

# 60.1

## Handbooks of Meditation in Society 1-6

by Piya Tan ©TAN Beng Sin, 2022, 3<sup>rd</sup> rev ed 2023

*20 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching*

by Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin)

assisted by Ratna Lim and family

2002-2023

### **SD 60.1 • Handbooks of Meditation in Society** (series title = HMS)

#### **SD 60.1a • How to be mindful: character analysis** (HMS 1)

An analytical study of Buddhaghosa's 6 character types, especially in relation of meditation

#### **SD 60.1b • Types of meditation: Samatha, Vipassana, Kammatthana** (HMS 2)

A contemporary study of Samatha and Vipassana.

Burmese Vipassana: its origins and developments

Thai Kammatthana: its main teachers and traditions

#### **SD 60.1c • Modern meditation: the rhetoric of Buddhist experience** (HMS 3)

Why and how Buddhism is successful in the West

How some Japanese teachers are reinventing Buddhism

Why some people are leaving Buddhism and Vipassana

#### **SD 60.1d • An evolutionary psychology of mindfulness** (HMS 4)

How Asian teachers are teaching mindfulness and meditation

How meditation can deceive us and how not to be deceived

Modern forms of Theravāda meditations

Self-deception and how to avoid it

(HMS 5)

#### **SD 60.1e • Delusion and experience: epistemology, psychology, Abhidhamma**

McMindfulness & Buddhist delusion

How psychology is taking over Buddhism

How Abhidhamma can help us

(HMS 6)

#### **SD 60.1f • Psychopathology of mindfulness: when religion and meditation fail**

The Buddhist roots of TM (Transcendental Meditation)

Altered states of consciousness (ASC) in Buddhism

Why many Buddhists are narcissists

Early Buddhism and the extended mind

How streamwinners, once-returners, non-returners and arhats are certified today

The difficulties and dangers with Buddhist meditations: how to avoid them

*Respecting the past and learning from the present for a Dhamma future*

## Handbook of Meditation in Society 1+2

### Sutta Discovery vol 60.1ab

Themes: Character analysis; and Samatha, Vipassana, Kammatthāna

Page

- A. TEXTUAL CONVENTIONS. (The Pali Canon, etc.) See the SD Guide  
B. TECHNICAL CONVENTIONS. (Abbreviations, etc.) See the SD Guide

*i-vi*

#### Detailed Table of Contents

<b>SD 60.1a</b>	<b>Character analysis.</b> Visuddhi, magga ch 3 and Vimutti, magga ch 6
1 (1)	<b>Meditation and character types.</b> Temperament and meditation.
8 (2)	<b>Character typology.</b> Upatissa and Buddhaghosa.
15 (3)	<b>The 6 character types.</b> Temperament, character types, roots, faculties.
21 (4)	<b>Conclusion.</b>
<b>SD 60.1b</b>	<b>Samatha, Vipassanā, Kammatthāna</b>
22 (1)	<b>Modern meditation and Burmese Vipassana.</b> 1.1 Religion and Buddhism. 1.2 An outsider's view of Buddhist meditation.
26 (2)	<b>Vipassana.</b> 2.1 Vipassana scholars. 2.2 Samatha-Vipassana terminology.
30	<b>2.3 Burmese Vipassana.</b> Ledi Sayadaw. Vipassana teachers and groups.
36	<b>2.4 Vipassanā, Ledi Sayadaw and the "new Burmese meditation."</b>
50	<b>2.5 Developments in the Vipassana movement.</b>
54 (3)	<b>Siamese Kammatthana.</b> Boran Kammatthāna.
57	<b>3.2 The rhetoric of Kammatthāna.</b>
59 (4)	<b>Samatha.</b> Siamese Samatha tradition. Siamese meditation masters.
65	<b>4.2 Early history of Siamese Kammatthāna and other developments.</b>
67	<b>4.3 Boran Kammatthān.</b> Esoteric Theravāda. Yogāvacara.
73	<b>4.4 The old Siamese meditation. 4.5 History and Buddhism, lost and found.</b>
78	<b>4.6 The Siamese Samatha tradition.</b>
79 (5)	<b>The "new Siamese meditation."</b>
84	<b>5.6 Ajahn Buddhādāsa. 5.8 Buddhādāsa's breath meditation teaching.</b>
106	<b>5.12 Ajahn Chah Subhaddo.</b>
109 (6)	<b>The Samatha Trust.</b> Boonman Poonyathiro.
121 (7)	<b>Samatha-vipassana variations.</b> Insight, "dry" and "wet."
128 (8)	<b>Pa-Auk Sayadaw. Samatha and vipassana. 8.4 Breath meditation up to dhyana.</b>
154	<b>8.7 The 4 elements (kaṣiṇa).</b>
161 (9)	<b>The 4 divine abodes. 168 (10) The 4 protective meditations.</b>
170 (11)	<b>Discerning materiality in Vipassana.</b> Buddhist atomism. <i>Kalāpa</i> .
186 (12)	<b>Discerning materiality (<i>rūpa kammatthāna</i>).</b>
205 (13)	<b>Discerning mentality (<i>nāma kammatthāna</i>).</b> Mental factors. Mental processes.
217 (14)	<b>Discerning the links of dependent arising.</b> Buddha's & Sāriputta's method.
225 (15)	<b>Cultivating Vipassana.</b> Vipassana knowledge. The 10 imperfections of insight.
239	<b>A select bibliography</b>

*Meditation is the ground from which we rise into the space of freedom*

Sutta translations & study: <http://dharmafarer.org>; Online sutta classes: [t.me/suttasangha](https://t.me/suttasangha)

ISBN 978-981-18-5504-7 (digital); ISBN 978-981-18-5505-4 (physical)

3<sup>rd</sup> revised edition ©2023 TAN Beng Sin  
All rights reserved  
Printed in Singapore

**THE MINDING CENTRE**, based in Singapore, is part of Piya Tan’s Dharma ministry. It was founded in 2006 to provide non-religious Dharma-based services to those in need of counsel and solace. It also serves as a haven and hub for those seeking Dharma by way of critical thinking, creative feeling, meditation, sutta translation and study, spiritual experience, and sharing that light and joy. The Centre also supports and promotes Piya Tan in his full-time Buddhist and related work.

**Courses:** <http://themindingcentre.org>

**THE SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES** is part of the Living Word of the Buddha project which aspires to present and encourage an exploration of early Buddhism, both in a Dharma-inspired and academic manner for personal development as well as outreach work on a local and global scale. The Minding Centre and the Living Word of the Buddha project are motivated and guided by a quest for the historical Buddha and a vision of mere Buddhism.

**Suttas:** <http://dharmafarer.org>

**THE MERE BUDDHIST VISION.** We aspire to learn, teach and practise mere Buddha Dharma, or “non-religious Buddhism,” that is, Buddhism as simple as possible, as the teaching of the historical Buddha, so that it is open to all who seek true stillness and liberating wisdom. We aspire to compassionately and joyfully proclaim the possibility, necessity and urgency of gaining spiritual liberation in this life itself—at least as streamwinners, with or without dhyana—in keeping with the spirit of the Okkanta Saṃyutta (S 25). ***Mere Buddhism is easy: live it and be free.***

Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin), 1949-  
SD 60 series theme: Meditation in society  
SD 60.1ab: Character analysis; and Samatha, Vipassana, Kammaṭṭhāna  
Series: The living word of the Buddha (2002- )  
First published 2022; 3<sup>rd</sup> rev 2023; publisher: the author  
ISBN 978-981-18-5504-7 (digital)  
ISBN 978-981-18-5505-4 (physical)

### YOU can help Buddhism grow

Your pledge & support bring Dharma to others:

- Print Dharma and related books, and Internet Dharma**
- Support our sutta translation:** <http://dharmafarer.org>
- Sponsor our full-time Dharma work and global ministry**

*WE GIVE*  
*for the sake of a beautiful mind,*  
*as a support for the mind (in inner peace).*  
(Aṭṭha Dāna Sutta, A 8.31/4:236)

# 60.1ab

## Handbook of Meditation in Society 1+2

A brief historical and psychological survey by Piya Tan ©TAN Beng Sin, 2022, 3<sup>rd</sup> rev ed 2023

**SD 60ab, Character analysis; Types of Meditation**, is part of the multi-volume SD 60 Handbook of Meditation in Society: comprising (to date):

<b>SD 60.1a</b>	Character Analysis	<b>SD 60.1d</b>	An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness
<b>SD 60.1b</b>	Samatha, Vipassana, Kammatthana	<b>SD 60.1e</b>	Delusion and Experience
<b>SD 60.1c</b>	The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience	<b>SD 60.1f</b>	Psychopathology of Mindfulness

### SD 60.1a Character analysis. Detailed Table of Contents (rev ed)

§	Topic	§	Topic
<b>1</b>	<b>MEDITATION AND CHARACTER TYPES</b>	3.1.1	Teachings on the character types
1.1	THE 4 MODES OF MEDITATION	3.1.2	Structure analysis of the types
1.1.1	The (Yuga,naddha) Paṭipadā Sutta (A 4.170)	3.2	AN ANALYSIS OF THE 6 CHARACTER TYPES
1.1.2	“Dharma-restlessness”	3.2.1	The lustful and the faithful
1.1.3	Samatha-vipassana and the 5 spiritual faculties	3.2.2	The hating and the intellectual
1.2	EXISTENTIAL ROOTS OF THE TYPES: CRAVING & IGNORANCE	3.2.3	The deluded and the speculative
1.2.1	Craving encompasses both lust and hate	3.2.4	Craving and views
1.2.2	Craving and view	3.3	<b>THE 6 TYPES AND THE 5 FACULTIES</b>
1.3	BUDDHAGHOSA’S PERSONALITY PSYCHOLOGY	3.3.1	The 5 faculties
<b>2</b>	<b>CHARACTER TYPOLOGY: Upatissa and Buddhaghosa</b>	3.3.2	Cultivating the faculties
2.1	UPATISSA’S TYPOLOGY (Vimutti,magga, ch 6)	3.3.3	The 4 right efforts
2.1.1	Upatissa’s character typology	3.3.4	The lustful
2.1.2	The 3 basic types and the 7 types of persons	3.3.5	The hating
2.2	BUDDHAGHOSA AND UPATISSA	3.3.6	The deluded
2.2.1	Buddhaghosa: the 7 types and the 3 types	3.3.7	The faithful
2.2.2	Elements and humours	3.3.8	The intellectual
<b>3</b>	<b>THE 6 KINDS OF CHARACTER TYPES</b>	3.3.9	The speculative
3.1	STRUCTURE OF THE 6 CHARACTER TYPES	<b>4</b>	<b>CONCLUSION</b>

### SD 60.1b Types of meditation: Samatha, Vipassana, Kamatthana. Detailed contents

§	Topic	§	Topic
<b>1</b>	<b>MEDITATION: MODERN, BURMESE &amp; SIAMESE</b>	2.1.1	Scholars’ views on meditation
1.1	RELIGION AND BUDDHISM	2.2	<b>SAMATHA-VIPASSANA TERMINOLOGY</b>
1.1.1	Academic study of religions	2.2.1	On the terms Samatha and Vipassana
1.1.2	Academic study of Buddhism	2.2.2	What is <i>vipassana</i> ?
1.1.3	Meditation studies	2.3	<b>BURMESE VIPASSANA</b>
1.1.4	Views on meditation: professional, practical	2.3.1	Burmese Buddhism and early Vipassana
1.2	AN OUTSIDER’S VIEW ON BUDDHIST MEDITATION	2.3.2	Pre-modern Vipassana in Burma
<b>2</b>	<b>VIPASSANA</b>	2.3.3	Ledi Sayadaw’s early years
2.1	VIPASSANA SCHOLARS	2.3.4	Ledi Sayadaw’s monastic learning

