of these 4 texts contains *the set of 8 qualities* and their application as parables to the wonderful nature of the Dharma-Vinaya. While only the Pahārāda Sutta (A 8.19) deals with the qualities of the Dharma itself, the other 3 texts highlight the importance of the Vinaya, especially the recital of the Pātimokkha [1.2].

Here’s a summary of the 8 parables of the Pahārāda Sutta:

- |  |      |
|--|------|
| (1) The great ocean deepens gradually  | [§2] |
| (2) The great ocean does not overflow its margins                              | [§3] |
| (3) The great ocean rejects dead bodies  | [§4] |
| (4) The 5 rivers merge into the great ocean losing their names                 | [§5] |
| (5) Despite the inflows by rivers and rains, the great ocean’s water is stable | [§6] |
| (6) The great ocean has only one taste, the taste of salt                      | [§7] |
| (7) The great ocean contains various kinds of treasures                        | [§8] |
| (8) The great ocean contains gargantuan beings                                 | [§9] |

### **2.1 THE GRADUAL TRAINING [§11]**

**2.1.1** The 1<sup>st</sup> of the 8 parables and its application is given thus:

Pahārāda, just as the great ocean *slopes gradually, slides gradually, inclines gradually, not abruptly*<sup>11</sup> like a precipice,

<sup>8</sup> See **Dhamma & Abhidhamma**, SD 26.1

<sup>9</sup> Eg V 1:64 = 181; M 1:472, 2:239; A 1:289, 5:24. See I B Horner, “*Abhidhamma abhivinaya* in the first 2 Piṭakas of the Pali Canon,” *Indian Historical Quarterly* 17,3 Sep 1941:291-310,

<sup>10</sup> Of the non-Pali Abhidharma traditions, only that of the Sarvāstivāda is extant. On **Abhidharma schools**, see *Ency of Buddhism* (ed Keown & Prebish), 2007:3-6. See K R Norman, *Pali Literature*, Wiesbaden, 1983:107 (§4.8); Analayo, *The Dawn of Abhidhamma*, Hamburg, 2014: 86-89 (§2.4). On *abhidhamma*, see Princeton Dictionary of Buddhism: abhidharma.

<sup>11</sup> “Not abruptly,” *na āyatakena*: see §2.1 ad loc n.

so, too, Pahārāda, in this Dharma-Vinaya, the training is gradual, the task is gradual, the way is gradual—there is no sudden penetration of final knowledge.<sup>12</sup> [§11.1-2]

### 2.1.2 The great ocean’s gradual deepening

The ancient Indians thought that the great ocean (*mahā samudda*) surrounded all the 4 ancient continents of which India was one.<sup>13</sup> The suttas and ancient texts often refer to ancient India as Jambudīpa, “the jambul continent,”<sup>14</sup> that is, as a continent by itself.<sup>15</sup> In other words, it is surrounded by deepening “waters on both sides” (*dvīpa*), or we might say “all around.”

The Commentary explains that the great ocean does not drop off suddenly like a precipice or deep pit. Beginning from the shore, it grows deeper by a finger,<sup>16</sup> two fingers, a span, a cubit, a pole, a chain, a quarter league,<sup>17</sup> a half league, a league and so on, until it is 84,000 leagues deep at the submarine base of Mt Sineru.<sup>18</sup>

### 2.1.3 The progress of the path

**2.1.3.1** The phrase, “the training is gradual, the task is gradual, the way is gradual,”<sup>19</sup> clearly refers to the 3 trainings (*ti, sikkha*) (AA 4:111)<sup>20</sup> as being gradual (*anupubba*), which is reiterated in many suttas.<sup>21</sup> The Commentary, however, explains that only “training” (*sikkhā*) here refers specifically to the 3 trainings (*ti, sikkhā*) (UA 4:303).

**2.1.3.2** By “task” (*kiriya*) here, says the Commentary (AA 4:111), is meant the 13 ascetic practices (*dhutaṅga*).<sup>22</sup> And the “way” (*paṭipadā*) is interpreted by the Commentary in an Abhidhamma sense, as comprising:

- |  |  |                  |
|--|--|------------------|
| • the 7 contemplations                           | <i>sattānupassanā</i>                                    | Vism 20.4/607    |
| • the 18 great insights                          | <i>aṭṭhā, rasa mahā, vipassanā</i>                       | Vism 20.90/628 f |
| • an analysis of the 38 objects of consciousness | <i>aṭṭha, tiṁsa ārammaṇa, vibhatti</i> <sup>23</sup>     |                  |
| • the 37 limbs of awakening                      | <i>satta, tiṁsa bodha, pakkiya, dhammā</i> <sup>24</sup> | [2.7]            |

<sup>12</sup> *Anupubba, sikkhā anupubba, kiriya anupubba, paṭipadā na āyatakeneva aññā, paṭivedho*. See [2.1.3.4].

<sup>13</sup> See PvA:BM 147 n132.

<sup>14</sup> The jambul is the black plum of India: see **Kosala S 1** (A 10.29/5:59-65) @ SD 16.15 (3).

<sup>15</sup> On ancient India as an island, see **Kosala S 1** (A 10.29), SD 16.15 (3).

<sup>16</sup> For details of this measurement and those that follow, see UA 246 (UA:M 609).

<sup>17</sup> A “league” or *yojana* is the yoke of an Indian plough (J 6:38, 42). As a distance, a “league” is as far as can be covered by a yoke of oxen, ie, about 11.25 km or 7 mi (DhA 1:108, 2:13). The archaic measurement units are not exact units here, but merely suggestive of the Indian distances.

<sup>18</sup> *So hi tīrato paṭṭhāya ek’aṅgula, dv’aṅgula, vidatthi, ratana, yaṭṭhi, usabha, aḍḍha. gāvuta, gāvuta, aḍḍha, yojan’-ādi, vasena gambhīro hutvā gacchanto sineru, pāda. mūle catur’āsītiyojana, sahassa, gambhīro hutvā ṭhito’ti dasseti* (AA 4:107).

<sup>19</sup> *Anupubba, sikkhā anupubba, kiriya anupubba, paṭipadā na āyatakeneva aññā, paṭivedho*.

<sup>20</sup> Eg A 1:234. On the 3 trainings, see **Sīla samādhi pañña**, SD 21.6.

<sup>21</sup> This central characteristic of early Buddhism is reiterated in **Kiṭṭā, giri S** (M 70, 22/1:79), SD 11.1; **Gaṇaka Mogallāna S** (M 107, 2/3:1), SD 56.3; **Pahārāda S** (A 8.19, 11.2/4:201), SD 45.18; **(Aṭṭha, dhamma) Uposatha S** (U 5.5/54, 29), SD 59.2.

<sup>22</sup> Vism 2/59-83: see SD 3.15 (2).

<sup>23</sup> MA 1:195, earth kasiṇa, etc, ItA 2:24; VA 491; AA 4:57; 29 at Miln 332; listed at Vism 110 f, minus light and space kasiṇas: DhA:PR 210 n2; for analysis, see Abhs:BRS IX §§6-12.

<sup>24</sup> Vism 22.32-43/678-681; UA 129.

**2.1.3.3** The commentarial analysis is clearly technical, reflecting a time when the suttas were analyzed “academically.” More simply (keeping to sutta teachings), we can say that “**training**” here refers to the 3 trainings in theory (learning them); “**task**” is the actual practice; and “**way**” is the various stages of realization (sainthood).

**2.1.3.4** The Commentary, however, is clear that there is no penetrating into arhathood all at once (*ādito va*) like a frog’s hopping, without first duly (*paṭipāṭiyā*) fulfilling moral virtue, mental concentration and wisdom (AA 4:111).<sup>25</sup>

This parable is found in **the Kathā,vatthu**, which says that it was quoted by the Sarvāstī,vāda and related schools<sup>26</sup> in support of the notion of gradual penetration (*anupubbābhisamaya*)<sup>27</sup> of 16 moments of insight into the 4 noble truths. This gradual unfolding of realization was rejected by the Theravādā school (of the Abhidhamma tradition) and strongly criticized by Harivarman’s Tattva,siddhi, both of which advocated the theory of instantaneous realization (*eka-k,khaṇābhisamaya*).<sup>28</sup>

## 2.2 THE DISCIPLE’S STABILITY [§12]

**2.2.1** The 2<sup>nd</sup> of the 8 parables and its application is given thus:

Pahārāda, just as the great ocean *is by nature stable: it does not overflow its margins*,  
so, too, Pahārāda, I have prescribed training-rules for my disciples [listeners],<sup>29</sup> which they  
would not transgress even for life’s sake.<sup>30</sup> [§12.1-2]

**2.2.2** While the 1<sup>st</sup> parable—that of the progressively deepening ocean—refers to the gradual progress of the 3 trainings [2.1.3.1], this parable illustrates the first training, that of moral virtue. In this connection, the Buddha declares that he has introduced monastic rules and Dharma guidelines so that the monastics are well restrained in their physical senses and speech, so that their minds are well guided towards mental cultivation.

These rules at first induce monastics to let go of lay habits and memories. Then, they induct them to conduct themselves as true monastics by correcting their wrong behaviour, so that their senses and speech are restrained. Such a sense-restraint prepares them for mental cultivation, so that they gain the liberating wisdom and awaken to nirvana.

**2.2.3** Traditionally, the early disciples are called “listeners” (*sāvaka*; sg *sāvaka*) because they mindfully and wisely listen to the Dharma. Then, reflecting on this, their understanding of true reality grows until they are free of ignorance and craving. The Commentaries explain the term **sāvaka** in the following ways:

“They all *listen* to his word, hence they are ‘**listeners**’ (*sāvaka*). Others listen as they like, but do not do what needs to be done. But these (disciples), having *heard*, and having practised the Dharma in ac-

<sup>25</sup> See Kīṭā,giri S (M 70,22/1:479), SD 11.1.

<sup>26</sup> The other schools are the Andhaka, the Sammitiya and Bhadra,yānika.

<sup>27</sup> Skt *anupūrvābhisamaya*. Kvu 2.9.17/219.

<sup>28</sup> Skt *eka,kṣanābhisamaya*. For details, see *The Princeton Dictionary of Buddhism*, 2014:10 sv abhisamaya. On the nature of mind-moments, see SD 33.6 (2.4). On the controversial theory of moments, see **Matter and moments**, SD 17.2b esp (3).

<sup>29</sup> Comy: Said of the aryas or saints, ie, the streamwinners, etc (UA 303).

<sup>30</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda yaṃ mayā sāvakānaṃ sikkhā,padaṃ paññattaṃ, taṃ mama sāvaka jīvita,hetu’pi nātikkamanti.*

cordance with the Dharma, attain the paths and the fruits; therefore, they are called ‘listeners’.” (KhpA 183 = SnA 1:278)<sup>31</sup>

“They are **the well-farer’s disciples** because they *hear* the Dharma; because they are born in the noble birth upon hearing the Dharma of the fully self-awakened one, they are ‘listeners’.”<sup>32</sup> (VvA 195). The Commentary here uses *sāvaka* in a broad sense to encompass both those not yet saints as well as the saints.

However, in the suttas, the term *sāvaka*, refers only to those who have actually attained sainthood, that is, are at least streamwinners. Such is the meaning, for example, of the expression, “the community of disciples [listeners]” *sāvaka,saṅgha*.<sup>33</sup>

## 2.3 REJECTING SPIRITUAL DEATH [§13]

**2.3.1** The 3<sup>rd</sup> of the 8 parables and its application is given thus:

Pahārāda, just as *the great ocean does not associate with the dead, a carcass: whatever that is dead, a carcass, the great ocean would quickly carry it to shore, wash it onto the land*<sup>34</sup>—

so, too, Pahārāda, the sangha does not associate with a person who is immoral, of bad character, of impure and suspicious conduct, secretive in deeds, not a recluse but pretending to be one, incelibate but pretending to be celibate,<sup>35</sup> rotten to the core, lustful and filthy by nature<sup>36</sup>—

the sangha communes<sup>37</sup> not with such a one, but having quickly assembled, it expels him.<sup>38</sup>

Even though he sits in the midst of the sangha, yet he is far away from the sangha, and the sangha is far away from him.<sup>39</sup> [§13.1-2]

### 2.3.2 Purpose of monasticism

**2.3.2.1** The 3<sup>rd</sup> parable—that *the great ocean casts out its dead ashore*—is a beautiful reminder of the spiritually robust monastic sangha true to its nature and purpose. The monastic community provides the ideal conditions for self-nurturing of bodily health and discipline, the expressing of right speech, the cultivating of the mind, all of which brings us to awakening and nirvana.

<sup>31</sup> *Sabbe’pi te vacanaṃ suṇantīti sāvakā. Kāmañ ca aññe’pi suṇanti, na pana sutvā kattabba,kiccaṃ karonti, ime pana sutvā kattabbaṃ dhammānudhamma-p,paṭipattim katvā magga,phalāni pattā, tasmā sāvakāti vuccanti* (KhpA 183 = SnA 1:278).

<sup>32</sup> *Sugatassa sāvakāti sammā,sambuddhassa dhamma,savanante ariyāya jātiyā jātātāya taṃ dhammaṃ suṇantīti sāvakā* (VvA 195).

<sup>33</sup> See SD 15.10a (1.0.2).

<sup>34</sup> Alluded to at Miln 1:188, 2:250.

<sup>35</sup> Or, “Not living the holy life (*brahma,cariya*), but pretending to do so.”

<sup>36</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda yo so puggalo dussīlo pāpa,dhammo asuci,saṅka-s,sara,samācāro paṭicchanna,kamanto assamaṇo samaṇa,paṭiñño abrahmacārī brahmacārī,paṭiñño anto,pūti avassuto kasambu,jāto.* §13.2 up to here recurs in **Aggi-k,khandhūpama S** (A 7.68/4:134), SD 89.12: [2.3.4].

<sup>37</sup> “Communes” or “to be in communion” (*saṃvasati*). Technically (according to Vinaya), he is not part of the monastic community: *saṃvāsa* def at V 4:315; *saṃvasati* def at V 4:138, 214. See also Pāc 69 (V 4:137): [2.3.5].

<sup>38</sup> *Na tena saṅgho saṃvasati, khippam eva naṃ sannipatitvā ukkhipati.* The vb **ukkkhipati** can also mean “to suspend” (V 2:61, 4:309; Pug 33).

<sup>39</sup> *Kiñcāpi so hoti majjhe bhikkhu,saṅghassa sannisinno, atha kho so ārakā’va saṅghamhā saṅgho ca tena.* Cf **Saṅghāṭi,kaṇṇā S** (It 92,2/91), SD 24.10a.

