

18

(Anuruddhā) Upakkilesa Sutta

The Discourse on Mental Impurities (to Anuruddha and Two Others) | M 128

Theme: Spiritual friendship and mental development

Translated by Piya Tan ©2003

1 The Kosambī incident

1.1 The (Anuruddhā)¹ Upakkilesa Sutta is a remarkable discourse on the Buddha's humanity [§§2-10] and the spiritual friendship amongst the arhats [§§11-14]. It is also an important document on the Bodhisattva's spiritual struggle before gaining awakening [§§15-30]. At the end of the Sutta [§§31-32], it is clearly evident that Anuruddha attains dhyana (*jhāna*), and in due course gains awakening.

The (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta is one of the texts recording the cycle of events and teachings connected with **the Kosambī incident**. These events occurred in the 10th year of the Buddha's ministry, when he spent his rains residence in the Pārileyya forest (BA 3). The Pali texts of the Kosambī incident are as follows: [Table 8]

Mahā,vagga 10	V 1:337-360	
Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta	M 31/1:205-211 ²	SD 44.11
Kosambīya Sutta	M 48/1:320-325	SD 64.1
(Anuruddhā) Upakkilesa Sutta	M 128/3:152-162	SD 5.18
Pārileyya Sutta	S 22.81/3:94-99	SD 6.1 precedes M 128
Kosambī (-bika) Jātaka	J 428/3:486-490	closing verses same as those of M 128
cf (Udāna) Nāga Sutta³	U 4.5/41 f	

1.2 The most comprehensive records of the Kosambī incident are found in **the Mahā,vagga 10** of the Vinaya (V 1:337-360). The Mahā,vagga gives the fullest account of the quarrel at Kosambī, and how such disorder should be dealt with (that is, the manner of communal reconciliation and the need for harmony). The Sutta texts, on the other hand, while echoing only selected episodes from the Mahāvagga account, give expositions of the Dharma not found in the Mahāvagga account.

All these early accounts characteristically present the Buddha as a human teacher of great compassion and wisdom dealing with human weaknesses and replacing them with spiritual strength and liberation. The overall story is like this: During the 9th year of the ministry, a group of monks in Kosambī are divided by an ugly quarrel over a small incident; the Buddha tries to reconcile them thrice but fails; the Buddha then goes on solitary rains residence so that the monks could sort the problem out themselves; the Kosambī laity, disapproving of the shameless monks, withheld their support, and the monks are brought back to their senses.

1.3 The Buddha, en route to the Pārileyya forest for his **10th rains retreat** (the start of the 10th year of his ministry), meets Bhagu, Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila (see below for each) and instructs them. Dur-

¹ On the use of *Anuruddhā* as pl, see §9n & also V 1:351.

² **Cūḷa Gosiṅga S** (M 31) is listed here because it contains very similar passages as those of Upakkilesa S. From the events of these suttas, it is clear that Upakkilesa S recounts the struggle of Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila for spiritual awakening, while in Cūḷa Gosiṅga S, they are arhats. See (5) here.

³ The opening story differs. Here, the Buddha reflecting in the discomfort (*dukkha*) of living in a crowded and busy monastery, leaves for the ease (*apposukka*) of the Pārileyya forest. It also has the story of a bull elephant that leaves its herd for solitude, and stays near to the Buddha. The *udāna* is uttered in connection with this elephant's quest for solitude.

ing the retreat itself in the forest, the Buddha is looked after by an elephant and a monkey. At the end of the retreat, Ānanda and 500 monks meet the Buddha in the Pārileyya forest (S 22.81).⁴ On his return to Kosambī, the monks have learned their lesson after a most uncomfortable rains residence, and are reconciled. The concordance [Table 8] below shows how the various texts are related.

2 Sutta summary and significance

2.1 The (Anuruddhā) Upakkilesa Sutta opens with the quarrel amongst the monks of Kosambī [§§1-2]. The Buddha is informed of the strife and he admonishes the monks but fails to quell it [§§3-4]. The Buddha prepares to leave for a solitary retreat [§5] and utters some stanzas reflective of the occasion [§6]. He reaches Bālaka,loṇa,kāra,gāma and there admonishes Bhagu [§7].

2.2 Then, he goes on to Pācīna,vaṃsa,dāya where he meets Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila, and asks after their welfare [§§8-9]. They speak of their spiritual friendship [§§10-13]. Here, Anuruddha makes two remarkable statements: “It seems, bhante, that we are of different bodies but of one mind!” [§12.1] and another statement showing that they are observing the rule of “noble silence,” yet maintaining fellowship. [§14].

The discussion then goes on to the subject of meditation progress, on why Anuruddha is unable to maintain his perception of light and vision of form, and beyond [§15]. In answer, the Buddha speaks of how he himself, as a bodhisattva, encountered various mental impurities [§§16-26], how he abandoned them [§27], then gained concentration [§§28-31] and finally liberation [§32].

2.3 The uniqueness of the Upakkilesa Sutta is its special treatment of “**the divine eye**” (*dibba,cakkhu*) in terms of meditation and the quest of spiritual awakening [§§15-31]. Sections 8-14 of the Upakkilesa Sutta are identical to those in **the Vinaya** account (V 1:350-352). The initial half of **the Gosiṅga Sutta** (M 31)⁵ is almost identical to that of the Upakkilesa Sutta (M 128),⁶ except for the stanzas [§6].

2.4 It is, however, clear from the Upakkilesa Sutta, which records how the 3 monks together strive for liberation, that it is set *before* the Cūḷa Gosiṅga Sutta, where *all* these 3 monks have attained arhathood. As such, the Cūḷa Gosiṅga Sutta can be treated as a sequel to the Upakkilesa Sutta, together giving an account of how the three monks win final awakening. The identical earlier halves of the two suttas show their connection here.⁷

3 Upakkilesa

3.1 The title term *upakkilesa* is usually translated as “mental impurity” or “mental imperfection” (the word “defilement,” being reserved for *kilesa*). The Upakkilesa Sutta lists 11 mental impurities [§§16-26]:⁸

- | | |
|-----------------------|---------------------|
| (1) spiritual doubt, | <i>vicikicchā</i> |
| (2) inattention, | <i>amanisākara</i> |
| (3) sloth-and-torpor, | <i>thīna,middha</i> |

⁴ See **Pārileyya S** (S 22.87/3:94-99), SD 6.1.

⁵ M 31,1-10/1:205-207.

⁶ M 128,1-5, 7-14/3:152-157.

⁷ See also **Cūḷa Go,siṅga S** (M 31) & SD 44.11 (2).

⁸ For another ancient list, that of the 18 mental impurities (*upakkilesa*), see **Dhamma Dāyāda S** (M 3,8-15/1:15 f) + SD 2.18 (3), & **Vatthūpama S** (M 7,3/1:36 f) + SD 28.12 (Table 3.2).

(4) terror,	<i>chambhitatta</i>
(5) excitement,	<i>ubbilla</i>
(6) inertia or inaction,	<i>duṭṭhulla</i>
(7) excessive effort,	<i>accāradḍha, viriya</i>
(8) weak effort,	<i>atīlīna, viriya</i>
(9) longing,	<i>abhijappā</i>
(10) perception of diversity,	<i>nānatta saññā</i>
(11) excessive scrutinizing of forms.	<i>atinijjhāyitattarū ... rūpānaṃ</i>

3.2 Apparently, these 11 mental impurities are an early listing of **the 5 mental hindrances** (*pañca, nīvaraṇā*),⁹ and the 11 can be subsumed into the list of the 5 hindrances, thus:

(1) sensual lust	= (5) excitement, ¹⁰ (9) longing, (11) excessive scrutinizing of forms;
(2) ill will	= (6) inertia or inaction;
(3) sloth-and-torpor	= (2) inattention, (3) sloth-and-torpor;
(4) restlessness & worry	= (4) terror, (5) excitement, (7) excessive effort, (8) weak effort;
(5) doubt	= (1) doubt, (10) perception of diversity.

In the Commentaries, the term *upakkilesa* is usually glossed as “the 5 mental hindrances” (*pañca, nīvaraṇāni*) (eg, DA 3:881; SA 3:201; AA 2:322).¹¹

4 Bhagu

4.1 Bhagu Thera comes from a Sakya family and renounces the world along with Anuruddha and Kimbila, dwelling together near the village of Bālaka, loṇa, kāra, gāma. One day, as he is leaving his cell to drive away his drowsiness, he falls on the terrace, and is then spurred on to gain liberation there and then. In due course, he wins arhathood.

4.2 Later the Buddha visits Bhagu and praises him on his solitude.¹² It is on this occasion that the Buddha, after his meal, discourses to Bhagu throughout the 3 watches of the night, that is, from dusk till dawn the next day.¹³ The next morning, Bhagu accompanies the Buddha on his almsround, and then turns back when the Buddha proceeds to Pācīna, vaṃsa, dāya to see Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila (SA 2:304).

4.3 Bhagu is mentioned in a number of places.¹⁴ He is probably the Jāti, pupphiya of **the Apadāna** (Ap 2:405 f).¹⁵

5 Anuruddha

⁹ The 5 mental hindrances, see **Listening beyond the ear**, SD 3.2.5 & **(Nīvaraṇa) Saṅgārava S** (S 46.55/5:121-126), SD 3.12.

¹⁰ “Excitement” (*ubbilla*) probably overlaps both sensual lust, and restlessness and worry.

¹¹ For other meanings of *upakkilesa*, see BDict: upakkilesa. See SD 60.1b (2.4.1.3).

¹² Tha 271-274; ThaA 2:112; cf V 1:350, 2:182; M 3:155; DhA 1:56, 133; J 1:140, 3:489; Miln 107.

¹³ SA 2:304. DPPN says that this discourse is referred to as **Kilesiya S** or **Sañkilesiya S** (MA 2:153), and that it has not been traced. The Be text, however, reads this as **Upakkilesa S** (M:Be 2:60).

¹⁴ His verses are at Tha 271-274. See V 2:182; J 1:140, 3:489; Miln 107; DhA 1:56, 133.

¹⁵ The DPPN however says that he is probably not the Bhagu staying with Jāti, pupphiya at the Kukkuṭ’ārāma near Pāṭaliputta as mentioned in **Mahā Vagga 8** (V 1:300). See **Thīna, middha**, SD 32.6 (3.3.3).