2.3.5	Ledi Sayadaw's writings	4.5.3	Monastic reforms in Siamese Buddhism
2.4	<b>LEDI SAYADAW &amp; THE "NEW BURMESE MEDITATION"</b>	4.5.4	Modern Siamese monastic education
2.4.1	Vipassana, pure and dry	4.6	<b>THE SIAMESE SAMATHA TRADITION</b>
2.4.2	Ledi Sayadaw's influence	4.6.1	Bangkok was far away
2.4.3	Lone-star Vipassana teachers	5	<b>THE "NEW SIAMESE MEDITATION"</b>
2.4.4	Mohnyin Sayadaw (1872-1964)	5.1	MASTERS OF SIAMESE KAMMATTHANA
2.4.5	Mahasi Sayadaw (1904-1982)	5.2	AJAHN MUN BHURIDATTO (1870-1949)
2.4.6	Saya Thetgyi (1873-1945)	5.3	AJAHN LEE DHAMMADHĀRO (1907-1961)
2.4.7	U Ba Khin (1899-1931)	5.4	AJAHN KHAMDEE PABHASO (1902-1984)
2.4.8	Ledi Sayadaw and U Ba Khin compared	5.5	AJAHN SIM BUDDHĀCĀRO (1909-1992)
2.4.9	A practical Buddhism	5.6	AJAHN BUDDHADĀSA (1906-1993)
2.4.10	S N Goenka (1924-2013)	5.7	BUDDHADĀSA'S MEDITATION TEACHINGS
2.4.11	Goenka's Vipassana rhetoric	5.7.1	Good meditation and its healthy habits
2.5	DEVELOPMENTS IN THE VIPASSANA MOVEMENT	5.7.2	The 8 supports ( <i>paccaya</i> ) of meditation
2.5.1	Goenka and the IMC teachers	5.7.3	Chasing the breath, counting the breath
2.5.2	Vipassana in the US	5.8	BUDDHADASA'S BREATH MEDITATION TEACHING
3	<b>SIAMESE KAMMATTHANA</b>	5.8.1	(1) Contemplation of the body
3.1	ADAPTING BUDDHISM, ADAPTING TO IT?	5.8.2	(2) Contemplation of feelings
3.1.1	From Burmese Vipassana teachers	5.8.3	(3) Contemplation of the mind
3.1.2	Nature of Buddhist meditation	5.8.4	(4) Contemplation of Dharma
3.1.3	Nature of Thai Kammatthana	5.8.5	From samatha to vipassana
3.2	THE RHETORIC OF KAMMATTHANA	5.9	AJAHN THATE DESARANSI (1902-1994)
3.2.1	Practice-centred meditation	5.9.1	Friendship: Thammayut and forest monks
3.2.2	Meditation-centred network	5.10	AJAHN FEUANG JOTIKO (1915-1986)
3.2.3	Keeping to the suttas	5.10.2	His works
4	<b>SAMATHA</b>	5.11	AJAHN MAHA BUA (1913-2011)
4.1	SAMATHA IN EARLY BUDDHISM	5.11.1	The early years
4.1.1	Historical trend	5.11.5	Narrative propensity
4.1.2	Early Buddhist trends	5.12	AJAHN CHAH SUBHADDO (1918-1992)
4.1.3	Samatha, samadhi and dhyana	5.12.1	Chah's meditation training
4.1.4	Meditations leading to dhyana	5.12.2	Training western monks
4.2	SIAMESE KAMMATTHANA: EARLY HISTORY	5.12.3	Ajahn Chah's teachings
4.2.1	Pre-Siamese Buddhism	5.12.4	Associated monasteries of Chah lineage
4.2.2	Sukhothai and Ayutthaya	5.13	AJAHN SUWAT SUVACO (1919-2002)
4.2.3	Sri Lanka: The uses of ordination	6	<b>THE SAMATHA TRUST</b>
4.2.4	The rise of Siam	6.1	BOONMAN POONYATHIRO (1932- )
4.3	BORAN KAMMATTHANA	6.1.1	Youth
4.3.1	The "old Siamese meditation"	6.1.2	Boonman's monkhood
4.3.2	Esoteric Theravada	6.1.3	As a layman: India and the west
4.3.3	The Yogāvacara tradition	6.1.4	The Tibetan connection
4.3.4	Shamanic meditation mantras	6.2	SAMATHA TRUST: BUDDHISM FOR TODAY
4.4	THE OLD SIAMESE MEDITATION	6.2.1	Early history of the Samatha Trust
4.4.1	Developments	6.2.2	Samatha Trust meditation
4.5	HISTORY, LOST AND FOUND	6.2.3	The Samatha Trust spirit
4.5.1	Burmese-Siamese hostilities	6.3	SAMATHA IN THE US
4.5.2	State and sangha	6.4	REFLECTIONS: BOONMAN, SAMATHA TRUST

6.4.1	The ideal lay teacher	8.7.1	The earth element ( <i>paṭhavī dhātu</i> )
6.4.2	The ideal lay Buddhist community	8.7.2	The water element ( <i>āpo dhātu</i> )
<b>7</b>	<b>SAMATHA-VIPASSANA VARIATIONS</b>	8.7.3	The fire element ( <i>tejo dhātu</i> )
7.1	INSIGHT, “DRY” AND “WET”	8.7.4	The wind element ( <i>vāyo dhātu</i> )
7.1.1	“Dry” insight	8.8	THE 2 INDEPENDENT “ELEMENTS”
7.1.2	The “wet” approach	8.8.1	The perception of light ( <i>āloka saññā</i> )
7.2	SAMATHA-BASED VIPASSANA	8.8.2	The perception of space ( <i>ākāsa saññā</i> )
7.2.1	Vipassana based on the divine abodes	8.9	<b>THE 4 FORMLESS ATTAINMENTS (SAMĀPATTI)</b>
7.3	VIPASSANA-BASED SAMATHA	8.9.1	The base of boundless space
7.3.1	Watching rise-and-fall	8.9.2	The base of boundless consciousness
7.3.2	The 3 characteristics	8.9.3	The base of nothingness
7.4	THE WINGS OF A FLYING BIRD	8.9.4	Neither-perception-nor-non-perception
7.4.1	Space and light	<b>9</b>	<b>THE 4 DIVINE ABODES (<i>brahma, vihāra</i>)</b>
7.4.2	The spirit of renunciation	9.1	CULTIVATION OF LOVINGKINDNESS
7.4.3	The 2 hands of meditation	9.1.1	How to cultivate lovingkindness
<b>8</b>	<b>PA-AUK SAYADAW (1934- )</b>	9.1.2	Cultivating lovingkindness by person
8.1	LIFE OF PA-AUK SAYADAW	9.1.3	Breaking the barriers
8.1.1	Early life and monkhood	9.1.4	The categories of beings
8.1.2	Pa Auk’s teachings	9.1.5	Cultivating lovingkindness, 10 directions
8.1.3	Pa Auk’s meditation methods	9.2	CULTIVATION OF COMPASSION
8.2	MINDFULNESS AND CLEAR COMPREHENSION	9.2.1	Compassion to the suffering
8.2.1	Mindfulness ( <i>sati</i> )	9.2.2	Compassion to the unseen sufferer
8.2.2	The 4 focuses of mindfulness	9.3	CULTIVATION OF JOY
8.2.3	Clear comprehension	9.4	CULTIVATION OF EQUANIMITY
8.2.4	Concentration ( <i>samādhi</i> )	<b>10</b>	<b>THE 4 PROTECTIVE MEDITATIONS</b>
8.2.5	The nature of dhyana ( <i>jhāna</i> )	10.1	WHY THE 4 PROTECTIVE MEDITATIONS
8.3	SAMADHI WITHOUT DHYANA	10.1.1	Protect what from what?
8.3.0	The 3 kinds of samadhi	10.1.2	The 4 protective meditations
8.3.1	Momentary concentration	10.2	RECOLLECTION OF THE BUDDHA
8.3.2	Access concentration	10.3	THE PERCEPTION OF FOULNESS
8.3.3	Attainment concentration	10.3.1	Arousing the sign
8.4	<b>BREATH MEDITATION UP TO DHYANA</b>	10.3.2	The nature of the sign
8.4.1	<i>What</i> to focus on: The breath	10.4	THE RECOLLECTION OF DEATH
8.4.2	From sitting to dhyana	10.4.1	Attaining the 1st dhyana
8.4.3	Getting into dhyana	10.4.2	A sense of urgency
8.4.4	Remaining in dhyana	<b>11</b>	<b>DISCERNING MATERIALITY IN VIPASSANA</b>
8.4.5	Emerging from dhyana	11.1	BUDDHIST ATOMISM
8.5	ATTAINING DHYANA WITH OTHER METHODS	11.1.1	Developments in the <i>kalāpa</i> theory
8.5.1	The 32 body-parts meditation	11.1.2	The material clusters ( <i>kalāpa</i> )
8.5.2	The skeleton meditation	11.2	THE 3 TYPES OF MATERIAL CLUSTERS
8.6	<b>THE 10 KASINAS</b>	11.2.1	Our 5-facultied existence
8.6.1	The 4 colour kasiṇas	11.2.2	Materiality of the 3 types of <i>kalāpa</i>
8.6.2	The white kasina	11.2.3	Sensitive matter ( <i>pasāda</i> )
8.6.3	The other colour kasinas	11.3	THE 4 ORIGINS OF MATERIALITY
8.7	<b>THE 4 ELEMENTS (KASIṆA)</b>	11.3.0	How materiality arises
8.7.0	The element kasiṇas with dhyana	11.3.1	Karma-born materiality