**2.3.2.2** Members of the monastic sangha are, by definition, celibate—they have vowed not to indulge in any kind of sexuality, that is, the enjoying of the bodily pleasures, whether for procreation and for itself. Not procreating is a choice a renunciant makes, so as not to bring any beings into a world of suffering.<sup>40</sup> Abstaining from sex is again a natural choice (not because sex is “bad” or “evil”) because we have tasted the supreme bliss of dhyanic joy, a mental bliss that transcends even the best of bodily pleasures.<sup>41</sup>

### **2.3.3 False monastics**

**2.3.3.1** Becoming a monastic is a personal and sacred pledge before a spiritual community that we vow to keep to its rules and training, and work for the goal of awakening in this life itself. A vital part of a monastic’s mental training is the abandoning of wrong views and cultivating right views, which are to help him in his meditation and, if he is inclined to, in teaching the Dharma to others, when it is proper to do so. Through his meditation, he learns to gradually let go of all views, even the right ones, so that he would experience true reality directly, and with it, a profound bliss that empowers him to journey closer to awakening.

**2.3.3.2** A monastic who reneges on his vows or tries to “modernize” the unique and specialized tools for attaining the unconditioned, as such, is one who goes back on his own word. This is not only wrong speech, but is also wrong practice. When such a monastic stays on, putting up a false front of what he neither believes nor practises, he is said to be a “thief” (*cora*), since he acts stealthily.<sup>42</sup>

The Commentaries say that a false monk eats the country’s alms as a *thief*, while a good monk, who eats without reflecting on it, is a *debtor*. A saint on the path takes his almsfood as an *heir*, while an arhat is the *owner* of his almsfood.<sup>43</sup>

**2.3.3.3** In the **Mahā Taṇhā,saṅkhaya Sutta** (M 38), the monk Sāti, who holds a serious wrong view—that “the same” consciousness is reborn when we die (but the reality is that this is all conditioned)—is said to be a “thief.”<sup>44</sup> A wrong view about livelihood or the Pātimokkha, declares the Buddha in the **Sāmagāma Sutta** (M 104), is trifling, but when the sangha dispute over the path or way (the eightfold path and other basic teachings) [2.7.2.2], it would have dire and widespread consequences.<sup>45</sup>

**2.3.3.4** In the **Alagaddūpama Sutta** (M 22), the monk Ariṭṭha holds the wrong view that, since laymen who enjoy sensual pleasure are capable of awakening, as such, *sexuality* is no stumbling block to the holy life of a monastic, too!<sup>46</sup> [2.3.3]. Ariṭṭha, too, has become a thief in the teaching when he refuses to give up his wrong view as a monk.

Merely harbouring a wrong view is a mental hindrance to meditation and spiritual growth, but which can be corrected with proper instruction, study and reflection. However, stubbornly holding on to such

---

<sup>40</sup> This is in no way an “ideal” approach to spirituality, but a choice we have made. On the other hand, if we are not inclined to a monastic or celibate life, we can live a layperson’s life of “enjoying sense-pleasures” (*kāma, bhogī*), moderated by the 5 precepts: see **Mahā Vaccha, gotta S** (M 73, 10/1:491), SD 27.4. With the habitual practice of the perception of impermanence, we are still able to attain at least streamwinning in this life itself: see **(Anicca) Cakkhu S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7; see also **Emotional independence**, SD 40a.8. On laymen arhats, see SD 8.6 (15.2.6).

<sup>41</sup> See **Dhyana**, SD 8.4.

<sup>42</sup> See Susīma’s confession: **Arahatta Susīma S** (S 12.70,58), SD 16.8.

<sup>43</sup> MA 5:32; SA 2:199; cf SA 1:100 thieves are those who cause ruin in the world. See SD 49.2 (1.1.3).

<sup>44</sup> M 38 @ SD 7.10

<sup>45</sup> M 104,5/2:245 @ SD 62.4.

<sup>46</sup> M 22 (SD 3.13).

views, and refusing to review or revise them will not only hinder our spiritual progress, but when made public, it also reveals us to be false individuals, falsely living of society's alms and support.<sup>47</sup>

**2.3.3.5 The Samaṇa Gadrabha Sutta** (A 3.81) records this delightfully instructive remark by the Buddha on a false monastic:

Suppose, bhikshus, an ass follows closely behind a herd of cows, thinking, "I'm one, too! I'm one, too!"

But his colour is not like that of the cows, nor is his sound like that of the cows, nor are his hoofs like those of the cows.

He merely follows closely behind a herd of cows, thinking, "I'm one, too! I'm one, too!"

Even so, bhikshus, here, a certain monk follows closely behind a community of monks, thinking, "I'm a monk, too! I'm a monk, too!"

But he has no keen desire to undertake the training in higher moral virtue, like some other monks.

But he has no keen desire to undertake the training in higher mind, like some other monks.

But he has no keen desire to undertake the training in higher wisdom, like some other monks.

He merely follows closely behind a community of monks, thinking, "I'm a monk, too! I'm a monk, too!"

(A 3.81,2), SD 24.10b

**2.3.3.6** In modern terms, the monk's wrong attitude towards the sangha [2.3.3.5] may be said to be a kind of "**imprinting**," a term used in psychology and ethology (a branch of zoology that studies animal behaviour) to describe "any kind of phase-sensitive learning, that is, learning occurring at a particular age or a particular life stage, that is rapid and apparently independent of the consequences of behavior."<sup>48</sup>

It was first used to describe situations in which a person or an animal learns the characteristics of some stimulus, which is therefore said to be "imprinted" onto the subject. In other words, such a person sees the monastic life as a secure, even comfortable, livelihood, but fails to understand or appreciate its true nature and purpose [2.3.2].

Such a religious imprinting is very common today in the urbanized Buddhist priesthood, where the priests and priestesses are "career religious," earning a living by preaching and preserving a Buddhist "religious materialism" of rituals, riches and sham. Such priests only dress as monastics, but otherwise work for money, enjoy sense-pleasures, accumulate worldly assets and effectively live just like any other lay worldly person, except that they are much wealthier and live more luxuriously, and do not have to pay income tax.

### **2.3.4 Religious truancy**

**2.3.4.1** The following passage from the Pahārāda Sutta recurs in **Aggi-k,khandhûpama Sutta** (A 7.68):

a person who is immoral, of bad character, of impure and suspicious conduct, secretive in deeds, not a recluse but pretending to be one, incelibate but pretending to be celibate,<sup>49</sup> rotten to the core, lustful and filthy by nature.<sup>50</sup> [§13.2]

<sup>47</sup> This aspect of the holy life is said to be monastic "right livelihood": see SD 37.8 (1.6).

<sup>48</sup> [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Imprinting\\_\(psychology\)](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Imprinting_(psychology)).

<sup>49</sup> Or, "Not living the holy life (*brahma,cariya*), but pretending to do so."

<sup>50</sup> For details of each of these qualities of the false monk, see SD 59.2a (2.2).



The Buddha strongly condemns such a Tartuffe (a false monastic or priest),<sup>51</sup> declaring that it is better if he were thrown into a boiling cauldron right here and now: at least he would die then. But if he were to continue to live falsely, so that he continues to enjoy the benefits of charity and support, he would, after death, be reborn in a suffering hellish state. This is the Buddha’s clear warning to renunciants not to live a wrong livelihood, not making a career of the cloth, not leeching off society, but to strive diligently for the spiritual goal.<sup>52</sup>

**2.3.4.2** Such false monastics and priests are like students who play truant in school—they fail to master the training they have avowed to undertake—and upon “graduation,” they live false lives pretending to help and heal others, but which is far from the truth. Such false individuals differ from the true individuals who are diligent renunciants, just as night differs from day.<sup>53</sup>

The Pahārāda Sutta continues [2.3.1] by saying that:

Even though he sits in the midst of the sangha, yet he is far away from the sangha, and the sangha is far away from him. [2.3.5] [§13.2]

**2.3.4.3** In the **Saṅghāṭi,kaṇṇā Sutta** (It 92), the Buddha echoes this same sentiment, with a dramatic image and further instruction, thus:

Bhikshus, even if a monk should hold on to my outer robe’s corner, following closely behind me, step for step;

yet, if he were covetous, strongly lusting after sense-pleasures, with a mind of ill will, with a mind of corrupted intentions,<sup>54</sup> muddle-headed, without clear knowing, lacking concentration, scatter-brained, loose in faculty,<sup>55</sup> then, he is really far from me, and I from him.

What is the reason for this?

That monk, bhikshus, sees not the Dharma; not seeing the Dharma, he sees me not.<sup>56</sup>

(It 92,1.1-1.2/91), SD 24.10a

The import of such a teaching is profound: we *are* our views. If we hold wrong views, we would effectively cut ourselves off from those with right views. We would attract those with similar views and be attracted to them. There is always some guru or charlatan out there who will readily applaud and endorse our views, no matter how false or quirky—but, there is a high cost for this, as we have already noted. [2.3.5.1]

## **2.3.5 Communion**

**2.3.5.1** The **Saṅghāṭi,kaṇṇā Sutta** (It 92) continues with the Buddha declaring in a positive way, thus:

Bhikshus, even if a monk were to dwell a hundred yojanas<sup>57</sup> away,

<sup>51</sup> Named after the leading character, a deviously scheming religious hypocrite, in “Tartuffe” (1664), by the French playwright and actor Molière (1622-1673). See **Me: The nature of conceit**, SD 19.2a (2.3.2).

<sup>52</sup> A 7.68/4:134 [A:B 7.62] @ SD 89.12.

<sup>53</sup> On the stock passage describing a false monastic, see (**Aṭṭhaka**) **Uposatha S** (A 8.20), SD 59.2a (2.2).

<sup>54</sup> *Paduṭṭha,mana,saṅkappo*.

<sup>55</sup> *So ca hoti abhijjhālū kāmesu tibba,sārāgo byāpanna,citto paduṭṭha,mana,saṅkappo muṭṭha-s,sati asampajāno asamāhito vibbhanta,citto pākat’indriyo*. As at **Jīvika S** (It 91,4/89) n, SD 28.9b.

<sup>56</sup> *Dhammaṃ hi so bhikkhave bhikkhu na passati, dhammaṃ apassanto na maṃ passati*. See (2.3.5.1) n ad loc.

<sup>57</sup> On the *yojana*, see §9.1 n.

but is not covetous, the mind not infatuated with great lust for strong sense-pleasures, not malevolent at heart, with a mind free of corrupted thinking, constantly mindful, clearly knowing, mentally focused, guarded in sense-faculties,<sup>58</sup> then, he is before me, and I before him.

What is the reason for this?

That monk, bhikshus, sees the Dharma; seeing the Dharma, he sees me.<sup>59</sup>

(It 92,1.3/91), SD 24.10a

The significance of this passage is spiritually profound. It is not the robes or uniform, no matter how impressive, that we don which make us holy or good, but it is our heart and conduct, rooted in goodness. that truly defines and liberates us, and empowers us to help and heal others. More importantly, it is our falsehood and badness that distance us from the Buddha and the Dharma. In our goodness and spirituality, we are before the Buddha and approaching nirvana.

**2.3.5.2** The Vinaya term for such a spiritual connection is “**communion**” (*samvāsa*), and the verb here is *samvāsati*, “(he) communes” [§13.2]. A true monastic *communes* with others in the sangha. A false monastic has no *communion* with the sangha. “Communion” here, then, means a spiritual life and connection with one another.<sup>60</sup>

The suttas, especially the verses of the monastics, especially in the Thera, gāthā, we often see them as also being in harmony with the environment and nature. They are at peace with everything around them, too.<sup>61</sup>

More broadly, then, we can say that when we practise the Dharma and live a wholesome life, we are, by that fact, in communion with others who are similarly Dharma-moved in a spiritual community. It is our Dharma life that truly unites us as a community. We cannot “join” such a community because it is not a club or a tribe.

We must *become* the community through our own *spirituality*. Through our love and life in the Dharma, we become a spiritual community. Communion—being wisely mindful and open-hearted, and compassionately touching other lives, and in touch with nature—then, is *the* defining quality in our spiritual life. Even if we have not yet attained these wonderful qualities, they should guide our every action, and re-orientate us when things go wrong.

### **2.3.6 Milinda,pañha quotes**

**2.3.6.1 The Milinda,pañha**, an early post-canonical work on apologetics, has at least two quotes from the Pahārāda Sutta. The first is in **Dilemma 3.12** on whether the Buddha has anger, in connection with his dismissal of the noisy monks led by Sāriputta, as recorded in **the Cātuma Sutta** (M 67).<sup>62</sup> In the Milinda,pañha, the monk Nāgasena explains to the Greek king Milinda (Menander) that the Buddha does not show anger in expelling those noisy monks, just as the great ocean casting dead bodies ashore without any anger. Indeed, it is with compassion that the Buddha does so, to teach those monks a lesson, so that they are more disciplined and amenable.<sup>63</sup>

<sup>58</sup> *So ca hoti anabhijjhālū kāmesu na tibba,sārāgo abyāpanna,citto appaduṭṭha,mana,samkappo upaṭṭhita,sati sampajāno samāhito ekagga,citto samvut’indriyo.*

<sup>59</sup> *Dhammaṃ hi so bhikkhave bhikkhu passati, dhammaṃ passanto maṃ passati.* Cf **Vakkali S** (S 22.87.13/3:-120), SD 8.8.

<sup>60</sup> In Vinaya, *samvāsa* is def at V 4:315; *samvasati* def at V 4:138, 214. See also Pāc 69 (V 4:137).

<sup>61</sup> See eg Mahā Kassapa’s verses (Tha 1057-1070).

<sup>62</sup> M 67,1-5 (SD 34.7).

<sup>63</sup> Miln 3.12/1:188.