5.1 Anuruddha, one of the most eminent early disciples, was the son of the Sākya, Amit'odana (a brother of Suddhōdana), and the brother of Mahā,nāma,¹⁶ and as such was the Buddha's first cousin. When the male members of other Sākya families had joined the order, Mahānāma was sad that none from his own had gone forth. As such, he proposed that either he himself or his brother Anuruddha should renounce the world. Anuruddha was reluctant at first, for he had lived a very delicate and luxurious life, staying in a different dwelling for each season, surrounded by dancers and performers.

However, on hearing from Mahānāma of the endless rounds of household cares, Anuruddha later agreed to go forth. His mother, however, only consented after his cousin Bhaddiya went with him. They went with Ānanda, Bhagu, Kimbila, Deva,datta, and their barber, Upāli, to see the Blessed One at the Anupiya mango grove,¹⁷ where they were ordained.¹⁸ Before the rains residence was over, Anuruddha had won the "divine eye" or clairvoyance (*dibba,cakkhu*), for which he was declared to be foremost amongst the monks (A 1:23). **The (Arahatta) Anuruddha Sutta** (A 3.128), however, tells us that Anuruddha attained arhathood in the eastern bamboo park (Pācīna,vaṁsa,dāya), amongst the Cetī people.¹⁹

5.2 The (Arahatta) Anuruddha Sutta (A 3.128) records Anuruddha's visiting Sāriputta and how the latter points out Anuruddha's conceit, arrogance and worry (and overcoming these defilements he finally becomes an arhat).²⁰ In due course, Sāriputta gives Anuruddha his meditation object, the thoughts of a great man (*mahā,purisa.vitakka*).²¹ Anuruddha then heads for Pācīna,vaṁsa,dāya in the Cetī country, to practise this meditation.

After he has mastered the first 7 of them, the Buddha visits him (in a holographic form, Tha 901) and teaches him the 8th. Thereupon Anuruddha develops insight and realizes arhathood of the highest grade.

The 8 thoughts of a great man are as follows:

- | | |
|--|---|
| (1) This Dharma is for one with <u>few wishes</u> , | not for one with many wishes. |
| (2) This Dharma is for the <u>contented</u> , | not for the discontented. |
| (3) This Dharma is for one in <u>solitude</u> [for the reclusive], | not for one who loves socializing. |
| (4) This Dharma is for one who puts forth <u>effort</u> [the energetic], | not for the indolent [the lazy]. |
| (5) This Dharma is for one established in <u>mindfulness</u> , | not for one of confused mind. |
| (6) This Dharma is for one in <u>samadhi</u> [mental concentration], | not for one without samadhi. |
| (7) This Dharma is for the <u>wise</u> , | not for the unwise. |
| (8) This Dharma is for one who rejoices in the <u>non-proliferation of the mind</u> , who delights in the non-proliferation of the mind, | not for one who rejoices in mental proliferation, who delights in mental proliferation. |

(A 8.30,1-3/4:228 f), SD 19.5

¹⁶ On Mahānāma, see **Cūḷa Dukkha-k,khandha S** (M 14/1:91-95), see SD 4.7, & **(Mahānāma) Roga S** (S 55.54/-4:408-410), see SD 4.10.

¹⁷ Located outside Anupiya (or Anupiyā), east of Kapila,vatthu in Malla country (DA 3:816; AA 1:191, 194; UA 161; cf AA 1:274; J 1:65, 140; DhA 1:133; BA 284; ApA 70; ThaA 1:43, 2:62, 3:52, 65).

¹⁸ V 2:180-183; AA 1:191; DhA 1:133, 4:127; Mvst 3:177-182.

¹⁹ A 3.128,1.2+32 (SD 19.4). Anuruddha's verses are at Tha 892-919. He is often mentioned together with his friends, Nandiya and Kimbila (eg, M 1:205), which although located in Gosiṅga Wood, is similar to the V account (Mv 10.4.2/1:350 f). Anuruddha is mentioned (without Nandiya) in a group of 6 friends, with Upāli, at V 2:182.

²⁰ A 3.128/1:281 f (SD 19.4).

²¹ **(Mahā,purisa,vitakka) Anuruddha S** (A 8.30/4:228-235; AA 1:191 f), SD 19.5.

5.3 When the Buddha fails to reconcile the quarrelsome monks of Kosambī, he spends the rains residence all alone in **the Pārileyya forest**. On the way there, he stops at Pācīna,vaṃsa,dāya where Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila dwell.

The (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta (M 128), on the joy of fellowship and the perfection of the divine eye, is given to Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila. At the end of the sutta, however, we are told that Anuruddha is pleased to have heard it, but no mention is made of the other two.²²

5.4 Again in **the Nalakapāna Sutta** (M 68),²³ although there are other eminent monks present, it is to Anuruddha whom the Buddha addresses his questions and it is Anuruddha who answers on their behalf.

The Cūḷa Gosiṅga Sutta (M 31)²⁴ records the fellowship and spiritual awakening of the three friends Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila. **The Mahā Gosiṅga Sutta**²⁵ also mentions Anuruddha along with other eminent monks discussing what kind of monk would illuminate the Gosiṅga forest, that is, what kind of monk is the ideal practitioner.

5.5 Anuruddha is present at **the Buddha's parinirvana** at Kusinārā. He is aware of the Buddha's final mental process and the exact moment of his passing. The verse he utters on that occasion is thoughtful and calm, in contrast, for example, to Ananda's involved remarks (D 2:156 f). Anuruddha is foremost in consoling the monks there and admonishing them as to their future course of action.

It is Anuruddha again that the Mallas of Kusinārā consult regarding the Buddha's last rites (D 2:160 f). Later, at the First Council, he is entrusted with the custody of **the Anguttara Nikāya** (DA 1:16).

5.6 Anuruddha appears in the suttas as an affectionate and loyal comrade of his fellow monks, loving and respecting the Buddha, who returns his love. In the assembly of monks, he often stood near the Buddha (B 1.60).

Anuruddha's verses are found in **the Thera,gāthā** (Tha 892-919). In one of his verses (Tha 904), he says that for the last 55 years of his life, he did not lie down on a bed (*nesajjika*, that is, he used a sitting position for resting). For twenty-five years of that period, he was without torpor (Tha 904), which the Commentary explains as that he went foregoing sleep (*niddā pariccattā*) during that period, and that during the last 30 years he slept only during the last watch of the night (ie from 2.00-4.00 am).²⁶

5.7 The Vinaya records Anuruddha as the occasion for the proclamation of **Pācittiya 6**, which forbids a monk from lying down in a sleeping-place with a woman. While on his journey to Sāvattihī, Anuruddha stops for the night in a rest-house run by a beautiful woman. When the room is crowded, the woman, who takes to liking him, offers him a couch in separate quarters.

She confesses her liking for Anuruddha, who silently keeps his restraint. The woman, realizing that he is a morally virtuous monk, then apologizes. Anuruddha admonishes her with Dharma, and she goes for refuge.

²² M 128/3:152-162 = SD 5.18.

²³ M 68/1:462-468.

²⁴ M 31/1:205-211.

²⁵ M 32/1:212-219.

²⁶ ThaA 3:70. Dīgha Comy however gives it as "50 years" (*paññāsa vassāni*), and lists other monks who are similarly said not to have used a bed are Sāriputta (30 years), Mahā Moggallāna (30 years), Mahā Kassapa (20 years), Bhaddiya (30 years), Soṇa (80 years). Raṭṭha,pāla (20 years), Ānanda (50 years), Rāhula (20 years), Bākula (80 years) and Nāḷaka throughout his monastic life, ie, until his parinirvana (DA 3:76).

On meeting the Buddha, Anuruddha informs the Buddha of this incident, but the more modest monks criticized him. This led the Buddha to promulgate the rule.²⁷ It is likely that this event occurred soon after his ordination but before his attainment of arhathood.²⁸

5.8 The Nikāyas mention an occasion when **Jālinī**, a Tāvātimsa deity, who had been his wife in a previous birth, seeing him aged and grey with meditation, offers him the joys of heaven, but he tells her he has no need of such things, having attained to freedom from rebirth.²⁹

He passes away in the shade of a bamboo thicket at Veluva,gāma in the Vajjī country (Tha 919). He is 150 at the time of his death (DA 2:413).

6 Nandiya

6.1 Six friends (excluding Nandiya), with Upāli the barber, are mentioned in **the Vinaya** (V 2:182). Nandiya and Kimbila were Anuruddha's friends and constant companions. The three are often mentioned together (such as in **the Cūḷa Go,siṅga Sutta**, M 31/1:205),³⁰ which although set in the Gosiṅga Wood, is similar to the Mahā,vagga passage (V 1:350-352). This Vinaya passage is a good example of spiritual friendship: there Anuruddha makes his famous statement to the Buddha,

What now, bhante, if I, having surrendered my own mind, were to live only according to the mind of these venerable ones? So I, bhante, having surrendered my own mind, am living only according to the mind of these venerable ones. Bhante, we have different bodies, but surely only one mind. (V 1:351 = M 128,12.1/3:156)

6.2 Nandiya belonged to a Sākya family of Kapilavatthu, and was so named because his birth brought great joy (*nanda*) to the family. He renounced the world together with Anuruddha, Kimbila and other Sākyas, and they soon attained arhathood. After that he dwelt with Anuruddha and Kimbila in Pācīna,-vaṃsa,dāya (V 1:350 f; M 3:155), where it is said that Māra appeared before him in a fearful form but he was able to rout him (ThaA 86). Later, they moved on to Gosiṅga,sāla,vana (M 1:205). Nandiya's verse is found in the Thera,gātha (Tha 25).³¹

7 Kimbila

7.1 Kimbila (also Kimila or Kimmila) is a Sākya of Kapilavatthu who renounces the world along with Bhaddiya, Anuruddha, Ānanda, Bhagu, Devadatta and Upāli at Anupiya Mango Grove shortly after the Buddha's visit.³² It is said that at Anupiya Mango Grove, the Buddha, in order to rouse a sense of urgency in Kimbila, projects the hologram of a beautiful woman in her prime who then rapidly evolves through the phases of decay into old age.³³ Kimbila keeps up his friendship with Anuruddha and Nandiya, and they dwell together as monks.

²⁷ Pāc 6 @ V 4:17-20.

²⁸ Cf I B Horner's n at V:H 2:201 n2.

²⁹ S 1:200; Tha 908. On the deity Jālinī, see SA 1:293; ThaA 3:72.

³⁰ M 31/1:205 @ SD 44.11.