11.3.2	Consciousness-born materiality	13.1.3	Discerning name and form
11.3.3	Temperature-born materiality	13.1.4	Discerning dhyana mental processes
11.3.4	Nutriments-born materiality	13.1.5	The mind-door process
11.3.5	Materiality in contemporary language	13.2	HOW TO DISCERN SENSE-SPHERE PROCESSES
11.4	<b>THE 4 ELEMENTS (VIPASSANA)</b>	13.2.1	Wise attention, unwise attention
11.4.1	The element <i>kaṣiṇas</i>	13.2.2	Discerning the mind-door process
11.4.2	The elements meditation, no dhyana	13.2.3	The 5-door process
11.5	DISCERNING THE 4 ELEMENTS	13.3	MENTAL, INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL
11.5.1	Sutta teachings on the 4 elements	13.3.0	How to discern external mentality
11.5.2	The 12 characteristics of 4 elements	13.3.1	Materiality internally/externally
11.6	MEDITATING ON MATERIALITY	13.3.2	Mentality internally/externally
11.6.1	10 ways of developing concentration	<b>14</b>	<b>THE LINKS OF DEPENDENT ARISING</b>
<b>12</b>	<b>DISCERNING MATERIALITY</b>	14.1	METHODS OF DISCERNING DEPENDENT ARISING
12.1	SEEING BODY TRANSLUCENCE AS A BLOCK	14.1.1	How <i>nāma, rūpa</i> arises
12.1.1	The 4 kinds of compactness	14.1.2	The 2 methods
12.1.2	Seeing through compactness	14.2	THE 5 <sup>TH</sup> METHOD OF DEPENDENT ARISING
12.1.3	How to see the material clusters	14.2.1	The 10 links and 3 cycles
12.1.4	Benefits of concentration	14.2.2	How to discern our past lives
12.2	ANALYSING THE MATERIAL CLUSTERS	14.2.3	Case study 1: A female meditator
12.2.1	The elements: sensitive, non-sensitive	14.2.4	Case study 2: A male meditator
12.2.2	How we see the 4 elements	14.2.5	How to discern more past lives
12.2.3	Seeing colour and smell of materiality	14.2.6	Discerning the future
12.2.4	How we “see” the taste of materiality	14.3	DEPENDENT ARISING: 1 <sup>ST</sup> METHOD
12.2.5	How we “see” nutritive essence	14.3.1	Dependent arising of the 18 elements
12.2.6	Seeing life-faculty & sex-faculty	14.3.2	The 3-life dependent arising
12.2.7	How we “see” the heart materiality	<b>15</b>	<b>CULTIVATING VIPASSANĀ</b>
12.3	ANALYZING THE SENSE-FACULTIES	15.1	VIPASSANA KNOWLEDGE
12.3.1	How we analyse the sensitivities	15.1.0	Introduction
12.3.2	How we analyse sex materiality	15.1.1	Cultivating Comprehension Knowledge
12.3.3	The 54 types of materiality of the eye	15.2	THE 40 PERCEPTIONS
12.4	SEEING CONSCIOUSNESS-BORN MATERIALITY	15.2.1	The 40 perceptions
12.5	SEEING TEMPERATURE-BORN MATERIALITY	15.3	THE 7 WAYS OF REFLECTING ON MATERIALITY
12.6	SEEING NUTRIMENT-BORN MATERIALITY	15.4	THE 7 WAYS OF REFLECTING ON MENTALITY
12.6.1	Nutriments and clusters	15.5	KNOWLEDGE OF ARISING AND CEASING
12.6.2	Eating and clusters	15.5.0	Introduction
12.7	OVERVIEW	15.5.1	Detailed dependent arising
12.7.1	The full practice	15.5.2	Discerning the nature of ceasing
12.7.2	Discernment of materiality: overview	15.5.3	The nature of arising and ceasing
12.8	MATERIALITY AND MENTALITY: AN OVERVIEW	15.5.4	Knowledge of arising and ceasing
12.8.1	Aggregates: materiality & mentality	15.6	THE 20 IMPERFECTIONS OF INSIGHT
12.8.2	No “radical pluralism”	15.6.2	The 10 imperfections of vipassana
<b>13</b>	<b>DISCERNING MENTALITY</b>	15.7	THE KNOWLEDGE OF DISSOLUTION
13.0	MENTAL FACTORS ( <i>CETASIKA</i> )	15.8	THE 1 <sup>ST</sup> 11 KNOWLEDGES
13.1	THE 4 ASPECTS OF MENTALITY	15.9	KNOWING AND SEEING NIRVANA
13.1.1	Consciousness and mental factors	15.10	REVIEW KNOWLEDGE
13.1.2	Mental processes	15.11	THE ESSENCE OF SAMATHA-VIPASSANA

# THE LIVING WORD OF THE BUDDHA

The Buddha's Teachings in the Oldest Texts

*Celebrating 20 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching, 2002-2022*

©TAN Beng Sin (Piya Tan) 2022b

## Handbook of Meditation in Society 3

### *Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1c*

#### *Theme: The rhetoric of Buddhist experience*

A psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism

For conventions (textual and technical) and bibliography, see **SD Guide**.

[PDF] To move around the book, click the BOOKMARK icon  on the far left panel; click the HEADINGS.

Page	
1	<a href="#">Detailed table of contents</a>
6	(1) <a href="#">A psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism.</a> Varieties of Buddhist modernism.
11	(2) <a href="#">Two areas of modern Buddhist experience.</a>
14	(3) <a href="#">The traditional Buddhist experience.</a>
18	(4) <a href="#">Western Buddhist experiences.</a>
19	(5) <a href="#">Revival of the "old meditations."</a>
22	(6) <a href="#">How modern Buddhisms are created.</a>
28	(7) <a href="#">Buddhist modernism.</a>
35	(8) <a href="#">Buddhist ethnicism, Buddhist modernism: A few issues.</a>
49	(9) <a href="#">Modernized ethnic Buddhisms.</a>
71	(10) <a href="#">Japan: How Buddhism became a "religion."</a>
88	(11) <a href="#">New Buddhisms: India, and the West.</a>
106	(12) <a href="#">Buddhist unbelief.</a>
128	(13) <a href="#">Leaving Theravāda.</a>
140	(14) <a href="#">Leaving Buddhism.</a>
142	(15) <a href="#">Religious intolerance.</a>
160	(16) <a href="#">Defending Buddhism against the Lotus Sutra.</a>
169	(17) <a href="#">Buddhism and affluence.</a>
178	(18) <a href="#">Pruning the Bodhi tree: Critical Buddhism.</a>
185	(19) <a href="#">When Zen is not Buddhism.</a>
194	(20) <a href="#">Vital conclusions:</a> Dialogue, ecumenism, communion, scholarship.

*Buddhism is daily experience fully and joyfully understood*

Sutta translations & study website: <http://dharmafarer.org>  
Courses and messaging: <http://themindingcentre.org> & [t.me/sutasangha](https://t.me/sutasangha)

ISBN 978-981-18-5949-6 (Physical); ISBN 978-981-18-5950-2 (Digital)



All rights reserved  
Printed in Singapore

**THE MINDING CENTRE**, based in Singapore, is part of Piya Tan’s Dharma ministry. It was founded in 2006 to provide non-religious Dharma-based services to those in need of counsel and solace. It also serves as a haven and hub for those seeking Dharma by way of critical thinking, creative feeling, meditation, sutta translation and study, spiritual experience, and sharing that light and joy. The Centre also supports and promotes Piya Tan in his full-time Buddhist and related work.

**Courses:** <http://themindingcentre.org>

**THE SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES** is part of the Living Word of the Buddha project which aspires to present and encourage an exploration of early Buddhism, both in a Dharma-inspired and academic manner for personal development as well as outreach work on a local and global scale. The Minding Centre and the Living Word of the Buddha project are motivated and guided by a quest for the historical Buddha and a vision of mere Buddhism.

**Suttas:** <http://dharmafarer.org>

**THE MERE BUDDHIST VISION.** We aspire to learn, teach and practise mere Buddha Dharma, or “non-religious Buddhism,” that is, Buddhism as simple as possible, as the teaching of the historical Buddha, so that it is open to all who seek true stillness and liberating wisdom. We aspire to compassionately and joyfully proclaim the possibility, necessity and urgency of gaining spiritual liberation in this life itself—at least as streamwinners, with or without dhyana—in keeping with the spirit of the Okkanta Saṃyutta (S 25). ***Mere Buddhism is easy: live it and be free.***

Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin), 1949-

Title: Sutta Discovery 60.1c.

Theme: The rhetoric of Buddhist Experience: a psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism

Series: The living word of the Buddha (2002- )

First published 2022; publisher: the author

ISBN 978-981-18-5949-6 (physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-5950-2 (digital)

### YOU can help Buddhism grow

Your pledge & support bring Dharma to others:

- ☑ Print Dharma and related books, and Internet Dharma
- ☑ Support our sutta translation: <http://dharmafarer.org>
- ☑ Sponsor our full-time Dharma work and global ministry

*WE GIVE*

*for the sake of a beautiful mind,  
as a support for the mind (in inner peace).*

(Aṭṭha Dāna Sutta, A 8.31/4:236)

The essay **SD 60.1c**, *The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience*,” is part of the multi-volume **SD 60**, comprising (to date), with a related earlier essay:

<b>SD 56.22</b>	Early Buddhist Psychology as experience	(2020c)
<b>SD 60.1a</b>	Character Analysis	
<b>SD 60.1b</b>	Samatha, Vipassana, Kammatthāna	
<b>SD 60.1c</b>	The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience	
<b>SD 60.1d</b>	An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness	
<b>SD 60.1e</b>	Delusion and Experience	
<b>SD 60.1f</b>	Psychopathology of Mindfulness	

## Detailed Table of Contents

<b>Volume 60.1c</b> .....	i
<b>Theme: The rhetoric of Buddhist experience</b> .....	i
Imprint page .....	ii
The Minding Centre: contacts and support .....	iii
Learning the Suttas & Piya Tan .....	iv
Sutta Discovery Series .....	vi
Detailed Table of Contents .....	1
1 A psychosocial exploration of modern Buddhism .....	6
1.1 Modern Buddhist experience .....	6
1.1.1 Modernity and modernism .....	6
1.1.2 The 2 pairs of counter-currents .....	7
1.2 Varieties of Buddhist modernism .....	9
2 Two areas of modern Buddhist experience .....	11
2.1 Introduction .....	11
2.1.2 Buddhist studies .....	11
2.1.3 Buddhist scholarship .....	12
2.1.4 Scholars and practitioners .....	12
3 The traditional Buddhist experience .....	14
3.0 Introduction .....	14
3.1 Experience as currency .....	14
3.2 The modern Buddhist experience .....	15
3.3 Lights and shadows .....	16
4 Western Buddhist experience .....	18
4.0 Introduction .....	18
4.1 Buddhism, revised Westernized edition .....	18
5 Revival of the “old meditations” .....	19
5.0 Introduction .....	19
5.1 Contrasting responses to Buddhism .....	19

5.2 Buddhism as sexual experience .....	20
5.3 Samatha Kammaṭṭhāna.....	21
6 How modern Buddhisms are created.....	22
6.0 Introduction.....	22
6.1 The 2 roots of modern Buddhism .....	22
6.2 Psychology and Buddhism.....	23
6.3 The scholars' Buddhism.....	24
7 Buddhist modernism .....	28
7.0 Introduction.....	28
7.1 Modernism and modernity .....	28
7.2 Post-Buddha Buddhism and Protestant Buddhism .....	31
7.3 Buddhist modernism in Asia.....	33
8 Buddhist ethnicism, Buddhist modernism: A few issues.....	35
8.0 Introduction.....	35
8.1 Race, culture, empire .....	35
8.2 Liberation anthropology, liberation Buddhism .....	39
8.3 Liberating Zen.....	42
8.4 The Zen of modernism: D T Suzuki.....	46
9 Modernized ethnic Buddhisms.....	49
9.0 Introduction.....	49
9.1 Myanmar and Thailand: Sociocultural backgrounds.....	49
9.2 Burmese Buddhist modernism.....	52
9.3 Google Mindfulness: the ultimate modernist meditation .....	54
9.4 Thai Buddhism and modernism .....	56
9.5 Caste Buddhism and sectarian modernism in Sri Lanka .....	57
9.6 "Buddha relics" politics .....	59
9.6.1 Sinhala caste rivalry .....	59
9.6.2 Off-note on the world's largest Buddha relic !!! .....	59
9.6.3 Economics of ethnic Buddhism .....	60
9.7 Modernist Buddhist developments in education and scholarship .....	64
9.8 "Uncomfortable" English.....	67
10 Japan: How Buddhism became a "religion" .....	71
10.0 Introduction.....	71
10.1 The rise and fall of Buddhism.....	72
10.2 Japanese nationalism and "New Buddhisms" .....	73
10.4 Buddhism: The newer the better? .....	81
10.5 Reasons for the Meiji government's anti-Buddhist stance.....	82

