

# THE LIVING WORD OF THE BUDDHA

The Buddha's Teachings in the Oldest Texts

*Celebrating 20 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching, 2002-2022*

©TAN Beng Sin (Piya Tan) 2022b

## Handbook of Meditation in Society 3

### *Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1c*

#### *Theme: The rhetoric of Buddhist experience*

A psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism

For conventions (textual and technical) and bibliography, see **SD Guide**.

[PDF] To move around the book, click the BOOKMARK icon  on the far left panel; click the HEADINGS.

Page	
1	<a href="#">Detailed table of contents</a>
6	(1) <a href="#">A psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism.</a> Varieties of Buddhist modernism.
11	(2) <a href="#">Two areas of modern Buddhist experience.</a>
14	(3) <a href="#">The traditional Buddhist experience.</a>
18	(4) <a href="#">Western Buddhist experiences.</a>
19	(5) <a href="#">Revival of the "old meditations."</a>
22	(6) <a href="#">How modern Buddhisms are created.</a>
28	(7) <a href="#">Buddhist modernism.</a>
35	(8) <a href="#">Buddhist ethnicism, Buddhist modernism: A few issues.</a>
49	(9) <a href="#">Modernized ethnic Buddhisms.</a>
71	(10) <a href="#">Japan: How Buddhism became a "religion."</a>
88	(11) <a href="#">New Buddhisms: India, and the West.</a>
106	(12) <a href="#">Buddhist unbelief.</a>
128	(13) <a href="#">Leaving Theravāda.</a>
140	(14) <a href="#">Leaving Buddhism.</a>
142	(15) <a href="#">Religious intolerance.</a>
160	(16) <a href="#">Defending Buddhism against the Lotus Sutra.</a>
169	(17) <a href="#">Buddhism and affluence.</a>
178	(18) <a href="#">Pruning the Bodhi tree: Critical Buddhism.</a>
185	(19) <a href="#">When Zen is not Buddhism.</a>
194	(20) <a href="#">Vital conclusions:</a> Dialogue, ecumenism, communion, scholarship.

*Buddhism is daily experience fully and joyfully understood*

Sutta translations & study website: <http://dharmafarer.org>  
Courses and messaging: <http://themindingcentre.org> & [t.me/sutasangha](https://t.me/sutasangha)

ISBN 978-981-18-5949-6 (Physical); ISBN 978-981-18-5950-2 (Digital)

All rights reserved  
Printed in Singapore

**THE MINDING CENTRE**, based in Singapore, is part of Piya Tan’s Dharma ministry. It was founded in 2006 to provide non-religious Dharma-based services to those in need of counsel and solace. It also serves as a haven and hub for those seeking Dharma by way of critical thinking, creative feeling, meditation, sutta translation and study, spiritual experience, and sharing that light and joy. The Centre also supports and promotes Piya Tan in his full-time Buddhist and related work.

**Courses:** <http://themindingcentre.org>

**THE SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES** is part of the Living Word of the Buddha project which aspires to present and encourage an exploration of early Buddhism, both in a Dharma-inspired and academic manner for personal development as well as outreach work on a local and global scale. The Minding Centre and the Living Word of the Buddha project are motivated and guided by a quest for the historical Buddha and a vision of mere Buddhism.

**Suttas:** <http://dharmafarer.org>

**THE MERE BUDDHIST VISION.** We aspire to learn, teach and practise mere Buddha Dharma, or “non-religious Buddhism,” that is, Buddhism as simple as possible, as the teaching of the historical Buddha, so that it is open to all who seek true stillness and liberating wisdom. We aspire to compassionately and joyfully proclaim the possibility, necessity and urgency of gaining spiritual liberation in this life itself—at least as streamwinners, with or without dhyana—in keeping with the spirit of the Okkanta Saṃyutta (S 25). ***Mere Buddhism is easy: live it and be free.***

Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin), 1949-

Title: Sutta Discovery 60.1c.