³¹ For the full verse, see SD 47.1 (1.3.2), where also see further details. For others named **Nandiya**, see SD 47.1 (1.3).

³² V 2:182; DhA 1:112 f.

³³ Khemā, Bimbisāra's queen, sees the same psychic sequence on her first visit to the Buddha (DhA 24.5): see SD 27.5a (7.1.1).

7.2 Once, at Veluvana, when the Buddha asks Kimbila about the benefits of the mindfulness of breathing, he is unable to answer even after being questioned thrice. Ānanda then intercedes and suggests that the Buddha should himself answer the question for the benefit of the monks (S 54.10/5:322 f).

Kimbila's verses are found in the **Thera,gātha** (Tha 118, 155 f).

7.3 The Aṅguttara Nikāya contains 3 suttas—the **Kimbila Suttas 1-3** (A 5.201, 6.40, 7.56)³⁴—recording conversations at Velu,vana or Nicelu,vana between Kimbila and the Buddha where Kimbila asks him the causes of the Dharma-ending after the Buddha passes away.

According to the Commentaries, he is probably another Kimbila, said to be a seth's son (*setṭhi,putta*)³⁵ of Kimbilā who joined the Order and won the power of recalling past lives. He recalled how he had been a monk at the time when Kassapa Buddha's dispensation was declining. Seeing how the Dharma was neglected by its followers, he made a staircase up a cliff and lived there as a recluse. It was this past-life memory that prompted him to ask the question (AA 3:323).

8 The eastern bamboo park

8.1 The (Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta says that, at that time, the 3 monks—Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila—are staying in **the eastern bamboo park** (*pācīna,vaṃsa,dāya*) [§8]. It is a deer park; hence, it is also called the “eastern bamboo deer park” (*pācīna,vaṃsa,miga,dāya*), that is, a deer park in the eastern bamboo park.

Buddhaghosa, in his commentary on **the Anuruddha Mahā,vitakka Sutta** (A 8.30),³⁶ says that the park was so called because it was located to the east of where the Buddha lived (namely, the Middle Country, *majjhima padesa*)³⁷ and it was filled with bamboo that radiated a cloud-grey hue.³⁸ (AA 2:765).

Dhamma,pāla, in his commentary on **the Kimbila Thera,gāthā** (Tha 155-156), says that *pācīna,vaṃsa,dāya* is the name given to a protected forest along with its vicinity. Its name arose either due to it being a forest located to the east of the village that was surrounded by clumps of bamboo, or simply on account of it being a bamboo forest.³⁹ (ThaA 2:31)

It is in the **Cetī** or Cetiya kingdom (*ceti,rattha*),⁴⁰ one of the 16 great states,⁴¹ and located between Bālaka,loṇa,kāra,gāma (outside Kosambī) and the Pārileyaka forest (DhA 1:47). The area is today in the Bundelkhand⁴² in central India (traversed by the Vindhya Range), a region between Uttar Pradesh and northern Madhya Pradesh (mostly in the latter).

³⁴ A 5.201/3:247, 6.40/3:339 f, 7.56/4:84. See “The Dharma-ending Age” (essay) in SD 1.10(5b).

³⁵ A *setṭhi*, sometimes tr as banker, guildmaster or treasurer, was a financial entrepreneur. The modern Indian word for it is “seth.”

³⁶ A 8.30 (SD 19.5).

³⁷ *Majjhima padesa* (a comy term): see SA 3:279; AA 2:37; see also DA 1:173; MA 3:409; DhA 3:248.

³⁸ *Pācīna,disāya ... vaṃsa,dāye nī'obhāsehi veḷūhi sañchanne arañṇe* (AA 4:117); also mentioned at M 3:153; A 4:228; Tha 155; DhA 1:56; ThaA 86.

³⁹ *Tattha pācīna,vaṃsa,dāyamhīti pācīna,vaṃsa,nāmake rakkhita,gopite saha,paricchede vane. Tañ hi vanam gāmassa pācīna,disāyam ṭhitattā vaṃsa,gumba,parikkhattattā ca “pācīna,vaṃsa,dāyo'to vutto, vaṃsa,vana,bhāvena vāti* (ThaA 2:31).

⁴⁰ A 4:228 f; AA 4:122. On the Cetī people, see **Anuruddha Mahā,vitakka S** (A 8.30,2) n, SD 19.5.

⁴¹ On **the 16 great states**, see SD 4.18 App & SD 9 (16); also <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mahajanapadas>. For map, see SD 9 (16c) or [Mahajanapadas Map, Map of 16 Mahajanapadas \(mapsofindia.com\)](http://www.mapsofindia.com),

⁴² <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bundelkhand>.

Table 8: The Kosambī Incident: A Concordance of Events Recorded in the Canon

<u>Vinaya (Mahāvagga 10)</u> (V 1:337-360)	<u>Kosambīya Sutta</u> (M 48/1:320-325)	<u>(Anuruddhā) Upakkilesa Sutta</u> (M 128/3:152-162)	<u>Pārileyya Sutta</u> (S 22.81/3:94-99)
10.1.1-10 Origin of the Kosambī incident.			
10.2.1 Dispute reported to the Buddha who admonishes.			
10.2.2 Dispute continues; the Buddha admonishes again but fails to quell them.	[48.1-5] A certain monk informs the Buddha, who fails to quell them.	[128.2-4] Kosambī . A certain monk informs the Buddha who fails to quell them.	
10.2.3-20 Story of Dīghīti and Dīghāvu.			
10.3 The Buddha’s stanzas uttered while standing. Leaves for solitary retreat.		[128.5] The Buddha’s stanzas uttered while standing. [128.6] Leaves for <u>solitary retreat</u> .	[22.81.1-2] Leaves for <u>solitary retreat</u> . [22.81.3-4] A certain monk asks Ānanda about the Buddha.
10.4.1 Bālaka,loṇa,kāra,gāma: Bhagu		[128.7] Bālaka,loṇa,kāra,gāma.	
10.4.2-3 Pācīna,varṃsa,dāya: Anuruddha, Nandiya, and Kimbila.*		[128.8-10] Pācīna,varṃsa,dāya: Anuruddha, Nandiya, and Kimbila.	
10.4.4 “Different bodies, one mind” statement.	[48.6-7] The 6 principles of cordiality.	[128.11-12] Principles of cordiality nos 1-3. “Different bodies, one mind” statement.	
10.4.5 Dwelling together diligent.	[48.7-15] The 7 factors for realizing stream-entry.	[128.13-14] Mental impurities. [128.15-32] Solutions to mental impurities.	
10.4.6 Pārileyya			[22.81.5] Pārileyya.
10.4.7 The elephant episode			[22.81.6-8] Ānanda & monks visit the Buddha at Pārileyya.
10.5.1-2 Kosambī laity boycotts the disputing monks.			[22.81.9-30] The Buddha teaches them the 37 limbs of awakening & on the destruction of the mental influxes.
10.5.3-9 The Buddha admonishes the great disciples.			
10.5.4-14 The disputing monks are rehabilitated.			
10.6.1-3 The Buddha admonishes Upāli; closes with Upāli’s verses.			

[* A similar story of these 3 monks is found in **Cūḷa Go,siṅga S** (M 31), which prob comes after Upakkilesa S. See (1).]

8.2 The Buddha visits the forest a number of times. **The Meghiya Sutta** (A 9.3) records that once when the Buddha is staying there with Meghīya as his personal attendant, the latter decides to do a solitary meditation there in a mango grove outside the village of Jantu, gāma.⁴³ According to the commentaries, “the eastern bamboo deer park” (*pācīna, vaṁsa, miga, dāya*) [8.1] is located outside Jantu, gāma, which has an alternate name of Jattu, gāma.⁴⁴

8.3 During the Kosambī incident [§§2-4] in the 10th year of the Buddha’s ministry, **the monks Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila** are residing in the eastern bamboo park on their solitary retreat. The Buddha visits them on his way to the Pārileyyaka forest for his own solitary rains-retreat that year.

The Anuruddha Mahā, vitakka Sutta (A 8.30) records how Anuruddha, while residing in the eastern bamboo park, reflects on the nature of the true Dharma, famously recorded as “the 8 thoughts of the great man” (*aṭṭha mahā, vitakka*). Reflecting on these qualities of the true Dharma, he goes into dhyana and emerges as an arhat.⁴⁵

— — —

(Anuruddhā) Upakkilesa Sutta

The Discourse on Mental Impurities (to Anuruddha and others)

M 128

1 Thus have I heard.

At one time the Blessed One was staying in Ghosita’s Park near Kosambī.⁴⁶

Kosambī: the disputing monks

2 Now, at that time, the monks at **Kosambī** had taken to quarrelling and arguing, drowned in dispute, attacking each other with the weapon of words.⁴⁷

3 Then, a certain monk approached the Blessed One. **[153]** Having approached, he saluted the Blessed One and stood at one side.

Standing thus at one side, the monk said this to the Blessed One:

3.2 “Bhante, the monks here at Kosambī have taken to quarrelling and arguing, drowned in dispute, attacking each other with the weapon of words. It would be good, bhante, if the Blessed One would go to those monks, out of compassion.”⁴⁸

⁴³ **Meghiya S** (A 9.3/4:354-358 ≈ U 31/4.1/34-37), SD 34.2.

⁴⁴ *Pācīna, vaṁsa, daye jantu, gāmaṁ* (DA 2:419); *pācīna, vaṁse miga, dāye jantu, gāmaṁ* (AA 1:293).

⁴⁵ (A 8.30/4:228-235), SD 19.5: *pācīna, vaṁsa, dāya* is mentioned in §§1.2+32.1.

⁴⁶ **Kosambī** was the capital of the kingdom of Vaṁsa or Vatsa (J 4:28, 6:236), located to the far west of the Central Gangetic plain. See DPPN sv.

⁴⁷ The opening setting is identical to **Kosambiya S** (M 48,1-2/1:320), SD 64.1. However, Kosambiya S (M 48,6) recounts the Buddha’s admonitions to the monks in greater detail giving the 6 principles of cordiality in full [12]. “Weapon of words,” *mukha, satthi*, lit, “swords of the mouth.”

The Blessed One consented with his silence.

4 Then, the Blessed One approached those monks. Having approached, he said this to them:
“Enough, bhikshus, let there be no quarrel, no arguing, no strife, no dispute!”⁴⁹

4.2 When this was said, a certain monk⁵⁰ said this to the Blessed One:

“Let it be,⁵¹ bhante! Let the Blessed One, the Lord of the Dharma, be unconcerned,⁵² devoted to the pleasant dwellings [abidings] here and now,⁵³ bhante. We are the ones who will be responsible for this quarrel, arguing, strife and dispute!”