10.6	How the Meiji Reformation transformed Japanese Buddhism.....	83
10.7	How Buddhism became a “religion” in Japan .....	86
10.8	Good scholars, true Buddhists .....	87
11	New Buddhisms: India, and the West .....	88
11.0	Introduction.....	88
11.1	India: Neo-Buddhism.....	89
11.2	The Industrial Revolution and Buddhism .....	92
11.2.1	Reasons for the rise of the Industrial revolution.....	92
11.2.2	Energy .....	93
11.2.3	Agriculture .....	94
11.2.4	Dickensian insights .....	94
11.2.5	Western Buddhism as Neo-Buddhism.....	94
11.2.6	“Woke” Buddhism .....	95
11.3	Challenges to Neo-Buddhisms .....	97
11.4	“Naturalized” Buddhism.....	99
12	Buddhist unbelief.....	106
12.0	Introduction.....	106
12.1	Leaving Buddhism: Unbelief and dissidence .....	106
12.1.3	Sāriputta’s faith .....	107
12.1.4	The houselord Citta’s faith .....	108
12.1.8	Principles of interfaith dialogue .....	111
12.2	Psychological aspects of leaving religion .....	112
12.3	Is Goenka’s Vipassana a New Religion? .....	114
12.3.9	Is Vipassana a religion?.....	118
12.3.11	The rhetoric of meditation experience .....	119
12.3.12	The “here and now” .....	120
12.3.13	Vipassana as a “tool” .....	120
12.3.14	The pure teachings of the Buddha .....	121
12.4	Leaving Vipassana .....	121
12.4.2	Drifting Through Samsara, 2002 ch 1 The conversion career .....	122
13	Leaving Theravāda .....	128
13.1	Leaving Theravāda in Myanmar .....	128
13.2	The Mopya Gaing (the Sky Blue Sect) .....	132
13.3	Types of informants .....	135
	Table 13.4 List of deviant sects .....	140
14	Leaving Buddhism.....	140
14.1	We cannot leave when we have not reached.....	140

14.2 “Outsider” .....	141
14.3 Keep going, we’re not there yet.....	142
15 Religious intolerance .....	142
15.1 Blind faith and religious imperialism.....	142
15.2 The biological basis of religious intolerance .....	143
15.3 The psychological bases of religious intolerance .....	144
15.3.1 Defence mechanism .....	144
15.3.2 Cognitive dissonance .....	145
15.3.3 Conversion .....	145
15.3.4 Religion as power and prejudice .....	146
15.3.5 Power, plenty, pleasure.....	147
15.3.6 World religions .....	147
15.4 The historical basis of religious intolerance .....	148
15.5 The philosophical basis of religious intolerance .....	149
15.6 The scriptural basis of religious intolerance .....	150
15.7 The theological basis of religious intolerance .....	154
15.7.6 The Buddhist answers to Baha’i assimilation .....	156
15.7.7 The God-idea in Buddhism .....	157
15.7.8 Religious imperialism.....	158
15.7.9 God-religions and religious imperialism.....	158
15.8 Religious tolerance .....	159
16 Defending Buddhism against the Lotus Sutra .....	160
16.1 A Christianized Sutra? .....	160
16.2 Why was the Lotus Sutra written? .....	161
16.3 The Lotus Sutra rejects the path .....	161
16.4 An exception is <i>not</i> the rule .....	163
16.5 The arhat may be degraded, but not downgraded.....	166
16.6 One buddha is sufficient in our universe .....	166
16.7 The “polemic of accommodation” .....	167
16.8 The Lotus Sutra as a reaction against the Abhidharma .....	168
17 Buddhism and affluence.....	169
17.1 Affluence and religion .....	169
17.2 The Axial Age .....	170
17.3 The Iron Age and urbanization .....	171
17.4 Wealth and renunciation .....	172
17.5 Religious retirement plans .....	173
17.5.3 An ideal case? .....	174

17.6 Renunciation as self-reliance .....	177
18 Pruning the Bodhi tree .....	178
18.1 Critical Buddhism: origin, nature and significance.....	178
18.1.1 Machida Muneo .....	178
18.1.2 HAKAMAYA Noriaki .....	179
18.1.3 MATSUMOTO Shirō.....	180
18.2 “Original enlightenment”? .....	181
18.3 Buddha-nature .....	182
18.4 Questioning themselves.....	182
18.5 Buddha, sect and society.....	183
18.5.1 Paul Swanson.....	183
18.6 How critical is Critical Buddhism? .....	184
19 When Zen is not Buddhism.....	186
19.3 Suzuki Zen and after .....	187
19.4 Returning to early Buddhism.....	189
19.5 The inevitability of Critical Buddhism.....	190
19.6 Japanese Buddhist aesthetics contra Suzuki .....	192
19.7 After the storm.....	193
20 Vital conclusions (thus far) .....	195
20.1 Mythology .....	195
20.2 Dialogue and ecumenism .....	196
20.3 Dialogue: Interfaith, intrafaith .....	198
20.4 Communion and ecumenism .....	199
20.4.1 Definition of ecumenism .....	199
20.4.2 Ecumenism: 3 levels .....	200
20.5 Spiritual scholarship .....	203
Support our sutta translation work: reasons and history .....	204



# THE LIVING WORD OF THE BUDDHA

The Buddha's Teachings in the Oldest Texts

*Celebrating 20 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching, 2002-2022*

## Handbook of Meditation in Society 4

### *Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1d*

#### **Theme: An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness**

Buddhist experience: The individual and society

©TAN Beng Sin (Piya Tan) 2023a

For conventions (textual and technical) and bibliography, see **SD Guide**.

[PDF] To move around the book, click the BOOKMARK icon  on the far left panel; click the HEADINGS.

#### Page

- 7 [Detailed table of contents](#)
- 12 (1) [Mindfulness in daily life.](#)
- 42 (2) [The body-mind process.](#)
- 61 (3) [The social construct of Buddhism.](#)
- 77 (4) [Buddhist: religion or path?](#)
- 113 (5) [Approaches to Buddhism: the scholar and the practitioner.](#)
- 161 (6) [Teacher-constructed Buddhisms.](#)
- 196 (7) [A moral psychology of self-deception.](#)

***Mindfulness is knowing oneself so that we awaken to true freedom***

Sutta translations & study website: <http://dharmafarer.org>

Courses and messaging:

<http://themindingcentre.org>;

[t.me/suttasangha](https://t.me/suttasangha) (Global Sutta Community telegram)

ISBN 978-981-18-6493-3 (Physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-6494-0 (Digital)

©2023a TAN Beng Sin

All rights reserved  
Printed in Singapore

**THE MINDING CENTRE**, based in Singapore, is part of Piya Tan’s Dharma ministry. It was founded in 2006 to provide non-religious Dharma-based services to those in need of counsel and solace. It also serves as a haven and hub for those seeking Dharma by way of critical thinking, creative feeling, meditation, sutta translation and study, spiritual experience, and sharing that light and joy. The Centre also supports and promotes Piya Tan in his full-time Buddhist and related work.

**Courses:** <http://themindingcentre.org>

**THE SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES** is part of the Living Word of the Buddha project which aspires to present and encourage an exploration of early Buddhism, both in a Dharma-inspired and academic manner for personal development as well as outreach work on a local and global scale. The Minding Centre and the Living Word of the Buddha project are motivated and guided by a quest for the historical Buddha and a vision of mere Buddhism.

**Suttas:** <http://dharmafarer.org>

**THE MERE BUDDHIST VISION.** We aspire to learn, teach and practise mere Buddha Dharma, or “non-religious Buddhism,” that is, Buddhism as simple as possible, as the teaching of the historical Buddha, so that it is open to all who seek true stillness and liberating wisdom. We aspire to compassionately and joyfully proclaim the possibility, necessity and urgency of gaining spiritual liberation in this life itself—at least as streamwinners, with or without dhyana—in keeping with the spirit of the Okkanta Samyutta (S 25). ***Mere Buddhism is easy: live it and be free.***

Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin), 1949-

Title: Sutta Discovery 60.1d.

Theme: An evolutionary psychology of mindfulness: Buddhist experience – the individual and society

Series: The living word of the Buddha (2002- )

First published 2023; publisher: the author

ISBN 978-981-18-6493-3 (physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-6494-0 (digital)

### YOU can help Buddhism grow

Your pledge & support bring Dharma to others:

- Print Dharma and related books, and Internet Dharma
- Support our sutta translation: <http://dharmafarer.org>
- Sponsor our full-time Dharma work and global ministry

*WE GIVE*

*for the sake of a beautiful mind,  
as a support for the mind (in inner peace).*

(Aṭṭha Dāna Sutta, A 8.31/4:236)

The essay, **SD 60.1d**, *An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness*, is part of the multi-volume SD 60 Handbook of meditation in Society, comprising (to date):

- SD 60.1a** Character Analysis
- SD 60.1b** Samatha, Vipassana, Kammaṭṭhāna
- SD 60.1c** The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience
- SD 60.1d** An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness
- SD 60.1e** Delusion and Experience
- SD 60.1f** Psychopathology of Mindfulness

## Detailed Table of Contents

<b>SUTTA DISCOVERY VOL 60.1D</b> .....	I
<b>THEME: AN EVOLUTIONARY PSYCHOLOGY OF MINDFULNESS</b> .....	I
<b>IMPRINT PAGE</b> ii	
<b>THE MINDING CENTRE: CONTACTS AND SUPPORT</b> .....	iii
<b>LEARNING THE SUTTAS &amp; PIYA TAN</b> .....	iv
<b>SOME SELECTED BOOKS BY PIYA TAN</b> .....	v
<b>SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES</b> .....	vi
<b>DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS</b> .....	7
<b>1 MINDFULNESS IN DAILY LIFE</b> .....	12
<b>1.0 What is “evolutionary psychology”?</b> .....	12
<b>1.1 What is experience in early Buddhism?</b> .....	12
1.1.1 Body and mind .....	12
<b>Table 1.1.1.6</b> The 7 aspects of the mind. Cf SD 60.1e (Table 7.4) The 4 ultimates, sense-bases, and elements. ....	16
1.1.2 Experience and knowledge .....	18
<b>1.2 The nature of experience</b> .....	20
1.2.1 Experience and its objects .....	20
1.2.2 Supports for Buddhist experience .....	21
1.2.3 How do we know what we are experiencing? .....	25
1.2.4 How do we know it is a <i>Buddhist</i> experience? .....	25
1.2.5 Active and passive aspects of experience .....	26
<b>1.2.5.1</b> The difference between experience and consciousness .....	26
<b>1.2.5.2</b> A strong mind can grow in even a disabled body .....	27
<b>1.2.5.3</b> How our body is connected with the mind.....	28
<b>1.2.5.4</b> How we think .....	28
<b>1.2.5.5</b> The 3 aspects of our mind: <i>Citta mano viññāṇa</i> .....	29
1.2.6 How our thinking process evolves .....	30
1.2.7 Vitakka, vicāra .....	31
<b>Table 1.2.7.3.</b> <i>Vitakka</i> and <i>vicāra</i> .....	33

