Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 2
Dutiya Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta
The 2nd Discourse on the 5 Kinds of Hate and Fear | S 12.42
Theme: The 4 limbs of a streamwinner

1 Sutta summary and significance

1.1 SUTTA SUMMARY

1.1.1 The Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 2 has the very same teachings as the Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 1 (S 12.42), SD 2.2(4.2). The unawakened worldling lived troubled by 5 kinds of hate and fear (vera bhaya) [§3], that is, those connected with killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, lying and intoxication [§§5-9]. These fears are only quelled with the attainment of streamwinning. [1.2.1]

1.2 SUTTA SIGNIFICANCE

1.2.1 Definitions of a streamwinner

1.2.1.1 A streamwinner (sotāpanna) is one who has wise faith in the 3 jewels, and whose moral virtue is “dear to the noble ones,” that is, valued by them, and the benefits of the precepts well kept conduces to mental concentration and insight wisdom [§§3, 10-14]. The suttas usually call this set of qualities “the limbs of a streamwinner” (sotāpanassa aṅgāni). Here, however, they are called “the limbs for streamwinning” (sotāpatti-y-aṅgāni). [§10 n]

1.2.1.2 The Sutta closes with this statement on how we become streamwinners:

“when the noble disciple’s 5 kinds of hate and fear have been quelled,
one is accomplished in the 4 limbs for streamwinning, and
one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way” [§18]

then, we may declare ourself to be a streamwinner.

The 1st of the 3 lines refers to our properly keeping the 5 precepts, so that we are “bodily cultivated” (bhāvita,kāya) enough to have support for our mental cultivation of a calm and clear mind, suggested by the 2nd line, on the 4 limbs for streamwinning: wise faith in the 3 jewels, that is, we are mindful of the wholesome qualities of the Buddha, the Dharma and the sangha, and moral virtue dear to the noble ones.

Notice that these 4 limbs are significantly listed after the keeping of the 5 precepts, suggesting that these are qualities to be cultivated to gain streamwinning. Those qualities are won by having “clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way,” which the Sutta defines as the truth of dependent arising, both in theory and in practice. Only then, are we streamwinners.

1.2.1.3 The streamwinner here is said to be one who “has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way” [§3.2]. This “the noble way” (ariya ṇāya) or “method of the noble ones” is

---

1 Uddāna title reads Saṭayham (?); also called Pañca Bhera Bhaya S. The importance of this discourse is attested by the fact that it also appears as Anātha,piṇḍika S 3 or Pañca Vera S (S 55.28/5:387-389), and Bhaya Vera S (A 10.92/5:182-184). It also has other names, such as Pañca Bhaya Vera S. Cf below, §10 n on Anātha,piṇḍika S 1 (S 55.26), SD 23.2a & Anātha,piṇḍika S 2 (S 55.27), SD 23.2b.

http://dharmafarer.org
defined at the closing of the Sutta in 2 ways [§15]: first, as its underlying principle, the specific conditionality [§16]; and then, as the 12-link dependent arising [§17].

This is a rare definition, and probably refers to one of the ways that we may attain streamwinning. that is, to see and understand the nature of conditionality. More commonly, streamwinning is said to be attainable by seeing directly into the true nature of impermanence, such as stated in the 10 suttas of the Okkanta Saṁyutta (S 25.1-10).²

1.2.1.4 Conditionality (paccayatā) and impermanence (aniccatā) are, of course, closely related. The principle of specific conditionality [§16 n] states that when condition A arises, B also arises, which, in turn, brings about the arising of C and so on in the 12 links [§17]. When we see and understand this causal relationship, and how they can be broken, we see the universal characteristic of impermanence at work: nothing is permanent.

In a mindful observation (yoniso manasikāra) of impermanence, we see how A becomes not-A1, and then not-A2, and so on: for example, ripples on the water-surface rising and falling away, or a person aging over the years. There is only a continuity of changes, where what we knew has become other, and continues to do so over time. Here again we see the universal characteristic of impermanence: nothing is permanent.