**2.3.6.2** The second Milinda, pañha quote of the Pahārāda Sutta is found in **Dilemma 6.5**, on why there are those who, after being ordained as monks, give up the training and return to lay life. Nāgasena explains that such people do not have enough merits to stay on, and so leave the order, just as the great ocean wash ashore any dead bodies. In other words, the Buddha gives everyone a chance to join the monastic sangha if they qualify in some way. But the sangha rejects them if they are unwilling or unable to continue in the training.<sup>64</sup>

## 2.4 SOCIAL EQUALITY IN THE DHARMA [§14]

**2.4.1** The 4<sup>th</sup> of the 8 parables and its application is given thus:

Pahārāda, just as *all the great rivers, that is to say,*  
*the Ganges, the Yamuna, the Aciravati, the Sarabhu and the Mahi,*<sup>65</sup>  
*upon reaching the great ocean, losing their former names and gotra [origins],*  
*come to be known simply as the great ocean—*  
 so, too, Pahārāda, when these 4 classes<sup>66</sup>—  
 the kshatriyas, the brahmins, the vaishyas, the shudras—  
 having gone forth from the house for the homeless life in the Dharma-Vinaya proclaimed by  
 the Tathagata,<sup>67</sup>  
they abandon their former names and gotras [lineages], and are simply known as  
**‘Sakya-putta recluses’** [‘recluses who are sons of the Sakya’].<sup>68</sup> [§14.1-2]

### 2.4.2 Suttas and texts mentioning the 5 rivers or the great ocean

**2.4.2.0** These 5 rivers—the Ganges, the Yamuna, the Aciravati, the Sarabhu and the Mahi [§§5+14]—are a stock list, mentioned in a number of other suttas.

**2.4.2.1** The Saṃyutta has two suttas of the same name, that is, **the Sambhejja Udaka Suttas 1+2** (S 13.3+4), both applying the parable of the “waters at the confluence” (*sambhejja udaka*) of the 5 rivers. In **the Sambhejja Udaka Sutta 1** (S 13.3), the Buddha declares that if a person were to take only a couple of drops of water from this confluence, clearly the waters of the confluence is very much more than those few drops. So, too, is the “breakthrough into the Dharma” (*dharmābhisaṃmayā*) or the “attaining of the Dharma-eye” (*dhama.cakkhu,paṭilābha*), like the waters of the confluence, compared to the few drops that is the whole world. Both the technical terms here refer to the attaining of streamwinning.<sup>69</sup>

**The Sambhejja Udaka Sutta 2** (S 13.4) is the same as its first namesake, except that “the water at the confluence” has disappeared. This amount that has disappeared is still greater than a few drops in our hand. Similarly, the attaining of streamwinning is far greater than even power over the whole world itself.<sup>70</sup>

<sup>64</sup> Miln 6.5/2:250.

<sup>65</sup> This parable and the foll [§15] are combined in Miln 70,

<sup>66</sup> On the 4 classes (*vaṇṇa*), see **Kaṇṇa,kaṭṭhala S** (M 90/2:125-133), SD 10.8 (6).

<sup>67</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda cattāro’me vaṇṇā khattiyā brāhmaṇā vessā suddā, te tathāgata-p,pavedite dhamma,-vinaye agārasmā anaḡāriyaṃ pabbajitvā.*

<sup>68</sup> *Jahanti purimāni nāma,gottāni samaṇā sakya,puttiyā tv-eva* [Be:Ka Se samaṇo sakya,puttiyo tv-eva] *saṅkhaṃ gacchanti.* On **sakya,putta** see [2.5.1].

<sup>69</sup> S 13.3+4/2:135.

<sup>70</sup> For a similar statement, see Dh 178.

**2.4.2.2** There are a set of 6 suttas with the same name, that is, **Pācīna,ninna Suttas 1-6** (S 45.91-95), all applying the river parable. These rivers are said to gradually “incline to the east” (*pācīna,ninna*). Each of the 5 rivers is the theme of a sutta of their own (S 45.91-95), and the last sutta incorporating all the 5 rivers, presented as “inclining to the east” (S 45.96).

Each limb of the eightfold path, too, needs to be gradually cultivated, “based on solitude, on dispassion, on cessation, maturing in release.”<sup>71</sup> This is the way in which the path is gradual so that the traveller or practitioner is progressively transformed and spiritually matures—like a sweet fruit ripening—and inclines towards nirvana.<sup>72</sup>

**2.4.2.3** Following this set of 6 suttas [2.4.2.2] is another set of 6 suttas, all with the same name, that is, **the Samudda,ninna Suttas 1-6** (S 45.7-102), which repeats the same cycle as the Pācīnā,ninna Sutta [2.4.2.2], except that we have “incline to the ocean” (*samudda,ninna*) instead of “incline to the east.”

**2.4.2.4 The (Satta) Suriya Sutta** (A 7.62) says that, in the distant future, all these 5 great rivers would dry up when the third of the 7 suns appear in this world, portending the world’s end. This is one of the reflections used by the Buddha to show the impermanence of the world. Reflecting thus, says the Buddha, it is sufficient that we would want to be liberated from the conditioned world.<sup>73</sup>

**2.4.2.5 In the Pahārāda Sutta** (A 8.19), these 5 great rivers [§§5 + 14], each with their own name, are said to flow into the great ocean where they blend with it and lose their names and are simply known as the “great ocean.” So, too, when members of the 4 classes—the kshatriya, the brahmins, the vaishyas, the shudras<sup>74</sup>—lose their class distinction, they become a classless community known simply as the “Sakyaputta recluses,” that is, “children” of the Buddha.

In some manuscripts, only four rivers are mentioned (omitting the last-named, the Mahi), to fit with the number of classes. However, the five rivers are meaningful, and we can include a fifth category, a sort of “non-class,” that is, the “fifth” (*pañcama*) group or the outcastes. They, too, on joining the sangha, lose their low status and are simply known as “Sakya-putta recluses.”<sup>75</sup>

**2.4.2.6 In the (Dasaka) Appamāda Sutta** (A 10.15), this parable of 5 rivers and the great ocean is its tenth and last one. In this case, the Buddha declares that just as the rivers merge with the great ocean, and is known as the “great ocean,” so that it is the foremost, even so, amongst wholesome qualities, heedfulness (*appamāda*) is declared to be the foremost.<sup>76</sup>

**2.4.2.7 The Milinda,pañha** quotes the parable of the rivers at least twice (that is, Miln 70 + 89). In the first case (**Miln 70**), king Milinda asks Nāgasena if he or his father before him has ever met the Buddha. When Nāgasena replies neither he nor his father has seen the Buddha, Milinda concludes that he does not exist. Nāgasena then asks Milinda if he has seen a certain distant but well-known river. Milinda admits that he has not. Does that mean it does not exist?

Milinda then asks Nāgasena how does he know that the Buddha is the foremost being if he has never met the Buddha. Nāgasena then presents the 4<sup>th</sup> parable—these 5 great rivers flow into the great ocean,

<sup>71</sup> *Viveka,nissitaṃ virāga,nissitaṃ nirodha,nissitaṃ vossagga,pariṇāmiṃ*. This is the *viveka,nissita* formula: see *Viveka,nissita*, SD 20.4.

<sup>72</sup> S 45.91-96/5:38 f.

<sup>73</sup> A 7.62 @ SD 47.8.

<sup>74</sup> On the 4 classes (*vaṇṇa*), see **Kaṇṇa,kaṭṭhala S** (M 90/2:125-133), SD 10.8 (6).

<sup>75</sup> **A 8.19**,5/4:199 f + 14/202 @ SD 45.18.

<sup>76</sup> A 10.15 @ SD 42.23.

filling it up, yet neither its fullness nor emptiness is affected by this. We would know this even without having seen the great ocean. Even so, we can know that the Buddha is the foremost of beings.

#### 2.4.2.8 OTHER CITATIONS OF THE PARABLE

(A) There are a number of other citations of the parables of the 5 rivers and the great ocean. Two more are found in **the Milinda,pañha** (that is, Miln 114, 380). In **Miln 114**, Nāgasena says that some 500 bodies of water flow down the Himalayas. but not all of them are regarded as rivers, because they tend to dry up. Only ten of them are called rivers. And the rivers of the parable are the first 5 of these 10 rivers.

(B) In **Miln 380**, Nāgasena is recorded as teaching that we should emulate 5 qualities of the great ocean. These 5 qualities are those represented by the following parables:

- |  |      |
|--|------|
| (1) Parable 3: The great ocean rejects dead bodies   | [§4] |
| (2) Parable 7: The great ocean contains various kinds of treasures   | [§8] |
| (3) Parable 8: The great ocean contains gargantuan beings  | [§9] |
| (4) Parable 2: A 100,000 rivers flow into the great ocean, beginning with the 5 rivers.<br>The great ocean does not overflow its margins | [§3] |
| (5) Parable 5: Despite the inflows by rivers and rains, the great ocean's water is stable  | [§6] |

Nāgasena, however, gives his own interpretations of these parables, calling them “**the 5 limbs to be grasped**” (*pañc’āṅga gahetabba*). thus:

Parable 1: A meditator (*yogi*) should not have any unwholesome qualities.

Parable 2: He should treat his spiritual qualities and attainments as precepts and not show them off.

Parable 3: He should dwell near good teachers as their spiritual friends and be harmonious with fellow brahmacharis.

Parable 4: He should not break any of the rules for the sake of any gain, honour or fame.

Parable 8: He should never tire of the Pātimokkha recitation, learning the Abhidhamma and the Vinaya, the deep suttas and its language, and all the limbs of the Buddha’s teachings.

(C) **The Visuddhi,magga**, very near its opening, in the description of moral virtue, alludes to the 5 rivers in its long verse, declaring that nothing in the world, not even the waters of any of the 5 rivers can wash away our impurities. Only moral virtue (*sīla*) can purify us. (Vism 1.24/10).

#### 2.4.3 Sakya,putta [§14.2]

In ancient India, even in the Buddha’s time, both he and his monks are referred to as **sakya,putta**, which can be translated as “Sakya son” or “son of the Sakya(s).” In the former case, “Sakya” can be singular or plural: if singular (as here) it would refer to “the Sakya” (the Buddha himself), as a synecdoche for the Buddha’s community. If it is taken as plural, it refers to “of the Sakyas,” that is, the early Buddhist community as a “sect” or “order.” For example, the Buddha is often referred to by others, even the monks themselves (eg Assaji, V 1:41), as “the great recluse, son of the Sakyas, gone forth from a Sakya family” (*mahā,samaṇo sakya,putto sakya,kulā pabbajito*). This depends on the context; hence, the anglicized “Sakya-putta” is a helpful broad term.<sup>77</sup>

<sup>77</sup> For a useful discussion, see V:H 2:xliv-xlvii (although Horner differs from above).

## 2.5 NIRVANA'S UNCONDITIONALITY [§15]

**2.5.1** The 5<sup>th</sup> of the 8 parables and its application is given thus:

Pahārāda, *despite those streams that flow into the great ocean, and the showers that fall from the sky, neither the decrease nor the fullness of the great ocean is evident—*  
 so, too, Pahārāda, although many monks attain the nirvana-element without residue,  
 neither the decrease or the fullness<sup>78</sup> of that nirvana-element is evident. [§15.1-2]

By way of summary, the “**nirvana-element without residue**” (*anupādi,sesa nibbāna,dhātu*) here refers to the nirvana of an arhat who has passed away. An arhat who continues to live (like the Buddha himself, for 45 years), is said to be experiencing the “nirvana with residue” (*sa.upādi,sesa nibbāna*), the “remains” here being the (non-clinging) 5 aggregates (*pañca-k,khandha*).

### 2.5.2 The 2 nirvana-elements

**2.5.2.1** This parable [2.5.1] may be understood in the context of the “2 kinds of nirvana,” that is:

- |                                       |   |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| (1) nirvana-element with residue, and | <i>sa,upādi,sesa nibbāna,dhātu</i>          |
| (2) nirvana-element without residue.  | <i>anupādi,sesa nibbāna,dhātu</i> [2.5.2.3] |

It should be noted that the word **dhātu**, “element,” here, means “a domain of experience or existence.”<sup>79</sup> In other words, it is a term used, as far as language permits, to refer to (that is, “point to”) or suggest some way for our understanding what that “state” is like.<sup>80</sup>

The “**nirvana-element with residue**” seems to be a non-technical term, where “residue” refers simply to the 5 aggregates *without* clinging [2.5.3]. where it refers to the Buddha or an arhat.

Other occurrences of the term “nirvana-element without residue” can be found in the texts listed in [2.0] above.

**2.5.2.2** The term “**nirvana-element without residue**” (*anupādi,sesa nibbāna,dhātu*) is more common, suggesting that it is an older term than “nirvana-element with residue” (*sa,upādi,sesa nibbāna,dhātu*), which was probably defined after it. In other words, the sutta compilers first described the state of the dying buddha or arhat as being a “nirvana-element without residue.”

In due course, they realized that it was helpful to describe the state of the living Buddha or an arhat as that of “nirvana *with* residue.” And so we have **the Nibbāna,dhātu Sutta** (It 44),<sup>81</sup> and a more elaborate discourse—the **Sa,upādi,sesa Sutta** (A 9.12) [2.5.5]—extending the idea to cover all the other types of saints, too.

**2.5.2.3** The more common term, “**nirvana-element without residue**,” occurs only by itself in the following suttas:

- (1) **The (Tathāgata) Loka Sutta** (A 4.23 = It 122), where a definition of *tathāgata* is given, thus:

<sup>78</sup> The parable at §14 and this are combined in Miln 70; also Bhagavad-Gita 2.70.

<sup>79</sup> See DP: dhātu 4.

<sup>80</sup> On the nirvana-element. see Miln 8.11/323-326. On the problem of defining or describing nirvana, see **Unanswered questions**, SD 401.10 esp (4).

<sup>81</sup> It 44/2.2.7/38 f (SD 50.13). On the 2 kinds of nirvana, see also SD 9 (15.2): Nirvana: 2 kinds and 3 kinds.

And, bhikshus, from the night that the Tathagata fully awakens to the night he utterly passes away into the nirvana-element without residue, throughout that period, whatever he speaks, utters, points out—all that is just so, not otherwise.<sup>82</sup> As such, he is called Tathagata.

(A 4.23,2.2/2:24), SD 15.7(2.1.2) = It 122.

The Commentary explains that when no buddhas arise in the incalculable aeons, it is not possible for a single being to attain nirvana. Yet, one cannot say that nirvana is empty. During a buddha-age, when countless beings attain the death-free from a single assembly, one cannot say that the nirvana-element has become full (AA 4:111).

(2) **The Saṁvejaniya Sutta** (A 4.118 = D 16) lists the 4 holy places that should inspire religious urgency (*saṁvega*), the drive to practise the Dharma right now. These 4 holy places are as follows:

1. the place of the nativity (Lumbinī Park, modern Rummindei);
2. the place of the great awakening (Uruvelā on the Nerañjarā, modern Ureli on the Lilanja river);
3. the place of the first discourse (the Deer Park at Isipatana, modern Sahet-Mahet); and
4. the place of the final passing-away (Kusināra, modern Kashgar).