1.2.8 Perception and conception.....	33
1.2.9 How does the mind construct our experiences? .....	36
1.2.10 The suffering pericope .....	38
<b>1.3 Cognition: distributed and asymmetrical.....</b>	<b>39</b>
1.3.1 The “arising-of-mind” pericope .....	39
1.3.2 Cognitive binding .....	40
1.3.3 Cognition: a structural symmetry .....	41
<b>2 THE BODY-MIND PROCESS .....</b>	<b>42</b>
<b>2.1 Body-mind in Buddhist meditation.....</b>	<b>42</b>
2.1.1 The conscious body.....	42
<b>2.1.1.3</b> Mental object ( <i>dhamma</i> ).....	43
<b>2.1.1.8</b> The body-based mind .....	45
<b>2.1.1.9</b> The physical base of mind and mind-consciousness .....	46
2.1.2 What is the purpose of all this? .....	47
<b>2.2 “All the elements” .....</b>	<b>48</b>
2.2.0 Investigating reality.....	48
2.2.1 Form: Our conscious body; the 6 elements; the 18 elements.....	49
2.2.2 Feelings: The 6 elements .....	50
2.2.3 Formations: the 6 elements.....	52
2.2.4 Consciousness: The 3 elements .....	53
2.2.5 Samsara and nirvana: The 2 elements.....	54
2.2.6 Dependent arising as a conditioned element.....	55
2.2.7 Nirvana: the unconditioned element.....	58
2.2.8 Speaking of nirvana.....	60
<b>3 THE SOCIAL CONSTRUCTION OF BUDDHISM .....</b>	<b>61</b>
<b>3.1 Buddhism and religion.....</b>	<b>61</b>
3.1.1 Buddhism as self-development.....	61
3.1.2 Who invented religion?.....	63
<b>3.2 Buddhism and its developments .....</b>	<b>66</b>
3.2.1 What’s wrong with Buddhist modernism? .....	66
3.2.2 Buddhism before religion, as a non-religious “path” .....	67
3.2.3 Buddhism and the Axial Age .....	69
<b>3.3 Buddhism as lay practice .....</b>	<b>70</b>
3.3.1 The lay discipline ( <i>gihī.vinaya</i> ) .....	70
3.3.2 The laity and moral training.....	72
3.3.3 Evolution of the 5 precepts.....	72
<b>Table 3.3.3.2</b> The 10 courses of action [karma] .....	74
3.3.4 Laity as saints .....	75

4 BUDDHISM: RELIGION OR PATH? .....	77
<b>4.1 Buddhism as a religion</b> .....	<b>77</b>
4.1.1 Minding our own Buddhism.....	77
4.1.2 Out of the Buddha’s hands? .....	80
4.1.3 Buddhism as a path.....	82
<b>Table 4.1.3.1</b> The 3 trainings (basic practice) for laity and renunciants.....	82
4.1.4 The dynamics of Buddhist moral ethics .....	82
4.1.5 Buddhist spiritual psychology as mental health .....	85
<b>4.2 McM mindfulness [SD 60.1c (1.9.2)]</b> .....	<b>85</b>
4.2.1 Marketing mindfulness .....	85
4.2.2 Why McM mindfulness is so successful.....	86
4.2.3 What’s wrong with McM mindfulness? .....	86
<b>4.3 Aspects of modern lay Buddhism</b> .....	<b>89</b>
4.3.1 Modern Buddhism in the US.....	89
4.3.2 Our real task as lay Buddhists .....	90
<b>4.4 Buddhism and modern science</b> .....	<b>91</b>
4.4.1 Is Buddhism scientific? .....	91
4.4.2 The Chicago World Fair: Race and religion .....	94
4.4.3 The doctrine of evolution .....	95
4.4.4 Protestant Buddhism? .....	97
4.4.5 Meditation and science.....	98
4.4.6 Where Buddhism and science may meet .....	100
4.4.7 Non-duality in early Buddhism .....	102
4.4.8 The teacher or the teaching?.....	104
4.4.9 Being <i>a</i> Buddhist, <i>being</i> Buddhist .....	105
<b>4.5 Modern Buddhism in Malaysia</b> .....	<b>108</b>
4.5.1 How other religions and cultures influence local Buddhism .....	108
4.5.2 Priestly politics .....	111
4.5.3 Buddhism and Buddha Dharma .....	112
<b>5 APPROACHES TO BUDDHISM: THE SCHOLAR AND THE PRACTITIONER</b> .....	<b>113</b>
<b>5.1 Early Buddhism and cultural Buddhisms</b> .....	<b>113</b>
5.1.1 Early Buddhism .....	113
5.1.2 Cultural Buddhisms .....	120
5.1.3 Textual Buddhisms .....	122
<b>Figure 5.1.3.4</b> The development of later Buddhisms .....	124
<b>5.2 Evolution of modern Buddhism</b> .....	<b>124</b>
5.2.1 Texts and contexts: Historians and ethnographers .....	124
5.2.2 The vital role and need for textual Buddhism .....	126

5.2.3 Socio-karma (Group karma).....	129
<b>5.3 Scholars' Buddhisms.....</b>	<b>132</b>
5.3.0 Reynolds' 4 modes of scholarship.....	132
5.3.1 Mode I scholarship: The Pali Text Society and Max Weber.....	133
5.3.2 Mode II scholarship: Spiro in Burma.....	136
5.3.3 Mode III scholarship: Gombrich in Sri Lanka.....	138
5.3.4 Mode IV scholarship: Tambiah in Thailand.....	141
5.3.5 Professional courtesy and academic honesty.....	149
5.3.6 Schopen's Buddhism.....	151
5.3.7 The 2 duties of a practitioner.....	154
5.3.8 Practitioners and professors of Buddhism.....	157
<b>5.4 Overview and recap.....</b>	<b>158</b>
5.4.1 Early Buddhist Texts.....	158
5.4.2 Modern Buddhist studies.....	159
<b>6 TEACHER-CONSTRUCTED BUDDHISMS.....</b>	<b>161</b>
<b>6.1 Privatization and certification.....</b>	<b>161</b>
6.1.1 Measuring meditation.....	161
6.1.2 Measuring sainthood.....	163
6.1.3 The middle of the middle way.....	166
<b>6.2 Measuring the breath (A modern account of the awakening process).....</b>	<b>167</b>
6.2.1 Sunlun Sayadaw (1878-1952).....	167
6.2.2 Theinngu Sayadaw (1913-1973).....	170
6.2.3 Sunlun Sayadaw's meditation practice and experience.....	172
6.2.4 Theinngu Sayadaw's meditation practice and experience.....	175
6.2.5 Authority and controversy.....	182
6.2.6 So, you're an arhat! Charisma and Dharma.....	186
<b>6.3 Whose Buddhism?.....</b>	<b>188</b>
6.3.1 Make my Buddhism.....	188
6.3.2 My Buddhism, your Buddhism.....	188
6.3.3 Creative teachers, creative misreadings.....	194
6.3.4 Buddhism as a conversation.....	196
<b>7 A MORAL PSYCHOLOGY OF SELF-DECEPTION.....</b>	<b>197</b>
<b>7.1 Self-deception in Buddhism.....</b>	<b>197</b>
7.1.1 How we deceive ourselves.....	197
7.1.2 Religious belief formation.....	199
<b>7.2 Unwholesome religious belief formation process.....</b>	<b>201</b>
7.2.1 Unwholesome religious beliefs.....	201
7.2.2 Religious belief and faith.....	201



7.2.3 Defence mechanisms and self-deception .....	203
7.2.4 All that we know is provisional .....	203
<b>7.3 Developments in self-deception studies .....</b>	<b>205</b>
7.3.1 Divided minds: Psychological definitions, philosophical difficulties.....	205
7.3.2 Robert Trivers’ theory .....	207
7.3.3 Evolutionary aspect of self-deception .....	209
<b>7.4 Deception and delusion .....</b>	<b>209</b>
7.4.1 Delusion or self-deception? .....	209
7.4.2 Belief, delusion and beyond.....	213
<b>7.5 Self-deception in modern Buddhism .....</b>	<b>216</b>
7.5.1 Notions of Self and Soul .....	216
7.5.2 Self-view: The root of self-deception.....	218
<b>7.6 The 3 fetters of self-deception .....</b>	<b>219</b>
7.6.1 Why 3 fetters?.....	219
7.6.2 Self-identity view: The status is not the state.....	221
7.6.3 Historical and social bases for self-identity view .....	222
7.6.4 Attachment to rituals and vows: Seeking answers outside of us .....	227
7.6.5 Rituals and “make believe” .....	229
7.6.6 The benefits of wholesome rituals .....	231
7.6.7 Doubt: Words as truth .....	232
<b>7.7 Resolving self-deception .....</b>	<b>235</b>
7.7.1 Healthy self-formation and streamwinning.....	235
7.7.2 “Seven at most”: The significance of the number 7 .....	236
7.7.3 Understanding the self.....	240
7.7.4 Seeing ourselves as we truly are.....	241
7.7.5 Understanding nonself.....	245
WHY SUPPORT OUR SUTTA TRANSLATION WORK: REASONS AND HISTORY .....	249

# THE LIVING WORD OF THE BUDDHA

The Buddha's Teachings in the Oldest Texts

*Celebrating 21 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching, 2002-2023*

## *Handbook of Meditation in Society 5*

### Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1e

#### Theme: Delusion and Experience

Epistemology, psychology and the Abhidhamma

©TAN Beng Sin (Piya Tan) 2023b

For conventions (textual and technical) and bibliography, see **SD Guide**.

[PDF] To move around the book, click the BOOKMARK icon  on the far right or left panel; click the HEADINGS.

Page	
7	<a href="#">Detailed table of contents</a>
14	(1) <a href="#">"Mindfulness" and Buddhist Meditation</a>
36	(2) <a href="#">A brief history of mindfulness</a>
46	(3) <a href="#">Mindfulness and awareness</a>
68	(4) <a href="#">The versatility of mindfulness</a>
79	(5) <a href="#">The nature of contemplative knowledge</a>
90	(6) <a href="#">Mindfulness: from anchoring to plunging to floating</a>
103	(7) <a href="#">A psychology of knowing</a>
117	(8) <a href="#">Early Buddhist epistemology</a>
136	(9) <a href="#">The 52 mental factors (<i>cetasikas</i>)</a>
164	(10) <a href="#">Conceptual knowledge</a>
182	(11) <a href="#">Wisdom and spiritual knowledge</a>
191	(12) <a href="#">Delusion and mental aberration</a>
213	(13) <a href="#">Delusion and Abhidhamma</a>

***"What we know is what we sense: thinking makes sense of it."***

Sutta translations & study website: <http://dharmafarer.org>

Courses and messaging:

<http://themindingcentre.org>;

[t.me/suttasangha](https://t.me/suttasangha) (Global Sutta Community telegram)

ISBN 978-981-18-8013-1 (Physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-8014-8 (Digital)

Delusion and Experience: epistemology, psychology and the Abhidhamma

# SUTTA DISCOVERY 60.1e

2023b

©2023b TAN Beng Sin

All rights reserved  
Printed in Singapore

**THE MINDING CENTRE**, based in Singapore, is part of Piya Tan’s Dharma ministry. It was founded in 2006 to provide non-religious Dharma-based services to those in need of counsel and solace. It also serves as a haven and hub for those seeking Dharma by way of critical thinking, creative feeling, meditation, sutta translation and study, spiritual experience, and sharing that light and joy. The Centre also supports and promotes Piya Tan in his full-time Buddhist and related work.

