

# 11

## Nibbedhika (Pariyāya) Sutta

The Discourse on (the Exposition on) the Penetrating | A 6.63

Theme: The noble truths as the path to spiritual insight and freedom

Translated with notes by Piya Tan ©2003, 2011, 2022

### 1 Sutta highlights

#### 1.1 SUTTA SUMMARY

**1.1.1** This popular sutta on **penetrating into true reality** is often quoted in the Commentaries.<sup>1</sup> It is a summary of the whole Teaching as a path of 6 parallel methods, each with 6 steps:

(1) *sensual desire*, (2) *feelings*, (3) *perceptions*, (4) *mental influxes*, (5) *karma* and (6) *suffering*—each to be understood by its:

(1) definition, (2) source or arising, (3) diversity (of manifestation), (4) result, (5) cessation and (6) the path [way] to its cessation.

It is a sort of extended “noble truth” formula [§13].

**1.1.2** In fact, each of the analytical schemes of the 6 defilements (sensual desire, etc) is built on the structure of the 4 noble truths with the additional factors of “diversity” and of “result.” The Aṅguttara Commentary glosses “diversity” as “various causes” (*vemattatā ti nānā, kāraṇaṃ*, AA 3:406). In other words, it serves as an elaboration of the 2<sup>nd</sup> noble truth, the various internal or subjective causes of *dukkha*. “Result” (*vipāka*), on the other hand, shows the external or objective causes of *dukkha*.

**1.2** The Aṅguttara Commentary takes *pariyāya* here to mean “cause” (*kāraṇa*), that is, a means of penetrating (that is, destroying) the defilements: “It is called ‘penetrative’ (*nibbedhika*) because it penetrates the mass of greed, etc, which had never before been penetrated or cleaved.” (AA 3:223)

The highlight of the exposition is found in these two remarkable lines of the sutta’s only verse:

The thought of lust is a person’s sensual desire:

The wondrous in the world remain just as they are. [§3.4]

This essentially means that the real world is not what we think of it: it is our mind that we have to deal with without blaming the world (as evil, etc). We tend to project our preconceived minds onto the world. Our daily existence tends to be autopiloted by the shadows of our past or by the mirages of the future.

#### 1.3 DEPENDENT ENDING AND THE “EXTENDED PĀMOJJA” FORMULA

##### 1.3.1 Dependent ending

**1.3.1.1** The list of spiritual methods listed here ends with the one dealing with suffering. This last method is related to the one given in **the Upanisā Sutta** (S 12.23) that applies the causal method of analysis for what is actually **dependent ending**, that is, the opposite of dependent arising, which describes how ignorance in the past leads to present suffering, and our present craving conditions continued suffering into the future.

<sup>1</sup> UA 176; DhsA 369 f; etc.

The early Buddhist texts often highlight dependent arising (*paṭicca samuppāda*),<sup>2</sup> but do not seem to name the process of “dependent ending” (*\*paṭicca sannirodha*), although this is often enough described following the formulation of the former, such as in **the (Nidāna) Desanā Sutta** (S 12.1) and **the Kaccā(ya)-na,gotta Sutta** (S 12.15).<sup>3</sup>

**1.3.1.2 The Upanisā Sutta** (S 12.23), interestingly, in describing with the ending *suffering*, there arise *faith, joy, zest, tranquillity, happiness, concentration, the knowledge and vision of reality, revulsion, dispassion and freedom*, that is, awakening [1.3.2]. When we look at the last link of dependent arising, we see it to be “suffering.” If dependent arising show how all the preceding links lead up to suffering, logically, dependent ending should show how these very same links, broken at their weakest or most vital point, leads in the opposite direction, that is, to awakening. This is what *upanisā*, “proximate condition,” refers to, the links of dependent ending.

### 1.3.2 The “extended pāmojja” formula

The dependent ending cycle listed out in **the Upanisā Sutta** (S 12.23) significantly starts with very happy states: *the ending of suffering, faith, joy, zest*, and so on up to *freedom* (that is, awakening itself). The last 3 links of **the upanisā cycle** (as we can also call it) are *revulsion, dispassion and freedom*, which form **the nibbidā formula**, show how seeing true reality initially arouses “*revulsion*” (*nibbidā*) in us:<sup>4</sup> we are totally disgusted with the way “reality” deludes us, or rather *we delude ourself* not seeing true reality.

Since this formula (from the Upanisā Sutta) has the term “joy” (*pāmojja*) embedded in it, we can conveniently call it “**the extended pāmojja formula**” (or the dependent ending sequence), thus:<sup>5</sup>

suffering ( <i>dukkha</i> )	is the immediate cause of	faith	<i>saddhā</i> <sup>6</sup>
faith	is the immediate cause of	joy [gladness]	<i>pāmojjā</i>
joy	is the immediate cause of	zest	<i>pīti</i>
zest	is the immediate cause of	tranquillity	<i>passaddhi</i>
tranquillity	is the immediate cause of	happiness	<i>sukha</i>
happiness	is the immediate cause of	concentration	<i>samādhi</i>
concentration	is the immediate cause of	knowledge and vision of reality	<i>yathā,bhūta,ñāna,dassana</i>
knowledge and vision of reality	are the immediate cause of	revulsion	<i>nibbidā</i>
revulsion	is the immediate cause of	dispassion	<i>virāga</i>
dispassion	is the immediate cause of	freedom	<i>vimutti</i>
freedom	is the immediate cause of	knowledge of the destruction (of the influxes)	<i>āsava-k,khaya,ñāna</i> (S 12.23/3:29-32), SD 6.12

<sup>2</sup> For refs, see **Dependent arising**, SD 5.16.

<sup>3</sup> S 12.1/2:1 f (SD 83.1) & 12.15/2:16 f (SD 6.13). On the 12 links explained, see SD 5.16 (1.4); On key terms related to dependent arising, see SD 5.16 (0.1.2); on dependent arising and dependent ending as processes, see SD 59.17 (1.1).

<sup>4</sup> On the shorter *nibbidā* formula, see **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22,29), SD 3.13; on the longer formula, SD 20.1 esp (2.2.2).

<sup>5</sup> For the better known “*pāmojja* formula,” see **(Ānanda) Subha S** (D 10,2.14), SD 40a.13 & **Bhikkhuṇī Vāsaka S** (S 47.10,7/5:156), SD 24.2.

<sup>6</sup> “Faith,” *saddhā*. There are 2 kinds of faith (*saddhā*): (1) “rootless faith” (*amūlaka,saddhā*), baseless or irrational faith, blind faith. (M 2:170); (2) “faith with a good cause” (*ākāravati,saddhā*), faith founded on seeing (M 47,16/-1:320,8), SD 35.6; (M 60,4/1:401,23), SD 35.5; also called *avecca-p,pasāda* (S 12.41,11/2:69), SD 3.3. “Wise faith” is syn with (2). *Amūlaka* = “not seen, not heard, not suspected” (V 2:243 3:163 & Comy). Further, see SD 10.4 (2.2).

**1.4** The Nibbedhika (Pariyāya) Sutta **closes** on a very positive note, dropping a broad hint that we can work our way out of suffering with a clear mind:

... there is one who is overwhelmed by suffering, his mind overcome by suffering, ... but is one who searches outside, asking, ‘Who knows a word or two to end this suffering?’

The result of suffering, bhikkhus, is either confusion or a search, I say! [§13.5]

**1.5** Thai philosopher monk, Prayudh Payutto, in his *Dependent Origination: The Buddhist Law of Conditionality*, briefly discusses the main point of this Sutta (1994:94 f).