1.2.2 The following suttas contain the same related teaching on streamwinning, differing only in their respective audiences, and small variations:³

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sutta Name</th>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 1</td>
<td>12.41</td>
<td>S 12.41 to Anātha,piṇḍika; abridged parallel of A 10.92 SD 3.3(4.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 2</td>
<td>12.42</td>
<td>S 12.42 to “some monks” = S 12.42 SD 59.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pañca Vera Sutta 1</td>
<td>55.28</td>
<td>S 12.42 = S 12.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pañca Vera Sutta 2</td>
<td>55.22</td>
<td>S 12.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Pañcaka) Gihī Sutta</td>
<td>5.179</td>
<td>S 12.41 the 5 precepts and streamwinning SD 70.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Navaka) Vera Sutta 1</td>
<td>9.27</td>
<td>A 9.27 extended parallel of S 12.41 (without dependent arising)⁴</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Dasaka) Bhaya Sutta</td>
<td>10.92</td>
<td>A 10.92 close parallel with S 12.41⁵</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.3 TEXT AND RELATED SUTTAS

1.3.1 On account of this repetition, most manuscripts either omit much of the text of this Sutta or give only abridged versions of it (which is an unwise practice, presenting an incomplete teaching for most readers). The PTS text, too, omits it, referring to S 12.41. The Burmese and the Siamese editions abridge parts of it, especially the closing. Only the Sinhala edition gives almost the full version. However, it is possible to reconstruct the full text from these different manuscripts, from which this translation is made.

1.3.2 Like S 12.41, this Sutta (S 12.42) is practically identical to the (Dasaka) Bhaya Sutta (A 10.92). The former, however, is slightly abridged, omitting one or two lines, which are found in the latter, which gives a more complete presentation [§5.2 n]. Another extended parallel is the (Navaka) Vera Sutta 1 (A 9.27).⁶
Pañca Vera Bhaya Sutta 2
The 2nd Discourse on the 5 Kinds of Hate and Fear
§ 12.42

1 (The Blessed One was) staying at Sāvatthī.

2 Then, some monks approached the Blessed One, saluted him and sat down at one side. As they were seated thus at one side, the Blessed One said this to them. [71]

The 5 kinds of hate and fear

3 “Bhikshus, when a noble disciple’s 5 kinds of hate and fear have been quelled, one is endowed with the 4 limbs for streamwinning (sotāpatti-y-āṅgāni),

3.2 and has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way [§§15-17]

3.3—he is one who, if he wishes, may himself declare of himself, thus:

‘I have destroyed hell, the animal birth, the preta realm,
I have destroyed the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

I am a streamwinner,

no longer bound for the lower worlds,

sure of crossing over to self-awakening!’

4 What are the 5 kinds of hate and fear that have been quelled?

5 (1) Bhikshus, one who harms life, conditioned by harming of life, generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too—and one feels mental pain and unease, too.

5.2 But for one who abstains from harming life, hate and fear are quelled.

One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.

6 (2) Bhikshus, one who takes the not-given, conditioned by taking the not-given, generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too—and one feels mental pain and unease, too.
6.2 But for one who abstains from taking the not-given, hate and fear are quelled.  
[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

7 (3) Bhikshus, one who indulges in sexual misconduct, conditioned by the indulging in sexual misconduct, 
generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too—and one feels mental pain and unease, too. 
7.2 But for one who abstains from sexual misconduct, hate and fear are quelled.  
[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

8 (4) Bhikshus, one who speaks falsely, conditioned by speaking falsely, 
generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too—and one feels mental pain and unease, too. 
8.2 But for one who abstains from speaking falsely, hate and fear are quelled.  
[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

9 (5) Bhikshus, one who takes strong drinks, distilled drinks, fermented drinks and that which causes heedlessness, conditioned by indulging in strong drinks, distilled drinks, fermented drinks and that which causes heedlessness, 
generates hate and fear in this life, and generates hate and fear in the next life, too—and one feels mental pain and unease, too. 
9.2 But for one who abstains from taking intoxicants, hate and fear are quelled.  
[One does not generate hate and fear in this life nor in the next life—and one does not feel mental pain and unease.]

These are the 5 kinds of hate and fear that have been quelled.

