

18

Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 2¹

Dutiya Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta

The 2nd Discourse on the 5 Kinds of Hate and Fear | S 12.42

Theme: The 4 limbs of a streamwinner

1 Sutta summary and significance

1.1 SUTTA SUMMARY

1.1.1 The Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 2 has the very same teachings as **the Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 1** (S 12.42), SD 2.2(4.2). The unawakened worldling lived troubled by 5 kinds of hate and fear (*vera bhaya*) [§3], that is, those connected with *killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, lying and intoxication* [§§5-9]. These fears are only quelled with the attainment of **streamwinning**. [1.2.1]

1.2 SUTTA SIGNIFICANCE

1.2.1 Definitions of a streamwinner

1.2.1.1 A streamwinner (*sotāpanna*) is one *who has wise faith in the 3 jewels, and whose moral virtue is “dear to the noble ones,”* that is, valued by them, and the benefits of the precepts well kept conduces to mental concentration and insight wisdom [§§3, 10-14]. The suttas usually call this set of qualities “the limbs of a streamwinner” (*sotāpanassa aṅgāni*). Here, however, they are called “the limbs for streamwinning” (*sotāpatti-y-aṅgāni*). [§10 n]

1.2.1.2 The Sutta closes with this statement on how we become streamwinners:

“when the noble disciple’s 5 kinds of hate and fear have been quelled,
one is accomplished in the 4 limbs for streamwinning, and
one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way” [§18]

then, we may declare ourself to be a streamwinner.

The 1st of the 3 lines refers to our properly keeping the 5 precepts, so that we are “bodily cultivated” (*bhāvita, kāya*) enough to have support for our mental cultivation of a calm and clear mind, suggested by the 2nd line, on the 4 limbs for streamwinning: wise faith in the 3 jewels, that is, we are mindful of the wholesome qualities of the Buddha, the Dharma and the sangha, and moral virtue dear to the noble ones.

Notice that these 4 limbs are significantly listed *after* the keeping of the 5 precepts, suggesting that these are qualities *to be cultivated* to gain streamwinning. Those qualities are won by having “clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom **the noble way**,” which the Sutta defines as the truth of **dependent arising**, both in theory and in practice. Only then, are we streamwinners.

1.2.1.3 The streamwinner here is said to be one who “has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way” [§3.2]. This “**the noble way**” (*ariya ñāya*) or “method of the noble ones” is

¹ Uddāna title reads *Saṭṭayham* (?); also called Pañca Bhera Bhaya S. The importance of this discourse is attested by the fact that it also appears as **Anātha, piṇḍika S 3** or **Pañca Vera S** (S 55.28/5:387-389), and **Bhaya Vera S** (A 10.92/5:182-184). It also has other names, such as **Pañca Bhaya Vera S**. Cf below, §10 n on **Anātha, piṇḍika S 1** (S 55.26), SD 23.2a & **Anātha, piṇḍika S 2** (S 55.27), SD 23.2b.

defined at the closing of the Sutta in 2 ways [§15]: first, as its underlying principle, the specific conditionality [§16]; and then, as the 12-link dependent arising [§17].

This is a rare definition, and probably refers to one of the ways that we may attain streamwinning. that is, to see and understand the nature of conditionality. More commonly, streamwinning is said to be attainable by seeing directly into the true nature of **impermanence**, such as stated in the 10 suttas of **the Okkanta Saṃyutta** (S 25.1-10).²

1.2.1.4 Conditionality (*paccayatā*) and **impermanence** (*aniccatā*) are, of course, closely related. The principle of specific conditionality [§16 n] states that when condition A arises, B also arises, which, in turn, brings about the arising of C and so on in the 12 links [§17]. When we see and understand this causal relationship, and how they can be broken, we see the universal characteristic of impermanence at work: nothing is permanent.