(D 16,5.8/2:140; A 4.118/2:120 f) + SD 9 (7c)

At each of these holy places, we should reflect its significance accordingly, and at the fourth place, we should reflect: “Here the Tathāgata attained the nirvana-element without residue.”

(3) **The Bhūmi,cāla Sutta** (A 8.70,19/4:313) gives 8 causes of earthquakes, which is also found in the Mahā Parinibbāna Sutta (D 16). The eighth and last cause of earthquakes is “when the Tathāgata enters into parinirvana, the nirvana-element without residue.”<sup>83</sup>

**2.5.2.4** THE 2 KINDS OF NIRVANA are fully defined in only one text, that is, **the Nibbāna,dhātu Sutta** (It 2.2.7).<sup>84</sup> They are, however, briefly mentioned in a number of texts, such as **the Māha Parinibbāna Sutta** (D 16)<sup>85</sup> and **the Pāsādika Sutta** (D 29).<sup>86</sup>

**The Cunda Kammāra,putta Sutta** (U 75) records the Buddha as consoling Cunda by telling him of the two foremost meal-offerings to be made to the Buddha: the first is the meal (offered by the lady Sujātā), after which the Buddha awakens, and the second is that (offered by Cunda the smith himself) after which the Buddha passes away into nirvana. Here, we see both kinds of nirvana alluded to, but the first is not given any technical name.<sup>87</sup>

Since *upādi* refers to the 5 aggregates (*khandha*), these 2 kinds of nirvana—the nirvana-element with residue and the nirvana-element without residue—are also respectively known as “the nirvana of the defilements” (*kilesa,nibbāna*) and “the nirvana of the aggregates” (*khandha,nibbāna*) (DA 899 f). Here, we see the idea of “nirvana” being used as an action noun to mean “extinction” of what holds us back in samsara.<sup>88</sup>

<sup>82</sup> *Sabbam taṁ tatth’eva hoti no aññathā.*

<sup>83</sup> D 16,2.13-20/2:107-109 (SD 9).

<sup>84</sup> It 44/2.2.7/38 f, SD 50.13. On the 2 kinds of nirvana, see also SD 9 (15.2): Nirvana: 2 kinds and 3 kinds.

<sup>85</sup> D 16,3.20/2:108 f (SD 9).

<sup>86</sup> D 29,29/3:135 (SD 40a.6).

<sup>87</sup> U 75/8.5/85.

<sup>88</sup> This 2 types of nirvana are also respectively called *kilesa,parinibbāna* and *khandha,parinibbāna*: see SD 50.13 (3.2.4.2).

**2.5.2.5 MEANINGS OF UPĀDI.** The compound, *anupādi,sesa* comes from *na* (“no, not”) + *upadi* (“clinging”; “support, fuel”) + *sesa* (“remains, residue”). The Pali word *upādi* (“clinging,” from *upa + ā + dā*, “to take”) is often confused with the Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit *upādhi* (meaning “remnant, substrate,” or better, “birth-basis” or “accumulation,” attachment to which leads to rebirth).<sup>89</sup> Despite the subtle but important difference in meaning, most modern commentators regard them as synonymous, and do not try to explain how and why the difference arose.<sup>90</sup>

Note here that *upādi* has two important senses: (1) “clinging” and (2) “support, fuel.” In (1), “clinging”—or more fully, “a [some] trace of clinging” (*upādi,sesa*)—refers to the 5 higher fetters [2.5.5], and is an old term (certainly older than the second meaning and usage), used apparently only in reference to the attaining of non-return vis-a-vis the attaining of arhathood [2.5.2.7].

**2.5.2.6** Let us look at meaning (2) of *upādi*, as it directly concerns our passage here. In the compound *anupādi,sesa*, *upādi* refers to “karmic support or fuel” that keeps us fettered to samsara. According to the Commentaries, these are the “material support” that is, the results of past karma, that is, the 5 aggregates (*pañca-k,khandha*).<sup>91</sup>

Its opposite is *sa,upādi,sesa*, “with residue of karmic support or fuel (ie, the aggregates),” which refers to the state of an arhat while he still lives. His life continues on the residual fuel of his past karma and present conditions. Technically, we should translate *sa,upādi,sesa nibbāna,dhātu* as “the nirvana with residual karmic fuel,” and *anupādi,sesa nibbāna,dhātu* as “the nirvana-element without any residual karmic fuel.” These definitions are technically descriptive, but a little cumbersome. They are helpful in explaining, even defining, the terms to us, and we should bear them in mind, whatever translation (which follows) we choose to use.

We could simply render them respectively as “the nirvana-element with residue remaining” and “the nirvana-element without residue remaining,” or, “the nirvana with traces left” and “the nirvana-element without traces” respectively. Even more simply, we can render them as “the nirvana with residue” and “the nirvana without residue.” After all, “residue” means the same thing as what “remains” behind, so we can settle simply for the word “residue.” Or, we could alternatively translate the two terms as “residual nirvana-element” and “residueless nirvana-element,” but this gives the impression that it is “nirvana” (despite the word “element”) that stay on in the world. The second term may work, but the first certainly gives us this uneasy implication.

Since these two are rare terms, but important ones, I think it is best that we render them *idiomatically* into modern English as “**nirvana with residue**” and “**nirvana without residue**” respectively, which clearly reflects the imports of both terms. They are quite a mouthful, but not so cumbersome. Such terms reinforce their respective meanings with proper usage.<sup>92</sup>

**2.5.2.7** The second sense of *upādi* is “clinging,” but this sense cannot be used in *sa,upādi,sesa nibbāna,dhātu* [2.5.2.6] to mean “the nirvana-element with a residue of clinging,” since one who has attained nirvana has *no* clinging! As such, *upādi* in this term (and its counterpart, *anupādi,sesa nibbāna,dhātu*) cannot be rendered as “clinging,” but as simply “residue,” that is, remnants of the (non-clinging) aggregates.

*Upādi* in the sense of “clinging” is probably the older of the two senses [2.5.2.5], as it is often used in reference to the attaining of arhathood and non-return, as stated in the well known stock: “If there is a

<sup>89</sup> See SD 28.11 (3.2).

<sup>90</sup> See K R Norman, “Mistaken Ideas about *Nibbāna*,” *The Buddhist Forum* 3, ed T Skorupski & U Pagel, 1995: 215. See also **The unconscious**, SD 17.8b (4.4) & also **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10,46.2) n on *upādi*, SD 13.3.

<sup>91</sup> MA 4:55; UA 151.

<sup>92</sup> On Pali polysemy, see SD 50.13 (3.2.1.2).



[any or some] trace of clinging” (*sati vā upādi, sese anāgāmitā*), one becomes a non-returner. This well-known phrase is found, for example, in **the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta** (M 10)<sup>93</sup> and **the Paṭisallāna Sutta** (It 45).<sup>94</sup>

**2.5.2.8** The differences between *upādi* and *upadhi* should be noted here. In the 2 kinds of nirvana [2.5.2.6], the former term, ***upādi***, meaning “fuel, residue (of the aggregates)” applies. The term ***upadhi***, meaning “birth-basis, substrate” is not used connection with *nibbāna*.<sup>95</sup>

### **2.5.3 A living arhat**

**2.5.3.1** One who awakens and continues to live (like the Buddha himself, for 45 years), is said to be experiencing the “nirvana with residue” (*sopādi, sesa nibbāna*), the “residue” here being the (non-clinging) 5 aggregates (*pañca-k, khandha*), that is, form, feeling, perception, formations and consciousness. In other words, an arhat (like the Buddha), has a body (like ours) but his mind is awakened, that is, freed from defilements and suffering. He is awakened.

According to **the Nibbāna, dhātu Sutta** (It 44), an arhat still has the 5 sense-faculties (like us), experiences the pleasant and the unpleasant (*manāpāmanāpaṃ paccanubhoti*), and so feel pleasure and pain, but is unafflicted (*avighāta*) by them.<sup>96</sup> This is easy to understand if we recall how we ourselves, as children simply react to pain or fear with displeasure and alarm. But as we mature, we are able to withstand pain and other negative emotions better, depending on our training. If we project this kind of personal development, with the experience of deep meditation, we will be able to manage pain, emotions and views in a more spiritual way.

**2.5.3.2 The Dve Khandha Sutta** (A 22.48) lays out two sets of the 5 aggregates, one simply called “the 5 aggregates” (*pañca-k, khandha*) and the other “the 5 aggregates of clinging” (*pañc’upādāna-k, khandha*). The first set is simply “functional,” that is, they are not “fuel” for further existence or suffering, as in a worldling. These are the 5 aggregates of an arhat, which does not generate any karma.

The aggregates of clinging means that they are the objects that we cling to (our bodies, feelings, perceptions, formations and consciousness), and they, in turn, cause us to continue clinging. So it is like an endless loop that we are caught up in, a snake biting its own tail.<sup>97</sup>

### **2.5.4 An arhat after death**

This is the most profound of the 8 parables, as it concerns the nature of nirvana. However, the nirvana referred to here, in **the Pahārāda Sutta**, is technically stated to be the “nirvana-element without residue” (*anupādi, sesā nibbāna, dhātu*) [§15], or more simply, the nirvana without any residue. This is a reference to the nirvana of the Buddha or an arhat who has passed away. It is a reference to the post-humous state of an arhat.<sup>98</sup> [2.5.2.5]

<sup>93</sup> M 10,46,2 passim (SD 13.3).

<sup>94</sup> It 45/2.2.8/38 f (SD 41.4).

<sup>95</sup> For details, see SD 9 (15.2).

<sup>96</sup> It 44/2.2.7/38 f, SD 50.13. On the 2 kinds of nirvana, see also SD 9 (15.2): Nirvana: 2 kinds and 3 kinds.

<sup>97</sup> See **Dve Khandha S** (S 22.48) + SD 17.1a (2.2).

<sup>98</sup> On the problem of describing an arhat’s after-death state, see **Unanswered questions**, SD 40.10 esp (4). On *nibbāna* and *parinibbāna*, see SD 9 (15).

### 2.5.5 Saints with residue

The **Sa,upādi,sesa Sutta** (A 9.12) is an important text listing those saints “with residue” (*sa,upādi,-sesa*), that is, with residue of karmic fuel, by way of the 5 aggregates of clinging.<sup>99</sup> These saints are the non-returner (*anāgāmi*), the once-returner (*sākadāgāmi*) and the streamwinner (*sotāpanna*). All these saints still have some residue or traces of the 5 aggregates of clinging because they have not broken all the 10 fetters.<sup>100</sup>

They will, however, in due course, with the gradual breaking of the fetters, upgrade themselves until they attain arhathood.<sup>101</sup> In this connection, we can say that *upādi* refers to the 5 higher fetters [2.5.2.7]. However, more specifically, this would be the fetter of restlessness (*uddhacca*), by way of a “dharma desire” (*dhamma,rāga*) or “dharma restlessness” (*dhamma’uddhacca*).<sup>102</sup>

### 2.5.6 Is nirvana a place or located anywhere?

**2.5.6.1** It is extremely difficult to envision or even imagine **nirvana** since it is nothing of this world, or existing as a thing or place outside of our universe. In **the Aggi Vaccha,gotta Sutta** (M 72), the Buddha explains to the wanderer Vaccha,gotta that nirvana, like a fire that has been extinguished, has “gone nowhere.” Simply put, the conditions that define life and suffering have all been extinguished. Using another parable—that of the great ocean—the Buddha adds that the awakened saint or tathagata is liberated from all reckoning in terms the 5 aggregates (form, feeling, perception, formations or consciousness), so that he is unfathomable like the great ocean.<sup>103</sup>

**2.5.6.2** Dilemma 8.12 of **the Milinda,pañha** deals with the problem of the location of nirvana. King Milinda tells the monk Nāgasena that if nirvana is not located anywhere (in some country, town or place), then it does not exist. Nāgasena replies that it is like the scent of plants: we can smell it but it is not stored anywhere in a plant, or just as fire is not stored anywhere, yet we can start it with fire-sticks.

Milinda then asks how does one attain such a nirvana. Nāgasena replies that this is done through the practice of moral virtue (*sīla*) and wise attention (*yoniso manasikāra*), that is, reflecting on the 3 characteristics (impermanence, unsatisfactoriness, and non-self) of all things in this world. Practising in this way, no matter where we are, in any country, town or place, we will be able to attain nirvana.<sup>104</sup>

## 2.6 THE DHARMA-VINAYA IS ABOUT FREEDOM [§16]

**2.6.1** The 6<sup>th</sup> of the 8 parables and its application are given thus:

<sup>99</sup> A 9.12/4:378-382 (SD 3.3(3)). On the aggregates of clinging, see **(Upādāna) Parivaṭṭa S** (S 22.56), SD 3.7 (2) & **Mahā Hatthi,paḍōpama S** (M 28,27-28), SD 6.16 = SD 17.8a (13.2.2).

<sup>100</sup> The 10 fetters (*dasa saṃyojana*), are: (1) self-identity view (*sakkāya,diṭṭhi*), (2) spiritual doubt (*vicikicchā*), (3) attachment to rituals and vows (*sīla-b,bata,parāmāsa*), (4) sensual lust (*kāma,rāga*), (5) aversion (*paṭigha*), (6) greed for form existence (*rūpa,rāga*), (7) greed for formless existence (*arūpa,rāga*), (8) conceit (*māna*), (9) restlessness (*uddhacca*), (10) ignorance (*avijjā*). See **Kiṭṭa,giri S** (M 70) @ SD 11.1 (5.1); **(Sekha) Uddesa S** (A 4.85), SD 3.3-(2). See S 5:61; A 5:13; Vbh 377.

<sup>101</sup> A 9.12 (SD 3.3(3)).

<sup>102</sup> For further details on *uddhacca*, see SD 41.4 (2.2). On *dhamm’uddhacca*, see **Uddhacca,kukkucca**, SD 32.7 (2.1), esp (2.1.4).

<sup>103</sup> M 72,18-20/1:487 f @ SD 6.15.

<sup>104</sup> Miln 8.12/326-328. On nirvana in relation to space and time, see SD 50.13 (3.4.3).