The 4 limbs for streamwinning (sotāpatti-y-āṅgāni)\(^{15}\)

10 What are the 4 limbs for streamwinning\(^{16}\) (sotāpatti-y-āṅgāni) that one possesses?

(1) Wise faith in the Buddha

11 Here, bhikshus, a noble disciple is accomplished with wise faith\(^{17}\) in the Buddha thus:

---

\(^{15}\) A parallel of this section appears in Anātha,piṇḍika S 1 (S 55.26,6-9/5:381 f), SD 23.2a & Anātha,piṇḍika S 2 (S 55.27,8/5:386 f), SD 23.2b.

\(^{16}\) The “limbs for streamwinning,” sotāpanna-y-āṅgāni (D 33,1.11(13)/3:227); usu the term here would be: sotāpanna-y-āṅgāni, “the limbs of a streamwinner” (D 33,1.11(14)/3:227) [4.1.4]; on “limbs for” and “limbs of,” see SD 47.1(2), esp (2.3.2). The 2 terms are sometimes used interchangeably in the suttas (such as here), depending on the context: see SD 47.1 (2.1.1). On these terms, see SD 23.2b (1.3). For a shorter statement on the limbs of a streamwinner, see Ogadha S (S 55.2/5:343 f), SD 3.3 (4.1.4). For the streamwinner’s practice, see (Agata,phala) Mahānāma S (A 6.40/3:284-288), SD 15.3. On the streamwinner’s faith, see Gethin 2001:116.

\(^{17}\) “Wise faith,” avecca-p, pasāda. This is a syntactical cpd with avecca (Sky aveya) absolutive of *aveti, “he undergoes, knows, experiences”; see SD 49.2. [On syntactical cpds, see K R Norman, 1991a:3.] There are 2 kinds of faith (saddhā): (1) “rootless faith” (amūlīka,saddhā), baseless or irrational faith, blind faith (M 2:170,21); (2) “faith with a good cause” (ākāravati,saddhā), faith founded on seeing (M 1:320,8, 401,23). “Wise faith” is syn with (2). Amūlaka =
'So, too, is he the Blessed One:¹⁺ for, he is arhat, fully self-awakened, accomplished in wisdom and conduct, well-farer, knower of worlds, peerless guide of tamable persons, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.’

(2) **Wise faith in the Dharma**

12 One is accomplished with wise faith in the Dharma thus:

Well-taught is the true teaching of the Blessed One, to be self-realized, immediate [having nothing to do with time], for one to “come and see,” accessible [leading onward], to be personally known by the wise.’

(3) **Wise faith in the sangha**

13 One is accomplished with wise faith in the sangha thus:

‘Of good conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples; of upright conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples; of right conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples; of proper conduct is the Blessed One’s community of holy disciples. These 4 pairs of persons, the 8 individuals, are this Blessed One’s community of holy disciples: worthy of offerings, worthy of hospitality, worthy of gifts, worthy of salutation with the lotus-palms, an incomparable field of merit for the world.’

“not seen, not heard, not suspected” (V 2:243 3:163 & Comy). Gethin speaks of two kinds of faith: the cognitive and the affective (eg, ERE: Faith & Jayatilleke, Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge, 1963:387): “Faith in its cognitive dimension is seen as concerning belief in propositions or statements of which one does not—or perhaps cannot—have knowledge proper (however that should be defined); cognitive faith is a mode of knowing in a different category from that knowledge. Faith in its affective dimension is a more straightforward positive response to trust or confidence towards something or somebody ... the conception of saddhā in Buddhist writings appears almost, if not entirely affective, the cognitive element is completely secondary.” (Gethin 2001:107; my emphases). The streamwinner’s faith is defined in Vīmaṁsaka S (M 47) as “his faith is strong, supported by reasons, rooted in vision” (ākāra- vati saddhā dassana, mūlikā dālāh, M 47,16/1:320).