In a mindful observation (*yoniso manasikāra*) of **impermanence**, we see how A becomes not-A1, and then not-A2, and so on: for example, ripples on the water-surface rising and falling away, or a person aging over the years. There is only a continuity of changes, where what we knew has become other, and continues to do so over time. Here again we see the universal characteristic of impermanence: nothing is permanent.

1.2.2 The following suttas contain the same related teaching on streamwinning, differing only in their respective audiences, and small variations:³

Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 1	S 12.41	to Anātha, piṇḍika; abridged parallel of A 10.92	SD 3.3(4.2)
Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 2	S 12.42	to “some monks” = S 12.42	SD 59.18
Pañca Vera Sutta 1	S 55.28	= S 12.41	
Pañca Vera Sutta 2	S 55.22	= S 12.42	
(Pañcaka) Gihī Sutta	S 5.179	the 5 precepts and streamwinning	SD 70.10
(Navaka) Vera Sutta 1	A 9.27	extended parallel of S 12.41 (without dependent arising) ⁴	
(Dasaka) Bhaya Sutta	A 10.92	close parallel with S 12.41 ⁵	

1.3 TEXT AND RELATED SUTTAS

1.3.1 On account of this repetition, most manuscripts either omit much of the text of this Sutta or give only abridged versions of it (which is an unwise practice, presenting an incomplete teaching for most readers). The PTS text, too, omits it, referring to S 12.41. The Burmese and the Siamese editions abridge parts of it, especially the closing. Only the Sinhala edition gives almost the full version. However, it is possible to reconstruct the full text from these different manuscripts, from which this translation is made.

1.3.2 Like **S 12.41**, this Sutta (S 12.42) is practically identical to **the (Dasaka) Bhaya Sutta** (A 10.92). The former, however, is slightly abridged, omitting one or two lines, which are found in the latter, which gives a more complete presentation [§5.2 n]. Another extended parallel is **the (Navaka) Vera Sutta 1** (A 9.27).⁶

² See esp **(Anicca) Cakkhu S** (S 25.12), SD 16.7.

³ This list is also at SD 3.3(4.2.2).

⁴ S 12.41/2:68-70 = A 10.92/5:183; A 9.27/4:406 (without the section on dependent arising).

⁵ The former, however, is slightly abridged, omitting one or two lines, which are found in the latter, which gives a more complete presentation [§5.2 n].

⁶ S 12.41/2:68-70 = A 10.92/5:183 (SD 87.6); A 9.27/4:406 (without the section on dependent arising).

Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 2

The 2nd Discourse on the 5 Kinds of Hate and Fear

S 12.42

- 1 (The Blessed One was) staying at Sāvattthī.
- 2 Then, some monks approached the Blessed One, saluted him and sat down at one side. As they were seated thus at one side, the Blessed One said this to them,⁷ [71]

The 5 kinds of hate and fear

3 “Bhikshus, when a noble disciple’s **5 kinds of hate and fear**⁸ have been quelled, one is endowed with **the 4 limbs for streamwinning** (*sotāpatti-y-aṅgāni*),⁹

3.2 and has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way [§§15-17]

3.3 —he is one who, if he wishes,¹⁰ may himself declare of himself, thus:

‘I have destroyed hell, the animal birth, the preta realm,

I have destroyed the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

I am a streamwinner,

no longer bound for the lower worlds,

sure of crossing over to self-awakening!’¹¹

4¹² What are **the 5 kinds of hate and fear that have been quelled?**

5 (1) Bhikshus, **one who harms life**, conditioned by *harming of life*, generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too— and one feels mental pain and unease, too.¹³

5.2 But for one who abstains from harming life, hate and fear are quelled.

One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.¹⁴

6 (2) Bhikshus, **one who takes the not-given**, conditioned by *taking the not-given*, generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too— and one feels mental pain and unease, too.

⁷ This intro para found only in Ce.