4.3 For the second time, the Blessed One said this:

“Enough, bhikshus, let there be no quarrel, no arguing, no strife, no dispute!”

For the second time that monk said to the Blessed One:

“Let it be, bhante! Let the Blessed One, the Lord of the Dharma, be unconcerned, devoted to the pleasant dwellings here and now, bhante. We are the ones who will be responsible for this quarrel, arguing, strife and dispute!”

4.3 For the third time, the Blessed One said this:

“Enough, bhikshus, let there be no quarrel, no arguing, no strife, no dispute!”

For the third time that monk said to the Blessed One:

“Let it be, bhante! Let the Blessed One, the Lord of the Dharma, be unconcerned, devoted to the pleasant dwellings here and now, bhante. We are the ones who will be responsible for this quarrel, arguing, strife and dispute!”

The Buddha goes into solitary retreat

5 Then, in the morning, the Blessed One, having dressed himself and taking his robe and bowl, entered Kosambī for alms.

Then, having gone into Kosambī for alms, having returned from his almsround, after his meal, set his lodging in order, took his bowl and robe and, while standing, he uttered these stanzas:⁵⁴ **[154]**

⁴⁸ The quarrel was between a group of Dharma experts and a group of Vinaya experts: for details, see Mv 10.1 (V 1:340), followed by an account of the Buddha’s instructions to the feuding parties (Mv 10.2 @ V 1:341-349). The V account continues as in **Pārileyya S** (S 22.81) [1.1].

⁴⁹ The Buddha’s admonition here includes the story of Dīghīti and Dīghāvu (Mv 10.2.3-10/V 1:342-349). See **Table 8**: “The Kosambī Incident” concordance.

⁵⁰ **Vinaya** calls this monk “a speaker of what is not Dharma” (*adhamma, vādī*, V 1:341). See V:H 4:489 n1.

⁵¹ “Let it be!” *āgametu*, 2nd sg (here suggesting ironic respect), usu tr as “Wait! Stay! Hold it!” *Āgameti = tiṭṭha*, “Stop!” (MA 2:281; J 4:258). The whole sentence here is stock (V 1:341, 342, 349; M 3:153 3 refs; DhA 1:55).

⁵² *Apposukko* (*appa*, “very little” + *ussukka*, “care, regret”), “with little care, unconcerned.”

⁵³ *Diṭṭha, dhamma, sukha, vihāra*, or “pleasant abiding here and now” (*sukha, vihāra*): **V 2**:188,2; **M 4**,34.2/1:23 (SD 44.3); **M 67**,12.2/459,2 (SD 347.7) (qv), **M 128**,4/3:153,3 (SD 5.18); **S 16.5**/2:203 (SD 75.6); **A 2.3.39**/1:61 (SD 44.3(4.6)); **Dhs** 123,3, 124,3; **Vbh** 183,2, 268,3, 281, 282,2, 302; **Kvu** 538,5. This concerns the 4 postures (standing, walking, sitting, reclining) (MA 1:128). On these 4 postures, cf M4,20.5 n (SD 44.3) on “just the way I am.”

⁵⁴ All **the 10 verses** (M 128,6/3:154) are clearly a soliloquy. They recur in **Vinaya** (Mv 10.3 @ V 1:349 f) = **Kosambī J** (J 428/3:488). **Vinaya**, however, mentions that the Buddha utters these stanzas “in the midst of the Sangha” (*saṅgha, majjhe*, V 1:349, 350). **Pārileyya S** (S 22.81) relates that the Buddha leaves for solitary retreat unnoticed (S 22.81,2-4/3:94 f). Moreover, the Buddha utters these stanzas while standing [§§5, 7a]: when admonishing the monks, the Buddha would usually be seated. On the other hand, it is possible that these verses (not mentioned in the **Pārileyya S**) are uttered *saṅgha, majjhe* before the Buddha leaves unnoticed. At this point, the narrative takes different turns: (1) the immediate events that occur in the monastery are related in **Pārileyya S** (S 22.81/3:94-99); (2) the Buddha’s journey is recounted here in **Upakkilesa S** [§§5 ff], preceded by a brief account of the Buddha’s failure to quell the discord [§§1-4]. [Table 8]

- 6 *Puthu,saddo samajano
na bālo koci maññatha
saṅghasmim bhijjamānasmim
nāññaṃ bhiyo amaññaruṃ* When many voices are shouting at once
no one considers himself a fool.
Although the sangha is being split,
no one thinks he is at fault.
(J 428/3:488 v1; V 1:349)
- 6.2 *Parimuṭṭhā paṇḍitā bhāsā
vācā,go.cara,bhāṇino
yāv'icchanti mukhāyāmaṃ
yena nītā na taṃ vidū* They have utterly forgotten wise speech,
speakers of words trapped by words.
They mouth away speaking as they wish,
no one knowing what is leading them on.
(U 5.9; J 428/3:488 v2; V 1:349)
- 6.3 *Akkocchi maṃ avadhi maṃ
ajini maṃ ahāsi me
ye ca taṃ upanayhanti
veraṃ tesam na sammati* 'He abused me, he struck me!
He defeated me, he robbed me!'—
In those who harbour such thoughts,
their hatred will never be quelled.
(Dh 3; Dh (Patna) 5 (1.5); J 428/3:488 v3; V 1:349)⁵⁵
- 6.4 *Akkocchi maṃ avadhi maṃ
ajini maṃ ahāsi me
ye ca taṃ nupanayhanti
veraṃ tesûpasammati* 'He abused me, he struck me!
He defeated me, he robbed me!'—
In those who harbour not such thoughts,
their hatred will be quelled.
(Dh 4; Dh (Patna) 6 (1.6); J 428/3:488 v4; V 1:349)⁵⁶
- 6.5 *Na hi verena verāni
sammantīdha kudācanaṃ
averena ca sammanti
esa dhammo sanantano* Never is hate by hate
ever quelled in this world.
By non-hate it is quelled—
this is the timeless truth.
(Dh 5; Dh (Patna) 253 (14.15); J 428/3:488 v5; V 1:349)⁵⁷
- 6.6 *Pare ca na vijānanti
mayam ettha yamāmase
ye ca tattha vijānanti
tato sammanti medhaḡā* And the others (the foolish) do not recognize⁵⁸
that we here restrain ourselves;⁵⁹
yet others (the wise) who recognize this,
for them, the quarrels are quelled.
(Dh 6; Dh (Patna) 254 (14.16); J 3:212; Tha 275; J 428/3:488 v5; V 1:349)⁶⁰

⁵⁵ Skt version: Uv 14.9; Mūlasārvāstivādi Vinaya (Gilgit 3.2.184).

⁵⁶ Skt version: Uv 14.10; Mūlasārvāstivādi Vinaya (Gilgit 3.2.184).

⁵⁷ Skt version: Uv 14.11; Mūlasārvāstivādi Vinaya (Gilgit 3.2.184).

⁵⁸ At **Tha 275**, this and the next line tr as "And others do not know | that we come to an end here!" foll DhA

⁵⁹ Comy gives 2 interpretations; the 1st (followed here): "The 'others' (*pare*), the creators of strife, are those other than the wise. They, creating strife in the midst of the sangha, do not realize: 'We cease to be, we perish, constantly and surely we are going into the Death's presence.'" (DhA 1:65,15-17). "Death" here is related to the pun on *yama* (counsellor of the hells) in *yamāmase*. Comy's 2nd interpretation: "They do not realize: 'Being caught in the grasp (*gahaṇa* or *gāha*) of falsehood due to desires and so on, we here, in the midst of the sangha, attempt to worsen strife (*yamāmase*) and other such conditions.'" (DhA 1:66,2-3). Tha 275b follows the 1st of these interpretations (DhA 1:65,15-17), apparently based on a wordplay on Yama, counsellor of the hells (Dh:N 62 n6; Tha:N 174 n275). See also Dh:CP 96 ad 6 n. On Yama, see SD 48.10 (1).

⁶⁰ Skt version: Mūlasārvāstivādi Vinaya (Gilgit 3.2.183).

6.7 *Aṭṭhi-c, chinnā pāṇa, harā
gavassa dhana, hārino
raṭṭham vilumpamānānam
tesam pi hoti saṅgati
kasmā tumhākaṃ no siyā*

Breakers of bones, takers of life,
robbers of cattle, horses and wealth,
those pillaging the country—
even they can work together,
why can you not do so, too?

(J 428/3:488 v7; V 1:350)

6.8 *Sace labhetha nipakaṃ sahāyaṃ
saddhiṃ caraṃ sadhu, vihāri dhīraṃ
abhibhuyya sabbāni parissayāni
careyya ten'attamano satīmā*

⁶¹If one finds a sensible companion,
with whom to fare, who abides well and wise,
then, overcoming all dangers, one should
wander with him in joy and mindfulness.

(Dh 328; Dh (Patna 9 (1.9); Sn 45; Ap 9,17; J 428/3:488 v8; V 1:350)

6.9 *No ce labhetha nipakaṃ sahāyaṃ
saddhiṃ caraṃ sadhu, vihāri dhīraṃ
rājā'va raṭṭham vijitam pahāya
eko care mātaṅga, raññe'va nāgo*

If one cannot find a sensible companion,
a fellow farer, who abides well and wise,
then, like a king abandoning a conquered kingdom,⁶²
one should wander alone like an elephant in the Mātaṅga
forest.⁶³

(Dh 329; J 428/3:488 v9; V 1:350)

6.10 *Ekassa carita, seyyo
n'atthi bāle sahāyatā
eko care na ca pāpāni kayirā
appossukko mātaṅg'araññe'va nāgo ti*

Better it is to fare alone:
there is no companionship with the foolish.
Walk alone and do no evil;
Unconcerned, just like an elephant in the Mātaṅga forest.⁶⁴
(Dh 330; Dh (Patna) 11 (1.11); J 428/3:488 v10; V 1:350)⁶⁵

Bālaka, loṇa, kāra, gāma: Bhagu

7 Then, the Blessed One, having uttered these verses while standing, went to **Bālaka, loṇa, kāra, -gāma** [Bālaka salt-makers' village].⁶⁶

7.2 ⁶⁷Now at that time, [155] the venerable **Bhagu**⁶⁸ was residing in Bālaka, loṇa, kāra, gāma. The venerable Bhagu, saw the Blessed One coming in the distance. Seeing (the Blessed One), he prepared a

⁶¹ The foll 2 stanzas are at V 1:350; M 3:154; Dh 328 f; J 3:488; DhA 1:52.