¹⁺ Alt tr: “For the following reasons, too, he is the Blessed One [the Lord] ...” On the meaning of iti pi so, see CPD: iti: ... kitti-saddo abbhuggato: “~ pi so bhagavā: araham sammā-sambuddho ... .” (“for the following reasons, too, he is a bhagavā: because he is arahaṁ ... ”), V 3:1,13 = D 1:49,27 = M 2:133,22 = S 1:219,31 = A 3:312,8, qu Vism 198,4 and MahV 26,11 (VA 112,4 = DA 146,5 ≠ Vism 198,8: so bhagavā “~ pi araham ~ pi sammāsambuddho ... iminā ca iminā ca kārānenā ti vuttam hoti). Translating iti pi so this way explains the double occurrence of Bhagavā. See LS Cousins, “Review of Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha,” in Journal of Buddhist Ethics 4, 1997:165. The Skt parallel to this opening reads: iti hi sa bhagavāṁ tathāgato, but tathāgato here is missing from the Pali version. See Dhaj’agga S (S 11.3), SD 15.5 (2).
(4) Noble Moral Virtue

14 One is accomplished with moral virtues dear to the noble ones, unbroken, untorn; un mixed, spotless; liberating, praised by the wise, un tarnished, giving rise to mental concentration.

These, bhikshus, are the 4 limbs for streamwinning that one possesses.

The noble way

15 And what, bhikshus, is the noble way [method] that one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom?

Specific Conditionality

16 Here, bhikshus, one properly and skillfully attends to dependent arising itself thus:

- Imasmiṃ sati idam hoti
- Imasmiṃ asati idam na hoti
- Imass'uppādā idam uppajjati
- Imassa nirodhā idam nirujjhati

When this is, that is;
when this is not, that is not.
With this arising, that arises;
with this ceasing, that ceases.

Dependent arising

17 That is, with ignorance as condition, mental formations (arise);

17.2 With mental formations as condition, there is consciousness; name-and-form; the 6 sense-bases; contact; feeling; craving; clinging; existence; birth; decay-and-death.

Such is the arising of this whole mass of suffering.

19 “Moral virtue dear to the noble ones,” ariya, kantāni sīlāni. The noble one’s moral virtue is explained at Vism 7.101-106/221 f. SA says that the noble ones do not violate the 5 precepts because this virtue is dear to them (SA 2:74).

20 Aparāmaṭṭhehi, “untarnished,” ie, unsmirched by craving and wrong view (DA 537); alt tr, “unattached to” on account of craving or wrong view.

21 Akhaṇḍhehi acchiddehi asabālehi akammāsehi bhujissehi viññūpasattthehi aparāmaṭṭthehi samādhi, saṅvattana-kehi. Found in 7 of the 10 suttas in Veḷu, dvāra Vagga (S 55.1-5, 7-8, ie, except nos 6, 9 ad 10); Cundī Rāja, Kumāri S (A 5.32/3:36), SD 66.4; (Agata,phala) Mahānāma S (A 6.10/3:286), SD 15.3. Details at Vism 1.143-161/51-58, 7.101-106/221 f. See also Virtue ethics, SD 18.11 (2.2).

22 Ariya āśaya, or “noble method."

23 Ce Se abridges the rest of this section and jumps straight into §18. Be gives the full passage.

24 Paticco, samuppāda: see n after next.

25 Paticco, samuppāda: V 1:1; S 11:1; Vbh 135; Vism 517; Abhs 8.2. See Dependent Arising, SD 5.16, esp (1.4) for def of each of the 12 links.
DEPENDENT ENDING

17.3 But with the remainderless fading away and cessation of ignorance, mental formations cease; with the cessation of mental formations as condition, consciousness ceases; with the cessation of consciousness as condition, name-and-form cease; with the cessation of name-and-form as condition, the 6 sense-bases cease; with the cessation of the 6 sense-bases as condition, contact ceases; with the cessation of contact as condition, feeling ceases; with the cessation of feeling as condition, craving ceases; with the cessation of craving as condition, clinging ceases; with the cessation of clinging as condition, existence ceases; with the cessation of existence as condition, birth ceases; with the cessation of birth as condition, decay-and-death cease.

There also cease sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair.

Such is the cessation of this whole mass of suffering.‘

This is the noble way that one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom.

18 Bhikshus, when the noble disciple’s 5 kinds of hate and fear have been quelled, one is accomplished in the 4 limbs for streamwinning, and one has clearly seen and thoroughly penetrated with wisdom the noble way —if one wishes one could by oneself declare of oneself, thus:

‘I have destroyed hell, the animal birth, the preta realm, I have destroyed the state of misery, the bad destination, the suffering state.

I am a streamwinner,
no longer bound for the lower worlds,
sure of crossing over to self-awakening!”’

— dutiyāṁ

211216 211217 211231 220104