⁸ “(Kinds of) hate and fear,” *bhayāni verāni*, or “terror and fear.” Comy glosses as “volitions of fear and hate” (*bhaya, vera, cetanāyo*) (SA 2:72). Cf A 9.27/4:405-407, 10.92/5:182-184, etc. “Hate” (*vera*) here I take as an emotion (expressed externally), while “fear” (*bhaya*) as an internal feeling (an unmoted or unexpressed mental state). See also A 3:204 f, 4:405 f, 5:182; It 57 = Sn 167; Vbh 378. See also (**Bhaya**) **Vera S** (A 5.174/3:204-206), SD 6.4 intro.

⁹ *Sotāpatti-y-aṅgāni*, see §10 n here.

¹⁰ *Akaṅkhamāno*, also “being without doubt,” “not doubting.”

¹¹ On this passage, see 3.3 (5.3.2). On streamwinning, see SD 3.3.

¹² PTS text numbering repeats at “3” here. This should read “4” and the rest upped by 1 in the PTS text.

¹³ *Yaṃ gahapati pāṇātipātī verāni, pāṇātipāta, paccayā bhayāni | diṭṭha, dhammikam pi bhayaṃ veram pasavati samparāyikaṃ pi bhayaṃ veram pasavati | cetasikam pi dukkham domanassam paṭisamvediyati.*

¹⁴ This line and that following each of the other 4 precept statements are missing here but found at A 10.92/5:183 f [4.2.1]. “It seems that the logic of the discourse requires this addition; its omission from the present text could be an early scribal error.” (S:B 761 n119).

6.2 But for one *who abstains from taking the not-given*, hate and fear are quelled.

[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

7 (3) Bhikshus, **one who indulges in sexual misconduct**, conditioned by *the indulging in sexual misconduct*,

generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too—
and one feels mental pain and unease, too.

7.2 But for one *who abstains from sexual misconduct*, hate and fear are quelled.

[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

8 (4) Bhikshus, **one who speaks falsely**, conditioned by *speaking falsely*,
generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too—
and one feels mental pain and unease, too.

8.2 But for one *who abstains from speaking falsely*, hate and fear are quelled.

[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

9 (5) Bhikshus, **one who takes strong drinks, distilled drinks, fermented drinks and that which causes heedlessness**, conditioned by *indulging in strong drinks, distilled drinks, fermented drinks and that which causes heedlessness*,

generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too—
and one feels mental pain and unease, too.

9.2 But for one *who abstains from taking intoxicants*, hate and fear are quelled.

[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

These are the 5 kinds of hate and fear that have been quelled.

The 4 limbs for streamwinning (*sotāpatti-y-aṅgāni*)¹⁵

10 What are **the 4 limbs for streamwinning**¹⁶ (*sotāpatti-y-aṅgāni*) that one possesses?

(1) WISE FAITH IN THE BUDDHA

11 Here, bhikshus, a noble disciple is accomplished with wise faith¹⁷ in **the Buddha** thus:

¹⁵ A parallel of this section appears in **Anātha,piṇḍika S 1** (S 55.26,6-9/5:381 f), SD 23.2a & **Anātha,piṇḍika S 2** (S 55.27,8/5:386 f), SD 23.2b.

¹⁶ The “limbs for streamwinning,” *sotāpanna-y-aṅgāni* (D 33,1.11(13)/3:227); usu the term here would be: *sotāpannassa aṅga*, “the limbs of a streamwinner” (D 33,1.11(14)/3:227) [4.1.4]; on “limbs for” and “limbs of,” see SD 47.1(2), esp (2.3.2). The 2 terms are sometimes used interchangeably in the suttas (such as here), depending on the context: see SD 47.1 (2.1.1). On these terms, see SD 23.2b (1.3). For a shorter statement on the limbs of a streamwinner, see **Ogadhā S** (S 55.2/5:343 f), SD 3.3 (4.1.4). For the streamwinner’s practice, see **(Agata,phala) Mahānāma S** (A 6.40/3:284-288), SD 15.3. On the streamwinner’s faith, see Gethin 2001:116.