Pahārāda, just as *the great ocean has only one taste, the taste of salt—*  
so, too, Pahārāda, this Dharma-Vinaya has only one taste, the taste of freedom.<sup>105</sup> [§16.1-2]

### **2.6.2 Essence of early Buddhism**

Saying that “this Dharma-Vinaya has only one taste, the taste of freedom” (*ayaṃ dhamma, vinayo eka, raso vimutti, raso*)<sup>106</sup> is to state the ultimate purpose or highest benefit of early Buddhism: to be freed from samsara. A slightly more elaborate statement is the famous summary of the 4 noble truths found in **the Anurādha Sutta** (S 22.86), that is, “I declare only suffering and the end of suffering” (*dukkhañ c’eva paññāpemi dukkhassa ca nirodhaṃ*).<sup>107</sup>

### **2.6.3 Breaking free**

We also see this very same idea implicit in the attaining of streamwinning, the very first real and sure step towards awakening in this life itself. This is attained by the breaking of the 3 fetters of self-identity view, doubt and attachment to rituals and vows.<sup>108</sup>

Breaking the fetter of self-identity view (*sakkāya, diṭṭhi*) is to be free of the notion that we are defined by our body and selfhood. We are an unfinished process, ever changing, and capable of learning and evolving so that we are limited neither by our body (through cultivating moral virtue) nor our mind (through mental cultivation). Such an effort brings us closer to understanding the universal reality of **non-self**.

Breaking the fetter of doubt (*vicikicchā*) is to realize and accept that only we can liberate ourselves spiritually. This liberating truth is called **diligence** (*appamāda*).<sup>109</sup> “Diligence” is a shorthand for the 4 right efforts or strivings (*samma-p, padhāna*), that is,

- if we do not have a certain bad habit, keep it so (prevention);
- if we do have a bad habit, we should give it up (abandoning);
- if we do not yet have a good habit (such as a moral life and cultivated mind), we should work in that direction (cultivation); and
- if we have a certain good habit, we should keep it up and grow (maintaining). Early Buddhism, in other words, tells us: we can do it!

Breaking the fetter of the attachment to rituals and vows (*sīla-b. bata, pārāmāsa*) is the understanding that when we lack wisdom, or is troubled by lust, ill will or ignorance, we tend to fall into the rut of a ritualism instead of seeing and solving the real problem that is troubling us. We see religion as rituals (emotional dependence on external support) and dogmas (fixed views, including philosophical notions), and think that some external agency is able to free us from our sufferings or grant our fond hope.

If we are habitually caught up in self-identity view, doubt and attachment to rituals and views—if we are self-centred, emotionally dependent on others, and superstitious—we are very likely to be suffering or be spiritually disabled in this life itself (and we might not even know this). In the hereafter, we would

<sup>105</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda ayaṃ dhamma, vinayo eka, raso vimutti, raso*. Cf Maitrāyana Brāhmaṇa Upaniṣad 6.35: sacrificers dissolve in that ocean like salt, and this is the oneness with Brahman. On the parable, cf Bṛhad-āraṇyaka Upaniṣad 6.11.

<sup>106</sup> See n at [2.6.1].

<sup>107</sup> The fuller quote is “As before, Anurādha, so, too, now, I declare only suffering and the end of suffering” (*pubbe cāhaṃ Anurādha etarahi ca dukkhañ c’eva paññāpemi dukkhassa ca nirodhan’ti*) (**Anurādha S**, S 22.86/3:119), SD 21.13.

<sup>108</sup> On the 3 fetters, see **Emotional independence**, SD 40a.8,

<sup>109</sup> See eg (**Dasaka**) **Appamāda S** (A 10.15), SD 42.23.

fall into the kind of existence we have been habituated to, that is, the animal world or a suffering hellish state.

### 2.6.4 Purpose of being Buddhist

If we see Buddhism as a path of awakening and nirvana, then we should also understand and accept the Buddha’s teaching that we can and should awaken or, at least, begin to awaken, in this life itself. This is done by understanding the nature of the 3 fetters [2.6.3]. When these fetters are broken, we become streamwinners in this life itself, and within 7 lives, we would surely awaken fully as arhats.<sup>110</sup>

How do we practise to break the 3 fetters to attain **streamwinning in this life itself**? The answer is the perception of impermanence (*anicca,saññā*), that is, the wise and habitual reflection of whatever we experience or whatever exists in this world as being *impermanent*. A better understanding of this practice can be gleaned from any of the 10 suttas of **the Okkanta Saṃyutta** (S 25), especially **the (Anicca) Cakkhu Sutta** (S 25.1).<sup>111</sup>

## 2.7 THE DHARMA-VINAYA AS PRICELESS TEACHINGS [§17]

### 2.7.1 A set of 10 jewels

The 7<sup>TH</sup> parable of the Pahārada Sutta first mentions that the great ocean contains 10 kinds of “treasures” (*ratana*): pearl, crystal, beryl, conch, quartz, coral, silver, gold, ruby, and cat’s-eye [§17.1]. The Sutta, then, declares the 7 awakening-factors to be **the “7 treasures”** of the Dharma-Vinaya<sup>112</sup> [§17.2].

Pahārāda, that the great ocean has many treasures, diverse treasures....pearl, crystal, beryl, conch, quartz, coral, silver, gold, ruby, cat’s-eye<sup>113</sup>—

so, too, Pahārāda, this Dharma-Vinaya has many treasures, various treasures. [§17.1-2]

Here, there are these treasures, that is to say [the 37 limbs of awakening in 7 sets]:

(1) the 4 focuses of mindfulness	<i>catu satipaṭṭhāna</i>	M 10/1:56-63
(2) the 4 right strivings	<i>catu samma-p, padhāna</i>	M 77,16/2:11
(3) the 4 paths to spiritual success	<i>catu iddhi, pādā</i>	M 16,26/1:103
(4) the 5 spiritual faculties	<i>pañc’indriya</i>	M 77,18/2:11 f
(5) the 5 spiritual powers	<i>pañca bala</i>	M 77,19/2:12
(6) the 7 awakening-factors	<i>satta bojjhaṅga</i>	M 2,21/1:11
(7) the noble eightfold path <sup>114</sup>	<i>ariya aṭṭh’āṅgika magga</i>	D 22,21/2:311 f <sup>115</sup>

<sup>110</sup> See **Entering the stream**, SD 3.3.

<sup>111</sup> S 25.1 (SD 16.7).

<sup>112</sup> For a better known list of 7 treasures (*satta, dhana*) or noble treasures (*ariya, dhana*)—those of faith (*saddhā, dhana*), moral virtue (*sīla, dhana*), moral shame (*hiri, dhana*), moral fear (*ottappa, dhana*), learning (*suta, dhana*), charity (*cāga, dhana*), and wisdom (*paññā, dhana*)—see **Ariya Dhana S 1+2** (A 7.5+6), SD 37.6 + SD 37.6(2).

<sup>113</sup> ie, pearl (*muttā*), gem (*maṇi*), beryl (*veḷuriya*), conch-shell [mother-of-pearl] (*saṅkha*), quartz (*silā*), coral (*pavāla*), silver (*rajata*), gold or money (*jāta, rūpa*), ruby (*lohitaka*), cat’s-eye (*masāra, galla*) [§17.1-2]. These incl the 7 jewels: beryl, gold, [crystal, *phalikā*], silver, cat’s eye, pearl (*mutta*), and ruby (*lohitaṅka, maṇi*) (VvA 300). Comy on “cat’s-eye” (*masāra, galla*): “A speckled gem (*kabara, maṇi*), variegated crystal (*citta, phalika*)” (AA 4:111; UA 3:205).

<sup>114</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda ayaṃ dhamma, vinayo bahu, ratano aneka, ratano, tatr’imāni ratanāni, seyyath’idaṃ cattāro satī’paṭṭhānā cattāro samma-p, padhānā cattāro iddhi, pādā pañc’indriyāni pañca balāni satta bojjh’āṅgā ariya aṭṭh’āṅgiko maggo.*

The 10 treasures mentioned in the parable here include the famous set of **7 treasures** (*satta, ratana*), that is, beryl, gold, crystal, silver, sapphire, pearl, and ruby<sup>116</sup> (VvA 300), but “crystal” is excluded. [2.8.1]

### **2.7.2 Another set of 10 treasures**

A very similar list of 10 treasures mentions precious metals (gold, silver, iron, copper, alloys) and precious stones (pearls, gems, beryls, diamonds, coral) in **the Milinda, pañha**.<sup>117</sup> In this case, it is better to translate *ratana* as “treasure,” since precious metals are a different category from “jewels” as precious stones.

## **2.8 MEANINGS AND USAGES OF RATANA**

### **2.8.1 A set of 7 jewels**

**2.8.1.1** The Pali word *ratana* literally means “gem, jewel,” or more broadly, “treasure.”<sup>118</sup> Taken in a physical sense, *ratana*, as “treasure or jewel,” can refer to either 7 precious stone or precious metals. The Commentary on **the Suvaṇṇa Vimāna Vatthu** (Vv 74) lists the 7 jewels as follows:

(1) beryl	<i>veḷuriya</i> ; Skt <i>vaidūry</i>	or lapis lazuli;
(2) gold	<i>suvaṇṇa</i> ; Skt <i>suvarna</i>	which could also refer to its form as money;
(3) crystal	<i>phalikā</i> ; Skt <i>sphaṭika</i>	probably fluorite or fluorspar; <sup>119</sup>
(4) silver	<i>rūpiya</i> ; Skt <i>rūpya</i>	which could also refer to its form as money;
(5) sapphire	<i>masāra, galla</i> ; Skt <i>musara, galva</i>	some translate as “cat’s-eye” or emerald; <sup>120</sup>
(6) pearl	<i>mutta</i> ; Skt <i>muktā</i>	at least 8 kinds are known (Mahv 11, 14)
(7) ruby	<i>lohitaṅka maṇi</i> ; Skt <i>rohita mukta</i>	literally, “red gem” (VvA 300) <sup>121</sup>

**The Mahā Sudassana Sutta** (D 17,16), in several places, mentions only six of the 7 jewels, such as in this passage describing the fabulous palm trees in the palace gardens of king Mahā Sudassana: “One row of palm trees is made of gold; one of silver; one of beryl; one of crystal; one of ruby; one of sapphire; one of all the jewels.”<sup>122</sup> Only pearl is missing from the list.

**2.8.1.2** It should be noted that most of these ancient words for the “treasures” might not refer exactly to the kinds of gem or metal they denote today. It was likely that, to the ancients, any of these

<sup>115</sup> On these two kinds of 7 treasures, see SD 37.6 (1.34): The 7 treasures and the 7 jewels.

<sup>116</sup> The Pali terms are as follows: beryl (*veḷuriya*), gold (*suvaṇṇa*), crystal (*phalikā*), silver (*rūpiya*), sapphire [sometimes tr as cat’s eye] (*masāra, galla*), pearl (*mutta*), and ruby (*lohitaṅka maṇi*) (VvA 300).

<sup>117</sup> Miln mentions these: “gold, silver, pearls, gems, conch-shells [mother-of-pearl], quartz, corals, rubies, sapphires [cat’s-eyes], beryl [lapis lazuli], diamonds, crystal, iron-ore [lit “black metal”], copper, alloys, bronzes” (*suvaṇṇaṃ rajataṃ muttā maṇi saṅkho silā pavāḷaṃ lohitaṅko masāra, gallaṃ veḷuriyo vajiraṃ phalikaṃ kāḷa, lohaṃ tamba, lohaṃ vaṭṭa, lohaṃ kaṃsa, lohaṃ*, Miln 267).

<sup>118</sup> Vedic *ratna*, “gift”; BHS *ratna* (Divy 26) and *ratana* (AvŚ 2:199). See VvA 321; PvA 53 (*nānā, vidhāni*, “various kinds”).

<sup>119</sup> See Raoul McLaughlin, *Rome and the Distant East*, London & NY” Continuum, 2010:150.

<sup>120</sup> Cf Skt *māsara*, “emerald” + *galva*, “crystal.”

<sup>121</sup> See also LIU Xinru, *The Silk Road in World History*, Oxford, 2010:53-55, 66, 79, 84.

<sup>122</sup> *Ekā tāla, panti sovaṇṇa, mayā, ekā rūpiya, mayā, ekā veḷuriya, mayā, ekā phalika, mayā, ekā lohitaṅka, mayā, ekā masāra, galla, mayā, ekā sabba, ratanamayā*. The tr folls the Pali; alt, it can be read as “One row has palm trees made of gold...” etc. (D 17,16), SD 36.12.

On §§1.6.1-2, cf §1.26.7 below.

words could broadly refer to a number of precious gems or items. For example, beryl also referred to glass.<sup>123</sup> The word *rupiya* and *suvaṇṇa* were used interchangeably for gold or silver, and might refer to money in general, since they were often used as currency coins. *Masāra, galla* probably referred to sapphire, but could also refer to emerald or cat’s-eye. Perhaps in the future, specialists would be able to make even more refined distinctions of such things, as science and technology advance.

Furthermore, besides these 7 jewels, there were clearly other precious or decorative materials which, after the Buddha’s time, decorated Buddha images, stupas and other religious edifices. Even in the Buddha’s time, these precious items were known locally and internationally, but they were, properly speaking, never offered to the monastics or monasteries, as monastics were prohibited from accepting or using such worldly valuables. They were only alluded to in stories, parables and imageries when teaching the Dharma. [2.8.1.3]

**2.8.1.3 In the Mahā Sudassana Sutta** (D 17), the palm trees around Mahā Sudassana’s lake in his meditation palace are made of these precious stones and metals, but only six are mentioned, that is: gold (*suvaṇṇa*), silver (*rūpiya*), beryl (*veḷuriya*), crystal (*phalika*), ruby (*lohitaṅka*), sapphire (*masāra, galla*), and all-jewel (*sabba, ratana*).<sup>124</sup>

**The Sīl’ānisaṁsa Jātaka** (J 190), for example, relates a fabulous story where a serpent-king, living on an island changed himself into a ship whose parts are made of the 7 treasures: the three masts are of sapphire, the anchor of gold, the ropes of silver and the planks of gold, too. As the serpent is virtuous, a not so virtuous barber sailing in his ship is left unharmed by a sea-spirit.<sup>125</sup>

The 7 treasures are alluded to in the Therī, gāthā, in a verse of the nun **Sumedhā**, where it is said:

<i>Satta, ratanāni vasseyya vuṭṭhimā dāsadisā samantena na c’atthi titti kāmānaṁ atittā’va maranti narā</i>	It might rain the 7 treasures, showering all around in the 10 directions, but there is still no satisfaction <sup>126</sup> with sense-pleasures: people indeed die unsated! (Thī 487)
---	---

**The Māgha Vatthu**, the story of how Magha becomes Sakra, leader of the devas (DhA 2.7), mentions a “pavilion of jewels” (*ratana, maṇḍapa*), 30 leagues in circumference, and at regular intervals around it, are raised flags “made of the 7 jewels” (*satta, ratana, mayā*).<sup>127</sup>

The Commentary to **the Uruga Peta, vatthu**, the Preta Story of the Snake (Pv 1.12)—which is the Peta, vatthu version of **Uruga Jātaka** (J 354)—Sakra, the leader of the gods, is said to have “filled their house with the 7 jewels” (*satta, ratana, bharitaṁ katvā*, PvA 66). The phrase, however, is unexplained. It does not seem to allude to any metaphorical or spiritual sense of “jewels,” but is likely to literally refer to mundane wealth. The Jātaka version simply states that before he leaves, he fills their house with immeasurable wealth (*aparimitaṁ dhanāṁ katvā*) (J 354/3:168).