## 2 Translation of *kāma* and *kāmā*

### **2.1 KĀMĀ BHIKKHAVE VEDITABBĀ**

#### **2.1.1 Desire and its objects**

The key line, *kāmā bhikkhave veditabbā* [§3], and the term *kāmā* thereafter, have their difficulties. The canonical commentary, **Mahā Niddesa**, says that *kāma* here may refer:

- (1) to “sensuousness<sup>7</sup> as defilement” (*kilesa, kāma*), that is, as desire; or
- (2) to “the sensual object or object of desire” (*vatthu, kāma*),<sup>8</sup> that is, respectively, either:

- (1) to subjective sensuousness (arising in the mind: *kāma-c, chanda, kāma, rāga*, etc), or
- (2) to objective defilement (arising via the 5 senses, ie, as the “objects of sensual desires,” *kāma, guṇa*) (Nm 2)<sup>9</sup> [2.2.1]

In other words, (1) is what we feel—our desire—for (2) the sensual object, which is **seen, heard, cognized** (smelt, tasted, touched or felt) or **thought** of as being *desirable*. We can feel desire not only for physical sense-objects but also for our own ideas, views or memories (we get caught up in a thought).

#### **2.1.2 The rule of contextuality**

**2.1.2.1** Technically, when two or more senses are applicable, we should either use a “pregnant” word (that covers or suggests all the intended senses) or apply some kind of “amplified translation” that reflects the polysemy. Thus, the translation, “sensuality,” can refer to either the subjective (the desire as defilement) or the objective (the sense-object or object desired).

Or, they should at least be some kind of note informing us of this polysemy or the Pali word’s difficulty. In the last line of **the *kāma* verse** [§3.4],<sup>10</sup> we see the phrase, “the wise remove the desire (for them).” Hence, to be mindful means that we:

- (1) avoid attending to any sensual objects (or mindfully attending to them when they cannot be avoided);
- (2) when we notice any desire arising for a sensual object, we wisely work to remove it.

**2.1.2.2** As rule, we should understand such a term according to its **context**: how it is used in a particular sutta or even sentence. Then, we should reflect on how this differs in other usages and contexts. We

<sup>7</sup> On the difference between “sensual” and “sensuous,” see [2.2.2.1 n].

<sup>8</sup> On *kāma* as subjective “desire as defilement” (*kilesa, kāma*) and objective “desire as object” (*vatthu, kāma*), see SD 38.4 (3.1.2); SD 41.4 (2.3.1).

<sup>9</sup> See SD 32.2 (1.2.2) The 2 kinds of sensuality; also BDict: *kāma*. See Ency Bsm: *kāma*.

<sup>10</sup> On Pali polysemy, see SD 1.1 (4.4.5); SD 10.16 (1.3.1-1.3.2).

can learn a lot of interesting points and the richness of Pali in this way. Ultimately, all this should help us better understand the nature of our own mind, and how we can train it and free it.

## 2.2 KĀMĀ AS “SENSUALITY”

### 2.2.1 *Kilesa, kāma and vatthu, kāma*

**2.2.1.1** The suttas, as noted in the commentaries, such as the Mahā Niddesa (Nm 1 f), uses the word *kāma* in at least 2 important senses—as subjective defilement and as objective “external” sense-objects [2.1.1]. Both these senses are found in the Nibbedhika (Pariyāya) Sutta, but none of them are used polysemously, that is, each usage is monosemous (has a single sense). Both usages of *kāma* are found in “**the kāmā verse**” [§3.4], where *kāma* in **line a + c** means “desire” as a defilement (*kilesa, kāmā*), but in **line b**, “sensual pleasures” (*kāmā*) are simply sense-objects (as *vatthu, kāmā*). In the rest of the Sutta (that is, the prose sections), *kāma* has the sense of “desire” (as a defilement). Hence, it is only proper we translate this polysemic Pali word as “**sensuality**,” especially where both the objective and subject senses apply.

**2.2.1.2 The Sutta Nipāta Commentary** (the Param’attha Jotika II), in fact, glosses *kāma* as “objects of pleasure that are regarded as states (or “things”) that are agreeable, pleasant, beautiful, and so on, in the 3 worlds (the sense-world, the form world and the formless world)” (*kāman ti manāpa, piya, rūp’ādi, te.- bhūmika, dhamma, saṅkhataṃ vatthu, kāmāṃ*, SnA 512,25).

Notice here that these states or “things” are simply said to be enticing, but without specific mention that they are defiling or not. Since the beings of the form world and of the formless world do not have the kind of physical senses that the sense-world (*kāma, loka*) have, those suprasomatic beings (with non-physical) bodies only enjoy the pleasure with neither the burden nor distraction of the body. This fact will become clear and significant as we examine the “*kāma* verse” in some detail below. [2.2.2]

### 2.2.2 Meaning of the *kāma* verse [§3.4]

**2.2.2.1 (1) The *kāma* verse** [§3.4] contains the key teaching and also the versification of the prose teaching of **the Nibbedhika (Pariyāya) Sutta** [§3.4]. The same verse—without line a—recurs in **the Na Santi Sutta** (S 1.34 = S 103).<sup>11</sup>

While the Nibbedhika (Pariyāya) Sutta teaching elaborates on our own thinking or intention, and mastering them, the Na Santi Sutta stresses on the nature of the world. Note how each line of **the *kāma* verse** flows naturally from line a into b; line c into d. Finally, line e points to what we should do.

#### **The *kāma* verse (§3.4 ≈ S 103)**

*Saṅkappa, rāgo purisassa kāmā  
n’ete<sup>14</sup> kāmā yāni citrāni loka*

The thought [intention] of lust<sup>12</sup> is a person’s **desire**:<sup>13</sup> [2.2.2.2]  
these diverse wonders<sup>15</sup> in the world are not **sensuous**.<sup>16</sup> [2.2.2.3]

<sup>11</sup> S 1.34/1:22 = S 103 (SD 42.6).

<sup>12</sup> On *saṅkappa, rāga*, “thought of lust” or “lustful intention,” see (2.2.2.4).

<sup>13</sup> *Saṅkappa, rāgo purisassa kāmā*. Be Ce Ee Se all give the same 5-line stanza. It recurs in **Na Santi S** (S 1.34), SD 42.6 without line a. Here [§3.4] the stress is in our own thinking or intention, while in S 1.34, it is on the nature of the world. Note how line a flows into b, and line c into d. Line e points to what should be done.

<sup>14</sup> S 103 *na te*.