¹⁷ “Wise faith,” *avecca-p,pasāda*. This is a syntactical cpd with *avecca* (Sky *avetya*) absolutive of **aveti*, “he undergoes, knows, experiences”; see SD 49.2. [On syntactical cpds, see K R Norman, 1991a:3.] There are 2 kinds of faith (*saddhā*): (1) “rootless faith” (*amūlika,saddhā*), baseless or irrational faith, blind faith (M 2:170,21); (2) “faith with a good cause” (*ākāravati,saddhā*), faith founded on seeing (M 1:320,8, 401,23). “Wise faith” is syn with (2). *Amūlaka* =

‘So, too, is he the Blessed One:¹⁸ for, he is
 arhat,
 fully self-awakened,
 accomplished in wisdom and conduct,
 well-farer,
 knower of worlds,
 peerless guide of tamable persons,
 teacher of gods and humans,
 awakened,
 blessed.’

(2) WISE FAITH IN THE DHARMA

12 One is accomplished with wise faith in the Dharma thus:

‘Well-taught is the true teaching of the Blessed One,
 to be self-realized,
 immediate [having nothing to do with time],
 for one to “come and see,”
 accessible [leading onward],
 to be personally known by the wise.’

(3) WISE FAITH IN THE SANGHA

13 One is accomplished with wise faith in the sangha thus:

‘Of good conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
 of upright conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
 of right conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples;
 of proper conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples.

These 4 pairs of persons, the 8 individuals, are this Blessed One’s **[70]** community of holy disciples:
 worthy of offerings,
 worthy of hospitality,
 worthy of gifts,
 worthy of salutation with the lotus-palms,
 an incomparable field of merit for the world.’

“not seen, not heard, not suspected” (V 2:243 3:163 & Comy). **Gethin** speaks of two kinds of faith: the cognitive and the affective (eg, ERE: Faith & Jayatilleke, *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge*, 1963:387): “Faith in its cognitive dimension is seen as concerning belief in propositions or statements of which one does not—or perhaps cannot—have knowledge proper (however that should be defined); cognitive faith is a mode of knowing in a different category from that knowledge. Faith in its affective dimension is a more straightforward positive response to trust or confidence towards something or somebody ... the conception of *saddhā* in Buddhist writings appears almost, if not entirely affective, the cognitive element is completely secondary.” (Gethin 2001:107; my emphases). The streamwinner’s faith is defined in **Vimāṃsaka S** (M 47) as “his faith is strong, supported by reasons, rooted in vision” (*ākāra,-vatī saddhā dassana,mūlikā dalhā*, M 47,16/1:320).

¹⁸ Alt tr: “For the following reasons, too, he is the Blessed One [the Lord] ...” On the meaning of **iti pi so**, see CPD: ¹**iti**: ... *kitti-saddo abbhuggato*: “~ **pi so bhagavā**: *arahaṃ sammā-sambuddho ...* .” (“for the following reasons, too, he is a *bhagavā*: because he is *arahaṃ ...*”), V 3:1,13 = D 1:49,27 = M 2:133,22 = S 1:219,31 = A 3:312,8, qu Vism 198,4 and Mahvṛ 26,11 (VA 112,4 = DA 146,5 ≠ Vism 198,8: *so bhagavā ~ pi arahaṃ ~ pi sammāsambuddho ... iminā ca iminā ca kāraṇenā ti vuttaṃ hoti*). Translating *iti pi so* this way explains the double occurrence of *Bhagavā*. See L S Cousins, “Review of *Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha*,” in *Journal of Buddhist Ethics* 4, 1997:165. The Skt parallel to this opening reads: *Iti hi sa bhagavāṃ tathāgato*, but *tathāgato* here is missing from the Pali version. See **Dhaj’agga S** (S 11.3), SD 15.5 (2).

(4) NOBLE MORAL VIRTUE

14 One is accomplished with moral virtues dear to the noble ones,¹⁹ unbroken, untorn; unmixed, spotless; liberating, praised by the wise, untarnished,²⁰ giving rise to mental concentration.²¹

These, bhikshus, are the 4 limbs for streamwinning that one possesses.