⁶² Comy (M 4:206) & **Jātaka** (J 3:489) allude to Mahā Janaka, the king of Mithilā (J 539) and to Arindama, the king of Benares (J 1:41).

⁶³ **Mātaṅga** is the name of a bull elephant (MA 4:206). His story is mentioned in Comy on Dh 329-330 (DhA 4:29 f); see DhA 23.7/4:26-31. It is possible that this elephant is Pārileyya himself since they both share the same story of leaving their herd (V 1:352 f = U 4.5; VA 1152; DhA 1.5b/1:59-65, 4:29 f; UA 250). Cf A 4:435.

⁶⁴ Both **Khagga, visāṇa S** (Sn 45 f) have line d as *eko care khagga, visāṇa. kappo*, "one should wander alone like a rhinoceros." It is likely that the elephant parable of M 128 refrain *eko care mātaṅg'araññe va nāgo* ("one should wander alone like an elephant in the Mātaṅga forest") is older than the rhinoceros simile. On the tr of *mātaṅg'araññe*, see Dh:CP 349 (n on Dh 329).

⁶⁵ Skt parallels: Uv 14.16ab (*droha*); Mūlasārvastivādi Vinaya, Gilgit 3.2.185. See Dh(Ace 152).

⁶⁶ DPPN on Bālaka, loṇa, kāra, gāma mentions the uncertainty of its reading. M 3:154; J 3:489; MA 3:55, 4:206 read *-gāma*. DhA 1:56; SA 3:304; ThaA:Se 1:380 read *-ārāma*, "park." Comy give 2 interpretations of the name's meaning (MA 3:55). See **Pārileyya S** (S 22.81/3:94-99), SD 6.1 (2).

⁶⁷ From here on [7-14], as at **Cūḷa Gosiṅga S** (M 31,1-10/1:205-207). However, the events of Upakkilesa S probably precede the Cūḷa Gosiṅga S. See Intro (1) above.

⁶⁸ Bhagu. See Intro (4) above & also **Pārileyya S** (S 22.81/3:94-99) (2).

seat and water for washing the feet. Then, the Blessed One sat down on the prepared seat, and while seated, washed his feet.

Then, the venerable Bhagu, having saluted the Blessed One, sat down at one side. When the venerable Bhagu was seated thus at one side, the Blessed One said this to him:

“I hope you find it bearable, bhikshu. I hope you’re able to keep going, I hope you have no trouble with almsfood.”

“It’s bearable, Blessed One; I’m able to keep going, Blessed One; I’ve no trouble with almsfood, bhante.”

7.3 Then, the Blessed One having instructed, inspired, roused and gladdened the venerable Bhagu with a Dharma talk,⁶⁹ rose from his seat and left, heading towards Pācīna,vaṁsa(mīga)dāya⁷⁰ [the eastern bamboo (deer) park].⁷¹

Pācīna,vaṁsa,dāya: Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila⁷²

8 ⁷³Now at that time, the venerable **Anuruddha**,⁷⁴ the venerable **Nandiya** and the venerable **Kimbila** were staying in **Pācīna,vaṁsa,dāya** [the eastern bamboo park].⁷⁵

8.2 The park-keeper saw the Blessed One coming from afar. Seeing him, he said this to the Blessed One:

“Great recluse,⁷⁶ do not enter this park. There are 3 sons of family dwelling here engaged in desiring for their own good.⁷⁷ Do not disturb them.”⁷⁸

⁶⁹ *Dhammiyā kathāya sandassetvā samādhapetvā samuttejetvā sampahamsetvā*, “...having instructed (*sandas-setvā*), inspired (*samādhapetvā*), roused (*samuttejetvā*) and gladdened (*sampahamsetvā*)...with a Dharma talk.” This action sequence reflects the basic structure of the Buddha’s teaching method: (1) the Dharma is shown; (2) the listener/s are filled with enthusiasm; (3) they are fired with commitment; and (4) filled with joy. Comys (eg, DA 1:293; UA 242; cf VA 1:65; MA 2:35) explain that by **instructing**, the Buddha dispels the listener’s delusion; by **inspiring** him, heedlessness is dispelled; by **rousing** him, indolence is dispelled; and by **gladdening**, brings the practice to a conclusion. In short, when we teach Dharma to benefit others, we should do our best to bring instruction, inspiration, motivation and joy to the listener. These 4 qualities are, in fact, the sixth or last of the ideal skills of a Dharma speaker. See SD 11.4 (4) & also L S Cousins, in his review of *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha* (tr Nāṇamoli) in JBE 4 1997:272, which he gives a slightly different listing of the above. See also Kalupahana, *A History of Buddhist Philosophy*, 1992:65-67.

⁷⁰ Comy interprets this name (AA 4:117). Besides here (M 3:155), it is mentioned at Tha 155, A 4:228, DhA 1:56, ThaA 86.

⁷¹ *Pācīna,vaṁsa(mīga)dāya*, see Intro (8). See also **Pārileyya S** (S 22.81) + SD 6.1 (2).

⁷² §§8-14 as at V 1:350-352. There are interesting identical and parallel passages with **Cūḷa Gosiṅga S** (M 31,2-19/1:206-209): §§8-15 are almost identical to M 31,3-10. It is clear from the Upakkilesa S, which records how the 3 monks strive for liberation, that it is set before the Cūḷa Gosiṅga S, where all 3 monks have attained arhathood.

⁷³ From here (§8) until §15.2, almost as at **Cūḷa Gosiṅga S** (M 31,2-10,1). SD 44.11, where, however, they are said to be residing at the “Gosiṅga forest grove” (*go.siṅga,vana,dāya*) (M 31,1).

⁷⁴ Anuruddha. See Intro (5) above & also **Pārileyya S** (S 22.81/3:94-99), SD 6.1 (2).

⁷⁵ On this park, see §7.3 n above.

⁷⁶ This suggests that the park-keeper may not be familiar with the Buddha. Cf **Cūḷa Go,siṅga S** (M 31,3.2) which omits the *mahā* here.

⁷⁷ “Engaged in desiring their own good,” *atta,kāma,rūpā*, ie, seeking their own spiritual well-being. At M 1:205 = 3:155 = V 1:350 = VvA 11; as *atta,kāma* at A 1:231, 2:236, S 1:75 = 140 = A 2:21 = 4:91, Vv 951. The Vinaya usage is negative, meaning “one’s own desire” (V 3:133,21).

⁷⁸ Clearly here either the park-keeper does not know it is the Buddha, or does not recognize him. On the significance of this, see **Lakkhaṇa S** (D 30), SD 36.9.

9 The venerable Anuruddha heard the park-keeper speaking to the Blessed One. Hearing this, he said this to the park-keeper:

“Friend park-keeper, do not obstruct the Blessed One. He is our teacher, the Blessed One, who has come.”

10 Then, the venerable Anuruddha approached the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila. Having approached them, he said this to the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila:

“Come out, bhante! Come out, bhante! Our teacher, the Blessed One, has come!”

Then, the venerable Anuruddha, the venerable Nandiya and the venerable Kimbila went out to meet the Blessed One.

One took the Blessed One’s bowl and robe, one prepared a seat, one set up water for washing the feet.

10.2 The Blessed One sat down on the prepared seat. Having sat down, he washed his feet. Then, the 3 venerables saluted the Blessed One and sat down at one side.

Sitting thus at one side, the Blessed One said this to the venerable Anuruddha:

“I hope you (three) find it bearable, **Anuruddhā**.⁷⁹ I hope you’re able to keep going, I hope you have no trouble with almsfood.” [156]

“It is bearable, Blessed One. We’re able to keep going, Blessed One. We have no trouble with almsfood, bhante.”

Blending like milk and water

11 “Anuruddhā, I hope that you are all dwelling in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, **blending like milk and water, looking at each other with kind eyes**.”⁸⁰

12 “Certainly, bhante, we are all dwelling in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, *blending like milk and water, looking at each other with kind eyes*.”

“But how, Anuruddhā, are you all dwelling in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, *blending like milk and water, looking at each other with kind eyes*?”

12.2 ANURUDDHA’S PRACTICE. “Bhante, here I think thus:

‘It is a gain for me! It is a great gain for me, that I am dwelling with such companions in the holy life.’

I, bhante, towards these venerable ones,⁸¹

- | | |
|---|----------------------------|
| (1) keep up <u>acts of lovingkindness</u> through deed , | both openly and privately; |
| (2) keep up <u>acts of lovingkindness</u> through speech , | both openly and privately; |
| (3) keep up <u>acts of lovingkindness</u> through the mind , | both openly and privately. |

⁷⁹ *Anuruddhā*, 3 voc pl, lit “Anuruddhas” (as in M:H), ie, Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila. This is an example of a multiple vocative, unique to Pali, used in addressing a group by its leader. I have used the original Pali. Also in **Nalaka, pāna S** (M 68,4.1/1:463), SD 37.4. See **Aggañña S** (D 27,3), SD 2.9.

⁸⁰ “Looking at each other with kind eyes” (*aññam-aññam piya, cakkhūhi sampassantā*). The Buddha’s remark (actually, a wish or question) here is fully understandable, because he has just left the quarrelsome monks of Kosambī [§§2-4]. Rajah Pasenadi makes a similar remark to the Buddha in **Dhamma, cetiya S** (M 89,11/2:120 f). This is stock: M 1:206, 398, 3:156; A 1:70, 3:67, 104; S 4:225. **Parisā S** (A 3.93) uses the rain simile to show how spiritual friendship (defined in the words here) [11] builds up positive qualities in one (A 3.93,5/1:243), SD 6.12 (3).

⁸¹ The foll 3 verses contain the first 3 of the 6 “conditions for conciliation” or “principles of cordiality” (*cha dhammā sārāṇiyā*) given in **Kosambiya S** (M 48). The remaining 3, found in the spirit in the next (4th) para, are: (4) sharing of gains with virtuous fellow brahmacharis; (5) keeping high moral virtues; (6) having compatible right view and practice (M 48,6/1:322 f, 2:250; D 3:245; A 3:288 f, 5:89; DhA 294; J 5:382). Cf *sārāṇiyam dhamma, katharṇ suṇāti*, DhA 4:168 & BHS *samrañjaṇiyam dharmam samādāya*, Divy 404). For details, see **(Chakka) Sārāṇiya Dhamma S 1** (A 6.11), SD 55.15.