**Courses:** <http://themindingcentre.org>

**THE SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES** is part of the Living Word of the Buddha project which aspires to present and encourage an exploration of early Buddhism, both in a Dharma-inspired and academic manner for personal development as well as outreach work on a local and global scale. The Minding Centre and the Living Word of the Buddha project are motivated and guided by a quest for the historical Buddha and a vision of mere Buddhism.

**Suttas:** <http://dharmafarer.org>

**THE MERE BUDDHIST VISION.** We aspire to learn, teach and practise mere Buddha Dharma, or “non-religious Buddhism,” that is, Buddhism as simple as possible, as the teaching of the historical Buddha, so that it is open to all who seek true stillness and liberating wisdom. We aspire to compassionately and joyfully proclaim the possibility, necessity and urgency of gaining spiritual liberation in this life itself—at least as streamwinners, with or without dhyana—in keeping with the spirit of the Okkanta Samyutta (S 25). ***Mere Buddhism is easy: live it and be free.***

Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin), 1949-

Title: Sutta Discovery 60e: Handbook of Meditation in Society 5

Theme: Delusion and Experience: epistemology, psychology and the Abhidhamma

Series: The living word of the Buddha (2002- )

First published 2023; publisher: the author

ISBN 978-981-18-8013-1 (physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-8014-8 (digital)

### YOU can help Buddhism grow

Your pledge & support bring Dharma to others:

- Print Dharma and related books, and Internet Dharma
- Support our sutta translation: <http://dharmafarer.org>
- Sponsor our full-time Dharma work and global ministry

*WE GIVE*

*for the sake of a beautiful mind,  
as a support for the mind (in inner peace).*

(Aṭṭha Dāna Sutta, A 8.31/4:236)

The essay, **SD 60.1e *Delusion and experience***, is part of the multi-volume *SD 60 Handbook of Meditation in Society*, comprising (to date):

<b>SD 60.1a</b>	Character Analysis
<b>SD 60.1b</b>	Samatha, Vipassana, Kammatṭhāna
<b>SD 60.1c</b>	The Rhetoric of Buddhist Experience
<b>SD 60.1d</b>	An Evolutionary Psychology of Mindfulness
<b>SD 60.1e</b>	Delusion and Experience
<b>SD 60.1f</b>	Psychopathology of Meditation

## Detailed Table of Contents

<b>Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1e</b> .....	i
<b>Theme: Delusion and Experience</b> .....	i
<b>IMPRINT PAGE</b> .....	ii
<b>THE MINDING CENTRE: CONTACTS AND SUPPORT</b> .....	iii
<b>LEARNING THE SUTTAS &amp; PIYA TAN</b> .....	iv
<b>SOME SELECTED BOOKS BY PIYA TAN</b> .....	v
<b>SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES</b> .....	vi
Detailed Table of Contents .....	7
<b>1 “Mindfulness” and Buddhist meditation</b> .....	14
1.1 Buddhist meditation: Historical and social realities .....	14
1.1.1 Persistent influences of Buddhist meditation .....	14
1.1.2 Mindfulness as a product and its consequences .....	18
1.1.3 Plagiarism and disavowal? .....	21
1.1.4 Debates over Mindfulness .....	24
1.1.5 “Mindfulness”: Trait, state or intervention? .....	28
1.1.6 Mindfulness <sup>KZ</sup> as an intervention .....	31
1.1.7 Mindfulness-Based Interventions (MBIs) .....	31
<b>2 A brief history of mindfulness</b> .....	36
2.1 Mindfulness: Right and wrong .....	36
2.2 What it means to be “mindful” .....	39
2.3 Mindfulness and memory .....	40
2.4 Mindfulness and perception .....	41
2.5 Attention and the past .....	42
<b>3 Mindfulness and awareness</b> .....	46
3.1 Clear awareness ( <i>sampajañña</i> ) .....	46
3.2 The uses of mindfulness and awareness .....	48
3.3 The ethics of mindfulness and awareness .....	50
3.4 The gradual progress of mindfulness and awareness .....	51
3.5 Mental harmony in daily life .....	53

3.6	Mindfulness-awareness and sleeping.....	54
3.7	Mindfulness-awareness and positive emotions .....	55
3.8	Mindfulness-awareness and the 3 <sup>rd</sup> dhyana.....	56
3.9	Clear awareness of emptiness .....	57
3.10	Mindfulness and dying well .....	60
3.11	Mindfulness and penetration ( <i>sati,nepakka</i> ).....	61
	Table 3.11.5 <i>Sati,nepakka</i> in dharma sets .....	66
<b>4</b>	<b>The versatility of mindfulness.....</b>	<b>68</b>
4.1	The 2 kinds of mindfulness .....	68
4.2	Location of mindfulness.....	71
	Table 4.2 Location of <i>sati</i> among the dharma sets (based on Analayo 2003:50).....	71
4.3	To sense, to know or to cognize .....	73
4.4	The range of knowledge: <i>Diṭṭha suta muta</i> and <i>viññāta</i> .....	75
<b>5</b>	<b>The nature of contemplative knowledge.....</b>	<b>79</b>
5.1	Embodying the mind.....	79
5.2	Dimensions of mindfulness: The 4 satipatthanas .....	81
	Table 5.2 Mindfulness and awareness.....	82
5.3	Dimensions of mindfulness: (1) Somatic awareness .....	82
5.4	Dimensions of mindfulness: (2) Hedonic awareness .....	84
5.5	Dimensions of mindfulness: (3) Conative awareness .....	85
5.6	Dimensions of mindfulness: (4) Dharma awareness.....	86
5.7	Metaphors for mindfulness and awareness .....	88
<b>6</b>	<b>Mindfulness: From anchoring to plunging to floating .....</b>	<b>90</b>
6.1	From anchoring to plunging.....	90
	6.1.1 The Sotānugata Sutta (A 4.191) .....	90
	6.1.2 Mindfulness in early Abhidhamma .....	91
	6.1.3 Mindfulness and modern Vipassana meditation .....	92
6.2	From plunging to floating.....	94
	6.2.1 Memory.....	94
6.3	Apilāpana and pilāpana.....	96
6.4	The wobble.....	98
6.5	The 3 friends of right cultivation.....	100
<b>7</b>	<b>A psychology of knowing .....</b>	<b>103</b>
7.1	Do we know what we are?.....	103
7.2	Experience and knowing .....	104
	Table 7.2.3 The 18 elements of cognition.....	105
7.3	Contact and feeling .....	106
	Table 7.3.3 The basic cognitive process leading up to feeling [SD 60.1d (1.1.1.3)].....	108

7.4 The aggregates and the sense-bases .....	111
Table 7.4.2 An event of seeing in terms of the aggregates and the sense-bases.....	111
Table 7.4.3 The 4 ultimates as aggregates, sense-bases, and elements .....	112
Table 7.4.4 The 7 consciousness elements ( <i>viññāṇa</i> , <i>dhātu</i> ) and 89 <i>cittas</i> [Table 7.4.3].....	114
7.5 Mental proliferation.....	115
<b>8</b> Early Buddhist epistemology.....	117
8.1 Validity of knowledge.....	117
8.2 Perceptual knowledge .....	119
<b>Table 8.3:</b> The 28 forms of materiality [SD 17.2a (10)] .....	121
8.3 An Abhidhamma analysis of the Dharma .....	122
8.3.4 The Abhidhamma and mental programming.....	124
8.3.5 Derived matter .....	125
8.4 From Dhamma to dhammas .....	126
8.4.2 The dhamma theory.....	126
8.5 The <i>paññatti</i> theory .....	127
8.6 “Own-nature” ( <i>sabhāva</i> ).....	128
8.7 <i>Paññatti</i> : Naming and meaning .....	132
Table 8.7.1 Comparative table: <i>nāma</i> , <i>paññatti</i> and <i>attha</i> , <i>paññatti</i> .....	133
<b>9</b> The 52 mental factors ( <i>cetasika</i> ).....	136
9.1 The nature of the <i>cetasikas</i> .....	136
Table 9.1 The 52 mental factors ( <i>cetasika</i> ).....	137
Table 9.1.3 <i>Cittas</i> , <i>cetasikas</i> , aggregates and knowledge [cf Table 5.2; 8.1.5].....	138
9.2 The 7 universals .....	138
9.3 (I) The 13 moral variables ( <i>añña</i> , <i>samāna cetasika</i> ) [Table 9.1].....	139
9.4 (B) The 6 occasional <i>cetasikas</i> ( <i>pakiṇṇaka cetasika</i> ) .....	141
9.5 (II) The 14 unwholesome <i>cetasikas</i> ( <i>akusala cetasika</i> ) [Table 9.1].....	143
9.5.2 (C) The 4 unwholesome universal <i>cetasikas</i> : (14-17) .....	143
9.6 (D) The 10 unwholesome occasional <i>cetasikas</i> : (18-27).....	144
9.6.1 (18) Greed .....	144
9.6.2 (19) Wrong view.....	145
9.6.6 Conceit, hatred, envy and avarice .....	146
9.6.7 Worry .....	148
9.6.8 Doubt about the wholesome .....	148
9.6.9 [25-26] Sloth, torpor, sloth and torpor .....	149
9.6.12 Doubt about the unwholesome.....	150
9.7 (III) The 25 beautiful factors ( <i>sobhana cetasika</i> ) [Table 9.1] .....	151
9.8 (E) The 19 beautiful universals ( <i>sobhana sādharmaṇa</i> ) .....	153
9.8.3 (28) 1 Faith ( <i>saddhā</i> ) .....	153