The noble way

15 And what, bhikshus, is **the noble way [method]**²² that one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom?²³

SPECIFIC CONDITIONALITY

16 Here, bhikshus, one properly and skillfully attends to dependent arising²⁴ itself thus:

*Imasmim sati idam hoti
imasmim asati idam na hoti
imass'uppādā idam uppajjati
imassa nirodhā idam nirujjhati*

When this is, that is;
when this is not, that is not.
With this arising, that arises;
with this ceasing, that ceases.

DEPENDENT ARISING²⁵

17 That is, with **ignorance** as condition,

17.2 With mental formations as condition, there is

with consciousness as condition, there are

with name-and-form as condition, there are

with the 6 sense-bases as condition, there is

with contact as condition, there is

with feeling as condition, there is

with craving as condition, there is

with clinging as condition, there is

with existence as condition, there is

with birth as condition, there are

There also arise

Such is the arising of this whole mass of suffering.

mental formations (arise);

consciousness;

name-and-form;

the 6 sense-bases;

contact;

feeling;

craving;

clinging;

existence;

birth;

decay-and-death.

sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair.

¹⁹ "Moral virtue dear to the noble ones," *ariya,kantāni sīlāni*. The noble one's moral virtue is explained at Vism 7.101-106/221 f. SA says that the noble ones do not violate the 5 precepts because this virtue is dear to them (SA 2:74).

²⁰ *Aparāmaṭṭhehi*, "untarnished," ie, unsmirched by craving and wrong view (DA 537); alt tr, "unattached to" on account of craving or wrong view.

²¹ *Akhaṇḍehi acchiddehi asabalehi akammāsehi bhujissehi viññūpasatṭhehi aparāmaṭṭhehi samādhi,samvattana-kehi*. Found in 7 of the 10 suttas in **Veḷu,dvāra Vagga** (S 55.1-5, 7-8, ie, except nos 6, 9 ad 10); **Cundī Rāja,kumārī S** (A 5.32/3:36), SD 66.4; **(Agata,phala) Mahānāma S** (A 6.10/3:286), SD 15.3. Details at Vism 1.143-161/51-58, 7.101-106/221 f. See also **Virtue ethics**, SD 18.11 (2.2).

²² *Ariya ṅāya*, or "noble method."

²³ Ce Se abridges the rest of this section and jumps straight into §18. Be gives the full passage.

²⁴ *Paṭicca.samuppāda*: see n after next.

²⁵ *Paṭicca,samuppāda*: V 1:1; S 11:1; Vbh 135; Vism 517; Abhs 8.2. See **Dependent Arising**, SD 5.16, esp (1.4) for def of each of the 12 links.

DEPENDENT ENDING

17.3 But with the remainderless fading away and cessation of **ignorance**, mental formations cease;
 with the cessation of mental formations as condition, consciousness ceases;
 with the cessation of consciousness as condition, name-and-form cease;
 with the cessation of name-and-form as condition, the 6 sense-bases cease;
 with the cessation of the 6 sense-bases as condition, contact ceases;
 with the cessation of contact as condition, feeling ceases;
 with the cessation of feeling as condition, craving ceases;
 with the cessation of craving as condition, clinging ceases;
 with the cessation of clinging as condition, existence ceases;
 with the cessation of existence as condition, birth ceases;
 with the cessation of birth as condition, decay-and-death cease.

There also cease

sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair.

Such is the cessation of this whole mass of suffering.'

This is the noble way that one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom.

18 Bhikshus, when the noble disciple's 5 kinds of hate and fear have been quelled,
 one is accomplished in the 4 limbs for streamwinning, and
 one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way
 —if one wishes one could by oneself declare of oneself, thus:

'I have destroyed hell, the animal birth, the preta realm,

I have destroyed the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

I am a streamwinner,

no longer bound for the lower worlds,
 sure of crossing over to self-awakening!"

— *dutiyaṃ* —

211216 211217 211231 220104