<sup>15</sup> Note that “the diverse wonders” (*citrāni*) (here and line d) is plural. [2.2.2.3]. **Citra** has a broad range of senses: **1** (mfn) (i) bright, bright-coloured, decorated, many-coloured; extraordinary, wonderful; attractive; (ii) variegated,

<i>saṅkappa,rāgo purisassa kāmo</i>	The thought of lust is a person’s <b>desire</b> .	[2.2.2.4]
<i>tiṭṭhanti citrāni tath’eva loke</i>	The diverse wonders in the world remain just as they are.	[2.2.2.5]
<i>ath’ettha dhīrā vinayanti chandan’ti</i>	Hence, here, <sup>17</sup> the wise remove the desire (for them). <sup>18</sup>	[2.2.2.6]
	(A 6.63,3.4 ≈ S 1.34 (S 103), SD 42.6)	

(2) This verse is an example of Pali polysemy [2.1.2], where a word—here *kāma*—has more than one senses, all of which apply simultaneously or whose sense depends on the context. The verse plays upon the double meaning of *kāma*, stressing that our goodness depends on our mind, and that purity and liberation is to be achieved by overcoming the defilement of sensuality instead of being overwhelmed by our clinging to pleasurable objects.<sup>19</sup>

### 2.2.2.2 [Line a] “The thought of lust is a person’s desire” (*saṅkappa,rāgo purisassa kāmo*):<sup>20</sup>

(1) **Saṅkappa,rāga** means “thought or intention” (*saṅkappa*) of “lust” (*rāga*). The Aṅguttara Commentary on the Nibbedhika (Pariyāya) Sutta glosses *saṅkappa,rāga* as “lust arisen by way of thought (or intention)” (*saṅkappa,vasena uppanna,rāgo*) (AA 3:407,5). The Saṃyutta Commentary on the Na Santi Sutta similarly glosses it as “intentional lust” (*saṅkappita,rāga*) (SA 1:63,3). The “Ancient Subcommentary” (Po-rāṇa Ṭīkā) on the Saṃyutta Commentary (Sār’attha-p,pakāsinī) adds, it is “lust towards objects thought about as being beautiful, etc” (*subh’ādi,vasena saṅkappita,vatthumhi rāgo*, SAṬ:Be 1:106).

(2) Two other verses—Dh 339 and Tha 760—and their commentaries help us to better understand the significance of the *kāma* verse [§3.4].

<i>Yassa cha-t,timsati sotā</i>		<i>Uddhacca,megha,thanitaṃ</i>	
<i>manāpassa bhusā</i>		<i>saṃyojana,valāhakaṃ</i>	
<i>vāhā vahantā dudittim</i>		<i>vāhā vahanti kuddhiṭṭhim</i>	
<i>saṅkappā rāga,nissitā</i>	(Dh 339)	<i>saṅkappā rāga,nissitā</i>	(Tha 760)

translated as:

For whom the 36 streams,  
flowing to what is exceedingly pleasing,  
that one, with false view, the torrents—  
thoughts caught on lust—wash away. (Dh 339)

Thoughts caught on lust  
are the torrents that wash away  
the one with wrong view, like a thunder-cloud  
of agitation, a storm-cloud of fetters. (Tha 760)

(3) Note that Dh 339d = Tha 760d, and that Dh 339c and Tha 760c have the same sense. All the 3 verses centre on craving (*taṇhā*) in the phrase, *saṅkappa,rāga ...* “thoughts caught on lust” (§3.4ac = **Dh 339d = Tha 760d**), that is, it is our intention that defines the morality or immorality of our deeds. **The 36 streams** (*cha-t,timsati sotā*) refer to the 18 “internal” courses of craving (*taṇhā,vicarita*) and the 18 “external”

---

speckled; (iii) various, different, manifold. **2** (n) a kind of bird (the speckled cuckoo?). **3** (n) (i) something brilliant or diverse or extraordinary; (ii) a painting, a picture. See DP for details.

<sup>16</sup> Meaning, “they are neither sensuous nor are they objects of sensuousness,” that is to say, the things we sense as attractive in the world are themselves neither objects of desire nor objects that defile us. It is our intention (*saṅkappa*) towards them that makes them so.

<sup>17</sup> “So here the wise” (*ath’ettha dhīrā’ti atha etesu ārammaṇesu paṇḍitā chanda,rāgaṃ vinayanti*, “here then the wise removes lust and desire in the sense-objects,” SA 1:63). In other words, “here” refers to the mind.

<sup>18</sup> On the verse’s significance, see (2.2.2.1(2)). Cf SD 60.1d (4.2.3.1).

<sup>19</sup> See also SD 3.2. (1.2.2.3).

<sup>20</sup> For the key points of the full explanations, see SD 58.5 (1.1.3).

courses of craving.<sup>21</sup> “Internal” (*ajjhattik’upādāya*) refers to one’s own sense-faculties over the 3 periods of time (past, present, future), and “external” (*bāhir’upādāya*) refers to those of others over time.<sup>22</sup>

(4) The Saṃyutta Commentary summarizes the import of **the *kāma* verse** [§3.4] as follows: “Here the sensual object (*vatthu, kāma*) is rejected; it is the sensual defilement (*kilesa, kāma*) that is called sensuality (*kāma*)” (*evam ettha vatthu, kāmaṃ parikkhipitvā kilesa, kāmo kāmo’ti vutto*, SA 1:63,4). This Commentary then quotes **the Pasūra Sutta** (Sn 4.8 = 824-834) citing 3 embedded verses (that is, verse not found in the actual Sutta).<sup>23</sup>

**2.2.2.3 [Line b] “These diverse wonders in the world are not sensuous [sensuous objects]”** (*n’ete* [S 103, na te] *kāmā yāni citrāni loke*):

(1) **Citra**, “wondrous, various, diversely beautiful,” has a broad range of meanings:

1. (mfn) (i) bright, bright-coloured, decorated, many-coloured; extraordinary, wonderful; (ii) variegated, speckled; (iii) various, different, manifold.
2. (n) a kind of bird (the speckled cuckoo?).
3. (n) (i) something brilliant or diverse or extraordinary; (ii) a painting, a picture.<sup>24</sup>  
Meaning (1) applies to the Sutta context. [2.2.2.5]

(2) The Aṅguttara Commentary glosses **citra** as “diverse and exquisite sense-objects” (*citrāni ti citra, -vicitr’ārammaṇāni*)<sup>25</sup> (AA 3:407). Hence, *citra* refers to the countless possible manifestations of things, states and events that occur in the external world. It refers to “things,” such as the mountains, rivers, the sun, the wind; and to the kind of things that we see, hear or notice around us or that we have.

There are “states,” such as other people and beings, how they appear to us, how they feel, how we feel, and so on.

Then, there are “events” we experience: we see forms, smell odours, taste food, touch tactile objects and feel the air and so on, and notice thoughts about such states, things and events—which we generally call our “experiences.” That’s all they merely are—experiences—until we start to “value-add” them. [2.2.2.4]

(3) **Kāmā** (qualified by *citrāni*) is a plural noun, literally and awkwardly translates as “sensuousnesses” (those things that give pleasure to the senses), and is polysemic: it can refer to the defiling quality (*kilesa, -kāma*) or to the object of desire (*vatthu, kāma*).<sup>26</sup> Hence, I have made an amplified translation here to refer to both these pregnant senses of *kāma*.

<sup>21</sup> DhA 4:48,13-49,11.

<sup>22</sup> See D 3:243,14; M 3:32,3, 216,2 f; A 2:212,9 = Vbh 392,20; A 5:52,31; Khp 4.6 (qu at DhsA 46,12); Vbh 79,27. See **Kāma, bhū S 1** (S 41.5/4:292), SD 71.9, where “stream” (*sotā*) = “craving” (*taṇhā*). (**Vicarita**) **Taṇhā S** (A 4.199/-2:211 f), SD 16.2, lists the 36 streams in similar structure but in reference to craving arising from self-views, which are explained in **Vibhaṅga** (Vbh 392-400).

<sup>23</sup> SA 1:63,8-21 ad S; SnA 539,20-24.

<sup>24</sup> See DP: *citra*<sup>2</sup> for details.

<sup>25</sup> In the suttas, *ārammaṇa* has a non-technical or general sense of “support” (Sn 945c, 506c, 1069c), or “basis” for rebirth (Sn 474c), for consciousness (S 2:65,16 f; 3:53,21+25, 55,16 +21). In Abhidhamma, later works and comys, it tends to be a tt for “sense-object” (Vbh 319,18 f, 332,20) or “meditation object” (Vism 3.102, 23.10).