Theme: The rhetoric of Buddhist Experience: a psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism

Series: The living word of the Buddha (2002- )

First published 2022; publisher: the author

ISBN 978-981-18-5949-6 (physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-5950-2 (digital)

### YOU can help Buddhism grow

Your pledge & support bring Dharma to others:

- ☑ Print Dharma and related books, and Internet Dharma
- ☑ Support our sutta translation: <http://dharmafarer.org>
- ☑ Sponsor our full-time Dharma work and global ministry

*WE GIVE*

*for the sake of a beautiful mind,  
as a support for the mind (in inner peace).*

(Aṭṭha Dāna Sutta, A 8.31/4:236)

The essay **SD 60.1c**, *The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience*,” is part of the multi-volume **SD 60**, comprising (to date), with a related earlier essay:

<b>SD 56.22</b>	Early Buddhist Psychology as experience	(2020c)
<b>SD 60.1a</b>	Character Analysis	
<b>SD 60.1b</b>	Samatha, Vipassana, Kammatthāna	
<b>SD 60.1c</b>	The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience	
<b>SD 60.1d</b>	An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness	
<b>SD 60.1e</b>	Delusion and Experience	
<b>SD 60.1f</b>	Psychopathology of Mindfulness	

## Detailed Table of Contents

<b>Volume 60.1c</b> .....	i
<b>Theme: The rhetoric of Buddhist experience</b> .....	i
Imprint page .....	ii
The Minding Centre: contacts and support .....	iii
Learning the Suttas & Piya Tan .....	iv
Sutta Discovery Series .....	vi
Detailed Table of Contents .....	1
1 A psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism .....	6
1.1 Modern Buddhist experience .....	6
1.1.1 Modernity and modernism .....	6
1.1.2 The 2 pairs of counter-currents .....	7
1.2 Varieties of Buddhist modernism .....	9
2 Two areas of modern Buddhist experience .....	11
2.1 Introduction .....	11
2.1.2 Buddhist studies .....	11
2.1.3 Buddhist scholarship .....	12
2.1.4 Scholars and practitioners .....	12
3 The traditional Buddhist experience .....	14
3.0 Introduction .....	14
3.1 Experience as currency .....	14
3.2 The modern Buddhist experience .....	15
3.3 Lights and shadows .....	16
4 Western Buddhist experience .....	18
4.0 Introduction .....	18
4.1 Buddhism, revised Westernized edition .....	18
5 Revival of the “old meditations” .....	19
5.0 Introduction .....	19
5.1 Contrasting responses to Buddhism .....	19

5.2 Buddhism as sexual experience .....	20
5.3 Samatha Kammaṭṭhāna.....	21
6 How modern Buddhisms are created.....	22
6.0 Introduction.....	22
6.1 The 2 roots of modern Buddhism .....	22
6.2 Psychology and Buddhism.....	23
6.3 The scholars' Buddhism.....	24
7 Buddhist modernism .....	28
7.0 Introduction.....	28
7.1 Modernism and modernity .....	28
7.2 Post-Buddha Buddhism and Protestant Buddhism .....	31
7.3 Buddhist modernism in Asia.....	33
8 Buddhist ethnicism, Buddhist modernism: A few issues.....	35
8.0 Introduction.....	35
8.1 Race, culture, empire .....	35
8.2 Liberation anthropology, liberation Buddhism .....	39
8.3 Liberating Zen.....	42
8.4 The Zen of modernism: D T Suzuki.....	46
9 Modernized ethnic Buddhisms.....	49
9.0 Introduction.....	49
9.1 Myanmar and Thailand: Sociocultural backgrounds.....	49
9.2 Burmese Buddhist modernism.....	52
9.3 Google Mindfulness: the ultimate modernist meditation .....	54
9.4 Thai Buddhism and modernism .....	56
9.5 Caste Buddhism and sectarian modernism in Sri Lanka .....	57
9.6 "Buddha relics" politics .....	59
9.6.1 Sinhala caste rivalry .....	59
9.6.2 Off-note on the world's largest Buddha relic !!! .....	59
9.6.3 Economics of ethnic Buddhism .....	60
9.7 Modernist Buddhist developments in education and scholarship .....	64
9.8 "Uncomfortable" English.....	67
10 Japan: How Buddhism became a "religion" .....	71
10.0 Introduction.....	71
10.1 The rise and fall of Buddhism.....	72
10.2 Japanese nationalism and "New Buddhisms" .....	73
10.4 Buddhism: The newer the better? .....	81
10.5 Reasons for the Meiji government's anti-Buddhist stance.....	82