9.8.6 (29) 2 Mindfulness ( <i>sati</i> ) .....	154
9.8.8 (30) 3 Moral shame ( <i>hiri</i> ) & (31) 4 moral fear ( <i>ottappa</i> ) .....	155
9.8.12 (32) 5 Non-greed ( <i>alobha</i> ), (33) 6 Non-hatred ( <i>adosa</i> ) .....	156
9.8.15 (34) 7 Neutrality of mind ( <i>tatra,majjhataṭā</i> ).....	158
<b>9.9 (35-46) The 6 <i>citta-kāya</i> pairs (<i>yugalaka</i>) .....</b>	<b>158</b>
9.9.4 (35+36) The tranquillity pair ( <i>passaddhi yugalaka</i> .....	160
9.9.5 (37+38) The lightness pair ( <i>lahutā yugalaka</i> ) .....	160
9.9.6 (39+40) The malleability pair ( <i>mudutā yugalaka</i> ).....	160
9.9.7 (41+42) The wieldiness pair ( <i>kammaññatā yugalaka</i> ) .....	160
9.9.8 (43+44) The proficiency pair ( <i>paguññatā yugalaka</i> ) .....	161
9.9.9 (45+46) The rectitude pair ( <i>ujjukatā yugalaka</i> ).....	161
9.10 (47-49) (F) The 3 abstinences ( <i>virati</i> ).....	161
9.11 (50+51) (G) The 2 illimitables ( <i>appamañña</i> ).....	162
9.12 (52) Non-delusion ( <i>amoha</i> ).....	162
<b>10 Conceptual knowledge.....</b>	<b>164</b>
Table 10 Classes of knowledge ( <i>khandha</i> -based) [cf Table 5.2] .....	164
10.1 The range and types of human knowledge.....	164
10.2 How do we know?.....	166
10.3 Theory of the 2 truths .....	170
10.4 The 2 truths in the suttas.....	172
10.5 The validity of the 2 truths.....	175
10.6 Sammuti and samutti,sacca .....	178
10.7 Two views of the same truth .....	179
10.8 The 2 teachings: <i>pariyāya</i> and <i>nippariyāya</i> .....	180
<b>11 Wisdom and spiritual knowledge .....</b>	<b>182</b>
11.1 Knowledge “to be developed” .....	182
11.2 Knowledge as perception ( <i>saññā</i> ) .....	182
11.3 Knowledge as view ( <i>diṭṭhi</i> ).....	183
11.4 Direct knowledge ( <i>ñāṇa</i> ).....	184
11.5 The 3 kinds of wisdom .....	189
<b>12 Delusion and mental aberration .....</b>	<b>191</b>
12.1 Delusion as key motivator.....	191
12.2 The 3 kinds of mental aberration.....	192
12.3 Aberrant perception: Defective sensing .....	195
12.4 Aberrant mind: Defective thinking .....	201
12.5 Aberrant view: Defective knowing.....	202
12.5.4 Early Buddhist ontology .....	203
12.5.7 Skillful means .....	205

12.6 How science influences religion.....	206
12.7 The mind: Distributed and extended.....	209
12.7.1 Distributed mind.....	209
12.7.2 Extended mind.....	209
12.7.3 Early Buddhist theory of mind.....	210
12.7.4 The mind and other bodies.....	210
12.7.5 Nonself and the mind.....	211
<b>13 Delusion and Abhidhamma.....</b>	<b>213</b>
13.1 The nature of delusion.....	213
13.1.1 Delusion as a modern Buddhist term.....	213
13.1.2 Delusion and ignorance.....	213
13.1.3 Root of ignorance.....	214
13.1.4 Delusional belief.....	214
13.1.5 Sin-belief vs non-identification.....	215
13.1.6 The 6 wrong views.....	216
13.2 Delusion as a mental factor ( <i>cetasika</i> ).....	217
13.2.2 Citta and cetasikas.....	217
13.2.3 Association and inclusion.....	218
13.3 Unwholesome or pathological?.....	218
13.3.2 When is a delusion pathological?.....	218
13.3.3 Analysis of pathological delusion [Referring to 13.3.2].....	219
13.4 Types of delusion.....	220
13.4.1 Delusion: bizarre or non-bizarre.....	221
13.4.2 Functional or organic.....	222
13.4.3 Genetic or biological.....	222
13.4.4 Motivated or defensive.....	222
13.4.5 Monothematic or polythematic.....	223
13.4.6 Circumscribed and elaborated.....	224
13.4.7 Primary and secondary.....	224
13.5 Delusion and irrationality.....	224
13.5.3 Merit-transfer as ego-defence.....	225
13.6 Overlapping of delusion and self-deception.....	226
13.6.3 An overlap between delusion and self-deception.....	228
13.7 Trajectories in modern Buddhism.....	228
13.7.1 Psychologization of Buddhism.....	228
13.7.2 “Judaification” of Buddhism.....	229
13.7.4 Tikkun olam, tikkun ha-olam.....	230
13.8 Delusion, belief, view.....	230

13.8.1 Belief, uncountable and countable .....	231
13.8.2 Cognitive faith, affective faith.....	231
13.8.3 The 4 influxes .....	231
13.8.4 <i>Diṭṭhi</i> : wrong view(s), right view .....	232
13.9 The 12 unwholesome cittas .....	233
Table 13.9 The 89 and 121 cittas (a summary) (Abhs:BRS 1999:28) .....	234
13.9.1 The cittas rooted in greed ( <i>lobha,mūla,citta</i> ) .....	235
Table 13.9.1 The 8 types of cittas accompanied by greed.....	235
13.9.2 The cittas rooted in hatred ( <i>dosa,mūla,citta</i> ) .....	237
13.9.3 Cittas rooted in delusion ( <i>moha,mūla,citta</i> ).....	237
Table 13.9.3 The 12 unwholesome cittas (Abhs:BRS 1999:35).....	238
13.10 The unwholesome cetasikas .....	239
13.11 The 2 roots and 12 links .....	241
Table 13.11 The 12 links over 3 consecutive lives [SD 8.2; SD 59.12 Table 3.1.2].....	241
13.12 The 24 conditions ( <i>paccaya</i> ) .....	242
13.12.1 The root condition ( <i>hetu,paccaya</i> ).....	242
Table 13.12 The 24 conditions ( <i>paccaya</i> ) and their varieties .....	243
13.12.2 Object condition ( <i>ārammaṇa,paccaya</i> ) .....	244
13.12.3 Predominance condition ( <i>adhipati,paccaya</i> ).....	244
13.12.4 Proximity condition ( <i>anantara,paccaya</i> ) &.....	245
13.12.5 Contiguity condition ( <i>samanantara,paccaya</i> ) .....	245
13.12.6 Connascence condition ( <i>sahajāta,paccaya</i> ) .....	245
13.12.7 Mutuality condition ( <i>aññām-añña,paccaya</i> ) .....	245
13.12.8 Support condition ( <i>nissaya,paccaya</i> ).....	246
13.12.9 Decisive support condition ( <i>upanissaya,paccaya</i> ).....	247
13.12.10 Prenascence condition ( <i>pure,jāta,paccaya</i> ).....	248
13.12.11 Postnascence condition ( <i>pacchā.jāta,paccaya</i> ).....	249
13.12.12 Repetition [frequency] condition ( <i>āsevana,paccaya</i> ).....	249
13.12.13 Karma condition ( <i>kamma,paccaya</i> ) .....	250
13.12.14 Karma-result condition ( <i>vipāka,paccaya</i> ) .....	251
13.12.15 Nutriment condition ( <i>āhāra,paccaya</i> ) .....	252
13.12.16 Faculty condition ( <i>indriya,paccaya</i> ) .....	253
Table 13.12.16 The 22 faculties .....	254
13.13 The 24 conditions: A synthesis.....	257
13.13.1 Abhs 8.12 Summary .....	257
13.13.2 Abhs 8.13 The mind for the mind .....	257
13.13.3 Abhs 8.14 The mind for mind-and-matter .....	259
13.13.4 Abhs 8.15 The mind for matter.....	260

13.13.5	Abhs 8.16 Matter for the mind .....	261
13.13.6	Abhs 8.17 Concepts and mind-and-matter for the mind.....	261
13.13.7	Abhs 8.18 Mind-and-matter for mind-and-matter .....	262
13.13.8	Abhs 8.19 Predominant condition .....	262
13.13.9	Abhs 8.20 Predominant condition .....	263
13.13.10	Abhs 8.21 Mutuality condition.....	263
13.13.11	Abhs 8.22 Support condition .....	264
13.13.12	Abhs 8.23 Nutriment condition .....	264
13.13.13	Abhs 8.24 Faculty condition.....	265
13.13.14	Abhs 8.25 Dissociation condition.....	266
13.13.15	Abhs 8.26 Presence and non-disappearance conditions .....	267
13.13.16	Abhs 8.27 The synthesis of conditions.....	267
13.13.17	Abhs 8.28 Summary .....	268
13.14	The key problems with the Abhidhamma.....	268
13.14.2	The Abhidhamma, language and realism .....	269
13.14.3	We are always “conscious of something,” but not of some <i>thing</i> .....	271
13.14.4	The conditional relations (paccaya) are circular .....	273
13.15	Dharma and Abhidhamma in perspective .....	274
13.15.1	Relative teaching ( <i>pariyāya</i> ) .....	274
13.15.2	“Scientific” Buddhism?.....	274
13.15.3	Higher Dharma? .....	275
	Why support our sutta translation work: Reasons and history.....	277

# THE LIVING WORD OF THE BUDDHA

The Buddha's Teachings in the Oldest Texts

*Celebrating 21 years of full-time sutta translation and teaching, 2002-2023*

## *Handbook of Meditation in Society 6*


### Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1f

#### Theme: A Psychopathology of Mindfulness

When religion and meditation fail

©TAN Beng Sin (Piya Tan) 2023c

For conventions (textual and technical) and bibliography, see **SD Guide**.

[PDF] To move around the book, click the BOOKMARK icon  on the far right or left panel; click the HEADINGS.

Page	
8	<a href="#">Detailed table of contents</a>
13	(0) <a href="#">Introduction to SD 60.1f</a>
17	(1) <a href="#">Meditation: its roots and undergrowth</a>
22	(2) <a href="#">Maharishi Mahesh Yogi and Transcendental Meditation</a>
40	(3) <a href="#">Modern meditation studies</a>
52	(4) <a href="#">Discoveries in modern consciousness studies</a>
86	(5) <a href="#">The self as path and pathy</a>
179	(6) <a href="#">The uses of awakening: Theravāda and the nation</a>
260	(7) <a href="#">Meditation and adverse experiences</a>

***Wisdom and science are the better alternative to religion***

Sutta translations & study website: <http://dharmafarer.org>

Courses and messaging:

<http://themindingcentre.org>;

[t.me/suttasangha](https://t.me/suttasangha) (Global Sutta Community telegram)

ISBN 978-981-18-8971-4 (Physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-8972-1 (Digital)

©2023c TAN Beng Sin

All rights reserved  
Printed in Singapore

**THE MINDING CENTRE**, based in Singapore, is part of Piya Tan’s Dharma ministry. It was founded in 2006 to provide non-religious Dharma-based services to those in need of counsel and solace. It also serves as a haven and hub for those seeking Dharma by way of critical thinking, creative feeling, meditation, sutta translation and study, spiritual experience, and sharing that light and joy. The Centre also supports and promotes Piya Tan in his full-time Buddhist and related work.

**Courses:** <http://themindingcentre.org>

**THE SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES** is part of the Living Word of the Buddha project which aspires to present and encourage an exploration of early Buddhism, both in a Dharma-inspired and academic manner for personal development as well as outreach work on a local and global scale. The Minding Centre and the Living Word of the Buddha project are motivated and guided by a quest for the historical Buddha and a vision of mere Buddhism.