<sup>26</sup> “Sensual,” meaning “physical, incl sexual” (and its noun, sensuality) are too narrow to apply here.

### 2.2.2.4 [line c] “The thought of lust is a person’s desire” (*saṅkappa,rāgo purisassa kāmo*):

(1) This line is a repetition of line a. Notice that this same line appearing as line a is basically *theoretical*: it simply tells us about how the Buddha teaches what **craving** (*taṇhā*) is—basically, it is a thought. Here—in **line b**—the line is repeated. If we are mindful enough, we realize that it is *our* own thought. It is no more “theoretical,” but our own experience.

(2) The deeper we understand this, the clearer we see how our sufferings arise, whether as physical pain or as mental pain. However, real insight only arises when we are able to see and understand how we are composed and conditioned by the 5 aggregates: form, feeling, perception, formations and consciousness—how we cling to them. We can call this clinging (*upādāna*) the “will to live,” which is so ingrained and tenacious in us that we never really know that it is working.

(3) Early Buddhism speaks of a conscious mind, which entails a **preconscious** dimension,<sup>27</sup> that aspect of the mind which precedes our acts, moralizing it with our intention (*cetanā*), making them “karmic formations” (*saṅkhārā*). The opening twin verses of **the Dhammapada** (Dh 1-2) famously declares how “the mind” (our intention) is behind all our conscious actions.<sup>28</sup> If there is clinging behind our act, it is effectively unwholesome. “Clinging” here is a shorthand for the 3 unwholesome roots: greed (or lust), hate and delusion.

### 2.2.2.5 [Line d] “The diverse wonders in the world remain just as they are” (*tiṭṭhanti citrāni tath’eva loke*):

(1) As we have noted [2.2.2.3(2)], *citra* refers to “diverse and exquisite sense-objects.” This refers to our experience of the “external” world in a non-technical (that is, general) sense. It is helpful to distinguish here 2 kinds of “external” objects: physical objects and mental objects. The unawakened person, as a rule, sees only “mental images” (*ārammaṇa*) or “formations” (*saṅkhārā*) of the physical world.

(2) In the case of the Buddha and the arhats, their minds, too, “form” images of the physical world. However, such a formation (abstract singular *saṅkhāra*) is a kind of “photo-perfect” vision of what is really out there. In other words, unlike the unawakened (who tend to project their preconstructed images onto the world outside), the arhats see things as they really are. Hence, the arhats do not cling to any sense-objects, since they know them to be impermanent, unsatisfactory and without any essence (non-self).

(3) The arhats, including the Buddha, are able to respond wholesomely towards any kind of sense-stimuli (including mental stimuli, that is, thoughts) because they have overcome all self-views, which means that they are free from craving and clinging. They experience a sense-object on the body level, just the way we do. Such experiences, as it were, remains on the body level without affecting the arhat’s mind, as explained in **the Sall’atthana Sutta** (S 36.6).<sup>29</sup>

The arhat’s mind is lust-free; hence, he is without desire for anything, even “the wondrous in the world.” He is the true renunciant” who has removed all desire for the world, and has left the world where it is. He may be *in* the world—for our benefit—but he is no more *of* the world. He does not identify himself with the world (*atam,mayatā*).<sup>30</sup>

In short, the arhats clearly and truly experience the objects (*vatthu,kāma*) without any defiling desires (*kilesa,kāma*) for any of them.

<sup>27</sup> On the preconscious, see SD 17.8b esp (1.1.2; 2.2); SD 7.10 (3.3).

<sup>28</sup> See 8.3 (3).

<sup>29</sup> S 36.6,7-11 (SD 5.5); SD 48.9 (6.2.5); SD 51.14 (3.2.3).

<sup>30</sup> See **Atam,mayatā**, SD 19.13.

**2.2.2.6 [Line e] “Hence, here, the wise remove the desire (for them)”** (*ath’ettha dhīrā vinayanti chandan ti*):

(1) The Commentary, explaining the phrase “so here the wise,” says, “Here then the wise removes lust and desire in the sense-objects” (***ath’ettha dhīrā’ti atha etesu ārammaṇesu pañḍitā chanda,rāgaṃ vinayanti***, SA 1:63). In other words, “here” refers to “in the mind.” The problem is not with the world—“there are no sensual pleasures in the diverse wonders in the world,” it is our mind that *desires* for them: “The thought of lust is a person’s desire.” Hence, we need to remove this desire for the world (that is, for the sensual object). [2.1.2.1]

(2) Now that we have examined all the lines of the “*kāma* verse,” we can better understand its preceding prose line—one of the most enigmatic statements in the early canon—means, when the Buddha declares: “**These are not sensuous (objects)**, but in the noble discipline, they are called ‘**the cords of sensuality.**” [§3.3]

In the suttas, sensual objects (*kāmā*) are called “the cords of sensuality” (*kāma,guṇa*) because we make them so in our minds. We “desire” (*kāmeti*) them; we accumulate them: we make a “pile” and proliferation (*guṇa*) of them—so that they become powerful “cords” (*guṇa*) that bind and play with us. When the enemy is named, it is known—we are in a better position to defend, strengthen and free ourselves.<sup>31</sup>

— — —

## Nibbedhika (Pariyāya) Sutta The Discourse on (the Exposition on) the Penetrating

A 6.63

[410]

**1** “Bhikshus, I shall teach you a Dharma exposition on **that which penetrates** (into true reality). Listen to it, pay careful attention, I will speak.”

“Yes, bhante!” the monks answered the Blessed One in assent.

The Blessed One said this:

### Synopsis

**2** “And what, bhikshus, is this Dharma exposition on penetrating insight?”

<p><b>2.1 Sensual desires</b>, bhikshus, The source that is <u>the arising</u> of sensual desires <u>The diversity</u> of sensual desires <u>The result</u> of sensual desires <u>The cessation</u> of sensual desires <u>The path to the cessation</u> of sensual desires</p>	<p>should be known. should be known. should be known. should be known. should be known. should be known.</p>	<p><b><i>kāmā</i></b> (pl)<sup>32</sup> <i>nidāna,sambhava</i><sup>33</sup> <i>veṃattatā</i><sup>34</sup> <i>vipāka</i> <i>nirodho</i> <i>nirodha,gāmini,paṭipadā</i></p>
--	--	---

<sup>31</sup> See **Kāma,guṇa S** (S 45.176/5:60). Further see **Mine: The nature of craving**, SD 19.3 (1.2).

<sup>32</sup> See n on §3.

<sup>33</sup> I have rendered *nidāna,sambhavo* in accordance with the context of this line throughout (in keeping with the 4 truths) and also following Comy which takes them as synonyms: *nidānam eva sambhavo* (AA 3:406).

<sup>34</sup> See UA 176; DhsA 369 = DhsA:PR 292; Abhs:SR 476.