Here, bhante, I think thus: ‘Why should I not set aside what I wish to do and instead do what these venerables wish to do?’

Then, bhante, I set aside what I wish to do and instead do what these venerables wish to do.⁸²

It seems, bhante, that we are of **different bodies but of one mind!**⁸³

12.3 NANDIYA’S PRACTICE. Then, the venerable **Nandiya**, too, said this to the Blessed One:

“Bhante, here we, too, think thus: ‘It is a gain for me! It is a great gain for me, that I am dwelling with such companions in the holy life.’

I, bhante, towards these venerable ones,

- (1) keep up acts of lovingkindness through deed, both openly and privately;
- (2) keep up acts of lovingkindness through speech, both openly and privately;
- (3) keep up acts of lovingkindness through the mind, both openly and privately.

Here, bhante, I think thus: ‘Why should I not set aside what I wish to do and instead do what these venerables wish to do?’

Then, bhante, I set aside what I wish to do and instead do what these venerables wish to do.

It seems, bhante, that *we are of different bodies but of one mind!*”

12.4 KIMBILA’S PRACTICE. Then, the venerable **Kimbila**, too, said this to the Blessed One:

“Bhante, here I, too, think thus: ‘It is a gain for me! It is a great gain for me, that I am dwelling with such companions in the holy life.’

I, bhante, towards these venerable ones,⁸⁴

- (1) keep up acts of lovingkindness through deed, both openly and privately;
- (2) keep up acts of lovingkindness through speech, both openly and privately;
- (3) keep up acts of lovingkindness through the mind, both openly and privately.

Here, bhante, I think thus: ‘Why should I not set aside what I wish to do and instead do what these venerables wish to do?’

Then, bhante, I set aside what I wish to do and instead do what these venerables wish to do.

It seems, bhante, that *we are of different bodies but of one mind!*

Bhante, this is how we all dwell in concord, in mutual joy, without disputing, blending like milk and water, looking at each other with kind eyes.

13 “Sadhu [Excellent]! Sadhu! Anuruddhā! I hope you, Anuruddhā, **dwel diligent, exertive and resolute.**” [157]

“Certainly, bhante, *we dwell diligent, exertive and resolute.*”⁸⁵

⁸² So *kho aham bhante sakam cittam nikkhipitva imesam y’eva ayasmantaṃ citassa vasena vattāmi.*

⁸³ *Nānā hi kho so bhante kāyā, ekañ ca pana maññe cittaṃ’ti.*

⁸⁴ The foll 3 verses contain the first 3 of the 6 “conditions for conciliation” or “principles of cordiality” (*cha dhammā sārāṇīyā*) given in **Kosambiya S** (M 48). The remaining 3, found in the spirit in the next (4th) para, are: (4) sharing of gains with virtuous fellow brahmacharis; (5) keeping high moral virtues; (6) having compatible right view and practice (M 48,6/1:322 f, 2:250; D 3:245; A 3:288 f, 5:89; DhsA 294; J 5:382). Cf *sārāṇīyam dhamma, katham suṇāti*, DhA 4:168 & BHS *samrañjanīyam dharmaṃ samādāya*, Divy 404). For details, see **(Chakka) Sārāṇīya Dhamma S 1** (A 6.11), SD 55.15.

⁸⁵ From here on, **Cūla Gosiṅga S** (M 31,10/1:208) takes a different turn. On spiritual friendship, see S 5:2-30; A 1:14-18; It 10. See **Meghiya S** (A 9.3/4:354-358 ≈ U 4.1/34-37), SD 34.2 (2.1); also see Piya Tan, *The Buddha and His Disciples*, 2004 ch 5 (on Sāriputta & Moggallāna).

Dwelling together in silence and diligence

13.2 “But, how, Anuruddhā, do you all **dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute**?”⁸⁶

14 “Here, bhante, whoever returns first from the almsround in the village, he prepares the seats, sets up water for drinking and for washing, and sets up the refuse bin.

Whoever returns last from the almsround in the village, if he wishes, he eats the leftovers.

Or, if he wishes, he would throw them away where there is no greenery or pour them away into water where there is no life. He puts away the seats and the water for drinking and for washing. After washing the refuse bin, he puts it away, and sweeps the refectory.

Whoever notices that the vessels of water for drinking or for washing or for the toilet are low or empty, he sets them up.

14.2 If he is unable to manage them, he would signal another with his hand, and by joining hands, they set them up.

14.3 As such, bhante, *there is no cause for us to break into speech*.⁸⁷

14.4 On every fifth day (of the week),⁸⁸ bhante, we sit together all night⁸⁹ discussing the Dharma.

14.5 This is how, bhante, we dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute.”

Light and vision of forms

15 “Sadhu! Sadhu! Anuruddhā! But, Anuruddhā, while you were dwelling thus diligent, exertive and resolute, have you attained **the superhuman state**,⁹⁰ dwelling in the comfort that is the distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones?”⁹¹

⁸⁶ The full passage is an abridgement of V 1:157 f (Mahāvagga 4.1-7) where it is stated that the monks were on good terms with one another but they “neither addressed one another nor conversed” (V 1:157). The Buddha speaks against such unwholesome silence and admonishes the monks to communicate with one another. See **Araṇa, vibhaṅga S** (M 139), SD 7.8 (2).

⁸⁷ Evidently, they dwell together observing the rule of silence, as the Buddha admonishes in **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26): “When you gather together, bhikshus, you should either discuss the Dharma or keep noble silence” (M 26, 4/ 1:161). The 2nd jhāna is known as “the noble silence” (*ariya, tuṇhī, bhāva*), explains the **Kolita S** (S 2:273), because within its initial thought and sustained application (thinking and pondering) (*vitakka, vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur. In **Kāmaḥū S 2** (S 4:293) *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī, saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. Comy on Ariyapariyesana S says that those who cannot attain *jhāna* are advised to maintain “noble silence” by attending to their basic meditation subject (MA 2:169). See prev n.

⁸⁸ “Every 5th day (of the week),” *pañcāhikam*, ie, in addition to the 8th and 14th/15th days, which are the usual days for listening to the Dharma, Nandiya and Kimbila would go to Anuruddha’s residence for Dharma discussion (MA 2:242; KhA 147). In modern terms, this is clearly a Friday (ie, once a week). On the full moon and new moon days, the monks recite the Pāṭimokkha (code of monastic rule) and the laity visit the monasteries to listen to the Dharma and to meditate. On the *uposatha* day of the fortnight—ie, the 8th (*aṭṭhamī*), the 14th (*cātuddasī*) or 15th (*pañnarāsī*) days, and sometimes incl the 5th day (*pañcamī*)—the laity observe the 8 *uposatha* precepts (V 1:87, 102; M 1:39, 2:74; A 4:248; Sn 401; Vv 37.11; Thī 31; J 4:1, 5:173, 194, 6:232; Cp 1:10:4; Vism 227 f). On *pañcamī, aṭṭhamī, cātuddasī, pañnarāsī* *uposatha, divasā*, see Ujl 192, 28. The “extraordinary half or fortnight” (*pāṭihāriya, pakkha*) is an ancient extra holy day now not observed (AA 2:234; SnA 378; Ujl 2:55; Thī:N 67 f n31). The “eight days” of observance mentioned here probably includes the “extra holy day,” observed during the commentarial times, ie, 4 days of observance for each of the 2 fortnights of the moon. See **Mahā Parinibbāna S** (D 16) @ SD 9 (7b) n on “the monthly 8 observances.”

⁸⁹ “All night” (*sabba, rattim*) could mean right through all the 3 watches: 1st watch (6-10 pm), the middle watch (10 pm-2 am) and last watch (2-6 am), or they could sleep from 2-4 am. As at V 1:352. This practice is qu as an example of “timely listening Dharma” (*kālena dhamma-s, savanam*) in **Maṅgala S** (Khp 5.9/3* = Sn 265) at KhpA 147 f & SnA 300.

15.2 “Here, bhante, while we were dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, we perceived both light⁹² and vision of forms.⁹³ But not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*. And we did not understand the cause.”

16 “But, Anuruddhā, **you should understand the cause**.”⁹⁴

The 11 mental impurities⁹⁵

16.2 Anuruddhā, before I awakened to the supreme awakening, when I was still a bodhisattva, I too perceived both **light** and **vision of forms**. But [158] not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

16.2 (1) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that *the light and the vision of forms* disappeared?’

Then, it occurred to me:

‘**Doubt** arose in me, and because of the doubt my concentration fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.

Now let me act so that doubt would not arise in me again.’

17 Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived light and vision of forms. But again, not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

(2) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that the light and the vision of forms disappeared?’

Then, it occurred to me:

‘**Inattention** arose in me, and because of inattention my concentration fell away.

⁹⁰ “The superhuman state,” *uttari,manussa,dhamma*, While the highest of ordinary human virtues are the 5 precepts, the 10 precepts, the 10 wholesome courses of actions (*kusala.kamma,patha*) (**Sammā Diṭṭhi S**, M 9,6/1:47; **Sāleyyaka S**, M 41,12-14/1:288), **the virtues of the saints**, called “the superhuman states,” include the dhyanas (*jhāna*), the superknowledges (*abhiññā*), and the paths (*magga*) and fruits (*phala*) (DA 2:388, 3:817; MA 2:21; AA 1:3:412). **Vinaya** includes the dhyanas in its definition of *uttari,manussa,dhamma* (V 3:91, 4:24). On **Acelaka Kassapa & Citta the houselord**, see SD 45.14 (3.2).

⁹¹ “The distinction ... of the noble ones” (*alam-ariya,ñāṇa,dassana,visesa*): in the suttas this often refers to the higher degrees of spiritual knowledge characteristic of the saints. In **Mahā Sīhanāda S** (M 12,2/1:68), Comy ad loc says that it means specifically the supramundane path that Sunakkhatta is denying the Buddha (MA 2:21 f). From here on, V 1:352 takes a different turn from **Cūḷa Gosīṅga S** (M 31,10.1): see §7.2 above where the parallel starts.

⁹² Light here refers to the sign (*nimitta*) preceding the arising of dhyana. See foll n.