<sup>123</sup> See eg the articles in Gan, Brill & Tian (eds), *Ancient Glass Research along the Silk Road*, New Jersey: World Scientific Publishing, 2009.

<sup>124</sup> D 17, 1.32/2:184 f @ SD 36.12.

<sup>125</sup> J 190/2:111 f.

<sup>126</sup> “Satisfaction,” *titti* (pp of *tappati*, “he satisfies,” from √TRP, “to be pleased”): Dh 186 = ThA 287 (*na kahāpaṇa, vassena ~ kāmesu vijjati*, “No satisfaction is found in sensual pleasures (even) by a shower of coins,” *api* is invisible); *n’atthi kāmānaṁ*, “there is no satisfaction in sensual pleasures,” Thī 487; J 5:486 (*na hi... dhammesu... ~*, “unsatisfied in teachings”); VvA 11; PvA 32 (*~rṁ gacchati*, “finds satisfaction”), 55 (*paṭilabhati*, “gets satisfaction”), 127.

<sup>127</sup> DhA 2.7/1:274. On *ratana* in similes, see JPTS 1909:127.

**2.8.1.4** The 7 jewels were apparently well known in ancient India and beyond. Presumably they were well known throughout the ancient world connected with the Silk Road that ran from Rome, through Persia (modern Iran) and Central Asia, through Chang’an (the Han<sup>128</sup> capital of China, now called Xi’an), through Korea right up to Japan. Hence, the Commentaries routinely mention “the 7 jewels” (*satta,ratana*), how they are found as parts of various ornaments or objects, without listing them.<sup>129</sup> We can assume, too, that the 7 jewels were well known during the Buddha’s time.

**Liu Xinru** makes the following observations with regards to the 7 jewels or treasures, and luxury items in general in connection with ancient and later Buddhism:<sup>130</sup>

In short, the Buddhist values of the seven treasures and the emphasis on donating these items developed out of an economic environment where both ruler and urban dweller sought luxury goods. ... On the one hand they bestowed prestige on their owners— the monasteries, the donors, the purchasers influenced by fashion. On the other hand their production and transaction encouraged substantial economic activities. Thus Buddhist values reinforced and extended trade while sustaining certain economic activities even through a period of urban decline.

(Liu Xinru, *Ancient India and Ancient China*, 1988:177, 180).

## **2.8.2 The jewels in figurative language**

**2.8.2.1** In a figurative sense (1), that is, physically, *ratana* means, “treasure, gem, jewel (of a ...),” reflects the value of a person or an object, such as “a woman jewel” or “jewel of a woman” (*itthī,ratana*),<sup>131</sup> or a very fine garment, “a treasure cloth” or “a treasure of a cloth” (*dussa,ratana*, Miln 262). However, these treasures are meant to support or glorify a unique person, that is, a wheel-turner or world monarch. They form a famous set of “7 treasures” (*satta,ratana*) of a world-monarch (*cakka,vatti*) (D 14),<sup>132</sup> such as those of king Mahā Sudassana (D 17), (where it is explained in great detail), that is, as follows:

(1) the wheel jewel	<i>cakka,ratana</i>	probably a solar disc;
(2) the elephant jewel	<i>hatthi,ratana</i>	a fabulous flying elephant called Uposatha;
(3) the horse jewel	<i>assa,ratana</i>	a fabulous flying horse called Valāhaka;
(4) the gem-jewel	<i>maṇi,ratana</i>	a powerful light-emitting orb;
(5) the woman jewel	<i>itthī,ratana</i>	the ideal woman for a world-monarch;
(6) the steward jewel	<i>gaha.pati,ratana</i>	the ideal prime minister and finance minister;
(7) the commander jewel	<i>pariṇāyaka,ratana</i>	the ideal defence minister and crown prince.

(D 17,1.7-1.17/2:172 -177) + SD 36.12 (3)

These are the regalia of the wheel-turner or universal monarch (*cakka,vatti*).<sup>133</sup>

<sup>128</sup> During the Han dynasty (202 BCE-220 CE), the Silk Road reached its greatest extent of over 6,500 km (4,000 mi). See SD 40.2 (3.4.3). Further see Liu Xinru, *The Silk Road in World History*, Oxford, 2010.

<sup>129</sup> Eg of a palace (*pāsāda*): DA 3:856, MA 2:185, UA 100, PmA 3:677; elephant shed (*kuñjara,sālā*): DhA 3:364, 4:203; Mt Citta (*citta,kūṭa*): UA 300; a divine mansion (*dibba,vimāna*): BA 9; a shrine (*cetiya*): BA 151, 161, 183, 196, 284; a pavilion (*mandapa*): BA 175, 240; a stupa (*thūpa*): BA 247; a boat (*nāvā*): CA 33, J 4:21; a house (*geha*), which the Buddha’s “jewelled house” (*ratana,ghara*) is not: J 1:78, DhA 13; lotus lake (*pokkharāṇī*): J 2:189; railing (*vedikā*): J 4:229; a gate-house (*dvāra,koṭṭhaka*): J 4:236. Comy on **Suvaṇṇa Vv** (Vv 74), however, lists the better known set of 7 jewels as: beryl (*veḷuriya*), gold (*suvaṇṇa*), crystal (*phalikkā*), silver (*rūpiya*), sapphire (sometimes tr as cat’s eye) (*masāra,galla*), pearl (*mutta*), and ruby (*lohitāṅka.maṇi*) (VvA 300).

<sup>130</sup> Liu’s book is subtitled: “Trade and Religious Exchanges, A.D. 1-600.” So, her book’s purview is post-Buddha.

<sup>131</sup> Sn 836 (*etādisaṃ ratanaṃ = dibb’itthi,ratana*, SnA 544).

<sup>132</sup> **Mahā’padāna S** (D 14,1.31/2:16), SD 49.8.

<sup>133</sup> See **Bāla Paṇḍita S** (M 129), for details of the 7 jewels, foll by the 4 blessings of beauty, longevity, excellent health and great charisma (M 129,34-47/3:172-177), S 2.22. This set of 7 is also listed at D 1:89, Sn p106, DA 1:250;

**2.8.2.2** Figurative sense (2) of *ratana* refers to the jewels as spiritual qualities. Hence, **the 7 spiritual jewels** (*satta, ratana*) alluded to in **the Arahatā Sutta 1** (S 22.76) refers to the 7 awakening-factors (*satta bojjaṅga*).<sup>134</sup> The 7 awakening-factors are also listed in **the Cakka, vatti Sutta** (S 46.42), where they are compared to the wheel-turner's 7 jewels, the symbols of his universal majesty and power.<sup>135</sup> [2.8.2.1]

**2.8.2.3** A unique set of 7 spiritual jewels is listed with details in **the Milinda, pañha**. The first 5 jewels are a standard set, that is, those of moral virtue (*sīla, ratana*), of concentration (*samādhi, ratana*), of wisdom (*paññā, ratana*), of liberation (*vimutti, ratana*), and of the knowledge and vision of liberation (*vimutti, ñāṇa, dassana, ratana*). To these are added the “analytic knowledge jewel” (*pañisambhidā, ratana*) and the “awakening-factor jewel” (*bojjhanga, ratana*) (Miln 336).

### **2.8.3 The 3 jewels**

There are frequent references in the suttas and Commentaries to “**the 3 jewels**” (*ratana-t, taya* or *ti, ratana*), comprising the Buddha, the Dharma, and the sangha (the holy community of saints, ordained and lay).<sup>136</sup> They are meditation objects for reflection (*anussati*) for a practitioner.<sup>137</sup> The 3 refuges are said to be “jewels” (*ratana*) because they are difficult to obtain (we need to train ourselves in order to win them), they are precious (they liberate us from suffering), and they bring us succour and joy (by teaching us to self-awaken).

**The Ratana Sutta** (Sn 2.2) is a set of 3 reflections on the 3 jewels, by invoking or reflecting on them. The 3 jewels are so called because they are the most precious things in the whole universe. Popular tradition, however, take the Sutta as a “protective text” (*parittā*) based on acts of truths (*sacca, kiriyā*) regarding the nature of the 3 jewels.<sup>138</sup>

### **2.8.4 The 7 sets**

**2.8.4.1** What are the essential teachings of early Buddhism? If we take survey the 45 years of the Buddha's teaching (plus the teachings of his arhats in the after-centuries), we can put them down to the “7 sets” or models of teaching, as listed here<sup>139</sup> [§17.2]. Any of these 7 models is a good place for a beginner to practise the Dharma, at least theoretically.

We need to have a good idea what each of these 7 models is and how their components work. Only then we have a better idea which model will suit us best. Moreover, we do not need to stick to one model, but select whichever works for us. As we become more familiar with the sets, then we begin to see how they connect and help one another.

J 4:232. On the wheel-turner's 7 jewels, see also **Cakka, vatti Sīha, nāda S** (D 26/3:58-79) & SD 36.10 (2.3). For the wheel-turner's 7 jewels and the Buddha's 7 jewels, see SD 37.8 (6.2.4). They are fully expl in **Param'attha, jotika** vol 1, Comy to the Khuddaka, pāṭha (the 1<sup>st</sup> book of the Khuddaka Nikāya, but a late compilation), commenting on the **Ratana S** (Kh 6) (KhpA 170-174): for tr, see KhpA:Ñ 185-188. See also Chakravarti 1987:152-158.

<sup>134</sup> S 22.76/3:83,24 @ SD 26.7. In the term *satta, ratana* in **Upassaya S** (S 16.10), *ratana* means “cubit,” the length from the elbow to the tip of the middle finger: see SD 4.17 (1.2.2) n on “leagues.” (S 16.10/2:217,16), SD 92.7. PED sv errs here (563b,17).

<sup>135</sup> S 46.42 @ SD 36.12(3.8).

<sup>136</sup> VbhA 284; VvA 123; PvA 1, 49, 141; Mhvs 5, 81. Cf BHS *ratna, traya*, Divy 481.

<sup>137</sup> See **Dhajagga S** (S 11.3), SD 15.5.

<sup>138</sup> Sn 2.2/39-42; Vism 414 (along with 4 others); Miln 150 (with 5 others); cf KhpA 63; SnA 201.

<sup>139</sup> On the 7 sets, see Vism 22.32-43/678-681; UA 129. For a study & refs, see SD 10.1 (1). See also R Gethin, *The Buddhist Path of Awakening*, 2001:240.



**2.8.4.2** When we have some working idea of the 7 sets, then we examine how they work as 7 progressive stages, thus:

- (1) attending to and contemplating on the 5 senses (body + feelings), the mind, and mental states;
- (2) rightly striving with the 5 cords of sense-pleasures (letting go of the 5 physical senses),
- (3) abandoning of the 5 mental hindrances (the mind being fully free from the body),
- (4) full knowledge of the 5 aggregates of clinging (*upādāna-k,khandha*): balanced practice,
- (5) cultivation of the 4 focuses of mindfulness and insight (*vipassanā*): mastering the mind,
- (6) development of calm (*samatha*) and insight (*vipassanā*),
- (7) knowledge of liberation (*vijjā*) and liberation itself (*vimutti*): approaching the path.<sup>140</sup>

Now, each of these 7 stages involves the working of all the 7 sets in some way, depending on the nature of the practitioner. However, this is on a more advanced level of practice, that leads to the attaining of streamwinning and onwards.

**2.8.4.3** Only on a higher level of practice, we will notice that the fulfilling of any one of the 7 sets involves the full development of all the other six. In other words, each set embraces all the other six. Two vital aspects of the path should be noted. Firstly, the path is gradual and cumulative (like the ocean gradually deepening) [2.1]. Secondly, this building-up of the practice occasionally comes to a definite climax or breakthrough (*anupubbābhisamaya*) [2.1.3.4].

The first climax is the key one: it is the breakthrough into the Dharma (*dharmābhisamaya*) or the “attaining of the Dharma-eye” (*dhamma.cakkhu,paṭilābha*), that is, the attaining of streamwinning [2.4.2.1]. The realization appears sudden, like we notice a fruit has ripened, but the actual process of ripening is always gradual. Once this initial breakthrough has been achieved, it is just a matter of time (not exceeding 7 lives) before we fully awaken to nirvana.<sup>141</sup>

**2.8.4.4** In post-canonical Buddhist literature, the 7 sets is conveniently referred to as a single sequential series known as the 37 limbs of awakening (*bodhi,pakkiya,dhamma*). The limbs of awakening are not always numbered so, but as they contain the 7 sets, and if we total their numbers, we would get “37.” The 37 limbs of awakening model, then, is a convenient shorthand for all the essential Buddhist teachings as found in the 7 sets.<sup>142</sup>

## 2.9 THE DHARMA-VINAYA PRODUCES TRUE INDIVIDUALS [§18]

### 2.9.1 The 3 gargantuan individuals

The last parable says that just as the great ocean has gargantuan beings, so there are likewise mighty saints in the Buddha’s teaching. We see here two levels of language, the worldly and the Dharma levels. In terms of the great ocean, “gargantuan” (*mahata*) has a mundane sense of size, whereas in terms of the Buddha’s teaching, “great” (*mahata*) has a supramundane sense of awakening.

<sup>140</sup> See Gethin 2001:245.

<sup>141</sup> On the twin practice of meditation and the 7 sets, see SD 41.5 (4.2). For a helpful reading, see Gethin 2001: 240-247.

<sup>142</sup> For a scholarly study on the 37 limbs of awakening, see Warder 2000:81-104. A comprehensive and reliable monograph is R Gethin, *The Buddhist Path to Awakening*, 2001 esp pp284-302, and p25 for n on a modern scholarly study of the 37 limbs of awakening. See SD 58.1 (5.2.8).