<p><b>2.2 Feelings</b>, bhikshus,  The source that is the arising of feelings  The diversity of feelings  The result of feelings  The cessation of feelings  The path to the cessation of feelings</p>	<p>should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.</p>	<p><b>vedanā</b></p>
<p><b>2.3 Perception</b>, bhikshus,  The source that is the arising of perceptions  The diversity of perceptions  The result of perceptions  The cessation of perceptions  The path to the cessation of perceptions</p>	<p>should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.</p>	<p><b>saññā</b></p>
<p><b>2.4 The mental influxes</b>, bhikshus,  The source that is the arising of mental influxes  The diversity of mental influxes  The result of mental influxes  The cessation of mental influxes  The path to the cessation of mental influxes</p>	<p>should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.</p>	<p><b>āśava</b></p>
<p><b>2.5 Karma</b>, bhikshus,  The source that is the arising of karma  The diversity of karma  The result of karma  The cessation of karma  The path to the cessation of karma</p>	<p>should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.</p>	<p><b>kamma</b></p>
<p><b>2.6 Suffering</b>, bhikshus,  The source that is the arising of suffering  The diversity of suffering  The result of suffering  The cessation of suffering  The path to the cessation of suffering</p>	<p>should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.</p>	<p><b>dukkha</b></p>

### (1) Sensual desires

<p><b>3</b> [§2.1] <b>Sensual desires</b>,<sup>35</sup> bhikshus,  The source that is <u>the arising</u> of <i>sensual desires</i>  <u>The diversity</u> of <i>sensual desires</i>  <u>The result</u> of <i>sensual desires</i> [411]  <u>The cessation</u> of <i>sensual desires</i>  <u>The path</u> to the cessation of <i>sensual desires</i>  —so it is said, but in what connection is this said?</p>	<p>should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.  should be known.</p>	<p><b>kāmā</b></p>
---	---	--------------------

<sup>35</sup> "Sensuality," *kāmā*. The Pali reads: *Kāmā bhikkhave veditabbā*. On the difficulty of tr *kāma* here, see (2).

## The 5 cords of sensuality

3.2 There are these **5 cords of sensuality** (*kāma,guṇa*):<sup>36</sup>

- |   |  |   |
|---|--|---|
| (1) <b>forms</b> cognized by <i>the eye</i>     | that are desirable, agreeable, pleasurable, lovable, | connected with sensual desire, arousing lust; |
| (2) <b>sounds</b> cognized by <i>the ear</i>    | that are desirable, agreeable, pleasurable, lovable, | connected with sensual desire, arousing lust; |
| (3) <b>smells</b> cognized by <i>the nose</i>   | that are desirable, agreeable, pleasurable, lovable, | connected with sensual desire, arousing lust; |
| (4) <b>tastes</b> cognized by <i>the tongue</i> | that are desirable, agreeable, pleasurable, lovable, | connected with sensual desire, arousing lust. |
| (5) <b>touches</b> cognized by <i>the body</i>  | that are desirable, agreeable, pleasurable, lovable, | connected with sensual desire, arousing lust. |

## The *kāma* verse

3.3 Bhikshus, **these are not sensuous (objects) (*kāmā*)** but, in the noble discipline, they are called ‘**the cords of sensuality**.’<sup>37</sup> [2.2.2.6(2)]

3.4<sup>38</sup>

*Saṅkappa,rāgo purisassa kāmo  
n’ete kāmā yāni citrāni loke  
saṅkappa,rāgo purisassa kāmo  
tiṭṭhanti citrāni tath’eva loke  
ath’ettha dhīrā vinayanti chandan ti*

The thought [intention] of lust is a person’s **desire**:  
these diverse wonders in the world are not **sensuous**. [2.2.2.3]  
The thought of lust is a person’s **desire**.  
The diverse wonders in the world remain just as they are.  
Hence, here, the wise remove the desire (for them). [2.2.2]

## The cycle of sensual desires

**4** And what, bhikshus, is **the source that is the arising of sensual desires** (*kāmānaṃ nidāna,sam-bhavo*)?

**Contact** (*phassa*),<sup>39</sup> bhikshus, is the source that is the arising of sensual desires.

4.2 And what, bhikshus, is **the diversity of sensual desires** (*kāmānaṃ vemattatā*)?

One is the sensual desire in visual forms;  
another is the sensual desire in sounds;  
another is the sensual desire in smells;

*añño kāmo rūpesu  
añño kāmo saddesu  
añño kāmo gandhesu*

<sup>36</sup> This passage recurs in **Araṇa Vibhaṅga S** (M 139,9.2/3:233), SD 7.8.

<sup>37</sup> *Api ca kho bhikkhave n’ete kāmā, kāma,guṇā nam’ete ariyassa vinaye vuccanti*. This is an enigmatic statement whose meaning is clarified in the verse that follows; see foll n. The apparent confusion in terminology is only apparent when we understand the nature of polysemy of Pali terms [2.1.2]: SD 1.1 (4.4.5); SD 10.16 (1.3.1-1.3.2). On the “cords of sensuality” (*kāma,guṇa*), see **Mahā Dukkha-k,khandha S** (M 13,7 n with refs), SD 6.9; **Kāma,guṇa S** (S 35.-117), SD 88.6; **Kāma-c,chanda**, SD 32.2 (2.3).

<sup>38</sup> The sense of *kāma* in each occurrence should be carefully noted here [2.2.2]. This verse recurs as S 104 in **Na Santi S** (S 1.34,6/1:22), SD 42.6, except for line a which is omitted and which reads *na te* for *n’ete*). The **A 6.63** verse is qu at Kvu 370; NmA 1:12. Comys however qu the verse **S 104**: SA 1:63×2, which attr it to comy on **Pasūra S**, Sn 830 (or one of its verses): SnA 2:539; AA 2:41. Cf Tha 674.

<sup>39</sup> “Contact,” *phassa*. Comy: “Contact arisen simultaneously” (*sahajāta,phassa*) (AA 3:406), ie, the coming together of consciousness and the sense-object through the sense-faculty: the “triangle of experience” or “perceptual triad.”

another is the sensual desire in tastes;  
another is the sensual desire in touches.

*añño kāmo rasesu*

*añño kāmo phoṭṭhabhesu*

—This, bhikshus, is called the diversity of sensual desires.

4.3 And what, bhikshus, is **the result of sensual desires** (*kāmānaṃ vipāko*)?

Bhikshus, desiring, one arises in this or that individual existence,<sup>40</sup>

depending on one's good karma or bad karma [one's merits or one's demerits].<sup>41</sup> [Cf §§6.3, 10.3]

This, bhikshus, is called the result of sensual desires.

4.4 And what, bhikshus, is **the cessation of sensual desires** (*kāma,nirodho*)?

The cessation of contact, bhikshus, is the cessation of sensual desires.

It is just this noble eightfold path that is the way to the cessation of sensual desires, that is to say:

right view, right thought,  
right speech, right **[412]** action, right livelihood,  
right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration.

4.5 Bhikshus, when the noble disciple [§2.1]

thus knows [understands]

**sensual desires;**

when he thus knows

the source that is the arising of

sensual desires;

when he thus knows

the diversity of

sensual desires;

when he thus knows

the result of

sensual desires;

when he thus knows

the cessation of

sensual desires;

when he thus knows

the path to the cessation of

sensual desires;

that noble disciple knows this holy life of penetrating insight<sup>42</sup> as the cessation of sensual desires.<sup>43</sup>

4.6 *Sensual desires, bhikshus,*

*should be known;*

*the source that is the arising of sensual desires*

*should be known;*

*the diversity of sensual desires*

*should be known;*

*the result of sensual desires*

*should be known;*

*the cessation of sensual desires*

*should be known;*

*the path to the cessation of sensual desires*

*should be known.*

—So it is said: it is in this connection that this is said.

## (2) Feelings

5 [§2.2] **Feelings**, bhikshus,

should be known;

*vedanā*

The source that is the arising of *feelings*

should be known.

The diversity of *feelings*

should be known.

The result of *feelings*

should be known.

The cessation of *feelings*

should be known.

The path to the cessation of *feelings*

should be known.