**Suttas:** <http://dharmafarer.org>

**THE MERE BUDDHIST VISION.** We aspire to learn, teach and practise mere Buddha Dharma, or “non-religious Buddhism,” that is, Buddhism as simple as possible, as the teaching of the historical Buddha, so that it is open to all who seek true stillness and liberating wisdom. We aspire to compassionately and joyfully proclaim the possibility, necessity and urgency of gaining spiritual liberation in this life itself—at least as streamwinners, with or without dhyana—in keeping with the spirit of the Okkanta Saṃyutta (S 25). ***Mere Buddhism is easy: live it and be free.***

Piya Tan (TAN Beng Sin), 1949-

Title: Sutta Discovery 60.1f: Handbook of Meditation in Society 6

Theme: A pathology of mindfulness: when religion and meditation fail

Series: The living word of the Buddha (2002- )

First published 2023; publisher: the author

ISBN 978-981-18-8971-4 (physical)

ISBN 978-981-18-8972-1 (digital)

### YOU can help Buddhism grow

Your pledge & support bring Dharma to others:

- Print Dharma and related books, and Internet Dharma**
- Support our sutta translation:** <http://dharmafarer.org>
- Sponsor our full-time Dharma work and global ministry**

*WE GIVE*

*for the sake of a beautiful mind,  
as a support for the mind (in inner peace).*

(Aṭṭha Dāna Sutta, A 8.31/4:236)



## **Table of contents**

Sutta Discovery Vol 60.1f	i
Theme: A Psychopathology of Mindfulness	i
IMPRINT PAGE	i
THE MINDING CENTRE: CONTACTS AND SUPPORT	iii
LEARNING THE SUTTAS & PIYA TAN	iv
SOME SELECTED BOOKS BY PIYA TAN	v
SUTTA DISCOVERY SERIES	vi
Table of contents	8
0 Introduction to SD 60.1f	13
0.3 A glossary of some technical terms in meditation studies	14
0.3.1 Types of meditation	14
0.3.2 Meditation terms	14
0.3.3 Related meditation traditions	15
0.3.4 Key terms related to religion	16
1 Meditation: Its roots and its undergrowth	17
1.1 Yoga: The early Buddhist roots of meditation	17
1.1.1 Earliest roots of Indian <i>yoga</i>	17
1.2 Usage of the term <i>yoga</i>	19
1.2.3 The Yoga Sūtras and Āyurveda	19
1.2.4 Buddhist roots	20
2 Maharishi Mahesh Yogi and Transcendental Meditation	22
2.1 How Mahesh becomes Maharishi	22
2.1.1 Mahesh and Brahmānand	22
2.1.2 Caste versus charisma	23
2.1.3 Strategies for holiness	24
2.2 The rise of the Maharishi	24
2.2.1 Mahesh wants to save the world	24
2.2.2 In the Gurudev's name	25
2.2.3 When stress fails you	25
2.3 Mahesh's mantra meditation	26
2.3.1 Mantras for sale	26
2.3.2 The "Sidhi" programme	27
2.3.3 The Science of Creative Intelligence (SCI)	27
2.4 The decline of the Maharishi	28
2.4.1 Fairfield, Fear-field	28
2.4.2 Pleasures of being the Guru	28
2.4.3 Legal karma	29
2.4.4 The serpent recoils	30
2.5 Profiling Mahesh	31
2.5.1 TM Survivor	31
2.5.2 How to fly (for a fee)	32
2.5.3 The psychopathy of Mahesh	32
2.6 The abdication syndrome	35
2.6.1 Handing over our remote to the leader	35
2.6.2 Desire to return to early childhood	36
2.6.3 The glassy-eyed look	37
2.6.4 Transference and counter-transference	38
3 Modern meditation studies	40
3.1 Roots of meditation and its modern vicissitudes	40

3.1.1 Body, mind and others	40
3.1.2 “Non-religious” mindfulness	40
3.2 Modern aspects of mindfulness	41
3.2.1 Novel concoctions	41
3.2.2 Short-term and long-term benefits of meditation	42
3.2.3 A Centre for Meditation Standards	43
3.3 Researches into meditation as therapy: A review	44
3.3.1 A review of meditation literature	44
3.3.2 TM and Zen meditation	44
3.3.3 “Zen is not meditation”	46
3.3.4 Meditation studies and related areas	49
4 Discoveries in modern consciousness studies	52
4.1 Pioneer research and developments	52
4.1.1 Study themes and trends	52
4.1.2 Mind the hype	53
4.2 Developments in consciousness theories	55
4.2.1 Personal construct theory	55
4.2.2 Streamwinners “enjoying sensual pleasures”	57
4.2.3 Ecstasy and enstasy	59
4.2.4 The knower, the doer and free will	60
4.2.5 Self-views	60
4.2.6 Is consciousness merely an epiphenomenon?	63
4.3 Altered states of consciousness	63
4.3.1 Typical altered states of consciousness	63
4.3.2 Hypnosis as a typical ASC	65
4.3.3 Sleep and dreams as typical ASCs	66
4.3.4 Lucid dreaming	67
4.4 Exceptional or higher states of consciousness	69
4.4.1 Optimal experience or the flow	69
4.4.2 Runner’s high or second wind	70
4.4.3 Out-of-body experiences (OBEs)	70
4.4.4 Near-death experiences (NDEs)	71
4.4.5 Mystical experiences	73
4.4.6 Spirituality of meditation	74
4.4.7 The inner silence	75
4.4.8 The outer silence	76
4.4.9 “Altered states of consciousness” and meditation	78
4.4.10 Meditative altered states of consciousness	78
4.5 ASCs in the Bodhisattva Siddhattha	79
4.5.1 ASCs in 7-year-olds	79
4.5.2 Saṃvega and pasāda	81
4.5.3 ASCs: Modern meditations and traditional meditations	82
5 The self as path and pathy	86
5.1 The self as state and act	86
5.1.1 The one way	86
5.1.2 Psychology, religion and Buddhism	88
5.1.3 The perfect imperfection	91
5.1.4 Cognitive development	92
5.1.5 Emotive development	93
5.1.6 The golden rule	94
5.1.7 Karma as act, karma as state	95

5.2 The 5 faculties of Dharma-spirited interbeing	96
5.2.1 Faith as a socializing faculty	96
5.2.2 Effort as a socializing faculty	97
5.2.3 Mindfulness as a socializing faculty	98
5.2.4 Concentration as a socializing faculty	99
5.2.5 Wisdom as a socializing faculty	99
5.2.6 The religious and mental health	100
5.3 Narcissism in Buddhist light	101
5.3.1 Narcissism as self-centred views and tendencies	101
5.3.2 Narcissism as a modern psychological concept	103
5.3.3 Types of narcissist	108
5.3.4 Narcissism in the light of the suttas	110
5.3.5 Sutta teaching on the vulnerable narcissist	112
5.3.6 Reactivity in narcissistic persons	114
5.3.7 Narcissistic entitlement	119
5.3.8 Narcissistic personality disorder	121
5.4 Self and religion	122
5.4.1 The dark triad	122
5.4.2 Self, narcissism and religion	125
5.4.3 Religion as mother, as father, as self and beyond	129
5.4.4 When self religion hurts	133
5.4.5 Life as a struggle	136
5.4.6 The faith that truly frees	138
5.4.7 Psychotic disorders in religious history	139
Table 5.4.7a Diagnostic Criteria for Schizophrenia	140
Table 5.4.7b Selected Bible passages suggesting psychiatric symptoms	141
5.4.8 Religious/spiritual struggles	147
5.4.9 The 6 kinds of existential struggles	150
5.4.10 Seeing whole, becoming whole	161
5.5 Buddhism and extended faith	166
5.5.1 Religious dialogues: paradigm shifts	166
5.5.2 The necessity of dialogue	168
5.5.3 Why some don't have dialogue	170
5.5.4 The Buddha's dialogue with the wanderers	172
5.5.5 The Buddha's 7 challenges to interreligious dialogue	176
6 The uses of awakening: Theravāda and the nation	179
6.1 The fate of Theravāda in SE Asia	179
6.1.1 Sri Lanka: modernizing Buddhism	179
6.1.2 Myanmar: ethnicizing Buddhism	179
6.1.3 Thailand: Bangkok-centred state	179
6.1.4 Khmer/Cambodia: from empire to state	180
6.1.5 Laos: Buddhist kingdom, Marxist state	181
6.1.6 Modern Laos	185
6.1.7 Neighbouring countries	188
6.2 Myanmar: Vipassana, sainthood, society	188
6.2.1 How Sotāpannas perceive	188
6.2.2 Sotapanna and <i>sotāpanna</i>	190
6.2.3 Significance of perception	193
6.2.4 Interviewing the Sotāpannas of Myanmar	195
6.2.5 Perception changes in the Sotapanna meditators	196
6.2.6 Study findings; strengths and weaknesses	199

6.2.7 Context, implications and conclusions	201
6.2.8 Towards quantum dhamma	202
6.3 Expert Dutch Vipassana Meditators	204
6.3.1 The terms of modern meditation	204
6.3.2 Studying experienced Western meditators of Vipassana	206
6.3.3 Perceived outcomes	208
6.3.4 Perceived processes	213
6.3.5 Significance of the Study	216
6.3.6 Limitations and new horizons	218
6.4 Embodying the path	220
6.4.1 The abstract and the embodied	220
6.4.2 Truth, reality and awakening	223
6.4.3 The sequence of the 3 characteristics	225
6.4.5 Abstract purpose, embodied meaning: knowing <i>dukkha</i>	231
6.4.6 Experiencing nonself	234
6.4.7 Living true reality	238
6.4.8 Situated dharma: meaning, purpose, realization	240
6.5 Attaining the Path in modern Myanmar	243
6.5.1 The Path as moral order in society	243
6.5.2 Mahasi's Vipassana	245
6.6 A Singaporean Sotapanna	248
6.6.1 Path certification by a lay meditation teacher	248
6.6.2 Mind-to-mind-transmission?	248
6.6.3 Discussion and significance	250
6.7 When the mind fails the meditator	251
6.7.1 The supports for gaining streamwinning	251
6.7.2 Unshakeable well-being	253
6.8 A modern Arahant revises Buddhism	255
6.8.1 Revising the stages of insight	255
6.8.2 Vipassanā jhāna	256
6.8.3 Self-declared Arahant	257
7 Meditation and adverse experiences	260
7.1 The ReSource project	260
7.1.1 Pair meditation for social bonding	260
7.1.2 The Presence Module	263
7.1.3 The Affect Module	268
7.1.4 The Perspective Module	274
7.2 Varieties of contemplative experiences	280
7.2.1 Significance of the VCE study	280
7.2.2 Influencing factors (in meditation)	282
7.3 Meditation challenges	284
7.3.1 Somatic challenges	284
7.3.2 Affective challenges	286
7.3.3 Cognitive challenges	287
7.3.4 Perceptual challenges	289
7.3.5 Conative challenges	291
7.3.6 Sense of self challenges	291
7.3.7 Social challenges	293
7.4 Progress or pathology?	294
7.4.1 Mental visions and memories	294
7.4.2 <i>Kuṇḍalinī</i> and energy issues	295

7.4.3 Experiences of insight	297
7.4.4 The dark night	298
7.4.5 The “insight gone wrong” discourse	299
7.4.6 The meditation “adverse effects” discourse	301
7.4.7 What we were really seeking	303
7.5 Meditation and the future	304
7.5.1 Kammaṭṭhāna	304
7.5.2 Meditation business	305
7.5.3 Conclusion: Future meditation	306
Why support our sutta translation work: Reasons and history	308