10.6	How the Meiji Reformation transformed Japanese Buddhism.....	83
10.7	How Buddhism became a “religion” in Japan .....	86
10.8	Good scholars, true Buddhists .....	87
11	New Buddhisms: India, and the West .....	88
11.0	Introduction.....	88
11.1	India: Neo-Buddhism.....	89
11.2	The Industrial Revolution and Buddhism .....	92
11.2.1	Reasons for the rise of the Industrial revolution.....	92
11.2.2	Energy .....	93
11.2.3	Agriculture .....	94
11.2.4	Dickensian insights .....	94
11.2.5	Western Buddhism as Neo-Buddhism.....	94
11.2.6	“Woke” Buddhism .....	95
11.3	Challenges to Neo-Buddhisms .....	97
11.4	“Naturalized” Buddhism.....	99
12	Buddhist unbelief.....	106
12.0	Introduction.....	106
12.1	Leaving Buddhism: Unbelief and dissidence .....	106
12.1.3	Sāriputta’s faith .....	107
12.1.4	The houselord Citta’s faith .....	108
12.1.8	Principles of interfaith dialogue .....	111
12.2	Psychological aspects of leaving religion .....	112
12.3	Is Goenka’s Vipassana a New Religion? .....	114
12.3.9	Is Vipassana a religion?.....	118
12.3.11	The rhetoric of meditation experience .....	119
12.3.12	The “here and now” .....	120
12.3.13	Vipassana as a “tool” .....	120
12.3.14	The pure teachings of the Buddha .....	121
12.4	Leaving Vipassana .....	121
12.4.2	Drifting Through Samsara, 2002 ch 1 The conversion career .....	122
13	Leaving Theravāda .....	128
13.1	Leaving Theravāda in Myanmar .....	128
13.2	The Mopya Gaing (the Sky Blue Sect) .....	132
13.3	Types of informants .....	135
	Table 13.4 List of deviant sects .....	140
14	Leaving Buddhism.....	140
14.1	We cannot leave when we have not reached.....	140

14.2 “Outsider” .....	141
14.3 Keep going, we’re not there yet.....	142
15 Religious intolerance .....	142
15.1 Blind faith and religious imperialism.....	142
15.2 The biological basis of religious intolerance .....	143
15.3 The psychological bases of religious intolerance .....	144
15.3.1 Defence mechanism .....	144
15.3.2 Cognitive dissonance .....	145
15.3.3 Conversion .....	145
15.3.4 Religion as power and prejudice .....	146
15.3.5 Power, plenty, pleasure.....	147
15.3.6 World religions .....	147
15.4 The historical basis of religious intolerance .....	148
15.5 The philosophical basis of religious intolerance .....	149
15.6 The scriptural basis of religious intolerance .....	150
15.7 The theological basis of religious intolerance .....	154
15.7.6 The Buddhist answers to Baha’i assimilation .....	156
15.7.7 The God-idea in Buddhism .....	157
15.7.8 Religious imperialism.....	158
15.7.9 God-religions and religious imperialism.....	158
15.8 Religious tolerance .....	159
16 Defending Buddhism against the Lotus Sutra .....	160
16.1 A Christianized Sutra? .....	160
16.2 Why was the Lotus Sutra written? .....	161
16.3 The Lotus Sutra rejects the path .....	161
16.4 An exception is <i>not</i> the rule .....	163
16.5 The arhat may be degraded, but not downgraded.....	166
16.6 One buddha is sufficient in our universe .....	166
16.7 The “polemic of accommodation” .....	167
16.8 The Lotus Sutra as a reaction against the Abhidharma .....	168
17 Buddhism and affluence .....	169
17.1 Affluence and religion .....	169
17.2 The Axial Age .....	170
17.3 The Iron Age and urbanization .....	171
17.4 Wealth and renunciation .....	172
17.5 Religious retirement plans .....	173
17.5.3 An ideal case? .....	174

17.6 Renunciation as self-reliance .....	177
18 Pruning the Bodhi tree .....	178
18.1 Critical Buddhism: origin, nature and significance.....	178
18.1.1 Machida Muneo .....	178
18.1.2 HAKAMAYA Noriaki .....	179
18.1.3 MATSUMOTO Shirō.....	180
18.2 “Original enlightenment”? .....	181
18.3 Buddha-nature .....	182
18.4 Questioning themselves.....	182
18.5 Buddha, sect and society.....	183
18.5.1 Paul Swanson.....	183
18.6 How critical is Critical Buddhism? .....	184
19 When Zen is not Buddhism.....	186
19.3 Suzuki Zen and after .....	187
19.4 Returning to early Buddhism.....	189
19.5 The inevitability of Critical Buddhism.....	190
19.6 Japanese Buddhist aesthetics contra Suzuki .....	192
19.7 After the storm.....	193
20 Vital conclusions (thus far) .....	195
20.1 Mythology .....	195
20.2 Dialogue and ecumenism .....	196
20.3 Dialogue: Interfaith, intrafaith .....	198
20.4 Communion and ecumenism .....	199
20.4.1 Definition of ecumenism .....	199
20.4.2 Ecumenism: 3 levels .....	200
20.5 Spiritual scholarship .....	203
Support our sutta translation work: reasons and history .....	204