—So it is said, but in what connection is this said?

<sup>40</sup> In this context, *kāma* should be tr as “desires.”

<sup>41</sup> *Yaṃ kho bhikkhave kāmayaṃāno* [vl *kamaṃ vediyamāno*] *tajjaṃ tajjaṃ attabhāvaṃ abhinibbatteti puñña, - bhāgiyaṃ vā apuñña, bhāgiyaṃ vā.*

<sup>42</sup> “Holy life of penetrating insight,” *nibbedhikhaṃ brahmacāriyaṃ*. Comy: The holy life here is the supramundane path (streamwinning, etc).

<sup>43</sup> “Cessation of sensuality,” *kāma,nirodha*.

5.2 Bhikshus, there are these **3 kinds of feeling**:

Pleasant feelings;  
 Unpleasant feelings;  
 Neutral feelings.<sup>44</sup>

The cycle of feelings6 And what, bhikshus, is **the source that is the arising of feelings**?

Contact, bhikshus, is the source that is the arising of feelings.

6.2 And what, bhikshus, is **the diversity of feelings**?<sup>45</sup>

Bhikshus,

there is	pleasant	sensual [carnal]	feeling; <sup>46</sup>
there is	pleasant	non-sensual [spiritual]	feeling; <sup>47</sup>
there is	painful	sensual	feeling;
there is	painful	non-sensual	feeling.
there is	neutral	sensual	feeling;
there is	neutral	non-sensual	feeling.

—This, bhikshus, is called the diversity of feelings.

6.3 And what, bhikshus, is **the result of feelings**. [cf §4.3]

Bhikshus, one arises in this or that individual existence depending on one's feelings, depending on one's good karma or bad karma [one's merits or one's demerits]

This, bhikshus, is called the result of feelings.

6.4 And what, bhikshus, is **the cessation of feelings**.

The cessation of contact, bhikshus, is the cessation of feelings.

It is just this noble eightfold path that is the way to the cessation of feelings, that is to say:

right view, right thought,  
 right speech, right action, right livelihood,  
 right effort, right mindfulness and right concentration.

## 6.5 Bhikshus,

when the noble disciple thus knows

when he thus knows

when he thus knows **[413]**

**feelings**

the source that is the arising of feelings,

the diversity of feelings,

<sup>44</sup> "Neutral feelings," ie, feelings that are neither painful nor pleasurable. "Feeling" (*vedanā*) here has the sense of "experience," as when we say "I feel good" or "I feel nothing." Hence, it makes sense here to say, "neutral feeling." On how ignorance arises from neutral feelings, see **Sall'atthana S** (S 36.6,8.5), SD 5.5.

<sup>45</sup> Cf the feelings as defined in **Satipaṭṭhāna S** (M 10,32/1:59), SD 13.3.

<sup>46</sup> *S'āmisarṃ sukharṃ vedanarṃ*. *S'āmisā* = *sa-āmisā*, "sensual," lit "with flesh" thus connoting some sense of the carnal, ie, connected to the pleasures of the 5 senses (*kāma,guṇā*) (S 4:235, 236).

<sup>47</sup> *Nirāmisarṃ sukharṃ vedanarṃ*. Here *nirāmisā* means "non-sensual," "non-carnal" or "spiritual," which according to Comy refers to the 6 joyful feelings connected with the sense-doors, but not dependent on sense-desire (MA 1:279). In **Saḷ'āyatana Vibhaṅga S** (M 137), *s'āmisā* and *nirāmisā* refer to the household life and to the renounced life respectively (SD 29.5). Elsewhere, as in **Suddhika Nirāmisā S** (S 36.29), *nirāmisā pīti*, *nirāmisā sukha* and *nirāmisā upekkhā* are experienced in the dhyanas (S 36.29,8-15/4:236 f), SD 55.6. See D 2:298; M 1:59; S 4:235, 236 (x2); A 1:81, 3:412; Pm 2:233. See also Sue Hamilton, *Identity and Experience*, 1996:43 f.

when he thus knows the result of feelings,  
 when he thus knows the cessation of feelings,  
 when he thus knows the path to the cessation of feelings,  
 he thus knows this holy life of penetrating insight to be *the cessation of feelings*.

6.6 *Feelings, bhikshus,* *should be known.* [§5.1]  
*The source that is the arising of feelings* *should be known.*  
*The diversity of feelings* *should be known.*  
*The result of feelings* *should be known.*  
*The cessation of feelings* *should be known.*  
*The path to the cessation of feelings* *should be known.*  
 —So it is said: it is in this connection that this is said.

### (3) Perception

**7** [§2.3] **Perception**, bhikshus, *should be known;* *saññā*  
 the source that is the arising of *perceptions* *should be known;*  
the diversity of *perceptions* *should be known;*  
the result of *perceptions* *should be known;*  
the cessation of *perceptions* *should be known;*  
the path to the cessation of *perceptions* *should be known.*  
 —So it is said, but in what connection is this said?

7.2 Bhikshus, there are these 6 kinds of perception:  
 the perception of forms;  
 the perception of sounds;  
 the perception of smells;  
 the perception of tastes;  
 the perception of touches;  
 the perception of thoughts.

### The cycle of perception

**8** And what, bhikshus, is **the source that is the arising of perceptions**?  
Contact, bhikshus, is the source that is the arising of perceptions.

8.2 And what, bhikshus, is **the diversity of perceptions**?  
 One is the perception of visual forms;  
 another the perception of sounds;  
 another the perception of smells;  
 another the perception of tastes;  
 another the perception of touches;  
 another the perception of thoughts.  
 —This, bhikshus, is called the diversity of perceptions.

8.3 And what, bhikshus, is **the result of perceptions**?  
 Perceptions, bhikshus, result in expression (*vohāra*), I say!  
In whatever way one perceives, in that way one expresses oneself (*voharati*), saying, ‘I perceived it so!’  
 —This, bhikshus, is the result of perceptions.

8.4 And what, bhikshus, is **the cessation of perceptions**?

The cessation of contact, bhikshus, is the cessation of perceptions.

It is just this noble eightfold path that is the way to the cessation of perceptions, that is to say:  
 right view, right thought,  
 right speech, right action, right livelihood,  
 right effort, right mindfulness and right concentration.

## 8.5 Bhikshus,

when the noble disciple thus knows	<b>perceptions;</b>
when he thus knows	the source that is <u>the arising</u> of perceptions;
when he thus knows [414]	<u>the diversity</u> of perceptions;
when he thus knows	<u>the result</u> of perceptions;
when he thus knows	<u>the cessation</u> of perceptions;
when he thus knows	<u>the path</u> to the cessation of perceptions;
that noble disciple knows this <b>holy life of penetrating insight</b> as the cessation of perceptions.	

8.6 *Perceptions, bhikshus,*

*the source that is the arising of perceptions*  
*the diversity of perceptions*  
*the result of perceptions*  
*the cessation of perceptions*  
*the path to the cessation of perceptions*

*should be known;*  
*should be known;*  
*should be known;*  
*should be known;*  
*should be known;*  
*should be known.*

—So it is said: it is in this connection that this is said.

(4) Mental influxes

9 [§2.4] **The mental influxes**, bhikshus,  
 the source that is the arising of *mental influxes*  
the diversity of *mental influxes*  
the result of *mental influxes*  
the cessation of *mental influxes*  
the path to the cessation of *mental influxes*

should be known;  
 should be known;  
 should be known;  
 should be known;  
 should be known;  
 should be known.

*āsava*

—So it is said, but in what connection is this said?