⁹³ “We perceive both ... forms,” *obhāsāṃ c’eva sañjānāma dassanāñ ca rūpānaṃ*. Light is perceived before and during dhyana, while vision of forms arises through the divine eye. From here on, the Sutta proceeds differently from **Cūḷa Gosīṅga S** (M 31,10/1:207). Comy glosses “light” (*obhāsa*) as the preliminary light (*parikamm’obhāsa*) [which MṬ glosses as the light produced by the access into meditation dhyana, adding that one who gains the 4th dhyana develops the light *kaṣiṇā* as the preliminary to attaining the divine eye]. The “visions of form” (*dassanāṃ rūpānaṃ*) is the seeing of forms with the divine eye (MA 4:207). Anuruddha was later declared by the Buddha as the foremost of the monks who have the divine eye (A 1:23).

⁹⁴ “**You should know the cause**,” *nimittāṃ paṭivijjhitabbam*, lit, “You should penetrate the sign.” Here “penetrate” means momentarily break through the hindrances, ie, “acquire,” meaning, “you should acquire the sign” to steadily overcome various mental obstructions: see Analayo, *Satipaṭṭhāna: The direct path to realization*, 2003:237 n21. Cf *pajānāti*: SD 13.1 (3.9.3).

⁹⁵ These 11 mental impurities (*cittassa upakkilesa*) are taught to advanced disciples and meditators, whereas the 16 mental impurities given in **Vatthūpama S** (M 7,3-4/1:36 f), SD 28.12, are addressed to the sangha at large. This explains why they are totally different sets. See Intro (3) above.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.
Now let me act so that *doubt* and *inattention* would not arise in me again.’

18 Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived *light* and *vision of forms*.
But again, not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

(3) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that the light and the vision of forms disappeared?’

Then, it occurred to me:

‘**Sloth-and-torpor** arose in me, and because of sloth-and-torpor my *concentration* fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.

Now let me act so that *doubt*, *inattention* and *sloth-and-torpor* would not arise in me again.’

19 Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived *light* and *vision of forms*.
But again, not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

(4) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that the light and the vision of forms disappeared?’

Then, it occurred to me:

‘**Terror**⁹⁶ arose in me, and because of terror my *concentration* fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.’

19.2 PARABLE OF THE MURDEROUS JOURNEY

Suppose, Anuruddhā, a person were to set out on a *journey* and *murderers* were to leap out from both sides of him—terror [alarm] would then arise in him on that account.⁹⁷

So too *terror* arose in me, and because of terror, my concentration fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.

‘Now let me **[159]** act so that *doubt*, *inattention*, *sloth-and-torpor* and *terror* would not arise in me again.’

20 Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived *light* and *vision of forms*.
But again, not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

(5) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that the light and the vision of forms disappeared?’

Then, it occurred to me:

‘**Excitement**⁹⁸ arose in me, and because of excitement my *concentration* fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.’

20.2 PARABLE OF THE HIDDEN TREASURE

Suppose, Anuruddhā, a person seeking the access to **hidden treasure**, were to find 5 accesses all at once:⁹⁹ excitement would arise in him on that account.

⁹⁶ *Chambhitatta*, “trembling, consternation, stupefaction” (DPL); cf: “**Chambhitatta** is a state of bodily stiffness in the form of paralysis of the thighs” (*Chambhitattan ti ūru-t, thambhaka, sarīrassa chambhita, bhāvaṃ*, UA 66).

⁹⁷ PTS ed has *ubhato, nidānaṃ*, probably thinking of the two murderers. Here the vl *tato nidānaṃ* reads better.

⁹⁸ *Ubbilla*, “elation, excitement, joy” (CPD); “pleasurable excitement” (M:H 3:204 n1). Be *uppila* which CPD says is wr for *ubbila*; see also CPD: *ubbilla*. See DP: *uppilāpana*. This a hapax legomenon, appearing only here although *ubbillāvitatta* (vl *uppillāvitatta*) occurs at D 1:3 = M 1:140 = Miln 183; D 1:37; M 1:140. Cf the commentarial *ubbilla* (“perhaps extracted from *ubbilla* on the analogy of *ussuka: ussukka*,” CPD).

⁹⁹ See **Aṭṭhaka, nāgara S** (M 52) = **Dasama S** (A 11.17), where “11 doors to the death-free” (*amata, dvāra*) are found (M 52,15/1:353 f = A 11.17/5:346 f), SD 41.2. These are the 4 dhyanas, the 4 divine abodes (*brahma, vihāra*),

So too *excitement* arose in me, and because of excitement, my concentration fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.

‘Now let me act so that *doubt, inattention, sloth-and-torpor, terror* and excitement would not arise in me again.’

21 Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived light and vision of forms. But again, not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

(6) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that the light and the vision of forms disappeared?’

Then, it occurred to me: ‘**Inertia** [inaction]¹⁰⁰ arose in me, and because of inertia my concentration fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared. Now let me act so that *doubt, inattention, sloth-and-torpor, terror, excitement* and inertia would not arise in me again.’

22 Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived light and vision of forms. But again, not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

(7) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that the light and the vision of forms disappeared?’

Then, it occurred to me: ‘**Excessive effort**¹⁰¹ arose in me, and because of excessive effort my concentration fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.’

22.2 THE QUAIL PARABLE (1)

Suppose, Anuruddhā, a person were to hold a quail tightly with both his hands, it would *die* then and there.

So too *excessive effort* arose in me, and because of excessive effort, my concentration fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.

‘Now let me act so that *doubt, inattention, sloth-and-torpor, terror, excitement, inertia* and excessive effort would not arise in me again.’

23 Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived light and vision of forms. But again, not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

(8) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that the light and the vision of forms disappeared?’

and the first 3 formless attainments used as bases for the development of insight and attainment of arhathood. Cf MA 4:208.

¹⁰⁰ “Inertia” (*duṭṭhulla*), ie, bodily inertia (*kāya, duṭṭhulla*). Comys gloss it as “a state of bodily inaction” (*kāyālasīya, bhāvo*, MA 4:202) or “Thinking, ‘With effort strongly mustered by me joy has arisen,’ but there is only weak effort. On account of that there arose bodily inertia, bodily stress, bodily lethargy” (*mayā viriyam gāḥhām pagghitam tena me ubbillam uppattan’ti viriyam sithilam akāsi. Tato kaya, duṭṭhullam kaya, daratho kāy’ālasīyam udapādi*, MA 4:208,10-12). VbhA explains it as “bodily unwieldiness due to food” (*bhattam nissāya kāyassa akammaññatā*, VbhA 479). This is prob where sensual lust (*kāma, rāga*) is inactive but not absent (pace Horner who suspects that *duṭṭhulla* represents *kāma-c, chanda* (M:H 4:194 n2). The term *kāya, duṭṭhulla* occurs at **Mahā Māluṅkya S** (M 64/1:435,29), SD 21.10; **(Ceto, vimutti) Anuruddha S** (M 127/3:151,29), SD 54.10; **(Anuruddha) Upakkilesa S** (M 128,21/3:160,32) as *duṭṭhulla*, SD 5.18.

¹⁰¹ *Acc’āraddha, viriya = ati + āraddha + viriya*, “putting in too much effort.” On the “middle way” in terms of effort, see the parable of the lute (V 1:182; A 3:375).

Then, it occurred to me:

‘**Weak effort**¹⁰² arose in me, [160] and because of weak effort my concentration fell away. When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.’

23.2 THE QUAIL PARABLE (2)

Suppose, Anuruddhā, a person were to hold a quail loosely with both his hands, it would then *fly away*.

So too weak *effort* arose in me, and because of weak effort, my concentration fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.

‘Now let me act so that *doubt, inattention, sloth-and-torpor, terror, excitement, inertia, excessive effort* and weak effort would not arise in me again.’

24 Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived light and vision of forms. But again, not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

(9) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that the light and the vision of forms disappeared?’

Then, it occurred to me:

‘**Longing**¹⁰³ arose in me, and because of longing my concentration fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.

Now let me act so that *doubt, inattention, sloth-and-torpor, terror, excitement, inertia, excessive effort, weak effort* and longing would not arise in me again.’

25 Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived light and vision of forms. But again, not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

(10) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that the light and the vision of forms disappeared?’

Then, it occurred to me:

‘**Perception of diversity**¹⁰⁴ arose in me, and because of perception of diversity my concentration fell away.

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.

Now let me act so that *doubt, inattention, sloth-and-torpor, terror, excitement, inertia, excessive effort, weak effort, longing* and perception of diversity would not arise in me again.’

26 Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived light and vision of forms. But again, not long afterwards *both* the light and the vision of forms *disappeared*.

(11) Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me: ‘What now is the cause, what is the reason that the light and the vision of forms disappeared?’

Then, it occurred to me:

‘**Excessive scrutinizing of the forms**¹⁰⁵ arose in me, and because of excessive scrutinizing of forms my concentration fell away.

¹⁰² *Ati, līna, viriya.*

¹⁰³ *Abhijappā*, “aspiration, desire” (CPD). Comy glosses it as “craving” (*taṇhā*), arising when one has made the light (*obhāsa*) pervade as far as the deva-world and has seen a host of devas (MA 4:209). The word also occurs at Dhs 1050, Vbh 361.

¹⁰⁴ *Nānatta, saññā.*

¹⁰⁵ *Atinijjhāyitattaṃ ... rūpānaṃ.* Comy: “When perception of diversity arose, I thought I would attend to one type of form, whether desirable or undesirable. As I did so, excessive gazing upon forms occurred to me.” (MA 4:208)

When my concentration fell away, the light and the vision of forms disappeared.

Now let me act so that *doubt, inattention, sloth-and-torpor, terror, excitement, inertia, excessive effort, weak effort, longing, perception of diversity, and excessive scrutinizing of forms* would not arise in me again.’