Pahārāda, that *the great ocean is an abode of great [gargantuan] beings*<sup>143</sup> [that is, the timis, the timingalas, the timitimingalas, asuras, nagas, gandharvas and various leviathans hundreds of yojanas long],

so, too, Pahārāda, this Dharma-Vinaya is the dwelling of great [gargantuan] beings.

Here, there are these beings, that is,

streamwinners and	those practising for the realization of the fruit of streamwinning,	
once-returners and	those practising for the realization of the fruit of once-return,	
non-return and	those practising for the fruit of non-return,	
arhats and	those practising for the fruit of arhathood.	[§19.1-2]

### 2.9.2 The 4 kinds of saints

There are 4 kinds of “great beings” or saints in the noble sangha, that is, **the streamwinner** (*sotāpanna*), the once-returned, the non-returned and the arhat. The streamwinner is great, or “bigger” (meaning “better”) than any worldling because the streamwinner has broken the 3 fetters [2.6.3], and so become an emotionally independent individual, one who is sure of awakening, and meantime will never fall into any subhuman plane.<sup>144</sup> Within 7 lives, a streamwinner will attain full awakening.

When the streamwinner is able to weaken the 3 unwholesome roots of greed, hate and delusion, especially the first two roots, he becomes a **once-returned** (*sakadāgāmi*). He has only one more life to go, and then fully awakens.

When the once-returned overcomes sensual lust and its opposite, aversion, especially through the attaining of dhyana, he becomes a **non-returned** (*anāgāmi*). He has no more feeling whatsoever for physical pleasures as he is able to enjoy dhyanic pleasures. It is like we have grown up and will never play with the toys we had when we were kids.

Finally, when he breaks the remaining 5 fetters—those of greed for form existence, greed for formless existence, conceit, restlessness and ignorance, he fully awakens as **an arhat**, like the Buddha. He is now beyond all the mental sufferings of the worldling, and would never be reborn ever again. He has attained nirvana.

— — —

<sup>143</sup> Alluded to at Miln 2:250.

<sup>144</sup> That is, the asura world, the preta realm, the animal kingdom, or as hell-beings. See **Pañca, gati S** (A 9.68), SD 2.20 & **Mahā Sīha, nāda S** (M 12,37-41), SD 49.1 = SD 2.24. See also “World of our own” (R115) 2012 & “We are not born human” (R216) 2011.

## Pahārāda Sutta

### The Discourse to Pahārāda

A 8.19

#### The asura Pahārāda

**1** At one time, the Blessed One was staying at the foot<sup>145</sup> of Naḷeru's<sup>146</sup> neem tree<sup>147</sup> outside Verañjā.<sup>148</sup>

Then, Pahārāda,<sup>149</sup> leader of the asuras,<sup>150</sup> approached the Blessed One, saluted him, and stood at one side.

1.2 As Pahārāda, leader of the asuras, was standing thus at one side, the Blessed One said this to him:

“Now, **[198]** Pahārāda, do the asuras delight in the great ocean?”<sup>151</sup>

“Bhante, the asuras do delight in the great ocean.”

1.3 “Now, Pahārāda, how many strange and wonderful things about the great ocean do the asuras see, on account of which they delight in it?”

#### The 8 qualities of the great ocean

1.4 “There are 8<sup>152</sup> strange and wonderful things about **the great ocean**, seeing which the asuras delight in it. What are the eight?”

**2** (1) The great ocean,<sup>153</sup> bhante, **slopes gradually**, slides gradually, inclines gradually, not abruptly<sup>154</sup> like a precipice.<sup>155</sup>

<sup>145</sup> *Mule*, “at the foot,” means “in the vicinity” (*samīpa*, VA 1:108).

<sup>146</sup> *Naḷeru* is the name of a yaksha (VA 1:108).

<sup>147</sup> *Naḷeru, puci.manda, mūle*. According to V Comy, the Naḷeru Puci, manda is a park whose chief tree is the *puci-manda* or neem (VA 1:108). The northern trail out of the Middle Land (the central Gangetic plain) passes this tree (VA 1:184). The **neem** (ts *nimba*), *Azadirachta indica*, is a beautiful shady tall (15-20 m = 49-66 ft) evergreen, with bitter (*tittaka*) leaves (DhsA 320), and well known for its hard wood. Its twig is chewed and used as a toothbrush, or split and used as a tongue-cleaner. See [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Azadirachta\\_indica](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Azadirachta_indica).

<sup>148</sup> The Buddha spends time here at V 3:1, A 8.11/4:172, 8.19/4:197.

<sup>149</sup> Pahārāda is one of the 3 seniormost (*jeṭṭhaka*) of the asuras [see foll], ie, Vepa, citti, Rāhu (who swallows the moon during eclipses), and Pahārāda (AA 4:106). They are each also known as “asura leader” (*asur'inda*, AA 4:106). On Vepa, citti, see **Isayo Samuddaka S** (S 11.10), SD 39.2. On Rāhu. see A 2:17; DA 1:95, 254 f, 3:421 f, MA 3:487; SA 1:108, 2:89; AA 3:20 (chief of those with a body (*attabhāvavantānaṃ*); J 3:364-366.

<sup>150</sup> The asuras (**asura**) are the “fallen gods” who once inhabited Tāvatiṃsa but were deposed by Sakka, so that they are enemies ever since, often battling one another, eg **Dhajagga S** (S 11.4), SD 15.5; **Isayo Samuddaka S** (S 11.10) + SD 39.2 (1). For etymologies, see UA 299. On the origins of the asuras, see SD 39.1 (2.2). On the asura mythology, see SD 36.1 (4.3).

<sup>151</sup> *Api* [Be:Ka *Kiṃ*] *pana pahārāda asurā mahā, samudde abhiramantīti*.

<sup>152</sup> Comy says that the Buddha could have also given, say, 16, 32, 64 or 1000 qualities, if he wishes. However, 8 qualities suffice here in response to Pahārāda's own number [A 8.19, 1.4, SD 45.18], which would also inspire him in the Dharma. (AA 4:111, 9-12).

<sup>153</sup> On the ancient Indian view of the physical world, see (2.1.2).

<sup>154</sup> “Not abruptly,” *na āyataka* (adv; a tricky word), “suddenly, all of a sudden, abruptly” (CPD); from *āyataka* (adj), “long, prolonged, long-drawn (of a tone). Perhaps suggests going some distance and then suddenly, dropping off sharply, like a cliff; but note the Pali *na*, “not.”

2.2 Bhante, that *the great ocean slopes gradually, slides gradually, inclines gradually, not abruptly like a precipice—*

this, bhante, is the **1<sup>st</sup>** strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight the great ocean.

**3** (2) Furthermore, bhante, the great ocean is by nature **stable**: it does not overflow its margins.<sup>156</sup>

3.2 Bhante, that *the great ocean is by nature stable: it does not overflow its margins—*

this, too, bhante, is the **2<sup>nd</sup>** strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight the great ocean.

**4** (3) Furthermore, bhante, the great ocean **does not associate with the dead**, a carcase.<sup>157</sup>

Whatever that is dead, a carcase, the great ocean quickly carries it to shore, washes it onto the land.<sup>158</sup>

4.2 Bhante, that *the great ocean does not associate with the dead, a carcase: whatever that is dead, a carcase, the great ocean quickly carry it to shore, wash it onto the land—*

this, too, bhante, is the **3<sup>rd</sup>** strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight the great ocean.

**5** (4) Furthermore, bhante, **all the great rivers**, that is to say, the Ganges, the Yamuna, the Aciravati, the Sarabhu and the Mahi,<sup>159</sup>

upon reaching the great ocean, lose their former names and gotras [origins], come to be known simply as the great ocean.<sup>160</sup> [199]

5.2 Bhante, that *all the great rivers, that is to say,*

*the Ganges, the Yamuna, the Aciravati, the Sarabhu and the Mahi, upon reaching the great ocean, losing their former names and gotras [origins], come to be known simply as the great ocean—*

this, too, bhante, is the **4<sup>th</sup>** strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight the great ocean.

**6** (5) Furthermore, bhante, despite those streams that flow into the great ocean, and the showers that fall from the sky, there is manifest **neither decrease nor fullness** of the great ocean.<sup>161</sup>

6.2 Bhante, that *despite those streams that flow into the great ocean, and the showers that fall from the sky, there is neither manifest decrease nor fullness of the great ocean—*

this, too, bhante, is the **5<sup>th</sup>** strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight the great ocean.

<sup>155</sup> *Mahā,samuddo bhante anupubba,ninno anupubba,poṇo anupubba,pabbhāro na āyataken’eva papāto. On the great ocean’s gradual deepening, see Intro (2.1.2).*

<sup>156</sup> *Puna ca’param bhante mahā,samuddo ṭhita,dhammo velam nātivattati, Comy: It does not overflow its margin when ebbing and flowing (VA 1287).*

<sup>157</sup> *Puna ca’param bhante mahā,samuddo na matena kuṇapena saṁvasati [Se saṁvattati]. Alluded to at Miln 1:188, 2:250*

<sup>158</sup> *Yam hoti mahā,samudde mataṁ kuṇaparāṁ, taṁ khippam eva tīraṁ vāheti thalam ussāreti. Cf Miln 187, 250.*

<sup>159</sup> *Puna ca’param bhante yā kāci mahā,nadiyo, seyyath’idaṁ gaṅgā yamunā aciravatī sarabhū mahī. See (2.4.2).*

<sup>160</sup> *Tā mahā,samuddaṁ patvā [Be:Ka pattā] jahanti purimāni nāma,gottāni mahā,samuddo tv-eva saṅkharā gacchanti.*

<sup>161</sup> *Puna ca’param bhante yā ca [Be:Ka Ee Se yā kāci] loke savantiyo mahā,samuddaṁ appenti, yā ca anta,likkhā dhārā papatanti, na tena mahā,samuddassa ūnattaṁ gā pūrattaṁ vā paññāyati.*

7 (6) Furthermore, bhante, the great ocean has **only one taste**, the taste of salt.<sup>162</sup>

7.2 Bhante, that *the great ocean has only one taste, the taste of salt*—

this, too, bhante, is the 6<sup>th</sup> strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight the great ocean.

8 (7) Furthermore, bhante, the great ocean has **many treasures** [jewels], diverse treasures.<sup>163</sup>

In it there are these treasures, that is to say:

pearl,<sup>164</sup> crystal,<sup>165</sup> beryl,<sup>166</sup> conch,<sup>167</sup> quartz,<sup>168</sup> coral,<sup>169</sup> silver, gold, ruby, cat's-eye.<sup>170</sup>

8.2 Bhante, that *the great ocean has many treasures, diverse treasures*.

*In it there are these treasures, that is to say:*

*pearl, crystal, beryl, conch, quartz, coral, silver, gold, ruby, cat's-eye—*

this, too, bhante, [200] is the 7<sup>th</sup> strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight the great ocean.

9 (8) Furthermore, bhante, the great ocean is **an abode of great [gargantuan] beings**.<sup>171</sup>

In it there are these beings, that is to say, the timis,<sup>172</sup> the timin-galas, the timi-timin-galas, asuras,<sup>173</sup> nagas,<sup>174</sup> gandharvas.<sup>175</sup>

There are in this great ocean, beings<sup>176</sup> a 100 yojanas<sup>177</sup> long,<sup>178</sup> 200 yojanas long, 300 yojanas long, 400 yojanas long, 500 yojanas long.<sup>179</sup>

<sup>162</sup> *Puna ca'param bhante mahā,samuddo eka,raso loṇa,raso.*

<sup>163</sup> *Puna ca'param bhante mahāmsamuddo bahu, ratano [Be:Ka pahūta, ratano] aneka, ratano.*

<sup>164</sup> "Pearl" (*mutta*), Comy: "Small, large, round, long etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

<sup>165</sup> "Crystal" (*maṇi*), or "gem," Comy: "Red, cloud-grey, etc." (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

<sup>166</sup> "Beryl" (*veḷuriya*), Comy: "The colour of bamboo, of acacia flower, etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305). See Miln:H 1:177.

<sup>167</sup> "Conch" (*saṅkha*), Comy: "The rightwise spiralled shell, the copper coloured, the hollow, the trumpet shell, etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

<sup>168</sup> "Quartz" (*silā*), Comy: "Coloured white or black or like a kidney-bean" (A 4:111; UA 2:305).

<sup>169</sup> "Coral" (*pavāḷa*), Comy: "Small, large, pink [pale red], deep red etc" (AA 4:111; UA 2:305).

<sup>170</sup> *Tatr'imāni ratanāni, seyyath'idam, muttā maṇi veḷuriyo saṅkha silā pavāḷam rajatam jāta, rūpam lohita ko ma-sāra, gallam.* Comy of "cat's-eye" (*masāra, galla*): "A speckled gem (*kabara, maṇi*), variegated crystal (*citta, phali-kam*)" (AA 4:111; UA 3:205).

<sup>171</sup> *Puna caparam bhante mahāsamuddo mahatam bhūtānam āvāso.*

<sup>172</sup> Comy: The *timi*, *timiṅgala* and *timi, timiṅgala* are 3 kinds of fishes or marine creatures. The *timiṅgala* is said to be able to swallow (*gilana*) the *timi*, and the *timi, timiṅgala* is capable of swallowing the both of them. (UA 2:303). Comy to Sutasoma J (J 537) says all 3 feed on "rock seaweeds" or kelp (?) (*pāsā, sevāka*) (J 5:462). SA 2:88 mentions 7 monsters or leviathans, one of which is the whale (*ānanda*). Cf also Miln 85.

<sup>173</sup> On *asuras*, see **Isayo Samuddaka S** (S 11.10) + SD 39.2 (1.1) & SD 29.6a (4.1.3).

<sup>174</sup> Some *nagas* (*nāga*) dwell on the crests of waves, while others have their own divine mansion (*vimāna*) (AA 4:111; UA 2:303). In Indian mythology, nagas are associated with the submarine (oceans) and subterranean (rivers). The latter is one the 7 kinds of nagas at SA 3:350. See T W Rhys Davids, *Buddhist India*, London & NY, 1903:223; J P Vogel, *Indian Serpent-lore*, London, 1926:32.

<sup>175</sup> *Tatr'ime bhūtā, timi timiṅgalo timira, piṅgalo [Ce timi, timiṅgalā timira, piṅgalā; Ee Se timi, timiṅgalā timira, miṅgalā] asurā nāgā gandhabbā.* On *gandharvas* (*gandhabba*), see **Gandhabba S** (S 31.1), SD 86.5.