9.2 Bhikshus, there are these 3 kinds of mental influxes:<sup>48</sup>

The mental influxes of sensuality.  
 The mental influxes of existence.  
 The mental influxes of ignorance.

*kām'āsava*  
*bhav'āsava*  
*avijj'āsava*

The cycle of mental influxes

10 And what, bhikshus, is **the source that is the arising of mental influxes**?  
Ignorance, bhikshus, is the source that is the arising of mental influxes.<sup>49</sup>

<sup>48</sup> “3 kinds of mental influxes” (D 33/3:216; M 2/1:55, 9/3:41; S 4:256 = 5:56 = 189; A 3.59/3:414, 67, 6.63; Vbh 347). A later formula adds a fourth mental influx, that of “view” (*ditth'āsava*) as the 3<sup>rd</sup> influx (V 3:5; D 2:81 = 84; A 1:241; Vbh 373). The 4 mental influxes are also known as “floods” (*ogha*, D 3:230; UA 362) and as “yokes” (*yoga*, D 3:230, 276; A 2:10).

10.2 And what, bhikshus, is **the diversity of mental influxes**?<sup>50</sup>

There are, bhikshus, mental influxes that lead one on to	the hells.	<i>niraya</i>
There are mental influxes that lead one on to	the animal kingdom.	<i>tiracchāna, yoni</i>
There are mental influxes that lead one on to	the ghost realm.	<i>pitti, visaya</i> <sup>51</sup>
There are mental influxes that lead one on to	the human world.	<i>manussa, loka</i>
There are mental influxes that lead one on to	the heavenly world.	<i>deva, loka</i>

—This, bhikshus, is called the diversity of mental influxes.

10.3 And what, bhikshus, is **the result of mental influxes**? [§4.3]

When one, bhikshus, fallen into ignorance, arises in this or that individual existence, depending on one's good karma or bad karma [one's merits or one's demerits].

—This, bhikshus, is called the result of mental influxes.

10.4 And what, bhikshus, is **the cessation of mental influxes**?

The cessation of ignorance, bhikshus, is the cessation of mental influxes.

It is just this noble eightfold path that is the way to the cessation of mental influxes, that is to say:  
 right view, right thought,  
 right speech, right action, right livelihood,  
 right effort, right mindfulness and right concentration.

## 10.5 Bhikshus,

when the noble disciple knows	<b>mental influxes;</b>
when he thus knows	the source that is <u>the arising</u> of mental influxes;
when he thus knows	<u>the diversity</u> of mental influxes;
when he thus knows	<u>the result</u> of mental influxes;
when he thus knows	<u>the cessation</u> of mental influxes;
when he thus knows	<u>the path</u> to the cessation of mental influxes ;
that noble disciple knows this <u>holy life of penetrating insight</u> as the cessation of mental influxes. [415]	

10.6 <i>Mental influxes, bhikshus,</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>The source that is the arising of mental influxes</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>The diversity of mental influxes</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>The result of mental influxes</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>The cessation of mental influxes</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>The path to the cessation of mental influxes</i>	<i>should be known.</i>

—So it is said: it is in this connection that this is said.

<sup>49</sup> **Sammā Diṭṭhi S** (M 9) says that mental influxes (incl ignorance) are the cause of ignorance (M 9,67/1:54), and ignorance is the cause of mental influxes (M 9,70/1:55), SD 11.14. Comy explains that this conditioning of ignorance by ignorance should be understood to mean that the ignorance in any existence is conditioned by the existence in the preceding existence. "Having shown this, (it follows that) no point of ignorance can be discovered, and as such this cyclic existence (*saṃsāra*) has no discernible beginning." (MA 1:224). See Ñāṇamoli (tr) 1991:22, 67.

<sup>50</sup> U Comy gives this as an example of influxes in terms of the 5 realms, summarized thus: (1) karmic defilement (*kamma, kilesa*) (**Pāsādika S**, D 29,22; **Pāda Doṇa S**, A 4.36,4); (2) defilements of present and of future states (V 3:21,-19); (3) sense-desires, existence and ignorance (**Ti Āsava S**, S 38.8); (4) Abhidhamma: these 2 + views [below]; (5) conducive to the 5 realms (**Nibbedhika (Pariyāya) S**, A 6.63,10.2); (6) to be abandoned through the 6 sense-restraints (**Chakka Āsava S**, A 6.58); (7) abandoned in 7 ways (**Sabb'āsava S**, M 2,4). (UA 176 f).

<sup>51</sup> *Pitti, visāya*, also tr as "realm of the departed. See **Jāṇussoṇi S** (A 10.177), SD 2.6

## (5) Karma

<b>11</b> [§2.5] <b>Karma</b> , bhikshus,	should be known;	<i>kamma</i>
the source that is <u>the arising</u> of <i>karma</i>	should be known;	
<u>the diversity</u> of <i>karma</i>	should be known;	
<u>the result</u> of <i>karma</i>	should be known;	
<u>the cessation</u> of <i>karma</i>	should be known;	
<u>the path</u> to the cessation of <i>karma</i>	should be known.	

—So it is said, but in what connection is this said?

### 11.2 Bhikshus, **intention is karma, I say!**

Having intended, one creates karma through the body, through speech, through the mind.<sup>52</sup>

## The cycle of karma

### **12** And what, bhikshus, is **the source that is the arising of karma?**

Contact, bhikshus, is the source that is the arising of karma.

### 12.2 And what, bhikshus, is **the diversity of karma?**

Bhikshus,

there are karma <sup>53</sup> that would be experienced <sup>54</sup> in	the hells.
There are karma that would be experienced in	the animal kingdom.
There are karma that would be experienced in	the ghost realms.
There are karma that would be experienced in	the human world.
There are karma that would be experienced in	the heavenly world.
—This, bhikshus, is called the diversity of karma.	

### 12.3 And what, bhikshus, is **the result of karma?**

There are, bhikshus, these 3 kinds of karmic results,<sup>55</sup> I say!

Those that arise [ripen] here and now, or in the next life, or in a subsequent life.

—This, bhikshus, is called the result of karma.

<sup>52</sup> As at Kvu 392. This famous statement is often misunderstood. “The Buddha’s utterance does not establish a mathematical equivalence between *cetanā* and *kamma*, such that every instance of volition must be considered *kamma*. As the second part of his statement shows, his words mean that *cetanā* is the decisive factor in action, that which motivates action and confers upon action the ethical significance intrinsic to the idea of *kamma*. This implies that the ethical evaluation of a deed is to be based on the *cetanā* from which it springs, so that a deed has no karmic efficacy apart from the *cetanā* to which it gives expression. The statement does not imply that *cetanā* (in the non-arahant) is always and invariably *kamma*.” (Bodhi 1998:§23/p25 digital ed). Cf **Cetanā Ss 1-3** (S 12.38/2:65-67), SD 7.6abc.

<sup>53</sup> I’ve taken “karma” as an uncountable noun here. Alt tr: “karmic acts.”

<sup>54</sup> “That would be experienced,” *vedanīyam*, participle of fut passive of *vidati* or *vindati*, “he knows” (DPL), but better, foll PED, as *vediyati*, “he feels, experiences” (S 4:114; A 1:249, 4:382).