Abandoning the impurities of the mind

27 Now, Anuruddhā,
having understood thus: “**Doubt** is an impurity of the mind,”¹⁰⁶
I **abandoned** *doubt*, an impurity of the mind.
Having understood thus: “**Inattention** is an impurity of the mind,”
I **abandoned** *inattention*, an impurity of the mind.
Having understood thus: “**Sloth-and-torpor** is an impurity of the mind,”
I **abandoned** *sloth-and-torpor*, an impurity of the mind.
Having understood thus: “**Terror** is an impurity of the mind,”
I **abandoned** *terror*, an impurity of the mind.
Having understood thus: “**Excitement** is an impurity of the mind,”
I **abandoned** *excitement*, an impurity of the mind.
Having understood thus: “**Inertia** is an impurity of the mind,”
I **abandoned** *inertia*, an impurity of the mind.
Having understood thus: “**Excessive effort** is an impurity of the mind,”
I **abandoned** *excessive effort*, an impurity of the mind.
Having understood thus: “**Weak effort** is an impurity of the mind,”
I **abandoned** *weak effort*, an impurity of the mind.
Having understood thus: “**Longing** is an impurity of the mind,”
I **abandoned** *longing*, an impurity of the mind.
Having understood thus: “**Perception of diversity** is an impurity of the mind,”
I **abandoned** *perception of diversity*, an impurity of the mind.
Having understood thus: “**Excessive scrutinizing at forms [161]** is an impurity of the mind,”
I **abandoned** *excessive scrutinizing at forms*, an impurity of the mind.

28 Now, Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived **light** but did *not* see forms.

Then, I saw **forms** but I did *not* perceive light, even for a whole night or a whole day or a whole day and night.

28.2 Then, Anuruddhā, it occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that I perceived **light** but did not see forms; then, I saw **forms** but I did not perceive light, even for a whole night or a whole day or a whole day and night?’

28.3 Then, it occurred to me:

‘Whenever I did *not* attend to **the form-sign**¹⁰⁷ but attended to **the light-sign**,¹⁰⁸ I perceived **light** but did not see *f* *orms*.

¹⁰⁶ “Impurity of the mind,” *cittassa upakkilesa*. The term is also used in **Vatthūpama S** (M 7,3/1:36 f), where it generally refers to various mental defilements. In *Upakkilesa S*, *upakkilesa* refers specifically to the cultivation of concentration. See M:ÑB 1179 n87.

¹⁰⁷ *Rūpa, nimitta*. One pays attention to the forms arising within the range of one’s divine eye (*dibba, cakkhu*) (MA 4:209).

¹⁰⁸ *Obhāsa, nimitta*. One pays attention to the preliminary reflex of the light (*parikamm’obhāsa*) (MA 4:209).

Whenever I did *not* attend to *the light-sign* but attended to **the form-sign**, I saw forms but did not perceive *light*, even for a whole night or a whole day or a whole day and night.’

29 Now, Anuruddhā, as I was dwelling diligent, exertive and resolute, I perceived *limited light*¹⁰⁹ and saw *limited forms*.

And I perceived *boundless light* and saw *boundless forms*, even for a whole night, or a whole day, or a whole day and night.

29.2 Then, Anuruddhā, this occurred to me:

‘What now is the cause, what is the reason, that I perceived limited light and saw limited forms; and I perceived boundless light and saw boundless forms, even for a whole night or a whole day or a whole day and night?’

29.3 Then, Anuruddhā, this occurred to me:

‘Whenever **concentration** is *limited*, my vision is *limited*, at that time, my vision is limited, too, and, with limited vision, I perceived limited light and saw limited forms.

Whenever my concentration is *boundless*, at that time, my eye is *boundless*.

And with the *boundless eye* I perceived boundless light and saw *boundless forms*, even for a whole night or a whole day or a whole day and night.’

REFRAIN

30 Anuruddhā, [162]

when I understood thus: “Doubt is an impurity of the mind,”

I abandoned the *doubt*, an impurity of the mind.

When I understood thus: “Inattention is an impurity of the mind,”

I abandoned the *inattention*, an impurity of the mind.

When I understood thus: “Sloth-and-torpor is an impurity of the mind,

I abandoned the *sloth-and-torpor*, an impurity of the mind.

When I understood thus: “Terror is an impurity of the mind,”

I abandoned *terror*, an impurity of the mind.

When I understood thus: “Excitement is an impurity of the mind,”

I abandoned the *excitement*, an impurity of the mind.

When I understood thus: “Inertia is an impurity of the mind,”

I abandoned the *inertia* that is an impurity of the mind.

When I understood thus: “Excessive effort is an impurity of the mind,”

I abandoned the *excessive effort*, an impurity of the mind.

When I understood thus: “Weak effort is an impurity of the mind,

I abandoned the *weak effort*, an impurity of the mind.

When I understood thus: “Longing is an impurity of the mind,

I abandoned the *longing*, an impurity of the mind.

When I understood thus: “Perception of diversity is an impurity of the mind,

I abandoned the *perception of diversity*, an impurity of the mind.

When I understood thus: “Excessive scrutinizing at forms is an impurity of the mind,

I abandoned the *excessive scrutinizing of forms*, an impurity of the mind.

¹⁰⁹ *Paritta obhāsa*. Comy explains as *paritta, kammaṭṭhāne obhāsaṃ*, the light limited to an object of meditation (MA 4:209).

30.2 Anuruddhā, with this, it occurred to me:

‘I have abandoned these impurities of the mind. Let me now cultivate **concentration in 3 ways**.¹¹⁰

31 ¹¹¹Then, Anuruddhā,

I cultivated concentration	(1) with initial application and sustained application. ¹¹²
I cultivated concentration	(2) without initial application but with sustained application only. ¹¹³
I cultivated concentration	(3) without initial application and without sustained application. ¹¹⁴
I cultivated concentration	with zest. ¹¹⁵
I cultivated concentration	without zest. ¹¹⁶
I cultivated concentration	accompanied with pleasure. ¹¹⁷
I cultivated concentration	accompanied by equanimity. ¹¹⁸

32 When, Anuruddhā,

<i>I had cultivated concentration</i>	<i>with initial application and sustained application;</i>
<i>I had cultivated concentration</i>	<i>without initial application but with sustained application only;</i>
<i>I had cultivated concentration</i>	<i>without initial application and without sustained application;</i>
<i>I had cultivated concentration</i>	<i>with zest;</i>
<i>I had cultivated concentration</i>	<i>without zest;</i>
<i>I had cultivated concentration</i>	<i>accompanied with pleasure;</i>
<i>I had cultivated concentration</i>	<i>accompanied with equanimity—</i>

the knowledge and vision arose in me:¹¹⁹

¹¹⁰ Bodhi: “The ‘3 ways’ seem to be the first 3 types of concentration mentioned in the next paragraph, also spoken of as a triad at [D 33.1.10(50)/3:219]. Of these, the first is the first jhāna and the third covers the 3 higher jhānas of the usual fourfold scheme. The second type of concentration has no place in the fourfold scheme, but appears as the second jhāna in the fivefold division of jhānas expounded in the Abhidhamma Piṭaka. This second jhāna of the fivefold scheme is attained by those who cannot overcome initial application and sustained application simultaneously but must eliminate them successively.” (M:ÑB 1340 n1195). See also M:H 3:208 n3. In other words, the “3 ways” refer to the 4 form dhyanas in their various forms. See A 1:91, 4:300 f, Vism 85. The canonical list of **dhyana factors** (*jhān’āṅga*) [SD 8.4 (6)] are as follows:

1st dhyana: initial thought (*vitakka*), sustained application (*vicāra*), zest (*pīti*), joy (*sukha*).

2nd dhyana: zest, joy, one-pointedness of mind.

3rd dhyana: joy, one-pointedness of mind.

4th dhyana: equanimity (*upekkhā*), one-pointedness of mind. (M 1:40).

¹¹¹ In this section, Comy explains that “the concentration with zest” (*sappīṭiko pi samādhi*) is the two lower dhyanas; “the concentration without zest” (*nippīṭiko pi samādhi*), the two higher dhyanas; “the concentration accompanied with pleasure (*sāta*), the three lower dhyana; “the concentration accompanied with equanimity,” the 4th dhyana (MA 4:209; AA 2:153). PTS omits *sāta, saḥagato pi samādhi bhāvito ahoṣi* found in other eds.

¹¹² This is **the 1st dhyana**, with initial application, sustained application, zest and joy. On one-pointedness of mind in the 1st dhyana, see SD 8.4 (5.1.2).

¹¹³ This is taught by the Buddha to help the 3 monks progress steadily from the 1st to the 2nd dhyana by letting go of first, initial application (*vitakka*), and then sustained application (*vicāra*). This stage is not found in the canonical scheme of 4 dhyanas. This special practice is the basis for the Abhidhamma formulation of the 5-dhyana system.

¹¹⁴ This refers to **the 2nd, 3rd or 4th dhyana** of the fourfold dhyana.

¹¹⁵ This refers to **the 1st or 2nd dhyana**.

¹¹⁶ This refers to **the 3rd or 4th dhyana**.

¹¹⁷ “With pleasure,” *sāta, saḥagato*. Here said in reference to “joy” (*sukha*). MA 4:209 says that this “pleasure” belongs to **the 3rd and 4th dhyanas**; but AA 2:153 says that *sāta, sukha* is the happiness of the first 3 dhyanas, while *upekkhā, sukha* is the happiness of the 4th dhyana. At Vism 85 *sāta* is replaced by *sukha*. This Pali sentence here is omitted in PTS ed.

¹¹⁸ “Equanimity,” *upekkhā*. Comy says that this belongs to **the 4th dhyana** in the fourfold system, and to the fifth in the fivefold system” (MA 4:209).

‘Unshakable is my liberation! This is my last birth! There is no more rebirth here (for me).’¹²⁰

33 The Blessed One said this. Satisfied, the venerable Anuruddha rejoiced¹²¹ in the Blessed One’s word.¹²²

— evaṃ —

041113 rev06091 071207 081214 091202r 100830 111203 121219 131110 141004 150501 160121 171014 180916
191105 220909

¹¹⁹ This phrase, referring to the Buddha’s awakening process “while he was seated under the great Bodhi tree during the 1st watch (of the great awakening day)” (MA 4:209,26 f), is found in **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,18.7 + nn) which gives details of the awakening process (M 26,17 f), SD 1.11.

¹²⁰ Comy: The Buddha cultivated the 3 types of mental concentrations [§30] in the last watch of the night of his awakening under the Bodhi tree (MA 4:209). The preceding passage and this one clearly attest to the fact that the Buddha first attains mental dhyana (*jhāna*) and then wins awakening.

¹²¹ “Joyfully approved,” *attamanā ... abhinandurū*.

¹²² Despite the Buddha’s instructions to Anuruddha, there is no mention of his awakening. This is only mentioned in **(Arahatta) Anuruddha S** (S 3.128) when Sāriputta gives an instructive feedback on Anuruddha’s meditation problems, which leads, in due course, to his awakening: see S 3.128 (SD 19.4). Also connected with his awakening is **Anuruddha Mahā, vitakka S** (A 8.30), SD 19.5.