<sup>176</sup> "Beings" (*atta, bhāva*), alt tr "creatures." Lit, "self-state, selfhood" and usu means "bodily form, existence as an individual." Here prob used non-technically to mean some uncertain life-forms, perhaps leviathans.

<sup>177</sup> *Yojana*, sometimes tr as "league," the yoke of an Indian plough (J 6:38, 42). As distance, *yojana* ("league" or "yojana") is as far as a yoke of oxen can go in a day, ie, about 11.25 km or 7 mi (DhA 1:108, 2:13). See also V:H 2:90 n8.

<sup>178</sup> Quoted in DhsA 299.

9.2 Bhante, that *the great ocean is an abode of gargantuan beings. In it these are these beings, that is to say, the timis, the timin, galas, the timi, timin, galas, asuras, nagas, gandharvas. There are in this great ocean, beings a 100 yojanas long, 200 yojanas long, 300 yojanas long, 400 yojanas long, 500 yojanas long—*

this, too, bhante, is the **8<sup>th</sup>** strange and wonderful thing about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight the great ocean.

9.3 These, bhante, are the 8 strange and wonderful things about the great ocean, seeing which the asuras delight the great ocean.

## The 8 qualities of the Dharma-Vinaya

9.4 But, bhante, do the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya?”

“The monks, Pahārāda, *do* delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.”

9.5 “But, bhante, how many strange and wonderful things, seeing which do the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya?”

**10** “Pahārāda, there are **8 strange and wonderful things about the Dharma-Vinaya**, seeing which the monks delight in the Dharma-Vinaya. What are the eight?

**11** (1) <sup>180</sup>Pahārāda, just as the great ocean slopes gradually, slides gradually, inclines gradually, not abruptly **[201]** like a precipice,

so, too, Pahārāda, in this Dharma-Vinaya, the training is gradual, the task is gradual, the way is gradual—there is no sudden penetration of final knowledge.<sup>181</sup>

11.2 Pahārāda, *in this Dharma-Vinaya, the training is gradual, the task is gradual, the way is gradual—there is no sudden penetration of final knowledge—*

this, Pahārāda, is the **1<sup>st</sup>** strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

**12** (2) Pahārāda, just as the great ocean is by nature stable: it does not overflow its margins, so, too, Pahārāda, I have prescribed **training-rules** for my disciples [listeners],<sup>182</sup> which they would not transgress even for life’s sake.<sup>183</sup>

12.2 Pahārāda, *I have prescribed training-rules for my disciples [listeners], which they would not transgress even for life’s sake—*

this, Pahārāda, is the **2<sup>nd</sup>** strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

**13** (3) Pahārāda, just as the great ocean does not associate with the dead, a carcass: whatever that is dead, a carcass, the great ocean quickly carries it to shore, washes it onto the land<sup>184</sup>—

<sup>179</sup> *Santi mahā, samudde yojana, satikā’pi atta, bhāvā, dvi, yojana, satikā’pi atta’bhāvā, ti, yojana, satikā’pi atta, bhāvā, catu, yojana, satikā’pi atta, bhāvā, pañca, yojana, satikā’pi atta, bhāvā.*

<sup>180</sup> Quoted at Kvu 219. See Intro (2.1.3.4).

<sup>181</sup> *Anupubba, sikkhā anupubba, kiriyā anupubba, paṭipadā na āyataken’eva aññā, paṭivedho.* Comy: There is no penetrating into arhathood all at once (*ādito va*) like a frog’s hopping, without first duly (*paṭipāṭiyā*) fulfilling moral virtue, mental concentration and wisdom (AA 4:111). See **Kiṭṭā, giri S** (M 70,22/1:479), SD 11.1. See Intro (2.1).

<sup>182</sup> Comy: Said of the aryas or saints, ie, the streamwinners, etc (UA 303). “Disciples,” *sāvaka*, sg *sāvaka*, which is der from √SRU, “to hear.”

<sup>183</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda yaṃ mayā sāvakanāṃ sikkhā, padarṃ paññattarṃ, tarṃ mama sāvaka jīvita, hetu’pi nātikkamanti.* For details, see (2.2).

13.2 so, too, Pahārāda, **the sangha does not associate with a person who is immoral**, of bad character, of impure and suspicious conduct, secretive in deeds,

not a recluse but pretending to be one, incelibate but pretending to be celibate,<sup>185</sup> rotten to the core, lustful and filthy by nature<sup>186</sup>—

the sangha communes<sup>187</sup> not with such a one, but having quickly assembled, it expels him.<sup>188</sup>

Even though he sits in the midst of the sangha, yet he is far away from the sangha, and the sangha is far away from him.<sup>189</sup>

13.3 Pahārāda, *the sangha does not associate with a person who is immoral, of bad character, of impure and suspicious conduct, secretive in deeds,*

*not a recluse but pretending to be one, incelibate but pretending to be celibate, rotten to the core, lustful and filthy by nature*<sup>190</sup>— **[202]**

*the sangha communes not with such a one, but having quickly assembled, it expels him.*

*Even though he sits in the midst of the sangha, yet he is far away from the sangha, and the sangha is far away from him—*

this, Pahārāda, is the 3<sup>rd</sup> strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

**14** (4) Pahārāda, just as all the great rivers, that is to say,

the Ganges, the Yamuna, the Aciravati, the Sarabhu and the Mahi,<sup>191</sup>

upon reaching the great ocean, losing their former names and gotra [origins],

come to be known simply as the great ocean—

14.2 so, too, Pahārāda, when **these 4 classes**<sup>192</sup>—

the kshatriyas, the brahmins, the vaishyas, the shudras—

having gone forth from the house for the homeless life in the Dharma-Vinaya proclaimed by the Tathagata,<sup>193</sup>

they abandon their former names and gotras [lineages], and are simply known as

**‘Sakya-putta recluses’** [‘recluses who are sons of the Sakya’]<sup>194</sup>—

14.3 Pahārāda, *when these 4 classes—*

*the kshatriyas, the brahmins, the vaishyas, the shudras—*

*having gone forth from the house for the homeless life in the Dharma-Vinaya proclaimed by the Tathagata,*<sup>195</sup>

<sup>184</sup> See (2.3).

<sup>185</sup> Or, “Not living the holy life (*brahma, cariya*), but pretending to do so.”

<sup>186</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda yo so puggalo dussīlo pāpa, dhammo asuci, saṅka-s, sara, samācāro paṭicchanna, kammanto assamaṇo samaṇa, paṭiññā abrahmacārī brahmacārī, paṭiññā anto, pūti avassuto kasambu, jāto.* §13.2 up to here recurs in **Aggi-k, khandhūpama S** (A 7.68/4:134), SD 89.12. See (2.3.4.1).

<sup>187</sup> “Communes” (v) or “to be in communion” (*saṃvasati*): see (2.3.5).

<sup>188</sup> *Na tena saṅgho saṃvasati, khippam eva naṃ sannipatitvā ukkhipati.* The vb **ukkkhipati** can also mean “to suspend” (V 2:61, 4:309; Pug 33).

<sup>189</sup> *Kiñcāpi so hoti majjhe bhikkhu, saṅghassa sannisinno, atha kho so ārakā’va saṅghamhā saṅgho ca tena.* Cf **Saṅghāṭi, kaṇṇā S** (It 92,2/91), SD 24.10a: see (2.3.4.2).

<sup>190</sup> This is stock; on its significance: [2.3]. For details on each quality of the false monk, see SD 59.2a (2.2).

<sup>191</sup> This parable and the foll [§15] are combined in Miln 70,

<sup>192</sup> On the 4 classes (*vaṇṇa*), see (2.4.2.4).

<sup>193</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda cattāro’me vaṇṇā khattiyā brāhmaṇā vessā suddā, te tathāgata-p, pavedite dhamma, vinaye agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitvā.*

<sup>194</sup> *Jahanti purimāni nāma, gottāni samaṇā sakya, puttiyā tv-eva* [Be:Ka Se *samaṇo sakya, puttiyo tv-eva*] *saṅkharāṃ gacchanti.* On *sakya, putta*, see (2.4.3).

*they abandon their former names and gotras, and are simply known as  
'Sakya-putta recluses' ['recluses who are sons of the Sakya']<sup>196</sup>—*

this, Pahārāda, is the 4<sup>th</sup> strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

**15** (5) Pahārāda, despite those streams that flow into the great ocean, and the showers that fall from the sky, there is manifest neither decrease nor fullness of the great ocean—

15.2 so, too, Pahārāda, although many monks **[203]** attain **the nirvana-element without residue**,<sup>197</sup> there is manifest neither decrease or fullness<sup>198</sup> of that nirvana-element is evident<sup>199</sup>—

15.3 Pahārāda, *although many monks attain the nirvana-element without residue, neither the decrease or the increase of that nirvana-element is evident*—

this, Pahārāda, is the 5<sup>th</sup> strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.<sup>200</sup>

**16** (6) Pahārāda, just as the great ocean has only one taste, the taste of salt—

so, too, Pahārāda, this Dharma-Vinaya has only one taste, **the taste of freedom**.<sup>201</sup>

16.2 Pahārāda, that *this Dharma-Vinaya has only one taste, the taste of freedom*—

this, Pahārāda, is the 6<sup>th</sup> strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

**17** (7) Pahārāda, the great ocean has many treasures, diverse treasures.

In it there are these treasures, that is to say:

pearl, crystal, beryl, conch, quartz, coral, silver, gold, ruby, cat's-eye<sup>202</sup>—

17.2 so, too, Pahārāda, **this Dharma-Vinaya** has many treasures, various treasures.

Here, there are these treasures, that is to say [the 37 limbs of awakening in 7 sets].<sup>203</sup>

- |   |                                |
|---|--------------------------------|
| 1. the 4 focuses of mindfulness,            | <i>catu satipaṭṭhāna</i>       |
| 2. the 4 right strivings,                   | <i>catu samma-p, padhāna</i>   |
| 3. the 4 paths to spiritual success,        | <i>catu iddhi, pādā</i>        |
| 4. the 5 spiritual faculties,               | <i>pañc'indriya</i>            |
| 5. the 5 spiritual powers,                  | <i>pañca bala</i>              |
| 6. the 7 awakening-factors,                 | <i>satta bojjhaṅga</i>         |
| 7. the noble eightfold path. <sup>204</sup> | <i>ariya aṭṭh'aṅgika magga</i> |

<sup>195</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda cattāro'me vaṇṇā khattiyā brāhmaṇā vessā suddā, te tathāgata-p, pavedite dhamma, vinaye agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajitvā.*

<sup>196</sup> Alluded to as "classlessness" at **Pabbajita Abhiṅga S** (A 10.48,2(1)), SD 48.9.

<sup>197</sup> "Nirvana-element without remains" (*anupādi, sesā nibbāna, dhātu*) refers to the nirvana of someone who has passed away: see (2.5).

<sup>198</sup> The parable at §14 and this are combined in Miln 70; also Bhagavad-Gita 2.70.

<sup>199</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda bahū ce'pi bhikkhū anupādi, sesāya nibbāna, dhātuyā parinibbāyanti, na tena nibbāna, dhātuyā ūnattaṃ vā pūrattaṃ vā paññāyati.* See Intro (2.5).

<sup>200</sup> On this parable and application, see SD 50.1 (1.1.4.2).

<sup>201</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda ayaṃ dhamma, vinayo eka, raso vimutti, raso.* See (2.6).

<sup>202</sup> On these 10 "treasures," see (2.7).

<sup>203</sup> The foll are the famous "7 sets": see Intro (2.8).

<sup>204</sup> *Evam evaṃ kho pahārāda ayaṃ dhamma, vinayo bahu, ratano aneka, ratano, tatr'imāni ratanāni, seyyath'i-daṃ cattāro sati'paṭṭhānā cattāro samma-p, padhānā cattāro iddhi, pādā pañc'indriyāni pañca balāni satta bojjh'aṅgā ariyo aṭṭh'aṅgiko maggo.*



17.3 Pahārāda, *this Dharma-Vinaya has many treasures, various treasures.*

*Here, there are these treasures, that is to say:*

*the 4 focuses of mindfulness, the 4 right strivings, the 4 paths to spiritual success, the 5 spiritual faculties, the 5 spiritual powers, the 7 awakening-factors, the noble eightfold path—*

this, Pahārāda, is the 7<sup>th</sup> strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

**18** (8) Pahārāda, the great ocean is **an abode of great beings.**<sup>205</sup>

In it these are these beings, that is to say,

the timis, [204] the timingalas, the timitingalas, asuras, nagas, gandharvas.

There are in this great ocean, beings a 100 yojanas long, 200 yojanas long, 300 yojanas long, 400 yojanas long, 500 yojanas long—

18.2 so, too, Pahārāda, this Dharma-Vinaya is the dwelling of great beings.

Here, there are these beings, that is to say,

streamwinners and	those practising for the realization of the fruit of streamwinning,
once-returners and	those practising for the realization of the fruit of once-returning,
non-returners and	those practising for the realization of the fruit of non-returning,
arhats and	those practising for the realization of the fruit of arhathood.

Bhikshus, *this Dharma-Vinaya is the dwelling of gargantuan beings.*

*Here, there are these beings, that is to say,*

<i>streamwinners and</i>	<i>those practising for the realization of the fruit of streamwinning,</i>
<i>once-returners and</i>	<i>those practising for the realization of the fruit of once-returning,</i>
<i>non-returners and</i>	<i>those practising for the realization of the fruit of non-returning,</i>
<i>arhats and</i>	<i>those practising for the realization of the fruit of arhathood</i> <sup>206</sup> —

this, Pahārāda, is the 8<sup>th</sup> strange and wonderful thing about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight in this Dharma-Vinaya.

18.4 These, Pahārāda, are the 8 strange and wonderful things about the Dharma-Vinaya, seeing which the monks delight the Dharma-Vinaya.

— evaṃ —

## Bibliography

Chakravarti, Uma

1987 *The Social Dimensions of Early Buddhism*. Delhi: Munishiram Manoharlal, 1996.

Gethin, R M

2001 *The Buddhist Path to Awakening* [1992], 2<sup>nd</sup> ed Oxford: Oneworld, 2001.

Warder, A K

2000 *Indian Buddhism*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1970; 2<sup>nd</sup> ed 1980; 3<sup>rd</sup> ed, 2000.

140409 140416 141024r 150326 160615 171018 180513 190804 201011 210927

<sup>205</sup> Alluded to at Miln 2:250.

<sup>206</sup> See (2.9).