<sup>55</sup> “3 kinds of karmic results,” see (**Kamma**) **Nidāna S** (A 3.33/1:134-136) on causes and kinds of karma (SD 4.14). See **Mahā Kamma Vibhaṅga S** (M 136,17-21), SD 4.16. See also **Visuddhi,magga** where these 3 types of karma are respectively named as *diṭṭha,dhamma vedanīya kamma*, *upapajja,vedanīya kamma* and *apara,pariyāya vedanīya kamma*—and a fourth, *ahosi kamma*, lapsed or ineffectual karma (Vism 19.14/601). The first 2 kinds of karma may be without karmic result if the circumstances required for their ripening are missing, or because of the presence of a stronger counteractive karma; as such, they are called *ahosi,kamma*: cf **Loṇa,phala S** (A 3.99/1:249-253), SD 3.5. See Vism:Ñ 19.14/696 n2.



12.4 And what, bhikshus, is **the cessation of karma**?

The cessation of contact, bhikshus, is the cessation of karma.

It is just this noble eightfold path that is the way to the cessation of karma, that is to say:

*right view, right thought,  
right speech, right action, right livelihood,  
right effort, right mindfulness and right concentration.*

## 12.5 Bhikshus,

when the noble disciple thus knows	<b>karma</b> ;
when he thus knows	the source that is <u>the arising</u> of karma;
when he thus knows	<u>the diversity</u> of karma;
when he thus knows	<u>the result</u> of karma;
when he thus knows	<u>the cessation</u> of karma;
when he thus knows	<u>the path</u> to the cessation of karma;
that noble disciple knows <u>this holy life of penetrating insight</u>	as the cessation of karma.

12.6 <i>Karma, bhikshus,</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>the source that is the arising of karma</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>the diversity of karma</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>the result of karma</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>the cessation of karma</i>	<i>should be known; [416]</i>
<i>the path to the cessation of karma</i>	<i>should be known.</i>

—So it is said: it is in this connection that this is said.

**(6) Suffering**

<b>13</b> [§2.6] <b>Suffering</b> , bhikshus,	should be known;	<i>dukkha</i>
the source that is <u>the arising</u> of <i>suffering</i>	should be known;	
<u>the diversity</u> of <i>suffering</i>	should be known;	
<u>the result</u> of <i>suffering</i>	should be known;	
<u>the cessation</u> of <i>suffering</i>	should be known;	
<u>the path</u> to the cessation of <i>suffering</i>	should be known.	

—So it is said, but in what connection is this said?

13.2 Birth is suffering,  
decay<sup>56</sup> is suffering,  
disease is suffering,<sup>57</sup>  
death is suffering;  
grief, lamentation, physical pain, mental pain and despair are suffering;  
[ ]<sup>58</sup>

not to get what one desires is suffering;

—in short, the 5 aggregates of clinging<sup>59</sup> are suffering.

<sup>56</sup> *jarā*, old age, aging.

<sup>57</sup> Only here & in the Vinaya version; not mentioned in Comys.

<sup>58</sup> The sufferings, “to be with the unpleasant is suffering; to be without the pleasant is suffering;” are omitted here. For the “8 sufferings,” see **Dhamma, cakka Pavattana S** (S 56.11,5/5:421), SD 1.1.

<sup>59</sup> *pañc’upadāna-k, khandha*, namely, form, feeling, perception, formations and consciousness (S 3:47; Vbh 1).

## The cycle of suffering

13.3 And what, bhikshus, is **the source that is the arising of suffering?**

Craving (*taṇhā*), bhikshus is the source that is the arising of suffering.

13.4 And what, bhikshus, is **the diversity of suffering?**

There is, bhikshus, suffering that is	excessive.	<i>adhimatta</i>
There is suffering that is	small [of no account].	<i>paritta</i>
There is suffering that	fades away slowly.	<i>dandha, virāgi</i> <sup>60</sup>
There is suffering that	fades away quickly.	<i>khippa, virāgi</i> <sup>61</sup>

—This, bhikshus, is called the diversity of suffering.

13.5 And what, bhikshus, is **the result of suffering?**

Here, bhikshus, there is one who is overwhelmed by suffering, his mind overcome by suffering: he grieves, moans, laments, beats his breast, weeps, becomes confused.

Or, one who overwhelmed by suffering, his mind overcome by suffering, but is one who searches outside, asking, ‘Who knows a word or two to end this suffering?’<sup>62</sup>

The result of suffering, bhikshus, is either confusion or a search (for solutions), I say!

—This, bhikshus, is called the result of suffering.

13.6 And what, bhikshus, is **the cessation of suffering?**

The cessation of craving, bhikshus, is the cessation of suffering.

It is just this noble eightfold path that is the way to the cessation of suffering, that is to say:

*right view, right thought,  
right speech, right action,  
right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness and right concentration.*

13.7 Bhikshus,

when the noble disciple thus knows	<b>suffering;</b>
when he thus knows	the source that is <u>the arising</u> of suffering;
when he thus knows	<u>the diversity</u> of suffering;
when he thus knows	<u>the result</u> of suffering;
when he thus knows	<u>the cessation</u> of suffering;
when he thus knows	<u>the path</u> to the cessation of suffering;

that noble disciple knows this holy life of penetrating insight as the cessation of suffering.

13.8 <i>Suffering, bhikshus,</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>the source that is the arising of suffering</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>the diversity of suffering</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>the result of suffering</i>	<i>should be known;</i>
<i>the cessation of suffering</i>	<i>should be known;</i>

<sup>60</sup> Cf Comy which notes that “the eternalist view” (*sassata dassana*) is of little fault but slow to fade away (*appa, -sāvajjaṃ dandha, virāgaṃ*) (MA 3:206).

<sup>61</sup> Cf Comy which notes that “the annihilationist view” (*uccheda dassana*) is of great fault but quick to fade away (*mahā, sāvajjaṃ khippa, virāgaṃ*) (MA 3:206).

<sup>62</sup> The Chin version, in fact, uses 呪 (var 咒) *zhòu* “mantra” (MĀ 111 @ T1.600b17-18). Comy explains this as “Who knows a mantra, a one-word or two-word mantra?” (*eka, pada, mantarāṃ vā dvi, pada, mantarāṃ vā, ko jānātīti attho*) (AA:Be 19:136,9; PTS reads *matta* for *manta*, AA 3:408,19 f; AAT:Be 3:140,1 also reads *mantarāṃ*). This is an allusion to Kisā Gotamī and her dead child: SD 43.2d.

*the path to the cessation of suffering should be known.*

—So it is said: it is in this connection that this is said.

This, indeed, bhikshus, is the Dharma exposition on penetrating insight.”

— evaṃ —

## Bibliography

### Aṅguttara Nikāya

1999 *Numerical Discourse of the Buddha: An anthology of Suttas from the Aṅguttara Nikāya.* Tr Nyana-ponika Thera & Bhikkhu Bodhi. Buddhist Publication Society, Kandy. Walnut Creek, Oxford: Altamira Press, 1999. 208 selected suttas.

Bodhi, Bhikkhu

1998 “A critical examination of Ñāṇavīra Thera’s ‘A note on paṭiccasamuppāda.’” *Buddhist Studies Review*, 1998.

Payutto, P[rayudh] Ar[yankura]

1994 *Dependent Origination: The Buddhist law of conditionality.* [Thai] Tr Bruce Evans. Bangkok: Buddha-dhamma Foundation, 1994:94 f.

### Sammā,diṭṭhi Sutta (M 9)

1991 *The Discourse on Right View: The Sammādiṭṭhi Sutta and its Commentary.* Tr Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli; ed & rev by Bhikkhu Bodhi. Wheel Publication nos 377/379. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 1991. 77pp.

040721 060418 081228 091113 101229 111225 120530 131008 140729 160126 170215 181230 190318  
200823 211101 221021.6